Reference Point Calculations in MAS

Jon Brodziak

Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center
1845 Wasp Boulevard, Building 176, Honolulu, HI 96818

11-June-2021

The calculation of biological reference points for a movement-based metapopulation assessment system is challenging due to movement among spatial domains. The movement of adults changes the contribution of populations to the reproductive output by domain. The potential movement of early life history stages through advection implies that recruitment produced in one domain may end up settling out in another domain. In this paper, we define reference point calculations for the Metapopulation Assessment System (MAS) for the general case of a total of P populations in D areas with G genders and A age groups.

We begin by defining the notation needed for indexing population, area, gender and age variables. Our convention is to use $p=1…P$ populations, $d=1...D$ spatial domains or areas, and $g=1…G$ genders. For the age group index, we allow for two options. In the first option the age of recruitment to the population is age-0, defined as all animals between 1 and 365 days of age, and the age index a runs from $a=0…A$-1 age groups. Here the terminal age group is age-(A-1) which is a plus group comprised of all fish age-(A-1) and older. Under the second option, the age of recruitment to the population is set to be age-1, and the age index a runs from $a=1…A$ age groups. Again the terminal age group age-A is a plus group comprised of all fish age-A and older. The use of two options allows for some generality in the recruitment process. Fast-species may recruit to the fishery system before they are one year old, e.g., billfishes. In contrast, the recruitment process for some species may be more appropriately modeled as having a lag of one year to account for density-dependent survival at early life history stages in the first year of life. That said, we will use the second option for indexing ages in this document without loss of generality, noting that the calculation of spawning biomass and the resulting recruitment under equilibrium conditions is not affected by a time lag of 1 year for recruitment age. Another notational convention is that we use the tilde symbol "~" to denote the equilibrium, or assumed constant value of any variable used in the calculation of a reference point.

We describe algorithms to calculate spatial reference points for multiple populations in multiple spatial domains for MAS. The spatial reference points can be calculated at three levels of organization. The first level is to calculate reference points by spatial domain, where several populations may use a given domain as habitat for spawning or feeding and are subject to harvest there. The second level is to calculate reference points by population, where a given population may inhabit several spatial domains and the issue is what is the constant reference level for that population across all of its inhabited domains. The third level is to calculate reference points at the global level for all populations across all spatial domains. In this case, the question is what is the appropriate reference point for the fishery system, as modeled in MAS, and taken as a whole. The reference point results will in general be different across these three levels of spatial domain, population, and global system.

In what follows, we assume that the fishery system is perfectly observed and also assume that the stock-recruitment dynamics are compensatory and follow a Beverton-Holt curve on average. The first assumption is made to focus on the correct technical specification of the referernce points given the input data. The second assumption is made to avoid the issue of having stock-recruitment dynamics be overcompensatory and possibly exhibit deterministic chaos. We begin with the calculation of Maximum Sustainable Yield (*MSY*)-based reference points at the three levels of spatial domain, population, and global system. We then proceed to calculate reference fishing mortality rates to produce fixed percentages of unfished spawning biomass, the fishing mortality rates that would produce the maximum yield per recruit, $F_{0.1}$ and F_{med}.

Calculation of *MSY*-based reference points

We apply the following numerical search algorithm to calculate *MSY*-based reference points. To initialize the calculations, we construct a uniformly-spaced set of fishing mortality rates for each spatial domain d, denoted by f^d for $d = 1, 2, ..., D$, with mesh size δ. Here the set F^d consists of $f^d = \{f_0, f_1, ..., f_B\}$ with $f_j = j \cdot \delta$ and f_B is the upper bound on the value of fishing mortality. For example, if $f_B = 2.00$ with a mesh of $\delta = 0.01$, then the set f^d has 201 fishing mortality elements where $f^d = \{f_0, f_1, ..., f_B\} = \{0, 0.01, 0.02, ..., 2.00\}$. Given the sets f^d for all spatial domains $d = 1, 2, ..., D$, we set the spatial fishing mortality grid $\underline{\underline{F}}$ consisting of all possible combinations of fishing mortality rates across all spatial domains as the *D*-fold Cartesian product of the sets f^d. That is,

(1) $$\underline{\underline{F}} = f^1 \otimes f^2 \otimes ... \otimes f^D = \left\{\underline{F} = (F_1, F_2, ..., F_D) : F_1 \in f^1 \text{ and } F_2 \in f^2 \text{ and}, ..., \text{and } F_D \in f^D \right\}$$

We can then numerically search over the individual *D*-dimensional fishing mortality rate vectors $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$ to calculate *MSY*-based reference points by domain, by population and by global *MSY* for all population over all areas. For comparison, one can also do the calculations by population and global system for a single constant fishing mortality rate across all areas although the use of a

scalar fishing mortality rate may not produce an optimal value of *MSY* by population or global system. In what follows, we describe the algorithm to calculate *MSY*-based reference points as comprised of 8 steps.

