Human Capital Investments and Expectations about Career and Family

Sebastian Valet, Johannes Walter

July 7, 2020

Summary I

Research questions and design

- What do students believe about the consequences of their education choices?
- How do students sort into majors?
- Novel: what role do family variables play in such choices?
- Survey with undergraduate students at NYU on perceptions about consequences of educational choices
- Specifically: choice of a major
- Follow-up survey after six years

Summary II

- Students believe in importance of consequences for own earnings and family life
- Particularly women, major choice also corresponds to different rates and timing of marriage and fertility
- Belief about marriage market "return" to higher earning majors
- Ex-ante beliefs are systematically related to educational choices and ex-post realized outcomes

Model I

Human capital investment under uncertainty

• Expected utility for human capital choice at time τ :

$$E_{i,\tau}(V_k) = \sum_{t=\tau+1}^T \beta^{t-\tau} \int u_t(X) \ dG_{i,\tau}(X|k,t)$$

- with discount rate beta and outcome X for all subsequent periods given a human capital investment k
- $G_{i,\tau}(X|k,t)$ is the belief distribution about the outcome given human capital investments k

Model II

Belief distribution $G_{i,\tau}(X|k,t)$

- Survey design elicits beliefs $G_{i,\tau}(X|k,t)$ about the choice of a major
- Belief distrubtions have four characteristics:
 - reflect individual uncertainty
 - are heterogenous
 - can be incorrect
 - can evolve over time due to learning
- Natural limitation: elicitation of degree of uncertainty

Model III

Different effects of human capital choices

Ex-ante individual differences in beliefs

$$\Delta_{G,i}(k,k') = G_i(X|k,t) - G_i(X|k',t)$$

Ex-post individual differences in potential outcomes

$$\Delta_{F,i}(k,k') = F_i(X|k,t) - F_i(X|k',t)$$

Ex-post individual differences realized outcomes

$$\Delta_H(k,k') = H(X|k,t) - H(X|k',t)$$

with
$$H(X|k,t) = \frac{1}{M_k} \sum_{t \in \Omega_k} F_i(k=k^*,t)$$

Data

- Survey among NYU undergraduate students in 2010
- Beliefs about earnings, earnings growth, earnings uncertainty, marriage, spousal earnings, fertility and labor supply
- Questions conditioned on ages 23, 30 and 45
- Sample consists of 493 individuals
- Main sources of variation in the data: gender, major choice, age
- Follow-up survey 6 years later

Current Population Characteristics

- Earnings, employment, and marriage data for the US population using the 2009 ACS data
- Not suited for causal inference; needs not reflect the student's beliefs
- Data from older cohort; includes not only high-ability participants
- But data is suited to document that career and family outcomes differ by educational choices in observational data

Earnings Beliefs

Earnings Levels

- Male students believe to earn more than female students at each age
- Perceived gender gap is largest in science/business and at later stages
- Higher expected earnings for a science/business degree (54k \$) than for huamnities degree (40k \$)
- Are these beliefs accurate and reasonable? Expectations and realizationsa are positively correlated
- Expected earnings are much higher than what ACS data suggests

Earnings Beliefs

Earnings Returns, Growth, Uncertanties

- Both female and male students perceive an approximately 30% higher return to completing a degree in science/busniess relative to humanities and an approximately 60% higher return to graduating relative to no degree.
- Expected returns grow over time, with higher expected returns for male students at the later ages
- There is considerable variation in the expected returns
- Students believe to see larger earning growth in the early parts of their careers
- Earings growth is believed to be higher for science/business relativee to humanities
- Uncertainty in earnings is much higher in the no degree scenario



Beliefs about Marriage and Spousal Characteristics

- Recent theory predicts that investment in education generates returns in the marriage market
- Probabilities:
 - Women belief they are slightly more likely to be married at younger ages, but no difference at age 45
 - Students believe they are less likely to be married without a degree
- Potential Spouse's Earnings
 - Men expect lower, women expect higher earnings for their potential Spouse
 - Students believe graduating in science or business relative to humanities or no degree will result in a higher earning spouse
 - There is evidence for assortative mating by education



Beliefs about Fertility

- Conditioned on ages 30 and 45
- Men and women believe that completing a science or business degree rather than a degree in the humanities would reduce their expected number of children at age 30
- In contrast, completing a degree relative to no degree doubles expected number of children
- Students believe major choice has a larger effect on the timing of fertility rather than on the level

Beliefs about Future Labor Supply

- Students believe their human capital choice will substantially affect their future employment
- Beliefs about working full-time is higher for males and higher for science/business degree relative to a degree in humanities
- Students' beliefs about their age 30 labor supply conditional on future expected marital status:
- Male students beliefs about future labor supply vary little by marital status, female students believe to work less when married

Policy Implications

- Beliefs about earnings and family variables matter and play an important role in degree choice
- Male students believe family variables to influence their career less than female students
- Suggests that society wide belief systems have to change to affect gender pay gap and gender gap in major choices
- Students who choose a humanities degree still expect higher returns to a science/business degree

- Until now: evidence that students hold beliefs that educational choices matter
- Natural next question: Does this translate to intended and actual decisions?
- Intended major and actual major are now the outcome variables in the analysis with career and family variables as explanatory variables

