

# Notes on perturbations of spherically symmetric spacetimes

Justin L. Ripley  
lloydripley[at]gmail[dot]com

June 15, 2023

## **Abstract**

We start by reviewing the Einstein equations in spherical symmetry. We then write down the perturbed Einstein equations about a spherically symmetric background. This is mostly a review of a covariant framework for the spherical decomposition of tensors [Mar04, MP05, GMG00, MGG01]. These notes are essentially an outgrowth of notes for the paper [RY18]. Please let me know if you find any typos/errors!

# Chapter 1

## General equations of motion

Our notation generally follows [Wal84]. For a textbook discussion of relativistic fluids, see [RZ13]. We consider the Einstein equations coupled to fluid matter

$$E_{\alpha\beta}^{(g)} \equiv R_{\alpha\beta} - \frac{1}{2}g_{\alpha\beta}R = \kappa T_{\alpha\beta}, \quad (1.1)$$

$$\nabla_\alpha T^{\alpha\beta} = 0, \quad (1.2)$$

$$E^{(g)} \equiv \nabla_\alpha J^\alpha = 0. \quad (1.3)$$

Here  $T_{\alpha\beta}$  is the stress-energy tensor, and  $J^\alpha$  is the fluid current.

We decompose the stress-energy tensor in terms of the fluid velocity vector  $u^\alpha$ , which is a unit timelike vector ( $u^\alpha u_\alpha = -1$ ):

$$T^{\alpha\beta} = \mathcal{E}u^\alpha u^\beta + \mathcal{P}\Delta^{\alpha\beta} + (\mathcal{Q}^\alpha u^\beta + \mathcal{Q}^\beta u^\alpha) + \mathcal{T}^{\alpha\beta}, \quad (1.4)$$

$$J^\alpha = \mathcal{N}u^\alpha + \mathcal{J}^\alpha, \quad (1.5)$$

where  $\mathcal{E}$ ,  $\mathcal{P}$ , and  $\mathcal{N}$  are scalars,  $\mathcal{Q}^\alpha$ ,  $\mathcal{J}^\alpha$  are vectors transverse to  $u^\alpha$  (for example  $u_\alpha \mathcal{Q}^\alpha = 0$ ), and  $\mathcal{T}^{\alpha\beta}$  is a symmetric transverse-traceless tensor with respect to  $u^\alpha$  (that is  $u_\alpha \mathcal{T}^{\alpha\beta} = \mathcal{T}^\alpha{}_\alpha = 0$ ), and

$$\Delta^{\alpha\beta} \equiv g^{\alpha\beta} + u^\alpha u^\beta, \quad (1.6)$$

projects onto the space transverse to  $u^\alpha$ . More specifically, for a  $d$  dimensional spacetime (we work in  $d = 4$  spacetime dimensions) we have

$$\mathcal{E} \equiv u_\alpha u_\beta T^{\alpha\beta}, \quad (1.7a)$$

$$\mathcal{P} \equiv \frac{1}{d-1} \Delta_{\alpha\beta} T^{\alpha\beta}, \quad (1.7b)$$

$$\mathcal{Q}_\alpha \equiv -\Delta_{\alpha\beta} u_\gamma T^{\beta\gamma}, \quad (1.7c)$$

$$\mathcal{N} \equiv -u_\gamma J^\gamma, \quad (1.7d)$$

$$\mathcal{J}_\alpha \equiv \Delta_{\alpha\beta} J^\beta, \quad (1.7e)$$

$$\mathcal{T}^{\alpha\beta} \equiv T^{\langle\alpha\beta\rangle}, \quad (1.7f)$$

where the angle brackets of a tensor is defined to be the symmetric transverse-traceless part of the tensor

$$X^{\langle\alpha\beta\rangle} \equiv \frac{1}{2} \left( \Delta^{\alpha\gamma} \Delta^{\beta\delta} (X_{\gamma\delta} + X_{\delta\gamma}) - \frac{2}{d-1} \Delta^{\alpha\beta} \Delta^{\gamma\delta} X_{\gamma\delta} \right). \quad (1.8)$$

So far we have only given a general decomposition of the stress-energy tensor with respect to a timelike unit vector  $u^\alpha$ . Specifying a specific fluid theory requires specifying *constitutive relations* for the quantities  $\mathcal{E}$ , ...,  $\mathcal{T}^{\alpha\beta}$ . It's worth noting that the trace of the stress-energy tensor is

$$T = -\mathcal{E} + 3\mathcal{P}, \quad (1.9)$$

that is, the heat flux and shear do not contribute to the trace. The conservation equation  $\nabla_\alpha T^{\alpha\beta} = 0$  can be split into a part parallel to  $u^\beta$  and perpendicular to  $u^\beta$  (the relativistic generalizations of the continuity and Euler-Navier-Stokes equations):

$$u^\alpha \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{E} + (\mathcal{E} + \mathcal{P}) \nabla_\alpha u^\alpha + \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{Q}^\alpha - u_\gamma u^\alpha \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{Q}^\gamma - u_\gamma \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{T}^{\alpha\gamma} = 0, \quad (1.10)$$

$$\begin{aligned} (\mathcal{E} + \mathcal{P}) u^\alpha \nabla_\alpha u^\beta + \mathcal{Q}^\alpha \nabla_\alpha u^\beta + \mathcal{Q}^\beta \nabla_\alpha u^\alpha + \Delta^{\alpha\beta} \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{P} \\ + \Delta^\beta_\gamma u^\alpha \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{Q}^\gamma + \Delta^\beta_\gamma \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{T}^{\alpha\gamma} = 0. \end{aligned} \quad (1.11)$$

The conservation of the current,  $\nabla_\alpha J^\alpha = 0$ , can be written as

$$u^\alpha \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{N} + \mathcal{N} \nabla_\alpha u^\alpha + \nabla_\alpha \mathcal{J}^\alpha = 0. \quad (1.12)$$

We consider perturbations of non-rotating neutron star solutions, that is perturbations of the Einstein-fluid system:

$$\delta \left( R_{\alpha\beta} - \kappa \left( T_{\alpha\beta} - \frac{1}{2} g_{\alpha\beta} T \right) \right) = 0, \quad (1.13)$$

$$\delta (\nabla_\alpha T^{\alpha\beta}) = 0, \quad (1.14)$$

$$\delta (\nabla_\alpha J^\alpha) = 0. \quad (1.15)$$

As we are perturbing about a spherically symmetric background, we can decompose linear perturbations according to how they transform under rotations (irreducible components of the rotation group). We consider perturbations of the metric  $\delta g_{\alpha\beta}$ , and Eulerian perturbations  $\delta u^\alpha$  of the fluid velocity.

## 1.1 Perturbation of the Ricci tensor

We start with the well-known identities [Wal84]

$$\delta R^\alpha_{\gamma\beta\delta} = \nabla_\beta \delta \Gamma^\alpha_{\delta\gamma} - \nabla_\delta \delta \Gamma^\alpha_{\beta\gamma}, \quad (1.16)$$

$$\delta\Gamma_{\alpha\beta}^{\gamma} = \frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}(\nabla_{\alpha}\delta g_{\delta\beta} + \nabla_{\beta}\delta g_{\delta\alpha} - \nabla_{\delta}\delta g_{\alpha\beta}). \quad (1.17)$$

We then have

$$\begin{aligned} \delta R_{\alpha\beta} &= \nabla_{\gamma}\delta\Gamma_{\alpha\beta}^{\gamma} - \nabla_{\beta}\delta\Gamma_{\alpha\gamma}^{\gamma} \\ &= -\frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}\nabla_{\gamma}\nabla_{\delta}\delta g_{\alpha\beta} + \frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}(\nabla_{\alpha}\nabla_{\gamma}\delta g_{\delta\beta} + \nabla_{\beta}\nabla_{\delta}\delta g_{\alpha\gamma} - \nabla_{\beta}\nabla_{\alpha}\delta g_{\delta\gamma}) \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}[\nabla_{\gamma}, \nabla_{\beta}]\delta g_{\delta\alpha} + \frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}[\nabla_{\gamma}, \nabla_{\alpha}]\delta g_{\delta\beta} \\ &= -\frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}\nabla_{\gamma}\nabla_{\delta}\delta g_{\alpha\beta} + \nabla_{(\alpha}v_{\beta)} - R_{\alpha}{}^{\gamma}{}_{\beta}{}^{\delta}\delta g_{\gamma\delta} + R^{\gamma}{}_{(\alpha}\delta g_{\beta)\gamma}, \end{aligned} \quad (1.18)$$

where we have defined

$$\boxed{v_{\mu} \equiv g^{\gamma\delta}\left(\nabla_{\gamma}\delta g_{\delta\mu} - \frac{1}{2}\nabla_{\mu}\delta g_{\gamma\delta}\right) = g^{\gamma\delta}\delta\Gamma_{\mu\gamma\delta}.} \quad (1.19)$$

Putting everything together, we have

$$\boxed{\delta R_{\alpha\beta} = -\frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}\nabla_{\gamma}\nabla_{\delta}\delta g_{\alpha\beta} - R_{\alpha}{}^{\gamma}{}_{\beta}{}^{\delta}\delta g_{\gamma\delta} + R^{\gamma}{}_{(\alpha}\delta g_{\beta)\gamma} + \nabla_{(\alpha}v_{\beta)}} \quad (1.20)$$

Some authors define the Lichnerowicz wave operator

$$\square_L\delta g_{\alpha\beta} \equiv -\frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}\nabla_{\gamma}\nabla_{\delta}\delta g_{\alpha\beta} - R_{\alpha}{}^{\gamma}{}_{\beta}{}^{\delta}\delta g_{\gamma\delta} + R^{\gamma}{}_{(\alpha}\delta g_{\beta)\gamma}. \quad (1.21)$$

The term  $\nabla_{(\alpha}v_{\beta)}$  can be thought as describing pure gauge fluctuations in the linearized Einstein equations. We see the linearized Einstein equations essentially take the form of a system of linear wave equations for the components of  $\delta g_{\alpha\beta}$ .

