

# Discrete Structures

## Assignment

Name: M. Istafa Malik

Section: 4A

Roll: P19-0033

Knights always lie

Knaves always speaks the truth

Spies can either lie or tell the truth.

Now, we encounter three people A, B and C.

We know two of them are knights and one is a knave.

### Propositions:-

$P_1 = A$  is a knight ,  $\neg P_1 = A$  is not a knight

$P_2 = A$  is a knave ,  $\neg P_2 = A$  is not a knave

$P_3 = A$  is a spy ,  $\neg P_3 = A$  is not a spy.

$Q_1 = B$  is a knight ,  $\neg Q_1 = B$  is not a knight

$Q_2 = B$  is a knave ,  $\neg Q_2 = B$  is not a knave

$Q_3 = B$  is a spy ,  $\neg Q_3 = B$  is not a spy.

$R_1 = C$  is a knight ,  $\neg R_1 = C$  is not a knight

$R_2 = C$  is a knave ,  $\neg R_2 = C$  is not a knave

$R_3 = C$  is a spy ,  $\neg R_3 = C$  is not a spy.

a) A: C is the knave  $\therefore R_2$

B: A is the knight  $\therefore P_1$

C: I am the spy  $\therefore R_3$

### Case 1: Knight, Knight, Knave

(2)

i)  $R_2 = F$

ii)  $P_1 = F$

iii)  $R_3 = T$

Now, put values

i)  $T \neq F$

Hence, does not hold

### Case 2: Knight, Knave, Knight

i)  $R_2 = F$

ii)  $P_1 = T$

iii)  $R_3 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $F = F$

ii)  $T = T$

iii)  $F = F$

Hence, it holds

### Case 3: Knave, Knight, Knight

i)  $R_2 = T$

ii)  $P_1 = F$

iii)  $R_3 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $F \neq T$

~~Hence~~ Hence, does not hold

Hence, we have a result

A = Knight

B = Knave

C = Knight

- (b) A: I am the knight  
 B: I am the knave  
 C: B is the knight

- i)  $P_1$   
 ii)  $Q_2$   
 iii)  $Q_1$

### Case 1: Knight, Knight, Knave

- i)  $P_1 = F$   
 ii)  $Q_2 = F$   
 iii)  $Q_1 = T$

Now, put values

- i)  $F \neq T$

Hence, does not hold

### Case 2: Knight, Knave, Knight

- i)  $P_1 = F$   
 ii)  $Q_2 = T$   
 iii)  $Q_1 = F$

Now, put values

- i)  $T \neq F$

Hence, does not hold

### Case 3: Knave, Knight, Knight

- i)  $P_1 = F$   
 ii)  $Q_2 = T$   
 iii)  $Q_1 = T$

Now, put values

- i)  $F = F$   
 ii)  $F \neq T$

Hence, does not hold

Here, we cannot determine which is a knight or a knave because there are only three cases. More cases are required to get the accurate result.



(4)

Case 4: Knight, Knave, Knave

- i)  $P_1 = F$
- ii)  $Q_2 = T$
- iii)  $Q_1 = T$

Now, put values

$$i) T \neq F$$

Hence, does not hold.

Case 5:

Knave, Knight, Knave

- i)  $P_1 = T$
- ii)  $Q_2 = F$
- iii)  $Q_1 = T$

Now, put values

$$i) F \neq T$$

Hence, does not hold

Case 6: Knave, knave, Knight

- i)  $P_1 = T$
- ii)  $Q_2 = T$
- iii)  $Q_1 = F$

Now, put values

$$i) F \neq T$$

Hence, does not hold

Case 7: Knave, Knave, Knave

- i)  $P_1 = T$
- ii)  $Q_2 = T$
- iii)  $Q_1 = T$

Now, put values

$$i) F \neq T$$

Hence, does not hold

### Case 8: Knight, Knight, Knight

(5)

i)  $P_1 = F$

ii)  $Q_1 = F$

iii)  $R_1 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $T \neq F$

Hence, does not hold

Result:

We cannot identify which are the knights and knaves.

- c) A: I am the knave  
B: I am the knave  
C: I am the knave

i)  $P_2$

ii)  $Q_2$

iii)  $R_2$

### Case 1: Knight, Knight, Knave

i)  $P_2 = F$

ii)  $Q_2 = F$

iii)  $R_2 = T$

i)  $F = F$

ii)  $F = F$

iii)  $T = T$

Hence, it holds.

### Case 2: Knight, Knave, Knight

i)  $P_2 = F$

ii)  $Q_2 = T$

iii)  $R_2 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $F = F$

ii)  $T = T$

iii)  $F = F$

Hence, it holds.

### Case 3: Knave, Knight, Knight

⑥

$$P_2 = T$$

$$Q_2 = F$$

$$R_2 = F$$

Now, put values

$$i) T = T$$

$$ii) F = F$$

$$iii) F = F$$

Hence, it holds

Result: Evidence suggests that all the cases hold so there is no unique solution, so we can't determine who is who.

d) A: I am the knight

B: A is testing the Truth

C: I am the spy.

$$i) P_1 = F$$

$$ii) Q_1 = F$$

$$iii) R_3 = T$$

### Case 1: Knight, Knight, Knave

~~i)  $P_2 = T$~~  Now put values

$$i) T \neq F$$

Hence, does not hold.

### Case 2: Knight, Knave, Knight

$$i) P_1 = F$$

$$ii) ~~Q_1 = F~~$$

$$iii) R_3 = F$$

Now, put values

$$i) T \neq F$$

Hence, does not hold.



Case 3: Knave, Knight, Knight

⑦

i)  $P_1 = T$

ii)  $Q_3 = F$

iii)  $R_3 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $T \neq F$

~~Case 3~~ Hence, does not hold

Case 4: Knight, Knave, Knave

i)  $P_1 = F$

ii)  $Q_3 = T$

iii)  $R_3 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $T \neq F$

Hence, does not hold.

Case 5: Knave, Knight, Knave

i)  $P_1 = T$

ii)  $Q_3 = F$

iii)  $R_3 = T$

Now, put values

i)  $F \neq T$

Hence, does not hold.

Case 6: Knave, Knave, Knight

i)  $P_1 = T$

ii)  $Q_3 = T$

iii)  $R_3 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $F \neq T$

Hence, does not hold.

Case 7: Knight, Knight, Knight

i)  $P_1 = F$

ii)  $Q_3 = F$

iii)  $R_3 = F$

Now, put values

i)  $T \neq F$

Hence, does not hold.

Case 8: Knave, Knave, Knave

i)  $P_1 = T$

ii)  $Q_3 = T$

iii)  $R_3 = T$

Now, put values

i)  $F \neq T$

Hence, does not hold

Result: None of the cases holds, so we cannot identify that which ones are knaves and which ones are knights.