

This module contains an abstract version of the *Quicksort* algorithm. If you are not already familiar with that algorithm, you should look it up on the Web and understand how it works—including what the partition procedure does, without worrying about how it does it. The version presented here does not specify a partition procedure, but chooses in a single step an arbitrary value that is the result that any partition procedure may produce.

The module also has a structured informal proof of *Quicksort*'s partial correctness property—namely, that if it terminates, it produces a sorted permutation of the original sequence. As described in the note “Proving Safety Properties”, the proof uses the *TLAPS* proof system to check the decomposition of the proof into substeps, and to check some of the substeps whose proofs are trivial.

The version of *Quicksort* described here sorts a finite sequence of integers. It is one of the examples in Section 7.3 of “Proving Safety Properties”, which is at

<http://lamport.azurewebsites.net/tla/proving-safety.pdf>

EXTENDS *Integers, Sequences, FiniteSets, TLAPS, SequenceTheorems, FiniteSetTheorems*

This statement imports some standard modules, including ones used by the *TLAPS* proof system.

To aid in model checking the spec, we assume that the sequence to be sorted are elements of a set *Values* of integers.

CONSTANT *Values*

ASSUME *ValAssump* \triangleq *Values* \subseteq *Int*

We define *PermsOf*(*s*) to be the set of permutations of a sequence *s* of integers. In TLA+, a sequence is a function whose domain is the set $1 \dots \text{Len}(s)$. A permutation of *s* is the composition of *s* with a permutation of its domain. It is defined as follows, where:

- *Automorphisms*(*S*) is the set of all permutations of *S*, if *S* is a finite set—that is all functions *f* from *S* to *S* such that every element *y* of *S* is the image of some element of *S* under *f*.
- *f* ****** *g* is defined to be the composition of the functions *f* and *g*.

In TLA+, DOMAIN *f* is the domain of a function *f*.

$\text{Automorphisms}(S) \triangleq \{f \in [S \rightarrow S] : \forall y \in S : \exists x \in S : f[x] = y\}$

$f \mathbf{**} g \triangleq [x \in \text{DOMAIN } g \mapsto f[g[x]]]$

$\text{PermsOf}(s) \triangleq \{s \mathbf{**} f : f \in \text{Automorphisms}(\text{DOMAIN } s)\}$

LEMMA *AutomorphismsCompose* \triangleq

ASSUME NEW *S*, NEW *f* \in *Automorphisms*(*S*), NEW *g* \in *Automorphisms*(*S*)

PROVE $f \mathbf{**} g \in \text{Automorphisms}(S)$

BY DEF *Automorphisms*, ******

LEMMA *PermsOfLemma* \triangleq

ASSUME NEW *T*, NEW *s* \in *Seq*(*T*), NEW *t* \in *PermsOf*(*s*)

PROVE $\wedge t \in \text{Seq}(T)$

$\wedge \text{Len}(t) = \text{Len}(s)$

$\wedge \forall i \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(s) : \exists j \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(s) : t[i] = s[j]$
 $\wedge \forall i \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(s) : \exists j \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(t) : t[j] = s[i]$
 BY DOMAIN $t = \text{DOMAIN } s \text{ DEF } \text{PermsOf}, \text{Automorphisms}, **$

LEMMA $\text{PermsOfPermsOf} \triangleq$
 ASSUME NEW T , NEW $s \in \text{Seq}(T)$, NEW $t \in \text{PermsOf}(s)$, NEW $u \in \text{PermsOf}(t)$
 PROVE $u \in \text{PermsOf}(s)$
 ⟨1⟩1. PICK $f \in \text{Automorphisms}(\text{DOMAIN } s) : t = s ** f$
 BY DEF PermsOf
 ⟨1⟩2. PICK $g \in \text{Automorphisms}(\text{DOMAIN } t) : u = t ** g$
 BY DEF PermsOf
 ⟨1⟩3. DOMAIN $t = \text{DOMAIN } s$
 BY PermsOfLemma
 ⟨1⟩4. $f ** g \in \text{Automorphisms}(\text{DOMAIN } s)$
 BY ⟨1⟩3, $\text{AutomorphismsCompose}$
 ⟨1⟩5. $u = s ** (f ** g)$
 BY ⟨1⟩1, ⟨1⟩2, ⟨1⟩3, $\text{Zenon DEF Automorphisms}, **$
 ⟨1⟩.QED BY ⟨1⟩4, ⟨1⟩5 DEF PermsOf

We define $\text{Max}(S)$ and $\text{Min}(S)$ to be the maximum and minimum, respectively, of a finite, non-empty set S of integers.