Step 1. Calculate the unfished equilibrium numbers of fish at age by population and spatial domain. For each population p, each area d and each gender g, calculate the unfished numbers at age in equilibrium, denoted by $\widetilde{\underline{N}}_{U,d,g}^{(p)}$, using Algorithm 1 (Appendix 1) as

(2) $$\widetilde{\underline{N}}_{U,d,g}^{(p)} = \left(\widetilde{N}_{U,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}, \widetilde{N}_{U,d,g,1}^{(p)},..., \widetilde{N}_{U,d,g,A}^{(p)} \right)$$

Step 2. Calculate the fished equilibrium numbers of fish at age by population and spatial domain. For each spatial fishing mortality vector in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, and for each population p, each area d and each gender g, calculate the fished numbers at age in equilibrium, denoted by $\widetilde{\underline{N}}_{F,d,g}^{(p)}$, using Algorithm 2 (Appendix 2) as

(3) $$\widetilde{\underline{N}}_{F,d,g}^{(p)} = \left(\widetilde{N}_{F,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}, \widetilde{N}_{F,d,g,1}^{(p)},..., \widetilde{N}_{F,d,g,A}^{(p)} \right)$$

Step 3. Set the fished equilibrium recruitment by population and spatial domain. For each spatial fishing mortality vector in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, and for each population p, each area d and each gender g, set the recruitment, $\widetilde{\underline{R}}_{F,d,g}^{(p)}$, as

(4) $$\widetilde{R}_{F,d,g}^{(p)} = \widetilde{N}_{F,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}$$

Step 4. Calculate the fished equilibrium yield per recruit by population and spatial domain. For each spatial fishing mortality vector in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, and for each population p, each area d and each gender g, calculate the domain-specific yield per recruit, denoted by $\widetilde{YPR}(F_d)_{d,g}^{(p)}$, as

(5)

$$\widetilde{YPR}(F_d)_{d,g}^{(p)} = \sum_{a=1}^{A-1} \left\{ \frac{\widetilde{W}_{C,d,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot F_d \cdot \widetilde{S}_{d,g,a}^{(p)}}{F_d \cdot \widetilde{S}_{d,g,a}^{(p)} + \widetilde{M}_{d,g,a}^{(p)}} \left(1 - \exp\left(-F_d \cdot \widetilde{S}_{d,g,a}^{(p)} - \widetilde{M}_{d,g,a}^{(p)} \right) \right) \cdot \exp\left(-\sum_{k=1}^{a-1} \left(F_d \cdot \widetilde{S}_{d,g,k}^{(p)} + \widetilde{M}_{d,g,k}^{(p)} \right) \right) \right\}$$
$$+ \frac{\widetilde{W}_{C,d,g,A}^{(p)} \cdot F_d \cdot \widetilde{S}_{d,g,A}^{(p)}}{F_d \cdot \widetilde{S}_{d,g,A}^{(p)} + \widetilde{M}_{d,g,A}^{(p)}} \exp\left(-\sum_{k=1}^{A-1} \left(F_d \cdot \widetilde{S}_{d,g,k}^{(p)} + \widetilde{M}_{d,g,k}^{(p)} \right) \right)$$

Step 5. Calculate the <u>fished equilibrium yield</u> by population and spatial domain. For each spatial fishing mortality vector in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, and for each population p, each area d and each gender g, calculate the domain-specific fishery yield, denoted by $\tilde{Y}(F_d)_{d,g}^{(p)}$, as the product of recruitment and yield per recruit

(6) $$\tilde{Y}(F_d)_{d,g}^{(p)} = \tilde{R}_{\underline{F},d,g}^{(p)} \cdot \widetilde{YPR}(F_d)_{d,g}^{(p)}$$

And complete the calculation of equilibrium yield by population and area, denoted by $\tilde{Y}(F_d)_d^{(p)}$, as the sum over genders of fishery yield per gender

(7) $$\tilde{Y}(F_d)_d^{(p)} = \sum_g \tilde{Y}(F_d)_{d,g}^{(p)}$$

Next calculate equilibrium yield by area, denoted by $\tilde{Y}(F_d)_d$, as the sum over populations of yield by area

(8) $$\tilde{Y}(F_d)_d = \sum_p \tilde{Y}(F_d)_d^{(p)}$$

Next calculate equilibrium yield by population, denoted by $\tilde{Y}(F_d)^{(p)}$, as the sum of population fishery yields over areas

(9) $$\tilde{Y}(F_d)^{(p)} = \sum_d \tilde{Y}(F_d)_d^{(p)}$$

Last calculate the global equilibrium yield for all populations and areas for each spatial fishing mortality vector in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, denoted by $\tilde{Y}(\underline{F})$, as the sum over all populations and areas of the <u>fished equilibrium</u> yield by population and area

(10) $$\tilde{Y}(\underline{F}) = \sum_p \sum_d \tilde{Y}(F_j)_d^{(p)}$$

Step 6. Calculate the <u>fished equilibrium maximum sustainable yields</u> by spatial domain, by population and by global system. Loop over the set of spatial fishing mortality vectors in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, to find $\underline{F}_{MSY,d} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$ by area d, such that $\tilde{Y}(\underline{F}_{MSY,d})_d \geq \tilde{Y}(\underline{F})_d$ for all $\underline{F} \neq \underline{F}_{MSY,d}$ and then set *MSY* by area d as

(11) $$MSY_d = \tilde{Y}(\underline{F}_{MSY,d})_d$$

Loop over the set of spatial fishing mortality vectors in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, to find $\underline{F}_{MSY}^{(p)} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$ by population p, such that $\tilde{Y}\left(\underline{F}_{MSY}^{(p)}\right)^{(p)} \geq \tilde{Y}\left(\underline{F}\right)^{(p)}$ for all $F_j \neq F_{MSY}^{(p)}$ and then set MSY by population as

(12) $$MSY^{(p)} = \tilde{Y}\left(\underline{F}_{MSY}^{(p)}\right)^{(p)}$$

Loop over the set of spatial fishing mortality vectors in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, to find $\underline{F}_{MSY}^{Global} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$ for the global system, such that $\tilde{Y}\left(\underline{F}_{MSY}^{Global}\right) \geq \tilde{Y}\left(\underline{F}\right)$ for all $\underline{F} \neq \underline{F}_{MSY}^{Global}$ and then set

