# **Lobyerev V1**

Itai van Rijn

February 24, 2019

# implementation of Lobyerev & Hoffman (2008) Selectivity model

This document describes the implementation of the selectivity algorithm described in Lobyrev, Feodor, and Matthew J. Hoffman. "A morphological and geometric method for estimating the selectivity of gill nets." Reviews in Fish Biology and Fisheries 28.4 (2018): 909-924.

### Step 1: Import field data on fish catch and gill net properties

#### **Step 1.1: Import catch data**

Catch data structure: Column 1: 'Mesh\_size' - name of the net (later connected to net properties under the same name) Column 2: 'Length\_group' - Fish total length (cm) Column 3: 'Wedged' - Number of wedged individuals Column 4: 'Tangled' - Number of tangled individuals

```
Catch.data.Cod <- read.csv("~/kinneret modeling/selectivity/R code
Feodor paper/Data/Catch data Cod.csv")
#Show the first 6 lines:
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
     Mesh_size Length_group Wedged Tangled
## 1
            20
                          14
                                  2
## 2
            20
                          16
                                  20
                                           5
## 3
            20
                          18
                                  15
                                          12
## 4
            20
                          20
                                 11
                                           8
## 5
            20
                          22
                                  20
                                          18
## 6
            20
                          24
                                          24
```

#### Step 1.2: Import table of net properties

Net properties data structure: (See Figure 2 in paper) Column 1: 'Mesh\_size' - mesh size (knot to knot) (mm) Column 2: 'y' - Smaller of the angels between mesh threads

```
net.properties <- read.csv("~/kinneret modeling/selectivity/R code
Feodor paper/Data/net properties.csv")
#Show table:
print(net.properties)
## Mesh_size y
## 1 20 60</pre>
```

```
## 2
             25 60
## 3
             30 60
Step 1.3: Add angel in Radian
net.properties$Radian=0.018*net.properties$y
#Show table:
print(net.properties)
##
     Mesh size y Radian
## 1
            20 60
                     1.08
## 2
             25 60
                     1.08
## 3
             30 60
                     1.08
Step 1.4: Define the angel between the end of upper and lower jaws (phi)
phi_deg=7
phi_radian=0.018*phi_deg
Step 1.5: Calculate the jaw length approximated by the linear function
slope jaw=1.02
intecept_jaw=3.41
Catch.data.Cod$Jaw_length=intecept_jaw +
(slope jaw*Catch.data.Cod$Length group)
#Calculate h
Catch.data.Cod$h=Catch.data.Cod$Jaw_length * sin(phi_radian) * 2
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
##
     Mesh_size Length_group Wedged Tangled Jaw_length
                                                                 h
## 1
             20
                          14
                                   2
                                           2
                                                   17.69 4.446094
                                           5
## 2
             20
                          16
                                  20
                                                   19.73 4.958815
## 3
             20
                          18
                                  15
                                          12
                                                   21.77 5.471535
## 4
                          20
            20
                                  11
                                           8
                                                   23.81 5.984256
## 5
             20
                          22
                                  20
                                          18
                                                   25.85 6.496977
            20
                          24
                                  32
                                          24
                                                   27.89 7.009698
## 6
Step 1.6: Merge the catch data with the net data
Catch.data.Cod=merge(Catch.data.Cod,net.properties,by="Mesh size")
#print first 6 lines
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
##
     Mesh_size Length_group Wedged Tangled Jaw_length
                                                                 h y
Radian
## 1
                                   2
                                           2
             20
                          14
                                                   17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
## 2
            20
                                  20
                                           5
                                                   19.73 4.958815 60
                          16
1.08
## 3
            20
                          18
                                  15
                                          12
                                                   21.77 5.471535 60
1.08
## 4
            20
                          20
                                  11
                                           8
                                                   23.81 5.984256 60
1.08
```

