

Use Apache Velocity as template engine

Context and Problem Statement

We need to choose a template engine for [custom export filters](#) and [AI features](#).

A discussion of template engines was also in [one of the JabRef repos](#).

A discussion was raised on StackOverflow [“Velocity vs. FreeMarker vs. Thymeleaf”](#).

Decision Drivers

- It should be fast.
- It should be possible to provide templates out of `Strings` (required by the AI feature).
- It should have short and understandable syntax. Especially, it should work well with unset fields and empty `Optional`s.

Considered Options

- Apache Velocity
- Apache FreeMarker
- Thymeleaf

Decision Outcome

Chosen option: “Apache Velocity”, because “Velocity’s goal is to keep templates as simple as possible” ([source](#)). It is sufficient for our use case. Furthermore, Apache Velocity is lightweight, and it allows to generate text output. This is a good fit for the AI feature.

Pros and Cons of the Options

Apache Velocity

- Main page: <https://velocity.apache.org/>.
- User guide: <https://velocity.apache.org/engine/devel/user-guide.html>.
- Developer guide: <https://velocity.apache.org/engine/devel/developer-guide.html>.

Example:

You are an AI assistant that analyses research papers. You answer questions about papers.

Here are the papers you are analyzing:

```
#foreach( $entry in $entries )  
${CanonicalBibEntry.getCanonicalRepresentation($entry)}  
#end
```

- Good, because supports plain text templating.
- Good, because it is possible to use `String` as a template.
- Good, because it has simple syntax, and it is designed for simple template workflows.
- Good, because it has a stable syntax ([source](#)).
- Bad, because it is in maintenance mode.
- Bad, because [removed from Spring 5.0.1](#)

Apache FreeMarker

- Main page: <https://freemarker.apache.org/index.html>.
- User guide: <https://freemarker.apache.org/docs/dgui.html>.
- Developer guide: https://freemarker.apache.org/docs/pgui_quickstart.html.

Example:

You are an AI assistant that analyzes research papers. You answer questions about papers.

Here are the papers you are analyzing:

```
<#list entries as entry>  
${CanonicalBibEntry.getCanonicalRepresentation(entry)}  
</#list>
```

- Good, because supports plain text templating.
- Good, because it is possible to use `String` as a template.
- Good, because in active development.
- Good, because it is powerful and flexible.
- Good, because it has extensive documentation ([source](#)).
- Neutral, because it has received some API and syntax changes recently ([source](#)).
- Neutral, because FreeMarker is used for complex template workflow, which we do not need in JabRef.

Thymeleaf

- Main page: <https://www.thymeleaf.org/>.
- Documentation: <https://www.thymeleaf.org/doc/tutorials/3.1/usingthymeleaf.html>.

Example:

You are an AI assistant that analyzes research papers. You answer questions about papers.

Here are the papers you are analyzing:

```
[# th:each="entry : ${entries}"]  
[(${CanonicalBibEntry.getCanonicalRepresentation(entry)})]  
[/]
```

- Good, because supports plain text templating.
- Good, because it is possible to use `String` as a template.
- Good, because it has [several template modes](#), that helps to make HTML, XML, and other templates.
- Good, because it is powerful and flexible.
- Neutral, because the API is a bit more complex than the other options.
- Bad, because the syntax is more complex than the other options. Especially for text output.

More Information

As stated in [the template discussion issue](#), we should choose a template engine, and then slowly migrate previous code and templates to the chosen engine.

Other template engines are discussed at <https://www.baeldung.com/spring-template-engines>, especially [#other-template-engines](#). We did not find any other engine there worth switching to.