(13) $$MSY_{Global} = \tilde{Y}\left(\underline{F}_{MSY}^{Global}\right)$$

Step 7. Calculate the <u>fished equilibrium female spawning biomass</u> by population and domain. Loop over the set of spatial fishing mortality vectors in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, to calculate the equilibrium female spawning biomass by population p and by area d, denoted by $\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}^{(p)}$, as

(14) $$\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}^{(p)} = \sum_a \widetilde{P}_{M,female,a}^{(p)} \cdot \widetilde{W}_{S,female,a}^{(p)} \cdot \widetilde{N}_{\underline{F},d,female,a}^{(p)} \cdot \exp\left(-\Delta_S \cdot \widetilde{Z}_{\underline{F},d,female,a}^{(p)}\right)$$

Next calculate equilibrium female spawning biomass by area d, denoted as $\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}$, as the sum of female spawning biomasses over populations in area d

(15) $$\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female} = \sum_p \widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}^{(p)}$$

Next calculate equilibrium female spawning biomass by population p, denoted as $\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},female}^{(p)}$, as the sum of female spawning biomasses over areas for population p

(16) $$\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},female}^{(p)} = \sum_d \widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}^{(p)}$$

Next calculate equilibrium female spawning biomass for all populations p and areas d, denoted by $\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},female}$, as the sum of female spawning biomasses over all populations and areas

(17) $$\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},female} = \sum_p \sum_d \widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}^{(p)}$$

And set the female spawning biomass to produce MSY by area d as

(18) $$\widetilde{SB}_{MSY,d} = \widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F}_{MSY,d},d,female}$$

And set the female spawning biomass to produce *MSY* by population p as

$$(19) \qquad \widetilde{SB}_{MSY}^{(p)} = \widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F}_{MSY}^{(p)}, female}^{(p)}$$

Last set the female spawning biomass to produce *MSY* for the global system as

$$(20) \qquad \widetilde{SB}_{MSY}^{Global} = \widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F}_{MSY}^{Global}, female}$$

Step 8. Calculate the <u>fished equilibrium female spawning biomass per recruit</u> by population and domain. Loop over the set of spatial fishing mortality vectors in the grid, $\underline{F} \in \underline{\underline{F}}$, to calculate the equilibrium female spawning biomass by population p and by area d, denoted by $\widetilde{SBPR}(\underline{F})_d^{(p)}$, as the female spawning biomass divided by the sum of recruitment by gender

$$(21) \qquad \widetilde{SBPR}(\underline{F})_d^{(p)} = \frac{\widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}^{(p)}}{\sum_g \widetilde{R}_{\underline{F},d,g}^{(p)}}$$

And calculate equilibrium female spawning biomass per recruit by area d as the sum of female biomasses over populations in area d divided by the sum of recruitment over populations and gender in area d

$$(22) \qquad \widetilde{SBPR}(\underline{F})_d = \frac{\sum_p \widetilde{SB}_{\underline{F},d,female}^{(p)}}{\sum_p \sum_g \widetilde{R}_{\underline{F},d,g}^{(p)}}$$

And calculate equilibrium female spawning biomass per recruit by population p as d as the sum of female biomasses over areas for population d divided by the sum of recruitment over areas and gender for population p

$$(23) \qquad \widetilde{SBPR}(F_j)^{(p)} = \frac{\sum_d \widetilde{SB}_{F_j,d,female}^{(p)}}{\sum_d \sum_g \widetilde{R}_{F_j,d,g}^{(p)}}$$

Next calculate equilibrium female spawning biomass per recruit for the global system, denoted by $\widetilde{SBPR}(\underline{F})$, over all populations and areas as the sum of female spawning biomasses over populations and areas divided by the sum of recruitment over population areas and genders

$$(24) \qquad \widetilde{SBPR}(\underline{F}) = \frac{\sum\limits_{p}\sum\limits_{d} \widetilde{SB}^{(p)}_{\underline{F},d,female}}{\sum\limits_{p}\sum\limits_{d}\sum\limits_{g} \widetilde{R}^{(p)}_{\underline{F},d,g}}$$

Next set the female spawning biomass per recruit to produce *MSY* by area d based on as $\underline{F}_{MSY,d}$ as

$$(25) \qquad \widetilde{SBPR}_{MSY,d} = \widetilde{SBPR}\left(\underline{F}_{MSY,d}\right)$$

Next set the female spawning biomass per recruit to produce *MSY* by population p based on as $\underline{F}^{(p)}_{MSY}$ as

$$(26) \qquad \widetilde{SBPR}^{(p)}_{MSY} = \widetilde{SBPR}\left(\underline{F}^{(p)}_{MSY}\right)$$

Last set the female spawning biomass per recruit to produce *MSY* for the global system based on $\underline{F}^{Global}_{MSY}$ as

$$(27) \qquad \widetilde{SBPR}^{Global}_{MSY} = \widetilde{SBPR}\left(\underline{F}^{Global}_{MSY}\right)$$

This completes the section on the calculation of *MSY*-based reference points.

Calculation of $F_{X\%}$ reference points

The fishing mortality that produces a fixed percentage $X\%$ of the unfished spawning biomass is $F_{X\%}$. To calculate $F_{X\%}$, one first needs to start with an estimate of the equilibrium spawning biomass as a function of F. We can use the calculations of equilibrium spawning biomass by population, area and for all populations and areas based on equations (14), (15) and (16) in the *MSY* reference point calculations. Without loss of generality, assume we have the equilibrium female spawning biomass by population ($\widetilde{SB}^{(p)}_{F_j,female}$), area ($\widetilde{SB}_{F_j,d,female}$), and for all populations and areas ($\widetilde{SB}_{F_j,female}$) already calculated for the set of fishing mortalities $F_j \in \underline{F}$. Here is the algorithm to calculate the fishing mortality that produces a fixed percentage $X\%$ of the unfished spawning biomass by population ($F^{(p)}_{X\%}$), area ($F_{X\%,d}$) and for all populations and areas ($F_{X\%}$).