$\text{Max}(S) \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } x \in S : \forall y \in S : x \geq y$
 $\text{Min}(S) \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } x \in S : \forall y \in S : x \leq y$

LEMMA $\text{MinIsMin} \triangleq$
 ASSUME NEW $S \in \text{SUBSET } \text{Int}$, NEW $x \in S$, $\forall y \in S : x \leq y$
 PROVE $x = \text{Min}(S)$
 BY DEF Min

LEMMA $\text{MaxIsMax} \triangleq$
 ASSUME NEW $S \in \text{SUBSET } \text{Int}$, NEW $x \in S$, $\forall y \in S : x \geq y$
 PROVE $x = \text{Max}(S)$
 BY DEF Max

LEMMA $\text{NonemptyMin} \triangleq$
 ASSUME NEW $S \in \text{SUBSET } \text{Int}$, $\text{IsFiniteSet}(S)$, NEW $x \in S$
 PROVE $\wedge \text{Min}(S) \in S$
 $\wedge \text{Min}(S) \leq x$
 ⟨1⟩.DEFINE $P(T) \triangleq T \in \text{SUBSET } \text{Int} \Rightarrow$
 $\wedge T \neq \{\} \Rightarrow \text{Min}(T) \in T$
 $\wedge \forall x \in T : \text{Min}(T) \leq x$
 ⟨1⟩1. $P(\{\})$
 OBVIOUS
 ⟨1⟩2. ASSUME NEW T , NEW x , $x \notin T$, $P(T)$
 PROVE $P(T \cup \{x\})$
 ⟨2⟩.HAVE $T \cup \{x\} \in \text{SUBSET } \text{Int}$

$\langle 2 \rangle 1.$ CASE $T = \{\}$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 1.$ $x = \text{Min}(T \cup \{x\})$
BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1$ DEF Min
 $\langle 3 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1, \langle 3 \rangle 1$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 2.$ CASE $T \neq \{\}$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 1.$ CASE $x < \text{Min}(T)$
 $\langle 4 \rangle 1.$ $\wedge x \in T \cup \{x\}$
 $\wedge \forall y \in T \cup \{x\} : x \leq y$
BY $\langle 1 \rangle 2, \langle 3 \rangle 1$
 $\langle 4 \rangle 2.$ $x = \text{Min}(T \cup \{x\})$
BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1$ DEF Min
 $\langle 4 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 2.$ CASE $\neg(x < \text{Min}(T))$
 $\langle 4 \rangle.$ DEFINE $mn \triangleq \text{Min}(T)$
 $\langle 4 \rangle 1.$ $\wedge mn \in T \cup \{x\}$
 $\wedge \forall y \in T \cup \{x\} : mn \leq y$
BY $\langle 1 \rangle 2, \langle 2 \rangle 2, \langle 3 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 4 \rangle.$ HIDE DEF mn
 $\langle 4 \rangle 2.$ $mn = \text{Min}(T \cup \{x\})$
BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1$ DEF Min
 $\langle 4 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 3 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1, \langle 3 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 2 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1, \langle 2 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 1 \rangle 3.$ $\forall T : \text{IsFiniteSet}(T) \Rightarrow P(T)$
 $\langle 2 \rangle.$ HIDE DEF P
 $\langle 2 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 1 \rangle 1, \langle 1 \rangle 2, \text{FS_Induction}, \text{IsaM}(\text{"blast"})$
 $\langle 1 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 1 \rangle 3$

LEMMA $\text{NonemptyMax} \triangleq$
ASSUME NEW $S \in \text{SUBSET Int}, \text{IsFiniteSet}(S), \text{NEW } x \in S$
PROVE $\wedge \text{Max}(S) \in S$
 $\wedge x \leq \text{Max}(S)$
 $\langle 1 \rangle.$ DEFINE $P(T) \triangleq T \in \text{SUBSET Int} \Rightarrow$
 $\wedge T \neq \{\} \Rightarrow \text{Max}(T) \in T$
 $\wedge \forall x \in T : x \leq \text{Max}(T)$

$\langle 1 \rangle 1.$ $P(\{\})$
OBVIOUS
 $\langle 1 \rangle 2.$ ASSUME NEW $T, \text{NEW } x, x \notin T, P(T)$
PROVE $P(T \cup \{x\})$
 $\langle 2 \rangle.$ HAVE $T \cup \{x\} \in \text{SUBSET Int}$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 1.$ CASE $T = \{\}$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 1.$ $x = \text{Max}(T \cup \{x\})$
BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1$ DEF Max
 $\langle 3 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1, \langle 3 \rangle 1$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 2.$ CASE $T \neq \{\}$

```

<3>1.CASE  $x > \text{Max}(T)$ 
  <4>1.  $\wedge x \in T \cup \{x\}$ 
     $\wedge \forall y \in T \cup \{x\} : x \geq y$ 
    BY <1>2, <3>1
  <4>2.  $x = \text{Max}(T \cup \{x\})$ 
    BY <4>1 DEF Max
  <4>.QED BY <4>1, <4>2
<3>2.CASE  $\neg(x > \text{Max}(T))$ 
  <4>.DEFINE  $mx \triangleq \text{Max}(T)$ 
  <4>1.  $\wedge mx \in T \cup \{x\}$ 
     $\wedge \forall y \in T \cup \{x\} : y \leq mx$ 
    BY <1>2, <2>2, <3>2
  <4>.HIDE DEF mx
  <4>2.  $mx = \text{Max}(T \cup \{x\})$ 
    BY <4>1 DEF Max
  <4>.QED BY <4>1, <4>2
<3>.QED BY <3>1, <3>2
<2>.QED BY <2>1, <2>2
<1>3.  $\forall T : \text{IsFiniteSet}(T) \Rightarrow P(T)$ 
  <2>.HIDE DEF P
  <2>.QED BY <1>1, <1>2, FS_Induction, IsaM("blast")
<1>.QED BY <1>3