# Chapter 2

## Spherically symmetric spacetime decomposition

### 2.1 Spherically symmetric spacetime

The metric for a spherically symmetric spacetime can generally be split into the form (for a review see [AV10])

$$\boxed{ds^2 = \alpha_{ab}dx^a dx^b + r^2\Omega_{AB}d\theta^A d\theta^B}, \quad (2.1)$$

where  $r$  (the areal radius) depends on the coordinates  $x^a$  (e.g.  $x^a = (t, r)$  in Schwarzschild-like coordinates). Here  $\Omega_{AB}$  is the metric for the unit two-sphere. We define the metric compatible derivative for  $\alpha_{ab}$  with  $D_a$ , and the metric compatible derivative for  $\Omega_{AB}$  with  $D_A$ . The Ricci scalar for  $\alpha_{ab}$  is  $\mathcal{R}$ , and the Ricci scalar for  $\Omega_{AB}$  is 2. We raise/lower lower case Latin indices with  $\alpha_{ab}/\alpha^{ab}$ , and raise/lower upper case Latin indices with  $\Omega_{AB}/\Omega^{AB}$ . We define  $r_a \equiv D_a r$ ,  $r_{ab} \equiv D_a D_b r$ , and so on. We denote the Lie derivative with respect to a vector  $\xi^\mu$  with  $\mathcal{L}_\xi$ .

The nonzero Christoffel symbol components are

$$\Gamma_{ab}^c = {}^{(2)}\Gamma_{ab}^c, \quad (2.2a)$$

$$\Gamma_{AB}^c = -\Omega_{AB} r r^c, \quad (2.2b)$$

$$\Gamma_{aB}^C = \delta_B^C \frac{1}{r} r_a, \quad (2.2c)$$

$$\Gamma_{AB}^C = {}^{(2)}\Gamma_{AB}^C. \quad (2.2d)$$

The nonzero components of the Riemann and Ricci tensors, along with the Ricci scalar, are

$$R_{abcd} = \frac{1}{2}\mathcal{R}(\alpha_{ac}\alpha_{bd} - \alpha_{ad}\alpha_{bc}), \quad (2.3a)$$

$$R_{aAbB} = -r r_{ab} \Omega_{AB}, \quad (2.3b)$$

$$R_{ABCD} = (1 - r_a r^a) r^2 (\Omega_{AC} \Omega_{BD} - \Omega_{AD} \Omega_{BC}), \quad (2.3c)$$

$$R_{ab} = \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{R} \alpha_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{ab}, \quad (2.3d)$$

$$R_{AB} = (1 - r_a r^a - r r_a^a) \Omega_{AB}, \quad (2.3e)$$

$$R = \mathcal{R} - \frac{4}{r} r_c^c + \frac{2}{r^2} (1 - r_a r^a). \quad (2.3f)$$

The covariant Misner-Sharp mass  $m$  is defined by

$$\boxed{1 - \frac{2m}{r} \equiv D_a r D^a r.} \quad (2.4)$$

The spherically symmetric stress-energy tensor can be written as

$$T_{\alpha\beta} dx^\alpha dx^\beta = T_{ab} dx^a dx^b + T_2 r^2 \Omega_{AB} d\theta^A d\theta^B. \quad (2.5)$$

Making use of the fluid-decomposition of the stress-energy tensor, we can also write this as

$$\boxed{T_{\alpha\beta} dx^\alpha dx^\beta = (\mathcal{E} u_a u_b + (\mathcal{P} + \mathcal{T}) \Delta_{ab} + \mathcal{Q}_a u_b + \mathcal{Q}_b u_a) dx^a dx^b + \left(\mathcal{P} - \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{T}\right) r^2 \Omega_{AB} d\theta^A d\theta^B,} \quad (2.6)$$

where  $\Delta_{ab} \equiv u_a u_b + \alpha_{ab}$ . Generally we can include a shear term in spherical symmetry, although it is not present in perfect fluids. With this, the spherical decomposition of the spherically symmetric Einstein equations are

$$\frac{2}{r} (\alpha_{ab} r_c^c - r_{ab}) - \frac{1}{r^2} (1 - r_c r^c) \alpha_{ab} = \kappa ((\mathcal{E} + \mathcal{P} + \mathcal{T}) u_a u_b + \mathcal{P} \alpha_{ab} + \mathcal{Q}_a u_b + \mathcal{Q}_b u_a) \quad (2.7)$$

$$\frac{1}{r} r_c^c - \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{R} = \kappa \left( \mathcal{P} - \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{T} \right). \quad (2.8)$$

The spherical decomposition of the fluid equations are

$$u^a D_a \mathcal{E} + (\mathcal{E} + \mathcal{P}) \frac{1}{r^2} D_a (r^2 u^a) + \frac{1}{r^2} D_a (r^2 \mathcal{Q}^a) + u_b u^a D_a \mathcal{Q}^b = 0, \quad (2.9)$$

$$u^a D_a u^b + \mathcal{Q}^a D_a u^b + \mathcal{Q}^b \frac{1}{r^2} D_a (r^2 u^a) + \Delta^{ab} D_a \mathcal{P} + \Delta_c^b u^a D_a \mathcal{Q}^c = 0. \quad (2.10)$$

The spherical decomposition of the conservation of the current is

$$u^a D_a \mathcal{N} + \mathcal{N} \frac{1}{r^2} D_a (r^2 u^a) + \frac{1}{r^2} D_a (r^2 \mathcal{J}^a) = 0. \quad (2.11)$$

## 2.2 Perturbation of a spherically symmetric spacetime

Following [MP05], we consider linear perturbations of a spherically symmetric metric

$$ds^2 = (\alpha_{ab} + p_{ab}) dx^a dx^b + 2p_{aA} dx^a d\theta^A + (r^2 \Omega_{AB} + p_{AB}) d\theta^A d\theta^B. \quad (2.12)$$

The inverse metric to linear order is

$$g^{ab} = \alpha^{ab} - p^{ab}, \quad (2.13a)$$

$$g^{aB} = -\frac{1}{r^2} p^{aB}, \quad (2.13b)$$

$$g^{AB} = \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{AB} - \frac{1}{r^4} p^{AB}. \quad (2.13c)$$

The perturbations decomposed with respect to irreducible representations of the rotation group are

$$p_{ab} = \sum_{\ell, m} [h_\ell^m]_{ab} Y_\ell^m, \quad (2.14a)$$

$$p_{aA} = \sum_{\ell, m} ([j_\ell^m]_a [E_\ell^m]_A + [h_\ell^m]_a [S_\ell^m]_A), \quad (2.14b)$$

$$p_{AB} = \sum_{\ell, m} (r^2 [k_\ell^m] \Omega_{AB} Y_\ell^m + r^2 [g_\ell^m] [Z_\ell^m]_{AB} + [h_\ell^m]_2 [S_\ell^m]_{AB}). \quad (2.14c)$$

We next review how to construct gauge-invariant linear perturbations in the spherical harmonic decomposition [MP05]. Consider linear gauge transformations

$$\begin{aligned} g'_{\alpha\beta} &= g_{\alpha\beta} - \mathcal{L}_\Xi g_{\alpha\beta} \\ &= g_{\alpha\beta} - \nabla_\alpha \Xi_\beta - \nabla_\beta \Xi_\alpha. \end{aligned} \quad (2.15)$$

We decompose the gauge transformation vector as

$$\Xi_a = \sum_{\ell, m} [\xi_\ell^m]_a Y_\ell^m \quad (2.16a)$$

$$\Xi_A = \sum_{\ell, m} ([\xi_\ell^m]_+ [E_\ell^m]_A + [\xi_\ell^m]_- [S_\ell^m]_A). \quad (2.16b)$$