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| | Intended Major | | | | Actual Major | |
|--|----------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-------------------|----------|
| | 0 | LS | LA | AD | Multinomial Logit | |
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| Panel A: Females | | | | | | |
| Age 30 Earnings (\$10,000s) | 0.146*** | 0.099** | 0.230*** | 0.183** | 0.084*** | 0.037 |
| | (0.047) | (0.048) | (0.065) | (0.078) | (0.019) | (0.026) |
| Ability Rank | 0.029*** | 0.029*** | 0.035*** | 0.039*** | 0.021*** | 0.022*** |
| ř | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.005) | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.004) |
| Prob Marriage by Age 30 | | -0.251 | | -0.171 | | 1.444** |
| | | (0.706) | | (0.713) | | (0.690) |
| Spousal Earnings (\$10,000s) | | 0.087*** | | 0.083 | | 0.110*** |
| 1 | | (0.028) | | (0.059) | | (0.036) |
| Exp num of children by 30 | | 0.306* | | 0.603*** | | 0.575*** |
| | | (0.188) | | (0.202) | | (0.143) |
| Constant | -1.473*** | -1.266*** | -1.445*** | -0.878*** | | |
| | (0.206) | (0.250) | (0.188) | (0.262) | | |
| Pvalue (Family variables) ^a | | 0.0124 | | 0.0088 | | 0.000 |
| Number of Individuals | 317 | 317 | 317 | 317 | 185 | 185 |
| Observations | 634 | 634 | 634 | 634 | 555 | 555 |
| (Pseudo) R-squared | 0.192 | 0.219 | 0.1323 | 0.1484 | 0.157 | 0.2399 |

dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent

variable is the actual major at graduation.

Robust standard errors in parentheses. ** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1.

a P-value of a F-test that coefficients on prob of marriage, spousal earnings, and exp number

of children are jointly zero.

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| | Intended Major | | | | | Actual Major | |
|--|----------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|----------|--------------|--|
| | 0 | LS | LAD | | Multinon | nial Logit | |
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | |
| Panel A: Females | | | | | | | |
| Age 30 Earnings (\$10,000s) | 0.146*** | 0.099** | 0.230*** | 0.183** | 0.084*** | 0.037 | |
| | (0.047) | (0.048) | (0.065) | (0.078) | (0.019) | (0.026) | |
| Ability Rank | 0.029*** | 0.029*** | 0.035*** | 0.039*** | 0.021*** | 0.022*** | |
| ř | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.005) | (0.004) | (0.004) | (0.004) | |
| Prob Marriage by Age 30 | | -0.251 | | -0.171 | | 1.444** | |
| 0,0 | | (0.706) | | (0.713) | | (0.690) | |
| Spousal Earnings (\$10,000s) | | 0.087*** | | 0.083 | | 0.110*** | |
| 1 | | (0.028) | | (0.059) | | (0.036) | |
| Exp num of children by 30 | | 0.306* | | 0.603*** | | 0.575*** | |
| 1 | | (0.188) | | (0.202) | | (0.143) | |
| Constant | -1.473*** | -1.266*** | -1.445*** | -0.878*** | | | |
| | (0.206) | (0.250) | (0.188) | (0.262) | | | |
| Pvalue (Family variables) ^a | | 0.0124 | | 0.0088 | | 0.000 | |
| Number of Individuals | 317 | 317 | 317 | 317 | 185 | 185 | |
| Observations | 634 | 634 | 634 | 634 | 555 | 555 | |
| (Pseudo) R-squared | 0.192 | 0.219 | 0.1323 | 0.1484 | 0.157 | 0.2399 | |

dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent

variable is the actual major at graduation.

Robust standard errors in parentheses. ** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1. * p<0.1. * p<0.05, * p<0.1.

of children are jointly zero.

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| git |
|-----|
| |
| |
| |
| 7 |
| (6) |
| *** |
| 14) |
| ** |
| (0) |
| *** |
| 6) |
| *** |
| 3) |
| |
| |
| 00 |
| 5 |
| 5 |
| 99 |
| 1 |

dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent

variable is the actual major at graduation.

Robust standard errors in parentheses. ** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1. * p<0.1. * p<0.05, * p<0.1.

of children are jointly zero.

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| | Intended Major | | | | Actual Major | |
|--|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------|
| | 0 | LS | LAD | | Multinon | nial Logit |
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| Panel A: Females | | | | | | |
| Age 30 Earnings (\$10,000s) | 0.146*** | 0.099** | 0.230*** | 0.183** | 0.084*** (0.019) | 0.037 (0.026) |
| Ability Rank | 0.029*** | 0.029*** | 0.035*** | 0.039*** | 0.021*** | 0.022*** |
| Prob Marriage by Age 30 | (0.004) | -0.251 (0.706) | (0.003) | -0.171 (0.713) | (0.004) | 1.444** (0.690) |
| Spousal Earnings (\$10,000s) | | 0.087*** | | 0.083 | | 0.110*** |
| Exp num of children by 30 | | 0.306* | | 0.603*** | | 0.575*** (0.143) |
| Constant | -1.473*** (0.206) | -1.266*** (0.250) | -1.445*** (0.188) | -0.878*** (0.262) | | (0.143) |
| | (0.200) | (0.230) | (0.100) | (0.202) | | |
| Pvalue (Family variables) ^a | | 0.0124 | | 0.0088 | | 0.000 |
| Number of Individuals | 317 | 317 | 317 | 317 | 185 | 185 |
| Observations | 634 | 634 | 634 | 634 | 555 | 555 |
| (Pseudo) R-squared | 0.192 | 0.219 | 0.1323 | 0.1484 | 0.157 | 0.2399 |

dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent

variable is the actual major at graduation.