<u>Step 1.</u> For each population and $F_j \in \underline{F}$, calculate the ratio $R^{(p)}_j = \dfrac{\widetilde{SB}^{(p)}_{F_j,female}}{\widetilde{SB}^{(p)}_{F=0,female}}$ and the difference $\Delta^{(p)}_j = \left| R^{(p)}_j - X_\% \right|$ by population.

<u>Step 2.</u> Next find the index $k \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ that produces the smallest difference $\Delta_k^{(p)} \le \Delta_j^{(p)}$ *for all* $j \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ for each population p. Then set the fishing mortality that produces a fixed percentage $X\%$ of the unfished spawning biomass by population along with the associated spawning biomass and fishery yield in each population p as

(27)
$$F_{X\%}^{(p)} = F_k \text{ and } \widetilde{SB}_{X\%}^{(p)} = \widetilde{SB}_{F_k, female}^{(p)} \text{ and } \widetilde{Y}_{X\%}^{(p)} = \widetilde{Y}(F_k)^{(p)}$$

<u>Step 3.</u> For each area and $F_j \in \underline{F}$, calculate the ratio $R_{j,d} = \dfrac{\widetilde{SB}_{F_j, d, female}}{\widetilde{SB}_{F=0, d, female}}$ and the difference $\Delta_{j,d} = |R_{j,d} - X_\%|$ by area.

<u>Step 4.</u> Next find the index $k \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ that produces the smallest difference $\Delta_{k,d} \le \Delta_{j,d}$ *for all* $j \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ for each area d. Then set the fishing mortality that produces a fixed percentage $X\%$ of the unfished spawning biomass along with the associated spawning biomass and fishery yield in each area d as

(28)
$$F_{X\%, d} = F_k \text{ and } \widetilde{SB}_{X\%, d} = \widetilde{SB}_{F_k, d, female} \text{ and } \widetilde{Y}_{X\%, d} = \widetilde{Y}(F_k)_d$$

<u>Step 5.</u> For each $F_j \in \underline{F}$, calculate the global ratio $R_j = \dfrac{\widetilde{SB}_{F_j, female}}{\widetilde{SB}_{F=0, female}}$ for all populations and area and the global difference $\Delta_j = |R_j - X_\%|$.

<u>Step 6.</u> Next find the index $k \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ that produces the smallest difference $\Delta_k \le \Delta_j$ *for all* $j \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$. Then set the fishing mortality that produces a fixed percentage $X\%$ of the unfished spawning biomass for all populations and areas along with the associated global spawning biomass and fishery yield as

(28)
$$F_{X\%} = F_k \text{ and } \widetilde{SB}_{X\%} = \widetilde{SB}_{F_k, female} \text{ and } \widetilde{Y}_{X\%} = \widetilde{Y}(F_k)$$

Calculate F_{MAX}, the *F* that produces the maximum yield per recruit

The fishing mortality that produces the maximum yield per recruit is F_{MAX}. To calculate F_{MAX}, one first needs to start with an estimate of the equilibrium yield per recruit as a function of *F*. We can use the calculations of equilibrium yield per recruit by population, area and for all populations and areas based on equations (7), (8) and (9) in the MSY reference point calculations. Without loss of generality, assume we have the set of values of the equilibrium

yield per recruit by population ($\widetilde{YPR}_{F_j}^{(p)}$), area ($\widetilde{YPR}_{F_j,d}$), and for all populations and areas ($\widetilde{YPR}_{F_j}$) already calculated for the set of fishing mortalities $F_j \in \underline{F}$. Here is the algorithm to calculate the fishing mortality that produces the maximum yield per recruit by population ($F_{MAX}^{(p)}$), area ($F_{MAX,d}$) and for all populations and areas (F_{MAX}).

Step 1. For each population p, find the index $k \in \{1,2,...,Upper\}$ that produces the maximum equilibrium yield per recruit such that $\widetilde{YPR}_{F_k}^{(p)} \geq \widetilde{YPR}_{F_j}^{(p)}$ *for all* $j \in \{1,2,...,Upper\}$. Then set the fishing mortality that produces the maximum yield per recruit by population along with the associated spawning biomass and fishery yield for each population p as

(29)
$$F_{MAX}^{(p)} = F_k \text{ and } \widetilde{SB}_{F_{MAX}}^{(p)} = \widetilde{SB}_{F_k,female}^{(p)} \text{ and } \widetilde{Y}_{F_{MAX}}^{(p)} = \widetilde{Y}(F_k)^{(p)}$$

Step 2. For each area d, find the index $k \in \{1,2,...,Upper\}$ that produces the maximum equilibrium yield per recruit such that $\widetilde{YPR}_{F_k,d} \geq \widetilde{YPR}_{F_j,d}$ *for all* $j \in \{1,2,...,Upper\}$. Then set the fishing mortality that produces the maximum yield per recruit by area along with the associated spawning biomass and fishery yield for each area d as

(30)
$$F_{MAX,d} = F_k \text{ and } \widetilde{SB}_{F_{MAX},d} = \widetilde{SB}_{F_k,d} \text{ and } \widetilde{Y}_{F_{MAX},d} = \widetilde{Y}(F_k)_d$$

Step 3. For each $F_j \in \underline{F}$, find the index $k \in \{1,2,...,Upper\}$ that produces the maximum global equilibrium yield per recruit such that $\widetilde{YPR}_{F_k} \geq \widetilde{YPR}_{F_j}$ *for all* $j \in \{1,2,...,Upper\}$. Then set the global fishing mortality that produces the global maximum yield per recruit by area along with the associated spawning biomass and fishery yield for each area d as

(31)
$$F_{MAX} = F_k \text{ and } \widetilde{SB}_{F_{MAX}} = \widetilde{SB}_{F_k} \text{ and } \widetilde{Y}_{F_{MAX}} = \widetilde{Y}(F_k)$$

Calculate $F_{0.1}$, the global fishing mortality rate where the slope of the global *YPR* curve is 10% of the value of the slope at the origin, where *F=0*

The reference point $F_{0.1}$ was developed by Gulland and Boerema (1973) and was based on maintaining marginal fishery yield at 10% of the initial fishery CPUE in order to support an economically efficient fishery. This reference point is calculated from the global yield per recruit curve and is the value of F that produces 10% of the slope of the yield per recruit curve at the origin.