The components of the linearized metric transform as

$$[h_\ell^m]'_{ab} = [h_\ell^m]_{ab} - D_a [\xi_\ell^m]_b - D_b [\xi_\ell^m]_a \quad (2.17a)$$

$$[j_\ell^m]'_a = [j_\ell^m]_a - [\xi_\ell^m]_a - D_a [\xi_\ell^m]_+ + \frac{2}{r} r_a [\xi_\ell^m]_+, \quad (2.17b)$$

$$[k_\ell^m]' = [k_\ell^m] + \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} [\xi_\ell^m]_+ - \frac{2}{r} r^a [\xi_\ell^m]_a, \quad (2.17c)$$



$$[g_\ell^m]' = [g_\ell^m] - \frac{2}{r^2} [\xi_\ell^m]_+, \quad (2.17d)$$

$$[h_\ell^m]'_a = [h_\ell^m]_a - D_a [\xi_\ell^m]_- + \frac{2}{r} r_a [\xi_\ell^m]_-, \quad (2.17e)$$

$$[h_\ell^m]'_2 = [h_\ell^m]_2 - 2 [\xi_\ell^m]_-. \quad (2.17f)$$

Gauge-invariant combinations of these variables are

$$[\tilde{h}_\ell^m]_{ab} \equiv [h_\ell^m]_{ab} - D_a [\varepsilon_\ell^m]_b - D_b [\varepsilon_\ell^m]_a, \quad (2.18)$$

$$[\tilde{k}_\ell^m] \equiv [k_\ell^m] + \frac{1}{2} \ell (\ell + 1) [g_\ell^m] - \frac{2}{r} r^a [\varepsilon_\ell^m]_a, \quad (2.19)$$

$$[\tilde{h}_\ell^m]_a \equiv [h_\ell^m]_a - \frac{1}{2} D_a [h_\ell^m]_2 + \frac{1}{r} r_a [h_\ell^m]_2. \quad (2.20)$$

where

$$[\varepsilon_\ell^m]_a \equiv [j_\ell^m]_a - \frac{1}{2} r^2 [g_\ell^m]. \quad (2.21)$$

In the Regge-Wheeler gauge [RW57, TC67]

$$\boxed{[j_\ell^m]_a = [g_\ell^m] = [h_\ell^m]_2 = 0.} \quad (2.22)$$

In this gauge we see that

$$\boxed{[\tilde{h}_\ell^m]_{ab} = [h_\ell^m]_{ab}, \quad [\tilde{k}_\ell^m] = [k_\ell^m], \quad [\tilde{h}_\ell^m]_a = [h_\ell^m]_a.} \quad (2.23)$$

We can then derive the polar and axial equations of motion in Regge-Wheeler gauge, and then make those equations gauge invariant by promoting  $[h_\ell^m]_{ab} \rightarrow [\tilde{h}_\ell^m]_{ab}$ ,  $[k_\ell^m] \rightarrow [\tilde{k}_\ell^m]$ , and  $[h_\ell^m]_a \rightarrow [\tilde{h}_\ell^m]_a$  [MP05].

Similarly to how we decompose the perturbations of the spacetime metric, we can decompose the perturbations of the stress-energy tensor

$$T_\beta^\alpha dx^\beta \partial_\alpha = (T_b^a + P_b^a) dx^b \partial_a + P_B^a d\theta^B \partial_a + P_b^A d\theta^b \partial_A + (\delta_B^A \mathcal{P} + P_B^A) d\theta^B \partial_A, \quad (2.24)$$

and set

$$P_b^a = \sum_{\ell, m} [H_\ell^m]_b^a Y_\ell^m, \quad (2.25a)$$

$$P_B^a = \sum_{\ell, m} ([J_\ell^m]^a [E_\ell^m]_B + [H_\ell^m]^a [S_\ell^m]_B), \quad (2.25b)$$

$$P_b^A = \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{AC} \alpha_{bc} P_C^c, \quad (2.25c)$$

$$P_B^A = \sum_{\ell, m} \left( [K_\ell^m] \delta_B^A Y_\ell^m + [G_\ell^m] [Z_\ell^m]_B^A + \frac{1}{r^2} [H_\ell^m]_2 [S_\ell^m]_B^A \right). \quad (2.25d)$$

Under linear gauge transformations, we have

$$\begin{aligned} (T')_\beta^\alpha &= T_\beta^\alpha - \mathcal{L}_\Xi T_\beta^\alpha \\ &= T_\beta^\alpha - \Xi^\gamma \nabla_\gamma T_\beta^\alpha + T_\beta^\gamma \nabla_\gamma \Xi^\alpha - T_\gamma^\alpha \nabla_\beta \Xi^\gamma. \end{aligned} \quad (2.26)$$

If  $T_{\alpha\beta} = 0$  on the background, then the linearized stress-energy tensor perturbations are gauge invariant. That is not generally the case for us, though. In general we have

$$([H_\ell^m]')_b^a = [H_\ell^m]_b^a - [\xi_\ell^m]^c D_c T_b^a + T_b^c D_c [\xi_\ell^m]^a - T_c^a D_b [\xi_\ell^m]^c \quad (2.27a)$$

$$([J_\ell^m]')^a = [J_\ell^m]^a + \mathcal{P} [\xi_\ell^m]^a - T_c^a [\xi_\ell^m]^c, \quad (2.27b)$$

$$[K_\ell^m]' = [K_\ell^m] - [\xi_\ell^m]^c D_c \mathcal{P}, \quad (2.27c)$$

$$[G_\ell^m]' = [G_\ell^m], \quad (2.27d)$$

$$([H_\ell^m]')^a = [H_\ell^m]^a, \quad (2.27e)$$

$$[H_\ell^m]'_2 = [H_\ell^m]_2. \quad (2.27f)$$

### 2.2.1 Perturbation of the Christoffel symbols

To compute the linearized equations of motion, we need the perturbed Christoffel symbol components. Using standard formulas [Wal84], we have

$$\begin{aligned} \delta\Gamma_{\alpha\beta}^\gamma &= \frac{1}{2} g^{\gamma\delta} (\nabla_\alpha \delta g_{\delta\beta} + \nabla_\beta \delta g_{\delta\alpha} - \nabla_\delta \delta g_{\alpha\beta}) \\ &= \frac{1}{2} g^{\gamma\delta} (\partial_\alpha \delta g_{\delta\beta} + \partial_\beta \delta g_{\delta\alpha} - \partial_\delta \delta g_{\alpha\beta}) - g^{\gamma\delta} \Gamma_{\alpha\beta}^\rho \delta g_{\delta\rho}. \end{aligned} \quad (2.28)$$

We then have

$$\begin{aligned} \delta\Gamma_{ab}^c &= \frac{1}{2} \alpha^{cd} (\partial_a p_{db} + \partial_b p_{da} - \partial_d p_{ab}) - \alpha^{cd} \Gamma_{ab}^\rho p_{d\rho} \\ &= C_{ab}^c, \end{aligned} \quad (2.29)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \delta\Gamma_{ab}^C &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} (\partial_a p_{Db} + \partial_b p_{Da} - \partial_D p_{ab}) - \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} \Gamma_{ab}^\rho p_{D\rho} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{r^2} (D_a p_b^C + D_b p_a^C - D^C p_{ab}), \end{aligned} \quad (2.30)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \delta\Gamma_{Ab}^c &= \frac{1}{2} \alpha^{cd} (\partial_A p_{db} + \partial_b p_{dA} - \partial_d p_{Ab}) - \alpha^{cd} \Gamma_{Ab}^\rho p_{d\rho} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} (D_A p_b^c + D_b p_A^c - D^c p_{bA}) - \left( \frac{1}{r} D_b r \right) p_A^c, \end{aligned} \quad (2.31)$$

$$\delta\Gamma_{AB}^c = \frac{1}{2} \alpha^{cd} (\partial_A p_{dB} + \partial_B p_{dA} - \partial_d p_{AB}) - \alpha^{cd} \Gamma_{AB}^\rho p_{d\rho}$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} (D_A p_B^c + D_B p_A^c - D^c p_{AB}) + \Omega_{AB} (r D_d r) p^{cd}, \quad (2.32)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \delta \Gamma_{Ab}^C &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} (\partial_A p_{Db} + \partial_b p_{DA} - \partial_D p_{Ab}) - \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} \Gamma_{Ab}^\rho p_{D\rho} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{r^2} (D_A p_b^C + D_b p_A^C - D^C p_{Ab}) - \left( \frac{1}{r^3} D_b r \right) p_A^C, \end{aligned} \quad (2.33)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \delta \Gamma_{AB}^C &= \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} (\partial_A p_{DB} + \partial_B p_{DA} - \partial_D p_{AB}) - \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} \Gamma_{AB}^\rho p_{D\rho} \\ &= \frac{1}{r^2} C_{AB}^C + \left( \frac{1}{r} D_p r \right) \Omega_{AB} p^{Cp}, h \end{aligned} \quad (2.34)$$

where we have defined

$$\begin{aligned} C_{ab}^c &\equiv \frac{1}{2} \alpha^{cd} (D_a p_{db} + D_b p_{da} - D_d p_{ab}) \\ C_{AB}^C &\equiv \frac{1}{2} \Omega^{CD} (D_A p_{DB} + D_B p_{DA} - D_D p_{AB}). \end{aligned} \quad (2.35)$$

Notice that we raise/lowered the capital Latin indices with the metric  $\Omega^{AB}/\Omega_{AB}$ , without any factors of  $r$ .

