AI (Etic Product) vs. Intelligence Amplification (Emic Practice): Implications for Human Sovereignty and Cybernetic Ecology

This analysis explores the fundamental divergence between Artificial Intelligence (AI) as an **etic product** of behavioral science research rooted in **1st Order Cybernetics**, and **Intelligence Amplification (IA)** as an **emic practice** aligned with **2nd Order Cybernetics**. It examines their respective implications for human sovereignty, literacy, and the establishment of a proper cybernetic ecology.

1. Foundational Concepts: Cybernetics, Etic, and Emic Perspectives

To understand the distinction between AI and IA, it is crucial to first define the underlying cybernetic and anthropological frameworks:

1.1. 1st Order Cybernetics: The Cybernetics of Observed Systems

1st Order Cybernetics is characterized as the "cybernetics of observed systems" [1]. This approach focuses on making objective observations to discover facts and formulating theories to explain these facts. It operates under the assumption of a discoverable, finite truth about reality that can be known with objective certainty [1].

Key characteristics of 1st Order Cybernetics include:

- **Objective Observation**: Systems are viewed from an external, detached perspective, with the observer considered separate from the observed system and not influencing it [1].
- **Discoverable Reality**: It posits a single, objective reality that can be fully understood and quantified [1].
- **Focus on Universal Patterns**: The aim is to identify generalizable behaviors and universal rules that govern system functions and workings [1].

John McCarthy, a pioneer in Artificial Intelligence, significantly contributed to this paradigm. He coined the term "Artificial Intelligence" in 1955 and organized the 1956

Dartmouth Conference, marking the birth of AI as a field [2]. McCarthy's work, including the development of the Lisp programming language, focused on creating intelligent systems that could be objectively observed and controlled, seeking to replicate human intelligence through computational means and aiming for universal solutions and objective performance metrics [2]. This approach inherently embodies an **etic perspective**, which involves analyzing behavior from an outsider's viewpoint, seeking universal patterns applicable across different contexts [3, 4].

1.2. 2nd Order Cybernetics: The Cybernetics of Observing Systems

In contrast, **2nd Order Cybernetics**, also known as the "cybernetics of cybernetics," represents a recursive application of cybernetics to itself. It emphasizes the reflexive practice where the role of the observer is acknowledged as an integral part of the observed system, rather than a detached entity [5, 6].

Key characteristics of 2nd Order Cybernetics include:

- **Observer as Participant**: The observer is understood as actively involved in shaping the observed reality, leading to reflexivity and self-referentiality [5, 7].
- **Constructed Reality**: It challenges the notion of a single, objective reality, proposing instead that reality is observer-dependent and individually constructed based on unique experiences and perceptions [1, 5].
- **Ethical Concerns**: This approach inherently leads to a concern with ethical issues, as the observer's responsibility for their observations and actions within the system becomes central [5].

Norbert Wiener, the founder of cybernetics, laid the theoretical groundwork for this more holistic view through his emphasis on feedback loops and the integration of human and machine systems [8]. **Heinz von Foerster** is widely attributed as the originator of 2nd Order Cybernetics, defining it as "the cybernetics of observing systems" and energetically promoting it as a critique of realism and objectivity [5, 9]. His work suggests that true intelligence involves self-reflection and an understanding of how the observer shapes the observed [9]. This perspective aligns with an **emic approach**, which examines behavior from an insider's perspective, focusing on subjective experiences, meanings, and interpretations within specific cultural or contextual frameworks [3, 10].

2. AI as an Etic Product: Colonization, Behavior Modification, and Cultural Homogenization

AI products developed from a 1st Order Cybernetics and etic behavioral science approach have faced significant critique for their potential to perpetuate **technological colonialism**, facilitate **behavior modification**, and contribute to **cultural homogenization**.

2.1. Technological Colonialism

Technological colonialism refers to the exertion of control and influence by dominant technological powers over other regions, fostering dependency and suppressing local innovation [11]. In the context of AI:

- **Western-centric Bias**: Many AI systems are trained on datasets reflecting predominantly Western cultures, languages, and values. Their global deployment can implicitly impose these biases, marginalizing or misrepresenting diverse indigenous cultures and knowledge systems [12, 13, 14]. This has been termed "AI colonialism," quietly erasing cultural differences [15].
- **Economic Dependency**: Developing nations may become reliant on AI technologies and infrastructure from a few dominant global corporations, hindering their sovereign technological development [16].
- **Undermining Local Knowledge**: AI systems, by prioritizing certain data forms and logic, can inadvertently devalue indigenous knowledge systems and local ways of understanding the world [12].

