

That which is unfit for direct perception or is subtle, we designate as past or future. Thus there is no chance of the manifest being given the three symptoms.

Herein the commentator has explained that even when a characteristic is not manifest, it exists. For example, when a mind is full of anger, it cannot be said that it has no feeling of attachment at the time. The next moment the characteristic of attachment might manifest itself.

(8) The commentator having explained the different states, proceeds to refute the objections that are raised. The critic says that when a thing and its characteristics always remain, then a thing, its characteristic, symptom and state are everlasting like immutable Awareness, *i.e.* what is called old is always there in a subtle form and what is called new is and will be there also. What remains always is everlastingly present; therefore, what is called a state of change is in fact immutably everlasting.

In reply, it is pointed out that 'everlasting' does not necessarily imply everlasting in the same form. That which always remains in the same form is only 'Kūtaśtha' (or truly, *i.e.* immutably everlasting). The material cause of the everchanging must be changeful. That is why, a naturally mutative entity called Pradhāna is mentioned as the material cause. Pradhāna though everlasting is changeful. That changing state is a form of characteristic or manifestation as Intellect etc. From the mutations, or appearance and disappearance of changes, the original cause is called changeably everlasting.

(9) The commentator concludes his observations by bringing out the symptoms of changes. The change of the form of a thing is its mutation. When we see that its previously noticed characteristic is not present, we say, it has changed.

In respect of subjective principles their mutation is change of condition in relation to time. Mental fluctuations have no spatial existence, but only covers time. Their change is only timely emergence or subsidence, *i.e.* the appearance of some modifications at one time and of others at another time. Thus alteration of condition either in reference to space or to time is change or mutation.

---