## 2.3 Perturbation of the stress-energy tensor and conserved vector about spherical symmetry

We consider linear perturbations about a spherically symmetric metric of the fluid stress-energy tensor. The general equation is

$$\begin{aligned} \delta (\nabla_\gamma T_\alpha^\gamma) &= \delta (\partial_\gamma T_\alpha^\gamma + \Gamma_{\gamma\beta}^\gamma T_\alpha^\beta - \Gamma_{\gamma\alpha}^\beta T_\beta^\gamma) \\ &= \partial_\gamma \delta T_\alpha^\gamma + \delta \Gamma_{\gamma\beta}^\gamma T_\alpha^\beta + \Gamma_{\gamma\beta}^\gamma \delta T_\alpha^\beta - \delta \Gamma_{\gamma\alpha}^\beta T_\beta^\gamma - \Gamma_{\gamma\alpha}^\beta \delta T_\beta^\gamma. \end{aligned} \quad (2.36)$$

The different components are

$$\begin{aligned} \delta (\nabla_\gamma T_a^\gamma) &= \partial_c P_a^c + \partial_C P_a^C + (\Gamma_{cb}^c + \Gamma_{Cb}^C) P_a^b + \Gamma_{CB}^C P_a^B - \Gamma_{ca}^b P_b^c - \Gamma_{Ca}^B P_B^C \\ &\quad + (\delta \Gamma_{cb}^c + \delta \Gamma_{Cb}^C) T_a^b - \delta \Gamma_{ca}^b T_b^c - \delta \Gamma_{Ca}^B T_B^C \\ &= D_c P_a^c + D_C P_a^C + \frac{2}{r} r_c P_a^c - \frac{1}{r} r_a P_C^C \\ &\quad - C_{ca}^b T_b^c + \left( C_{cb}^c + \frac{1}{2r^2} D_b p_C^C - \frac{1}{r^3} r_b p_C^C \right) T_a^b - \left( \frac{1}{2r^2} D_a p_C^C - \frac{1}{r^3} r_a p_C^C \right) \mathcal{P} \end{aligned} \quad (2.37a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \delta (\nabla_\gamma T_A^\gamma) &= \partial_c P_A^c + \partial_C P_A^C + (\Gamma_{cb}^c + \Gamma_{Cb}^C) P_A^b + \Gamma_{CB}^C P_A^B - \Gamma_{CA}^B P_B^C \\ &\quad + (\delta \Gamma_{cb}^c + \delta \Gamma_{Cb}^C) T_A^b - \delta \Gamma_{cA}^b T_b^c - \delta \Gamma_{CA}^B T_B^C \\ &= D_c P_A^c + D_C P_A^C + \frac{2}{r} r_c P_A^c \\ &\quad + \left( \frac{1}{2} D_A p_c^c - \frac{1}{r} r_c p_A^c \right) \mathcal{P} - \left( \frac{1}{2} D_A p_c^b - \frac{1}{r} r_c p_A^b \right) T_b^c. \end{aligned} \quad (2.37b)$$

## 2.4 Perturbation of the Ricci tensor in spherical symmetry

We will use the formula

$$\delta R_{\alpha\beta} = -\frac{1}{2}g^{\gamma\delta}\nabla_\gamma\nabla_\delta\delta g_{\alpha\beta} - R_{\alpha}{}^{\gamma}{}_{\beta}{}^{\delta}\delta g_{\gamma\delta} + R^{\gamma}{}_{(\alpha}\delta g_{\beta)\gamma} + \nabla_{(\alpha}v_{\beta)} \quad (2.38)$$

where,

$$v_\alpha \equiv g^{\gamma\delta}\nabla_\gamma g_{\alpha\delta} - \frac{1}{2}\nabla_\alpha(g^{\rho\sigma}\delta g_{\rho\sigma}) . \quad (2.39)$$

We first compute the spherical decomposition of the covariant derivatives of the perturbation of the metric tensor [Mar04]. The first covariant derivatives follow from

$$\nabla_\gamma p_{\alpha\beta} = \partial_\gamma p_{\alpha\beta} - \Gamma_{\gamma\alpha}^\delta p_{\delta\beta} - \Gamma_{\gamma\beta}^\delta p_{\delta\alpha}. \quad (2.40)$$

Using Eq. (2.2), we then have

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_c p_{ab} &= \partial_c p_b - \Gamma_{ca}^d p_{db} - \Gamma_{cb}^d p_{da} \\ &= D_c p_{ab}, \end{aligned} \quad (2.41a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_C p_{ab} &= \partial_C p_{ab} - \Gamma_{Ca}^D p_{Db} - \Gamma_{Cb}^D p_{Da} \\ &= D_C p_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} p_{b)C}, \end{aligned} \quad (2.41b)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_c p_{aB} &= \partial_c p_{aB} - \Gamma_{ca}^d p_{dB} - \Gamma_{cB}^D p_{Da} \\ &= D_c p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_c p_{aB}, \end{aligned} \quad (2.41c)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_C p_{aB} &= \partial_C p_{aB} - \Gamma_{Ca}^D p_{DB} - \Gamma_{CB}^D p_{Da} - \Gamma_{CB}^d p_{da} \\ &= D_C p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_a p_{BC} + r r^d \Omega_{BC} p_{da}, \end{aligned} \quad (2.41d)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_c p_{AB} &= \partial_c p_{AB} - \Gamma_{cA}^D p_{DB} - \Gamma_{cB}^D p_{DA} \\ &= D_c p_{AB} - \frac{2}{r} r_c p_{AB}, \end{aligned} \quad (2.41e)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_C p_{AB} &= \partial_C p_{AB} - \Gamma_{CA}^D p_{DB} - \Gamma_{CB}^D p_{DA} - \Gamma_{CB}^d p_{da} \\ &= D_C p_{AB} + 2r r^d \Omega_{C(A} p_{B)d}. \end{aligned} \quad (2.41f)$$

It then follows that

$$\begin{aligned} v_a &= g^{\gamma\delta}\nabla_\gamma p_{\delta a} - \frac{1}{2}\nabla_a(g^{\gamma\delta}p_{\gamma\delta}) \\ &= \alpha^{cd}\nabla_c p_{da} + \frac{1}{r^2}\Omega^{CD}\nabla_C p_{Da} - \frac{1}{2}\nabla_a p \\ &= \alpha^{cd}D_c p_{da} + \frac{1}{r^2}\Omega^{CD}\left(D_C p_{Da} - \frac{1}{r}r_a p_{CD} + r r^d \Omega_{CD} p_{ad}\right) - \frac{1}{2}D_a p \end{aligned}$$

$$= D_c p_a^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C p_a^C - \frac{1}{r^3} r_a p_C^C + \frac{2}{r} r^d p_{ad} - \frac{1}{2} D_a p \quad (2.42a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} v_A &= g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma p_{\delta A} - \frac{1}{2} \nabla_A (g^{\gamma\delta} p_{\gamma\delta}) \\ &= \alpha^{cd} \nabla_c p_{dA} + \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} \nabla_C p_{DA} - \frac{1}{2} \nabla_A p \\ &= \alpha^{cd} D_c p_{dA} - \frac{1}{r} r^d p_{dA} + \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} D_C p_{DA} + \frac{2}{r} r^d \Omega^{CD} \Omega_{C(DP_A)d} - \frac{1}{2} D_A p \\ &= D_c p_A^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C p_A^C + \frac{2}{r} r^d p_{Ad} - \frac{1}{2} D_A p \end{aligned} \quad (2.42b)$$

We also have

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_a v_b &= \partial_a v_b - \Gamma_{ab}^c v_c \\ &= D_a v_b \end{aligned} \quad (2.43a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_a v_B &= \partial_a v_B - \Gamma_{aB}^C v_C \\ &= D_a v_B - \frac{1}{r} r_a v_B, \end{aligned} \quad (2.43b)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_A v_b &= \partial_A v_b - \Gamma_{Ab}^C v_C \\ &= D_A v_b - \frac{1}{r} r_b v_A, \end{aligned} \quad (2.43c)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_A v_B &= \partial_A v_B - \Gamma_{AB}^C v_C - \Gamma_{AB}^c v_c \\ &= D_A v_B + \Omega_{AB} r r^c v_c. \end{aligned} \quad (2.43d)$$

