HW 9: page 203 - 205, #1, 2, 3(a)(c)(e)(g), 7(c), 13, 16, 18, 19

# Chapter 5 Continued:

### Theorem 5.1.8

Let  $f: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and let  $c \in D'$ 

Then,

 $\lim_{x\to c} f(x) = L \in \mathbb{R}$  iff for **every** sequence  $\{s_n\}$  in D st  $s_n \neq c \ \forall \ n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\lim_{n\to\infty} s_n = c$  it follows that  $\lim_{n\to\infty} \{f(s_n)\} = L$ 

So,

 $\lim_{x \to \infty} f(x) = L$ 

for  $\epsilon > 0, \exists \delta > 0$  st

 $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$  (i.e.  $L - \epsilon < f(x) < L + \epsilon$  ) whenever  $0 < |x - c| < \delta$ 

## Corollary 5.1.9

If  $f: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and if  $c \in D'$ ,

 $_{
m then}$ 

if  $\lim_{x\to c} f(x) = L$ , then L is unique.

Proof.

Assume that

$$\lim_{x \to c} f(x) = L_1 \tag{1}$$

and

$$\lim_{x \to c} f(x) = L_2 \tag{2}$$

Let  $\{s_n\}$  be a sequence in D st

 $\mathbf{s}_n \neq \mathbf{c} \; \forall \; \mathbf{n} \in \mathbb{N} \text{ and } \lim_{n \to \infty} \mathbf{s}_n = \mathbf{c}$ 

By (1) and Theorem 5.1.8,  $\lim_{n\to\infty} f(s_n) = L_1$ .

And by (2) and Theorem 5.1.8,  $\lim_{n\to\infty} f(s_n) = L_2$ 

However, by Theorem 4.1.14, if a sequence converges, then its limit is unique.

So,  $L_1 = L_2$ , hence, uniqueness.

#### Theorem 5.1.10

Let  $f: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and let  $c \in D'$ 

Then the following are equivalent:

- a. f does not have a limit at c
- b.  $\exists$  a sequence  $\{s_n\}$  in D st  $s_n \neq c \ \forall \ n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\lim_{n \to \infty} s_n = c$  but  $\{f(s_n)\}$  is not convergent in  $\mathbb{R}$  (looks like the second part of Thm 5.1.8 except the opposite)

Proof.

 $\longrightarrow$ 

We first prove that  $a \Rightarrow b$  by using the contrapositive. (i.e. not b implies not a)

Assume (b) is false.

Thus, for every sequence  $\{s_n\}$  in D st  $s_n \neq c \ \forall \ n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\lim_{n \to \infty} s_n = c$  it follows that  $\{f(s_n)\}$  converges in  $\mathbb{R}$ 

Want to show:  $\lim f(x)$  exists

Let  $\{s_n\}$  and  $\{t_n\}$  be sequences in D st  $s_n \neq c$  and  $t_n \neq c \ \forall \ n \in \mathbb{N}$  in  $\lim_{n \to \infty} s_n = c$ ,  $\lim_{n \to \infty} t_n = c$ .

Thus,

 $\exists \ L_1, \ L_2 \in \mathbb{R} \ st \lim_{n \to \infty} \ f(s_n) = L_1 \ and \lim_{n \to \infty} \ f(t_n) = L_2$ 

Want to show:  $\widetilde{L}_1 = L_2$ 

Define the sequence  $\{u_n\}$  in D by

 $\{u_n\} = s_1, t_1, s_2, t_2, \dots$ 

Then  $u_n \neq c \ \forall \ n \in \mathbb{N}$  (should be obvious) and  $\lim_{n \to \infty} u_n = c$ 

So  $\exists L \in \mathbb{R} \text{ st } \lim_{n \to \infty} f(u_n) = L$ 

Since  $s_n$  and  $t_n$  are subsequences of  $u_n$ ,  $s_n$  and  $t_n$  must also converge to L.

Thus,

 $L_1 = L_2$ 

-Side Note

To see that  $\lim_{n \to \infty} u_n = c$ ,

Let:  $\epsilon > 0^{n \to \infty}$ 

Then  $\exists N_1, N_2 \in \mathbb{N} \text{ st } |s_n - c| < \epsilon \text{ for } n \geq N_1, \text{ and}$ 

 $|\mathbf{t}_n - \mathbf{c}| < \epsilon \text{ for } \mathbf{n} \ge \mathbf{N}_2$ 

Let  $N = \max \{N_1, N_2\}$ 

Also, consider  $|\mathbf{u}_n - \mathbf{c}|$ 

Case:

i) n is even

Then n = 2k for some  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  and

$$|u_n - c| = |u_{2k} - c| = |t_k - c| < \epsilon \text{ for } k \ge N$$

So,

$$|u_n - c| < \epsilon \text{ for } n \ge 2N \tag{1}$$

ii) n is odd

Then n = 2k - 1 for some  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  and

$$|u_n - c| = |u_{2k-1} - c| = |s_k - c| < \epsilon \text{ for } k \ge N$$

So,

$$|u_n - c| < \epsilon \text{ for } n = 2k - 1 \ge 2N - 1 \tag{2}$$

From (1) and (2),  $\lim_{n\to\infty} \mathbf{u}_n = \mathbf{c}$ 

Since  $\{f(u_n)\}$  converges to L and  $\{f(s_n)\}$ ,  $\{f(t_n)\}$  are subsequences of  $\{f(f_n)\}$ , it follows by Theorem 4.4.4 that  $L_1 = L_2 = L$ 

Hence, by Theorem 5.1.8, 
$$\lim_{x\to c} f(x) = L$$

 $\leftarrow$ 

Direct proof of (b) implies (a).

