

Al-Ghadeer

In Quran, traditions and literature

Vol. 1

Allamah Shaykh Abdul Husain Amini (r.a.)

Selection:

Muhammad Hasan Shafi-ee Shaahroodi

English Translation:

Sayyid Athar Husain S.H. Rizvi

Assisted by:

Janab Syed Fayyaz Husain Abedi

Published:

Jafari Propagation Centre

Title : *Al-Ghadeer (Selections), Vol. 1*
Author : Allamah Shaykh Abdul Husain Amini (r.a.)
Selections : Muhammad Hasan Shafi-ee Shaahroodi
Translator : Sayyid Athar Husain S.H. Rizvi
Published : Ja'fari Propagation Centre
94, Asma Manzil, Room no. 10-11, Bazar Road,
Opp. Khoja Masjid, Bandra (W), Mumbai – 400 050. India
Tel.: 91-22-26425777
E-mail: jpcbandra@gmail.com, jpcbandra@yahoo.com
Website: www.jpconline.org

Translator's Foreword

In the Name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful. Praise to Allah, the Mighty and Sublime and benedictions on Muhammad al-Mustafa (s.a.w.a.) and Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

Al-Ghadeer by Allamah Abdul Husain Amini (r.a.) is among the most important Shia polemic books of all times and the most outstanding book of modern times. I will not mention more than this about the book or the author, as the preface and introduction after this are quite sufficient and detailed in this regard.

However, I would like to thank **Dr. Ali Mohammed Bhayani** for sponsoring the English translation of this book and also **Ja'fari Propagation Centre** for sponsoring translation and publishing it.

JPC has made remarkable contribution in publishing some of the most important books on Shia Islam. May it continue this work with same interest and zeal, as there is nothing better in the world than propagating the Islam of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

May Allah, the Mighty and Sublime bless Muhammad and Aale Muhammad (a.s.) and shower His favors on our learned scholars, who dedicated their lives to the preservation and dissemination of the knowledge of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). May He give us Taufeeq to strive on the path of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) under the guidance of last successor of Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.a.).

As always, we invite the readers to correspond with the translator, in case of doubts about any point mentioned therein and also to make suggestions.

Peace be on all of you and mercy of Allah and His blessings.

Syed Athar Husain S. H. Rizvi

sayedathar@hotmail.com

Table of Contents

Translator's Foreword.....	3
Preface	28
First: About the author of Al-Ghadeer	28
Lineage.....	28
Birth	28
Education.....	28
Commission in Najaf Ashraf	29
Return to Tabriz	29
To Najaf Ashraf again	29
Permission for jurisprudence (Ijtehaad)	29
Scholarly pursuits.....	30
Incident.....	31
Another story	31
The Allamah adds:	31
Personal qualities and noble manners	32
Travels and travails	33
Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) Library	34
Writings, compilation and research of the Allamah.....	35
Children	37
Death and Burial	37
Second Discussion – A Glance at the magnum opus, Al-Ghadeer.....	37
Topic One: Aim of writing Al-Ghadeer	41
Topic Two: Sources of Allamah's research.....	43
Topic Three: Distinctions of Al-Ghadeer	44
Discussions.....	45
Traditional discussions	45
Historical discussions	45
Religious discussions	45
Ethical discussions	45
Jurisprudential discussions	46
Discussions about tradition narrators	46
Linguistic discussions	46

Topic Four: Mastership (Wilayat) in Ghadeer	46
Belief of Shia Imamiyah regarding Caliphate	47
Conclusion.....	51
Excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).....	52
Excellence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).....	54
Excellence and merits of Lady Fatima (s.a.).....	63
Indictments of the enemies and opponents of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and usurpers of their rights	64
Abu Bakr	64
Umar.....	65
Uthman.....	66
Muawiyah	67
Note	68
An account of fabrication of traditions and false propaganda.....	71
Fabricating the excellence of ordinary persons	73
Instances of fabrications	73
Exaggerating the excellence of Abu Bakr.....	73
Exaggerating the excellence of Umar	73
Exaggerating the excellence of Uthman	74
Exaggerations regarding Muawiyah	74
Note:.....	75
Third – Selections from Al-Ghadeer	75
Our Style in selection and research.....	75
Tasks completed in Selections from Al-Ghadeer and the present translation.....	76
Associates	77
Event of Ghadeer	82
Special attention to the tradition of Ghadeer	86
Narrators of Ghadeer tradition from companions of companions of the Prophet.....	92
Classes of narrators from the scholars	94
Writers about the tradition of Ghadeer	99
Swearing by and reasoning through the tradition of Ghadeer	100
1. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of Shura in the year 23 A.H. or beginning of 24 A.H.....	100
2. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) during the reign of Uthman bin Affan.....	101

3. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of Rahba during 35 A.H.	103
4. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and his argument against Talha on the day of the Battle of Jamal in the year 36 A.H.	104
5. Tradition of fame In Kufa during the year 36-37 A.H.	105
Those involved in the curse of Imam Ali (a.s.) for concealing the tradition of Ghadeer	106
6. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of the Battle of Siffeen in 37 A.H.	106
7. Protest of the respected daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.).....	106
8. Protest of Imam Abu Muhammad Hasan (a.s.), grandson of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in 41 A.H.	107
9. Challenge of Imam Husain (a.s.), grandson of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) through the tradition of Ghadeer in 58-59 A.H.	107
10. Reasoning of Amr Aas with Muawiyah through the tradition of Ghadeer	108
11. Reasoning of Ammaar Yasir with Amr Aas in the Battle of Siffeen..... Masudi's statement	109
Verse of announcement..... Conclusion.....	111
Another conclusion	115
End of statement	115
2. Perfection of religion through Mastership (<i>Wilayat</i>)	117
3. Descent of divine chastisement	119
A glance at the tradition..... First objection	121
Reply: Firstly:	121
Secondly	122
Second objection..... Reply	122
Third objection..... Reply	122
Fourth objection..... Reply	124
Fifth objection.....	125

Reply	125
Sixth objection	125
Reply	125
Eid Ghadeer in Islam	127
First point	127
Second point	128
Tradition of felicitation [of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)]	129
Return to the beginning of the statement	130
As long as you live time will show surprises to you!	133
Coronation on the day of Ghadeer	134
Conclusion	135
Statements of reliable Ahle Sunnat Hafiz scholars and intellectuals regarding the tradition of Ghadeer	137
Judgment regarding the authorities of tradition	140
Whereas we say:	141
Another person appears and says:	142
A survey of Ibne Hazm Andulasi's viewpoint (d. 456 A.H.)	146
Question	146
Other viewpoints of Ibne Hazm	150
Reply	154
Meaning of the tradition of Ghadeer	158
Evidence of this tradition on the Imamate of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)	158
Master (<i>Maula</i>) in the meaning of foremost (<i>Awla</i>)	160
Second category	161
Raazi's statement regarding the meaning of tradition	162
Raazi's objection in the view of scholars	164
Another statement of Raazi	165
Raazi's reply to the above statements	166
Tohfa Ithna Asharia	167
Discussion regarding meaning of <i>Maula</i>	168
As for the first meaning	169
As for the meanings of 2 and 3 till 14	169
Follower and helper	170
As for the second possibility	171
Meaning implied in the tradition	172

In the same way is the meaning of guardian of affair.....	173
Conclusion.....	175
Contexts of Maula	176
First context	176
Second context.....	177
Third context.....	178
Fourth context.....	179
Fifth context.....	179
Sixth context.....	180
Seventh context.....	180
Eighth context.....	181
Ninth context	182
Tenth context	182
Eleventh context.....	183
Twelfth context.....	183
Thirteenth context	184
Fourteenth context.....	185
Fifteenth context	185
Sixteenth context.....	185
Seventeenth context	186
Eighteenth context.....	187
Traditions which mention the meaning of Master (<i>Maula</i>) and Mastership (<i>Wilayat</i>)	189
Clear explanation regarding the meaning of the tradition.....	192
Worship acts on Ghadeer Day.....	194
Rituals for Ghadeer Day	194
Report of fasting on the day of Ghadeer.....	194
As for the contraventional (Naqzi) reply	195
As for the solutional (Halli) reply.....	196
Firstly	197
Secondly	197
Poetry and poets	199
Poetry and poets in Quran and Sunnah	201
Announcers of couples.....	204
Association of poets.....	206
Poetry and poets in the view of Imams (a.s.)	208

Poetry and poets in the view of elders of faith	211
Poets of Ghadeer in the first century Hijri	213
1. Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).....	214
Explanation regarding the couplets	214
2. Hassan bin Thabit	216
Explanation of the couplets	216
Senior tradition scholars (Huffaz), who narrated them	217
Collected Works (Diwan) of Hassan.....	218
Couplets expunged from Hassan's collection.....	218
Other compositions of Hassan regarding Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)	221
First line.....	221
Second line	221
Third line	222
Another poem of Hassan regarding Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.)	231
Another verse of Hassan.....	232
Introduction to the poet	232
3. Qays Ansari.....	234
Explanation of the verses.....	234
Introduction to the poet	235
Nobility of Qays.....	235
His governorship.....	235
Shrewdness and expertise of Qays	236
Absolute control of Qays on administrative issues	236
Generosity and nobility of Qays	237
Eloquence of Qays	238
Piety of Qays.....	238
Excellence and wisdom of Qays	239
Death of Qays	239
4. Amr bin Aas	239
Explanation	245
Introduction to the poet	245
Lineage of Amr Aas	246
Amr Aas' conversion.....	247
1. Statement of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)	249
2. Statement of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).....	249
3. Letter of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) to Amr Aas	250

Point	250
4. Qunut of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) cursing Amr	251
5. Ayesha condemns Amr	251
6. Conversation between Muawiyah and Amr Aas	251
‘Valor’ of Amr Aas	252
Lesson in religion and morals	253
Explanation	253
Death of Amr Aas	255
Point	255
5. Muhammad Himyari	256
Explanation of the couplets	256
Introduction to the poet	256
Poets of Ghadeer in the second century Hijri	258
6. Abu Mustahal Kumayt	259
Explanation regarding the verses	260
Qasida of Ainiyya from Hashimiyyat	260
Hashemiyyat	261
Qasida Maimiya from Qasida Hashemiya	262
Qasida Baiyya from the Hashimiya Qasidas	262
Qasida Lamiya from the Qasida Hashimiya	263
Introduction to the poet	264
Kumayt and his religious life	265
Kumayt and the supplications of the Imams in his favor	266
Birth and martyrdom	268
7. Sayyid Himyari	268
Introduction to the poet	270
His parents and his story in their words	270
His greatness and statements regarding him	271
His works praised	272
His extensive compositions regarding Ahle Bayt (a.s.)	272
His religious beliefs and statements of scholars regarding him	272
Statement of Saduq	273
Statement of Marzabani	273
Caliphs during his period	274
Birth and demise	274
Expertise in knowledge and history	274

Tradition of the beginning of the call in history and literature	275
Wording of the tradition	275
Statement of Iskafi regarding the tradition in his book of Al-Naqdh alal Uthmaniya	277
Iskafi's reply	277
Felonies upon tradition	278
8. Abdi Kufi	279
Introduction to the poet	279
His genius in literature and traditions	280
Birth and death	280
Examples of his poetry	280
Explanation of traditions alluded to in these verses and prominent Ahle Sunnat scholars, who have narrated them	281
Some other verses of Abdi	286
Explanations of traditions alluded to in these lines	287
Word of the poet: 'most truthful lady'	291
Word of the poet: 'most truthful man'	291
Some verses of Abdi	294
Explanation of couplets	294
Abdi's panegyric in praise of Ali (a.s.)	295
Other verses of Abdi	296
Abdi's verses in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)	297
Another verse of Abdi in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)	297
Some verses of Abdi	298
Among his verses is:	299
Other verses of Abdi	299
Abdi, contemporary of Abdi	300
Poets of Ghadeer in the third century Hijri	301
9. Abu Tammam Tai	302
Explanation of the couplets	302
Introduction to the poet	303
Collected poems of Abu Tammam	304
Birth and death	304
Only the valiant fall in the battlefield	305
10. Dibil Khuzai	306
Explanation regarding the verses from the statements of important Ahle	

Sunnat scholars	307
Statements of prominent Shia personalities.....	310
Introduction to the poet	312
Family of Razin	312
Abdul Hasan Ali, brother of Dibil.....	313
Dibil Khuzai	313
His biography is discussed from four aspects:.....	314
As for the first aspect	314
His literary expertise	315
Traditions narrated by him	315
His conduct with Caliphs and ministers	315
Birth and death.....	315
11. Abu Ismail Alawi.....	316
Introduction to the poet	316
12. Wamiq Nasrani	316
Explanation of the verses.....	316
Introduction to the poet	317
The first slogan of the period of Ignorance	318
Decline of the east or decadence of Arabs.....	321
May his mother mourn him!	321
Blatant falsehood	323
Yes!	325
13. Ibne Rumi	332
Introduction to the poet	333
His religious beliefs.....	334
His satirical poetry	334
Date of his death	334
His martyrdom	334
14. Himmāni Afwa	335
Introduction to the poet	335
Birth and death.....	336
Zaid, the martyr and the Twelver Imamite Shia	337
As for traditions	337
Statements of scholars.....	338
Shia poets	339
Important and extremely beneficial writings	339

Conclusion.....	339
A survey of spurious books and writings	342
1. Iqdu'l Fareed.....	342
Some of his statements and their criticism.....	343
1. Statement One.....	343
Reply to Statement One.....	343
2. Statement Two	344
Reply to Statement Two.....	344
3. Statement Three	346
Reply to Statement Three	346
4. Statement Four	347
Reply to Statement Four.....	347
5. Statement Five	350
Reply to Statement Five	350
6. Statement Six	351
Reply to Statement Six	351
7. Statement Seven.....	351
Reply to Statement Seven.....	351
8. Statement Eight	351
Reply to Statement Eight.....	352
9. Statement Nine.....	353
Reply to Statement Nine.....	353
Funny statement	354
10. Statement Ten	354
Reply to Statement Ten	354
2. Kitabul Intisar.....	356
3. Al-Farq bainal Firaq.....	357
4. Al-Fisal fil Milal wan Nihal	357
1. First objection	357
Reply to the first objection	357
2. Second objection	358
Reply to the second objection	358
3. Third objection.....	361
Reply to the third objection	361
4. Fourth objection	361
Reply to the fourth objection	362

5. Fifth objection.....	362
Reply to the fifth objection.....	362
6. Sixth objection	363
Reply to the sixth objection.....	363
Text of the tradition.....	364
7. Seventh objection	365
Reply to the seventh objection.....	365
8. Eighth objection	369
Reply to the eighth objection.....	369
Text of the tradition.....	371
5. Al-Milal wan Nihil.....	372
Refutation	373
6. Minhajus Sunnah	374
1. First objection	374
Reply to the first objection	374
2. Second objection	375
3. Third objection.....	376
4. Fourth objection	376
5. Fifth objection.....	376
6. Sixth objection	376
7. Seventh objection	376
Replies to second till seventh objection	376
8. Eighth objection	376
Reply to the eighth objection.....	377
9. Ninth objection.....	377
Reply to the ninth objection.....	377
Denial of qualities	379
Creatibility of Quran	379
Denial of seeing God.....	379
10. Tenth objection	379
Reply to the tenth objection.....	380
According respect to tombs	380
As for abusing above-mentioned persons.....	380
Shaykh Mufeed's book.....	381
11. Eleventh objection.....	381
Reply to the eleventh objection.....	382

Text of the tradition.....	383
Flimsy objections	384
12. Twelfth objection	387
Reply to the twelfth objection.....	387
13. Thirteenth objection	388
14. Fourteenth objection.....	388
Reply to the fourteenth objection.....	388
15. Fifteenth objection.....	389
Reply to the fifteenth objection.....	389
16. Sixteenth objection.....	390
Reply to these statements	391
As for the verse being Meccan.....	391
Context of revelation and obligation of loving Ahle Bayt (a.s.)	392
Ali's marriage to Fatima and requirement of its precedence over the verse	392
17. Seventeenth objection.....	393
Reply to the seventeenth objection	393
18. Eighteenth objection.....	394
Reply to the eighteenth objection.....	394
19. Nineteenth objection.....	396
Reply to the nineteenth objection.....	396
20. Twentieth objection.....	397
Reply to the twentieth objection	397
21. Twenty-first objection	397
Reply to the twenty-first objection.....	397
Source of the report.....	398
Another form of this traditional report	399
22. Twenty-second objection.....	400
Reply to the twenty-second objection	400
23. Twenty-third objection	403
Reply to the twenty-third objection.....	405
First	406
Second	406
Third.....	407
Another part of tradition that Ibne Taymiyyah falsified.....	407
Reply	407
Regarding authentic the report of Abu Bakr's friendship and opening of a	

window from his room into the Masjid.....	408
Another part of tradition.....	409
Refutation of Ibne Taymiyyah.....	409
7. Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya	410
1. False statement one	411
Reply to false statement one	411
2. False statement two	411
Reply to false statement two.....	411
3. False statement three	411
Reply to false statement three	411
4. False statement four.....	412
Reply to false statement four	412
Clear statements of Prophet	412
Statements of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).....	413
Statement of Imam Hasan (a.s.).....	413
Viewpoint of companions and companions of companions regarding the first Muslim.....	414
Statement regarding the Islam of Abu Bakr	418
As for three years	419
As for five years.....	419
As for seven years.....	419
Conclusion.....	421
As for nine years	421
5. False statement five.....	421
Reply to false statement five.....	422
6. False statement six	423
Reply to false statement six	423
7. False statement seven	423
Reply to false statement seven.....	423
8. Mahazirat Tarikh Umamul Islamiyah	424
1. Objection one	424
Reply to objection one.....	425
2. Objection two.....	427
Reply to objection two	427
3. Objection three.....	429
Another objection.....	430

Reply to objection three	430
First aspect.....	430
Second aspect.....	431
As for his viewpoint regarding restriction of Caliphate in a family.....	432
4. Objection four	432
Reply to objection four.....	433
9. As-Sunnah wash Shia	435
10. As-Sara Bainal Islam wal Wathniya	437
1. First objection	437
Reply to first objection.....	438
2. Second objection	439
Reply to second objection.....	439
3. Third objection.....	440
Reply to third objection.....	440
4. Fourth objection	443
Reply to fourth objection.....	443
5. Fifth objection.....	444
Reply to fifth objection.....	444
6. Sixth objection	444
Reply to sixth objection.....	444
7. Seventh objection	446
Reply to seventh objection	446
11. Al-Washiya fee Naqde Aqaidush Shia.....	447
1. First objection	448
Reply to first objection.....	449
2. Second objection	450
Summary of his statements about Fixed-time marriage (Mutah).....	450
Reply to second objection.....	451
1. Fixed-time marriage (Mutah) in Quran	451
2. Rules of Fixed-time marriage (Mutah) in Islam.....	451
3. Who was the first to prohibit Fixed-time marriage (Mutah)?	452
4. Companions and companions of companions.....	452
Fifth discussion: regarding Fixed-time marriage (Mutah).....	453
Other fabricated books:.....	453
Poets of Ghadeer in the fourth century Hijri.....	455
15. Ibne Tabataba Isfahani	456

Introduction to the poet	456
16. Ibne Alawiya	456
Explanation	457
Introduction to the poet	458
17. Mufajja	458
Explanation	459
Tradition of ‘Ashbah’	460
Introduction to the poet	462
18. Abul Qasim Sanobari	462
Introduction to the poet	462
19. Qaazi Tanukhi	463
Introduction to the poet	463
20. Abul Qasim Zahi	463
Introduction to the poet	464
Among them being the following verses in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s):.....	464
Statement of the poet: “He was the one who conversed with the sun”	464
Statement of the poet: “and one for whom the sun rose up again after it had set in Babel”	465
Statement of the poet: “he caused a spring of fresh water to flow”	465
Statement of the poet: “hearing ear”	466
Some other verses of Zahi in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s).....	467
21. Amir Abu Faras Hamadani	467
Introduction to the poet	467
Following are some of his verses:	468
22. Abul Fath Kashjam	468
Introduction to the poet	468
Birth and death	469
23. Nashi Saghir	469
Introduction to the poet	469
24. Bishnoi Kurdi	470
Introduction to the poet	470
A samples of his verses	470
25. Sahib bin Ubbad	471
Introduction to the poet	471
His verses regarding religion	472