We compute the second derivative of the perturbed metric tensor using

$$\nabla_\delta \nabla_\gamma p_{\alpha\beta} = \partial_\delta (\nabla_\gamma p_{\alpha\beta}) - \Gamma_{\delta\gamma}^\rho (\nabla_\rho p_{\alpha\beta}) - \Gamma_{\delta\alpha}^\rho (\nabla_\gamma p_{\rho\beta}) - \Gamma_{\delta\beta}^\rho (\nabla_\gamma p_{\alpha\rho}). \quad (2.44)$$

To compute the perturbation of the Ricci tensor in spherical symmetry, all we have to compute are

$$\nabla_c \nabla_d p_{\alpha\beta}, \quad \nabla_C \nabla_D p_{\alpha\beta}. \quad (2.45)$$

For  $\alpha = a, \beta = b$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_d \nabla_c p_{ab} &= \partial_d (\nabla_c p_{ab}) - \Gamma_{dc}^p (\nabla_p p_{ab}) - \Gamma_{da}^p (\nabla_c p_{pb}) - \Gamma_{db}^p (\nabla_c p_{ap}) \\ &= D_d D_c p_{ab}, \end{aligned} \quad (2.46a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_D \nabla_C p_{ab} &= \partial_D (\nabla_C p_{ab}) - \Gamma_{DC}^P (\nabla_P p_{ab}) - \Gamma_{DC}^p (\nabla_p p_{ab}) - \Gamma_{Da}^P (\nabla_C p_{Pb}) - \Gamma_{Db}^P (\nabla_C p_{aP}) \\ &= D_D (\nabla_C p_{ab}) + r r^P \Omega_{CD} \nabla_P p_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} \nabla_{|C|} p_{b)D} \\ &= D_D \left( D_C p_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} p_{b)C} \right) + r r^P \Omega_{CD} D_P p_{ab} \\ &\quad - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} \left( D_{|C|} p_{b)D} - \frac{1}{r} r_b p_{CD} + p_{b)P} r r^P \Omega_{CD} \right) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= D_D D_C p_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} D_{|D|} p_{b)C} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} D_{|C|} p_{b)D} \\
&\quad + \frac{2}{r^2} r_a r_b p_{CD} + r r^p \Omega_{CD} \left( D_p p_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} p_{b)p} \right)
\end{aligned} \tag{2.46b}$$

For  $\alpha = a, \beta = B$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\nabla_d \nabla_c p_{aB} &= \partial_d (\nabla_c p_{aB}) - \Gamma_{dc}^p (\nabla_p p_{aB}) - \Gamma_{da}^p (\nabla_c p_{aB}) - \Gamma_{dB}^P (\nabla_c p_{aP}) \\
&= D_d (\nabla_c p_{aB}) - \frac{1}{r} r_d \nabla_c p_{aB} \\
&= D_d \left( D_c p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_c p_{aB} \right) - \frac{1}{r} r_d \left( D_c p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_c p_{aB} \right) \\
&= D_d D_c p_{aB} + \frac{1}{r^2} r_c r_d p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_{cd} p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_c D_d p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_d D_c p_{aB} + \frac{1}{r^2} r_c r_d p_{aB} \\
&= D_d D_c p_{aB} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(c} D_d p_{aB)} + \left( \frac{2}{r^2} r_c r_d - \frac{1}{r} r_{cd} \right) p_{aB},
\end{aligned} \tag{2.47a}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\nabla_D \nabla_C p_{aB} &= \partial_D (\nabla_C p_{aB}) - \Gamma_{DC}^P (\nabla_P p_{aB}) - \Gamma_{DC}^p (\nabla_p p_{aB}) - \Gamma_{Da}^P (\nabla_C p_{PB}) \\
&\quad - \Gamma_{DB}^P (\nabla_C p_{aP}) - \Gamma_{DB}^p (\nabla_C p_{ap}) \\
&= D_D (\nabla_C p_{aB}) - \frac{1}{r} r_a \nabla_C p_{DB} + r r^p \Omega_{CD} \nabla_p p_{aB} + r r^p \Omega_{BD} \nabla_C p_{ap} \\
&= D_D \left( D_C p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_a p_{BC} + r r^d \Omega_{BC} p_{ad} \right) - \frac{1}{r} r_a (D_C p_{BD} + 2 r r^d \Omega_{C(B} p_{D)d}) \\
&\quad + r r^p \Omega_{CD} \left( D_p p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_p p_{aB} \right) + r r^p \Omega_{BD} \left( D_C p_{ap} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} p_{p)C} \right) \\
&= D_D D_C p_{aB} - \frac{2}{r} r_a D_{(C} p_{D)B} + r r^p \left( \Omega_{CD} D_p p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} r_a \Omega_{BC} p_{pD} \right) \\
&\quad + 2 r r^p \left( \Omega_{B(C} D_D p_{aP)} - \frac{1}{r} r_p \Omega_{D(B} p_{C)a} - \frac{1}{r} r_a \Omega_{D(B} p_{C)p} \right).
\end{aligned} \tag{2.47b}$$

For  $\alpha = A, \beta = B$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\nabla_d \nabla_c p_{AB} &= \partial_d (\nabla_c p_{AB}) - \Gamma_{dc}^p (\nabla_p p_{AB}) - \Gamma_{da}^P (\nabla_c p_{PB}) - \Gamma_{dB}^P (\nabla_c p_{PA}) \\
&= D_d (\nabla_c p_{AB}) - \frac{2}{r} r_d (\nabla_c p_{AB}) \\
&= D_d D_c p_{AB} - \frac{2}{r} r_{cd} p_{AB} + \frac{6}{r^2} r_c r_d p_{AB} - \frac{4}{r} r_{(c} D_d p_{AB)},
\end{aligned} \tag{2.48a}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\nabla_D \nabla_C p_{AB} &= \partial_D (\nabla_C p_{AB}) - \Gamma_{DC}^P (\nabla_P p_{AB}) - \Gamma_{DC}^p (\nabla_p p_{AB}) \\
&\quad - \Gamma_{DA}^P (\nabla_C p_{PB}) - \Gamma_{DA}^p (\nabla_C p_{pB}) - \Gamma_{DB}^P (\nabla_C p_{PA}) - \Gamma_{DB}^p (\nabla_C p_{pA}) \\
&= D_D (\nabla_C p_{AB}) + \Omega_{CD} r r^p (\nabla_p p_{AB}) + 2 \Omega_{D(A} r r^p (\nabla_{|C|} p_{B)p}) \\
&= D_D (D_C p_{AB} + 2 r r^d \Omega_{C(A} p_{B)d}) \\
&\quad + r r^p \Omega_{CD} \left( D_p p_{AB} - \frac{1}{r} r_p p_{AB} \right)
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + 2rr^p \Omega_{D(A} \left( D_{|C|pB)p} - \frac{1}{r} r_{|p|pB)C} + rr^q \Omega_{B)C} p_{pq} \right) \\
& = D_D D_C p_{AB} + 2rr^p \left( \Omega_{C(A} D_{|D|pB)p} + \Omega_{D(A} D_{|C|pB)p} \right) \\
& \quad - 2r^p r_p \left( \Omega_{CD} p_{AB} + \Omega_{D(A} p_{B)C} \right) + 2r^2 r^p r^q \Omega_{D(A} \Omega_{B)C} p_{pq} + rr^p \Omega_{CD} D_p p_{AB}
\end{aligned} \tag{2.48b}$$

These expressions match those in Martel's PhD thesis [Mar04].

We can now compute the covariant wave operator acting on the perturbed metric

$$\begin{aligned}
g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{ab} &= \left( \alpha^{cd} \nabla_c \nabla_d + \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} \nabla_C \nabla_D \right) p_{ab} \\
&= \left( D_c D^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C D^C \right) p_{ab} - \frac{4}{r^3} r_{(a} D_{|C|p_b)}^C \\
&\quad + \frac{2}{r} r^c \left( D_c p_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} p_{b)c} \right) + \frac{2}{r^4} r_{(a} r_{b)} \Omega^{CD} p_{CD}
\end{aligned} \tag{2.49}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{aB} &= \left( \alpha^{cd} \nabla_c \nabla_d + \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} \nabla_C \nabla_D \right) p_{aB} \\
&= \left( D_c D^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C D^C \right) p_{aB} - \frac{1}{r} \left( \frac{1}{r} r_c r^c + r_c^c \right) p_{aB} - \frac{4}{r^2} r_a r^c p_{Bc} \\
&\quad - \frac{2}{r^3} r_a D_C p_B^C + \frac{2}{r} r^c D_B p_{ac}
\end{aligned} \tag{2.50}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{AB} &= \left( \alpha^{cd} \nabla_c \nabla_d + \frac{1}{r^2} \Omega^{CD} \nabla_C \nabla_D \right) p_{AB} \\
&= \left( D_c D^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C D^C \right) p_{AB} - \frac{2}{r} (r_c^c + r^c D_c) p_{AB} \\
&\quad + \frac{4}{r} r^c D_{(A} p_{B)c} + 2\Omega_{AB} r^c r^d p_{cd}.
\end{aligned} \tag{2.51}$$

