Verifying Snapping Mechanism - Floating Point Implementation Version

Jiawen Liu

February 21, 2020

In order to verify the differential privacy property of an implementation of the snapping mechanism [5], we follow the logic rules designed from [1] and the floating point error semantics from [7, 4, 2, 6].

1 Preliminary Definitions

Definition 1 (Laplace mechanism [3])

Let $\epsilon > 0$. The Laplace mechanism $\mathcal{L}_{\epsilon} : \mathbb{R} \to \mathsf{Distr}(\mathbb{R})$ is defined by $\mathcal{L}(t) = t + v$, where $v \in \mathbb{R}$ is drawn from the Laplace distribution $\mathsf{laplace}(\frac{1}{\epsilon})$.

2 Syntax

Following are the syntax of the system. The circled operators are rounded operation in floating point computation.

```
Floating Point Expr. e_{\mathbb{F}} ::= c \mid x \mid f(x) \mid e_{\mathbb{F}} \circledast e_{\mathbb{F}} \mid \textcircled{n}(e_{\mathbb{F}}) \mid x \xleftarrow{\$} \mu

Real Expr. e_{\mathbb{R}} ::= r \mid X \mid F(X) \mid e_{\mathbb{R}} \ast e_{\mathbb{R}} \mid \ln(e_{\mathbb{R}}) \mid X \xleftarrow{\$} \mu

Arithmetic Operation \ast ::= + \mid - \mid \times \mid \div

Value v ::= r \mid c

Distribution \mu ::= laplce | unif | bernoulli

Error err ::= (e_{\mathbb{R}}, e_{\mathbb{R}})
```

We use upper case for variables in real computation and lower case for variables in floating point computation. * represents the operation in floating point machine.

F(X) denotes function F evaluates to value F(X) given input X in real computation, and f(x) denotes the same function F evaluates to value f(x) given the same input x in floating point computation.

3 Semantics

The big step semantics with relative floating point computation error are shown in Figure. 1. The semantics are $e_{\mathbb{R}} \downarrow e_{\mathbb{F}}, err$, which means a real world expression $e_{\mathbb{R}}$ can be represented in floating point computation $e_{\mathbb{F}}$ with error bound err. The η is the machine epsilon.

$$\frac{c = \mathtt{fl}(r)}{r \Downarrow c, \left(\frac{r}{(1+\eta)}, r(1+\eta)\right)} \xrightarrow{\mathtt{CONST}} \frac{e_{\mathbb{R}}^{1} \Downarrow e_{\mathbb{F}}^{1}, (e_{\mathbb{R}}^{1}, \bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}^{1}}) \qquad e_{\mathbb{R}}^{2} \Downarrow e_{\mathbb{F}}^{2}, (e_{\mathbb{R}}^{2}, \bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}^{2}})}{e_{\mathbb{R}}^{1} \circledast e_{\mathbb{R}}^{2} \Downarrow \mathtt{fl}(e_{\mathbb{F}}^{1} \circledast e_{\mathbb{F}}^{2}), \left(\left(\frac{e_{\mathbb{R}}^{1} \circledast e_{\mathbb{R}}^{2}}{(1+\eta)}, (\bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}^{1}} \circledast \bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}^{2}})(1+\eta)\right)} \xrightarrow{\mathtt{OP}} \frac{e_{\mathbb{R}} \Downarrow e_{\mathbb{F}}, (e_{\mathbb{R}}, \bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}}) \qquad e_{\mathbb{R}} \wr e_{\mathbb{R}}^{2})}{\mathtt{ln}(e_{\mathbb{R}}) \Downarrow \textcircled{m}(e_{\mathbb{F}}), \left(\left(\frac{\textcircled{m}(e_{\mathbb{R}})}{(1+\eta)}, (\ln(\bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}}))(1+\eta)\right)} \xrightarrow{\mathtt{LN}} \frac{e_{\mathbb{R}} \Downarrow e_{\mathbb{F}}, (e_{\mathbb{R}}, \bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}}) \qquad e_{\mathbb{R}} \wr 1}{\mathtt{ln}(e_{\mathbb{R}}) \Downarrow \textcircled{m}(e_{\mathbb{F}}), \left((\ln(e_{\mathbb{R}}))(1+\eta), \frac{\textcircled{m}(\bar{e_{\mathbb{R}}})}{(1+\eta)}\right)} \xrightarrow{\mathtt{LN}} \mathtt{DP}$$

Figure 1: Semantics with Relative Floating Point Error

Theorem 1 (Soundness Theorem)

Given $e_{\mathbb{R}}$ and $e_{\mathbb{F}}$ where $e_{\mathbb{R}} \downarrow e_{\mathbb{F}}, err$, when evaluating the $e_{\mathbb{F}}$ in floating point computation and get the value c, we have $c \in err$.