Sahib and religion	472
Sayings of Sahib bin Ubbad, which have become proverbs in Arabic language.....	473
Demise.....	474
26. Jauhari Jurjani.....	474
Introduction to the poet	475
27. Ibne Hajjaj Baghdadi	475
Introduction to the poet	475
Literary contribution	476
Birth and death.....	476
28. Abul Abbas Zabbi.....	476
Explanation of the verse.....	477
Introduction to the poet	477
29. Abu Raqamaq Antaki.....	477
Introduction to the poet	478
30. Abul Aala Sarawi.....	478
Introduction to the poet	478
31. Abu Muhammad Auni	478
Introduction to the poet	479
32. Ibne Hammad Abdi.....	479
Explanation.....	480
2. Another Qasida in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).....	481
Introduction to the poet	481
Birth and death.....	482
33. Abul Faraj Razi.....	483
Introduction to the poet	483
34. Ja'far bin Husain.....	483
Poets of Ghadeer in the fifth century Hijri	484
35. Abu Najib Tahir.....	485
Introduction to the poet	485
36. Sayyid Razi.....	485
Introduction to the poet	486
His teachers.....	486
His students and those who have narrated from him.....	487
Books and writings.....	487
Other writings	488

Poetry of Sayyid Razi.....	488
Birth and death.....	488
37. Abu Muhammad Suri.....	488
Introduction to the poet	489
38. Mahyar Dailami	489
Introduction to the poet	490
His verses regarding religion	490
39. Sayyid Murtada.....	491
Introduction to the poet	491
His praises	491
His teachers and from whom he has narrated	492
Students	492
Birth and death.....	492
40. Abu Ali Basir.....	492
Introduction to the poet	493
41. Abul Alaa Muarra	493
Explanation of the verses and account of the poet	493
42. Moyyad fid Deen	494
Introduction to the poet	494
43. Jabri Misri	494
Introduction to the poet	494
Poets of Ghadeer in the sixth century Hijri	496
44. Abul Hasan Fanjkardi	497
Explanation.....	497
Introduction to the poet	497
45. Ibne Munir Tarabulusi	499
Explanation	499
Introduction to the poet	499
46. Qaazi Ibne Qadoos.....	500
Introduction to the poet	500
47. Malik Salih	500
Introduction to the poet	501
Birth and death.....	502
48. Ibne Awdi Neeli.....	502
Introduction to the poet	502
49. Qaazi Jalees	503

Introduction to the poet	503
50. Ibne Makki Neeli	503
Introduction to the poet	503
51. Khatib Khwarizmi.....	504
Introduction to the poet	505
His writings.....	505
Verses, sermons, date of birth and death.....	506
52. Faqih Ummara	506
Introduction to the poet	507
53. Sayyid Muhammad Aqsasi.....	508
Introduction to the poet	508
The Aqsasi clan.....	508
Note.....	510
As long as you are alive, you will continue to see amazing things!	511
1. Tradition of returning of the sun.....	512
2. A thousand units of prayer	512
Difficult recitations	516
3. Muhaddath in Islam	519
Ahle Sunnat reports.....	519
As for Shia traditional reports.....	521
4. Knowledge of the unseen of the Shia Imams	523
A drop from the ocean.....	532
An amazing point	532
5. Transferring the last remains to holy tombs	533
Malikis say:.....	533
Hanbalis say:.....	533
Shafeis say:	533
Hanafis say:	534
Conclusion.....	534
6. Visitation (Ziyarat) of tombs of the Holy Progeny, supplication at graves, seeking mediation/blessings	535
Encouragement for visitation (Ziyarat) of the Prophet (s.a.).....	537
Statements of scholars of four schools regarding Ziyarat of Prophet (s.a.w.a.).....	539
Etiquette of Visitor according to Ahle Sunnat	540
Ziyarat of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).....	542

Supplication at the head of Prophet (s.a.w.a.).....	542
Invoking blessings (Salawat) on the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)	543
Seeking mediation through the holy tomb of His Eminence	543
Seeking blessings from the holy grave by touching and kissing it	544
Ziyarat of Imams of Baqi and other places of visitation	547
Ziyarat of the martyrs of Uhad.....	547
Encouragement for visiting tombs.....	548
Etiquette for visitors of graves	549
Statement regarding Ziyarat.....	549
Statements of Ahle Sunnat scholars regarding visitation of graves.....	550
Offerings for the inmates of tombs	551
First	552
Second	552
Tombs where one can travel with the intention of Ziyarat.....	552
Conclusion regarding visiting of tombs	555
7. A close look at the tradition	556
Reply	556
Series of liars and fabricators of traditional reports.....	557
Note	560
List of fabricated traditions	566
Difficulty of reliable and reliability	566
False traditions attributed to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).....	569
Traditions fabricated regarding Caliphate.....	578
Dirty falsehood	583
What are these rude statements and calls of confusion?	586
Command regarding fabricators and liars	587
Command regarding those, who memorize these invalid false statements	588
54. Qutubuddin Rawandi	589
Introduction to the poet	589
His teachers.....	590
His valuable writings.....	590
55. Sibte Ibne Taweezi.....	590
Introduction to the poet	590
Poets of Ghadeer in the seventh century Hijri.....	592
56. Abul Hasan Mansur billaah	593
Introduction to the poet	593

57. Majduddeen bin Jamil.....	593
Introduction to the poet	594
58. Shawwa Kufi Halabi.....	594
Introduction to the poet	594
59. Kamaluddin Shafei	595
Introduction to the poet	595
As for Surah Shura:.....	595
As for Surah Hal Ataa:.....	596
As for Surah Ahzab:.....	596
60. Abu Muhammad Mansur billaah.....	597
Introduction to the poet	597
61. Abul Husain Jazzaar	597
Introduction to the poet	598
62. Qaazi Nizamuddin	598
Introduction to the poet	599
63. Shamsuddin Mahfuz	599
Introduction to the poet	600
64. Bahaudin Irbili.....	600
Introduction to the poet	600
Poets of Ghadeer in the eighth century Hijri.....	602
65. Abu Muhammad bin Dawood Hilli	603
Introduction to the poet	603
His valuable writings.....	603
66. Jamaluddin Khalai	604
Introduction to the poet	604
67. Sariji Awali.....	605
Explanation of the couplets	606
Introduction to the poet	607
68. Safiuddin Hilli	607
Introduction to the poet	607
69. Imam Shaibani Shafei	608
Explanation of the couplets	608
Introduction to the poet	608
70. Shamsuddin Maliki	608
Explanation of couplets	610
Text of the Tradition	611

The longer you live, the times show more wonders to you.....	615
Masterpieces of Umar's knowledge	616
1. View point of Caliph regarding one, who has no water for ablution	616
Distortion in this report	616
2. The Caliph was ignorant about rules of doubts in prayer.....	619
3. The Caliph's ignorance about Quran	620
Most amazing.....	621
4. Everyone is more knowledgeable than Umar!.....	622
5. Umar did not know the meaning of 'Abb'	623
Note.....	624
6. Caliph's order regarding the insane female, who committed fornication .	624
Reminder	625
7. Caliph's ignorance about interpretation of Quran	625
8. Everyone is more knowledgeable than Umar.....	626
9. The Caliph's ignorance of tenors and metaphors	626
10. Opinion of Caliph regarding recitation in prayer.....	628
11. The Caliph's opinion about inheritance	629
12. Ignorance of Caliph about divorce of slave girl	629
13. If Ali hadn't been there, Umar would have perished	630
14. The Caliph's ignorance about the Sunnah.....	630
15. Deduction of Caliph regarding the grandfather	631
16. The Caliph and the female singer	632
Another instance	632
17. Condemning the rape victim	633
Explanation.....	633
18. The Caliph doesn't know what he is saying	634
19. Incidents of the Caliph patrolling in the nights and spying on people ...	634
20. The Caliph's view on liquor	635
21. The Caliph and a falsely accused woman	635
22. Caliph and the rule of Kalalah	636
23. The Caliphs viewpoint about retaliation	638
24. The Caliph's opinion regarding the slain from the People of Book	638
25. The Caliph's verdict regarding human fingers	638
26. The Caliph's view regarding the thief.....	639
27. All, even elderly ladies are more knowledgeable than Umar	640
28. Viewpoint of Caliph regarding the tree of Rizwan	640

29. Caliph's view regarding the relics of the prophets	641
30. The Caliph beat up people without any reason.....	642
31. The Caliph prohibited weeping for the dead	642
32. Sacrifice and deduction of the Caliph	646
33. Viewpoint of Caliph regarding puberty	647
34. Reducing the penalty.....	647
35. "O Abul Hasan, may God not put me in a difficulty, where you are not there to solve it."	648
36. Viewpoint of the caliph about three divorces	650
37. The caliph's view about non-Arabs	653
38. Taking permission from Ayesha.....	655
39. The Caliph's sermon at Jabiya.....	657
Note	659
40. The Caliph and learning of Surah Baqarah	661
Like father like son	663
Viewpoint of Caliph regarding Hajje Tamatto and Fixed time marriage.....	663
41. Hajje Tamatto	663
42. Fixed time marriage	664
Two Mutahs: Mutah of Hajj and Mutah of women	665
Other opinions regarding two Mutahs.....	666
Hajje Tamatto	666
Fixed-time marriage.....	666
Reply to Moosa.....	671
Mutah (Fixed time marriage in Quran).....	672
Now, stay with me	674
Salient features of Fixed time marriage in Islam.....	675
Read; and laugh or cry	676
43. Independent judgment (Ijtehaad) of the Caliph regarding liquor and its verse.....	678
44. Caliph was the founder of preference (Awl) in inheritance	683
45. The Caliph's viewpoint regarding Baitul Maqdas	686
46. The Caliph's viewpoint regarding Zoroastrians (Majus)	687
47. The Caliph's viewpoint about fast of Rajab	688
First aspect.....	688
Second aspect.....	688
Third aspect	688

Fourth aspect.....	689
Fifth aspect	689
48. Independent judgment (Ijtehaad) of the Caliph regarding difficult questions on Quran	690
49. Viewpoint of the Caliph regarding query about future	691
50. Prohibition of the Caliph regarding traditions	692
51. Writing of the Sunnah	693
52. Caliph's viewpoint regarding books	693
53. Ijtehaad of Caliph regarding names and agnomens	696
54. The Caliph didn't know which Surahs were recited on Eid days	701
55. The Caliph and the meanings of terms.....	701
Return to the poetry of Shamsuddin Maliki.....	709
Nobility regarding the tradition.....	711
Introduction to the poet	714
71. Alauddin Hilli.....	714
Introduction to the poet	714
Poets of Ghadeer in the ninth century Hijri.....	716
72. Ibne Arandas Hilli.....	717
Explanation of the verses.....	717
Introduction to the poet	718
73. Ibne Daghar Hilli	719
Introduction to the poet	719
74. Hafiz Bursi Hilli	719
Introduction to the poet	720
Conclusion.....	721
Valuable writings of Bursi	723
His beautiful couplets	723
Exaggerating excellence	724

In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful

Praise is only for Allah, Who is the true Lord and Master; and blessings be on Muhammad Mustafa (s.a.w.a.); and his descendants, who are illuminated lamps and clear proofs for the folks of discernment.

Preface¹

This preface consists of three parts:

First: About the author of *Al-Ghadeer*.

Second: About the book of *Al-Ghadeer*.

Third: About the present book; that is Selections from *Al-Ghadeer*.

First: About the author of Al-Ghadeer

Lineage

Ayatullah Shaykh Abdul Husain, son of Shaykh Ahmad Amini Tabrizi Najafi, was a prominent Imamiyah scholar of the fourteenth century and the author of the most valuable book of *Al-Ghadeer fil Kitab was Sunnah wal Adab* (Ghadeer in Quran, traditions and literature).

Birth

Shaykh Abdul Husain, son of Shaykh Ahmad Amini was born in Tabriz in the year 1320 A.H. and he was brought up in an intellectual and a scholarly family.

The academic history of this family begins with the grandfather, Shaykh Najafqali Amin, who was born in Sardha, a suburb of Tabriz (Iran), in the year 1275 A.H. and basically this family is known as Amini, because their grandfather was known as the *Amin* (Trustee) of Shariah. Amin of Shariah was a very intelligent littérateur, who was well known for his piety and religion; and the scholarly and literary environment of this family was shaped by him and this environment left an imprint on his sons and grandsons from the aspects of ethics, ideals, behavior and manners. And his father also was the jurisprudent of his time and well known for his knowledge, cognition and conduct.

Education

His elementary education commenced under his father, Shaykh Ahmad Amini. After that he attended Madressa Talibiya Tabriz, which at that time was an important center of knowledge in that city. He continued his elementary education there. Then he studied law and principles under well known teachers of his time. The following were his main teachers:

1. Ayatullah Sayyid Muhammad Abdul Karim Musawi, A *Maraja Taqleed* (Supreme jurist) in Tabriz.
2. Ayatullah Sayyid Murtada bin Ahmad bin Muhammad Husaini

¹ Introduction of *Mausuatal Ghadeer*, edited by Markazul Ghadeer Ad-Darasaatul Islamiyya, and *Seeri dar Ghadeer*, by Agha Muhammad Amini Najafi, and the present book.

Khosroshahi. He was an expert of knowledge and jurisprudence. He is considered as the most accomplished scholar of Tabriz.

3. Ayatullah Shaykh Husain bin Abde Ali Tutunchi, a prominent scholar of jurisprudence, principles and *Ilme Kalam* (scholastics). He held a high status among scholars of jurisprudence.
4. Allamah Shaykh Mirza Ali Asghar Malaki; he was a senior scholar of jurisprudence and literature.

Commission in Najaf Ashraf

The late Allamah Amini traveled to Najaf Ashraf to continue higher studies (*Darse Kharij*) under the teachers of jurisprudence, principles, traditions and science of traditions. Therefore, he attended the classes of teachers of jurisprudence and its principles, like:

1. Ayatullah Sayyid Muhammad bin Muhammad Baqir Husaini Firozabadi (d. 1354 A.H.).
2. Ayatullah Sayyid Abu Turab bin Abul Qasim Khwansari (d. 1346 A.H.).
3. Ayatullah Mirza Ali bin Abdul Husain Erawani (d. 1354 A.H.).
4. Ayatullah Mirza Abul Hasan bin Abdul Husain Mishkini (d. 1358 A.H.).

Return to Tabriz

After a long stay in Najaf, during which he attended classes and held discussion with students, so that he may gain perfect knowledge and know-how, he returned to Tabriz, his hometown. There he became engrossed in teaching and further research. It was during this period that he began lessons on the exegesis of Surah Hamd.

To Najaf Ashraf again

The Shaykh did not stay in Tabriz for a long time. He was always in pursuit of advanced knowledge and his mind was always inclined to Najaf Ashraf. The holy city, which is the abode of knowledge and intellectuality. He was so much attracted to it that he returned to Najaf Ashraf once more, inspite of having a comfortable life and fame in Tabriz.

Permission for jurisprudence (Ijtehaad)

After returning to Najaf Ashraf, he continued his higher education in the Najaf Seminary and along with senior students, gained advanced knowledge in his chosen field. He was able to obtain the license to practice jurisprudence (*Ijtehaad*) from great scholars like:

1. Ayatullah Sayyid Mirza Ali bin Mujaddid Shirazi (d. 1355 A.H.).
2. Ayatullah Shaykh Mirza Husain Naini Najafi (d. 1355 A.H.).
3. Ayatullah Shaykh Abdul Karim bin Mulla Muhammad Ja'far Yazdi Haeri (d. 1355 A.H.).

4. Ayatullah Sayyid Abul Hasan bin Sayyid Muhammad Musawi Isfahani (d. 1365 A.H.).
5. Ayatullah Shaykh Muhammad Husain bin Muhammad Hasan Isfahani Najafi, famous as Kampani (d. 1361 A.H.).
6. Ayatullah Shaykh Muhammad Husain bin Ali Kashiful Ghita (d. 1373 A.H.).

He obtained permission from them to practice jurisprudence (*Ijtehaad*). Some senior scholars of Najaf also issued permission for him to narrate traditions; and in this way he joined the category of tradition narrators. From this we can conclude his caliber in reporting of traditions and traditional reports. Some of them are as follows:

1. Ayatullah Sayyid Abul Hasan Musawi Isfahani.
2. Ayatullah Sayyid Mirza Ali Husaini Shirazi.
3. Ayatullah Shaykh Ali Asghar Maliki Tabrizi.

Scholarly pursuits

He possessed unlimited eagerness for scholarly pursuits and gaining of knowledge and he did not leave any stone unturned in this way. He had hair-splitting expertise in researching intellectual subjects and he never felt exhausted; such was his stamina for pursuit of knowledge and sciences.

The proof is the wide range of books and writings, which studied for the writing of *Al-Ghadeer*.

With this aim in mind, he sifted through books in Kerbala, Baghdad, Kazmain and Samarra, and in the end traveled to Iran, India, Syria and Turkey for his research, in order to obtain the sources of his subject. Whenever it was possible, he obtained a copy of the book for himself.

Due to his intense love for the world of books and libraries, it is narrated from him that he paid no attention to the discomfort of this intellectual pursuit. So, there was no pleasure in his life except studying and researching. He forsook all pleasures of life for this aim; and did not give priority to his personal health and family life.

It is also narrated about him that so engrossed he was in his pursuit that he did not pay attention to food and personal needs. Many a times his family members had to call him at dinner times and he was found immersed in his books. He did not care if the food went cold or even if he was given the leftovers of the previous day. He did not care what he ate and drank. Even during meals, he was immersed in his thoughts concerned with the topics of his research.

He never relied solely on quotations from written manuscripts of the past scholars. He made it a point to himself go through the source, so that there is no scope of doubt and uncertainty.

Even great scholars do not go to such extent when they are compiling books,

because it is known that source books are dispersed in various libraries around the world. But this was not a big problem for the Shaykh. With this aim he traveled to far off places in order to gain direct access to the books of reference.

Regarding this, it is narrated that he traveled to India and sifted through the books present in the libraries there. He obtained the manuscripts available and referred to the books, whose copies were not available anywhere else.

Incident

Some of his close friends have narrated an incident, which shows his deep efforts in pursuit of knowledge. Its gist is that one day he was weeping, because an important book concerned with his subject was not obtainable.

The Shaykh sought the mediation of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) to help him to obtain the book as it was meant as a reference for his book of *Al-Ghadeer*.

Allamah Amini says: I woke up after a short sleep as someone was knocking at the door and found that it was my neighbor. He said: "I have purchased a new house and shifted my things over there. This book was found in a corner of my house and my wife suggested that I should present it to Allamah Amini."

It was the same manuscript that Allamah Amini had been searching for.

Another story

Another incident narrated by Allamah Amini is as much amazing. Its gist is that the Allamah required the book of *Rabiul Abrar* of Zamakhshari. We should know that before its publication, the manuscripts of this book were very rare and only three manuscripts existed. One of them was with Imam Yahya in Yemen, the second was present in the Zahiriyya Library in Damascus and the third was with a great scholar in Najaf Ashraf. After his passing away, his library, including this book, was inherited by his son.

Allamah Amini went to the house of that scholar and asked his son to lend him the book only for three days, but he declined. Allamah requested him to give it for two days, yet he disagreed. Then he asked for only a day.

Allamah Amini says: I asked him for only three hours, but he still did not agree. I said: "Allow me to sit in your place to study the book there itself." This was also not accepted. In the end the Allamah was completely disappointed.

The Allamah adds:

After that I met a great Maraja scholar, Sayyid Abul Hasan Isfahani and requested him to recommend my case; but the man still refused. Then I came to Shaykh Muhammad Husain Kashiful Ghita, that perhaps he will accept his recommendation, but he continued to decline. I became completely hopeless of getting the book and went for the Ziyarat of the holy tomb of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). I complained about my problem and returned home crestfallen. I fell asleep and saw the Imam in dream and complained to him about the distress I had to

face in obtaining that book.