We next consider the covariant components of the Riemann tensor contracted with the perturbed metric.

$$\begin{aligned}
R_a{}^\gamma{}_\delta{}^b p_{\gamma\delta} &= R_a{}^c{}_\delta{}^d p_{cd} + R_a{}^C{}_\delta{}^D p_{CD} \\
&= \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{R} (\alpha_{ab} \alpha^{cd} - \delta_a^d \delta_b^c) p_{cd} - \frac{1}{r^3} (r_{ab}) \Omega^{CD} p_{CD}
\end{aligned} \tag{2.52a}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
R_a{}^\gamma{}_B{}^\delta p_{\gamma\delta} &= R_a{}^C{}_B{}^d p_{Cd} \\
&= \left( \frac{1}{r} r_a^d \right) p_{Bd}
\end{aligned} \tag{2.52b}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
R_A{}^\gamma{}_B{}^\delta p_{\gamma\delta} &= R_A{}^c{}_B{}^d p_{cd} + R_A{}^C{}_B{}^D p_{CD} \\
&= -\Omega_{AB} (rr^{cd}) p_{cd} + \frac{1}{r^2} (1 - r_a r^a) (\Omega_{AB} \Omega^{CD} - \delta_A^D \delta_B^C) p_{CD}.
\end{aligned} \tag{2.52c}$$

Finally, we consider the covariant components of the Ricci tensor contracted with the perturbed metric

$$\begin{aligned} R^\gamma_{(a)p_b)\gamma} &= R^c_{(a)p_b)c} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{R} p_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r^c_{(a} p_{b)c} \end{aligned} \quad (2.53a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} R^\gamma_{(a)p_B)\gamma} &= \frac{1}{2} (R^c_{ap_{Bc}} + R^C_{Bp_{aC}}) \\ &= -\frac{1}{r} r^c_a p_{Bc} + \left( \frac{1}{4} \mathcal{R} + \frac{1}{2r^2} (1 - r_c r^c - r r^c_c) \right) p_{aB} \end{aligned} \quad (2.53b)$$

$$\begin{aligned} R^\gamma_{(A)p_B)\gamma} &= R^C_{(A)p_B)C} \\ &= \frac{1}{r^2} (1 - r_c r^c - r r^c_c) p_{AB}. \end{aligned} \quad (2.53c)$$

Alternatively, we could make use of the Einstein equations to write this as

$$R^\gamma_{(a)p_b)\gamma} = \kappa \hat{T}^c_{(a)p_b)c} \quad (2.54a)$$

$$\begin{aligned} R^\gamma_{(a)p_B)\gamma} &= \frac{\kappa}{2} \left( \hat{T}^c_{ap_{Bc}} + \hat{T}^C_{Bp_{aC}} \right) \\ &= \frac{\kappa}{2} \left( \hat{T}^c_{ap_{Bc}} - (\mathcal{E} - \mathcal{P}) p_{aB} \right) \end{aligned} \quad (2.54b)$$

$$R^\gamma_{(A)p_B)\gamma} = \frac{\kappa}{2} (\mathcal{E} - \mathcal{P}) p_{AB}. \quad (2.54c)$$



# Chapter 3

## Axial and polar spherical harmonic decomposition of the Einstein equations

### 3.1 Axial perturbations

We only need to consider the components  $\delta R_{aB}$  and  $\delta R_{AB}$ . As we reviewed in Sec. 2.2, as first shown in [MP05], we can work in the Regge-Wheeler gauge, and then promote the variables to gauge-invariant ones at the end. We also drop the  $\ell, m$  labels to make the equations less cluttered. We use  $\dot{=}$  to indicate that we are dropping all terms that are zero for an axial perturbation in Regge-Wheeler gauge. The only nonzero component of the metric perturbation then is

$$p_{aB} \dot{=} h_a S_B. \quad (3.1)$$

#### 3.1.1 Computing the $aB$ component of the Ricci tensor

We first look at

$$\begin{aligned} g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{aB} &\dot{=} \left( D_c D^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C D^C \right) S_B h_a - \frac{1}{r} \left( \frac{1}{r} r_c r^c + r_c^c \right) S_B h_a - \frac{4}{r^2} r_a r^c h_c S_B \\ &= \left( \left( D_c D^c + \frac{1}{r^2} (1 - \ell(\ell + 1)) \right) - \frac{1}{r^2} r_c r^c - \frac{1}{r} r_c^c \right) h_a - \frac{4}{r^2} r_a r_c h^c \Big) S_B. \end{aligned} \quad (3.2)$$

We next look at

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_a v_B + \nabla_B v_a &\dot{=} \left( D_a - \frac{2}{r} r_a \right) v_B \\ &\dot{=} \left( D_a - \frac{2}{r} r_a \right) \left( D_c h^c + \frac{2}{r} r_c h^c \right) S_B \\ &= \left( D_a D_c h^c + \frac{2}{r} r_c D_a h^c - \frac{2}{r} r_a D_c h^c + \frac{2}{r} r_{ac} h^c - \frac{6}{r^2} r_a r_c h^c \right) S_B. \end{aligned} \quad (3.3)$$

For the Riemann and Ricci tensor components, we have

$$R_a{}^\gamma{}_B{}^\delta p_{\gamma\delta} = \left( \frac{1}{r} r_{ac} \right) h^c S_B \quad (3.4)$$

$$R^\gamma{}_{(a} p_{B)\gamma} = \frac{1}{2} \left( \kappa \hat{T}_{ac} h^c + \frac{1}{r^2} (1 - r_c r^c - r r_c^c) h_a \right) S_B. \quad (3.5)$$

We have substituted the trace-reverse of the stress-energy tensor  $\hat{T}_{ab}$  for  $R_{ab}$ , while directly writing out the expression for  $R_{AB}$ , so our formulas will match those in [MP05]<sup>1</sup>. Using Eq. (1.20), and promoting everything to gauge-invariant quantities, we are left with

$$\boxed{\delta R_{aB} = \frac{1}{2} \left( - \left( D_c D^c - \frac{1}{r^2} \ell(\ell+1) \right) \tilde{h}_a + D_a D_c \tilde{h}^c + \frac{4}{r} r_{[c} D_{a]} \tilde{h}^c - \frac{2}{r^2} r_a r_c \tilde{h}^c + \kappa \hat{T}_{ac} \tilde{h}^c \right) S_B.} \quad (3.6)$$

We can now write down the tensor equations of motion,

$$\delta R_{aB} \doteq \kappa \left( \delta T_{aB} - \frac{1}{2} \delta g_{aB} T \right). \quad (3.7)$$

### 3.1.2 Computing the $AB$ component of the Ricci tensor

We first look at

$$\begin{aligned} g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{AB} &\doteq \frac{4}{r} r_c \Omega^{CD} \Omega_{C(A} D_{|D|} S_{B)} h^c \\ &= \frac{4}{r} r_c h^c S_{AB}. \end{aligned} \quad (3.8)$$

We next look at

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_A v_B + \nabla_B v_A &\doteq D_A v_B + D_B v_A \\ &\doteq (D_A S_B + D_B S_A) \left( D_c h^c + \frac{2}{r} r_c h^c \right) \\ &= 2 \left( D_c h^c + \frac{2}{r} r_c h^c \right) S_{AB} \end{aligned} \quad (3.9)$$

where,  $S_{AB} \equiv D_{(A} S_{B)}$ . The other terms  $R_A{}^\gamma{}_B{}^\gamma p_{\gamma\delta}$  and  $R^\gamma{}_{(A} p_{B)\gamma}$  are zero for axial perturbations in the Regge-Wheeler gauge. Using Eq. (1.20), and promoting everything to gauge-invariant quantities, we have

$$\boxed{\delta R_{AB} = D_c \tilde{h}^c S_{AB}.} \quad (3.10)$$

Note that the axial perturbation of the  $AB$  component of the Einstein and Ricci tensors are the same in the Regge-Wheeler gauge

$$\delta G_{AB} \doteq \delta R_{AB}. \quad (3.11)$$

This is why our expression Eq. (3.10) matches Eq (5.9) of [MP05].

---

<sup>1</sup>Their Eq. 5.8, although note that those authors assume the background is vacuum so  $R_{\mu\nu} = 0$ .

### 3.1.3 Computing the $a$ component of the Bianchi identity

There are no axial perturbations of this component.

