

**TENANCY TRIBUNAL** - Hamilton | Kirikiriroa

APPLICANT: Monarch Realty Limited T/A Harcourts Property  
Management As Agent For Trevor Roberts  
Landlord

RESPONDENT: Pipi Emily Te Tomo  
Tenant

TENANCY ADDRESS: 359A Kahikatea Drive, Dinsdale, Hamilton 3204

**ORDER**

1. No application for suppression has been made in this case and no suppression orders apply around publication of this decision.
2. Pipi Emily Te Tomo must pay Monarch Realty Limited T/A Harcourts Property Management As Agent For Trevor Roberts \$2,505.75 immediately, calculated as shown in table below.
3. The Bond Centre is to pay the bond of \$1,440.00 (3437367-012) to Monarch Realty Limited T/A Harcourts Property Management As Agent For Trevor Roberts immediately.

Description	Landlord	Tenant
Rent arrears to 11/5/2023	\$64.29	
Holes in walls - bedroom and lounge	\$500.00	
Window repairs	\$116.44	
Lock/key replacement	\$730.00	
Lawns and Garden work	\$250.70	
Rubbish removal	\$799.31	
Repairs: replace and repair 10 doors	\$1,200.00	
Replace clothesline	\$264.57	
Filing fee reimbursement	\$20.44	
<b>Total award</b>	<b>\$3,945.75</b>	
Bond	\$1,440.00	
<b>Total payable by Tenant to Landlord</b>	<b>\$2,505.75</b>	

**Reasons:**

1. Only the applicant landlord attended the hearing.
2. The landlord has applied for rent arrears, compensation, refund of the bond, and reimbursement of the filing fee following the end of the tenancy.

*How much is owed for rent?*

3. The tenancy ended on 11 May 2023. The landlord provided rent records which prove the amount owing at the end of the tenancy.

*Did the tenant comply with their obligations at the end of the tenancy?*

4. At the end of the tenancy the tenant must leave the premises reasonably clean and tidy, remove all rubbish, return all keys and security devices, and leave all chattels provided for their benefit. See section 40(1)(e)(ii)-(v) Residential Tenancies Act 1986. The tenant is required to replace worn out smoke alarm batteries during the tenancy. See section 40(1)(ca) Residential Tenancies Act 1986. The tenant must also replace standard light bulbs.
5. The tenant did not leave the premises reasonably clean and tidy, and did not remove all rubbish. The lawns and gardens were overgrown and an area of lawn required replanting.
6. The tenant did not return the keys.
7. The amounts ordered are proved.

*Is the tenant responsible for the damage to the premises?*

8. A landlord must prove that damage to the premises occurred during the tenancy and is more than fair wear and tear. If this is established, to avoid liability, the tenant must prove they did not carelessly or intentionally cause or permit the damage. Tenants are liable for the actions of people at the premises with their permission. See sections 40(2)(a), 41 and 49B RTA.
9. Where the damage is caused carelessly, and is covered by the landlord's insurance, the tenant's liability is limited to the lesser of the insurance excess or four weeks' rent (or four weeks' market rent in the case of a tenant paying income-related rent). See section 49B(3)(a) RTA.
10. Where the damage is careless and is not covered by the landlord's insurance, the tenant's liability is limited to four weeks' rent (or market rent). See section

49B(3)(b) RTA. Where insurance money is irrecoverable because of the tenant's conduct, the property is treated as if it is not insured against the damage. See section 49B(3A)(a) RTA.