The Imam said: "The reply to your request is with my son, Husain."

I woke up immediately, performed the ablution and it was dawn. I put on my garments and set out for Kerbala. After prayers, I complained to Imam Husain (a.s.) about the trouble I had gone through in obtaining the book. Then I came out for the Ziyarat of the shrine of His Eminence, Abbas. After the Ziyarat, I petitioned Almighty Allah through the right of Abbas and his brother. I implored Him to help me in this difficulty.

Then I came out in the holy courtyard just as the sun was rising and I sat in one of the halls and began to intone divine utterance.

Suddenly the great orator of Kerbala, Mohsin Abul Hubb came towards me and after asking about my well being invited him to his house near the shrine for breakfast. I accepted his invitation. It was summer.

I seated myself in the place he offered me in his orchard and after sometime, I said: "Please allow me to visit your library." He took me to his library.

I found a large number of fine books in that library. As I was scanning through the books, I noticed the book I was searching for all along. I looked carefully and found that it was indeed the same. I wept in joy.

Shaykh Abul Hubb asked what the matter was. I narrated to him my dream, how Imam (a.s.) had directed me to refer to his son. When Shaykh Mohsin Abul Hubb heard my story, he was also moved.

He said: "This manuscript is very rare and Qasim Muhammad Rajab owner of the Al Musanna Library in Baghdad offered me a thousand dinars¹ for the copy, but I refused."

Then the Shaykh removed his pen and wrote that it was a gift for Allamah Amini and said that it was upon the recommendation of two Imams.

Personal qualities and noble manners

1. The late Allamah Amini dedicated his life for the pursuit of research and writing and a major part of his days was spent in study and research into the records of Islamic heritage, till he became such a point of reference that complex problems related to religion were addressed to him. He became the final authority on history and science of narrators of traditions. He had the final word on this subject for researchers, authors and scholars.
2. He was a religious and pious man. He possessed deep piety and a good behavior. He was a man of pure temperament. He did not harbor suspicion on anyone. He always had a nice expectation from others, even if he had academic differences with them. He possessed great determination and a good nature. He was moderate in food and dress. He paid scant attention to

¹ During that time one thousand dinars was a huge amount and it was possible to buy a house with that money in a good locality.

- the material aspects of life and focused his attention to the hereafter and was always in its pursuit.
3. He was fond of reciting the Quran, supplications and Midnight Prayers and his daily life followed a well organized time table. After the breakfast, he came to his personal library and became engrossed in his studies till his students arrived. Then he started lessons and discussions till noon, when he arose for the Noon Prayer. After the prayer, he ate and rested a little, then returned to his library and stayed there till midnight.
 4. He went for the Ziyarat of the shrine of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) often and regularly went for the Ziyarat of Imam Husain (a.s.) eighty kilometers away. He covered this distance in three days on foot. Throughout the journey, he rendered advices to people, enjoining good and forbidding evil.
 5. Along with these preoccupations, he did not neglect his obligations and assisted the poor and needy. He did good turns with his friends and acquaintances and regarded it as his duty. He dealt with everyone with justice and did not reject the request of anyone. He himself bore many hardships in order to fulfill the requests of others.
 6. He was of tall stature, handsome appearance and a fair complexion inclined to red. His voice was soft and delicate. He dressed in garments of spiritual persons. He wore gold framed glasses. His face was that of those who worship in excess. He was fluent in Arabic, Persian and Turkish.

Travels and travails

In 1380, Allamah Amini traveled to India in order to study the Islamic sources and books present in the libraries there.

With this object in mind, he spent four months going through the books available there. Sometime he spent has days and nights, without experiencing any exhaustion. During this period he was able to derive all the information of the past scholars, without caring for his health and comfort.

He continuously studied the books till the last day of his journey; then he returned to his quarters and studied the manuscripts that he had brought with himself.

In addition to the book and study – and in spite of the advice of the physicians regarding his health and their dissuading him from taking classes and advising him to take care of his health, and not to strain himself – the Shaykh on that continent saw upon himself a great religious responsibility and regarded it obligatory to sit on the pulpit for exhortation, advice and justification for Muslims to call them to Quran and Sunnah and what the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) brought.

With this aim in mind, the late Allamah Amini, traveled to Syria in the year 1384 A.H. and stayed there for four months, during which, he sifted through libraries to glean all information pertaining to the field of his studies. Some of the

libraries where studied manuscripts, are as follows:

Darul Kutubul Wataniyya Zahiriyya, Damascus.

Library of Majmuatul Lughatul Arabiyya. Damascus.

Library of Awaqaful Ahmadiyya in Aleppo.

Maktabal Wataniyya in Aleppo.

Allamah Amini described each book that he studied in these libraries and they are more than two hundred and fifty books.

Then in 1388 A.H. he traveled to study ancient manuscripts in Turkey and procured a large number of books from there regarding Islamic heritage. He remained in that country, in spite of his pain and illness, from which he was suffering since the past year. He paid no heed to his health and physical well being in order to accomplish his aim of compiling *Al-Ghadeer*.

He stayed in Istanbul for fifteen days, then moved to Borsa, where he stayed for ten days and researched through the books present in libraries over there. Some of the libraries he referred there were: Sulaimaniya Library, Library of Jame Ayah Sufiya, Noore Uthmaniya Library, Ughuli Library, Chalbi library etc.

Due to his failing health, he was unable to study all the books that he had planned. He was content only to study fifty-five written manuscripts and historical records as follows: *Saheeh Ibne Habban*, *Saheeh Ibne Khuzaima*, Muhammad bin Ishaq Nishapuri, *Azfa* of Muhammad bin Ismail Bukhari, *Musnad* Abad bin Hamid of Imam Abu Muhammad Abad bin Hamid Kishi, *Al-Mojamul Kabeer* Tibrani, *Najmus Thaqib fee Israqil Manaqib* of Hasan bin Umar bin Habib Halabi, *Al-Kamil* of Hafiz Abdullah Ibne Iddi Jurjani, *Lulu wal Maknoon* of Abdul Ghani Nablus and so on.

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) Library

Allamah Amini was not content only with guiding friends and writing books, he also felt the absence and dire need of a library in the cradle of the Islamic world – that is Najaf Ashraf; therefore he decided to take up the establishment of this library, which would one day, be a kind of second Ghadeer, so that seekers of truth may gather over there, and as far as possible, it should be filled with books, sources and manuscripts.

He initiated the project by purchasing two adjacent houses in the Huwaish locality in Najaf Ashraf and bought up as many houses around them as was possible; so that it may be a preface to the foundation of a grand library worthy of Najaf Ashraf and its fame in the Islamic world, and that an academic center for debate, compilation and research may come into being.

When the first phase of construction was over, he traveled to many countries, especially to Iran to collect important books for the library and equipped it in the best way.

This project was completed after seven years and it was inaugurated on Eid Ghadeer.

Then Allamah Amini accompanied by his son, Shaykh Reza travelled to India to visit the libraries over there, which contained tens of thousands of books. He visited the Aligarh Muslim University library and obtained microfilms of invaluable books. After that he returned.

Then he traveled to Iran and Damascus with the same aim.

Late Allamah Amini had microfilms prepared from the books present there as well.

Writings, compilation and research of the Allamah

Allamah Amini left many important writings on Islamic subjects, which are incomparable in the field. Some of them being:

1. *Shohadul Fazeela*: Published from Najaf Ashraf in 1355 A.H.

This is a book of history and it comprises of the biographies of martyrs from scholars of Islam from 4th century Hijri till the present age. Allamah Amini has included in it more than one hundred and thirty Shia scholar, who were martyred in defense of Islam and Shiaism.

This includes eight martyrs in the 4th century, five in the 5th century, fifteen in the 6th century, four in the 7th century, twelve in the 8th century, one in the ninth century, eighteen in the 10th century, seven in the eleventh century, twenty-two in the 12th century, nineteen in the 13th century and thirteen in the 14th century.

The most prominent scholars mentioned along with their biographies are as follows: Allamah Adeeb Abul Hasan Tahami, famous as Ali bin Muhammad Hasan Amili Shami, Imam Abul Mahasin Ruhayani Tabari, Abu Ali Fattal Nishapuri, Ibne Rawandi Tughrai, Allamah Tabarsi, whose martyrdom is not so well known, because he was poisoned. Shahid Awwal Muhammad bin Makki Amili Nabti Jazaini; he was the first of those, who became famous among the Imamiyah with this title. Ali bin Abul Fazal Halabi, Sayyidul Hukma Abul Maali and Sayyid Fazil Amir Ghayasuddin, Allamah Muhaqqiq Karki, Shahid Thani, Zainuddin bin Ali Amili, Third martyr, Shahabuddin bin Mahmud bin Saeed Tastari Khorasani, Shaykh Jalil Mulla Ahmad, Allamah Qazi Shustari Marashi, Allamah Sayyid Muhammad Momin, Allamah Mudarris Abul Fateh, Faqih Shaykh Muhammad, Allamah Shaykh Muhammad Husain Asim, Allamah Shaykh Fazlullah Ibne Mulla Abbas Noori and tens of other persons, who irrigated the tree of Islam and gave their blood for the religion and people of religion.

2. *Seeratina wa Sunnatina*: He wrote this book in Najaf Ashraf in 1384 A.H. and it was published in Tehran.

It is a collection of the lectures of Allamah Amini, which he delivered in Syria in 1384 A.H. and the book comprises of complete replies to questions posed to him regarding extremism in love for Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and Azadari of Imam Husain (a.s.).

Allamah Amini has replied to allegations that Shia regard Turbah as Sajdagah and he explained that Shia regard prostrating on Turbah as lawful and not obligatory, as they regard prostrating on all parts of lands lawful. They only prefer prostrating on the Turbah, since the son of the daughter of the Prophet was martyred on it and it is a mark of respect for him.

In other words, Allamah Amini implies that this is due to devotion for Imam Husain (a.s.), as he belongs to us and this is Azadari for him, and this Kerbala belongs to him and this is the Turbah, which is the place of our prostration, and the Almighty Allah is our Lord and our Sunnah is same as the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

3. Kamiluz Ziyaraat: This book is authored by Shaykhut Taifah Abul Qasim Ja'far bin Muhammad bin Quluwayh (d. 386), the chains of its narrators are valid and they are narrated extensively (*Mutawatir*) and trustworthy scholars have narrated them through numerous chains from the Holy Imams (a.s.) and its narrators reach almost 600 reliable narrators.

Allamah Amini researched this book and compared and corrected it with reliable sources like *Wasailush Shia* and its *Mustadrak*; *Biharul Anwar* and other reliable books of narrators of traditions.

4. Tafseer Faatehatul Kitab: It was published in Tehran in 1359 A.H.

This is one of the first writings of Allamah Amini and his first step in the world of compilation and research, and perhaps it is the clearest matter that could be derived for the exegesis of the verses of this chapter. Problems related to monotheism, destiny and free will and all important topics are explained through the sayings of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Ahle Bayt (a.s.). Inter alia, in this exegesis, Allamah Amini has hinted at various subjects, like divine qualities, qualities of actions, brief and detailed knowledge, eternal accidental and exigency, providential (*Takweeni*) and legislative (*Tashreei*) and other complex problems of scholasticism were satisfactorily solved for the inquirers.

5. Adabuz Zaair Liman Yaqmul Haair: Published in 1362 A.H. in Najaf Ashraf.

This a brief treatise comprising of the qualities with which the pilgrim of Imam Husain (a.s.) should be imbued and it explains the etiquette of supplication at the tomb of Imam Husain (a.s.) and in the same way, it explains Dua Al-Qama – which consists of very important points regarding mediation of the Almighty Allah and seeking refuge through Him and reliance upon Him.

6. Taaleeq fee Usoolil Fiqha Alaa Kitabur Rasail, by Shaykh Ansari: This is a manuscript.

7. Al-Maqasidul Aliyya fil Matalibul Sunniya: This is also a manuscript and it comprises of exegesis of verses of the Holy Quran.

8. Riyazul Uns: In two volumes; it is also in manuscript form.

9. Rijaal Azerbaijan: It is in manuscript form.

10. *Samaraatul Asfaar*: It is in manuscript form.

11. *Al Itratut Taahera fil Kitabal Azeez*.

12. *Al-Ghadeer*, which is the fruit of fifty years of the life of Allamah Amini.

Children

From his first wife, Allamah Amini had, in addition to daughters, three sons as follows: Dr. Shaykh Muhammad Hadi Amini, who is mostly busy in research and writing works.

Secondly, his son, Hujjatul Islam wal Muslimeen, Shaykh Reza Amini, who always accompanied his father everywhere, including his travels to India, Syria and Turkey etc.

As for his third son, it is the late Sadiq Amini. He was among the most ardent supporters of the Shia of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

As for his children through his second, Alawite wife, the daughter of Sayyid Ali Khalkhali, they are as follows:

Shaykh Ahmad, Shaykh Muhammad Amini and so on.

Death and Burial

After a prolonged and troublesome malady, which doctors were helpless to cure, and which continued for a long time, and due to that illness, the Allamah spent time between his house and hospital, he passed away before Zuhr on Friday in Tehran, 28th Rabius Thani, 1390 A.H. corresponding to 1349, 12 Teer, and the last words that he uttered was the following supplication:

“O Allah, these are the throes of death, which appeared in me. So, turn to me with Your kindly face and help me upon myself as You render help to the righteous on their selves...”

After this, he passed away. His body was shifted to Najaf Ashraf to be buried at the place he had chosen near Ameerul Momineen Library.

He passed away when his heart was imbued with sincere devotion to Ahle Bayt (a.s.). May Allah bestow their intercession to him and be pleased with him. Indeed, the Almighty Allah is the guardian of every believer in this world and the hereafter.

Second Discussion – A Glance at the magnum opus, Al-Ghadeer

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) passed away on Monday, the 28th of Safar, in the year 10 A.H. and three days later, his body was buried in the dead of the night. According to historical reports, during those three days, the grave digger, Abu Ubaidah, with the help of a broker of quadrupeds, dared to appoint a person as the Caliph of Muslims upon the pretext that he was the eldest of all.

That night when the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) was buried, people were in deep sleep due to fatigue; and the daughter of Prophet sat at the grave of her father, with her two sons, repeating the lines:

“O father, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), what all my husband had to bear at the hands of so and so.”

People were exhausted. It is three days since they had been lamenting. It is three days since they surrendered their hands and legs to the opponents. Neither their legs helped them nor their hands have any strength to make a grave for a departed one.

Even Abu Bakr and Umar did not get time to attend the burial of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). People had filled the mouths of the opponents of the Caliph with so much dirt that there was no need for them to lament about dropping soil on the grave of the Prophet. So much had the larynxes screamed about killing the opponents, that they did not have further need to recite dirges for the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

Bodies are tired and eyes are congealed from the smoke of the fire of the house. O diggers, who are digging the grave of the Prophet, be quiet! Be quiet as the daughter of the Caliph – under the shade of the Caliphate of her father – is in sleep of coyness. O diggers, don’t make any noise, as the people are asleep, and tomorrow and after that they shall have many preoccupations.

Tomorrow is the day of plundering the property of people. Tomorrow in prayers, the Caliph has planned assassination with Khalid. Tomorrow on the pulpit of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) will he innovate the practice of misbehaving with ladies of the Prophet. Tomorrow Baqi will witness another nocturnal burial. Tomorrow apology would be demanded from Fatima.

From tomorrow, no one will have the right to name their sons as Muhammad or to narrate traditions from Muhammad (s.a.w.a.).

Tomorrow the tree of Rizwan would have to be uprooted, which was a reminder of allegiance of the people to Prophet.

Tomorrow Malik bin Nuwairah would have to be beheaded and his wife would have to be raped.

Tomorrow the dogs of Hawwab would bark at a camel.¹

Tomorrow Ali would have to be attacked with the sword of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*).

Tomorrow Hasan (a.s.) would be injured by the dagger of malicious poison.

Tomorrow the grandson of the Prophet will be deserted with his liver in shreds.

Tomorrow the severed head of Imam Husain (a.s.) would be placed in a gold

¹ The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said to Ayesha: “O Ayesha, a day will come when the dogs of Hawwab will bark on you and you will fight against Ali, and usurp his right.”

pail and would be knocked by the stick of the Caliph.

Tomorrow is autumn of the garden of the Prophet.

Tomorrow would belong to the Khalids and Marwans.

Tomorrow begins the period of ascendancy of the accursed (family) tree and the sons of the freed slaves.

From tomorrow would begin the killings of people like Hujr bin Adi and Muhammad bin Abi Bakr.

Tomorrow the teeth of Abdullah bin Masuds would be broken up.

Tomorrow is the day of preparation of Rabdhas.

From tomorrow, people like Ammaar would have to be kicked and beaten up.

Tomorrow Kufa Masjid would be piled with severed hands.

Tomorrow 500 dirhams would be paid from the Governor's Palace for every severed head.

Tomorrow the tortured body of Mitham would be crucified on a date palm.

Tomorrow the severed head of Zaid would be fixed near the tomb of the Prophet.

Tomorrow the headless torso of Yahya would be hung for six years.

Tomorrow is the tomorrow of the strangeness of the religion of Prophet.

From tomorrow, Walids would lead the congregational prayer intoxicated.

From tomorrow, fellows like Mughira bin Shoba would fornicate and then prostrate in prayer niches to make a show of piety.

Tomorrow is the day for the search of fiction makers.

Tomorrow, Muawiyah would invite fabricators of reports to his Green Palace.

Tomorrow, the Caliph would swear that he would also bury the name of the Prophet.

Ghadeer is the history of these morrows.

Ghadeer is an evocative narrative of tragedies in Islamic history.

Ghadeer is the complain of one, who has a thorn on his eye and a bone struck in his throat.

Ghadeer is much above the fabricated reports in Islam.

And such years would follow one another...and the passage of time would repeatedly get Yazidite, Muawiyah and Saqifaii Caliphs, and they would issue whatever orders they like on religion, human beings and wealth.

Muawiyah died and went away, but his practices of nominating successor remained in his descendants from the accursed tree and those who came after that also continued this practice.

Also, a long time would pass after the events of Saqifah, but same practice of harassing opponents and use of force continues in the political fields.

During these hard years...in order to make un-Islamic politics gain prominence; policies which have no basis at all, except personal desires of individuals, and worldly greed.

They made the noble practice of the Prophet (*Sunnah*) as a target and on this basis, created heresies and initiated the mischief of fabrication of traditions and reports and all the people, due to greed, foolishness or fear, accepted them.

A generation passed and then another generation...and Muslims arrived, who had not witnessed those incidents; on the contrary they only heard about these events through reporters, and flattering scholars testified to their authenticity and which were read out in the presence of the Caliph (called as chief of believers!); that is why they regarded those reports as religious principles issued by the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). And generations grew up on this custom and with this thinking.

Such events, in which truth and falsehood becomes doubtful for ordinary and simple minded people and for whoever that came under the shade of 'the chief of believers'!

After a passage of time, Muhammad bin Ismail, Muslim bin Hajjaj and others like them arrived and came across common people and court scholars, who were under the control of 'the chief of believers'; they were narrating traditions, in which the good were mixed with the bad and the authentic with inauthentic and all of them being regarded as the practice (*Sunnah*) of the Prophet!

On the contrary, they even regarded as authentic, traditions that were fabricated to please the Caliph. After that generations arrived who regarded them as religion and other than them were labeled as heresies, whose owners should be declared apostates.

To prevent such calamities, confusion and innovations, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) stood up on the day of Ghadeer and announced the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali (a.s.).

To achieve this, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) made the people stand in the scorching noon and when the earth was burning their feet, so that Muslims may not get burnt in the fire of disunity and controversy and their back may not be lashed by the 'chiefs of believers' for centuries; because the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was seeing – through the eyes of the heart, if we don't say the eyes of head – all that was going to befall upon his Ummah and his Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and near kindred.

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) repeatedly warned people against disunity and disputes; and clearly announced what he was commanded to.