### 3.1.4 Computing the $A$ component of the Bianchi identity

We next consider the divergence of the stress-energy tensor (see Sec. (2.3)). We first look at

$$\begin{aligned} D_c P_A^c + \frac{2}{r} r_c P_A^c + D_C P_A^C &\doteq S^A \left( D_c H^c + \frac{2}{r} r_c H^c \right) + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C S_A^C H_2 \\ &= S^A \left( \frac{1}{r^2} D_c (r^2 H^c) + \frac{1}{r^2} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{2} \ell(\ell+1) \right) H_2 \right). \end{aligned} \quad (3.12)$$

Next, looking at the metric perturbations, we have

$$\left( \frac{1}{2} D_A p_c^c - \frac{1}{r} r_c p_A^c \right) \mathcal{P} - \left( \frac{1}{2} D_A p_b^c - \frac{1}{r} r_b p_A^c \right) T_c^b \doteq S^A \left( -\frac{1}{r} r_c h^c \mathcal{P} + \frac{1}{r} r_b h^c T_c^b \right). \quad (3.13)$$

Promoting  $h_a$  to its gauge invariant counterpart  $\tilde{h}_a$ , we conclude that the axial matter equations of motion are

$$\boxed{\frac{1}{r^2} D_c (r^2 H^c) - \frac{(\ell-1)(\ell+2)}{2r^2} H_2 + \frac{1}{r} r_c \tilde{h}^b T_b^c - \frac{1}{r} r_c \tilde{h}^c \mathcal{P} = 0.} \quad (3.14)$$

## 3.2 Polar spherical harmonic decomposition of the Einstein equations

We need to consider the components  $\delta R_{ab}$ ,  $\delta R_{aB}$ , and  $\delta R_{AB}$ . As we review in Sec. 2.2, we can work in the Regge-Wheeler gauge, and promote all variables to their gauge-invariant counterparts at the end of the calculation. We now use  $\doteq$  to indicate that we only keep terms that are nonzero in a polar decomposition in Regge-Wheeler gauge. We work in a spherical harmonic basis and drop the  $\ell, m$  labels to make the expressions less cluttered. The only nonzero components of the metric perturbation are

$$p_{ab} \doteq h_{ab} Y, \quad (3.15a)$$

$$p_{AB} \doteq r^2 k \Omega_{AB} Y. \quad (3.15b)$$

### 3.2.1 Computing the $ab$ components of the Ricci tensor

We first look at

$$g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{ab} \doteq \left( D_c D^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C D^C \right) h_{ab} Y + \frac{2}{r} r^c \left( D_c h_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} h_{b)c} \right) Y + \frac{4}{r^2} r_{(a} r_{b)} k Y$$

$$= \left( \left( D_c D^c - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} \right) h_{ab} + \frac{2}{r} r^c \left( D_c h_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} h_{b)c} \right) + \frac{4}{r^2} r_{(a} r_{b)} k \right) Y. \quad (3.16)$$

We next look at (we can symmetrize later)

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_a v_b &\doteq D_a \left( D_c h_b^c - \frac{2}{r} r_b k + \frac{2}{r} r^c h_{bc} - \frac{1}{2} D_b (h + 2k) \right) Y \\ &= \left( D_a D_c h_b^c + \frac{2}{r^2} r_a r_b k + \frac{1}{r} r^c (2D_{(a} h_{b)c} - D_c h_{ab}) \right. \\ &\quad \left. - \frac{2}{r^2} r_a r^c h_{bc} + \frac{2}{r} (r_a^c h_{bc} + r^c D_a h_{bc}) - D_a D_b \left( \frac{1}{2} h + k \right) \right) Y. \end{aligned} \quad (3.17)$$

For the Riemann and Ricci tensor components, we have

$$R_a{}^\gamma{}_\delta p_{\gamma\delta} \doteq \left( \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{R} (\alpha_{ab} \alpha^{cd} - \delta_a^c \delta_b^d) h_{cd} - \frac{2}{r} r_{ab} k \right) Y, \quad (3.18)$$

$$R^\gamma{}_{(a} p_{b)\gamma} \doteq \left( \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{R} h_{ab} - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a}^c h_{b)c} \right) Y. \quad (3.19)$$

Using Eq. (1.20), and promoting everything to gauge-invariant quantities, we end up with

$$\boxed{\begin{aligned} \delta R_{ab} &\doteq \left( -\frac{1}{2} \left( D_c D^c - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} \right) \tilde{h}_{ab} + D_{(a} D^c \tilde{h}_{b)c} - D_a D_b \left( \frac{1}{2} \tilde{h} + \tilde{k} \right) \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \frac{2}{r} r^c \left( D_c \tilde{h}_{ab} + D_{(a} \tilde{h}_{b)c} \right) - \frac{2}{r} r_{(a} D_{b)} \tilde{k} + \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{R} \left( 3\tilde{h}_{ab} - \alpha_{ab} \tilde{h} \right) \right) Y. \end{aligned}} \quad (3.20)$$

### 3.2.2 Computing the $aB$ component of the Ricci tensor

We first look at

$$g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{aB} \doteq \left( -\frac{2}{r} r_a k + \frac{2}{r} r^c h_{ac} \right) E_B. \quad (3.21)$$

We next look at

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_a v_B + \nabla_B v_a &= D_a v_B + D_B v_a - \frac{2}{r} r_a v_B \\ &\doteq \left( D_c h_a^c - D_a k - D_a h + \frac{2}{r} r_c h_a^c + \frac{1}{r} r_a h - \frac{2}{r} r_a k \right) E_B. \end{aligned} \quad (3.22)$$

The Riemann tensor components are zero

$$R_a{}^\gamma{}_\delta p_{\gamma\delta} \doteq 0. \quad (3.23)$$

The Ricci tensor components are also zero

$$R^\gamma{}_{(a}p_{B)\gamma} \doteq 0. \quad (3.24)$$

Using Eq. (1.20), and promoting to gauge-invariant quantities, we have

$$\boxed{\delta R_{aB} \doteq \frac{1}{2} \left( D_c \tilde{h}_a{}^c - D_a \tilde{h} - D_a \tilde{k} + \frac{1}{r} r_a \tilde{h} \right) E_B.} \quad (3.25)$$

### 3.2.3 Computing the $AB$ components of the Ricci tensor

We first look at

$$\begin{aligned} g^{\gamma\delta} \nabla_\gamma \nabla_\delta p_{AB} &\doteq \left( D_c D^c + \frac{1}{r^2} D_C D^C \right) \Omega_{AB} r^2 k Y - \frac{2}{r} (r_c^c + r^c D_c) \Omega_{AB} r^2 k Y + 2 \Omega_{AB} r^c r^d h_{cd} Y \\ &= \left( \left( D_c D^c - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} \right) k + \frac{2}{r} r^c D_c k - \frac{2}{r^2} r_c r^c k + \frac{2}{r^2} r^c r^d h_{cd} \right) r^2 \Omega_{AB} Y. \end{aligned} \quad (3.26)$$

We next look at (we can symmetrize later)

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla_A v_B &= D_A v_B + \Omega_{AB} r^c v_c \\ &= -\frac{1}{2} h Z_{AB} \\ &\quad + \left( \frac{1}{r} r^c D_d h_c{}^d - \frac{1}{r} r^c D_c h - \frac{2}{r} r^c D_c k + \frac{2}{r^2} r^c r^d h_{cd} - \frac{2}{r^2} r_c r^c k - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{2r^2} h \right) r^2 \Omega_{AB} Y. \end{aligned} \quad (3.27)$$

The Riemann tensor components are

$$R_A{}^\gamma{}_B{}^\delta p_{\gamma\delta} \doteq \left( -\frac{1}{r} r^{cd} h_{cd} + \frac{1 - r_a r^a}{r^2} k \right) r^2 \Omega_{AB} Y. \quad (3.28)$$

The Ricci tensor components are also zero

$$R^\gamma{}_{(A} p_{B)\gamma} \doteq \left( \frac{1 - r_a r^a - r r_a^a}{r^2} k \right) r^2 \Omega_{AB} Y. \quad (3.29)$$

Using Eq. (1.20), and promoting to gauge-invariant quantities, we have

$$\boxed{\begin{aligned} \delta R_{AB} &= -\frac{1}{2} \tilde{h} Z_{AB} \\ &\quad + \left( -\frac{1}{2} \left( D_c D^c - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} \right) \tilde{k} - \frac{3}{r} r^c D_c \tilde{k} - \left( \frac{1}{r^2} r^c r^c - \frac{1}{r} r_c^c \right) \tilde{k} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \frac{1}{r} r^c D_d \tilde{h}_c{}^d - \frac{1}{r} r^c D_c \tilde{h} + \frac{2}{r^2} r^c r^d \tilde{h}_{cd} - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{2r^2} \tilde{h} \right) r^2 \Omega_{AB} Y. \end{aligned}} \quad (3.30)$$

### 3.2.4 Computing the $a$ component of the Bianchi identity

We consider the divergence of the stress-energy tensor. We first look at

$$D_c P_a^c + D_C P_a^C + \frac{2}{r} r_c P_a^c - \frac{1}{r} r_a P_C^C = \left( D_c H_a^c + \frac{2}{r} r_c H_a^c - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} J_a - \frac{2}{r} r_a K \right) Y. \quad (3.31)$$