## 5

1.08

20

22

20

18

25.85 6.496977 60

```
## 6 20 24 32 24 27.89 7.009698 60
1.08
```

## Step 2: Calculate P(O|C) and P(Th|C)

For calculating P(0|C) use eq. 4 in the paper

```
#Calculate sin, cos, tan
Catch.data.Cod\sin=\sin(0.5*Catch.data.Cod\sRadian)
Catch.data.Cod$cos=cos(0.5*Catch.data.Cod$Radian)
Catch.data.Cod$tan=tan(0.5*Catch.data.Cod$Radian)
#Calculate P(0|C) Eq. 4
Catch.data.Cod$POC=(((Catch.data.Cod$cos * Catch.data.Cod$Mesh size)-
Catch.data.Cod$h)*((Catch.data.Cod$sin*Catch.data.Cod$Mesh_size)-
(Catch.data.Cod$tan*Catch.data.Cod$h)))/(Catch.data.Cod$cos*Catch.data.
Cod$sin*(Catch.data.Cod$Mesh_size)^2)
#Calculate P(Th/c)
Catch.data.Cod$PThC=1-Catch.data.Cod$POC
#Print first 6 rows
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
##
     Mesh_size Length_group Wedged Tangled Jaw_length
                                                              h y
Radian
## 1
            20
                         14
                                 2
                                          2
                                                 17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
                                          5
## 2
            20
                         16
                                20
                                                 19.73 4.958815 60
1.08
## 3
                         18
                                         12
                                                 21.77 5.471535 60
            20
                                15
1.08
## 4
            20
                         20
                                11
                                          8
                                                 23.81 5.984256 60
1.08
            20
                         22
                                                 25.85 6.496977 60
## 5
                                20
                                         18
1.08
## 6
            20
                         24
                                32
                                                 27.89 7.009698 60
                                         24
1.08
##
                                         POC
                                                  PThC
          sin
                    cos
                              tan
## 1 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5488078 0.4511922
## 2 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5054167 0.4945833
## 3 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4638123 0.5361877
## 4 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4239946 0.5760054
## 5 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3859636 0.6140364
## 6 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3497193 0.6502807
```

## Step 3: Calculate P(W|E)

!!!!I just import the data from your Excel, but do not know how the calculation was made

```
PWE <- read.csv("~/kinneret modeling/selectivity/R code Feodor
paper/Data/PWE.csv", stringsAsFactors=FALSE)</pre>
```

```
#print the first 6 lines
print(head(PWE))
##
    Mesh_size Length_group PWE
## 1
            20
                         14 0.35
## 2
            20
                         16 0.69
## 3
            20
                         18 0.81
            20
                         20 0.88
## 4
## 5
            20
                         22 0.88
## 6
            20
                         24 1.00
#merge with table 'Catch.data.Cod'
Catch.data.Cod=merge(Catch.data.Cod,PWE ,by=c("Mesh_size",
"Length_group"))
```

### Step 4: Calculate Eq. 2

#### Step 4.1: Calculate P(E|O) by the linear equation

```
##Get the min and max size groups for each net
#Create table
net PEO=data.frame(Mesh size=unique(Catch.data.Cod$Mesh size))
#Length group interval
Length group interval=2
#The minimal size for each net
min wedged=data.frame(Catch.data.Cod %>%
   filter(!is.na(Wedged)) %>%
  group by(Mesh size) %>%
  summarize(min_size = min(Length_group, na.rm = TRUE)))
#The maximal size for each net
max_wedged=data.frame(Catch.data.Cod %>%
   filter(!is.na(Wedged)) %>%
  group by(Mesh size) %>%
  summarize(max size = max(Length group, na.rm = TRUE)))
net_PEO=merge(net_PEO,min_wedged,by="Mesh_size")
net PEO=merge(net PEO,max wedged,by="Mesh size")
#Substract and add the Length group interval
net_PEO$min_size=net_PEO$min_size-(Length_group_interval/2)
net PEO$max size=net PEO$max size+(Length group interval/2)
#Calculate the linear function
net_PEO$slope=-1/(net_PEO$max_size-net_PEO$min_size)
net PEO$intercept=1-(net PEO$slope*net PEO$min size)
#print
print(net_PE0)
##
     Mesh size min size max size
                                       slope intercept
## 1
            20
                     13
                              31 -0.05555556 1.722222
## 2
            25
                     17
                              35 -0.05555556 1.944444
## 3
            30
                     21
                              37 -0.06250000 2.312500
```

```
#Calculate PEO
#Merge slope and intercept to data
Catch.data.Cod=merge(Catch.data.Cod,net_PEO,by="Mesh_size")
Catch.data.Cod$PEO=Catch.data.Cod$intercept+(Catch.data.Cod$Length grou
p)*Catch.data.Cod$slope
#Remove PEO values if no fish were wedged
Catch.data.Cod[is.na(Catch.data.Cod$Wedged),"PEO"]=NA
#Print first 6 lines
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
     Mesh size Length group Wedged Tangled Jaw length
Radian
## 1
            20
                         14
                                 2
                                          2
                                                 17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
## 2
                                20
                                          5
                                                 19.73 4.958815 60
            20
                         16
1.08
## 3
            20
                         18
                                15
                                         12
                                                 21.77 5.471535 60
1.08
## 4
            20
                         20
                                11
                                          8
                                                 23.81 5.984256 60
1.08
## 5
            20
                         22
                                20
                                         18
                                                 25.85 6.496977 60
1.08
## 6
            20
                         24
                                32
                                         24
                                                 27.89 7.009698 60
1.08
##
          sin
                                         POC
                                                  PThC PWE min size
                    cos
                              tan
max size
## 1 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5488078 0.4511922 0.35
                                                                  13
31
## 2 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5054167 0.4945833 0.69
                                                                  13
31
## 3 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4638123 0.5361877 0.81
                                                                  13
## 4 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4239946 0.5760054 0.88
                                                                  13
31
## 5 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3859636 0.6140364 0.88
                                                                  13
## 6 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3497193 0.6502807 1.00
                                                                  13
31
           slope intercept
##
                                 PE<sub>0</sub>
## 1 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.9444444
## 2 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.8333333
## 3 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.7222222
## 4 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.6111111
## 5 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.5000000
## 6 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.3888889
```