But after his passing away, when the personal lusts and greeds saw the opportunity, they began to grow up again in the selves, whom the Last Prophet had not been able to polish and who were not completely free of Ignorance,

began to turn back to Ignorance.

If you call a living man, you would definitely make him understand, but...

Yes, the coming generations imitate the former generations...and the facts become blurred and with the coming of persons with diseased thinking and breasts filled with malice and more than everything, ignorance and blind-heartedness, the facts gradually disappeared.

Circles of falsehood and deceit connected Ibne Kathir to Ibne Taymiyyah to Qaseemi to Muhammad Thabit Misri to Moosa, author of *Washiya* and their compatriots.

When Allamah Amini, who was concerned for Muslim unity, saw that they were sunk into mud and slime and caught up in the whirlpool of false and invalid statements, and they had made the people negligent and inverted the reality for them, he decided to save them from this whirlpool of ignorance and to throw light on the facts; so that truth and reality becomes clear to people, including the scholars and that they can distinguish the facts from fiction and the truth from falsehood for those who can see.

After writing the book of *Shohadaul Fazila*, he wrote *Al-Ghadeer*, to write which, he dedicated his whole life, like a solid rock, against which doubts strike to be broken up; and it became a mountain on whose fort truth shines. And *Al-Ghadeer* is a destroying refutation and will blacken the face of every sinful liar.

Yes, *Al-Ghadeer* is the running spring, which quenches those thirsty for truth; it is a school, which teaches different sciences and arts; on the contrary, it is a university, in which the lesson of unity is taught and Muslims develop attachment to each others.

This is the valuable book of *Al-Ghadeer*, from which a selection is presented to you.

We will mention four important points regarding the book of *Al-Ghadeer*:

Topic One: Aim of writing *Al-Ghadeer*

The secret of supremacy of Muslims was in abstaining from disunity and the basis of their success becomes clear in being attached to the rope of Allah.

وَاعْتَصِمُوا بِحَبْلِ اللَّهِ جَمِيعًا وَلَا تَفَرَّقُوا

“And hold fast by the covenant of Allah all together and be not disunited.”¹

As some Ahle Sunnat scholars² have narrated: that rope of Allah mentioned in the verse is the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). Shafei, the Imam of the Shafeis, has mentioned this in his couplets and explained that rope of Allah is the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ahle Bayt (a.s.):

¹ Surah Aale Imran 3:103

² *Shawahidut Tanzil*, Vol. 1, Pg. 130 and 169.

1. “When I saw that the religion of people was in the ocean of deviation and ignorance, I boarded the ship of salvation of the Ahle Bayt of the Prophet and held to the rope of Allah as we are ordered to remain attached to the rope of Allah.”¹

Hakeem Haskani, who was prominent scholar of Hanafi school, in his book of *Shawahidut Tanzil*, has dedicated a separate section to this topic and quoted traditions in the exegesis of these verses. Among the traditional reports he has quoted from Abdullah Ibne Umar is the Hadees Qudsi: “Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) is My fort. One who enters My fort is secure from My chastisement.”²

The late Allamah Amini, for the exaltation of Islam, called the believers in this upright religion to the rope of Allah and began the book of *Al-Ghadeer* with the tradition: “The title of the scroll of the believer is love for Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”³

Seekers of material wealth and power, after the passing away of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) - even though during the lifetime of the Prophet, they had paid allegiance to Ali (a.s.) as the successor of Prophet – left this divine rope and became followers of the path of disunity and discord among Muslims.

After that through the wealth of Muawiyah and his like, with their own hands, they wrote the life history of the Prophet and distorted the Sunnah of Prophet; traditions were fabricated in praise of the Caliphs and numerous reports, especially on the subject of Caliphate were falsely attributed to the Prophet.

Following the fabrication of traditions and divine commands, numerous books were compiled on traditions, history, exegesis, jurisprudence etc., largely based on these fabricated reports. By and by schools, founded during the period of early Caliphs, appeared one after another and Muslims were gradually divided into sects.

The path for creating a new unity among Muslims – that is the same unity and consensus which existed during the period of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is only possible through careful discernment of the mentioned incidents and obtaining these facts requires an extensive efforts, so that through research and investigation, they may hunt for the pearls of reality in the boundless sea of books. That is why the late Allamah himself says that the book of Ghadeer is an effort to expose the reality.

It is mentioned in the introduction of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) Library, founded by the Allamah that: Islamic unity should on the basis of expression of facts in the Ummah (facts of Quran and Sunnah of the Prophet) and not political unity, which the imperialists raise through their agents and when they obtain their

¹ Rashfatas Saadi, 24; Al-Ghadeer, 2:423.

² *Shawahidut Tanzil*, Vol. 1, Pg. 131 and 170.

³ Al-Jaame' al-Sagheer, Suyuti, 2:182; Kanzul Ummaal, 11:601; Tareekh Medinatul Damishq, Ibne Asakir, 5:230; Yanabiul Mawaddah, Qunduzi, 1:272.

objective they pit them against each other.

Topic Two: Sources of Allamah's research

A period of around fifty-five years went into the writing of the book of *Al-Ghadeer*. This book and its author became so famous that no one is ignorant about them.

This book comprises of 20 volumes in Arabic¹ with a very solid prose and literary writing. So far only eleven volumes from it are printed. Ayatullah al-Uzma Sayyid Mohsin al-Hakeem and Ayatullah Sayyid Husain al-Hamami have said regarding this book:

لَا يَأْتِيهَا الْبَاطُلُ مِنْ بَيْنِ يَدَيْهِ

“Falsehood shall not come to it from before it.”²

The great Ayatullah Sayyid Abdul Hadi Shiraz, Shaykh Muhammad Reza Aale Yasin and Allamah Urdubadi have said:

لَا رَيْبٌ فِيهِ هُدًى لِلْمُتَّقِينَ ⑦

“There is no doubt in it, is a guide to those who guard (against evil).”³

In spite of the fact that points mentioned in *Al-Ghadeer* are not pleasing to the taste of many, since they are based on reliable sources and references, and till now, that is fifty-five years have passed since it was written, but so far, no one and no group has been able to write the rebuttal of *Al-Ghadeer*, or even a critique of a page of it.

Late Allamah Amini himself said: I fully read ten thousand books - many of them multi-volume - from the beginning to the end and I constantly referred to around a hundred thousand books.

Sources, on which the points mentioned in book of *Al-Ghadeer* are based, are all from books of Ahle Sunnat. This does not mean that Ahle Sunnat books were reliable in the view of Allamah Amini and the books of Shia were not reliable in his view.

One of the elemental basis of logic is to argue through the established principles of the opponent. The late Allamah has followed this same logical principle and based all the points on the established principles of Ahle Sunnat and he himself says:

“The points mentioned in *Al-Ghadeer* are not sectarian, they are Islamic; that is not limited to points in which only the Shia believe; on the contrary, they

¹ It is mentioned in the daily Irani Risalat in issue no. 3825 dated 17 Zilhajj 1419 A.H. that the Iranian historian, Rasul Ja'fariyan has stated that Allamah Amini wrote *Al-Ghadeer* comprising of 20 volumes.

² Surah Fussilat 41:42

³ Surah Baqarah 2:2

are points on which all schools of Islam have consensus.”

He also says:

“During debate with Ahle Sunnat, Shia argue through Ahle Sunnat traditions as their traditions are acceptable to them (Ahle Sunnat); otherwise Shia do not have any need for their traditions. It is also an established and reliable style of debate and not a style followed by Ahle Sunnat: because all the time, they reason through traditions and important books of their own sect; whereas such reasoning is beyond the pale of the rules of debate and discussion.”

Some have a false notion of Ghadeer and they think that it causes dispute among Islamic sects. Those, who have this notion, not only have they studied Ghadeer, on the contrary they are ignorant of the influence of Ghadeer in Islamic countries.

Firstly, one who reads *Al-Ghadeer*, will realize that the author is having healthy intention and his aim was only to compile history of Islam.

Secondly, the matter of Ghadeer is not only the personal view of Allamah Amini and extensive sources, which are hinted at in *Al-Ghadeer*, support this claim. Approximately, it can be said that not a single sentence is mentioned in *Al-Ghadeer*, without reasoning and without reference.

Therefore, if someone claims that the book can cause disunity, we would have to accept that all books, in which Ghadeer is mentioned, are roots of this cause. And we know that sources of Ghadeer comprise primary non-Shia Islamic sources including the six most authentic books (*Sihah Sitta*) of Ahle Sunnat.

Thirdly, after the publication of *Al-Ghadeer*, numerous articles appeared in the journals of Egypt, Syria and Iraq etc. extolling this book and a flood of appreciative letters started from all Islamic countries.

Most letter writers were important Ahle Sunnat scholars, who had obtained this book from rulers and ministers of Islamic countries so that Friday prayer leaders, congregation leaders and university teachers may write commendations and appreciate the value of the efforts invested by the author. Around fifty samples of such letters are mentioned in the introduction to the new edition of *Al-Ghadeer*.¹

These letters and articles show that *Al-Ghadeer* is a book, on the authentic matter of which, all Muslims sects have consensus.

Topic Three: Distinctions of Al-Ghadeer

1. Compilation of discussion in the style of argumentation; that is to defeat the opponent through their own beliefs.
2. It shows as authentic all challenges and points mentioned in the field of debate.

¹ Refer: Volume I, Preface, which is recently published by Maususa Sairatul Marif Fiqh Islami, under the aegis of Ayatullah Shahroodi Hashemi.

3. Use of very inimitable prose in all discussions, which is at the same time fluent and eloquent.
4. Use of Arabic language idioms throughout the book.
5. Quoting verses of Quran at the end of each discussion or within the discussion.
6. Discussions regarding numerous fundamental issues in different spheres: Traditions, history, beliefs, morals, jurisprudence, science of narrators etc. By way of example we mention below some discussions on various subjects mentioned in *Al-Ghadeer*:

Discussions

Traditional discussions

1. Regarding fabrication of traditions.
2. Traditions falsely attributed to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
3. Traditions fabricated regarding Caliphate.

Historical discussions

1. Regarding Muawiyah and nomination of Yazid through him.
2. Regarding the uprising of Imam Husain (a.s.).
3. Killing of Uthman.

Religious discussions

1. Refutation of the belief of the infallibility of the Ummah.
2. The Imams being *Muhaddath*.¹
3. Knowledge of the infallible Imams about the unseen.
4. Belief of Shia regarding Caliphate.
5. The discussion that Imamate is from the roots of religion.
6. Meaning of negation of qualities.
7. Discussion that Quran is created.
8. Regarding refutation of the belief that people will be able to see God in the hereafter.
9. Explanation that *Tawassul* (seeking mediation) is not contradictory to monotheism (*Tauheed*).
10. Regarding the creation of the action of people.
11. Regarding predestination.

Ethical discussions

1. Moral and ethical lessons – faith in the body of man like laws of kingdoms

¹ To whom the angels speak.

- formed through particular persons.
2. Meaning of modesty.

Jurisprudential discussions

1. Regarding Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*).
2. Hajj-e-Tamatto.
3. Discussion regarding music.
4. Regarding prayers during journey.
5. Regarding the dress of ladies.
6. Regarding three divorces.
7. Regarding lawfulness of excessive worship.
8. Regarding the respect of Masjids.
9. Regarding the unlawfulness of shaving the beard.

Discussions about tradition narrators

A gallery of fabricators of traditions.

Linguistic discussions

It comprises of discussion that the maternal grandson of man is his son only.

Topic Four: Mastership (Wilayat) in Ghadeer

It is possible to divide the gist of all discussions of *Al-Ghadeer* into two topics:

First: Evidences of the absolute Mastership (*Wilayat*) of the Holy Imams (a.s.) through the evidence of immediate Caliphate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) after the passing away of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

Second: Negation of Mastership (*Wilayat*) of non-infallible in Islam and investigation of false traditions in favor of authority of fallible leaders.

In his discussion entitled: ‘Caliphate in our view is a divine matter,’ the late Allamah says:

“In view of Shia, it is not allowed for people to choose an Imam; even ‘the people of the say’ cannot choose an Imam, because reason dictates that imam should have some important qualities and conditions, including infallibility, piety, spirituality and a pure nature.”

In this discussion, the Allamah points out that appointment of an infallible Imam to whom general and absolute mastership of the Islamic society can be entrusted, can only be from Almighty Allah and people have no right of choosing an Imam.

Regarding the permanent rule of such selections, the late Allamah says: So numerous are the sanctities, which were trespassed through such selections; and so many rights were usurped because of it.

In these selections, public exigencies were trampled upon; proper rules, which should make the world tread the right path, were distorted and led the world into destruction. It was the basis of conspiracy, and the doors of peace and amity among the people were closed, and as a result of internal battles, innocent blood was shed; and the foundation and structure of correct Islam became weak, and disconnected from each other...in other words, as a result of selection of people, misfortunes and tragedies came into being and took the matter to such a point that debased persons like that cloth seller without personality, and that cattle broker, whom the trading in market had kept busy, and that cloth-dealer, who imposed his brothers and relatives on the people, and that grave-digger, who could not differentiate between his breadth and length, and that freshly released prisoner and the irreligious cheat, and that excessive imbibing of wine, and that careless greedy disturbance creator, all focused their sights on the rulership of Muslims, yes, these were the ones, who regarded the servants of God to be their slaves and the funds of the Public Treasury as their personal property and the book of God (Quran) as a means of deceit and cheating and the religion of God as the document of their destruction.

Belief of Shia Imamiyah regarding Caliphate

Our belief regarding Caliphate is that it is a God-given authority, like prophethood; although only a prophet can receive divine revelation of prophethood; and the functions of the Caliph are as follows: propagation and explanation, providing details of the brief and exegesis of difficult issues; application of words to the implications and details; and to fight on the interpretation of Quran¹ in the same way as the Prophet fought on the basis of revelation of Quran

It is an expression of what the Prophet was unable to introduce or the time for which had not been ripe to act on it, or the people did not have the capacity to bear it, or other causes; thus all those, who are appointed as prophets or caliphs from Almighty Allah, it is a divine grace for them and it is their function to make people proximate to obedience and remove them from disobedience as it is obligatory on Allah to make this appointment.

That is why He created them and called them to His worship and obedience and He taught them what they did not know and did not leave the human beings free like cattle so that they may eat and enjoy and remain engrossed in pleasures.

On the contrary, He created them so that they may recognize Him and He

¹ The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) introduced Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in this way and said: "Among you is there is one, who would fight for the interpretation of Quran just I fought for its revelation." Abu Bakr asked: "O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), am I the one, who would do that?" He replied: "No." Umar asked: "Am I that person?" He replied: "No, but the one mending my sandals." And he had given his sandals to Ali for mending.

Some Huffaz have narrated this traditional report and Hakeem, Zahabi [in *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3/132, H. 4621 and in the same way, in its *Talkhis*] and Haithami [in *Majmauz Zawaad*, 9/133] have regarded it as authentic.

gave them capacity to achieve His pleasure. He also made this easy for them through sending of prophets and revealing scriptures in every period of time.

Since every prophet does not have a lifespan as long as the tenure of the world and they are not supposed to live forever, and the religious codes of laws (*Shariat*) have capacities to last longer; thus, whenever a prophet passed away, his *Shariat* remained valid for a time; after which it was necessary to repeal it through introduction of a new *Shariat*. As there would be laws, which have not been announced even though they were framed; or there are some laws the time to act upon which has not arrived; and new laws.

In such circumstances, it is not logical that the Ummah should be left without a guardian, because all the people are included in divine grace, which is obligatory on God and is same for all. Hence, it is obligatory for Him to appoint someone to safeguard the religion; that he may take religion to perfection, remove doubts of disbelievers through evidence and remove darkness of ignorance and prevent attacks of the enemy and with his hand and tongue, he should cure deviations and weakness.

When Almighty Allah has concern for the creatures and regards it obligatory to do good to them, He has to select leaders for them to bear this important function and perform all these duties. He should act like a prophet, whose successor he is and in whose words, his successorship was announced. Therefore, the Almighty Allah cannot leave the people to their devices, without appointing a successor of the prophet, leaving the people in lurch.

Did Abdullah bin Umar not say to his father (Umar):

“People ask that will you not appoint anyone as Caliph after you? Now, if you had some quadrupeds or cattle, would you have left them to their devices? If you did that it would be said that you were neglectful. Whereas the matter of leadership of people is more important than cattle and camels. What justification would you offer to the Almighty Allah if you meet Him, without having appointed anyone as Caliph?”¹

Ayesha said to Ibne Umar: “O son of my near kindred, convey my greetings and tell him not to leave the Ummah of Muhammad without a guardian. Appoint a Caliph for them and not to desert them after him, as I fear mischief for them.”²

And this is Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan, who in appointing Yazid as Caliph, relied on this logical command completely and said: “I fear leaving the Ummah of Muhammad after me like a herd of cattle, without a shepherd.”³

Alas, if I only knew how the Prophet became neglectful of appointing a Caliph?! And how they blame the Prophet for this mistake?!

Entrusting this matter (appointment of Caliph) to members of public or to

¹ *Sonan Baihagi*, 8:149, quoting from *Saheeh Muslim*, 102:4, Tradition: 12, *Kitabul Imarah*.

² *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:22 [28/1].

³ *Tareekh Tabari*, 6:170 [5:304, Events of 56 A.H.]; *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:151 [159:1].

influential persons is not allowed, because common sense regards some conditions to be necessary in the Imam and some of them are personal and concealed and only the Knower of unseen is aware of them: like infallibility, divinity of soul and purity of self, so that he may ward off selfish desires; and knowledge; that he may not be misguided in any command, and other qualities, which are presented to the self and soul, and only its external parts become apparent.

وَرَبُّكَ يَعْلَمُ مَا تُكِنُ صُدُورُهُمْ وَمَا يُعْلِمُونَ ﴿٤﴾

“And your Lord knows what their breasts conceal and what they manifest.”¹

اللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ حِينَ يَجْعَلُ رِسَالَةً

“Allah best knows where He places His message.”²

Thus, the Ummah, which has no unseen knowledge, cannot distinguish who is imbued with these qualities. People cannot differentiate good from evil.

When a prophet like Moosa chose seventy persons from thousands of his followers and before them asked Almighty Allah to manifest Himself, how ordinary people can select a person like that and how they could assure that they would not select a transgressor, or a deviated person?

Or that they gather at the door of anyone, who does not intend the well being of the Ummah, on the contrary he is in pursuit of personal profit. Or that they select an ignorant person, so that the laws are lost that he commits great mistakes, and that he commits crimes and sins due to his ignorance. Or that he knows, but he does not have the least hesitation in lying or issuing deceptive commands; and in this way they will deviate from all the paths of reformation and fall into corruption.

Since they would be unaware, they would fall into destruction, as is the example of their allegiance to Muawiyah, Yazid and the Umayyad Caliphs.

Since Almighty Allah does not like these circumstances to befall the people, it is obligatory that He should not leave this matter to discretion of people so that they create injustice and ignorance.³

أَلَا يَعْلَمُ مَنْ خَلَقَ طَوْهُ اللَّطِيفُ الْخَبِيرُ ﴿١٣﴾

“Does He not know, Who created? And He is the Knower of the subtleties, the Aware.”⁴

¹ Surah Qasas 28:69

² Surah Anaam 6:124

³ Surah Ahzab 33:72.

⁴ Surah Mulk 67:14

وَرَبُّكَ يَخْلُقُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَيَخْتَارُ مَا كَانَ لَهُمْ أَخْيَرَةٌ

“And your Lord creates and chooses whom He pleases; to choose is not theirs.”¹

وَمَا كَانَ لِمُؤْمِنٍ وَّلَا مُؤْمِنَةٍ إِذَا قَضَى اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ أَمْرًا أَن يَكُونَ لَهُمْ أَخْيَرَةٌ
مِّنْ أَمْرِهِمْ وَمَنْ يَعْصِ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ فَقَدْ ضَلَّ ضَلَالًا مُّبِينًا²

“And it behoves not a believing man and a believing woman that they should have any choice in their matter when Allah and His Apostle have decided a matter; and whoever disobeys Allah and His Apostle, he surely strays off a manifest straying.”²

And since the first day, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) informed about this matter, when he mentioned his call to the clans and invited the Bani Aamir bin Saasa tribe to Almighty Allah and one of them asked:

“If we follow you and Almighty Allah makes you victorious over opponents, would rulership be there for us after you?”