Step 1. For each population p, area d, and gender g, calculate the unfished equilibrium recruitment $\widetilde{R}_{F=0,d,g}^{(p)}$ as in equation (3) above.

Step 2. Construct the global yield per recruit function $YPR(F)$ as

(32) $$YPR(F) = \frac{\widetilde{R}_{F=0,d,g}^{(p)}}{\sum_p \sum_d \sum_g \widetilde{R}_{F=0,d,g}^{(p)}} \cdot \widetilde{YPR}(F)_{d,g}^{(p)}$$

Where $\widetilde{YPR}(F)_{d,g}^{(p)}$ is defined in equation (4) above.

Step 3. Calculate the derivative of the global yield per recruit curve as a function of fishing mortality F as $\dfrac{\partial YPR(F)}{\partial F}$ and calculate 10% of the slope at the origin where $F=0$ as $0.1\dfrac{\partial YPR(0)}{\partial F}$.

Step 4. For each $F_j \in \underline{F}$, calculate the derivative of the yield per recruit function at F_j as $\dfrac{\partial YPR(F_j)}{\partial F}$ and the difference $\Delta_j = \left| \dfrac{\partial YPR(F_j)}{\partial F} - 0.1\dfrac{\partial YPR(0)}{\partial F} \right|$

Step 5. Find the index $k \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ that produces the smallest difference $\Delta_k \le \Delta_j$ for all $j \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ and set $F_{0.1} = F_k$. Then set the spawning biomass and fishery yield at $F_{0.1}$ as $SB_{F_{0.1}} = SB_{Eq}(F_k)$ and $Y_{F_{0.1}} = Y_{Eq}(F_k)$.

Calculate F_{Med}, the global F that produces 50% of year classes with stock replacement

The reference point F_{Med} is the fishing mortality rate that produces the value of spawning biomass per recruit equal to the inverse of the median of the observed survival ratios for a stock. This is an empirically-derived reference point that depends on the observed time series of recruitment values and the spawning biomasses that produced them. Let $\underline{R} = (R_1, ..., R_T)$ and $\underline{SB} = (SB_1, ..., SB_T)$ be the observed recruitment and female spawning biomass time series where recruitment and female spawning biomass totals are summed over all population and areas.

Then given the global recruitment and spawning biomass time series, one calculates F_{Med} as

Step 1. Calculate the distribution of observed global survival ratios as the vector $\underline{RS}$ where

$$\underline{RS} = \left(\frac{R_1}{S_1}, ..., \frac{R_T}{S_T} \right),$$ then calculate the median of this distribution $Median(\underline{RS})$ and its inverse

$$\frac{1}{Median(\underline{RS})}.$$

Step 2. Based on a uniform grid of fishing mortality rates $\underline{F}$ with mesh size δ where $\underline{F} = \left(F_1, F_2, ..., F_{Upper} \right)$ and $F_j = (j-1) \cdot \delta$ and F_{Upper} is a maximal value of fishing mortality, then for each $F_j \in \underline{F}$, calculate the global spawning biomass per recruit, $SBPR(F_j)$ and then calculate the difference between $SBPR(F_j)$ and the inverse of the median of the global survival ratio as

(33)
$$\Delta_j = \left| SBPR(F_j) - \frac{1}{Median(\underline{RS})} \right|$$

Step 3. Find the index $k \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ that produces the smallest difference $\Delta_k \leq \Delta_j$ for all $j \in \{1, 2, ..., Upper\}$ and set $F_{Med} = F_k$. Then calculate the global equilibrium spawning biomass at F_{Med} as $SB_{Med} = SB_{Eq}(F_k)$ given the value of $SBPR(F_k)$.

Appendix 1. Algorithm to Calculate Unfished Equilibrium Numbers at Age

In this Appendix we provide details of an algorithm to iteratively calculate unfished equilibrium numbers at age, conditioned on the existence of an equilibrium solution. That is, we need to calculate unfished numbers at age in equilibrium by population, area, and gender $\left(\widetilde{N}_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)} \right)$ to determine the values of unfished female spawning biomasses by population and area to calculate the resulting unfished recruitment value. Here note that the unfished numbers at age by population, area, and gender depend on the population movement and recruitment distribution matrices and are needed to compute the unfished spawning biomasses by population and area, which in turn, are needed to implement the recruitment submodels by population and area for the initial fished equilibrium time period and assessment time horizon. That is, this algorithm will determine the values of the unfished equilibrium female spawning biomasses for the recruitment submodels by population and area, which are derived quantities that depend on the unfished recruitment parameters by population and area.