Robust standard errors in parentheses. ** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1. * p<0.1. * p<0.05, * p<0.1.

of children are jointly zero.

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| | | | | | Tuble 14. (Interface and Fletail) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family | | | | | | | | |
|----------|---|--|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | d Major | | Actual Major | | | | | | | | | |
| OI | _S | LA | AD | Multinomial Logit | | | | | | | | | |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 0.095*** | 0.093*** | 0.105** | 0.102** | 0.407*** | 0.410*** | | | | | | | | |
| (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.047) | (0.051) | (0.074) | (0.080) | | | | | | | | |
| 0.024*** | 0.025*** | 0.018*** | 0.018*** | 0.002 | 0.002 | | | | | | | | |
| (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.007) | | | | | | | | |
| | 0.704 | | 1.513 | | 0.569 | | | | | | | | |
| | (1.049) | | (1.517) | | (1.383) | | | | | | | | |
| | 0.029 | | 0.018 | | -0.010 | | | | | | | | |
| | (0.029) | | (0.081) | | (0.046) | | | | | | | | |
| | 0.202 | | 0.242 | | 0.211 | | | | | | | | |
| | (0.234) | | (0.225) | | (0.234) | | | | | | | | |
| -0.423* | -0.243 | -0.178 | -0.018 | | | | | | | | | | |
| (0.235) | (0.290) | (0.138) | (0.223) | | | | | | | | | | |
| | 0.5248 | | 0.6978 | | 0.8005 | | | | | | | | |
| 176 | 176 | 176 | 176 | 88 | 88 | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | 264 | | | | | | | | |
| | 0.167 | 0.0744 | 0.0803 | 0.39 | 0.3953 | | | | | | | | |
| | (1) 0.095*** (0.026) 0.024*** (0.005) -0.423* (0.235) | OLS (1) (2) 0.095*** 0.093*** (0.026) (0.026) 0.024*** (0.025) (0.005) (0.005) 0.704 (1.049) 0.029 (0.029) 0.202 (0.234) -0.423* -0.243 (0.235) (0.290) 176 176 352 352 | (1) (2) (3) 0.095*** 0.093*** (0.026) (0.026) (0.027) (0.028** 0.025*** 0.018*** (0.005) (0.005) (0.006) (1.049) 0.029 (0.029) (0.029) (0.029) 0.202 (0.234) -0.423* -0.243 -0.178 (0.235) (0.290) (0.138) 0.5248 176 176 176 176 352 352 352 | OLS LAD (1) (2) (3) (4) 0.095*** 0.093*** 0.105** 0.102** (0.026) (0.047) (0.051) 0.024*** 0.025*** 0.018*** 0.018*** (0.005) (0.006) (0.006) (0.006) (0.029) (0.018 (1.517) 0.029 (0.029) (0.028) 0.018 (0.234) (0.234) (0.225) -0.423* -0.243 -0.178 -0.018 (0.235) (0.290) (0.138) (0.223) 0.5248 0.6978 176 176 176 176 352 352 352 352 | OLS LAD Multinor (1) (2) (3) (4) (5) 0.095*** 0.093*** 0.105** 0.102** 0.407*** (0.026) (0.024) (0.047) (0.051) (0.074) (0.005) (0.005) (0.006) (0.006) (0.006) (0.005) (0.04) (1.517) (0.029) (0.018) (0.029) (0.029) (0.081) (0.234) (0.224) (0.234) (0.224) (0.225) (0.244) (0.225) -0.423* -0.243 -0.178 -0.018 (0.223) (0.235) (0.290) (0.138) (0.223) 0.5248 0.6978 176 176 176 88 352 352 352 352 264 | | | | | | | | |

Cols (1)-(2) show OLS estimates. Cols (3)-(4) show Least Absolute Deviation estimates. The dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent variable is the actual major at graduation.

Robust standard errors in parentheses. ** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1.

^a P-value of a F-test that coefficients on prob of marriage, spousal earnings, and exp number of children are jointly zero.

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| Table 14. (Interface and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Falling | | | | | | | |
|---|----------|----------------|----------|----------|-------------------|----------|--|
| | | Intended Major | | | | Major | |
| | Ol | LS | LA | VD | Multinomial Logit | | |
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | |
| Panel B: Males | | | | | | | |
| Age 30 Earnings (\$10,000s) | 0.095*** | 0.093*** | 0.105** | 0.102** | 0.407*** | 0.410*** | |
| | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.047) | (0.051) | (0.074) | (0.080) | |
| Ability Rank | 0.024*** | 0.025*** | 0.018*** | 0.018*** | 0.002 | 0.002 | |
| , | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.007) | |
| Prob Marriage by Age 30 | | 0.704 | | 1.515 | | 0.569 | |
| 8 7 8 | | (1.049) | | (1.517) | | (1.383) | |
| Spousal Earnings (\$10,000s) | | 0.029 | | 0.018 | | -0.010 | |
| 1 | | (0.029) | | (0.081) | | (0.046) | |
| Exp num of children by 30 | | 0.202 | | 0.242 | | 0.211 | |
| 1 | | (0.234) | | (0.225) | | (0.234) | |
| Constant | -0.423* | -0.243 | -0.178 | -0.018 | | | |
| | (0.235) | (0.290) | (0.138) | (0.223) | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Pvalue (Family variables) ^a | | 0.5248 | | 0.6978 | | 0.8005 | |
| Number of Individuals | 176 | 176 | 176 | 176 | 88 | 88 | |
| Observations | 352 | 352 | 352 | 352 | 264 | 264 | |
| (Pseudo) R-squared | 0.159 | 0.167 | 0.0744 | 0.0803 | 0.39 | 0.3953 | |

Cols (1)-(2) show OLS estimates. Cols (3)-(4) show Least Absolute Deviation estimates. The dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent variable is the actual major at graduation.