The Prophet replied: “This matter is with the Almighty Allah and He places it wherever He wants.”³

How is it possible that people in this matter (in selecting a Caliph) should have discretion, inspite of excessiveness, vested interests, claims and inclinations, and desires regarding selection and in spite of differences, varying beliefs in analysis of capacities of people of the society and prominent personalities and in spite of numerous groups and sects and communities and different tribes, and in spite of social differences and tribes and clans which are present in the human society?

And the selection from the first day gave birth to enmity, conflict, injuries, anger and fury, plea and requests and severe enmity, and by this selection, how many sanctities are trespassed, rights are invalidated and righteous and learned persons are trampled upon and harmony and unity is destroyed; and safety and comfort are changed into distress and anxiety and pure blood is spilt on the earth and the structure of the right Islam is destroyed.

Some people vied for Caliphate, whereas they had no share and capability for it, except that they was busy selling cloth in the market, acting as brokers or spinning cloth and they were imposed as rulers on the people, or one who dug graves, while he was even unaware of its length and breadth, or a slave freed by

¹ Surah Qasas 28:68

² Surah Ahzab 33:36

³ *Seerah Ibne Hisham*, 2:32 [66/2]; *Al Rauzal Unuf* 1:264 [39-38:4]; *Bahjatul Mahafil*, Imaduddin Aamiri, 1:138; *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 2-3; *Seerah Zaini Dahlan*, 1-302 [1/147]; Marginal notes in the book of *Seerah Halabiyya*, *Hayat Muhammad*, Haikal, 152 [Pg. 201-202].

unjust or usurper, or one, who was always intoxicated, or a shameless man, who did whatever he liked. And mischief making persons, who enslaved people and gifted the funds of Almighty Allah to each other and misused the Book of Allah, and turned the religion of God upside down.

Conclusion

The conclusion of this discourse is that the Caliph should be superior to the creatures (he should be the best of men), because if during that time, there is someone who is equal or superior to him, he would be eligible for Caliphate, without any doubt.

If the imam is deficient in one of the qualities, in instances in which his knowledge is deficient and his insight regarding it, is less, it only can be removed through the two ways:

He can deliver a verdict without knowledge and offer a view without proof, or ask someone to bring him to the right path. The first path is a source of corruption and weakness, and the second path is source of decline of his status; when the imam is supposed to be obeyed like the Prophet.

وَمَا أَرْسَلْنَا مِنْ رَّسُولٍ إِلَّا لِيَطَّاعَ بِإِذْنِ اللَّهِ

“And We did not send any apostle but that he should be obeyed by Allah’s permission.”¹

In the Holy Quran, obedience of the imam is regarded at par with obedience of God and the Prophet.

أَطِيعُوا اللَّهَ وَأَطِيعُوا الرَّسُولَ وَأُولَئِكَ الْمُرْسَلُونَ

“Obey Allah and obey the Apostle and those in authority from among you.”²

So that He may give him power to establish divine limits and destroy falsehoods. And how often if the source of establishment of religion and its elder, who calls people to religion, is unable to remove doubts from it, those doubts fall on the call of the Prophet and the reality of religion. And all of them demand that the imam should be perfect in all qualities and should have precedence on all people:

قُلْ هَلْ يَسْتَوِي الَّذِينَ يَعْلَمُونَ وَالَّذِينَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ

“Say: Are those who know and those who do not know alike?”³

قُلْ هَلْ يَسْتَوِي الْأَعْمَى وَالْبَصِيرُ إِنَّمَا هَلْ تَسْتَوِي الظُّلْمِنْتُ وَالنُّورُ

“Say: Are the blind and the seeing alike? Or can the darkness

¹ Surah Nisa 4:64

² Surah Nisa 4:59

³ Surah Zumar 39:9

and the light be equal?”¹

قُلْ هُلْ مِنْ شَرِّ كَلِمَاتٍ مَّنْ يَهْدِي مَنْ إِلَى الْحَقِّ طَقْلِ اللَّهُ يَهْدِي بَنِي الْلَّهِ قَلْمَانْ يَهْدِي إِلَى الْحَقِّ أَحَقُّ أَنْ يُتَّبَعَ أَمْ أَنْ لَا يَهْدِي إِلَّا أَنْ لَا يَهْدِي فَمَا لَكُمْ قَلْمَانْ كَيْفَ تَحْكُمُونَ ⑤

“Is He then Who guides to the truth more worthy to be followed, or he who himself does not go aright unless he is guided? What then is the matter with you; how do you judge?”²

With attention to this explanation, we present in brief, excellences of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and defects of their enemies, which are explained in the book of *Al-Ghadeer*.

As for excellence in the book of *Al-Ghadeer*: the excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) generally; and excellence of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) and Imams Hasan and Husain (a.s.) are especially mentioned although the actual topic of the book is explanation of excellences of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and evidences of his immediate Caliphate.

Excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.)

As for the excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.):

1. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“The act of any person is not having any benefit, except that he acknowledges their rights.”

2. It is mentioned in reliable traditional reports that Almighty Allah has commanded invoking blessings on Ahle Bayt (a.s.) during Prayer.

3. Tradition of the Cloak (*Hadees Kisa*) is an authentic and widely narrated tradition, on which there is general consensus.

4. According to the command of the verse:

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوَدَّةُ فِي الْقُرْبَانِ

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives.”³

...love towards them is obligatory.

5. In the verse of:

إِهْدِنَا الصِّرَاطَ الْمُسْتَقِيمَ ⑤

¹ Surah Raad 13:16

² Surah Yunus 10:35

³ Surah Shura 42:23

“Keep us on the right path.”¹

‘The right path’ implies the path of Muhammad and Aale Muhammad (a.s.).

6. Names of Fatima, her father, her husband and her sons are inscribed under the shade of the divine throne (*Arsh*) and at the gate of Paradise.

7. The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

“Recognition of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) is immunity from Hellfire; and love of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) is the permit on the Siraat Bridge; and Mastership (Wilayat) of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) is assurance from divine chastisement.”

8. And he said:

“None would love them, except the righteous and none would be inimical to them, except of illegitimate birth.”

9. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“These two: Quran and Progeny will not separate from each other, till they arrive to me at the Pool.”

10. And he says:

“I and my Ahle Bayt (a.s.) are like the Ark of Nuh, whoever boards it, is saved and one, who refrains from it, is drowned.”

11. And he said:

“I am the tree and Fatima is its branch, Ali is its trunk, Hasan and Husain are its fruits; and our Shia are its leaves.”

12. The following verse of Surah Dahr was revealed about them:

وَيُظْعَمُونَ الظَّعَامَ عَلَى حُبَّهِ مُسْكِنًا وَبَيْتِهِ وَآسِيرًا

“And they give food out of love for Him to the poor and the orphan and the captive.”²

13. Their names are derived from the names of the Almighty Allah.

14. The Almighty Allah has some angels, who roam the earth and they are appointed to help the Aale Muhammad (a.s.).

15. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) had fixed a tent and was leaning at its entrance. Present in that tent were Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain. He said:

“O Muslims, I am at peace with those, who are at peace with the occupants of this tent and I am at war with those, who are at war with them.”

16. All purified Imams and Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) were *Muhaddath*.³

¹ Surah Fatiha 1:6

² Surah Insan 76:8

³ A person with whom the angels speak.

17. They are aware of the unseen.

Excellence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

1. Ali (a.s.) is the most learned of the people after the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). And no verse was revealed, except that he knew in which regard it was revealed and regarding whom it was revealed.

2. Numerous verses regarding him were revealed.

3. And the tradition of the clansmen:

وَأَنذِرْ عَشِيرَتَكَ الْأَقْرَبِينَ ﴿١١﴾

“And warn your nearest relations,”¹

It is mentioned that it was regarding them.

4. The verse:

وَالسَّبِقُونَ السَّبِقُونَ ۚ أُولَئِكَ الْمُقْرَبُونَ ﴿١٢﴾

“And the foremost are the foremost, these are they who are drawn nigh (to Allah),”²

...was revealed about Ali (a.s.).

5. Almighty Allah himself selected Lady Fatima (s.a.) for her marriage to Imam Ali (a.s.) and He was her guardian and Jibreel recited the marriage sermon.

6. Dispensing of drinks from the Pool of Kauthar are with Ali (a.s.) and he will give drinks to his friends and followers and he would drive away the hypocrites and infidels.

7. The statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that no one will cross the Siraat Bridge, except one for whom Ali writes the permit.

8. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) mentioned him to be the most superior of his Ummah, from the aspect of forbearance and the best of them from the aspect of nature.

9. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that Ali is the best of men, and one, who denies this is like a disbeliever.

10. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that Ali is from me and I am from him; and after me, he is the guardian of every believer.

11. Ali is with truth and the truth is with Ali. Wherever Ali turns, the truth turns in that same direction.

12. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that no one is inimical to Ali, except that Satan has shared and his seed.

¹ Surah Shoara 26:214

² Surah Waqiyah 56:10-11

13. None, but an illegitimate born would be inimical to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

14. He is the brother of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the world and the hereafter.

15. The sun came back for him twice.

16. The verse:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيُّكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِنَّمَا يُقِيمُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ
الزَّكُوَةَ وَهُمْ رَاكِعُونَ ﴿٤٤﴾

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”¹

...was revealed about Imam Ali (a.s.), when he gave his ring in Sadaqah.

17. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that Ali is the *Farooq* of this Ummah, who will distinguish truth and falsehood.

18. Ali is the first of those, who brought faith in the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

19. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) closed all the doors opening to the Masjid, except for the door of Imam Ali (a.s.).

20. Tradition of *Manzilah* (rank). The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“You are to me as Harun was to Moosa (a.s.).”

21. Tradition of *Ashbah* (most resembling): The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“One, who wants see Adam with his knowledge, Nuh with his courage, Ibrahim with his forbearance, and Moosa with his power, he should look at Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

22. He spoke to the sun.

23. The Almighty Allah said:

وَتَعِيهَا أُذْنُ وَاعِيَةٌ ﴿٣٩﴾

“And that the retaining ear might retain it.”²

And the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to Ali (a.s.):

“You are the retaining ear of my knowledge.”

24. Tradition of the hand operated flour mill operating on its own.

25. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

¹ Surah Maidah 5:55

² Surah Haqqah 69:12

“From this cloud 313 prophets and 313 successors have eaten; among them there was no Prophet more exalted than me and no successor more exalted than Ali.”

26. The miracle of folding of the earth.
27. Imam Ali (a.s.) was born inside the Holy Kaaba in Mecca.
28. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):
“I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate.”
29. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said in the tradition of immunity:
“I am commanded to convey this message personally or through a person, who is from me.”
30. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that the right of Ali on this Ummah is like the right of the father on his son.
31. One named by the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) as the chief of believers (*Ameerul Momineen*), was Ali (a.s.).

After extensive search of Shia and Sunni books, we have concluded that Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is introduced with hundreds of qualities in the words of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

1. Ali is the chief of Muslims.
2. Ali is the Imam of the pious.
3. Ali is chief of the bright faced ones.
4. Ali is the leader of the believers.
5. Ali is the Master (*Wali*) of the pious.
6. Ali is the leader of faith (*Yasoobud deen*).
7. Ali is the chief of the believers.
8. Ali is the chief of sons of Adam, (except the prophets).
9. Ali is the seal of the successors.
10. Ali is the first to meet the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on Judgment Day.
11. Ali is the first to shake hands with the Prophet on Judgment Day.
12. Ali is the great truthful one (*Siddiq Akbar*).
13. Ali is discriminator of good and evil (the *Farooq*) of this Ummah.
14. Ali is discriminator (*Farooq*) between truth and falsehood.
15. Ali is the first to testify for the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
16. Ali is the first of those believed in Allah.
17. Ali is the chief of the Muslims.
18. Ali is the Caliph of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the Ummah after him.
19. Ali is the chief of Quraish.

20. Ali is the best of what the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) left behind.
21. Ali is the chief of the Arabs.
22. Ali is the chief in the world and the hereafter.
23. Ali is the chief of the believers.
24. Ali is the vicegerent of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
25. Ali is the companion of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
26. Ali is among the first monotheists.
27. Ali is the fulfiller of the promises of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
28. Ali is the bearer of the secrets of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
29. Ali is the best of those, who survived the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
30. Ali is the judge of the religion of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
31. Ali is the brother of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the world and the hereafter.
32. Ali is the owner of the knowledge of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
33. Ali is the gate of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
34. Ali is the successor of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
35. Ali is the one, who is established by the command of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
36. Ali is the Imam on the Ummah of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
37. Ali is the Caliph of Allah on His earth after His Messenger.
38. Ali is the Imam of the creatures of Allah.
39. Ali is the master of the creatures.
40. Ali is the inheritor of the knowledge of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
41. Ali is the father of the progeny of the Prophet.
42. Ali is the arm of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
43. Ali is the trusted one of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on his message.
44. Ali is the master of those, whose master is the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
45. Ali is the one having the standard of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the gathering on Judgment Day.
46. Ali is the repayer of the debts of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
47. Ali is the one, who would drive away the enemies from the cistern of Kauthar.
48. Ali is the father of this Ummah.
49. Ali is the owner of the pool of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
50. Ali is the destroyer of the oath-breakers (*Nakiseen*), the unjust (*Qasiteen*) and apostates (*Mariqeen*).
51. Ali is the guardian of all believers after the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

52. Ali is the chosen one of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
53. Ali is the beloved of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
54. Ali is the chief of the successors.
55. Ali is the most superior of the successors.
56. Ali is the seal of the successors.
57. Ali is the best of the successors.
58. Ali is the Imam of the pious.
59. Ali is the heir of the Prophet.
60. Ali is the sword of Allah.
61. Ali is the guide.
62. Ali is the father of the Holy Imams (a.s.).
63. Ali is the first of the believers.
64. Ali is the vizier of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the heavens and the earth.
65. Ali is Allah's most beloved successor (of Prophet).
66. Ali is the most superior to men in lineage.
67. Ali is the most noble in lineage.
68. Ali is the most merciful of people on the subjects.
69. Ali is the most equitable on people.
70. Ali is the most expert in adjudication.
71. Ali is the favorite (*Wali*) of Allah.
72. Ali is the successor of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the world and the hereafter.
73. Ali is the Master (*Wali*) of believers after the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
74. Ali is the is fulfiller of promises of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
75. Ali is the Imam of all believing men and women.
76. Ali is the Master (*Wali*) of all believing men and women.
77. Ali is the source for Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
78. Ali is the defender of the community of the Prophet.
79. Ali is the most superior of people after the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
80. Ali is the first of all in belief.
81. Among the people (believers), Ali is the greatest fulfiller of the covenant of Allah.
82. Ali is the most steadfast of the people with regard to the covenant of Allah.
83. Ali is the most equitable of the people.
84. Ali is the most kind for the subjects (believers).

85. Ali is the most equitable for the subjects.
86. Ali is the trustee of God on His secrets.
87. Ali is the greatest of men in the view of Allah in excellence.
88. Ali is the chief of the formers and latters, excepting the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
89. Ali is the prayer direction (*Qibla*) of the Gnostics.
90. Ali is the first of Muslims.
91. Ali is the first of all in faith.
92. Ali is the most knowledgeable of people in Ummah.
93. Ali is the greatest one of the Ummah.
94. Ali is the most forbearing of the people.
95. Ali is the best of people in manners.
96. Ali is the most cognizant of God among the Ummah.
97. Ali is the first of those, who will reach the Hauz.
98. Ali is the last of men to whom the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) made his bequest.
99. Ali is the first of men to join the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
100. Ali is the most valiant of people ever.
101. Ali is the most generous.
102. Ali is the distributor of Paradise and Hell.
103. Ali is the most correct in faith.
104. Ali is the most superior of the people in certainty.
105. Ali is the most perfect of men in forbearance.
106. Ali is the standard of guidance.
107. Ali is the minaret of faith.
108. Ali is the Imam of the Awliya of Allah.
109. Ali is the effulgence of all that Allah has bestowed.
110. Ali is the owner of the standard of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on Judgment Day.
111. Ali is the trustee of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
112. Ali is the key to the treasures of Allah.
113. Ali is the greatest of men.
114. Ali is the effulgence of saints (*Awliya*) of Allah.
115. Ali is the Imam of all who obeyed Allah.
116. Ali is the trustee of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on Judgment Day.
117. Ali is the owner of the pool of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

118. Ali is the beloved of the heart of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
119. Ali is the depository of the relics of the prophets.
120. Ali is the trustworthy one of Allah on His earth.
121. Ali is the Proof of Allah on the creatures.
122. Ali is the pillar of faith.
123. Ali is the prop of religion.
124. Ali is the brilliant lamp.
125. Ali is the minaret of guidance.
126. Ali is the raised standard for people of the world.
127. Ali is the clear path.
128. Ali is the straight path.
129. Ali is the word on which the Almighty Allah has united the pious.
130. Ali is the most learned of the believers about the days of Allah.
131. Ali is the greatest of the suffering believers.
132. Ali is the one, who gave funeral bath to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
133. Ali is the one, who buried the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
134. Ali is the foremost in all calamities and hardships.
135. Ali is the most steadfast of the people on the command of Allah.
136. Ali is the most kind with the people.
137. Ali is the shelter.
138. Ali is forbearing.
139. Ali is the most superior of people in rank.
140. Ali is the most proximate of men in relationship.
141. Ali is the greatest of men in self sufficiency.
142. Ali is the proof of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
143. Ali is the gate of Allah.
144. Ali is the friend of Allah.
145. Ali is the friend of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
146. Ali is the sword of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
147. Ali is on the path to Allah.
148. Ali is the great news.
149. Ali is the supreme example.
150. Ali is the Imam of Muslims.
151. Ali is the chief of the truthful ones.
152. Ali is the leader of the Muslims towards Paradise.
153. Ali is the most pious of men.

154. Ali is the most superior of people in this Ummah.
155. Ali is the most learned of people.
156. Ali is the most righteous of believers.
157. Ali is the most learned of people.
158. Proof.
159. Worshipper.
160. Guide.
161. Mahdi (the guided).
162. The youth.
163. The chosen one for Imamate.
164. Companion of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) at the Praised Station (*Maqame Mahmood*).
165. Kingdom of the hereafter.
166. Trustee of the secrets of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
167. The trustee on the creatures of the earth.
168. The trustee on the creatures of the heavens.
169. Reviver of the practice of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
170. Immersed in the being of Allah.
171. One, having the most perfect faith in the Ummah.
172. The most stable proof.
173. Proof of the Prophet on the Ummah on Judgment Day.
174. Ali is the chief (*Shaykh*) of Muhajireen and Ansar.
175. Ali is the flesh of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), his blood and his hair.
176. Ali is the father of two grandsons.
177. Ali is the father of two blossoms.
178. Ali is the remover of the grief of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
179. Ali is the lion of Allah on His earth.
180. Ali is the sword of Allah on His enemies.
181. Ali is the beloved of Allah.
182. Ali is the carrier of the standard of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
183. Ali is the owner of the standard of praise.
184. Ali is the first of those, who will enter Paradise.
185. Ali is the first to knock at the gate of Paradise.
186. Ali is the monk of this Ummah.
187. Ali is the judge of the Arabs.
188. Ali is the judge of this Ummah.

