

Summary

Group08 do the identification of Raphael's paintings from the forgeries and post their source code onto Github so that users can replicate the experiment easily. They divide the dataset into training set, validation set and test set. Feature extraction is done by scattering net algorithm and VGG19 and image classification is shown by some traditional learning methods include PCA, SVM and KNN.

Strengths

Clear code that can be run on notebook.

They trained the net by themselves instead of use the exist well-trained nets.

Weakness

The report is not clear and hard to visualize because they just post the source code without figures or theoretical support.

Evaluation on Clarity and quality of writing (1-5) 1

There is no direct report in NIPS format or any poster. They did not show figures for their result.

Evaluation on Technical Quality (1-5): 3

The result seems technically sound and no obvious flaws in the reasoning. There are no claims and theoretical analysis. The experiment designed is well but it hard for readers to read directly. The result can be replicated easily by other users. There is no discussion part and thus no evaluation or reflection. No citations or comparison either.

Overall rating: 2

Confidence on your assessment (1-3)

2 I have carefully read the paper and checked the results