Project: Unreliable heterogeneity

Table 1

Variance in reliability leads to positive bias in heterogeneity estimates

| | | Observed Effect Sizes | | | | |
|---------------|-------------|---|---|---|--------|--|
| | | Study 1 | Study 2 | Study 3 | | |
| Meta-Analysis | ρ_{xy} | $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}} = .6$ | $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}} = .7$ | $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}} = .8$ | SD(ES) | |
| I | 0.0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | |
| II | 0.3 | 0.18 | 0.21 | 0.24 | 0.03 | |
| III | 0.5 | 0.30 | 0.35 | 0.40 | 0.05 | |

Note: Reproduced from Olsson Collentine et al. (2020). The values under Study 1, 2 and 3 are observed effect sizes for that study given its measurement reliability $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}}$ and the true effect size ρ_{xy} when within-study sample size is infinite. SD (ES) is the standard deviation of the observed effect sizes for meta-analysis I, II and III, equivalent to heterogeneity given infinite within-study sample sizes. Code to reproduce table: LINK

Table 2 (version 1)

Imperfect reliability leads to negative bias in heterogeneity estimates

| | Obser | | | |
|--|---------|---------|---------|--------|
| $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}}$ | Study 1 | Study 2 | Study 3 | SD(ES) |
| 1 | 0.1 | 0.15 | 0.2 | 0.05 |
| 0.8 | 0.08 | 0.12 | 0.16 | 0.04 |
| 0.6 | 0.06 | 0.09 | 0.12 | 0.03 |

Note: The values under Study 1, 2 and 3 are observed effect sizes for that study given the measurement reliability $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}}$ and the true effect size of that study (first row) when within-study sample size is infinite. SD (ES) is the standard deviation of the observed effect sizes, equivalent to heterogeneity given infinite within-study sample sizes. Code to reproduce table: LINK

Table 2 (version 2)

Imperfect reliability leads to negative bias in heterogeneity estimates

| | Obsei | | | |
|---|---------|---------|---------|--------|
| | Study 1 | Study 2 | Study 3 | SD(ES) |
| $\overline{\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}}} = 1$ | 0.1 | 0.15 | 0.2 | 0.05 |
| $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}} = 0.8$ | 0.08 | 0.12 | 0.16 | 0.04 |
| $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}} = 0.6$ | 0.06 | 0.09 | 0.12 | 0.03 |

Note:

The values under Study 1, 2 and 3 are observed effect sizes for that study given the measurement reliability $\sqrt{R_{xx'}} \times \sqrt{R_{yy'}}$ and the true effect size of that study (first row) when withinstudy sample size is infinite. SD (ES) is the standard deviation of the observed effect sizes, equivalent to heterogeneity given infinite within-study sample sizes. Code to reproduce table: LINK