Robust standard errors in parentheses. ** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1.

^a P-value of a F-test that coefficients on prob of marriage, spousal earnings, and exp number of children are jointly zero.

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| | | Intended Major | | | | Major |
|--|----------|----------------|----------|----------|-------------------|----------|
| | 0 | LS | LA | ND | Multinomial Logit | |
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| Panel B: Males | | | | | | |
| Age 30 Earnings (\$10,000s) | 0.095*** | 0.093*** | 0.105** | 0.102** | 0.407*** | 0.410*** |
| | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.047) | (0.051) | (0.074) | (0.080) |
| Ability Rank | 0.024*** | 0.025*** | 0.018*** | 0.018*** | 0.002 | 0.002 |
| • | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.007) |
| Prob Marriage by Age 30 | | 0.704 | | 1.513 | | 0.569 |
| | | (1.049) | | (1.517) | | (1.383) |
| Spousal Earnings (\$10,000s) | | 0.029 | | 0.018 | | -0.010 |
| | | (0.029) | | (0.081) | | (0.046) |
| Exp num of children by 30 | | 0.202 | | 0.242 | | 0.211 |
| | | (0.234) | | (0.225) | | (0.234) |
| Constant | -0.423* | -0.243 | -0.178 | -0.018 | | |
| | (0.235) | (0.290) | (0.138) | (0.223) | | |
| Pvalue (Family variables) ^a | | 0.5248 | | 0.6978 | | 0.8005 |
| Number of Individuals | 176 | 176 | 176 | 176 | 88 | 88 |
| Observations | 352 | 352 | 352 | 352 | 264 | 264 |
| (Pseudo) R-squared | 0.159 | 0.167 | 0.0744 | 0.0803 | 0.39 | 0.3953 |

Cols (1)-(2) show OLS estimates. Cols (3)-(4) show Least Absolute Deviation estimates. The dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent variable is the actual major at graduation.

Robust standard errors in parentheses. ** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1. ** p<0.05, * p<0.1. ** p<0.05, ** p<0.05, ** p<0.1. ** p<0.05, ** p<0.1. ** p<0.05, of children are jointly zero.

Table 14: (Intended and Actual) Major Choice and Expectations about Career and Family

| | Intended Major | | | | Actual Major | |
|--|----------------|----------|----------|----------|--------------|------------|
| | Ol | | LAD | | | nial Logit |
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| Panel B: Males | | | | | | |
| Age 30 Earnings (\$10,000s) | 0.095*** | 0.093*** | 0.105** | 0.102** | 0.407*** | 0.410*** |
| | (0.026) | (0.026) | (0.047) | (0.051) | (0.074) | (0.080) |
| Ability Rank | 0.024*** | 0.025*** | 0.018*** | 0.018*** | 0.002 | 0.002 |
| • | (0.005) | (0.005) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.006) | (0.007) |
| Prob Marriage by Age 30 | | 0.704 | | 1.513 | | 0.569 |
| 0,0 | | (1.049) | | (1.517) | | (1.383) |
| Spousal Earnings (\$10,000s) | | 0.029 | | 0.018 | | -0.010 |
| | | (0.029) | | (0.081) | | (0.046) |
| Exp num of children by 30 | | 0.202 | | 0.242 | | 0.211 |
| | | (0.234) | | (0.225) | l | (0.234) |
| Constant | -0.423* | -0.243 | -0.178 | -0.018 | | |
| | (0.235) | (0.290) | (0.138) | (0.223) | | |
| Pvalue (Family variables) ^a | | 0.5248 | | 0.6978 | | 0.8005 |
| Number of Individuals | 176 | 176 | 176 | 176 | 88 | 88 |
| Observations | 352 | 352 | 352 | 352 | 264 | 264 |
| (Pseudo) R-squared | 0.159 | 0.167 | 0.0744 | 0.0803 | 0.39 | 0.3953 |

Cols (1)-(2) show OLS estimates. Cols (3)-(4) show Least Absolute Deviation estimates. The dep. variable is the intended likelihood of choosing a major.

Cols (5)-(6) show estimates from a multinomial logit regression, where the dependent

variable is the actual major at graduation. Robust standard errors in parentheses. *p < 0.01, ** p < 0.05, * p < 0.1. * p < 0.05, * p < 0.0of children are jointly zero.