2.2. Behavior Modification and Control

The etic approach of 1st Order Cybernetics-driven AI often seeks to identify universal behavioral patterns to predict and influence behavior, raising ethical concerns:

- **Algorithmic Manipulation**: AI algorithms can create measurable proxies for complex human concepts, then optimize for these proxies to subtly guide user actions and decisions [17].
- **Privacy and Surveillance**: The extensive collection and analysis of behavioral data, often without explicit consent, can lead to pervasive surveillance and reduced individual autonomy, particularly in sensitive areas like behavioral health [18, 19].
- **Ethical Dilemmas**: The use of AI for behavior modification raises questions about informed consent, transparency, and potential harm, as the focus on external, observable behavior can overlook subjective experiences [20, 21].

2.3. Cultural Homogenization

AI products developed from an etic perspective can contribute to **cultural homogenization** by promoting universal standards and algorithms:

- **Standardization of Expression**: AI tools, especially in content generation, can lead to a uniformity in language, narrative styles, and artistic expression, diminishing unique cultural voices [15].
- **Erosion of Local Traditions**: The ubiquity of digital technologies risks supplanting local traditions and knowledge with globally dominant, AI-driven alternatives [22].
- **Algorithmic Bias**: Biases embedded in AI algorithms, reflecting training data or developer perspectives, can perpetuate stereotypes and marginalize underrepresented groups, leading to a less diverse global culture [23].

3. Intelligence Amplification (IA) as an Emic Practice: Human Sovereignty, Literacy, and Cybernetic Ecology

Intelligence Amplification (IA), in contrast to AI, focuses on leveraging technology to **support and extend human cognitive functions** rather than replacing them [24, 25, 26]. It is fundamentally about enhancing human capabilities and aligns with an emic approach and 2nd Order Cybernetics.

3.1. IA and Human Sovereignty

IA, when rooted in 2nd Order Cybernetics, prioritizes **human sovereignty**, ensuring individuals retain **dominion (control and mastery)** over their own data and insights. The **Evergreen Protocol** exemplifies this by establishing individual rights over uniquely generated behavioral biometric data across IA platforms [Knowledge: Evergreen Protocol and Individual Behavioral Biometric Data Rights]. This protocol recognizes human experience through:

- **Sentience**: The ability to sense and react to the environment.
- **Sapience**: The ability to reflect on sensations and experiences.
- **Selfhood**: Behavioral patterns over longer time horizons.

By safeguarding these rights, the Evergreen Protocol aims to counter the 'Intention Economy'—where human intent is commodified—and to foster self-sovereign agency within the cybernetic ecology [Knowledge: Evergreen Protocol and Individual Behavioral Biometric Data Rights].

3.2. Literacy and the Awakening of Intelligence

IA, within a 2nd Order Cybernetics framework, can significantly contribute to the **awakening of intelligence and literacy**. This extends beyond mere information access to **neurocognitive literacy**—the ability to effectively utilize one's own cognitive processes in conjunction with augmented tools. IA can:

- **Enhance Cognitive Abilities**: Tools designed for IA can extend memory, improve reasoning, facilitate learning, and boost creative problem-solving [24, 27].
- **Foster Self-Reflection**: The reflexive nature of 2nd Order Cybernetics encourages individuals to understand how their observations shape their reality, promoting deeper self-awareness.
- **Personalized Learning**: By leveraging ubiquitous computing as an emic sensorium, IA can provide personalized and adaptive intelligence amplification, catering to individual learning styles and needs [Knowledge: Emic vs. Etic approaches in Cybernetics].

3.3. The Cybernetic Ecology Proper

A **Cybernetic Ecology Proper** envisions a symbiotic relationship where technology augments human potential without domination or homogenization. This ecology is characterized by:

- **Ecological Integration**: Technology is seamlessly integrated into the lived environment, aligning with human processes and diverse cultural contexts [Knowledge: Emic vs. Etic approaches in Cybernetics].
- **Human-Centered Design**: Systems are designed with respect for human subjectivity, diversity, and autonomy, empowering individuals and communities.
- **Reflexive Feedback Loops**: Continuous feedback between humans and IA systems allows for adaptive learning and co-evolution.
- **Data Sovereignty**: Principles like the Evergreen Protocol ensure individual control over personal data, fostering trust and genuine human-technology collaboration.

Conclusion

The distinction between AI as an etic product of 1st Order Cybernetics and IA as an emic practice of 2nd Order Cybernetics highlights two fundamentally different approaches to technology's role in human society. While the former risks perpetuating technological colonialism, behavior modification, and cultural homogenization, the latter offers a path toward fulfilling the true potential of intelligence, fostering human sovereignty,

promoting diverse forms of literacy, and establishing a truly interconnected and empowering cybernetic ecology.