```

LEMMA *IntervalMinMax* \triangleq
 ASSUME NEW $i \in \text{Int}$, NEW $j \in \text{Int}$, $i \leq j$
 PROVE $i = \text{Min}(i \dots j) \wedge j = \text{Max}(i \dots j)$
 BY DEF *Min*, *Max*

The operator *Partitions* is defined so that if I is an interval that's a subset of $1 \dots \text{Len}(s)$ and $p \in \text{Min}(I) \dots \text{Max}(I) - 1$, the *Partitions*(I, p, seq) is the set of all new values of sequence *seq* that a partition procedure is allowed to produce for the subinterval I using the pivot index p . That is, it's the set of all permutations of *seq* that leaves *seq*[i] unchanged if i is not in I and permutes the values of *seq*[i] for i in I so that the values for $i \leq p$ are less than or equal to the values for $i > p$.

Partitions(I, p, s) \triangleq
 $\{t \in \text{PermsOf}(s) :$
 $\wedge \forall i \in (1 \dots \text{Len}(s)) \setminus I : t[i] = s[i]$
 $\wedge \forall i \in I : \exists j \in I : t[i] = s[j]$
 $\wedge \forall i, j \in I : (i \leq p) \wedge (p < j) \Rightarrow (t[i] \leq t[j])\}$

LEMMA *PartitionsLemma* \triangleq
 ASSUME NEW T , NEW $s \in \text{Seq}(T)$, NEW $I \in \text{SUBSET}(1 \dots \text{Len}(s))$,
 NEW $p \in I$, NEW $t \in \text{Partitions}(I, p, s)$
 PROVE $\wedge t \in \text{Seq}(T)$
 $\wedge \text{Len}(t) = \text{Len}(s)$
 $\wedge \forall i \in (1 \dots \text{Len}(s)) \setminus I : t[i] = s[i]$
 $\wedge \forall i \in I : \exists j \in I : t[i] = s[j]$

$\wedge \forall i, j \in I : i \leq p \wedge p < j \Rightarrow t[i] \leq t[j]$

BY *PermsOfLemma* DEF *Partitions*

Our algorithm has three variables:

seq : The array to be sorted.

seq0 : Holds the initial value of *seq*, for checking the result.

U : A set of intervals that are subsets of $1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0})$, an interval being a nonempty set *I* of integers that equals $\text{Min}(I) \dots \text{Max}(I)$. Initially, *U* equals the set containing just the single interval consisting of the entire set $1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0})$.

The algorithm repeatedly does the following:

- Chose an arbitrary interval *I* in *U*.
- If *I* consists of a single element, remove *I* from *U*.
- Otherwise :
 - Let *I1* be an initial interval of *I* and *I2* be the rest of *I*.
 - Let *newseq* be an array that's the same as *seq* except that the elements *seq*[*x*] with *x* in *I* are permuted so that *newseq*[*y*] ≤ *newseq*[*z*] for any *y* in *I1* and *z* in *I2*.
 - Set *seq* to *newseq*.
 - Remove *I* from *U* and add *I1* and *I2* to *U*.

It stops when *U* is empty. Below is the algorithm written in *PlusCal*.

```
*****
--fair algorithm Quicksort{
  variables  seq ∈ Seq(Values) \ {⟨⟩}, seq0 = seq,  U = {1 .. Len(seq)};
  { a: while ( U ≠ {} )
    { with ( I ∈ U )
      { if ( Cardinality(I) = 1 )
        { U := U \ {I} }
      else
        { with ( p ∈ Min(I) .. (Max(I) - 1),
          I1 = Min(I) .. p,
          I2 = (p + 1) .. Max(I),
          newseq ∈ Partitions(I, p, seq) )
          { seq := newseq;
            U := (U \ {I}) ∪ {I1, I2} } } } } }
```

Below is the TLA+ translation of the *PlusCal* code.

```
BEGIN TRANSLATION
VARIABLES seq, seq0, U, pc

vars ≜ ⟨seq, seq0, U, pc⟩

Init ≜ Global variables
      ∧ seq ∈ Seq(Values) \ {⟨⟩}
```

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge seq0 = seq \\
& \wedge U = \{1 \dots Len(seq)\} \\
& \wedge pc = \text{"a"} \\
a \triangleq & \wedge pc = \text{"a"} \\
& \wedge \text{IF } U \neq \{\} \\
& \quad \text{THEN } \wedge \exists I \in U : \\
& \quad \quad \text{IF } Cardinality(I) = 1 \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{THEN } \wedge U' = U \setminus \{I\} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \wedge seq' = seq \\
& \quad \quad \text{ELSE } \wedge \exists p \in Min(I) \dots (Max(I) - 1) : \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{LET } I1 \triangleq Min(I) \dots p \text{ IN} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{LET } I2 \triangleq (p + 1) \dots Max(I) \text{ IN} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \exists newseq \in Partitions(I, p, seq) : \\
& \quad \quad \quad \wedge seq' = newseq \\
& \quad \quad \quad \wedge U' = ((U \setminus \{I\}) \cup \{I1, I2\}) \\
& \quad \wedge pc' = \text{"a"} \\
& \quad \text{ELSE } \wedge pc' = \text{"Done"} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle seq, U \rangle \\
& \wedge seq0' = seq0
\end{aligned}$$

Allow infinite stuttering to prevent deadlock on termination.

