

1) We first show that

$$r_0 \perp\!\!\!\perp Z|e(X_{Z=1}) \quad (1)$$

where  $e(X_{Z=1})$  is the distribution of the propensity score for the treated units.

Note that  $P(Z = 1|X) = E(Z|X)$ . Following Rosenbaum and Rubin, we have:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}(Z|r_0, e(X_{Z=1})) &= \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}[Z|r_0, X_{Z=1}]|r_0, e(X_{Z=1})] = \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}[Z|X_{Z=1}]|r_0, e(X_{Z=1})] \\ &= \mathbb{E}[e(X_{Z=1})|r_0, e(X_{Z=1})] = e(X_{Z=1}) \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\mathbb{E}(Z|e(X_{Z=1})) = \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}(Z|X_{Z=1})|e(X_{Z=1})] = \mathbb{E}(e(X_{Z=1})|e(X_{Z=1})) = e(X_{Z=1})$$

Thus,  $\mathbb{E}(Z|r_0, e(X_{Z=1})) = \mathbb{E}(Z|e(X_{Z=1}))$ , and so, (1) must hold.

Now, by (1) and the law of iterated expectations,

$$\begin{aligned} ATT &= \mathbb{E}(r_1 - r_0|Z = 1) = \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}(r_1|Z = 1, e(X_{Z=1}))] - \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}(r_0|Z = 1, e(X_{Z=1}))] \\ &= \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}(r_1|Z = 1, e(X_{Z=1}))] - \mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}(r_0|Z = 0, e(X_{Z=1}))] \end{aligned}$$

We can compute this last expression using actual data. By the assumption that  $e(X_{Z=1}) < 1$ , the expectation  $\mathbb{E}[\mathbb{E}(r_0|Z = 0, e(X_{Z=1}))]$  is well defined.

To estimate the ATE unbiasedly, we need to strengthen the conditions to

$$\begin{aligned} r_0, r_1 &\perp\!\!\!\perp Z|X \\ 0 &< e(X) < 1 \end{aligned}$$

These are the conditions outlined in Rosenbaum and Rubin (1983).