189. Ali is the two-horned one of Paradise.
190. Genius from the companions of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
191. Chief of the creatures.
192. Slayer of transgressors.
193. Ali is the slayer of the infidels.
194. Ali is the most harsh in humility before Allah.
195. Ali is the son-in-law of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
196. Ali is the best of men.
197. Ali is the best of people.
198. Ali is the best of the humans.
199. Ali is the best of this Ummah after its prophet.
200. Ali is the best of those, on whom the sun shone after the Prophet.
201. Ali is the companion of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in Paradise.
202. Ali is the most equitable of the Ummah.
203. Ali is the chief of the verses of Quran.
204. Ali is the holder of the standard of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the world and the hereafter.
205. Ali is the Imam of the creatures.
206. Ali is the companion (*Rafiq*) of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in Paradise.
207. Ali is the most beloved of the creatures to Allah and His Messenger.
208. Ali is the gate of knowledge.
209. Ali is the favorite of the Prophet.
210. Ali is the closest of people to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
211. Ali is the most generous of people in rank.
212. Ali is the greatest near Allah in obedience.
213. Ali is the greatest of people on Allah.
214. Ali is the chief of the Ummah towards Paradise.
215. Ali is the Proof of Allah on people after the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
216. Ali is the trustee of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
217. Most truthful (*Siddiq*).
218. Ali is the witness (*Shahid*).
219. Most proximate of people to Paradise.
220. Ali is the guide of the believers to Paradise.
221. Ali is the guided one.
222. Ali is the father of the orphans and destitute.

- 223. Ali is the supporter of widows.
- 224. Ali is the refuge of all the weak.
- 225. Ali is the assurer to all the terrified.
- 226. Ali is the strong rope of Allah.
- 227. Ali is the firm rope.
- 228. Ali is the word of piety.
- 229. Ali is the eye of Allah.
- 230. Ali is the truthful tongue of Allah.
- 231. Ali is the side of Allah.
- 232. Widespread hands of Allah for creatures in forgiveness and mercy.
- 233. Ali is the gate of repentance.
- 234. Ali is the first of those, who testified to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
- 235. Ali is the first to testify divine monotheism.
- 236. Ali is the gate of the knowledge of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
- 237. Ali is the gate of the city of knowledge.
- 238. Ali is the father of the purified and guiding progeny.
- 239. Ali is the heir of the knowledge of the prophets.
- 240. Ali is the wisest in judgment.
- 241. Ali is the proof of Allah on the earth after the Prophet.
- 242. Ali is the trustee of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on his Pool (*Hauz*).
- 243. Ali is the guardian of all believer men and women, all Muslim men and women.
- 244. Ali is the guardian of those, whose guardian is the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
- 245. Ali is the Caliph of Allah on the people.
- 246. Ali is the preacher from Allah and His Messenger.
- 247. Ali is distributor of the numbers of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
- 248. Ali is the confidant of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).¹

Excellence and merits of Lady Fatima (s.a.)

- 1. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that since Lady Fatima (s.a.) protected her chastity, the Almighty Allah prohibited hellfire on her progeny.
- 2. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) named his daughter Siddiqa (most truthful).

¹ *Sharh Ihqaqul Haqq*, Qaazi Sayyid Nuruddin Marashi, who was martyred in India in 1019, with marginal notes by Ayatullah Marashi, 4:4-10.

3. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

"O Ali, indeed the earth belongs to Allah and whoever He likes, He makes him inherit it; and He revealed to me that one-fifth of the earth is dower of Fatima, which is given in your marriage with her. So, whoever is inimical to you, it is unlawful for him to walk on the earth."

4. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

"Fatima is a part of my body. One who makes her furious distresses me; and one, who pleases her, makes me happy."

5. Fatima, the daughter of Muhammad is the best of your women.

6. She is named as Fatima, because Almighty Allah kept her and her descendants away from Hellfire.

Indictments of the enemies and opponents of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and usurpers of their rights

1. Bani Umayyah are the accursed tree mentioned in Quran.

2. Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

"When the number of Bani Umayyah reaches forty, they would enslave the people, distribute the property of Allah among themselves and cheat through the Book of Allah."

3. One day, when the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) saw Abu Sufyan with Muawiyah: he said:

"May God curse the leading one and the following one."

4. One day the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) saw Abu Sufyan mounted and Muawiyah and his brother accompanying him: one of them held the reins and the other was driving from behind. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

"May God curse the rider, the one leading the mount and the one driving it from behind."

5. Abu Sufyan is the chief of the clans, who in the Battle of Uhud fought the Prophet and slain seventy best men of the Prophet from Muhajireen and Ansar, especially Hamza, the lion of Allah.

6. Amr Aas - his mother, Laila, was a well known wanton female in Mecca. When she became pregnant with Amr Aas, five persons, who had copulated with her, claimed that Amr was their child.

Abu Bakr

1. He used to gamble during the period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*).
2. He drank liquor even after the revelation of the verse of alcohol in Surah Baqarah.
3. We do not find any evidence that during the period of his being a Muslim,

he displayed any prominence in knowledge, initiative in Jihad, prominence in manners and morals, interest in worship or steadfastness on Islamic beliefs.

4. Nothing remarkable is related regarding his expertise in the science of exegesis (*Tafseer*).
5. His rank in knowledge of Sunnah and narrating of traditional reports: All that Imam Ahmad Hanbal has narrated from him in *Musnad* comprises of eighty traditions. And the paucity of narrations from him is due to his lack of access to traditions and incapability in memorizing them.
6. Some examples of his ignorance: His ignorance regarding the terms of *Abbun*, *kalala* and laws of inheritance of the grandmother and two grandmothers.
7. Some of his heresies: His viewpoint about the leadership of the inferior, his viewpoint about destiny and free will, his viewpoint in the incident of Malik bin Nuwairah.
8. The burden of Caliphate was heavy on his shoulders, and he was unable to solve difficult problems; he often mentioned the excuse that: "I would mention my opinion soon." Or: "The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) opined on the basis of divine revelation and he was accompanied by an angel; but I have a satan, who deceives me. Thus, when I am angry, leave me alone."
9. Since he had meager share of knowledge of Quran and Sunnah, whatever he said regarding them was on the basis of his personal views, which opened the door of personal deductions.
10. His ignoring the claim of Fatima (s.a.): Along with Bani Hashim ladies, Fatima protested, lamented and called out:

"O Abu Bakr, how soon have besieged the Ahle Bayt of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)..." and she said: *"O father, O Messenger of Allah, what all we had to bear at the hands of the son of Khattab and son of Abu Qahafa!"*

Thus, Fatima was infuriated on and she kept aloof from Abu Bakr till she passed away.

Umar

1. **Some of his heresies and conjectures:** Regarding one, who has no water to make ablution; regarding recitation (*Qirat*) in prayers; regarding inheritance of aged father; regarding tree of Rizwan; regarding relics of prophets; regarding weeping on the dead; regarding puberty; regarding three divorces; regarding non-Arabs; regarding Hajj Tamatto and temporary marriages; regarding precedence (*Awl*) in inheritance; regarding Baitul Maqdas; regarding fasting in month of Rajab; regarding questions about the difficult portions of Quran; prohibition of narrating traditions; prohibition of writing down the Sunnah; destruction of books during conquests of other places; regarding names and agnomens (*kunniyat*).

2. **Some examples of his ignorance:** His ignorance about doubts in prayers; his order regarding the amount of dower; his command about the mentally challenged woman, who committed fornication; interpretation of Quran; method of divorcing a slave girl; his order about a pregnant woman, who confessed to adultery; his command regarding a woman, who married during the waiting period; his command regarding a black couple, who give birth to a red-skinned child; regarding penalty for drinking liquor; regarding a woman, who tried to snare a youth; regarding the command of *Kalala*; command regarding those slain from People of Book; command regarding human fingers; regarding a thief, whose one hand and leg is already cut off; command of Majus, meanings of terms.
3. Umar was so terrifying that when the copper was cupping him and he (Umar) coughed, his cough frightened the copper, who passed flatulence; so Umar tipped him forty dirhams for that.
4. He has a remarkable statement about marriage, which informs of his excessive lust.
5. He believed that music was lawful and he listened to it.
6. Anger of Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) on him. The beloved of Prophet came out of the house lamenting and saying: "O my father, O Messenger of Allah, what all we had to bear at the hands of the son of Khattab and son of Abu Qahafa." And she said: "By God, I will not speak to Umar till I meet God."
7. Umar was hard-hearted and nasty; wherever he went, he carried his lash and people feared it more than a sword; and very few senior companions were safe from it.

Uthman

1. Among the signs of his ignorance is that he ruled about a woman, who gave birth in the sixth month of pregnancy that she committed adultery; he asked Ubayy bin Kaab about divine commands.
2. Some of his heresies and conjectures: He prayed the prayers in full during journey; he trespassed on the divine limits, he did not apply them; prohibition of Hajj Tamatto; his viewpoint regarding sexual pollution (*Janabat*), regarding Zakat on horses, his recitation of sermon before the Eid prayers; regarding *Qirat* in prayers; regarding prayer of traveler; his viewpoint regarding taxes; omission of Takbeer while sitting and standing in prayers.
3. He found oratory difficult; worshippers did not like the unsystematic way he employed and dispersed from him.
4. He diverted public funds to himself and his relatives.
5. He gifted Fadak to Marwan.
6. His largesse on Hakam bin Aas.
7. His largesse on Marwan.

8. His largesse on Harith.
9. Share of Saeed from the bestowal of the Caliph.
10. His largesse on Walid from the property of Muslims.
11. His largesse on Abu Sufyan.
12. Great amount of wealth gathered during his Caliphate.
13. Caliphate and the accursed tree in Quran.
14. Expulsion of Abu Zar to Rabdha.
15. The Caliph forcibly expelled Ibne Masud from the Masjid.
16. Behavior of the Caliph with Ammaar.
17. Expulsion of righteous persons to Kufa and Syria.
18. Expulsion of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).
19. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) banned Uthman from visiting the grave of Ruqaiyyah, because he copulated with another woman on the night she lay dying in the house.
20. Uthman opened the door of audacity to Almighty Allah and attributing falsehood to Him and after him Muawiyah, Marwan and his other brothers played with the religion of God, like children play with toys.
21. He feared returning to Mecca lest he becomes one about whom the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:
“A man would apostatize and disbelieve in Mecca, who would be eligible for chastisement of half of the folks of the earth.”
22. He regarded music lawful.

Muawiyah

1. He imbibed wine.
2. He took usury.
3. Some of his heresies: He recited prayers in full during journey; he recited *Adhan* in Eid prayers; he recited the Friday Prayer on Wednesday; he regarded marrying two sisters at the same time lawful; his innovation regarding blood money; his leaving recommended Takbeers in prayers; his not reciting of *Talbiyah* in opposition of Ali (a.s.); he recited the Eid sermons before the prayers.
4. Among his crimes in the black record of his deeds is initiating the cursing of Imam Ali (a.s.) and he was the first to start this evil practice.
5. He trespassed the limits set by Allah.
6. His wearing of unlawful materials.
7. His relating Ziyad to Abu Sufyan.
8. His taking of allegiance for Yazid was among his four crimes.
9. His battle against Ameerul Momineen, Imam Ali (a.s.).

10. Shameless deeds recorded in the scroll of deeds of Hind's son.
11. Improper allegations regarding feats of the son of Hind, the liver-eater.
12. His behavior with Imam Hasan (a.s.): the son of Hind, the liver-eater, behaved with the beloved grandson of the Prophet, Imam Mujtaba (a.s.) in a way that makes one shudder.
13. Shedding the blood of Shia and destroying their property.
14. His killing of Hujr bin Adi and his friends.
15. His killing of two Hadramis due to their being Shia.
16. His killing of Malik Ashtar.
17. His killing of Muhammad bin Abu Bakr.
18. When Saad bin Abi Waqqas – one of the ten persons according to Ahle Sunnat to have received glad tidings of Paradise – quoted for Muawiyah, traditions of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and then rose up to leave, Muawiyah ridiculed Saad by releasing flatulence.
19. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said regarding him: “O Allah, curse him and do not fill his stomach, except with dirt.”

Note

In spite of the fact that the merits and distinctions of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) are numerous; and friends and enemies confess to them, and on the other hand, history has recorded innumerable condemnations and ridicules of enemies and opponents of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), it is surprising that some books are full of condemnation for opponents of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) but illogical merits are narrated for them as well. More extraordinary is the fact that since they lacked all merits some of their defects are shown as points of excellence!

In this way, the tyrant Caliphs, on one hand began to fabricate merits for themselves and on the other hand cursed and abused Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and went to the extent of reporting his defects and reducing his rank and that of the family of prophethood.

Yaqut Hamuyi has said in *Mo'jamul Buldan*:¹

“They cursed Imam Ali (a.s.) in every land from the pulpits of the east and west.”

It was made a practice to curse Imam Ali (a.s.) and during the period of Bani Umayyah this was carried out from seventy thousand pulpits. They regarded cursing Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as a definite principle of belief or an obligatory duty of Sunnah on which they acted upon with full enthusiasm. So much so that when Umar bin Abdul Aziz, for some exigency or political expediency prohibited it, they reacted in such a way as if he had brought a severe calamity upon them or

¹ *Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 5:38 [3/191].

that he had committed a deadly sin.

Leave aside the rank of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) with regard to the great divine Caliphate, and his precedence in defense of Islam and in making it established and in spreading justice and equity, strengthening the bases of obligatory and recommended in religion!

Also, his merits and excellence of manners and the verses of Quran revealed in his favor and the traditional reports of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in his excellence!

But was he beyond the circle of Muslims, to curse and abuse whom is prohibited in widely narrated traditions and which is unlawful according to the verdict of Islamic law? Only one tradition of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is sufficient for illustration:

“Abusing a Muslim is transgression.”¹

In addition to that even if we overlook the pure and chaste birth, sacred lineage and origin, noble descent; and personal and acquired merits and noble capacities of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), but according to their own beliefs, His Eminence is one of the ten persons, regarding whom Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) has guaranteed Paradise!

Or at least he was one of the companions of the Prophet, all of whom are regarded as just; and through whose words and deeds the Ahle Sunnat argue, and whose condemnation is not regarded lawful, for which they vehemently denounce the Shia and think that Shia talk ill of some companions. They have also prescribed laws of dealing with them.

To all this, add the fact that: Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.), in view of Ahle Sunnat and consensus of all sects of Islam, is one of the ‘Rightly Guided Caliphs’, to abuse whom is severely condemned.

Come, let us ask them what is the justification for Muawiyah and Umayyads and their followers that they should commit this infamy?

And ask them: why they remain silent at those, who expelled Imam Ali (a.s.) from Caliphate and companionship and even put him beyond the pale of Islam. Why they regarded talking ill of him permissible?

So much they devalued the position of the Imam that they divested him from all the three ranks of: Caliphate, companionship of Prophet and Islam; and they do not accord any value to him and do not honor any of his rights?

Yes, the matter is such that Aamir bin Abdullah said to Zubair, to his son, who spoke ill of Ali (a.s.):

“My son, abstain from talking ill of Ali (a.s.); because Bani Umayyah abused him for sixty years and tried to bring down his rank, but the Almighty

¹ Refer *Saheeh Bukhari*, 1:27, H. 48; *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:114, H. 116, *Kitabul Imaan*; *Sunan Tirmizi*, 4:311, H. 1983; *Sunanul Kubraa Nasai*, 2:313, H. 3568 and 3571.

Allah raised his position.”¹

They did not remain content only with abusing and cursing Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and ridiculing and censuring their Shia, and writers like the four ‘Ibn’s’: Ibne Hazm, Ibne Jauzi, Ibne Taymiyyah and Ibne Kathir, who bore the filthy spirit of Umayyads, in their books, denied the excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and fabricated false merits for the three Caliphs; and spread ridicule and allegations against the Shia.

For example, with regard to the tradition of the roasted fowl, which is authentic and widely narrated and scholars of traditions have accepted its authenticity and wide narration, Ibne Kathir has quoted this report and then given vent to his true feelings, saying:

“Although this tradition is narrated through numerous channels, but my heart does not accept that it is authentic.”

Yes, this is a heart, which Almighty Allah has sealed. Were it healthy and perfect, he would not have expressed such opinion?

Yes, as if foolishness and ignorance is yet alive, although Abu Jahl is dead since long. Still the tongues of the fire of ignorance are not extinguished, although Abu Lahab is in hell. As if the world has turned on its heels and has not benefited from the sun of Islam to the extent of getting warmth (and has not benefited from it sufficiently).

In spite of numerous merits of Ali (a.s.), they sidelined him from Caliphate on the pretext that he was young of age and partial to the descendants of Abdul Muttalib. And they followed persons, for whom ignorance testifies that they are its folks, and gave them power over the people, and the consequence of these deadly crimes was that fellows lacking every positive quality and transgressors like Muawiyah and Yazid came to control the life and property of people, instead of Imam Hasan (a.s.) and Imam Husain (a.s.)!

And there is contradiction between the element of prophethood and divinity transferred from loins of pure ancestors and from wombs of chaste mothers, from prophets to successors, from successors to guardians (*Wali*), and from guardians (*Wali*) to wise ones, and from wise ones to elders and from elders to nobles, and from nobles to the seal of the messengership and his successor, the owner of the great mastership (*Wilayat*) and between the Umayyad, ‘Abshami’ elements.²

How profound was the difference between these two family trees: The *Nabawi* (of the Prophet) and *Alawite* (of Ali), the pure tree, whose roots are firm and whose branches and leaves are in heavens; whereas the accursed Umayyad family tree – the evil tree, whose roots grow into the earth and which has no stability.

How remote these two family trees are from each other: One is the blessed

¹ *Al-Mahasin wal Masawi*, Baihaqi, 1:40 [Pg. 55].

² He was Abde Shams, sons of Abde Manaf, the ancestor of Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan.

olive tree, which shades you and the other is the accursed tree of the Holy Quran.¹

An account of fabrication of traditions and false propaganda

Unscrupulous politicians and their followers fabricated a large number of traditions – some of which are against reason and logic. For example: Exaggeration of Hanafites that Abu Hanifah was more knowledgeable than the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

Sometimes traditions are fabricated to decrease the status of prophethood.

But love is something, which makes a person blind and deaf. To talk of the impossible is not impossible, but piety and shame restrain man from saying what is beyond the circle of reason.

It is amazing that in *Saheeh Muslim* and *Saheeh Bukhari*, a large number of lies and fabricated points are mentioned; and the existence of such reports in these two books should not burden you; because these two books are large vessels of debased and valueless statements and a treasure of mistakes and errors.

There are so many shameless points and lies in these two books that it has sullied the fame of authorship and has weakened the arm of the science of traditions.

As if the pivot of worldly politics in its six directions is falsehood and deception.

Muawiyah squandered a lot of money for fabricating traditions regarding excellence of the sons of his debased family, that is the accursed (family) tree in Quran – Bani Umayyah, generally and clan of Abil Aas, especially.

Paying careful attention to history and traditions make us aware that the usual habit of the fabricators and liars is that they attribute such qualities to a fellow, who is absolutely bereft of any such thing, and which is opposed and belied by every history and biography concerning him.

In this connection for example, they have exaggerated the valor of Abu Bakr so much that they pose him to be the most valiant of companions, whereas the fact is that though he was present in all the battles of the Prophet, he did not wield a sword even once and never stood at the war front. He never faced any archers. And on no day was he seen as a combatant in the battlefields; that is why they fabricated excessive reports about his bravery and narrated meaningless and funny traditions about his valor with the hope that some of them would prove against what is known through perception and sight; and what is known to all.

They exaggerate about his piety and religiosity and say that such intense was his fear of God that his liver burnt in terror and smoke came out of his mouth;

¹ Surah Isra 17:60.

whereas the fact is that he had no precedence in worship and nothing is reported about him praying or fasting in excess or doing what makes one proximate to the Almighty Allah.

They have exaggerated the knowledge of Umar and posed him to be the wisest person of his time; and attributed nine out of ten parts of knowledge to him. In the pan of balance, his wisdom is regarded as heavier than that of all Arabs!

They have narrated a large number of traditional reports regarding this nonsense, while the fact was that preoccupation in the market made this fellow forgetful of Quran and Sunnah; and according to his own confession – which is proved true – all the people, even the women in their houses, are wiser than him.

They have exaggerated about him regarding denial of falsehood and his hatred to music, while it is proved that he regularly committed unlawful acts and regarded music lawful.

When they found that authentic history and what is proved from the biography of Uthman negates modesty, and which shows him to be a shameless fellow, they fabricated blatant statements about him and narrated shameless traditional report and placed these fabricated points in his biography till he was posed as the most modest person of the Ummah of Muhammad; such that even the angels were ashamed before him!