4 Snapping Mechanism

Definition 2 (Snap_{\mathbb{R}}(a): $A \to \mathsf{Distr}(\mathbb{R})$)

Given privacy parameter ϵ , the ideal Snapping mechanism $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}(a)$ is defined as:

$$U \overset{\$}{\leftarrow} \mu; S \overset{\$}{\leftarrow} \{-1,1\}; Y = \ln(U) \div \epsilon; Z = S \times Y; X = F(a); W = X + Z; W' = \lfloor W \rceil_{\Lambda}; R = \mathsf{clamp}_B(W')$$

where f is the query function over input $a \in A$, ϵ is the privacy budget, B is the clamping bound and Λ is the rounding argument satisfying $\lambda = 2^k$ where 2^k is the smallest power of 2 greater or equal to the $\frac{1}{\epsilon}$.

Let $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a, U, S)$ be the same as $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a)$ given U, S without rounding and clamping steps.

Definition 3 (Snap_{\mathbb{F}}(a): $A \to \mathsf{Distr}(\mathbb{R})$)

Given privacy parameter ϵ , the floating point implemented Snapping mechanism $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a)$ is defined as (where all parameters are defined the same as above):

$$u_{\mathbb{F}} \overset{\$}{\leftarrow} \mu; s_{\mathbb{F}} \overset{\$}{\leftarrow} \{-1,1\}; y = \textcircled{n}(u) \oplus \varepsilon; z = s \otimes y; x = f(a); w = x \oplus z; w' = \lfloor w \rceil_{\Lambda}; r = \mathsf{clamp}_B(w')$$

Let $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a, u, s)$ be the same as $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a)$ without rounding and clamping precesses given u, s.

5 Main Theorem

Theorem 2 (The Snap mechanism is ϵ -differentially private)

Consider Snap(a) defined as before, if Snap(a) = x given database a and privacy parameter ϵ , then its actual privacy loss is bounded by $\epsilon + 12x\epsilon\eta + 2\eta$

Proof. Given $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a) = x$ and parameter ε , we consider a' be the adjacent database of a satisfying $|f(a) - f(a')| \le 1$. Without loss of generalization, we assume f(a) + 1 = f(a') (\diamond). The proof is developed by cases of the output of $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a)$ mechanism.

Consider the $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}(a)$ outputting the same result x, let (L,R) be the range where $\forall u \in (L,R)$ and some s, $\mathsf{Snap}'_{\mathbb{R}}(a,u,s) = x$, we have $\mathsf{Pr}[\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}(a)] = R - L$. Given the $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}$ is ε -dp, we have:

$$e^{-\epsilon} \le \frac{\Pr[\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}(a)]}{\Pr[\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}(a)]} = \frac{R-L}{R'-L'} \le e^{\epsilon}$$

Let (l, r) be the range where $\forall u \in (l, r)$ and some s, $\operatorname{Snap}'_{\mathbb{F}}(a, u, s) = x$, we estimated the |r - l| in terms of floating point relative error and |R - L| through our semantics in order to verify the privacy loss of $\operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}$.

case x = -B

Let b be the largest number rounded by Λ that is smaller than B. We know s = 1, L = l = 0 and R = -b, so we only need to estimate the right side range r in this case. The derivation of this case given $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,R,1) = \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a',R,1) = x$ is shown as following:

$$\frac{R \Downarrow r, (\underline{R}, \overline{R})}{\text{OP}}$$

$$\ln(R) \Downarrow (\underline{n}), (\ln(\underline{R})(1+\eta), \frac{\ln(\overline{R})}{(1+\eta)})$$

$$\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(R) \Downarrow \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes (\underline{n}), ((\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\underline{R}))(1+\eta)^2, \frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\overline{R})}{(1+\eta)^2})$$

$$\frac{1}{\text{ID}}$$

$$\frac{f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(R) \Downarrow f(a) \oplus \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes (\underline{n})(r), ((f(a) + (\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\underline{R}))(1+\eta)^2)(1+\eta), \frac{(f(a) + \frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\overline{R})}{(1+\eta)^2})}{(1+\eta)})}{(1+\eta)}$$

$$\frac{1}{\text{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a, R, 1) \Downarrow \text{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a, r, 1), ((f(a) + (\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\underline{R}))(1+\eta)^2)(1+\eta), \frac{(f(a) + \frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\overline{R})}{(1+\eta)^2})}{(1+\eta)})}{(1+\eta)}$$

In the same way, we have the derivation for $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a',r,1)$:

Given $\operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a) = \operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a') = x = -b$, we have following values for $\underline{R}, \overline{R}, \underline{R}'$ and \overline{R}' :

$$\begin{split} & \underline{R} = e^{\epsilon \left((x(1+\eta) - f(a))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \bar{R} = e^{\epsilon \frac{\left(\frac{x}{1+\eta} - f(a) \right)}{(1+\eta)^2}} \\ & \underline{R'} = e^{\epsilon \left((x(1+\eta) - f(a'))(1+\eta)^2 \right)}, \bar{R'} = e^{\epsilon \frac{\left(\frac{x}{1+\eta} - f(a') \right)}{(1+\eta)^2}} \end{split}$$

