Symmetry Conditional Expectation

于峥 518030910437

May 22, 2020

Problem 1 (Exercise 9.2 of Chapter E)

Suppose that $X, Y \in \mathcal{L}^1(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, P)$ and that

$$E(X|Y) = Y$$
, a.s., $E(Y|X) = X$, a.s.

Prove that P(X = Y) = 1.

Hint, consider $E(X - Y; X > c, Y \le c) + E(X - Y; X \le c, Y \le c)$

Proof: Because of E(X|Y) = Y, we have $E(X; Y \le c) = E(Y; Y \le c)$ for every c by the definition of conditional expectation. Because $X, Y \in \mathcal{L}^1(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, P)$, so

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &= \mathsf{E}(\mathsf{X} - \mathsf{Y}; \mathsf{Y} \leqslant c) \\ &= \mathsf{E}(\mathsf{X} - \mathsf{Y}; \mathsf{X} > c, \mathsf{Y} \leqslant c) + \mathsf{E}(\mathsf{X} - \mathsf{Y}; \mathsf{X} \leqslant c, \mathsf{Y} \leqslant c) \end{aligned}$$

Consider P(X < Y), note that event $\{X < Y\} = \bigcup_{c} \{X < c < Y\}$, and

$$\{X < c - \frac{1}{n} < c + \frac{1}{n} < Y\} \uparrow \{X < c < Y\}$$

If P(X < Y) > 0, $\exists c, n, s.t. \ P(X < c - \frac{1}{n} < c + \frac{1}{n} < Y) = p > 0$, hence,

$$\mathsf{E}(\mathsf{X}-\mathsf{Y};\mathsf{X}>c,\mathsf{Y}\leqslant c)\geqslant \frac{2}{n}\mathsf{P}(\mathsf{X}< c-\frac{1}{n}< c+\frac{1}{n}<\mathsf{Y})=\frac{2p}{n}>0$$

And the $E(X-Y;X\leqslant c,Y\leqslant c)$ must be zero because the symmetric in X,Y, we get $E(X-Y;Y\leqslant c)>0$, it is impossible. Therefore P(X< Y)=0.

We can prove P(X > Y) = 0 from E(Y|X) = X use the same way. Hence P(X = Y) = 1.