Thus, modesty of Uthman, like the valor of Abu Bakr and wisdom of Umar is complete negation of facts.

And these qualities of theirs are like ‘honesty’ and ‘wisdom’ of Muawiyah as mentioned in traditional reports attributed to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

“Such is the wisdom and honesty of Muawiyah regarding the words of my Lord that he was almost appointed as a prophet.”!

Also:

“Seven persons are trustworthy: Tablet (*Lauh*), Pen (*Qalam*), Israfeel, Mikaeel, Jibraeel, Muhammad and Muawiyah.”!

A report that Abu Bakr Hazali has narrated exposes the trustworthiness of Muawiyah and his actual worth regarding this quality.

He says: One day, Abul Aswad Duali was speaking to Muawiyah when the former shifted his posture and passed flatulence. He told Muawiyah: “Don’t tell anyone about this.” “All right,” said Muawiyah.

When Abul Aswad went away, Muawiyah mentioned this to Amr Aas and Marwan bin Hakam. When Abul Aswad came to Muawiyah the following day, Amr asked: “O Abul Aswad, what did the gas do yesterday?”

He replied: “Gases come and go, and that too from an old man, whom age has weakened.”

Then he turned to Muawiyah and said: “One, who has no trustworthiness to even conceal intestinal gas cannot be trusted regarding the Muslim community!”

Fabricating the excellence of ordinary persons

The fabricators did not leave a single miracle and sign of the prophets, but that they attributed it to ordinary persons, whom they were loyal to, and purposely fabricated for them things, which are most remote from reason. I don't know whether their aim was to reduce the position of prophets or to raise the status of these ordinary persons?

Whatever the motive, their mixing of illogical reports with authentic ones is sufficient for their indictment.

Instances of fabrications

Following are some instances of exaggerating the excellence of some figures:

Exaggerating the excellence of Abu Bakr

1. Seeking mediation from the beard of Abu Bakr.
2. Miracle of Abu Bakr's burial.
3. Abu Bakr was a famous old man and the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) was an unknown youth.
4. Abu Bakr was elder to the Prophet.
5. Islam of Abu Bakr preceded the birth of Ali (a.s.).
6. Abu Bakr was the most aged companion of the Prophet.
7. A dog from jinns is appointed to bite one, who curses Abu Bakr and Umar.
8. Status of Abu Bakr near God.
9. Five silhouettes from the progeny of Adam.
10. Abu Bakr is the best of the folks of the heavens and the earth.
11. Abu Bakr in the pan of balance.
12. The father of no emigrant (*Muhajir*) embraced Islam, except Abu Bakr's.
13. Abu Bakr and his parents in Quran.
14. Sermon of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the excellence of Caliph.
15. Praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) about the Caliph.
16. Verses revealed about Abu Bakr.
17. Abu Bakr was one of the ten persons given glad tidings of Paradise.

Exaggerating the excellence of Umar

1. Statements regarding Umar: Umar was the wisest person of his time.
2. Umar was most knowledgeable about recitation of Quran among companions and the most intelligent of them.
3. Satan is terrified of Umar and he flees from him.

4. Lash of Umar is a like the staff of Moosa (a.s.).
5. Four miracles of Umar regarding the four elements: earth, water, air and fire.
6. Applying the appellation of Ameerul Momineen for Umar.
7. Paper in the shroud of Umar.
8. Umar is one of ten persons given glad tidings of Paradise.

Exaggerating the excellence of Uthman

1. Exaggeration regarding Uthman's modesty.
2. "Every prophet has a companion in Paradise and my companion is Uthman bin Affan."
3. "You are my Master (*Wali*) in the world and the hereafter."
4. Prophet pledged oath of brotherhood between himself and Uthman.
5. The Prophet never went to the pulpit, but that he said: "Uthman is in Paradise."
6. And: "O Uthman, whatever Allah has concealed and revealed and whatever will occur on Judgment Day, is all bestowed to you." After this Uthman did not care what he did.
7. Uthman bin Affan purchased Paradise twice from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).
8. Uthman recited the complete Quran in one unit of prayer.
9. Majority of the jockeys (riders), who moved towards Uthman became insane.
10. If people had not sought revenge for the killing of Uthman, stones would have rained upon them from the sky.
11. It is narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that: "I have not given Umme Kulthum to Uthman, except due to heavenly revelation."
12. Uthman is one of ten persons given glad tidings of Paradise.

Exaggerations regarding Muawiyah

1. It is narrated from Ali:

"I and Muawiyah will stand for taking the account on Judgment Day."
2. They call him as the scribe of revelation.
3. They call him as the maternal uncle of believers.
4. Some traditions like:

'May Allah never fill the belly of Muawiyah' are regarded to be in praise of Muawiyah.
5. After narrating the tradition of the dream (of monkeys jumping on the pulpit

of the Prophet), Tabari says:

“Uthman, Umar bin Abdul Aziz and Muawiyah are not included in this dream.”

6. The trustworthy near Allah are three:

“I, Jibraeel and Muawiyah.”

Note:

Dishonest rulers and their associates have fabricated traditions regarding excellence of Caliphs and attributed them to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), Ali (a.s.), Imam Husain (a.s.), Imam Hasan (a.s.) or Fatima, till it can be said:

“The most falsehood in the Muslim Ummah, is attributed to Ameerul Momineen, Ali (a.s.).¹

Third – Selections from Al-Ghadeer

After performing the Ziyarat of Holy Medina in 1383 A.H., and after some discussions with Ahle Sunnat people in the Baqi cemetery, at that same place, through the blessings of the oppressed Holy Imams (a.s.), I decided to prepare a selection of *Al-Ghadeer*, so that students of religion, respected scholars and other people can use its information.

It can also prove useful during missionary trips in the holy month of Ramadhan, in the first ten days of Mohurrum, in the ten days of Safar and ten days of Fatima.

In this way, the book of *Al-Ghadeer* will not remain cryptic and confined to libraries. On the contrary, its information would be available for students, missionaries and the public in general.

Our Style in selection and research

Selections from this book is based on four methods:

1. The late Allamah Amini, in addition to excellence and condemnations, has mentioned 105 poets of Ghadeer. We have also mentioned all 105 poets from the eleven volumes of the book published so far.

Our selection is that we have mentioned only verses related to Ghadeer from all the verses mentioned in the book, which sometimes runs into tens of pages. Except the verses, which the Allamah has explained and commented on, or mentioned verses of Quran or traditional reports in their explanation. When the late Allamah has written the biography of poets running into tens of pages, we have condensed it for our purpose.

2. In the part about excellence [of Ahle Bayt (a.s.)], **we have not expunged any of their merits**. In case an excellence is narrated in numerous versions, we have mentioned the version, which is most inclusive.

¹ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, Zahabi, 1:77 [1:82].

3. In sections about the defects of the enemies of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), we have mentioned most of the important defects and the rest are omitted. For example to prove the ignorance of the second Caliph, there is a section: 'Miscellaneous reports about the knowledge of Umar', in which a hundred stories are mentioned, but we have selected only 55 important ones. Also, we have mentioned them in summarized form and similarly regarding other defects.
4. With attention to the excessive number of narrators in different discussions, we have chosen prominent personalities from different centuries and from various schools of thoughts.

Tasks completed in Selections from Al-Ghadeer and the present translation

1. For *Selections from Al-Ghadeer*, I have relied on the researched edition of *Al-Ghadeer* published from Markaze Al-Ghadeer, under the supervision of Ayatullah Hashemi Shahroodi (d.z.). In such a way that I have followed the text accurately and selected portions with such care that no discussion is left out and all points of the original book are reflected in this selection. We have also included extensive footnote references.
2. In the published edition, references of the Allamah are included in the main text, whereas references of new books are mentioned in the footnotes. In this book, we have mentioned both in the footnotes.
3. References, not mentioned in the original book, are also mentioned here. All idioms and proverbs used in the book are also explained in the footnotes.
4. Topics referred to in the previous or coming pages are tagged for cross reference.
5. Subheadings are mentioned in appropriate places so that the reader may find it easy to skim through the topics.
6. Headers are given to make access to chapters easy.
7. The translation was compared with the original, four times.
8. Arabic texts of important quotations are included in the main text.

The phrase 'May Allah be pleased with him' (r.a.) is only mentioned, because it was present in the original, while we believe that Almighty Allah was not pleased with some people and He would never be please with them ever; individuals inimical to Ahle Bayt (a.s.) or who initiated heresies and deviation; all such people are included in the curse of Allah:

أُولَئِكَ يَلْعَنُهُمُ اللَّهُ وَيَلْعَنُهُمُ الْعَنُونَ ﴿٦﴾

"These it is whom Allah shall curse, and those who curse shall

curse them (too).”¹

Associates

I hope my efforts in producing this book would be accepted in the court of the Almighty and by Imam Ali (a.s.) and may the Imam grant us his special attention during throes of death, at death, on the first night in the grave, in Purgatory (*Barzakh*) and on Judgment Day (*Qiyamat*).

I thank the translators, who assisted me in translating from Arabic into Persian; especially Mahdi Moizzi, Saifullah Habibi, Sayyid Mahmud Murtazvi Shahroodi, Ali Quddusi, Sayyid Mahdi Hashemi, Abdul Husain Muhaqqiq Kashani, Mohsin Muhaqqiq.

Also, most respected Ali Saadi, Ja’far Saadi, Shaykh Safa Khazraji and Haider Hubbullah, who helped me in the meaning of the Arabic texts, for which I am thankful to them.

Group of comparers: Ali Rahimiyan, Abul Fazl Talqabi, Murtada Akbari Joo, Murtada Asadi, Muhammad Jawad Nabi Nizad, Ali Ismaili, Muhammad Husain Rabbani, Reza Fauladi, Muhammad Jawad Arzinda and Sayyid Hujjat Pahrezkar.

Ruhullah Mandgari, Hadi Minapour, Ali Rahimiyan, F. Abul Hasni, F. Bakhtiyari. H. Husaini Nizad.

Finally, since this book was completed in the beginning of the Days of Fatima (*Ayyam Fatimiya*), I dedicate this book to her, the lady, who had to bear great afflictions after the passing away of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).²

The human Hourie (*Hauriya Insiya*), the most beloved female to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), by whose anger Almighty Allah is infuriated³ and by whose pleasure, He is pleased.⁴

Fatima, the pure and chaste one, from whom and whose progeny the Almighty Allah has prohibited Hell fire.⁵

The lady, who was most resembling the Prophet in manners and habits,⁶ and the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) named her as Siddiqa.⁷

It is regrettable that none of these excellence and recommendations of the

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:159

² Al-Fusool Muhiimma, 150 [Pg. 144]; Nuzhatul Majalis, 2:228; Nurul Absar, 45 [Pg. 96].

³ *Saheeh Bukhari*, [3:1361, H. 3510]; *Khasais Nasai*, 35 [*Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, 147, H. 135]; and in *Sonan Kubra*, 5:97, H. 8371; *Kitabul Manaqib*.

⁴ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:154 [3:167, H. 4730]; *Zakhaerul Uqbah* 39; *Tadkiratul Sibt*, 175 [Pg. 310]; *Maqtaal Khwarizmi*, 1:52; *Kifayatut Talib*, 219 [Pg. 364, Chap. 99]; *As-Sawaiq*, 105 [Pg. 175].

⁵ *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, 3:152 [3/165, H. 4726].

⁶ These traditional reports are mentioned by Hafiz Ibne Hibban [in his *Saheeh* 15/403, Tr, 6953], thus in *Zakhaerul Uqbah*, it is mentioned on Pg. 40 and Hafiz Tirmizi [*Sonan Tirmizi*, 5/657, H. 3872] have narrated and Tirmizi has regarded this tradition as good.

⁷ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:202 [3/152].

Prophet were respected¹ and the house of revelation was put torched.

Umar came with a lighted torch to burn down the house; Fatima saw him and said:

“O son of Khattab, will you burn down my place?”²

“Yes,” he replied, “unless you enter in which the Ummah has entered.”

The leader of that political group then called for firewood, and said:

“By God, I will burn down the house upon you, unless you come out for allegiance,”

Or said:

“I will burn down the house with whoever is present therein.”

He was told: “Fatima is present in this house.”

He replied: “Even if Fatima is present in it.”³

Ibne Shahna says: Umar came to the house of Ali, in order to burn it down along with its occupants. He said: “Enter that, which the Ummah has entered.”⁴

The beloved daughter of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) lamented in grief. She came out of the house weeping aloud:

“My father, O Messenger of Allah, what all the son of Khattab and the son of Qahafa⁵ have wrought on us.”

Fatima Siddiqa (a.s.) lamented with the Hashemite ladies and cried aloud:

“O Abu Bakr, how soon you laid siege to the house of Ahle Bayt (a.s.)! By God, I will not speak to Umar till I meet Almighty Allah.”⁶

And that Egyptian poet⁷ brawls in drunkenness and stokes fires of repulsion, and reminds of those crimes – whose flames, by God, will never extinguish and he boasts shamelessly in his ‘Umariya Qasida’ – upon which he and his co-religionists pride:

“The statement of Umar to Ali – how noble is its hearer and how great is its sayer: If you don’t give allegiance, I would burn down your house and not leave you alive in that, and it was when the daughter of Mustafa was present in that house. No one other than Abu Hafas (Umar) can make such a statement against

¹ *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:285 [4/137]; *Subhal Aashi*, 1:228 [1/273]; *Sharh Nahjul Balaghha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 3:407 [15/74, Letter 9].

² *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:250 [4/87]; *Tareekh Abul Fida*, 1:156; *Elamun Nisa*, 3:1207 [4/114].

³ *Tareekh Tabari*, 3:198 [3/202, Events of 11 A.H.]; *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:13 [1/19]; *Sharh Nahjul Balaghha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 1:134; 2:19 [2/56, Sermon 26; and 6/48, Sermon 66]; *Elamun Nisa*, 3:1205 [4/114].

⁴ *Tareekh Ibne Shahna*, Marginal notes on *Kamil* 7:164 [*Rauzatul Manazir*, 1/189, Events of year 11 A.H.].

⁵ *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:13 [1/20]; *Elamun Nisa*, 3:1206 [4/115]; *Al-Imam Ali*, Abdul Fattah Abdul Maqsood 1:255 [1/191].

⁶ *Sharh Nahjul Balaghha*, 1: 134; 2:19 [2/57, Sermon 26]; and 6/49, Sermon 66].

⁷ Muhammad Hafiz Ibrahim, died year 1933 A.D., 1351 A.H.

the descendants of Adnan and their supporters!”

Damiyati, the exegete of this sinister collection (*Diwan*), writes:

“It implies that the presence of the Prophet’s daughter in that house did not guarantee that Ali would remain safe from Umar’s hands.”

He also writes¹:

“In the report of Ibne Jarir Tabari from Jarir, from Mughira, from Ziyad bin Kulaib, it is narrated that Umar bin Khattab came to the house of Ali, where Talha, Zubair and some persons from Emigrants (*Muhajireen*) were present; he said: ‘My God, I will burn down the house with you, except that you come out for allegiance.’”

Then Zubair came out with a sword to attack him, but the sword slipped from his hand and he was apprehended. If Ziyad in the chain of narrators is Ziyad Hanzali, Abu Mashir Kufi, he is trustworthy and apparently Tabari has trusted this report.

Fadak was also another pretext of taking revenge from the house of revelation.

Bukhari in the chapter of obligation of Khums² has narrated from Ayesha:

“Fatima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), after the passing away of the Prophet, asked for her inheritance from Abu Bakr: what Allah has given to the Prophet and what the Prophet had left behind. Abu Bakr said: Indeed, the Messenger of Allah said: ‘We do not leave any inheritance and whatever we leave is Sadaqah.’ Fatima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) became infuriated and she became estranged from Abu Bakr and kept away from him till she passed away.”

Also, in the battles, in the chapter of the Battle of Khyber,³ it is narrated from Ayesha that she said: “Indeed, Fatima... till she said: So, Abu Bakr did not give anything to Fatima; due to this she was infuriated with him. She kept away from him and did not speak to him till she passed away. She survived the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) only for six months; and when she passed away, her husband, Ali, buried her at night and did not inform Abu Bakr and he prayed on her personally.”

The anger of Fatima on the rulers of her time was to such an extent that she made a bequest to be buried at night and that no one from them should visit her. She did not permit Ayesha to visit her as well, what to say about Abu Bakr! And Abu Bakr did not pray on her. Thus, she was buried at night and Abu Bakr was not informed about it. Ali prayed on her and he gave her the funeral with the

¹ On page 139 in his explanation.

² *Saheeh Bukhari*, 5:5 [3/1126, H. 2926].

³ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 6:196 [4/1549, H. 3998]; *Saheeh Muslim*, 2:72 [4/29, H. 52]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:6 & 9 [1/13, H. 26; Pg. 18, H. 56].

assistance of Asma binte Umais.¹

On the basis of the quotation of *Seeratul Halabiyya*², Waqidi has said that:

“It is proved for us that Ali, Karramallahu Wajhu buried Fatima at night and prayed on her; and Abdullah and Fazal were present with him and they did not inform anyone of that.”

“And why was the beloved daughter of Mustafa buried in the dead of the night and why the signs of her grave were obliterated?” (Persian couplet)

Fatima stood at the grave of her father, took a handful of dust, placed it to her eyes and said:

“What would be the condition of one, who smells the dust of the grave of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.); he would not never smell another fragrance. Such calamities have befallen me that had they fallen on days, they would have turned into nights.”

O Prophet of Allah, peace be upon you from me and from your daughter, who has come to you and who has hastened to meet you.

O Prophet of Allah, my patience about your chosen (daughter) has been exhausted, and my power of endurance has weakened, except that I have ground for consolation in having endured the great hardship and heart-rending event of your separation. I laid you down in your grave when your last breath had passed (when your head was) between my neck and chest.

إِنَّمَا وَرَأَيْتُ مِنْ جُنُونٍ

“Surely we are Allah’s and to Him we shall surely return.”³

Now, the trust is returned and what was given is taken back. As to my grief, it knows no bounds, and as to my nights, they will remain sleepless till Allah chooses for me the house in which you now reside.

Certainly, your daughter would apprise you of the uniting of your *ummah* (people) to oppress her. You ask her in detail and get all news of the situation. This happened when a long time had not elapsed and your remembrance had not disappeared. My *salam* (salutation) be on you both, the *salam* of a grief stricken, not a disgusted or hateful person; for if I go away, it is not because I am weary (of you), and if I stay, it is not due to lack of belief in what Allah has promised the endurers.⁴

Then he recited the following couplets at the grave of Fatima:

Every company of two friends gets dispersed and a gathering, which

¹ Tabaqat Ibne Saad, 8:29-30; Mustadrak Hakeem, 3:163 [3/178, H. 4764 & 4769]; Maqta Khwarizmi, 1:83.

² Seeratul Halabiyya, 3:390 [3/361].

³ Surah Baqarah 2:156

⁴ It is mentioned like this in the original source. But in *Nahjul Balagha* /320, Sermon 202 it is mentioned as follows: “due to fatigue”, and this is most apt according to the context.

continues till death has to be less. And indeed my losing one after another¹ is the proof that no companionship is enduring.”²

In the end, I hope that this book, which is in defense of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and which mentions his merits and those of pure Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and criticism of his enemies and opponents, would be accepted in the court of Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.); whereas her pleasure is the pleasure of Almighty Allah.

We beseech the Almighty for sincerity of intention as it is the base of every deed and the Almighty Allah is the giver of divine encouragement (*Taufeeq*).

Praise be to the one, who made us among the adherents to the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).

Qom Muqaddas – Mausia Meeraath Nubuwwat

Muhammad Hasan Shafi-ee Shaahroodi

9/3/1386 Hijri Solar: 9 Jamadiul Awwal 1428 Hijri Lunar

¹ It is mentioned in a copy: Certainly my loss of Fatima after Ahmad...
² *Elamun Nisa* 3:1222 [4/131].

Event of Ghadeer

In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful

Ten years after the migration (*Hijrat*), the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) decided to perform the Hajj and a public announcement was made concerning this.