$$Terminating \triangleq pc = \text{"Done"} \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } vars$$

$$Next \triangleq a \vee Terminating$$

$$Spec \triangleq \wedge Init \wedge \Box [Next]_{vars} \wedge WF_{vars}(Next)$$

$$Termination \triangleq \Diamond (pc = \text{"Done"})$$

END TRANSLATION

$PCorrect$ is the postcondition invariant that the algorithm should satisfy. You can use TLC to check this for a model in which $Seq(S)$ is redefined to equal the set of sequences of at elements in S with length at most 4. A little thought shows that it then suffices to let $Values$ be a set of 4 integers.

$$\begin{aligned}
PCorrect \triangleq & (pc = \text{"Done"}) \Rightarrow \\
& \wedge seq \in PermsOf(seq0) \\
& \wedge \forall p, q \in 1 \dots Len(seq) : p < q \Rightarrow seq[p] \leq seq[q]
\end{aligned}$$

Below are some definitions leading up to the definition of the inductive invariant Inv used to prove the postcondition $PCorrect$. The partial TLA+ proof follows. As explained in "Proving Safety Properties", you can use TLC to check the level-1 proof steps. TLC can do those checks on a model in which all sequences have length at most 3.

$$UV \triangleq U \cup \{\{i\} : i \in 1 \dots Len(seq) \setminus \text{UNION } U\}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
DomainPartitions \triangleq & \{DP \in \text{SUBSET SUBSET } (1 \dots Len(seq0)) : \\
& \wedge (\text{UNION } DP) = 1 \dots Len(seq0) \\
& \wedge \forall I \in DP : I = Min(I) \dots Max(I) \\
& \wedge \forall I \in DP : \exists mn, mx \in 1 \dots Len(seq0) : I = mn \dots mx \\
& \wedge \forall I, J \in DP : (I \neq J) \Rightarrow (I \cap J = \{\})\}
\end{aligned}$$

$$RelSorted(I, J) \triangleq \forall i \in I, j \in J : (i < j) \Rightarrow (seq[i] \leq seq[j])$$

$$\begin{aligned}
TypeOK \triangleq & \wedge seq \in Seq(Values) \setminus \{\langle \rangle\} \\
& \wedge seq0 \in Seq(Values) \setminus \{\langle \rangle\} \\
& \wedge U \in \text{SUBSET } ((\text{SUBSET } (1 \dots Len(seq0))) \setminus \{\{\}\}) \\
& \wedge pc \in \{\text{"a"}, \text{"Done"}\}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
Inv \triangleq & \wedge TypeOK \\
& \wedge (pc = \text{"Done"}) \Rightarrow (U = \{\}) \\
& \wedge UV \in DomainPartitions \\
& \wedge seq \in PermsOf(seq0) \\
& \wedge \text{UNION } UV = 1 \dots Len(seq0) \\
& \wedge \forall I, J \in UV : (I \neq J) \Rightarrow RelSorted(I, J)
\end{aligned}$$

THEOREM $Spec \Rightarrow \Box PCorrect$

$\langle 1 \rangle 1. Init \Rightarrow Inv$

$\langle 2 \rangle$ SUFFICES ASSUME $Init$

PROVE Inv

OBVIOUS

$\langle 2 \rangle 1. TypeOK$

$\langle 3 \rangle 1. seq \in Seq(Values) \setminus \{\langle \rangle\}$

BY DEF $Init, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, RelSorted, UV$

$\langle 3 \rangle 2. seq0 \in Seq(Values) \setminus \{\langle \rangle\}$

BY DEF $Init, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, RelSorted, UV$

$\langle 3 \rangle 3. U \in \text{SUBSET } ((\text{SUBSET } (1 \dots Len(seq0))) \setminus \{\{\}\})$

$\langle 4 \rangle 1. Len(seq0) \in Nat \wedge Len(seq0) > 0$

BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1, EmptySeq, LenProperties$ DEF $Init$

$\langle 4 \rangle 2. 1 \dots Len(seq0) \neq \{\}$

BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1$

$\langle 4 \rangle 3. QED$

BY $\langle 4 \rangle 2, U = \{1 \dots Len(seq0)\}$ DEF $Init$

$\langle 3 \rangle 4. pc \in \{\text{"a"}, \text{"Done"}\}$

BY DEF $Init, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, RelSorted, UV$

$\langle 3 \rangle 5. QED$

BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1, \langle 3 \rangle 2, \langle 3 \rangle 3, \langle 3 \rangle 4$ DEF $TypeOK$