Here we provide the formulas to calculate the unfished numbers at age for *P* populations, *D* areas, *A* ages from *a*=1 to the plus group age *A*, and *G* genders. The inputs for this calculation are:

- The *DxD* matrix of recruitment distribution probabilities from area *k* to area *d* for each population *p* denoted by $\underline{\underline{Q}}^{(p)} = \left(Q_{k \to d}^{(p)} \right)_{DxD}$

- The *Gx1* vector of sex ratio by gender for each population *p* denoted by $\rho_g^{(p)}$

- The *Ax1* vectors of natural mortality at age and gender vector for each population *p* denoted by $\underline{M}_{g,a}^{(p)}$

- The *Ax1* vectors of mean spawning weight at age and gender vector for each population *p* denoted by $\underline{W}_{S,g,a}^{(p)}$

- The *Ax1* vectors of probability of maturity at age and gender vector for each population *p* denoted by $\underline{P}_{M,g,a}^{(p)}$

- The *DxD* matrices of movement probabilities from area *k* to area *d* by age and gender for each population *p* denoted by $\underline{\underline{T}}_{k \to d,g,a}^{(p)} = \left(T_{k \to d,g,a}^{(p)} \right)_{DxD}$

- The fraction of the year prior to spawning offset for each population *p* denoted as $\Delta_S^{(p)}$

Iteration 1: Calculate the initial unfished numbers at age estimates by population, area, and gender based on unfished recruitment, the recruitment distribution, equilibrium natural mortality and no movement, where $(x)^{[k]}$ denotes the kth iterate of an estimate of a quantity *x*.

    i.   In general, population recruitment by area and gender is a function of area-specific recruitment production and the recruitment distribution matrix $\underline{\underline{Q}}^{(p)}$. Set age-1 recruits as a function of unfished recruitment by area $\left(R_{U,d}^{(p)}\right)$ and recruitment distribution by area and gender via

(28)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} = \rho_g^{(p)} \sum_k R_{U,k}^{(p)} \cdot Q_{k\to d}^{(p)}$$

    ii.   Set age-a survivors by area and gender for true ages $a=2$ to A-1 via

(29)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} = \left(N_{U,d,g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)$$

    iii.   Set the survivors of the age-A plus group by area and gender via

(30)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} = \frac{\left(N_{U,d,g,A-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,A-1}^{(p)}\right)}{1 - \exp\left(-M_{g,A}^{(p)}\right)}$$

    iv.   Set unfished spawning biomass by population, area and gender via

(31)
$$\left(SB_{U,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} = \sum_a P_{M,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot W_{S,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot \left(N_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-\Delta_S^{(p)} \cdot M_{g,a}^{(p)}\right)$$

Iteration 2: Calculate the next iterate of unfished numbers at age estimates by population, area, and gender based on unfished recruitment, the recruitment distribution, equilibrium survival, movement probabilities by area, age, and gender, and the previous iterate. Unfished recruitment production by area is a function of area-specific spawning biomasses which need to be iteratively calculated to account for the movement probabilities that redistribute fish.

    i.   Set age-1 recruits as a function of the area-specific stock-recruitment submodel $f_d^{(p)}$ and recruitment distribution by area and gender. This step initiates the recruitment dynamics via

(32)
$$\left(R_{U,d}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = f_d^{(p)}\left(\left(SB_{U,d,g=female}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} \mid \underline{\theta}_d^{(p)}, \left(SB_{U,d,g=female}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]}\right) \quad \text{and}$$
$$\left(N_{F,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \rho_g^{(p)} \sum_k Q_{k\to d}^{(p)} \cdot \left(R_{U,k}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]}$$

    i.   Set age-a survivors for ages $a=2$ to A-1 by population, area, and gender that did not emigrate plus age-a surviving immigrants from other areas via

(33)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \sum_k \left(N_{U,k,g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,a-1}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k \to d,g,a-1}^{(p)}$$

ii. Set age-(A-1) survivors that did not emigrate plus age-(A-1) immigrants from other areas plus age-A group survivors that did not emigrate plus age-A group immigrants from other areas via

(34)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \sum_k \left(N_{U,k,g,A-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,A-1}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k \to d,g,A-1}^{(p)}$$
$$+ \sum_k \left(N_{U,k,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,A}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k \to d,g,A}^{(p)}$$

iii. Set unfished spawning biomass by population, area and gender via

(35)
$$\left(SB_{U,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \sum_a P_{M,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot W_{S,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot \left(N_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} \cdot \exp\left(-\Delta_S^{(p)} \cdot M_{g,a}^{(p)}\right)$$

Iteration j+1: Calculate the $(j+1)^{st}$ iterate of equilibrium fished numbers at age estimates by population, area, and gender based on unfished recruitment, the recruitment distribution, equilibrium survival, movement probabilities by area, age, and gender, and the jth iterate.

i. Set age-0 recruits as a function of the recruitment submodel $f_d^{(p)}$ and recruitment distribution by area and gender via

(36)
$$\left(R_{U,d}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = f_d^{(p)}\left(\left(SB_{U,d,g=female}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \mid \underline{\theta}_d^{(p)}, \left(SB_{U,d,g=female}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]}\right) \text{ and}$$

(37)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \rho_g^{(p)} \sum_k Q_{k \to d}^{(p)} \cdot \left(R_{U,k}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]}$$

ii. Set age-a survivors for true ages a=2 to A-1 by population, area, and gender that did not emigrate plus age-a surviving immigrants from other areas via

(38)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \sum_k \left(N_{U,k,g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,a-1}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k \to d,g,a-1}^{(p)}$$

iii. Set age-(A-1) survivors that did not emigrate plus age-(A-1) immigrants from other areas plus age-A group survivors that did not emigrate plus age-A group immigrants from other areas via

(39)
$$\left(N_{U,d,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \sum_k \left(N_{U,k,g,A-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,A-1}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k \to d,g,A-1}^{(p)}$$
$$+ \sum_k \left(N_{U,k,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \cdot \exp\left(-M_{g,A}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k \to d,g,A}^{(p)}$$

v. Set unfished spawning biomass by population, area and gender via

(40)
$$\left(SB_{U,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \sum_a P_{M,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot W_{S,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot \left(N_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} \cdot \exp\left(-\Delta_S^{(p)} \cdot M_{g,a}^{(p)}\right)$$

Continue the iterations until the convergence criteria below is achieved or the maximum number of iterations has been reached.