Beliefs and Realized Outcomes I

Follow-up survey

- Follow-up survey six years after the initial survey
- 274 out of the initial 493 respondents participated
- Average age of respondent is 25
- Provides some evidence for the "quality" of the expectations data
- Respondents are not reminded of their initial answers

Beliefs and Realized Outcomes II

Population descriptive statistics

- No statistically significant differences for earnings: expected \$73.500 vs \$74.900 and working full-time
- working part-time: 18% of females expected to work part-time, but only 9% in reality
- Large significant differences for likelihood of marriage

Beliefs and Realized Outcomes III

Individual-level relationshp - career variables

Table 16: The Link between Expectations and Outcomes

| Table 16: The Link between Expectations and Outcomes | | | | | | |
|--|----------|---------|----------|--|--|--|
| | All | Males | Females | | | |
| Panel A, dependent variable: Log (current earnings | | | | | | |
| Log(Exp Earnings, Age Weighted) | 0.386*** | 0.167 | 0.521*** | | | |
| | (0.131) | (0.207) | (0.125) | | | |
| Observations | 201 | 64 | 137 | | | |
| R^2 | 0.092 | 0.018 | 0.153 | | | |
| Mean of Dependent Variable | 10.99 | 11.18 | 10.90 | | | |
| Panel B, dependent variable: Employed Full-time | | | | | | |
| Expected Prob of full-time emp at 30 | 0.165 | -0.189 | 0.358* | | | |
| | (0.148) | (0.220) | (0.187) | | | |
| Observations | 273 | 88 | 185 | | | |
| R^2 | 0.005 | 0.007 | 0.023 | | | |
| Mean of Dependent Variable | 0.740 | 0.740 | 0.740 | | | |
| Panel C, dependent variable: Employed Part-time | | | | | | |
| Expected Prob of part-time Emp at 30 | 0.272* | 0.0203 | 0.392** | | | |
| | (0.161) | (0.263) | (0.196) | | | |
| Observations | 273 | 88 | 185 | | | |
| R^2 | 0.015 | 0.000 | 0.032 | | | |
| Mean of Dependent Variable | 0.0900 | 0.0900 | 0.0900 | | | |

Beliefs and Realized Outcomes III

Individual-level relationshp - career variables

| Table 16: The Link between Expectations and Outcomes | | | | | | | | |
|--|------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| | All | Males | Females | | | | | |
| Panel A, dependent variable: Log (current earnings | | | | | | | | |
| Log(Exp Earnings, Age Weighted) | (0.131) | (0.207) | (0.125) | | | | | |
| Observations R^2 | 201 0.092 | 64 0.018 | 137 0.153 | | | | | |
| Mean of Dependent Variable | 10.99 | 11.18 | 10.90 | | | | | |
| Panel B, dependent variable: Employed Full-time Expected Prob of full-time emp at 30 | 0.165 (0.148) | -0.189 (0.220) | 0.358* (0.187) | | | | | |
| Observations \mathbb{R}^2 Mean of Dependent Variable | 273 0.005 0.740 | 88 0.007 0.740 | 185 0.023 0.740 | | | | | |
| Panel C, dependent variable: Employed Part-time Expected Prob of part-time Emp at 30 | 0.272* (0.161) | 0.0203 (0.263) | 0.392** (0.196) | | | | | |
| Observations \mathbb{R}^2 Mean of Dependent Variable | 273 0.015 0.0900 | 88 0.000 0.0900 | 185 0.032 0.0900 | | | | | |

- Marriage variable is distorted due to young age of respondents
- Significant if approximated by actual outcome "in a relationship"
- Beliefs about spousal income are predictive for actual spousal income
- Overall beliefs compare favorably to actual outcomes
- Indication that students can anticipate career and family outcomes of educational choices to some degree

Limitations

- Representativeness of sample?
- Due to time restrictions, the authors did not ask about reasons for participant's beliefs

Future Research

- Run follow-up surveys when students realize outcomes at ages 30 and 45
- Choice of participants casts doubt on external validity: extend the Sample
- Study elicits student's beliefs, but does not uncover the reasons for these beliefs
- Stated beliefs are not consequential

Current Population Characteristics

| Table 2: | Descriptive | Statistics | of 2009 | ACS Data |
|----------|-------------|------------|---------|----------|
| | | | | |