$\langle 2 \rangle 2. pc = \text{"Done"} \Rightarrow U = \{\}$

BY DEF $Init$

$\langle 2 \rangle 3. UV \in DomainPartitions$

BY DEF $Init, UV, DomainPartitions$

$\langle 2 \rangle 4. seq \in PermsOf(seq0)$

$\langle 3 \rangle 1. seq \in PermsOf(seq)$
 $\langle 4 \rangle. \text{DEFINE } f \triangleq [i \in 1 \dots Len(seq) \mapsto i]$
 $\langle 4 \rangle. \wedge f \in [DOMAIN seq \rightarrow DOMAIN seq]$
 $\wedge \forall y \in DOMAIN seq : \exists x \in DOMAIN seq : f[x] = y$
 BY DEF *Init*
 $\langle 4 \rangle. \text{QED BY DEF } Init, PermsOf, Automorphisms, **$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 2. \text{QED}$
 BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1$ DEF *Init*
 $\langle 2 \rangle 5. \text{UNION } UV = 1 \dots Len(seq0)$
 BY DEF *Init, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, RelSorted, UV*
 $\langle 2 \rangle 6. \forall I, J \in UV : (I \neq J) \Rightarrow RelSorted(I, J)$
 BY DEF *Init, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, RelSorted, UV*
 $\langle 2 \rangle 7. \text{QED}$
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1, \langle 2 \rangle 2, \langle 2 \rangle 3, \langle 2 \rangle 4, \langle 2 \rangle 5, \langle 2 \rangle 6$ DEF *Inv*
 $\langle 1 \rangle 2. Inv \wedge [Next]_{vars} \Rightarrow Inv'$
 $\langle 2 \rangle \text{SUFFICES ASSUME } Inv,$
 $[Next]_{vars}$
 PROVE Inv'
 OBVIOUS
 $\langle 2 \rangle 1. \text{CASE } a$
 $\langle 3 \rangle \text{USE } \langle 2 \rangle 1$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 1. \text{CASE } U \neq \{\}$
 $\langle 4 \rangle 1. \wedge pc = "a"$
 $\wedge pc' = "a"$
 BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1$ DEF *a*
 $\langle 4 \rangle 2. \text{PICK } I \in U : a!2!2!1!(I)$
 $a!2!2!1(I)$ is the formula following $\exists I \in U :$ in the definition of *a*.
 BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1$ DEF *a*
 $\langle 4 \rangle 3. \text{CASE } Cardinality(I) = 1$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 1. \wedge U' = U \setminus \{I\}$
 $\wedge seq' = seq$
 $\wedge seq0' = seq0$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 2, \langle 4 \rangle 3$ DEF *a*
 $\langle 5 \rangle. IsFiniteSet(I)$
 $\langle 6 \rangle. IsFiniteSet(1 \dots Len(seq0))$
 BY *FS_Interval* DEF *Inv, TypeOK*
 $\langle 6 \rangle. I \subseteq 1 \dots Len(seq0)$
 BY DEF *Inv, TypeOK*
 $\langle 6 \rangle. \text{QED BY } FS_Subset$
 $\langle 5 \rangle j. \text{PICK } j : I = \{j\}$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 3, FS_Singleton$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 2. \text{QED}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 1. UV' = UV$
 The action removes a singleton set $\{j\}$ from U , which adds j to the set $\{\{i\} : i \in 1 \dots Len(seq) \setminus \text{UNION } U\}$, thereby keeping it in UV .

$\langle 7 \rangle 1. j \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq})$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle j, \text{PermsOfLemma}$ DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 2. \forall J \in U : I \neq J \Rightarrow j \notin J$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle j, \text{Zenon}$ DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}, \text{DomainPartitions}, UV$
 $\langle 7 \rangle$.QED BY $\langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 5 \rangle j, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 7 \rangle 2$ DEF UV
 $\langle 6 \rangle 2. \text{TypeOK}'$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 1$
 DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}, \text{DomainPartitions}, \text{PermsOf}, \text{RelSorted}, \text{Min}, \text{Max}, UV$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 3. ((pc = \text{"Done"}) \Rightarrow (U = \{\}))'$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 1$
 DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}, \text{DomainPartitions}, \text{PermsOf}, \text{RelSorted}, \text{Min}, \text{Max}, UV$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 4. (UV \in \text{DomainPartitions})'$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 1$
 DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}, \text{DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 5. (\text{seq} \in \text{PermsOf}(\text{seq0}))'$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 1, \text{Isa}$
 DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}, \text{PermsOf}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 6. (\text{UNION } UV = 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0}))'$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 1$ DEF Inv
 $\langle 6 \rangle 7. (\forall I_1, J \in UV : (I_1 \neq J) \Rightarrow \text{RelSorted}(I_1, J))'$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 1$
 DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}, \text{RelSorted}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 8.$ QED
 BY $\langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle 3, \langle 6 \rangle 4, \langle 6 \rangle 5, \langle 6 \rangle 6, \langle 6 \rangle 7$ DEF Inv
 $\langle 4 \rangle 4.$ CASE $\text{Cardinality}(I) \neq 1$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 1. \text{seq0}' = \text{seq0}$
 BY DEF a
 $\langle 5 \rangle I.$ PICK $mn \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0}), mx \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0}) : I = mn \dots mx$
 BY DEF $\text{Inv}, UV, \text{DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 5 \rangle mn. mn < mx$
 $\langle 6 \rangle.$ SUFFICES ASSUME $mn \geq mx$ PROVE FALSE
 OBVIOUS
 $\langle 6 \rangle 1.$ CASE $mn > mx$
 $\langle 7 \rangle. I = \{\}$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle I, \langle 6 \rangle 1$
 $\langle 7 \rangle.$ QED BY DEF $\text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 2.$ CASE $mn = mx$
 $\langle 7 \rangle. I = \{mn\}$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle I, \langle 6 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 7 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 4 \rangle 4, \text{FS_Singleton}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle.$ QED BY $\langle 6 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 5 \rangle$ DEFINE $I1(p) \triangleq mn \dots p$
 $I2(p) \triangleq (p + 1) \dots mx$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 2.$ PICK $p \in mn \dots (mx - 1) :$
 $\wedge \text{seq}' \in \text{Partitions}(I, p, \text{seq})$

