

# ENGG105 Tutorial 9 – critiquing design

## Learning Outcomes

By the end of this tutorial, students will have had an opportunity to:

- Use their own experience to assess other's report writing skills;
- Analyse a draft engineering design report;
- Give feedback on the quality and completeness of an engineering design report;
- Consider their team's progress towards milestones 4 and 5.

## Resources

- Team reports – 1 copy per group member **\*If you have not printed these, ask your tutor to allow you to leave class and get this done at the beginning of the tutorial. Teams that do not have a report, or sufficient copies will not be able to participate in the assessable task.**
- Milestone 5 Assessment criteria – 1 per student

## Tutorial Plan

This class is an opportunity to see how others are approaching their design and report – you can learn a lot from this experience if by taking the time to read others' reports carefully.

**Task 1** – Quick team progress updates.

**Task 2** – Setting standards and reflection task discussion.

**Step 1)** Work in your team to develop a list of things you will each be looking for in other team's reports. This could include evidence of creativity, feasibility of the design ideas, report structure, spelling, grammar etc. You should also review the Milestone 5 assessment criteria at this time, and consider how close you would expect draft reports to be to meeting the full requirements of Milestone 5.

During step 1, if you have identified any team issues or have problems with the reflection task results, you can discuss this with your tutor.

**Step 2)** Each group will report their list to the class. Consider points other teams have made – this is a chance to understand what the standards and expectations of the class are – Are some teams expecting progress closer to Milestone 5 than others?

**Step 3)** You need to give useful and constructive feedback in your peer review, this is not about highlighting everything that has been done badly, but helping your peers to develop an excellent report. Consider the overview of strategies to use and strategies to avoid on the following page. Is there anything missing? What might you add to this table based on your own experience?

## Task 2 – Milestone 3 assessment

In the second hour of the class, you will work independently through the report you are given, providing written feedback on the report **AND** on the marking sheet. Once finished, return the report and marking sheet to your tutor. Your tutor will then assess the quality of feedback you have provided **in this class time**.

| Mark | Criteria   |
|------|--|
| 100% | Extensive and detailed review - full marking with significant comments and feedback on both report and review form |
| 80%  | Complete review - full marking with comments throughout the report.  |
| 60%  | Good review - full marking with some comments  |
| 40%  | Partial review - full marking with no comments, or comments with no marking  |
| 20%  | Minimal review - minor comments only or partial marking only   |

## Key strategies for giving helpful feedback on formative assessment tasks:

| Use   | Avoid  |
|---|--|
| Comments about <i>why</i> x was right or wrong (see pages 2 and 3 for some examples)  | Ticks or crosses (not easy to understand which bit is right or wrong, and many crosses can be very demoralising)   |
| Physically change spelling or other errors: if the entire piece of work has a significant problem, carefully mark up one page, and tell the student that they need to correct the remainder themselves, using the specimen page as a guide  | Circles around, or lines underneath, spelling or grammatical errors, without any comment as to why these marks have been made  |
| Comments such as 'This sentence is not easy to understand, although I get the drift: it's worth having someone read your assignment before you submit it'.  | Underlined sentences with question marks don't let the student know whether it is the content or the style that is the problem.  |
| Positive words, such as 'good point', 'I agree', 'You've got the idea!', 'Good example', 'Didn't think of that... good!', 'I like this!', and 'Yes!'.   | Negative words, such as 'Failed', 'big mistake', 'No, No, No!', 'You're joking, aren't you?', 'Have you read this?', 'Not up to scratch', 'Wrong, wrong', 'This just won't do', 'Style!'   |
| 'I' statements, such as 'I find this information very surprising – maybe you could quote the figures/source?'   | Statements which make assumptions about the student, such as, 'You obviously haven't done the reading', 'You haven't put much effort into this'.   |
| If the student has misunderstood a question, begin with praise for any new insights or ideas, and then draw their attention to the fact they've misinterpreted or overlooked some aspect of the question. Suggest alternative approaches to keeping on track.   | Statements which make assumptions about the student, such as, 'You obviously haven't done the reading', 'You haven't put much effort into this'.<br><br>You might, at the same time, want to check what previous assignment topics in this subject have been, or to put a selected phrase into a plagiarism detection program. |
| Demonstrate how a piece of work could have been improved, or an idea elaborated upon, such as, 'Important point, but it needs broadening out from the specific example'; 'Comment on the results – why is there such a difference?'; 'Yes, this is a problem – I would have welcomed a local example'. An overall comment on the cover sheet (about how, for example, providing local examples would improve their marks) is also required. | Global remarks that the student cannot turn into a guideline for future work in more than this subject, or so much detailed feedback that they don't know where to begin, and therefore dismiss all of the feedback as being too demanding to be relevant to any other subject.  |
| Guidance on a key area for improvement that is likely to affect performance more broadly, thus ensuring that students can use the feedback effectively.   | Identifying everything that needs improving – this can help teachers feel better, but students then don't know where to start and can become thoroughly demoralised.   |