Assume (a) is false.

Then,

 $\exists L \in \mathbb{R} \text{ st } \lim_{x \to a} f(x) = L.$  The result follows directly from Theorem 5.1.8

Recall: a iff  $b \longrightarrow not$  a iff not b

# **Example 5.1.11**

**Let:**  $f(x) = \sin(\frac{1}{x})$  for x > 0

Prove that  $\lim_{x\to 0} f(x)$  does not exist.

Proof.

Let:  $x_n = \frac{2}{n\pi}$  for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ 

Then,

 $\{x_n\}$  is a sequence in D (x > 0) st

 $\mathbf{x}_n \neq 0 \ \forall \ \mathbf{n} \in \mathbb{N} \ \text{and} \ \lim_{n \to \infty} \mathbf{x}_n = 0, \ \text{but}, \ \forall \ \mathbf{n} \in \mathbb{N} \ ,$ 

$$f(x_n) = \sin(\frac{1}{x_n}) = \sin(\frac{n\pi}{2})$$

Now,  $\{f(x_n)\} = 1, 0, -1, 0, 1, 0, -1, 0 \dots$ 

Notice that  $\{f(x_n)\}\$  does not converge since it possesses subsequences that converge to different limits.

(i.e. 
$$\lim_{k \to \infty} f(x_{2k}) = 0$$
,  $\lim_{k \to \infty} f(x_{4k-3}) = 1$ , etc.)

By Theorem 5.1.10, f(x) does not have a limit at x = 0.

### Definition 5.1.12

Let  $f: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and  $g: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$ 

Define:

- a. The  $\mathbf{sum}\ f+g:D\ \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$  by  $(f+g)(x)=f(x)+g(x)\ \forall\ x\in D$
- b. The **product**  $fg: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$  by  $(fg)(x) = f(x)g(x) \ \forall \ x \in D$
- c. The **multiple**  $kf:\,D\ \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}\ (kf)(x)=kf(x)\ \forall\ x\in D,\, k\in\mathbb{R}$
- d. The quotient  $\frac{f}{g}: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R} \left(\frac{f}{g}\right)(x) = \frac{f(x)}{g(x)} \ \forall \ x \in D$  provided that  $g(x) \neq 0 \ \forall \ x \in D$

## Theorem 5.1.13

Let  $f: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$ ,  $g: D \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$  and let  $c \in D'$ If  $\lim_{x\to c} f(x) = L$  and  $\lim_{x\to c} g(x) = M$ , then

a. 
$$\lim_{x \to a} (f + g) = L + M$$

b. Let 
$$k \in \mathbb{R}$$
,  $\lim_{x \to c} kf = kL$ 

c. 
$$\lim_{x \to c} (fg) = LM$$

d. 
$$\lim_{x\to c} \left(\frac{f}{g}\right) = \frac{L}{M}$$
, provided that  $M \neq 0$ 

Proof.

(a) through (c) are similar to (d).

(d): Let  $\{s_n\}$  be a sequence in D st  $s_n \neq c \ \forall \ n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\lim_{n \to \infty} s_n = c$ .

Then, by Theorem 5.1.8,  $\lim_{n\to\infty} f(s_n) = L$ .

Now, 
$$\lim_{n\to\infty} g(x) = M \neq 0$$
.

So  $\exists \ N \in \mathbb{N} \text{ st}$ 

$$g(s_n) \neq 0 \text{ for } n \geq N$$

(ask why? next time)

Then, 
$$\lim_{n\to\infty} \left(\frac{f}{g}\right)(\mathbf{s}_n) = \lim_{n\to\infty} \frac{f(s_n)}{g(s_n)} = \frac{\lim_{n\to\infty} f(s_n)}{\lim_{n\to\infty} g(s_n)}$$
 (by Theorem 4.2.11d) =  $\frac{L}{M}$ 

$$|x| - |y| \le ||x| - |y|| \le |x - y|$$

$$|y| \ge |x| - |x - y|$$

So,

$$|g(\mathbf{s}_n)| \ge |\mathbf{M}| - |\mathbf{M} - g(\mathbf{s}_n)|$$

and since,

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} g(\mathbf{s}_n) = \mathbf{M} \neq 0$$

$$|g(\mathbf{s}_n) - \mathbf{M}| < \frac{|M|}{2}$$

$$\begin{aligned} |\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{s}_n) - \mathbf{M}| &< \frac{|\mathbf{M}|}{2} \\ -|\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{s}_n) - \mathbf{M}| &> \frac{-|\mathbf{M}|}{2} \end{aligned}$$

for  $n \ge N$ 

So,

$$|g(s_n)| > |M| - \frac{|M|}{2} = \frac{|M|}{2}$$
 for  $n \ge N$ 

Also, for the homework:

 $\lim P(x) = P(c)$  where P is a polynomial.