$\wedge U' = ((U \setminus \{I\}) \cup \{I1(p), I2(p)\})$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 2, \langle 4 \rangle 4, \langle 5 \rangle I, \langle 5 \rangle mn, IntervalMinMax$
 $\langle 5 \rangle p. mn \leq p \wedge p < mx$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle mn$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 3. \wedge \wedge I1(p) \neq \{\}$
 $\wedge I1(p) \subseteq 1 \dots Len(seq0)$
 $\wedge \wedge I2(p) \neq \{\}$
 $\wedge I2(p) \subseteq 1 \dots Len(seq0)$
 $\wedge I1(p) \cap I2(p) = \{\}$
 $\wedge I1(p) \cup I2(p) = I$
 $\wedge \forall i \in I1(p), j \in I2(p) : (i < j) \wedge (seq[i] \leq seq[j])$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 1. mn \in I1(p) \wedge mx \in I2(p)$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle p$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 2. \wedge I1(p) \subseteq 1 \dots Len(seq0)$
 $\wedge I2(p) \subseteq 1 \dots Len(seq0)$
 BY DEF *Inv, TypeOK*
 $\langle 6 \rangle 4. I1(p) \cup I2(p) = I$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle I$
 $\langle 6 \rangle. QED$ BY $\langle 6 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle 4$
 Since I is in U , invariant *Inv* implies I is a non-empty subinterval of $1 \dots Len(seq)$, and the $\langle 4 \rangle 4$ case assumption implies $Min(I) < Max(I)$. Therefore $I1(p)$ and $I2(p)$ are nonempty subintervals of $1 \dots Len(seq)$. It's clear from the definitions of $I1(p)$ and $I2(p)$ that they are disjoint sets whose union is I . The final conjunct follows from the definition of *Partitions*(I, p, seq).
 $\langle 5 \rangle 4. \wedge seq' \in Seq(Values)$
 $\wedge Len(seq) = Len(seq')$
 $\wedge Len(seq) = Len(seq0)$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle 2, PermsOfLemma$ DEF *Partitions, Inv, TypeOK*
 $\langle 5 \rangle 5. UNION U = UNION U'$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 5 \rangle 3$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 6. UV' = (UV \setminus \{I\}) \cup \{I1(p), I2(p)\}$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 5 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 4, \langle 5 \rangle 5$ DEF *UV*
 $\langle 5 \rangle 7. TypeOK'$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 1. (seq \in Seq(Values) \setminus \{\langle \rangle\})'$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle 4$ DEF *Inv, TypeOK*
 $\langle 6 \rangle 2. (seq0 \in Seq(Values) \setminus \{\langle \rangle\})'$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle 1$ DEF *TypeOK, Inv*
 $\langle 6 \rangle 3. (U \in SUBSET ((SUBSET (1 \dots Len(seq0))) \setminus \{\{\}\}))'$
 BY $\langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 5 \rangle 3$ DEF *Inv, TypeOK*
 $\langle 6 \rangle 4. (pc \in \{\text{"a"}, \text{"Done"}\})'$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 5. QED$
 BY $\langle 6 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle 3, \langle 6 \rangle 4$ DEF *TypeOK*
 $\langle 5 \rangle 8. ((pc = \text{"Done"}) \Rightarrow (U = \{\}))'$
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1$