The privacy loss of $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a)$ in this case is bounded by:

$$\frac{\frac{1}{2}(\bar{R}-0)}{\frac{1}{2}(\underline{R}'-0)} = e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{(\frac{x}{1+\eta}-f(a))}{(1+\eta)^2} - \left((x(1+\eta)-f(a'))(1+\eta)^2\right)\right)} \\
= e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{x}{(1+\eta)^3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^2} - x(1+\eta)^3 + f(a')(1+\eta)^2\right)} (\star)$$

Since $(1+\eta)^3 > 1+3\eta$, $\frac{1}{(1+\eta)^3} < \frac{1}{1+3\eta}$, $(1+\eta)^2 < 1+2.1\eta$ and $\frac{1}{(1+\eta)^2} > 1-2\eta$, we have:

$$\begin{array}{ll} (\star) & < e^{\epsilon \left(-\frac{9\eta+6}{1+3\eta}x+4.1\eta f(a)+(1+2.1\eta)\right)} \\ & < e^{\epsilon (10.1\eta B+1+2.1\eta)} \end{array}$$

case $x \in (-B, \lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda})$

subcase $|f(a)|_{\Lambda} \le 0 \lor (|f(a)|_{\Lambda} > 0 \land x \in (-B,0))$

Let $y_1 = x - (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, $y_2 = x + (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, we know $y_1 < 0$, $y_2 < 0$, S = s = 1, $L = e^{\epsilon(y_1 - f(a))}$ and $R = e^{\epsilon(y_2 - f(a))}$ in this case. The derivations of estimating l and r are shown as following:

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$.

Taking the lower bound, we have: $\underline{R} = e^{\epsilon \left((y_1(1+\eta) - f(a))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}$.

Taking the upper bound, we have: $\bar{R} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_1}{1+\eta} - f(a))}{(1+\eta)^2}}$.

$$\frac{ \frac{ }{ \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,L,1) \Downarrow \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,l,1), (\frac{f(a)+(\frac{1}{\epsilon}\times \ln(\underline{L}))(1+\eta)^2}{1+\eta}, (f(a)+\frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon}\times \ln(\bar{L})}{(1+\eta)^2})(1+\eta))}{ \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,L,1) \Downarrow \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,l,1), (err_1,err_2)}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$.

Taking the lower bound, we have: $\underline{L} = e^{\epsilon \left((y_2(1+\eta) - f(a))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}$.

Taking the upper bound, we have: $\bar{L} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_2}{1+\eta} - f(a))}{(1+\eta)^2}}$.

In the same way, we have the bound of l, r for adjacent data set a':

$$\bar{R}' = e^{\epsilon \left((y_1(1+\eta) - f(a'))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ \bar{R}' = e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{y_1}{1+\eta} - f(a')}{(1+\eta)^2} \right)}.$$

$$\bar{L}' = e^{\epsilon \left((y_2(1+\eta) - f(a'))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ \bar{L}' = e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{y_2}{1+\eta} - f(a')}{(1+\eta)^2} \right)}.$$

Then, we have the privacy loss is bounded by:

$$\frac{|\bar{R} - \underline{L}|}{|\underline{R}' - \bar{L}'|}.$$

We also have:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \frac{\bar{R}}{\bar{R}} &= e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{y_1}{(1+\eta)^3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^2} - y_1 + f(a)\right)} \leq e^{\epsilon \left(-\frac{3\eta}{1+3\eta}y_1 + 2\eta f(a)\right)} \leq e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{3\eta}{1+3\eta}B + 2\eta B\right)} \leq e^{5\epsilon B\eta} \\ \frac{L}{\bar{I}} &= e^{\epsilon \left(y_2(1+\eta)^3 - f(a)(1+\eta)^2 - y_2 + f(a)\right)} \geq e^{\epsilon \left(3\eta y_1 - 2\eta f(a)\right)} \geq e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} \end{array}$$

