Status: 38 / 38 Resolved



AggLayer v0.3.0 Audit Response

Version: 1.0 [DRAFT]

Authors: Dave Huseby, Simon Paitrault

Organization: Polygon AppSec

Document History

Mar 18, 2025 - Document Created

Mar 21, 2025 - Audit 1 Findings Added

May 14, 2025 - Status Updated, Audit 2 Findings Added

May 27, 2025 - Status Updated

Jun 10, 2025 - Submitted fix for 3.2-22.2, Status Updated

Jul 18, 2025 - Completed

Table of Contents

ggLaver v0.3.0 Audit Response
<u>Introduction</u>
<u>Scope</u>
Audit 1 Mar 10, 2025 – Mar 21, 2025
Audit 2 Mar 24, 2025 – Apr 4, 2025
<u>Detailed Findings – Audit 1</u>
ALGO3-01 - Use of Unhashed Leaf Values in Merkle Tree
AGLO3-02 - Use of H::Digest::default() for Empty Nodes May Break Non-Inclusion Logic
AGLO3-03 - Field Omission in L1 Leaf Hash
AGLO3-04 - Mistaken Network Identity in the Event of Integer Overflow
AGLO3-05 - Unchecked Use of unwrap() May Cause Panics
AGLO3-06 - Unchecked TREE_DEPTH Values May Cause Compile-Time Panics and
<u>Logic Issues</u>
AGLO3-07 - Potential Cross-Structs Keccak Hash Collisin
AGLO3-08.1 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Unclear Bit Indexing in Specification
Comment ACL CO. CO. C. Address TODO Comments
AGLO3-08.2 - Address TODO Comments
AGLO3-08.3 Miscellaneous General Comments: Improve Error Context When Deserializing Hex-Encoded Digest
AGLO3-08.4 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Deterministic Root Initialization
AGLO3-08.5 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Debug Formatting Inconsistency
Detailed Findings - Audit 2
AGLO3.2-01 - Lack of Authentication/Authorization on RPC Services
AGLO3.2-02 - Network Tasks Can Drop Certificates if Channel is Full
AGLO3.2-03 - Unencrypted Communication for RPC and Metric Endpoints
AGLO3.2-04 - Blind Reproving of Proven Certificates Without State Recovery of
Consistency Checks
AGLO3.2-05 - Missing Recovery for Failed Network Tasks
AGLO3.2-06 - Unchecked Panic with unwrap() and expect()
AGLO3.2-07 - Use of unwrap() with gRPC reflection server can result in panic
AGLO3.2-08 - on proven certificate() Continues on Partial Error
AGLO3.2-09 - insert_certificate_header() Has no Conflict Detection for Settled
<u>Certificates</u>
AGLO3.2-10 - No Panic Handling on Orchestrator or RPC Tasks
AGLO3.2-11 - Potential Resource leak on Panic in LocalExecutor
AGLO3.2-12 - Potential Resource Leak on Panic Before Shutdown
AGLO3 2-13 - write_batch() Skips default_write_options

- AGLO3.2-14 Partial Error Handling in create new backup()
- AGLO3.2-15 Unimplemented GPU Prover Type
- AGLO3.2-16 Fallback mechanism Cloning Overhead
- AGLO3.2-17 Fallback Service Readiness Not Polled in Executor::poll ready()
- AGLO3.2-18 No Resource Cleanup At Shutdown
- AGLO3.2-19 Hardcoded Default Socket Addresses
- <u>AGLO3.2-20 LocalNetworkStateData State Risks Incorrect State Recorded on Error Conditions</u>
- AGLO3.2-21 Task Spawning Without Limits
- <u>AGLO3.2-22.1 Miscellaneous General Comments: Health Status Set Before Services Start</u>
- AGLO3.2-22.2 Miscellaneous General Comments: Blocking Calls Inside Tokio Runtime Context
- AGLO3.2-22.3 Miscellaneous General Comments: Redundant Reflection Service Registration
- AGLO3.2-22.4 Miscellaneous General Comments: Commented Out Code
- AGLO3.2-22.5 Miscellaneous General Comments: Address TODOs

Introduction

This is a response to the two audit reports produced by Sigma Prime over the Aggregation Layer code.

2025-04_aggregation-layer_d7b3dd1c28_sigma-prime_audit-part-1.pdf

Scope

Audit 1 Mar 10, 2025 - Mar 21, 2025

- https://github.com/agglayer/agglayer/
 - P0: crates/pessimistic-proof-program
 - o P0: crates/pessimistic-proof-core
 - P1: crates/pessimistic-proof

Audit 2 Mar 24, 2025 - Apr 4, 2025

- https://github.com/agglayer/provers
 - o P0: crates/aggchain-proof-program
 - o P1: crates/prover-engine
 - o P1: crates/prover-executor

Detailed Findings – Audit 1

ALGO3-01 - Use of Unhashed Leaf Values in Merkle Tree

Severity: Medium Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/49

This approach has been deemed valid by design within a resource constrained, SP1-based zero-knowledge environment where hashing is expensive, tree depth is fixed and privacy is not required.