11. Tenants are liable for the cost of repairing damage that is intentional or which results from any activity at the premises that is an imprisonable offence. This applies to anything the tenant does and anything done by a person they are responsible for. See section 49B(1) RTA.
12. Damage is intentional where a person intends to cause damage and takes the necessary steps to achieve that purpose. Damage is also intentional where a person does something, or allows a situation to continue, knowing that damage is a certainty. See *Guo v Korck* [2019] NZHC 1541.
13. The following damage was caused during the tenancy: several walls and doors were damaged, a window had been repaired but with glass that did not fit and the clothesline which was less than a year old was damaged. The damage is more than fair wear and tear, and the tenant has not disproved liability for the damage.
14. The amounts ordered are proved.
15. I have taken into account betterment and depreciation. The landlord should be returned to the position they would have been in had the tenant not breached their obligations, and should not be better or worse off. In calculating depreciation, I have taken into account the age and condition of the items at the start of the tenancy and their likely useful lifespan. The claim for replacement doors is reduced because there is an element of fair wear and tear with the door hardware. The claim for repairing walls is only for repairs and not painting, it is allowed in full.
16. Because Monarch Realty Limited T/A Harcourts Property Management As Agent For Trevor Roberts has wholly succeeded with the claim I must reimburse the filing fee.



J Maher  
27 September 2023

## **Please read carefully:**

Visit [justice.govt.nz/tribunals/tenancy/rehearings-appeals](https://justice.govt.nz/tribunals/tenancy/rehearings-appeals) for more information on rehearings and appeals.

### **Rehearings**

You can apply for a rehearing if you believe that a substantial wrong or miscarriage of justice has happened. For example:

- you did not get the letter telling you the date of the hearing, **or**
- the adjudicator improperly admitted or rejected evidence, **or**
- new evidence, relating to the original application, has become available.

You must give reasons and evidence to support your application for a rehearing.

A rehearing will not be granted just because you disagree with the decision.

You must apply within five working days of the decision using the Application for Rehearing form: [justice.govt.nz/assets/Documents/Forms/TT-Application-for-rehearing.pdf](https://justice.govt.nz/assets/Documents/Forms/TT-Application-for-rehearing.pdf)

### **Right of Appeal**

Both the landlord and the tenant can file an appeal. You should file your appeal at the District Court where the original hearing took place. The cost for an appeal is \$200. You must apply within 10 working days after the decision is issued using this Appeal to the District Court form: [justice.govt.nz/tribunals/tenancy/rehearings-appeals](https://justice.govt.nz/tribunals/tenancy/rehearings-appeals)

### **Grounds for an appeal**

You can appeal if you think the decision was wrong, but not because you don't like the decision. For some cases, there'll be no right to appeal. For example, you can't appeal:

- against an interim order
- a final order for the payment of less than \$1000
- a final order to undertake work worth less than \$1000.

### **Enforcement**

Where the Tribunal made an order about money or property this is called a **civil debt**. The Ministry of Justice Collections Team can assist with enforcing civil debt. You can contact the collections team on **0800 233 222** or go to [justice.govt.nz/fines/civil-debt](https://justice.govt.nz/fines/civil-debt) for forms and information.

### **Notice to a party ordered to pay money or vacate premises, etc.**

Failure to comply with any order may result in substantial additional costs for enforcement. It may also involve being ordered to appear in the District Court for an examination of your means or seizure of your property.

---

If you require further help or information regarding this matter, visit [tenancy.govt.nz/disputes/enforcing-decisions](https://tenancy.govt.nz/disputes/enforcing-decisions) or phone Tenancy Services on 0800 836 262.

Mēna ka hiahia koe ki ētahi atu awhina, kōrero ranei mo tēnei take, haere ki tenei ipurangi [tenancy.govt.nz/disputes/enforcing-decisions](https://tenancy.govt.nz/disputes/enforcing-decisions), waea atu ki Ratonga Takirua ma runga 0800 836 262 ranei.

A manaomia nisi faamatalaga poo se fesoasoani, e uiga i lau mataupu, asiasi ifo le matou aupega tafailagi: [tenancy.govt.nz/disputes/enforcing-decisions](https://tenancy.govt.nz/disputes/enforcing-decisions), pe fesootai mai le Tenancy Services i le numera 0800 836 262.