Then, we can derive:

$$\begin{split} |\bar{R} - \underline{L}| & \leq e^{5\epsilon B\eta} R - e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} L \\ & = L \left(e^{\Lambda\epsilon + 5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} \right) \\ & = L \left(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{5\epsilon B\eta} + e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} \right) \\ & = L \left(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{5\epsilon B\eta} + \frac{1}{(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} - 1)} (e^{\Lambda\epsilon} - 1) e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} \right) \\ & \leq L \left(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{5\epsilon B\eta} + \frac{1}{(e^{-1})} (e^{\Lambda\epsilon} - 1) e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} \right) \\ & \leq L \left(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{5\epsilon B\eta} + \frac{1}{(e^{-1})} (e^{\Lambda\epsilon} - 1) e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} \right) \\ & = L \frac{e}{(e^{-1})} \left(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{-5\epsilon B\eta} \right) \\ & < L \frac{e}{(e^{-1})} \left(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} e^{5\epsilon B\eta} - e^{5\epsilon B\eta} \right) \\ & = L(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} - 1) e^{\ln(\frac{e}{(e^{-1})}) + 5\epsilon B\eta} \\ & < L(e^{\Lambda\epsilon} - 1) e^{11\epsilon B\eta} \left(by \left(\frac{1}{\epsilon} < B < 2^{42} \frac{1}{\epsilon} \right) \right) \\ & = (R - L) e^{11\epsilon B\eta} \end{split}$$

In the same way, we can derive:

$$|R - \bar{L}| > e^{-5\epsilon B\eta}R - e^{5\epsilon B\eta}L > (R - L)e^{-12\epsilon B\eta}$$

Then we have:

$$\frac{|\bar{R} - \underline{L}|}{|R' - \bar{L}'|} < e^{(23\epsilon B\eta + \epsilon)}.$$

subcase $\lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda} > 0 \land x \in (0, \lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda})$

Let $y_1 = x - (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, $y_2 = x + (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, we know $y_1 > 0$, $y_2 > 0$, S = s = 1, $L = e^{\epsilon(y_1 - f(a))}$ and $R = e^{\epsilon(y_2 - f(a))}$ in this case. The derivations of estimating l and r are shown as following:

$$L \Downarrow l, (\underline{L}, \overline{L})$$

$$\ln(L) \Downarrow \textcircled{n}(l), (\ln(\underline{L})(1+\eta), \frac{\ln(\overline{L})}{(1+\eta)})$$

$$\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(L) \Downarrow \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes \textcircled{n}(l), ((\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\underline{L}))(1+\eta)^2, \frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\overline{L})}{(1+\eta)^2})$$

$$\frac{f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(L) \Downarrow f(a) \oplus \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes \textcircled{n}(l), (\frac{f(a) + (\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\underline{L}))(1+\eta)^2}{1+\eta}, (f(a) + \frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\overline{L})}{(1+\eta)^2})(1+\eta))}{\text{Snap}'_{\mathbb{m}}(a, L, 1) \Downarrow \text{Snap}'_{\mathbb{m}}(a, l, 1), (err_1, err_2)}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_1 \le err_2$.

Taking the lower bound (i.e. $err_1 = y_1$), we get: $\underline{L} = e^{(y_1/(1+\eta)-f(a))(1+\eta)^2\epsilon}$. Taking the upper bound (i.e. $err_2 = y_1$), we get: $\bar{L} = e^{(y_1(1+\eta)-f(a))\epsilon/(1+\eta)^2}$.

$$\frac{\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,R,1) \Downarrow \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,r,1), (\frac{f(a)+(\frac{1}{\epsilon}\times \ln(\bar{R}))(1+\eta)^2}{1+\eta}, (f(a)+\frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon}\times \ln(\bar{R})}{(1+\eta)^2})(1+\eta))}{\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,R,1) \Downarrow \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,r,1), (err_1,err_2)}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$.

Taking the lower bound (i.e. $err_1 = y_2$), we have: $\underline{R} = e^{(y_2/(1+\eta)-f(a))(1+\eta)^2\epsilon}$. Taking the upper bound (i.e. $err_2 = y_1$), we have: $\underline{R} = e^{(y_2(1+\eta)-f(a))\epsilon/(1+\eta)^2}$.

In the same way, we have the derivation for $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a',l,1)$ and $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a',r,1)$:

$$\frac{\dots}{\operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a',L',1) \Downarrow \operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a',l',1), (\frac{f(a')+(\frac{1}{\epsilon}\times \ln(\underline{L'}))(1+\eta)^2}{1+\eta}, (f(a')+\frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon}\times \ln(\bar{L'})}{(1+\eta)^2})(1+\eta))}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$.

Taking the lower bound (i.e. $err_1 = y_1$), we get: $\underline{L} = e^{(y_1/(1+\eta)-f(a'))(1+\eta)^2\epsilon}$. Taking the upper bound (i.e. $err_2 = y_1$), we get: $\bar{L} = e^{(y_1(1+\eta)-f(a'))\epsilon/(1+\eta)^2}$.

$$\frac{\dots}{\operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a',R',1) \Downarrow \operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a',r',1), (\frac{f(a')+(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\times \ln(\underline{R}'))(1+\eta)^2}{1+\eta}, (f(a')+\frac{\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\times \ln(\bar{R}')}{(1+\eta)^2})(1+\eta))}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$.