Convergence Criterion

Calculate the distance between successive sets of unfished equilibrium spawning biomass estimates by population, area and gender, denoted by $\Delta^{[j]}$, by applying the L_1, or least absolute deviations norm, to the set of estimates as

(41)
$$\Delta^{[j]} = \sum_p \sum_d \sum_g \left|\left(SB_{U,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} - \left(SB_{U,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]}\right|$$

Stop the iterations when the set of unfished spawning biomass estimates have converged. That is, stop when $\Delta^{[j]} < \varepsilon$ for a small positive constant $\varepsilon > 0$.

If the iterations converge, then the outputs are the vectors of unfished numbers at age by population, area, and gender $\widetilde{\underline{N}}_{U,d,g}^{(p)} = \left(\widetilde{N}_{U,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)_{Ax1}$ in equilibrium along with the unfished spawning biomasses by population, area, and gender $\left(\widetilde{SB}_{U,d,g}^{(p)}\right)$ in equilibrium.

Algorithm 2. Calculate Equilibrium Fished Numbers at Age

Similarly, one needs to calculate fished numbers at age in equilibrium prior to the start of the assessment time horizon by population, area, and gender $\left(\widetilde{N}^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a} \right)$ as a function of population recruitment distribution by area, movement probabilities, and the equilibrium total mortality at age. The equilibrium fished numbers at age by population, area, and gender depend on the population movement and recruitment distribution matrices and are needed to compute the fished equilibrium spawning biomasses by population and area, which in turn, are needed to calculate the equilibrium numbers at by population, area, and gender for the initial fished equilibrium time period to the start of the assessment time horizon.

In this Appendix, we provide the formulas to calculate the unfished numbers at age for P populations, D areas, A ages from $a=1$ to the plus group age A, and G genders. Similar to the unfished equilibrium calculation, the inputs for fished equilibrium calculation are:

- The DxD matrix of recruitment distribution probabilities from area k to area d for each population p denoted by $\underline{\underline{Q}}^{(p)} = \left(Q^{(p)}_{k \to d} \right)_{DxD}$

- The $Gx1$ vector of sex ratio by gender for each population p denoted by $\rho^{(p)}_{g}$

- The $Ax1$ vectors of total mortality at age by area and gender for each population p denoted by $\underline{Z}^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a}$

- The $Ax1$ vectors of mean spawning weight at age and gender vector for each population p denoted by $\underline{W}^{(p)}_{S,g,a}$

- The $Ax1$ vectors of probability of maturity at age and gender vector for each population p denoted by $\underline{P}^{(p)}_{M,g,a}$

- The DxD matrices of movement probabilities from area k to area d by age and gender for each population p denoted by $\underline{\underline{T}}^{(p)}_{k \to d,g,a} = \left(T^{(p)}_{k \to d,g,a} \right)_{DxD}$

- The fraction of the year prior to spawning offset for each population p denoted as $\Delta^{(p)}_{S}$

- The vectors of unfished numbers at age by population, area, and gender in equilibrium denoted by $\underline{\widetilde{N}}^{(p)}_{U,d,g} = \left(\widetilde{N}^{(p)}_{U,d,g,a} \right)_{Ax1}$

- The unfished spawning biomasses by population, area, and gender in equilibrium denoted by $\left(\widetilde{SB}^{(p)}_{U,d,g} \right)$

Iteration 1: Calculate the initial equilibrium fished numbers at age estimates by population, area, and gender based on unfished recruitment, the recruitment distribution, equilibrium total mortality and no movement, where $(x)^{[j]}$ denotes the jth iterate of an estimate of a quantity x.

    i.   In general, population recruitment by area and gender is a function of area-specific recruitment production and the recruitment distribution matrix $\underline{\underline{Q}}^{(p)}$. Set the initial age-1 fished recruits as a function of unfished recruitment by and recruitment distribution by area and gender via

(42)
$$\left(N^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a=1}\right)^{[1]} \equiv \left(R^{(p)}_{F,d,g}\right)^{[1]} = \sum_k Q^{(p)}_{k \to d} \cdot \widetilde{N}^{(p)}_{U,k,g,a=1}$$

    ii.   Set initial age-a survivors by area and gender for ages $a=2$ to A-1 from the initial fished recruits and equilibrium total mortality by area and gender via

(43)
$$\left(N^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a}\right)^{[1]} = \left(N^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a-1}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-Z^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a-1}\right)$$

    iii.   Set initial Age-A group of survivors from the initial fished recruits and equilibrium total mortality by area and gender via

(44)
$$\left(N^{(p)}_{F,d,g,A}\right)^{[1]} = \frac{\left(N^{(p)}_{F,d,g,A-1}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-Z^{(p)}_{F,d,g,A-1}\right)}{1-\exp\left(-Z^{(p)}_{F,d,g,A}\right)}$$

    iv.   Set equilibrium fished spawning biomass by population, area and gender via

(45)
$$\left(SB^{(p)}_{F,d,g}\right)^{[1]} = \sum_a P^{(p)}_{M,g,a} \cdot W^{(p)}_{S,g,a} \cdot \left(N^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a}\right)^{[1]} \cdot \exp\left(-\Delta^{(p)}_S \cdot Z^{(p)}_{F,d,g,a}\right)$$