$\langle 5 \rangle 9. (UV \in \text{DomainPartitions})'$
 $\langle 6 \rangle \text{ HIDE DEF } I1, I2$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 1. UV' \in \text{SUBSET SUBSET } (1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0}'))$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 6, \langle 5 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 4, \langle 5 \rangle 1 \text{ DEF } Inv$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 2. \text{UNION } UV' = 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0}')$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 6, \langle 5 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 4, \langle 5 \rangle 1 \text{ DEF } Inv$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 3. \text{ASSUME NEW } J \in UV'$
 $\text{PROVE } \exists i, j \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0}') : J = i \dots j$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 5 \rangle \text{mn}, \langle 5 \rangle 6 \text{ DEF } Inv, \text{TypeOK}, \text{DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 4. \text{ASSUME NEW } J \in UV', \text{NEW } K \in UV', J \neq K$
 $\text{PROVE } J \cap K = \{\}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 1. \text{CASE } J \in UV \wedge K \in UV$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 4, \langle 7 \rangle 1 \text{ DEF } Inv, \text{DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 2. \text{CASE } J \in (UV \setminus \{I\}) \wedge K \in \{I1(p), I2(p)\}$
 $\langle 8 \rangle. J \cap I = \{\}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 7 \rangle 2 \text{ DEF } UV, Inv, \text{DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 8 \rangle. \text{QED BY } \langle 7 \rangle 2, \langle 5 \rangle I$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 3. \text{CASE } J \in \{I1(p), I2(p)\} \wedge K \in (UV \setminus \{I\})$
 $\langle 8 \rangle. K \cap I = \{\}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 7 \rangle 3 \text{ DEF } UV, Inv, \text{DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 8 \rangle. \text{QED BY } \langle 7 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle I$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 4. \text{CASE } J \in \{I1(p), I2(p)\} \wedge K \in \{I1(p), I2(p)\}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 4, \langle 7 \rangle 4$
 $\langle 7 \rangle. \text{QED BY } \langle 5 \rangle 6, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 7 \rangle 2, \langle 7 \rangle 3, \langle 7 \rangle 4$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 5. \text{QED}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle 3, \langle 6 \rangle 4 \text{ DEF } \text{DomainPartitions}, \text{Min}, \text{Max}$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 10. (\text{seq} \in \text{PermsOf}(\text{seq0}))'$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 5 \rangle 2, \text{PermsOfPermsOf} \text{ DEF } Inv, \text{TypeOK}, \text{Partitions}$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 11. (\text{UNION } UV = 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq0}))'$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 6, \langle 5 \rangle 3, \langle 5 \rangle 4, \langle 5 \rangle 1 \text{ DEF } Inv$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 12. (\forall II, JJ \in UV : (II \neq JJ) \Rightarrow \text{RelSorted}(II, JJ))'$
 $\langle 6 \rangle \text{ SUFFICES ASSUME NEW } II \in UV', \text{NEW } JJ \in UV',$
 $II \neq JJ,$
 $\text{NEW } i \in II, \text{NEW } j \in JJ,$
 $i < j$
 $\text{PROVE } \text{seq}'[i] \leq \text{seq}'[j]$
 $\text{BY DEF } \text{RelSorted}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle. \wedge i \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq})$
 $\wedge j \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq})$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 1, \langle 5 \rangle 4, \langle 5 \rangle 9 \text{ DEF } \text{DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle I. \wedge I \in \text{SUBSET } (1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq}))$
 $\wedge p \in I$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle I, \langle 5 \rangle 2, \text{PermsOfLemma} \text{ DEF } Inv, \text{TypeOK}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 1. \text{CASE } II \in UV \setminus \{I\} \wedge JJ \in UV \setminus \{I\}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle 1, \text{Zenon}$

$\text{DEF } \text{Inv}, \text{TypeOK}, UV, \text{DomainPartitions}, \text{Partitions}, \text{RelSorted}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 2. \text{CASE } II \in UV \setminus \{I\} \wedge JJ \in \{I1(p), I2(p)\}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 1. JJ \subseteq I$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 3, \langle 6 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 3. \text{PICK } k \in I : seq'[j] = seq[k]$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle I, \text{PartitionsLemma DEF Inv, TypeOK}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 4. II \cap I = \{\}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 2, \text{Zenon DEF UV, Inv, DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 5. \text{PICK } mnI, mxI \in 1 \dots Len(seq0) : II = mnI \dots mxI$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 2 \text{ DEF Inv, DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 5. i < k$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle I, \langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 7 \rangle 4 \text{ DEF Inv, TypeOK}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 6. seq[i] \leq seq[k]$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 7 \rangle 5 \text{ DEF Inv, RelSorted, UV}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 7. seq'[i] = seq[i]$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle I, \langle 7 \rangle 4, \text{PartitionsLemma DEF Inv, TypeOK}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle \text{.QED BY } \langle 7 \rangle 3, \langle 7 \rangle 6, \langle 7 \rangle 7$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 3. \text{CASE } II \in \{I1(p), I2(p)\} \wedge JJ \in UV \setminus \{I\}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 1. II \subseteq I$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 3, \langle 6 \rangle 3$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 3. \text{PICK } k \in I : seq'[i] = seq[k]$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle I, \text{PartitionsLemma DEF Inv, TypeOK}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 4. JJ \cap I = \{\}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 3, \text{Zenon DEF UV, Inv, DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 5. \text{PICK } mnJ, mxJ \in 1 \dots Len(seq0) : JJ = mnJ \dots mxJ$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 3 \text{ DEF Inv, DomainPartitions}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 5. k < j$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle I, \langle 6 \rangle 3, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 7 \rangle 4 \text{ DEF Inv, TypeOK}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 6. seq[k] \leq seq[j]$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 3, \langle 7 \rangle 1, \langle 7 \rangle 5 \text{ DEF Inv, RelSorted, UV}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle 7. seq'[j] = seq[j]$
 $\langle 8 \rangle 1. j \in (1 \dots Len(seq)) \setminus I$
 $\text{BY } \langle 7 \rangle 4$
 $\langle 8 \rangle 2. \wedge seq \in Seq(Values)$
 $\wedge seq' \in Partitions(I, p, seq)$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 2 \text{ DEF Inv, TypeOK}$
 $\langle 8 \rangle \text{.QED BY } \langle 6 \rangle I, \langle 8 \rangle 1, \langle 8 \rangle 2, \text{PartitionsLemma}$
 $\langle 7 \rangle \text{.QED BY } \langle 7 \rangle 3, \langle 7 \rangle 6, \langle 7 \rangle 7$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 4. \text{CASE } II = I1(p) \wedge JJ = I2(p)$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 2, \langle 5 \rangle 3, \langle 6 \rangle I, \langle 6 \rangle 4, \text{PartitionsLemma DEF Inv, TypeOK}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle 5. \text{CASE } II = I2(p) \wedge JJ = I2(p)$
 $\text{BY } \langle 6 \rangle 5 \text{ contradiction: } i < j \text{ impossible}$
 $\langle 6 \rangle \text{ QED BY } \langle 5 \rangle 6, \langle 6 \rangle 1, \langle 6 \rangle 2, \langle 6 \rangle 3, \langle 6 \rangle 4, \langle 6 \rangle 5$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 13. \text{QED}$
 $\text{BY } \langle 5 \rangle 7, \langle 5 \rangle 8, \langle 5 \rangle 9, \langle 5 \rangle 10, \langle 5 \rangle 11, \langle 5 \rangle 12 \text{ DEF Inv}$