Taking the lower bound (i.e. $err_1 = y_2$), we have: $\bar{R} = e^{(y_2/(1+\eta)-f(a'))(1+\eta)^2\epsilon}$. Taking the upper bound (i.e. $err_2 = y_1$), we have: $\bar{R} = e^{(y_2(1+\eta)-f(a'))\epsilon/(1+\eta)^2}$.

The privacy loss is bounded by:

$$\frac{|R - \underline{L}|}{|\underline{R}' - \bar{L}'|}$$

Since the following bound can be proved by using $1 - 2\eta < (1 + \eta)^2 < 1 + 2.1\eta$, $y_1 > -B$, $y_2 > -B$ and simple approximation:

$$\bar{R} - \underline{L} < (R - L)e^{(5B\eta\epsilon)}, \underline{R'} - \bar{L'} > (R' - L')e^{-7B\eta\epsilon}$$

We also have the $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}(a)$ is ϵ -dp:

$$\frac{|R-L|}{|R'-L'|} = e^{\epsilon}$$

So we can get:

$$\frac{|\bar{R}-\underline{L}|}{|\underline{R}'-\bar{L}'|}<\frac{|R-L|}{|R'-L'|}e^{(12B\eta\epsilon)}=e^{(1+12B\eta)\epsilon}$$

subcase $[f(a)]_{\Lambda} > 0 \land x = 0$

Let $y_1=x-(\frac{\Lambda}{2}),\ y_2=x+(\frac{\Lambda}{2}),$ we know $y_1<0,\ y_2>0,\ S=s=1,\ L=e^{\epsilon(y_1-f(a))}$ and $R=e^{\epsilon(y_2-f(a))}$ in this case. We have the derivation as:

$$\frac{ }{ \frac{ \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,L,1) \Downarrow \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,l,1), (\frac{f(a)+(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\times \ln(\underline{L}))(1+\eta)^2}{1+\eta}, (f(a)+\frac{\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\times \ln(\bar{L})}{(1+\eta)^2})(1+\eta)) }{ \frac{\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,L,1) \Downarrow \mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,l,1), (err_1,err_2) }{ } }$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$.

Taking the lower bound , we have: $\underline{L} = e^{\epsilon \left((y_2(1+\eta) - f(a))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}$.

Taking the upper bound, we have: $\bar{L} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_2}{1+\eta} - f(a))}{(1+\eta)^2}}$.

$$\frac{\operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,R,1) \Downarrow \operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,r,1), (\frac{f(a) + (\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\underline{R}))(1+\eta)^2}{1+\eta}, (f(a) + \frac{\frac{1}{\epsilon} \times \ln(\bar{R})}{(1+\eta)^2})(1+\eta))}{\operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}'(a,R,1) \Downarrow \operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}'(a,r,1), (err_1,err_2)}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$. Taking the lower bound (i.e. $err_1 = y_2$), we have: $\bar{R} = e^{(y_2/(1+\eta)-f(a))(1+\eta)^2\epsilon}$. Taking the upper bound (i.e. $err_2 = y_1$), we have: $\bar{R} = e^{(y_2(1+\eta)-f(a))\epsilon/(1+\eta)^2}$. Using the bound we proved before, we have the folloing bound on $|\bar{R} - \bar{L}|$ and $|R - \bar{L}|$:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \bar{R} - \underline{L} & < e^{(2B\eta\epsilon)}R - e^{-5B\eta\epsilon}L < (R-L)e^{6B\eta\epsilon} \\ \underline{R} - \bar{L} & > e^{(-3B\eta\epsilon)}R - e^{5B\eta\epsilon}L > (R-L)e^{-8B\eta\epsilon}, \end{array}$$

and privacy loss is bounded by:

$$\frac{|\bar{R} - \underline{L}|}{|R' - \bar{L}'|} < e^{14B\eta\epsilon + \epsilon}$$

case $x = \lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda}$

This case can also be split into 3 subcases by: $\lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda} < 0$, $\lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda} = 0$ and $\lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda} > 0$. Without loss of generalization, we consider the worst case where the error propagate in the same direction, i.e. $\lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda} < 0$.

From this assumption, let $y_1 = x - (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, $y_2 = x + (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, we know $y_1 < 0$, $y_2 < 0$. Since f(a) + 1 = f(a'), we also have $\lfloor f(a) \rfloor < \lfloor f(a') \rfloor$. So, we know s can only be 1 for input a' but s can be 1 or -1 for input a.