#### Step 4.2: Claculate Eq.2

Catch.data.Cod\$Ntotal=Catch.data.Cod\$Wedged/(Catch.data.Cod\$POC\*Catch.data.Cod\$PWE\*Catch.data.Cod\$PEO)

```
#Print first 6 lines
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
     Mesh_size Length_group Wedged Tangled Jaw_length
                                                             h y
Radian
## 1
            20
                         14
                                 2
                                         2
                                                17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
## 2
            20
                                20
                                         5
                                                19.73 4.958815 60
                         16
1.08
## 3
            20
                         18
                                15
                                        12
                                                21.77 5.471535 60
1.08
## 4
            20
                         20
                                11
                                         8
                                                23.81 5.984256 60
1.08
## 5
            20
                         22
                                20
                                        18
                                                25.85 6.496977 60
1.08
                                                27.89 7.009698 60
## 6
                         24
                                        24
            20
                                32
1.08
##
                                        POC
                                                 PThC PWE min size
          sin
                    cos
                              tan
max_size
## 1 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5488078 0.4511922 0.35
                                                                  13
## 2 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5054167 0.4945833 0.69
                                                                  13
## 3 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4638123 0.5361877 0.81
                                                                  13
31
## 4 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4239946 0.5760054 0.88
                                                                  13
## 5 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3859636 0.6140364 0.88
                                                                  13
31
## 6 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3497193 0.6502807 1.00
                                                                  13
31
##
           slope intercept
                                 PE0
                                        Ntotal
## 1 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.9444444 11.02466
## 2 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.8333333 68.81967
## 3 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.7222222 55.28320
## 4 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.6111111 48.24247
## 5 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.5000000 117.76900
## 6 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.3888889 235.29074
```

### **Step 5: Calculate CPUE**

(table 21)

```
#Define the number of trials
n_trials=11
#Aggregate catch for each mesh size
Catch.data.Cod$CPUE=rowSums(Catch.data.Cod[,c("Wedged","Tangled")],na.r
m=T)/n_trials
#Print first 6 lines
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
```

```
Mesh size Length group Wedged Tangled Jaw length
Radian
## 1
            20
                         14
                                 2
                                         2
                                                17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
## 2
            20
                                20
                                         5
                                                19.73 4.958815 60
                         16
1.08
## 3
            20
                         18
                                15
                                        12
                                                21.77 5.471535 60
1.08
## 4
            20
                         20
                                11
                                         8
                                                23.81 5.984256 60
1.08
## 5
            20
                         22
                                20
                                                25.85 6.496977 60
                                        18
1.08
                                                27.89 7.009698 60
## 6
            20
                         24
                                32
                                        24
1.08
##
          sin
                              tan
                                        POC
                                                 PThC PWE min size
                    cos
max size
## 1 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5488078 0.4511922 0.35
                                                                  13
## 2 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5054167 0.4945833 0.69
                                                                  13
31
## 3 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4638123 0.5361877 0.81
                                                                  13
## 4 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4239946 0.5760054 0.88
                                                                  13
31
## 5 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3859636 0.6140364 0.88
                                                                  13
## 6 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3497193 0.6502807 1.00
                                                                  13
31
##
           slope intercept
                                 PEO
                                        Ntotal
                                                    CPUE
## 1 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.9444444 11.02466 0.3636364
## 2 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.8333333 68.81967 2.2727273
## 3 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.7222222 55.28320 2.4545455
## 4 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.6111111 48.24247 1.7272727
## 5 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.5000000 117.76900 3.4545455
## 6 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.3888889 235.29074 5.0909091
```