$\langle 4 \rangle 5.$ QED
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 3, \langle 4 \rangle 4$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 2.$ CASE $U = \{\}$
 $\langle 4 \rangle$ USE $\langle 3 \rangle 2$ DEF $a, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, PermsOf, RelSorted, Min, Max, UV$
 $\langle 4 \rangle 1.$ $TypeOK'$
 OBVIOUS
 $\langle 4 \rangle 2.$ $((pc = \text{"Done"}) \Rightarrow (U = \{\}))'$
 OBVIOUS
 $\langle 4 \rangle 3.$ $(UV \in DomainPartitions)'$
 BY Isa
 $\langle 4 \rangle 4.$ $(seq \in PermsOf(seq0))'$
 BY Isa
 $\langle 4 \rangle 5.$ $(UNION\ UV = 1 \dots Len(seq0))'$
 OBVIOUS
 $\langle 4 \rangle 6.$ $(\forall I, J \in UV : (I \neq J) \Rightarrow RelSorted(I, J))'$
 OBVIOUS
 $\langle 4 \rangle 7.$ QED
 BY $\langle 4 \rangle 1, \langle 4 \rangle 2, \langle 4 \rangle 3, \langle 4 \rangle 4, \langle 4 \rangle 5, \langle 4 \rangle 6, Zenon$ DEF Inv
 $\langle 3 \rangle 3.$ QED
 BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1, \langle 3 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 2.$ CASE UNCHANGED $vars$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 1.$ $TypeOK'$
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 2$ DEF $vars, Inv, TypeOK$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 2.$ $((pc = \text{"Done"}) \Rightarrow (U = \{\}))'$
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 2$ DEF $vars, Inv$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 3.$ $(UV \in DomainPartitions)'$
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 2, Isa$ DEF $vars, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, UV$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 4.$ $(seq \in PermsOf(seq0))'$
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 2, Isa$ DEF $vars, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, PermsOf$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 5.$ $(UNION\ UV = 1 \dots Len(seq0))'$
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 2$ DEF $vars, Inv, UV$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 6.$ $(\forall I, J \in UV : (I \neq J) \Rightarrow RelSorted(I, J))'$
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 2$ DEF $vars, Inv, TypeOK, DomainPartitions, PermsOf, RelSorted, UV$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 7.$ QED
 BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1, \langle 3 \rangle 2, \langle 3 \rangle 3, \langle 3 \rangle 4, \langle 3 \rangle 5, \langle 3 \rangle 6$ DEF Inv
 $\langle 2 \rangle 3.$ QED
 BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1, \langle 2 \rangle 2$ DEF $Next, Terminating$
 $\langle 1 \rangle 3.$ $Inv \Rightarrow PCorrect$
 $\langle 2 \rangle$ SUFFICES ASSUME $Inv,$
 $pc = \text{"Done"}$
 PROVE $\wedge seq \in PermsOf(seq0)$
 $\wedge \forall p, q \in 1 \dots Len(seq) : p < q \Rightarrow seq[p] \leq seq[q]$
 BY DEF $PCorrect$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 1.$ $seq \in PermsOf(seq0)$
 BY DEF Inv

$\langle 2 \rangle 2. \forall p, q \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq}) : p < q \Rightarrow \text{seq}[p] \leq \text{seq}[q]$
 $\langle 3 \rangle$ SUFFICES ASSUME NEW $p \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq})$, NEW $q \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq})$,
 $p < q$
PROVE $\text{seq}[p] \leq \text{seq}[q]$
OBVIOUS
 $\langle 3 \rangle 1. \wedge \text{Len}(\text{seq}) = \text{Len}(\text{seq}0)$
 $\wedge \text{Len}(\text{seq}) \in \text{Nat}$
 $\wedge \text{Len}(\text{seq}) > 0$
BY *PermsOfLemma* DEF *Inv*, *TypeOK*
 $\langle 3 \rangle 2. UV = \{\{i\} : i \in 1 \dots \text{Len}(\text{seq})\}$
BY $U = \{\}$ DEF *Inv*, *TypeOK*, *UV*
 $\langle 3 \rangle 3. \{p\} \in UV \wedge \{q\} \in UV$
BY $\langle 3 \rangle 1, \langle 3 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 3 \rangle$ QED
BY $\langle 3 \rangle 3$ DEF *Inv*, *RelSorted*
 $\langle 2 \rangle 3.$ QED
BY $\langle 2 \rangle 1, \langle 2 \rangle 2$
 $\langle 1 \rangle 4.$ QED
BY $\langle 1 \rangle 1, \langle 1 \rangle 2, \langle 1 \rangle 3, \text{PTL}$ DEF *Spec*

\ * Created *Mon Jun 27 08:20:07 PDT 2016* by lamport