For input a, when s = 1, we have following derivations:

$$R \Downarrow r, (R, R)$$

$$\ln(R) \Downarrow \textcircled{n}(r), (\ln(R)(1+\eta), \frac{\ln(R)}{1+\eta})$$

$$\frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R) \Downarrow \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes \textcircled{n}(r), (\frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R)(1+\eta)^2, \frac{1}{\epsilon} \frac{\ln(R)}{(1+\eta)^2})$$

$$\frac{f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R) \Downarrow f(a) \oplus \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes \textcircled{n}(r), \left((f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R)(1+\eta)^2)(1+\eta), (f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \frac{\ln(R)}{(1+\eta)^2})/(1+\eta) \right)}{\operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{R}}^{\prime}(a, 1, R) \Downarrow \operatorname{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}^{\prime}(a, 1, r), (err_1, err_2)}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$. Then we can get following bounds for r:

$$R_{+} = e^{\epsilon \left((y_{2}(1+\eta) - f(a))(1+\eta)^{2} \right)}, \ \bar{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_{2}}{1+\eta} - f(a))}{(1+\eta)^{2}}}.$$

Since $y_2 = \lfloor f(a) \rceil + \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, we have $e^{\epsilon \left((y_2 - f(a)) \right)} > 1$, so actually we know R = r = 1.

We can also derive the bound for
$$l$$
 in the same way as:
$$L_{+} = e^{\epsilon \left((y_1(1+\eta) - f(a))(1+\eta)^2 \right)}, \ \bar{L_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(y_1(1+\eta) - f(a))}{(1+\eta)^2}}.$$

When s = -1, we can derive following bounds in the same way for l and r:

$$L_{-} = e^{\epsilon \left((f(a) - y_2(1+\eta))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \, L_{-} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(f(a) - \frac{y_2}{1+\eta})}{(1+\eta)^2}}.$$

$$\bar{R_2} = e^{\epsilon \left((f(a) - y_1(1+\eta))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ \bar{R_2} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(f(a) - \frac{y_1}{1+\eta})}{(1+\eta)^2}}.$$

Since $y_1 = \lfloor f(a) \rceil - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, we have $e^{\epsilon \left((f(a) - y_1) \right)} > 1$, so actually we know R' = r' = 1.

For input a', we have only one case where s = 1, the following bound can be derived:

$$\begin{split} & \underline{R}' = e^{\epsilon \left((y_2(1+\eta) - f(a'))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ \bar{R}' = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_2}{1+\eta} - f(a'))}{(1+\eta)^2}}. \\ & \underline{L}' = e^{\epsilon \left((y_1(1+\eta) - f(a'))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ \bar{L}' = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_1}{1+\eta} - f(a'))}{(1+\eta)^2}}. \end{split}$$

We have following bounds on their ratios:

$$\frac{R_{+}}{\bar{R}_{+}} = e^{\varepsilon \left((1+\eta)^{3} y_{2} - (1+\eta)^{2} f(a) - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} > e^{-3\varepsilon B\eta}, \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\varepsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\varepsilon B\eta},$$

The same bound for L_+ by substituting y_2 with y_1 , and similar bound for L', R'.

$$\frac{R'}{R} = e^{\varepsilon \left((1+\eta)^2 f(a) - (1+\eta)^3 y_2 - f(a) + y_2 \right)} > e^{-2\varepsilon B\eta}, \frac{\bar{R'}}{R'} = e^{\varepsilon \left(\frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^2} - frac y_2 (1+\eta)^3 - f(a) + y_2 \right)} < e^{2\varepsilon B\eta},$$

Using the bound on their ratios, we can get following bounds on $|\bar{R_+} - L_+|$ and $|\bar{R'} - \bar{L'}|$:

$$|\bar{R_{+}} - \bar{L_{+}}| < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}R - e^{-3\epsilon B\eta}L < (R - L)e^{7\epsilon B\eta}, |\bar{R'} - \bar{L'}| > e^{-2\epsilon B\eta}R - e^{2\epsilon B\eta}L > (R' - L')e^{-5\epsilon B\eta}$$

Then we have the following bounds on privacy loss:

$$\frac{2-(\underline{L_+}+\underline{L_-})}{\underline{R'}-\bar{L'}}<\frac{\bar{R_+}-\underline{L_+}}{\underline{R'}-\bar{L'}}<\frac{e^{7\epsilon B\eta}(R_+-L_+)}{e^{-5\epsilon B\eta}(R'-L')}=e^{12\epsilon B\eta+\epsilon}$$

case $x \in (\lfloor f(a) \rceil_{\Lambda}, \lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda})$

case
$$x = \lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda}$$

This case is symmetric with the case where $x = \lfloor f(a') \rfloor_{\Lambda}$. It can also be split into 3 subcases by: $\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda} < 0$, $\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda} = 0$ and $\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda} > 0$. Without loss of generalization, we consider the worst case where the error propagate in the same direction, i.e. $\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda} < 0$.

From this assumption, let $y_1 = x - (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, $y_2 = x + (\frac{\Lambda}{2})$, we know $y_1 < 0$, $y_2 < 0$. Since f(a) + 1 =f(a'), we also have $\lfloor f(a) \rfloor < \lfloor f(a') \rfloor < 0$. So, we know s can only be -1 for input a but s can be 1 or -1 for input a'.