**Step 6: Calculate Nw per hour** 

(table 23)

```
#Define number of hours of single (??) field trial
n_hours=12
Catch.data.Cod$Ntotal_per_hour=Catch.data.Cod$Ntotal/n_hours
#Print first 6 lines
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))

## Mesh_size Length_group Wedged Tangled Jaw_length h y
Radian
## 1 20 14 2 2 17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
```

## 2	20	16	20 5	19.73	4.958815	60
1.08						
## 3 1.08	20	18	15 12	21.77	5.471535	60
## 4	20	20	11 8	23.81	5.984256	60
1.08 ## 5	20	22	20 18	25.85	6.496977	60
1.08						
## 6	20	24	32 24	27.89	7.009698	60
1.08						
	in cos	taı	n POC	PThC	PWE min_	_size
max_size ## 1 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5488078 0.4511922 0.35 13						
	36 0.8577087	0.599429	6 0.5488078	0.4511922	0.35	13
31 ## 2 0 51413	36 0.8577087	A E004204	5 A FAF4167	0 4045022	0 60	13
31	30 0.83//08/	0.5994290	0.5054167	0.4945655	0.09	13
	36 0.8577087	0.599429	5 0.4638123	0.5361877	0.81	13
31	30 0.0377007	0.555 (25)	0.1030123	0.3301077	0.01	13
	36 0.8577087	0.599429	6 0.4239946	0.5760054	0.88	13
31						
## 5 0.51413	36 0.8577087	0.599429	6 0.3859636	0.6140364	0.88	13
31						
	36 0.8577087	0.599429	5 0.3497193	0.6502807	1.00	13
31						
## slope intercept PEO Ntotal CPUE						
Ntotal_per_hour ## 1 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.9444444 11.02466 0.3636364						
0.9187218						
## 2 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.8333333 68.81967 2.2727273						
5.7349724						
## 3 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.7222222 55.28320 2.4545455						
4.6069330						
## 4 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.6111111 48.24247 1.7272727						
4.0202057						
## 5 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.5000000 117.76900 3.4545455 9.8140830						
## 6 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.3888889 235.29074 5.0909091 19.6075616						
13.0010						

# **Step 7:**

## Step 7.1: SLI,t for each length class as Ntotal-Qt

# (table 24)

```
Catch.data.Cod$SL_1_t=Catch.data.Cod$Ntotal_per_hour-
Catch.data.Cod$CPUE
#Print first 6 lines
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
```

```
Mesh size Length group Wedged Tangled Jaw length
Radian
## 1
            20
                        14
                                2
                                        2
                                               17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
## 2
                                20
                                        5
                                               19.73 4.958815 60
            20
                        16
1.08
## 3
            20
                        18
                                15
                                       12
                                               21.77 5.471535 60
1.08
## 4
                         20
                                        8
                                               23.81 5.984256 60
            20
                                11
1.08
## 5
                                               25.85 6.496977 60
            20
                         22
                                20
                                       18
1.08
                                               27.89 7.009698 60
## 6
            20
                         24
                                32
                                       24
1.08
##
                             tan
                                       POC
                                                 PThC PWE min size
          sin
                    cos
max size
## 1 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5488078 0.4511922 0.35
                                                                13
## 2 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5054167 0.4945833 0.69
                                                                13
31
## 3 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4638123 0.5361877 0.81
                                                                13
## 4 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4239946 0.5760054 0.88
                                                                 13
31
## 5 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3859636 0.6140364 0.88
                                                                 13
## 6 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3497193 0.6502807 1.00
                                                                 13
31
##
           slope intercept
                                 PEO
                                                   CPUE
                                       Ntotal
Ntotal per hour
## 1 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.9444444 11.02466 0.3636364
0.9187218
## 2 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.8333333 68.81967 2.2727273
5.7349724
## 3 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.7222222 55.28320 2.4545455
4.6069330
## 4 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.6111111 48.24247 1.7272727
4.0202057
## 5 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.5000000 117.76900 3.4545455
9.8140830
## 6 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.3888889 235.29074 5.0909091
19.6075616
##
         SL 1 t
## 1 0.5550854
## 2 3.4622451
## 3 2.1523876
## 4 2.2929329
## 5 6.3595376
## 6 14.5166525
```