The position of each node is structurally determined by the key, so there is no ambiguity between leaf and internal nodes. The system does not rely on the cryptographic binding of the leaf value itself but instead on the overall integrity of the tree structure, which is preserved through secure hashing of internal nodes. This design avoids an extra hashing round at the leaf level, which is a practical optimization given the cost of hashing in SP1-based environments.

AGLO3-02 - Use of H::Digest::default() for Empty Nodes May Break Non-Inclusion Logic

Severity: Medium *

Resolution: Won't Fix *

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/51

This design is correct as there is no semantic difference between an "unset" and "zero balance" leaf, they are the same as the chain starts with a 0 balance for each token anyways.

AGLO3-03 - Field Omission in L1 Leaf Hash

Severity: Low Resolution: Fixed

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/56

In #725 the missing fields were added to the hash commitment and thus the full leaf state.

AGLO3-04 - Mistaken Network Identity in the Event of Integer Overflow

Severity: Low Resolution Fixed

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/55

The fix is spread out over three different PRs: #208, #800, and agglayer/interop #21. Essentially we're panicking on overflow in PP programs while also handling overflows gracefully in other contexts where panics must be avoided.

AGLO3-05 - Unchecked Use of unwrap() May Cause Panics

Severity: Low

Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/52

This is in the SP1 proof code, meaning that if the unwrap() triggers the worst that could happen is the proof fails to generate. It might still be an avenue for code quality improvement, that said.

For the global_index, the value's type is U256 that guarantees the fact that we have the amount of bytes needed. There is a comment that explains why we can unwrap.

AGLO3-06 - Unchecked TREE_DEPTH Values May Cause Compile-Time Panics and Logic Issues

Severity: Informational Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/58

Leo Gaspard: This is a const value, so if it were to overflow it'd result in a compile-time error. I think this is good enough?

Dave Huseby: Yes, compile-time failures are OK. In fact if there ever is an error, we prefer to catch it at compile time.

AGLO3-07 - Potential Cross-Structs Keccak Hash Collision

Severity: Informational Resolution: Tech Debt

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/54

This issue is noted and will be addressed as time allows. The team's assessment is that the fix could help with defense-in-depth but isn't an error.

AGLO3-08.1 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Unclear Bit Indexing in Specification Comment

Severity: Informational

Resolution: Fixed

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/53

Leo Gaspard: I'm not sure I understand the issue here? The comment does define it as the 64th bit from the right; the comment is just MSB order to make it clear for the user (large values are always represented MSB) while the code refers to the bit in an LSB fashion

SigP: Makes sense, just a minor confusion when reading the comment/code. Perhaps could consider just a simple addition to the comment that the layout is described in MSB-first order, and that bit positions in code are interpreted in LSB-first order. Just for clarity for future contributors. No issue otherwise.

This issue was addressed in <u>agglayer/interop #30</u> by adding a comment and renaming the constant to be MAINNET_FLAG_LSB_0FFSET

AGLO3-08.2 - Address T0D0 Comments

Severity: Informational Resolution: Tech Debt

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/22

Leo Gaspard: Unfortunately, I think we'll have to postpone that until later, unless you can see it becoming a vulnerability: some of them are very long-term planned improvements

AGLO3-08.3 Miscellaneous General Comments: Improve Error Context When Deserializing Hex-Encoded Digest

Severity: Informational Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/64

This still needs to be addressed. The fix is a simple change of the format! string.

AGLO3-08.4 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Deterministic Root Initialization

Severity: Informational Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/60

We recompute the roots for all trees at first and an empty root has semantics to refer to empty trees.

AGLO3-08.5 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Debug Formatting Inconsistency

Severity: Informational Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/90

Adding the suggested debug wrapper does not bring a lot of value since we moved all of the root and digest values to newtypes. The existing fmt::Debug impl for Digest makes the output of the newtypes more readable.

Detailed Findings - Audit 2

AGLO3.2-01 - Lack of Authentication/Authorization on RPC Services

Severity: Medium

Resolution: Tech Debt

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/92

The team acknowledges that they need to add authentication/authorization to the RPC services. There is some design required to properly add it and that will be completed in the next version of AggLayer.

AGLO3.2-02 - Network Tasks Can Drop Certificates if Channel is Full

Severity: Medium

Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/93

No data is lost if the channel fills because the Certificates are already in the pending pool. Also, current refactoring will likely remove this channel altogether.

AGLO3.2-03 - Unencrypted Communication for RPC and Metric Endpoints

Severity: Low

Resolution: Tech Debt -

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/94

This is similar to the authentication/authorizing finding above. The team acknowledges that encryption needs to be added to RPC communications and it will be addressed in a future version of AggLayer.

AGLO3.2-04 - Blind Reproving of Proven Certificates Without State Recovery of Consistency Checks

Severity: Low

Resolution: Tech Debt

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/95

This is an improvement, not a flaw, and will be addressed in the next round of AggLayer work.

AGLO3.2-05 - Missing Recovery for Failed Network Tasks

Severity: Low

Resolution: Fixed

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/96

This issue was fixed in #812. The code was restructured to remove the spawned network task if poll the future results in an Err.