For input a', when s = 1, we have following derivations:

$$R'_+ \Downarrow r_+, (R'_+, R'_+)$$

$$\ln(R'_{+}) \Downarrow \textcircled{m}(r_{+}), (\ln(R'_{+})(1+\eta), \frac{\ln(R'_{+})}{1+\eta})$$

$$\frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R) \Downarrow \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes \textcircled{m}(r_{+}), (\frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R'_{+})(1+\eta)^{2}, \frac{1}{\epsilon} \frac{\ln(R'_{+})}{(1+\eta)^{2}})$$

$$\frac{f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R'_{+}) \Downarrow f(a) \oplus \frac{1}{\epsilon} \otimes \textcircled{m}(r_{+}), ((f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \ln(R'_{+})(1+\eta)^{2})(1+\eta), (f(a) + \frac{1}{\epsilon} \frac{\ln(R'_{+})}{(1+\eta)^{2}})/(1+\eta))}{\text{Snap}_{\mathbb{m}}'(a, 1, R'_{+}) \Downarrow \text{Snap}_{\mathbb{m}}'(a, 1, r_{+}), (err_{1}, err_{2})}$$

From soundness theorem, we have $err_1 \le y_2 \le err_2$. Then we can get following bounds for r:

$$R'_{+} = e^{\epsilon \left((y_2(1+\eta) - f(a'))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \, \bar{R'_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_2}{1+\eta} - f(a'))}{(1+\eta)^2}}.$$

Since $y_2 = \lfloor f(a) \rceil + \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, we have $e^{\epsilon \left((y_2 - f(a)) \right)} > 1$, so actually we know $R'_+ = r'_+ = 1$. We can also derive the bound for l in the same way as:

$$L'_{+} = e^{\epsilon \left((y_1(1+\eta) - f(a'))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \, \bar{L'_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(\frac{y_1}{1+\eta} - f(a'))}{(1+\eta)^2}}.$$

When s = -1, we can derive following bounds in the same way for l and r:

$$L'_{-} = e^{\epsilon \left((f(a') - y_2(1+\eta))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ L'_{-} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(f(a') - \frac{y_2}{1+\eta})}{(1+\eta)^2}}.$$

$$R'_{-} = e^{\epsilon \left((f(a') - y_1(1+\eta))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \, \bar{R'_{-}} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(f(a') - \frac{y_1}{1+\eta})}{(1+\eta)^2}}$$

Since $y_1 = \lfloor f(a') \rceil - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, we have $e^{\epsilon \left((f(a') - y_1) \right)} > 1$, so actually we know $R'_- = r'_- = 1$. For input a, we have only one case where s = -1, the following bound can be derived:

$$\begin{split} & \underline{R} = e^{\epsilon \left(f(a) - (y_2(1+\eta))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ \bar{R} = e^{\epsilon \frac{\left(f(a) - \frac{y_2}{1+\eta} \right)}{(1+\eta)^2}} \\ & \underline{L} = e^{\epsilon \left((f(a) - y_1(1+\eta))(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \ \bar{L} = e^{\epsilon \frac{f(a) - \frac{y_1}{1+\eta}}{(1+\eta)^2}}. \end{split}$$

We have following bounds on their ratios:

$$\frac{R_{+}}{\bar{R}_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left((1+\eta)^{3} y_{2} - (1+\eta)^{2} f(a) - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} > e^{-3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}, \\ \frac{\bar{R}_{+}}{R_{+}} = e^{\epsilon \left(frac y_{2} (1+\eta)^{3} - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^{2}} - y_{2} + f(a) \right)} < e^{2\epsilon R_{+}}$$

The same bound for L_+ by substituting y_2 with y_1 , and similar bound for L', R'.

$$\frac{\underline{R'}}{R} = e^{\epsilon \left((1+\eta)^2 f(a) - (1+\eta)^3 y_2 - f(a) + y_2 \right)} > e^{-2\epsilon B\eta}, \frac{\bar{R'}}{R'} = e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^2} - frac y_2 (1+\eta)^3 - f(a) + y_2 \right)} < e^{2\epsilon B\eta},$$

Using the bound on their ratios, we can get following bounds on $|\bar{R}_+ - L_+|$ and $|\bar{R}' - \bar{L}'|$:

$$|\bar{R_{-}'} - L_{-}'| < e^{3\epsilon B\eta}R - e^{-3\epsilon B\eta}L < (R_{-}' - L_{-}')e^{7\epsilon B\eta}, |\bar{R} - \bar{L}| > e^{-2\epsilon B\eta}R - e^{2\epsilon B\eta}L > (R - L)e^{-5\epsilon B\eta}R - e^{2\epsilon B\eta}R - e^{2$$