#### Step 7.2: N\_AP calculation

First the table of Nlim (table 22c) is defined, in reality it is in input

!!!Notice- value of tau is very sensitive to the sum of the CPUE

```
###The next data frame will be an experimental input
n lim=data.frame(Mesh size=c(20,25,30),Nlim=c(36,32,12))
#Sum CPUE per net
CPUE=data.frame(Catch.data.Cod %>%
  group by(Mesh size) %>%
  summarize(CPUE sum = sum(CPUE, na.rm = TRUE)))
#merge to n lim table
n lim=merge(n lim,CPUE,by="Mesh size")
#Calculate tau (table 25)
n_lim$tau=n_hours/(-log(1-(n_lim$CPUE/n_lim$Nlim)))
n lim$N AP=((n lim$Nlim*(1.71))/n lim$tau)*n hours
print(n lim)
##
    Mesh size Nlim CPUE sum
                                           N AP
                                   tau
                 36 25.09091 10.050904 73.49787
## 1
            20
            25
## 2
                 32 26.27273 6.974731 94.14557
## 3
            30
                 12 11.72727 3.171088 77.65157
```

Step 7.3: Size specific N\_AP

!!!In table 26 you use data from table 24 (SL)- is SL=0 if there is no value for this length group in table 24?

```
#Replace NA's in column 'SL L t' with 0
Catch.data.Cod[is.na(Catch.data.Cod$SL_l_t), "SL_l_t"]=0
Catch.data.Cod=merge(Catch.data.Cod,n lim,by="Mesh size")
#Calculate N AP per size class
Catch.data.Cod$N_AP_size=(Catch.data.Cod$N_AP*(Catch.data.Cod$CPUE/Catc
h.data.Cod$CPUE sum))+Catch.data.Cod$SL 1 t
print(head(Catch.data.Cod))
##
     Mesh_size Length_group Wedged Tangled Jaw_length
                                                               h y
Radian
## 1
            20
                         14
                                  2
                                          2
                                                 17.69 4.446094 60
1.08
## 2
            20
                         16
                                 20
                                          5
                                                 19.73 4.958815 60
1.08
## 3
            20
                          18
                                 15
                                         12
                                                 21.77 5.471535 60
1.08
## 4
            20
                          20
                                 11
                                          8
                                                 23.81 5.984256 60
1.08
## 5
            20
                          22
                                 20
                                         18
                                                 25.85 6.496977 60
1.08
## 6
            20
                          24
                                 32
                                         24
                                                 27.89 7.009698 60
```

```
1.08
                                       POC
##
                                                PThC PWE min size
          sin
                   cos
                             tan
max size
## 1 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5488078 0.4511922 0.35
                                                                13
31
## 2 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.5054167 0.4945833 0.69
                                                                13
## 3 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4638123 0.5361877 0.81
                                                                13
## 4 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.4239946 0.5760054 0.88
                                                                13
31
## 5 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3859636 0.6140364 0.88
                                                                13
## 6 0.514136 0.8577087 0.5994296 0.3497193 0.6502807 1.00
                                                                13
31
                                PE0
##
           slope intercept
                                       Ntotal
                                                   CPUE
Ntotal_per_hour
## 1 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.9444444 11.02466 0.3636364
0.9187218
## 2 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.8333333 68.81967 2.2727273
5.7349724
## 3 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.7222222 55.28320 2.4545455
4,6069330
## 4 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.6111111 48.24247 1.7272727
4.0202057
## 5 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.5000000 117.76900 3.4545455
9.8140830
## 6 -0.05555556 1.722222 0.3888889 235.29074 5.0909091
19.6075616
         SL_l_t Nlim CPUE sum
##
                                 tau
                                         N AP N AP size
## 1 0.5550854
                 36 25.09091 10.0509 73.49787 1.620272
## 2 3.4622451
                 36 25.09091 10.0509 73.49787 10.119661
## 3 2.1523876
                 36 25.09091 10.0509 73.49787 9.342396
                 36 25.09091 10.0509 73.49787 7.352569
## 4 2.2929329
## 5 6.3595376
                 36 25.09091 10.0509 73.49787 16.478809
## 6 14.5166525
                 36 25.09091 10.0509 73.49787 29.429263
```

### **Step 8: Calculate selectivity**

(table 28)

```
##Calculate selectivity
Catch.data.Cod$selectivity=Catch.data.Cod$CPUE/Catch.data.Cod$Ntotal_pe
r_hour
##plot
Catch.data.Cod$Mesh_size_fac=as.character(Catch.data.Cod$Mesh_size)
ggplot(Catch.data.Cod, aes(x=Length_group, y=selectivity,
group=Mesh_size_fac)) +
    geom_line(aes(color=Mesh_size_fac))+
```

```
geom_point(aes(color=Mesh_size_fac))+
   labs(x = "length Group",y="Selectivity",color="Mesh Size")
## Warning: Removed 25 rows containing missing values (geom_path).
## Warning: Removed 25 rows containing missing values (geom_point).
```