AGLO3.2-06 - Unchecked Panic with unwrap() and expect()

Severity: Low

Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/97

Per this <u>comment</u>, this issue won't be fixed because it is desired behavior in our recursive ZK proof generation design.

AGLO3.2-07 - Use of unwrap() with gRPC reflection server can result in panic

Severity: Low

Resolution: Fixed •

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/98

This issue is fixed in <u>agglayer/provers #216</u> that improves the error handling in the reflection build methods.

AGLO3.2-08 - on_proven_certificate() Continues on Partial Error

Severity: Low

Resolution: Fixed

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/99

Addressed in #819

AGLO3.2-09 - insert_certificate_header() Has no Conflict Detection for Settled Certificates

Severity: Low

Resolution: Fixed -

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/100

Simon Paitrault: This has been mitigated by adding more complex checks on a higher level function that handle L1 communication and extra checks.

AGLO3.2-10 - No Panic Handling on Orchestrator or RPC Tasks

Severity: Low

Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/101

Leo Gaspard: I just checked, and even a single-thread tokio runtime will not cause a panic in a task to kill the process:

https://play.rust-lang.org/?version=stable&mode=debug&edition=2024&gist=7f6695143e5a937c 011498707387f019

No panic will kill the process. Closing, as "won't fix".

AGLO3.2-11 - Potential Resource leak on Panic in LocalExecutor

Severity: Low

Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/102

Further testing showed this to not be a concern. The only possibility for resource leaking would be if there is manual resource clean-up code that won't be run if the task panics. There is no manual cleanup code so this isn't an issue.

AGLO3.2-12 - Potential Resource Leak on Panic Before Shutdown

Severity: Low

Resolution: Fixed -

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/103

This issue is fixed in <u>agglayer/provers #225</u>. The cancellation token gets a DropGuard added now that will cancel the CancellationToken when it is dropped (i.e. during a stack unwind on panic)

AGLO3.2-13 - write_batch() Skips default_write_options

Severity: Low

Resolution: Tech Debt

https://github.com/agglaver/security/issues/104

This issue will be addressed in a future version of AggLayer.

AGLO3.2-14 - Partial Error Handling in create_new_backup()

Severity: Low

Resolution: Tech Debt •

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/105

This issue will be addressed in a future version of AggLayer.

AGLO3.2-15 - Unimplemented GPU Prover Type

Severity: Informational

Resolution: Fixed •

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/106

The todo! was changed to return an error instead of panicking.

AGLO3.2-16 - Fallback mechanism Cloning Overhead

Severity: Informational Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/107

The cloning is unavoidable with the code as-is because the handle to the fallback service gets moved to the closure encapsulated by the Future returned from the call method.

AGLO3.2-17 - Fallback Service Readiness Not Polled in

Executor::poll_ready()

Severity: Informational Resolution: Fixed

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/108

This issue is fixed in agglaver/provers #222. It adds a check for the fallback's readiness.

AGLO3.2-18 - No Resource Cleanup At Shutdown

Severity: Informational

Resolution: Fixed -

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/109

This issue is fixed in <u>agglayer/provers #221</u>. It adds configurable shutdown timeouts and ensures all resources are cleaned up.

AGLO3.2-19 - Hardcoded Default Socket Addresses

Severity: Informational

Resolution: Fixed •

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/110

This issue is fixed in <u>agglayer/provers #221</u>. It moves the hard coded port values to be the defaults in the config.

AGLO3.2-20 - LocalNetworkStateData State Risks Incorrect State Recorded on Error Conditions

Severity: Informational Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/111

The code operates on a clone of the data so that any interruption doesn't cause partial updates. No fix needed.

AGLO3.2-21 - Task Spawning Without Limits

Severity: Informational Resolution: Tech Debt

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/112

Currently the network ID is bounded by the L1 and isn't an issue that requires an immediate fix. This will be addressed in a future version of AggLayer.

AGLO3.2-22.1 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Health Status Set Before Services Start

Severity: Informational Resolution: Won't Fix

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/113

This isn't actually an issue because the health service is designed to only be exposed to the API and the other services are already read. This isn't providing invalid state.

AGLO3.2-22.2 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Blocking Calls Inside Tokio Runtime Context

Severity: Informational Resolution: Fixed

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/114

This issue is fixed in agglayer/provers #235. It adds appropriate comments.

AGLO3.2-22.3 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Redundant Reflection Service Registration

Severity: Informational

Resolution: Fixed

https://github.com/agglaver/security/issues/115

This issue is fixed in <u>agglayer/provers #216</u>. It fixes the redundancy in the prover engine logic.

AGLO3.2-22.4 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Commented Out Code

Severity: Informational

Resolution: Fixed •

https://github.com/agglayer/security/issues/116

This issue is fixed in <u>agglayer/provers #221</u>. The commented out code is uncommented as it should be.

AGLO3.2-22.5 - Miscellaneous General Comments: Address TODOs

Severity: Informational Resolution: Tech Debt

https://github.com/agglaver/security/issues/117

Currently being addressed.