Then we have the following bounds on privacy loss:

$$\frac{\underline{R} - \bar{L}}{2 - (\underline{L}'_+ + \underline{L}'_-)} > \frac{\underline{R} - \bar{L}}{\bar{R}'_- - L'_-} > \frac{e^{-5\epsilon B\eta}(R - L)}{e^{7\epsilon B\eta}(R'_- - L'_-)} = e^{-12\epsilon B\eta - \epsilon}$$

case $x \in (\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda}, B)$

This case can also be split into 3 subcases symmetric with the case where $x \in (-B, \lfloor f(a) \rfloor_{\Lambda})$:

subcase $\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda} > 0 \lor \lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda} < 0 \land x \in (0, B)$ let $y_1 = x - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, $y_2 = x - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, we have $y_1, y_2 > 0$. The bounds derived for l, r in this case are as

subcase $\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda} < 0 \land x \in (\lfloor f(a') \rceil_{\Lambda}, 0)$ let $y_1 = x - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, $y_2 = x - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, we have $y_1, y_2 < 0$. The bounds derived for l, r in this case are as

subcase $[f(a')]_{\Lambda} < 0 \land x = 0$

let $y_1 = x - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, $y_2 = x - \frac{\Lambda}{2}$, we have $y_1 < 0$ and $y_2 > 0$. The bounds derived for l, r in this case

case x = B

We know s = -1, L = l = 0 and R = b, so we only need to estimate the right side range r in this case. The bounds derived for r, r' are as following:

$$\begin{split} & \bar{R} = e^{\epsilon \left((f(a) - \frac{x}{1+\eta})(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \bar{R} = e^{\epsilon \frac{(f(a) - x(1+\eta))}{(1+\eta)^2}} \\ & \bar{R}' = e^{\epsilon \left((f(a') - \frac{x}{1+\eta})(1+\eta)^2) \right)}, \bar{R}' = e^{\epsilon \frac{(f(a') - x(1+\eta))}{(1+\eta)^2}} \end{split}$$

The privacy loss of $\mathsf{Snap}_{\mathbb{F}}(a)$ in this case is bounded by:

$$\frac{\frac{1}{2}(\underline{R}-0)}{\frac{1}{2}(\bar{R}'-0)} = e^{\epsilon \left(\left((f(a) - \frac{x}{1+\eta})(1+\eta)^2 \right) \right) - \frac{(f(a') - x(1+\eta))}{(1+\eta)^2} \right)}$$

$$= e^{\epsilon \left(f(a)(1+\eta)^2 - x(1+\eta) - \frac{f(a)}{(1+\eta)^2} + \frac{x}{(1+\eta)} \right)} (\star)$$

Since $1 + 2.1\eta > (1 + \eta)^2 > 1 + 2\eta$ and $\frac{1}{(1+\eta)^2} > 1 - 2\eta$, we have:

$$\begin{array}{ll} (\star) &> e^{\epsilon \left((1+2\eta) f(a) - \frac{\eta(\eta+2)}{1+\eta} x - \frac{1}{1+2\eta} (f(a)+1) \right)} \\ &= e^{\epsilon \left(\frac{4\eta(\eta+1)}{1+2\eta} f(a) - \frac{\eta(\eta+2)}{1+\eta} x - \frac{1}{1+2\eta} \right)} \\ &> e^{\epsilon \left(-B\eta \frac{4(\eta+1)}{1+2\eta} + \frac{(\eta+2)}{1+\eta} x - 1 \right)} \\ &> e^{\epsilon (-6\eta B - 1)} \end{array}$$

References

- [1] Gilles Barthe, Marco Gaboardi, Benjamin Grégoire, Justin Hsu, and Pierre-Yves Strub. Proving differential privacy via probabilistic couplings. In *LICS* 2016.
- [2] H. Becker, N. Zyuzin, R. Monat, E. Darulova, M. O. Myreen, and A. Fox. A verified certificate checker for finite-precision error bounds in coq and hol4. In 2018 Formal Methods in Computer Aided Design (FMCAD), 2018.
- [3] Cynthia Dwork, Frank McSherry, Kobbi Nissim, and Adam Smith. Calibrating Noise to Sensitivity in Private Data Analysis. In *TCC*, 2016.
- [4] Matthieu Martel. Semantics of roundoff error propagation in finite precision calculations. *Higher-Order and Symbolic Computation*, 2006.
- [5] Ilya Mironov. On significance of the least significant bits for differential privacy. In *CCS 2012*, 2012.
- [6] Mariano Moscato, Laura Titolo, Aaron Dutle, and César A. Muñoz. Automatic estimation of verified floating-point round-off errors via static analysis. In Stefano Tonetta, Erwin Schoitsch, and Friedemann Bitsch, editors, *Computer Safety, Reliability, and Security*, 2017.
- [7] Tahina Ramananandro, Paul Mountcastle, Benoundefinedt Meister, and Richard Lethin. A unified coq framework for verifying c programs with floating-point computations. In *Proceedings of the 5th ACM SIGPLAN Conference on Certified Programs and Proofs (CPP)*. Association for Computing Machinery, 2016.