| 14070 | Tuble 2. Descriptive statistics of 2007 New Data | | | | | | |
|----------------------------|--|---------|--------|----------|--------|----------|--|
| | A, A | ge 23 | A | .ge 30 | Age 45 | | |
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female | |
| E (610,000) | | | | | | | |
| Earnings (in \$10,000s) | | | | | | | |
| Science/Business | 3.33 | 3.22 | 6.74 | 5.48+++ | 11.61 | 7.46+++ | |
| | (2.15) | (2.19) | (4.81) | (3.15) | (9.79) | (6.49) | |
| Humanities | 2.51 | 2.57 | 5.40 | 4.47+++ | 9.07 | 5.93+++ | |
| | (1.33) | (1.88) | (4.20) | (2.71) | (8.48) | (5.67) | |
| No Degree | 2.54 | 2.15+++ | 4.21 | 3.08+++ | 5.70 | 3.88+++ | |
| C | (1.52) | (1.41) | (2.50) | (1.59) | (4.13) | (2.57) | |
| p-value ^a | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Spousal Earnings (in \$10. | (2000s) | | | | | | |
| Science/Business | 3.41 | 4.75+++ | 5.26 | 8.25+++ | 7.44 | 12.68+++ | |
| | (2.09) | (3.11) | (3.44) | (5.79) | (6.69) | (10.15) | |
| Humanities | 2.27 | 3.49+++ | 4.30 | 6,66+++ | 5.71 | 9.85+++ | |
| Tumumtes | (1.33) | (1.93) | (2.61) | (5.64) | (4.72) | (9.42) | |
| No Degree | 2.21 | 3,50+++ | 3.24 | 4.82+++ | 3.76 | 6.36+++ | |
| 110 Degree | (1.13) | (1.93) | (1.86) | (2.92) | (2.59) | (4.81) | |
| p-value | (1.13) | 0.003 | 0 | (2.52) | (2.55) | (4.01) | |
| p-value | · · | 0.005 | v | · · | V | 0 | |
| Full-time Employed (%) | | | | | | | |
| Science/Business | 38.5 | 42.4+++ | 80.86 | 64.40+++ | 82.68 | 58.42+++ | |
| Humanities | 30.9 | 36.2+++ | 72.96 | 57.92+++ | 75.86 | 52.07+++ | |
| No Degree | 40.1 | 34.4+++ | 66.53 | 46.51+++ | 67.88 | 52.44+++ | |
| p-value | 0.1 | 0 | 00.55 | 40.51777 | 07.88 | 0 | |
| p-value | U | U | U | U | U | U | |
| Married (%) | | | | | | | |
| Science/Business | 8.2 | 15.9+++ | 61.72 | 67.49+++ | 80.79 | 76.14+++ | |
| Humanities | 11.5 | 15.3+++ | 55.7 | 64.94+++ | 76.58 | 74.51+ | |
| No Degree | 15.2 | 26.4+++ | 54.86 | 59.29+++ | 69.3 | 69.65 | |
| p-value | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 09.3 | 09.05 | |
| p-value | | 610.000 | U | V | U | V | |

Earnings and spousal earnings shown in \$10,000s.

Mean (standard deviation) shown for the continuous outcomes.
+++, ++, epender differences statistically significant at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively. Symbols denoted on female column.

"p-value of a F-test of the joint equality of means across majors. p-value of zero

implies p-vlaue < 0.001.

Earnings Beliefs: Earnings Levels

Table 3: Self Earnings

| | Age | e 23 | Ag | Age 30 | | ge 45 |
|------------------------------------|---------|---------|----------|-----------|---------|----------|
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Panel A: Levels (in 10,000s of do | llars) | | | | | |
| Science/Business | 5.93 | 5.39 | 13.74 | 10.86++ | 19.00 | 13.81+++ |
| | (7.32) | (4.66) | (16.61) | (9.31) | (22.38) | (14.12) |
| Humanities | 4.71 | 3.94 | 6.87 | 6.86 | 11.03 | 9.60 |
| | (7.38) | (3.51) | (5.51) | (7.4) | (13.53) | (11.75) |
| No Degree | 3.50 | 2.45++ | 5.07 | 3.27++ | 8.97 | 5.86+++ |
| <u> </u> | (7.54) | (1.16) | (11.0) | (4.56) | (15.95) | (10.22) |
| Overall | 5.60 | 4.68+ | 12.95 | 9.21+++ | 18.44 | 12.33+++ |
| | (7.36) | (3.81) | (16.35) | (8.45) | (22.52) | (13.90) |
| Panel B: Individual Log Difference | es | | | | | |
| Sci/Business versus. Humanities | .267*** | .304*** | .523*** | .425***++ | .446*** | .347***+ |
| | (.019) | (.017) | (.048) | (.025) | (.051) | (.026) |
| Graduate versus. No Degree | .594*** | .642*** | 1.022*** | 1.038*** | .829*** | .833*** |
| _ | (.033) | (.026) | (.055) | (.037) | (.054) | (.038) |

Panel A shows the mean and standard deviations of expected earnings (in \$10,000s). +++, ++, + denote gender differences are statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.

Panel B shows the avg. log differences and standard deviations in parentheses. ***, **, * denote the means are statistically different from zero at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively. +++, ++, + (shown on the female column) denote gender differences are statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.

Earnings Growth

Table 4: Earnings growth beliefs

| A | | | |
|-------|---|---------------|--|
| Age | 23-30 | Age : | 30-45 |
| Male | Female | Male | Female |
| | | | |
| .67 | .63 | .25 | .19 |
| (.72) | (.65) | (.47) | (.54) |
| .41 | .51+ | `.32 | `.27 |
| (.56) | (.53) | (.45) | (.52) |
| .23 | .21 | .47 | .43 |
| (.78) | (.55) | (.74) | (.58) |
| .66 | .6 | .29 | .23 |
| (.73) | (.58) | (.48) | (.52) |
| | | | |
| 26*** | .12***+++ | 08* | 08*** |
| | | | (.03) |
| 42*** | | | 2*** |
| | | | (.03) |
| | Male .67 (.72) .41 (.56) .23 (.78) .66 (.73) | Male Female | Male Female Male .67 .63 .25 .(.72) .(.65) .(.47) .41 .51+ .32 .23 .21 .47 .(.78) .(.55) .(.74) .66 .6 .29 .(.73) .(.58) .(.48) .26*** .12***+++ 08* .(.05) .(.03) .(.04) .20** .20** .20** .20** .20 .20 .20 .20 .21 .22 .23 .43 .24 .25 |

Panel A shows the mean and standard dev of beliefs about earnings growth (in %). +++, ++, + denote gender differences are statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.