Iteration 2: Calculate the next iterate of the equilibrium fished numbers at age estimates by population, area, and gender based on the recruitment submodel, the recruitment distribution, equilibrium total mortality, movement probabilities by area, age, and gender, and the previous iterate. Equilibrium fished recruitment production by area is a function of area-specific spawning biomasses which need to be iteratively calculated to account for the movement probabilities that redistribute fish.

    ii.   Set age-1 recruits as a function of the area-specific stock-recruitment submodel $f^{(p)}_d$ and recruitment distribution by area and gender. This step initiates the recruitment dynamics via

(46)
$$\left(R^{(p)}_{F,d}\right)^{[2]} = f^{(p)}_d\left(\left(SB^{(p)}_{F,d,g=female}\right)^{[1]} \mid \underline{\theta}^{(p)}_d, SB^{(p)}_{U,d,g=female}\right) \quad \text{and}$$

(47)
$$\left(N_{F,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \rho_g^{(p)}\sum_k Q_{k\to d}^{(p)}\cdot\left(R_{F,k}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]}$$

  iii. Set age-*a* survivors for true ages *a*=2 to *A*-1 by population, area, and gender as survivors that did not emigrate plus age-*a* surviving immigrants from other areas This step turns on the movement dynamics via

(48)
$$\left(N_{F,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \sum_k \left(N_{F,k,g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]}\cdot\exp\left(-Z_{F,k,g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)\cdot T_{k\to d,g,a-1}^{(p)}$$

  iv. Set age-(*A*-1) survivors that did not emigrate plus age-(*A*-1) immigrants from other areas plus age-*A* group survivors that did not emigrate plus age-*A* group immigrants from other areas via

(49)
$$\left(N_{F,d,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \sum_k \left(N_{F,k,g,A-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]}\cdot\exp\left(-Z_{F,k,g,A-1}^{(p)}\right)\cdot T_{k\to d,g,A-1}^{(p)}$$
$$+\sum_k \left(N_{F,k,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[1]}\cdot\exp\left(-Z_{F,k,g,A}^{(p)}\right)\cdot T_{k\to d,g,A}^{(p)}$$

  iv. Set equilibrium fished spawning biomass by population, area and gender via

(50)
$$\left(SB_{F,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]} = \sum_a P_{M,g,a}^{(p)}\cdot W_{S,g,a}^{(p)}\cdot\left(N_{F,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[2]}\cdot\exp\left(-\Delta_S\cdot Z_{F,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)$$

Iteration j+1: Calculate the (*j*+1)[st] iterate of equilibrium fished numbers at age estimates by population, area, and gender based on the recruitment submodels and recruitment distribution, equilibrium total mortality, movement probabilities by area, age, and gender, and the *j*[th] iterate.

  iv. Set age-1 recruits as a function of the recruitment submodel $f_d^{(p)}$ and recruitment distribution by area and gender via

(51)
$$\left(R_{F,d}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = f_d^{(p)}\left(\left(SB_{F,d,g=female}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \mid \underline{\theta}_d^{(p)}, SB_{U,d,g=female}^{(p)}\right)\quad\text{and}$$

(52)
$$\left(N_{F,d,g,a=1}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \rho_g^{(p)}\sum_k Q_{k\to d}^{(p)}\cdot\left(R_{F,k}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]}$$

  ii. Set age-*a* survivors for true ages *a*=2 to *A*-1 by population, area, and gender that did not emigrate plus age-*a* surviving immigrants from other areas via

(53)
$$\left(N_{F,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \sum_k \left(N_{F,k,g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]}\cdot\exp\left(-Z_{F,k,g,a-1}^{(p)}\right)\cdot T_{k\to d,g,a-1}^{(p)}$$

iii. Set age-(A-1) survivors that did not emigrate plus age-(A-1) immigrants from other areas plus age-A group survivors that did not emigrate plus age-A group immigrants from other areas via

(54)
$$\left(N_{F,d,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \sum_k \left(N_{F,k,g,A-1}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \cdot \exp\left(-Z_{F,k,g,A-1}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k\to d,g,A-1}^{(p)} + \sum_k \left(N_{F,k,g,A}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \cdot \exp\left(-Z_{F,k,g,A}^{(p)}\right) \cdot T_{k\to d,g,A}^{(p)}$$

Set unfished spawning biomass by population, area and gender via

(55)
$$\left(SB_{F,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} = \sum_a P_{M,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot W_{S,g,a}^{(p)} \cdot \left(N_{F,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} \cdot \exp\left(-\Delta_S \cdot Z_{F,d,g,a}^{(p)}\right)$$

Convergence Criterion

Calculate the distance between successive sets of unfished equilibrium spawning biomass estimates by population, area and gender, denoted by $\Delta^{[j]}$, by applying the least absolute deviations norm to the set of estimates as

(56)
$$\Delta^{[j]} = \sum_p \sum_d \sum_g \left| \left(SB_{F,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[j+1]} - \left(SB_{F,d,g}^{(p)}\right)^{[j]} \right|$$

Stop the iterations when the set of unfished spawning biomass estimates have converged. That is, stop when $\Delta^{[j]} < \varepsilon$ for a small positive constant $\varepsilon > 0$.

If the algorithm converges, then one has determined the fished numbers at age by population, area, and gender in equilibrium $\left(\widetilde{N}_{F,d,a,g}^{(p)}\right)$ along with the fished spawning biomass by population, area, and gender in equilibrium $\left(\widetilde{SB}_{F,d,g}^{(p)}\right)$. This population-specific information is used to set the initial conditions at the start (first year) of the initialization time period, prior to the stock assessment time horizon. These initial conditions, along with initial numbers-at-age deviation parameters, determine the population dynamics for the initialization time period.