We next look at the metric terms

$$-C_{ca}^b T_b^b + \left( C_{cb}^c - \frac{1}{r^4} r_b p_C^C \right) T_a^b + \frac{1}{r^3} r_a p_C^C \mathcal{P} = \left( -C_{ca}^b T_b^b + \left( C_{cb}^c - \frac{2}{r^2} r_b k \right) T_a^b + \frac{2}{r} r_a k \mathcal{P} \right) Y. \quad (3.32)$$

Putting everything together, we have

$$\boxed{\frac{1}{r^2} D_c (r^2 H_a^c) - \frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^2} J_a - \frac{2}{r} r_a K - C_{ca}^b T_b^b + \left( C_{cb}^c - \frac{2}{r^2} r_b k \right) T_a^b + \frac{2}{r} r_a k \mathcal{P} = 0.} \quad (3.33)$$

### 3.2.5 Computing the $A$ component of the Bianchi identity

We consider the divergence of the stress-energy tensor. We first look at

$$D_c P_A^c + D_C P_A^C + \frac{2}{r} r_c P_A^c = \left( D_c J^c + K - \frac{(\ell+2)(\ell-1)}{2} G + \frac{2}{r} r_c J^c \right) E_A. \quad (3.34)$$

We next look at the metric terms

$$\frac{1}{2} D_A p_c^c \mathcal{P} - \frac{1}{2} D_A p_c^b T_b^c = \frac{1}{2} (h \mathcal{P} - T_c^b h_b^c) E_A. \quad (3.35)$$

Putting everything together, we have

$$\boxed{\frac{1}{r^2} D_c (r^2 J^c) + K - \frac{(\ell+2)(\ell-1)}{2} G + h \mathcal{P} - T_c^b h_b^c = 0.} \quad (3.36)$$

# Appendix A

## Scalar, vector, and tensor spherical harmonics

We work on the unit two-sphere  $\mathbb{S}^2$ , with metric  $\Omega_{AB}$ , Levi-Cevita tensor  $\varepsilon_{AB}$ , and metric compatible derivative  $D_A$ . The Ricci tensor is  $R = +2$ . Our notation for the spherical harmonics follows that of [NR05].

### A.1 Scalar spherical harmonics

The scalar spherical harmonics satisfy

$$(\Omega^{AB} D_A D_B + \ell(\ell + 1)) Y_\ell^m = 0, \quad (\text{A.1})$$

along with the following orthogonality relation

$$\int d\Omega Y_\ell^m Y_{\ell'}^{m'} = \delta_{\ell\ell'} \delta_{mm'}. \quad (\text{A.2})$$

### A.2 Vector spherical harmonics

The polar and axial vector spherical harmonics respectively are

$$[E_\ell^m]_A \equiv D_A Y_\ell^m, \quad [S_\ell^m]_A \equiv \varepsilon_{BA} D^B Y_\ell^m. \quad (\text{A.3})$$

The vector spherical harmonics satisfy

$$(\Omega^{AB} D_A D_B + (-1 + \ell(\ell + 1))) [V_\ell^m]_C = 0, \quad (\text{A.4})$$

along with the following orthogonality relation

$$\int d\Omega [V_\ell^m]_A [V_{\ell'}^{m'}]^A = \ell(\ell + 1) \delta_{\ell\ell'} \delta_{mm'}. \quad (\text{A.5})$$

The divergence of the polar and axial vector spherical harmonics respectively are

$$\begin{aligned} D_A [E_\ell^m]^A &= D_A D^A Y_\ell^m \\ &= -\ell(\ell+1) Y_\ell^m. \end{aligned} \quad (\text{A.6})$$

$$\begin{aligned} D_A [S_\ell^m]^A &= \varepsilon_{BA} D^B D^A Y_\ell^m \\ &= 0. \end{aligned} \quad (\text{A.7})$$

### A.3 Tensor spherical harmonics

The polar and axial tensor spherical harmonics respectively are

$$[Z_\ell^m]_{AB} \equiv D_A D_B Y_\ell^m + \frac{1}{2} \ell(\ell+1) \Omega_{AB} Y_\ell^m, \quad [S_\ell^m]_{AB} \equiv D_{(A} [S_\ell^m]_{B)}. \quad (\text{A.8})$$

The tensor spherical harmonics satisfy

$$(\Omega^{AB} D_A D_B + (-2 + \ell(\ell+1))) [T_\ell^m]_{CD} = 0, \quad (\text{A.9})$$

along with the following orthogonality relation

$$\int d\Omega [T_\ell^m]_{AB} [T_{\ell'}^{m'}]^{AB} = \frac{1}{2} (\ell-1) \ell (\ell+1) (\ell+2) \delta_{\ell\ell'} \delta_{mm'}. \quad (\text{A.10})$$

The polar and axial tensor spherical harmonics are both traceless

$$\begin{aligned} \Omega^{AB} [Z_\ell^m]_{AB} &= D_A D^A Y_\ell^m + \ell(\ell+1) Y_\ell^m \\ &= 0, \end{aligned} \quad (\text{A.11})$$

$$\begin{aligned} \Omega^{AB} [S_\ell^m]_{AB} &= D_A [S_\ell^m]^A \\ &= 0. \end{aligned} \quad (\text{A.12})$$

The trace is captured by the scalar spherical harmonic  $Y_\ell^m$ , which is sometimes denoted by [Mar04]

$$[U_\ell^m]_{AB} \equiv \Omega_{AB} Y_\ell^m. \quad (\text{A.13})$$

The divergence of the polar and axial tensor spherical harmonics respectively are

$$\begin{aligned} D_A [Z_\ell^m]^{AB} &= D_A D^A D^B Y_\ell^m + \frac{1}{2} \ell(\ell+1) D^B Y_\ell^m \\ &= D^B D_A D^A Y_\ell^m + R_C^B D^C Y_\ell^m + \frac{1}{2} \ell(\ell+1) D^B Y_\ell^m \\ &= D^B Y_\ell^m - \frac{1}{2} \ell(\ell+1) D^B Y_\ell^m \\ &= \left(1 - \frac{1}{2} \ell(\ell+1)\right) [E_\ell^m]^B, \end{aligned} \quad (\text{A.14})$$



$$\begin{aligned}
D_A [S_\ell^m]^{AB} &= \frac{1}{2} D_A \left( D^A [S_\ell^m]^B + D^B [S_\ell^m]^A \right) \\
&= \frac{1}{2} \left( (1 - \ell(\ell + 1)) [S_\ell^m]^B + D_B D_A [S_\ell^m]^A + R_C^B [S_\ell^m]^C \right) \\
&= \left( 1 - \frac{1}{2} \ell(\ell + 1) \right) [S_\ell^m]^B.
\end{aligned} \tag{A.15}$$

We have used that  $R = 2$  and  $R_{AB} = (R/2)\Omega_{AB} = \Omega_{AB}$ .

# Bibliography

- [AV10] Gabriel Abreu and Matt Visser. Kodama time: Geometrically preferred foliations of spherically symmetric spacetimes. *Phys. Rev. D*, 82:044027, 2010.
- [GMG00] Carsten Gundlach and Jose M. Martin-Garcia. Gauge invariant and coordinate independent perturbations of stellar collapse. 1. The Interior. *Phys. Rev. D*, 61:084024, 2000.
- [Mar04] Karl Martel. *Particles and black holes: time domain integration of the equations of black hole perturbation theory*. PhD thesis, The University of Guelph, 2004.
- [MGG01] Jose M. Martin-Garcia and Carsten Gundlach. Gauge invariant and coordinate independent perturbations of stellar collapse. 2. Matching to the exterior. *Phys. Rev. D*, 64:024012, 2001.
- [MP05] Karl Martel and Eric Poisson. Gravitational perturbations of the Schwarzschild spacetime: A Practical covariant and gauge-invariant formalism. *Phys. Rev. D*, 71:104003, 2005.
- [NR05] Alessandro Nagar and Luciano Rezzolla. Gauge-invariant non-spherical metric perturbations of Schwarzschild black-hole spacetimes. *Class. Quant. Grav.*, 22:R167, 2005. [Erratum: *Class.Quant.Grav.* 23, 4297 (2006)].
- [RW57] Tullio Regge and John A. Wheeler. Stability of a Schwarzschild singularity. *Phys. Rev.*, 108:1063–1069, 1957.
- [RY18] Justin L. Ripley and Kent Yagi. Black hole perturbation under a  $2 + 2$  decomposition in the action. *Phys. Rev. D*, 97(2):024009, 2018.
- [RZ13] Luciano Rezzolla and Olindo Zanotti. *Relativistic Hydrodynamics*. 2013.
- [TC67] Kip S. Thorne and Alfonso Campolattaro. Non-Radial Pulsation of General-Relativistic Stellar Models. I. Analytic Analysis for  $L \geq 2$ . *Astrophys. J.*, 149:591, September 1967.
- [Wal84] Robert M. Wald. *General Relativity*. Chicago Univ. Pr., Chicago, USA, 1984.