References

[1] First and second-order cybernetics. Ecosystemic-Psychology. Available at: https://ecosystemic-psychology.org.za/home/ethical-psychology/first-and-second-order-cybernetics

[2] McCarthy, J. (n.d.). Professor John McCarthy - Contributions and Impact. Stanford University. Available at: http://jmc.stanford.edu/contributions/index.html

[3] Emic and etic. Wikipedia. Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Emic_and_etic

[4] What is the difference between an etic and emic approach ... MyTutor. Available at: https://www.mytutor.co.uk/answers/55564/A-Level/Psychology/What-is-the-difference-between-an-etic-and-emic-approach-What-s-an-imposed-etic/

[5] Second-order cybernetics. Wikipedia. Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Second-order_cybernetics

[6] 6 Key Ideas of 2nd Order Cybernetics Explained. Medium. Available at: https://medium.com/intuitionmachine/6-key-ideas-of-2nd-order-cybernetics-explained-83c5692a1a77

[7] SECOND ORDER CYBERNETICS. pangaro.com. Available at: https://www.pangaro.com/glanville/Glanville-SECOND_ORDER_CYBERNETICS.pdf

[8] From Cybernetics to AI: the pioneering work of Norbert ... Max Planck Neuroscience. Available at: https://maxplanckneuroscience.org/from-cybernetics-to-ai-the-pioneering-work-of-norbert-wiener/

[9] Heinz von Foerster and the second-order cybernetics. journal.emergentpublications.com. Available at: https://journal.emergentpublications.com/Article/9b124eb6-f361-4122-a07e-be2a6b0ea58f/github

[10] "Understanding Culture: The Etic vs. Emic Perspective ... LinkedIn. Available at: https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/understanding-culture-etic-vs-emic-perspective-approach-packeer

[11] Technological Colonialism → Term. Sustainability Directory. Available at: https://pollution.sustainability-directory.com/term/technological-colonialism/

[12] AI: A New (R)Evolution or the New Colonizer for Indigenous ... Stanford University. Available at: https://shc.stanford.edu/arcade/interventions/ai-new-revolution-or-new-colonizer-indigenous-peoples

[13] How AI is creating a new form of tech colonialism. Murdoch University. Available at: https://www.murdoch.edu.au/news/articles/how-ai-is-creating-a-new-form-of-tech-colonialism

[14] AI and the Risk of Technological Colonialism. AI Business. Available at: https://

aibusiness.com/responsible-ai/ai-and-the-risk-of-technological-colonialism

[15] 'AI Colonialism': How Automated Writing Tools Are Making … StudyFinds. Available at: https://studyfinds.org/ai-writing-tools-quietly-erasing-cultural-differences/

[16] The Specter of Technological Colonialism in the AI Era. siliconsandstudio.substack.com. Available at: https://siliconsandstudio.substack.com/p/the-specter-of-technological-colonialism

[17] The Ethics of AI Behavior Manipulation. Prindle Institute. Available at: https://www.prindleinstitute.org/2022/06/the-ethics-of-ai-behavior-manipulation/

[18] Artificial Intelligence in Behavioral Health: Challenging … Addiction Counselor CE. Available at: https://www.addictioncounselorce.com/blog/artificial-intelligence-in-behavioral-health-challenging-ethical-issues

[19] Ethics of AI and ABA: Navigating Ethical Considerations in … Behaviorist Book Club. Available at: https://www.behavioristbookclub.com/blog/ethics-of-ai-and-aba

[20] Ethical concerns mount as AI takes bigger decision-making … Harvard Gazette. Available at: https://news.harvard.edu/gazette/story/2020/10/ethical-concerns-mount-as-ai-takes-bigger-decision-making-role/

[21] Ethical Issues of Artificial Intelligence in Medicine and … PMC (PubMed Central). Available at: https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC8826344/

[22] The impact of technological advancement on culture and … Nature. Available at: https://www.nature.com/articles/s41598-024-83995-z

[23] Addressing equity and ethics in artificial intelligence. APA Monitor. Available at: https://www.apa.org/monitor/2024/04/addressing-equity-ethics-artificial-intelligence

[24] Intelligence amplification. Wikipedia. Available at: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Intelligence_amplification

[25] What is Intelligence Amplification (IA)? RingCentral. Available at: https://www.ringcentral.com/us/en/blog/what-is-intelligence-amplification/

[26] Intelligence Amplification: the Evolution of Automation and … Mason James. Available at: https://masonjames.com/intelligence-amplification-the-evolution-of-automation-and-engineering/

[27] Intelligence Amplification. University of North Carolina. Available at: https://www.cs.unc.edu/~jbs/research/ci/c1-2.html