Panel B shows average log differences and standard deviations in parentheses.

***, ** denote means are statistically different from zero at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively. +++, +++, ++, known on the female column) denote gender differences are statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.

Earnings Uncertainty

Table 5: Age 30 Earnings Uncertainty - Std deviations from fitting a Beta Distribution

| | Male | Female |
|-------------------------------|---------|--------|
| Panel A: Levels (in \$10,000) | | |
| Science/Business | 9.17 | 9.49 |
| | (1.44) | (2.48) |
| Humanities | 10.34 | 10.01 |
| | (27.44) | (2.32) |
| No Degree | 14.73 | 15.27 |
| _ | (7.34) | (7.53) |
| Overall | 9.71 | 9.68 |
| | (2.02) | (2.01) |

Panel B: Individual differences

| Sci/Business versus. Humanities | 11*** | 057***+++ |
|---------------------------------|--------|-----------|
| | (.014) | (.012) |
| Graduate versus. No Degree | 305*** | 335*** |
| 9 | (050) | (.0.42) |

Panel A shows the mean and std dev of age 30 earnings uncertainty beliefs (in \$10,000). Uncertainty is the standard deviation of the

behiefs (in \$10,000). Uncertainty is the standard overation of the individual-specific (beta-) fitted earnings distribution.
+++, ++, + denote gender differences statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.
Panel B shows average log differences and standard deviations in parentheses. **** *** ** denote means are statistically diff from 0 at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively. +++, ++, (shown on female leaders). column) denote gender differences are statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.

Beliefs about Marriage

Table 6: Reliefs about Marriage

| 10 | oic o. De | ners about | viailiage | | | |
|---------------------------------|-----------|------------|-----------|----------|---------|---------|
| Prob Marriage: | Age 23 | | Age 30 | | Age | e 45 |
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Panel A: Levels (0-1 scale) | | | | | | |
| Science/Business | .148 | .167 | .593 | .594 | .804 | .778 |
| | (.207) | (.214) | (.286) | (.271) | (.248) | (.253) |
| Humanities | .152 | .182 | .601 | .66++ | .797 | .800 |
| | (.214) | (.229) | (.291) | (.268) | (.253) | (.246) |
| No Degree | .153 | .221+++ | .535 | .605++ | .727 | .743 |
| | (.219) | (.26) | (.329) | (.29) | (.302) | (.287) |
| Overall | .149 | .179 | .589 | .634+ | .797 | .793 |
| | (.213) | (.225) | (.288) | (.266) | (.25) | (.242) |
| Panel B: Individual Log Differe | nces | | | | | |
| Sci/Business versus. Humanities | 008 | 096* | 024 | 147***++ | .013 | 020 |
| Des Business versus. Humannies | (.046) | (.053) | (.042) | (.039) | (.014) | (.024) |
| Graduate versus. No Degree | .075 | 192**+ | .354*** | .127**++ | .317*** | .161*** |

(.099) (.091) (.11)Panel A shows the mean and standard deviations of marriage beliefs. +++, ++, + denote gender diffs are

respectively. +++, ++, + (shown on the female column) denote gender differences are statistically significant at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.

Beliefs about Potential Spousal Earnings

Table 7: Beliefs about Potential Spousal Earnings, Conditional on Own Major (and Own Age)

| | | e 23 | Age 30 | | Age 45 | |
|---|-----------------|----------------|----------------|-----------------|-----------------|------------------|
| | Male | Female | Male | Female | Male | Female |
| Panel A: Levels (in 10,000s of dollars) | | | | | | |
| Science/Business | 5.06 | 5.74+ | 9.00 | 10.76++ | 11.29 | 13.68+ |
| | (4.12) | (3.92) | (7.72) | (9.14) | (13.25) | (13.67) |
| Humanities | 4.52 | 4.75 | 7.05 | 7.86 | 8.02 | 11.07+++ |
| | (7.35) | (3.75) | (8.93) | (7.69) | (7.95) | (12.90) |
| No Degree | 4.58 | 3.46 | 4.57 | 5.54 | 6.25 | 7.76 |
| Overall | (11.99) 5.02 | (2.26) 5.30 | (5.56) 8.42 | (9.11) 9.74+ | (9.89) 10.77 | (12.03) 12.73 |
| | (5.90) | (3.88) | (7.60) | (8.91) | (13.20) | (13.61) |
| Panel B: Individual Log Differences | | | | | | |
| Sci/Business versus. Humanities | .185*** | .198*** | .282*** | .292*** | .241*** | .221*** |
| | (.019) | (.015) | (.044) | (.024) | (.04) | (.026) |
| Graduate versus. No Degree | .432*** | .481*** | .687*** | .741*** | .587*** | .632*** |
| | (.048) | (.028) | (.05) | (.041) | (.054) | (.039) |

Panel A shows the mean and standard dev of beliefs about spouse's expected earnings (in \$10,000s) conditional on own major.

+++, ++, + denote gender differences are statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively. Panel B shows avg. log differences and standard deviations in parentheses. **** ** denote means are statistically different from zero at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively. +++, ++, +(shown on the female column) denote gender differences are statistically different at the 1, 5, and 10% levels, respectively.

Beliefs and Realized Outcomes

Population descriptive statistics - career variables

Table 15: Descriptive Statistics - Expectations (Weighted by Major Probs) and Outcomes

| is. Desc. | | | ectations (we | | | | |
|----------------------------|--|---|---|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|--|
| Expectations in 2010 | | | | Realizations in 2016 | | | |
| | All | Males | Females | All | Males | Females | |
| Panel A | : Earnings | Full-time | (age-weighted | l expectatio | m) | | |
| Mean | 7.35 | 9.90 | 6.16 | 7.49 | 10.18 | 6.24 | |
| | | | | | | | |
| SD | (8.19) | (13.52) | (3.06) | (7.74) | (12.39) | (3.46) | |
| N | 201 | 64 | 137 | 201 | 64 | 137 | |
| Panel B Mean SD N | : Likelihoo 77.61 (19.15) 273 | d of full-tin 82.28 (19.51) 88 | ne employmer 75.38 (18.61) 185 | nt (age 30 e 73.99 (43.95) 273 | xpectation 73.86 (44.19) 88 | 74.05 (43.95) 185 | |
| Panel C Mean SD N | : Likelihoo 16.02*** (13.1) 273 | d of part-tir 11.71 (12.02) 88 | me employme 18.08*** (13.12) 185 | nt (age 30 e 9.16 (28.9) 273 | expectatio 9.09 (28.91) 88 | n) 9.19 (28.97) 185 | |

Beliefs and Realized Outcomes

Population descriptive statistics - family variables

| Table | 15: Descriptive Statistics - Expectations | (Weighted by Major Probs) and Outcomes |
|-------|---|--|
| | Expectations in 2010 | Realizations in 2016 |

| | Expectations in 2010 Realizations in 2016 | | | | | | |
|---------|---|---------------|---------------------------|--------------|-------------|---------|--|
| | All | Males | Females | A11 | Males | Females | |
| Panel I |): Likelihoo | od of Marria | oe. | | | | |
| Usino | expectation | for 1-yr afte | r graduation 17.16*** | (and marria | ice for ou | tcomes) | |
| Mean | 16 04*** | 13 62* | 17 16*** | 5.56 | 8 14 | 4 35 | |
| SD | (21.62) | (19.83) | (22.37) | (22.95) | (27.5) | (20.45) | |
| N | 270 | 86 | 184 | 270 | 86 | 184 | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Using a | age-weighte | d expectation | on (and marri 35.77*** | age + cohal | o, for outc | omes) | |
| Mean | 34.36*** | 31.35*** | 35.77*** | 48.15 | 45.35 | 49,46 | |
| SD | (21.08) | (21.97) | (20.56) | (50.06) | (50.08) | (50.13) | |
| N | 270 | 86 | 184 | 270 | 86 | 184 | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | d of partner | working full | | | | |
| Mean | 73.91 | 62.28 | 78.89 | 76.15 | 69.23 | 79.12 | |
| SD | (21.19) | (23.28) | (18.2) | (42.78) | (46.76) | (40.87) | |
| N | 130 | 39 | 91 | 130 | 39 | 91 | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Panel F | Partner's | Earnings (ag | ge-weighted 6.4** | expectation) | | | |
| Mean | 6.52* | 6.84 | 6.4** | 7.73 | 5.68 | 8.5 | |
| SD | (2.84) | (3.24) | (2.69) | (6.14) | (3.53) | (6.73) | |
| N | 99 | 27 | 72 | 99 | 2.7 | 72. | |

Beliefs and Realized Outcomes

Individual-level relationship - family variables

Table 16: The Link between Expectations and Outcomes

| Table 16: The Link between Expectations and Outcomes | | | | | | | |
|--|------------------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|--|--|--|--|
| | All | Males | Females | | | | |
| Panel D, dependent variable: Married | 0.217** | 0.378* | 0.147 | | | | |
| Age-Weighted Exp Probability of Being Married | (0.100) | (0.217) | (0.0936) | | | | |
| Observations R^2 Mean of Dependent Variable | 270 | 86 | 184 | | | | |
| | 0.040 | 0.091 | 0.022 | | | | |
| | 0.0600 | 0.0800 | 0.0400 | | | | |
| Panel E, dependent variable: In Any relationship | 0.503*** | 0.606*** | 0.441*** | | | | |
| Age-Weighted Exp Probability of Being Married | (0.127) | (0.209) | (0.161) | | | | |
| Observations R^2 Mean of Dependent Variable | 270 | 86 | 184 | | | | |
| | 0.045 | 0.071 | 0.033 | | | | |
| | 0.480 | 0.450 | 0.490 | | | | |
| Panel F, dependent variable: Spouse/Partner Workin Expected Prob of Spouse full-time Emp at 30 | ng Full-time 0.415** (0.183) | 0.458 (0.298) | 0.339 (0.253) | | | | |
| Observations \mathbb{R}^2 Mean of Dependent Variable | 130 | 39 | 91 | | | | |
| | 0.042 | 0.052 | 0.023 | | | | |
| | 0.760 | 0.690 | 0.790 | | | | |
| Panel G, dependent variable: Log(Spouse/Partner E Log(Age-Weighted Expected Earnings of Spouse) | Earnings) 0.400** (0.173) | 0.598** (0.233) | 0.344* (0.206) | | | | |
| Observations \mathbb{R}^2 Mean of Dependent Variable | 112 | 31 | 81 | | | | |
| | 0.054 | 0.119 | 0.042 | | | | |
| | 1.690 | 1.420 | 1.790 | | | | |