People from all the tribes gathered in Medina to accompany the Prophet.

This Hajj of the Prophet is referred to as the Farewell Hajj, Hajj of Islam, Complete Hajj, Perfect Hajj, Whole Hajj etc.¹

It is so named, because it was the only Hajj, which the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) performed after Hijrat.

It was Saturday, five or six days before the end of the Zilqad month [five or six days before the new moon of Zilhajj], that he came out on foot.

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) performed the ritual bath (*Ghusl*), massaged oil to the body², applied perfume, combed the hair and set out from Medina.

When he came out of Medina, he wore only two pieces of cloth: one was a piece thrown around the shoulders and another piece tied around the waist; and accompanied by his wives and family members.

All his family members, and Muhajireen and Ansar and other people accompanied him.³

At that time there was an epidemic of small pox or measles, in Medina due to which a large number of people were deprived of the honor of accompanying the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). Inspite of this, tens of thousands of people accompanied him. Various historians have mentioned 90 thousand and more.

In addition to this, there were people residing in Mecca and those who came from the surrounding areas and those who accompanied Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) from Yemen and Abu Moosa.⁴

In this way, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) completed the rituals of Hajj and on his return journey, halted at a place from where the caravans of Medina, Egypt and Iraq diverged in different directions.

On Thursday⁵, 18th of Zilhajj, when he reached the land of Johfa and the locality of Ghadeer Khum, the trustworthy angel of divine revelation, Jibreel

¹ Reason of naming it as Farewell Hajj is mentioned in the verse 5:67 and the reason it is called as the Perfect Hajj or the Complete Hajj can be found in verse 5:3.

² Applying oil to the body.

³ *Tabaqat*, Ibne Saad 3:225 [2/173]; *Al-Imtaa*, Maqrizi: 510; *Irshadus Sari*, 6:429 [9/426].

⁴ *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:283 [3/257]; *Sirat*, Ahmad Zaini Dahlani, 3:3 [2/143]; *Taareekhul Kholaifa*, Ibne Jauzi, Part Four; *Tadkira Khawasul Ummah*; [Pg. 30]; *Dairatul Maarif*, Fareed Wajdi 3:542.

⁵ According to explanation of some reporters of the tradition of Ghadeer, like Baraa bin Azib.

descended on His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) and conveyed to him the following message from Almighty Allah:

يَا أَيُّهَا الرَّسُولُ بَلَّغْ مَا أُنزِلَ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ رَبِّكَ وَإِنْ لَمْ تَفْعَلْ فَمَا بَلَّغْتَ
رِسَالَتَهُ وَاللَّهُ يَعْصِمُكَ مِنَ النَّاسِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَا يَهِبُّ إِلَيْكُمُ الْقَوْمَ الْكُفَّارِينَ ④

“O Apostle! Deliver what has been revealed to you from your Lord; and if you do it not, then you have not delivered His message, and Allah will protect you from the people; surely Allah will not guide the unbelieving people.”¹

And he was commanded to publicly announce that Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) is the standard of guidance and the emblem of religion and to declare his obedience and Mastership (*Wilayat*) on all.

Hence the Prophet ordered halt, told the people to call back those gone ahead and wait for those following behind.

A vast multitude conglomerated in the scorching desert. It was such a hot day that people kept one end of their dress on their heads and the other below their feet.

All were anxious to know why the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) had ordered them to halt at such an apparently unfit place. The fire of curiosity mingled with the scorching heat in the atmosphere and made the pilgrims restless.

Orders were issued to tie a canopy below some aged trees and to erect a pulpit of camel saddles. At about the time of Noon Prayer, when all the pilgrims had arrived, the Prophet mounted the pulpit² and delivered the following sermon:³

“All praise is only for Almighty Allah. We seek help from Him, have faith in Him and rely only on Him. We seek His refuge from personal evil and our bad deeds. He is the God, Who does not guide the deviated people and does not misguide the guided ones. I testify that there is no deity, except Allah and Muhammad is His servant and messenger.

So to say: “O people, the kind⁴ and all-knowing Lord has informed me that the age of every prophet does exceed half that of his preceding prophet.⁵ I will be summoned very soon and I will have to harken to the call. I will be questioned and so will you be. What will you reply?”

People said: “We would say that you conveyed the message of God, gave counsel and endeavored to spread the message. May Allah recompense you well for it.”

¹ Surah Maidah 5:67

² *Majmauz Zawaadeed*, Hafiz Haithami 9:106.

³ *Thimarul Qulub*: 51 [Pg. 636, No. 1068].

⁴ Ref: *Tafseer Majmaul Bayan*, 4:128, under the exegesis of verse 103 of Surah Anaam.

⁵ [I could not find this statement in Shia books of traditions and its meanings is also not clear].

His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) said: “Do you not testify that there is no god, except Allah; and Muhammad is His messenger – that Paradise and Hell are confirmed facts, death is a reality and Judgment Day is imminent, and that Allah will raise the people from the dead?”

They replied: “Yes, we testify to it.”

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “O Allah be a witness to this.”

Then His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) said: “Do you not give ear?”

All said: “Yes, we are listening.”

He said: “I will reach the Kauthar Pool first and you shall meet me there. It is a vast pool as long as the distance between Sanaa¹ and Busra². There are silver cups in it, equal to the number of stars in the sky. Take care how you behave with the two weighty things³ after me.”

Someone asked: “What do you mean by ‘two weighty things’?”

He replied: “The greater weighty thing is the Book of Allah. One of its ends is in the hand of Allah and the other is with you. You must remain attached to it, so that you never go astray. The lesser weighty thing is my Ahle Bayt. The Kind and all-knowing Lord has informed me that the two shall not separate till they meet me at the Kauthar Pool. Going ahead of them or leaving them behind will destroy you.”

After that His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) held the hands of Ali (a.s.) and raised them so high that the whiteness of the armpits was visible. He asked:

“Who is having more discretion on your selves than yourself?”

All said: “Allah and His messenger know better.”

He said: “Indeed, Allah is my master and I am the master of the believers and more deserving (superior) than them, having more right than they have on themselves. Of whomsoever I am the master; this Ali (also) is the master.”

He repeated this thrice.

Then he said: “O Allah, be a friend of one, who befriends Ali and be inimical to those, who are inimical to Ali. Love one, who loves Ali and hate one, who hates Ali⁴, help one, who helps Ali and degrade one, who insults Ali. And turn the truth in whichever direction Ali turns.

O people, those present here are obliged to convey this to those, who are absent.”

As soon as the sermon of the Prophet was concluded, Jibraeel descended

¹ Sana, capital of Yemen.

² A village near Damascus, which is presently famous as Kura Hauran.

³ Ref: *Tahdibul Lugha*, Azhari; *An-Nihaya fee Ghareebul Hadith*, Ibne Asir; *Lesaanul Arab*, Ibne Manzur; *Qaamoosul Moheet*, Firozabadi under the word: TH-Q-L.

⁴ Wilayat is a kind of affection having aspects of help and assistance; its opposite is enmity and absence of help and assistance.

with the following verse of Quran:

اللَّيْوَمَةَ أَكْمَلْتُ لَكُمْ دِيْنَكُمْ وَأَمْبَثْتُ عَلَيْكُمْ نِعْمَتِي وَرَضِيَتْ لَكُمْ
الإِسْلَامَ دِيْنًا

**“This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed
My favor on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion.”¹**

Here, the seal of the prophets said: “God is the greatest for the perfection of religion and completion of favor, and the pleasure of the Lord with His message and the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali after me.”

At that time people congratulated Imam Ali (a.s.).

Abu Bakr and Umar were among the first of those, who congratulated Ali (a.s.) and each of them said:

“Congratulations, O son of Abu Talib! This day you have become my master and the master of all believing men and women.”

Ibne Abbas says: “By God, Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali (a.s.) became obligatory on everyone.”

This is the gist of the incident of Ghadeer, on which the Islamic Ummah has consensus and there is no other incident named as Ghadeer other than this, in such a way that if the word of Ghadeer is mentioned, no other incident comes to mind and if it is asked where is the location of Ghadeer? It is the same pool of Khum, near Johfa.

This is the viewpoint of all scholars and researchers; only Dr. Mulhim Ibrahim Aswad, in the footnote to *Diwan* of Abu Tammam, has introduced this incident as a battle! We will analyze this claim in the chapter on Abu Tammam in this book.

¹ Surah Maidah 5:3

Special attention to the tradition of Ghadeer

Allah, the Mighty and the High has bestowed great fame to the tradition of Ghadeer: so much so that it is mentioned by all reporters of traditions continuously through the ages, so that it may be a firm evidence for the supporter of His religion, Ali (a.s.), and that he may be the Imam and chief of believers.

That is why, majority of the people, upon return of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) from the greater Hajj (*Hajje Akbar*) acquired a special condition till Almighty Allah made its announcement definite and His Messenger also hastened to implement it.

Groups of people had surrounded him from the Islamic territories; those gone ahead were called back and those left behind were waited for, and this tradition was conveyed to the ears of all.¹ He ordered that those present should inform those, who are absent, so that all the people present in that gathering become reporters of this tradition, a gathering, which exceeded a hundred thousand persons.

Allah, the Mighty and the High did not rest content with this number; on the contrary He revealed verses regarding this, so that they may be recited day and night by new generations and Muslims remember this incident in every period; and created means of their guidance and a point of reference they can recognize, through which they may derive their religion.

Such attention was paid by the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to this matter that that year a large number of people were invited to perform Hajj and people joined in groups after groups, because he knew that at the end of this journey a great announcement was to be made.

A great news was completed from the citadel of faith, which exalted and pleased its community over other people and applied its command between the east and west; although if this Ummah understands where its well being lies and

¹ Nasai from one of the channels of the tradition of Ghadeer from Zaid bin Arqam in *Khasais*: 21 [Pg. 96, H. 79], and *Sunan Kubra*, 5:130, H. 8464 has narrated a tradition, in which it is mentioned: Abu Tufayl asked: Have you heard this tradition from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)? He replied: [Yes] there was no one there that did not see the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) with his own eyes and heard his sermon with his ears.

Zahabi has also mentioned regarding this in *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer Shami*, 5:208 [5/228, Events of the year 10 A.H.]; and in *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, in a tradition of Ghadeer Pg. 94, it is mentioned: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) called out in a loud voice...

Ibne Jauzi has written as follows in *Manaqib*: One hundred and twenty thousand persons comprising of companions, Bedouins and all those, who lived on the outskirts of Mecca and Medina had accompanied the Prophet and witnessed the Farewell Hajj and heard these statements.

sees the path of its guidance through insight.¹

With this aim, the Holy Imams (a.s.) have always mentioned this incident and through this, proved the Imamate of their ancestor, Imam Ali (a.s.). In the same way Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) himself protested through this tradition all his life and in every gathering, and made those companions remember it; those who were present in Ghadeer and heard the tradition directly from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

All this was so that the event of Ghadeer, in spite of the passage of time, should remain fresh and due to this the Holy Imams (a.s.) ordered their Shia to celebrate the day of Ghadeer as Eid and customs of greetings and celebrations should be promoted, so that every year the greatness of this incident is renewed.

Shia Imamiyah also acted in the most excellent and incomparable way on the day of Eid of Ghadeer, and gathered at the tomb of Imam Ali (a.s.) and elders of tribes and leaders of country from far and near to spread the remembrance of this valuable day.

They recite² a lengthy Ziyarat narrated from the Holy Imams (a.s.), which explains the articles of Imamate and quoting from the Quran and Sunnah is a firm evidence of Caliphate and successorship of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and which narrates the story of Ghadeer in detail. Especially the day of Ghadeer is also having recommended prayers, fasts and supplications, in which the reminder of Ghadeer day is mentioned. Shia have performed those acts in all centers, areas, cities and villages.

As for the books of Shia, including traditional, historical and scholastic, whichever of them is referred, it is seen brimming with points about Ghadeer.

I think Ahle Sunnat are not much behind the Shia Imamiyah in proving the Ghadeer tradition, acceptance of its veracity, reliance upon it, belief in its authenticity and confession of its being widely narrated³. But few individuals,

¹ In *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:109 [1/175, H. 861], quoting from Zaid bin Yashi from Ali from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said in a tradition: If you accept Ali (a.s.) as your leader – but I know that you will not do that – you will find that he is a guide and the guided one, who will take you on the straight path.

In *Tareekh Khateeb Baghdadi*, 11:47 [No. 5728] through his chains from Huzaifah in a tradition – whose beginning is fabricated and it is added – from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: If you accept Ali (a.s.) as the caretaker and leader of the matter of Caliphate, you will find him a guide and a guided one, who will take you on the straight path.

And it is mentioned in the traditional report of Abu Dawood: If you accept Ali (a.s.) as your ruler – which you will never do – he will take you on the right path and you will find him a guided and a guided one.

In other statement it is mentioned: And if you make Ali (a.s.) as your leader – and I don't think that you will do that – you will find him a guide and a guided one and he will take care of you on the straight path.

² Pl. refer: *Behaarul Anwaar*, 97/359, H. 6.

³ Ahmad bin Hanbal has narrated it through 40 channels; Ibne Jarir Tabari through some 70 channels; Jazari Maqri has narrated through 80 channels; Ibne Uqdah has narrated through 105 channels; Abu Saeed Sajistani has narrated through 120 channels; Abu Bakr Joabi has

following the path of deviation, or with blind prejudice have turned the discussion on secondary and misleading meanings; and their view is not the expression of the view of scholars of the society in general; it is only their personal view.

narrated through 125 channels. Under the addenda to the book of *Hidaytul Uqul*, 30, from Amir Muhammad Yemeni, a poet of Ghadeer in the twelfth century, it is narrated that there are 150 channels for the tradition of Ghadeer.

Narrators of the tradition of Ghadeer from the companions of Prophet

In *Al-Ghadeer*, after compiling the chains of narrators, Allamah Amini,¹ has mentioned 110 important companions, who narrated the tradition of Ghadeer, then he says:²

“According to prevailing circumstances, the number of narrators of this traditions should have been much higher, because companions, who heard and memorized this tradition numbered more than a hundred thousand. Naturally upon their return they must have conveyed it to others, since it is the habit of every traveler to report the highlights of his journey. We will mention only 25 from those mentioned by the author.”³

1. Abu Huraira al-Dowsi, he lived for 78 years (d. 57-59 A.H.)⁴
2. Asma binte Umais Khathamia
- * Ibne Uqda, in the book of *Wilayah*,⁵ has narrated through a chain of narrators from her.
3. Umme Salma (wife of the Prophet).⁶
4. Umme Hani binte Abi Talib.⁷
5. Abu Hamza Anas Ibne Malik Ansari Khazraji (the servant of the Prophet, d. 93).⁸
6. Jabir Ibne Abdullah Ansari: He lived for 94 years and he died in Medina (d. 73/74/78 A.H.).⁹
7. Abu Zar Jundab bin Junada Ghiffari (d. 31 A.H.).¹⁰
8. Hassan Ibne Thabit.

For his biography refer to the section about the poets of Ghadeer from the

¹ Pl. refer: *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/41-144.

² *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/144.

³ Names are mentioned in alphabetical order.

⁴ Pl. refer: *Tahzeebul Kamaal*, [20/484. no. 4089]; *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 7:337 [7/296]; *Manaqib Khwarizmi*: 130 [Pg. 156, H. 184]; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:259 [19/3]; *Tareekh Madina Damishq* [12/234]; *Taareekhul Kholafa*; 114 [Pg. 158]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:154 [11/609, H. 32950; and 13/157, H. 36486].

⁵ *Kitabul Wilayah*/152.

⁶ *Jawahirul Iqdain* [Pg. 174]; *Yanabiul Mawaddah*: 40 [1/38, Chap. 4].

⁷ *Jawahirul Iqdain* [Pg. 174]; *Yanabiul Mawaddah*: 40 [1/38, Chap. 4].

⁸ *Al-Maarif*: 291 [Pg. 580]; *Maqtal Imam Husain (a.s.)*, Khwarizmi [1/48]; *Taareekhul Kholafa*; 114 [Pg. 158]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:154 & 403 [11/609, H. 32950; and 13/157, H. 36486].

⁹ *Al-Istiab*, Ibne Abde Barr 2:473 [Part Three/1099, No. 1855]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:398 [13/137, H. 36430; and 36433].

¹⁰ *Faraaezus Simtain*, Chap. 58 [1/315, H. 250]; *Maqtal Imam Husain (a.s.)*, Khateeb Khwarizmi [1/48].

first century after Hijrat.

9. Imam Hasan Mujtaba (a.s.), grandson of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

in *Kitabul Wilayah*,¹ Ibne Uqdah has mentioned the tradition of Imam Hasan Mujtaba (a.s.) through chains that he provided; Khwarizmi has also included him among the narrators of the tradition of Ghadeer.²

10. Chief of the martyrs, Imam Husain (a.s.), grandson of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).³

11. Zubair Ibne Awwam Qarshi, killed in 36 A.H.

He is one of the ten persons, who ‘were given glad tidings of Paradise’.⁴ Ibne Maghzili has regarded all of them as narrators of the tradition of Ghadeer.⁵

In *Asniul Mataalib*, Jazari Shafei has also considered him as the reporter of the tradition of Ghadeer.⁶

12. Abu Ishaq, Saad Ibne Abi Waqqas (d. 54-55-56-58).⁷

13. Abu Abdullah, Salman Farsi, who lived for approximately 300 years (d. 36-37).⁸

14. Ayesha Ibne Abi Bakr (wife of the Prophet).

Ibne Uqdah has quoted Hadeese Wilayah⁹ from her.

15. Abbas Ibne Abdul Muttalib Ibne Hashim, uncle of the Prophet (d. 32 A.H.).¹⁰

16. Abdullah Ibne Ja’far Ibne Abi Talib Hashemi (d. 80 A.H.). Ibne Uqdah has narrated the tradition of Ghadeer from him, and he challenged Muawiyah

¹ Kitabul Wilayah/150.

² [And Zahabi in *Kitab Ghadeer*, H. 121; Salihin Shahbuddin Eiji in *Taudheehud Dalail*, 197 A.H. He has included him among companions, from whom the tradition of Ghadeer is narrated.

³ *Maqtal Imam Husain (a.s.)*, Khateeb Khwarizmi [1/48].

⁴ On the basis of the tradition attributed to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), which was fabricated during the period of Uthman, he gave glad tidings of Paradise to ten persons; therefore it became famous as ‘ashra mubashira’ (ten persons who got glad tiding of Paradise). These ten were: Ali (a.s.), Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman, Talha, Zubair, Saad bin Abi Waqqas, Abdur Rahman bin Auf, Abu Ubaidah bin Jarrah, Saad bin Zaid bin Amr. It is astonishing that Ali (a.s.) and his enemies will come together even in Paradise. Ref: *Sunan Tirmizi*, 5/311, H. 3830, 3831, 3832; *Sunan Abi Dawood*, 2/401, H. 2648; *Musnad Ahmad*, 1/193. And another edition: 1/316, H. 1678.

In *Khatat Maqrizia*, 2/332, Taqiuuddin Maqrizi claims that these persons were jurists during lifetime of Prophet; Ref: *Hisrul Ijtehaad*, Aga Buzurg Tehrani/71].

⁵ Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), [Pg. 27, H. 39.]

⁶ *Asniul Mataalib*: 3 [Pg. 48]

⁷ Khasais Ameerul Momineen, Khasais Nasai: 3[Pg. 28, H. 9]; Sonan Kubra [5/107, H. 8397]

⁸ *Faraaezus Simtain*, Chap. 58 [1/315, H. 250].

⁹ Kitabul Wilayah/152.

¹⁰ *Asniul Mataalib*: 3 [Pg. 48].

through it.¹

17. Abdullah Ibne Abbas (d. 68).²

18. Abu Abdul Rahman, Abdullah Ibne Umar Ibne Khattab Adawi (d. 72/73).³

19. Abu Abdul Rahman, Abdullah Ibne Masud Hazali (d. 32/33). He is buried at Baqi.⁴

20. Uthman bin Affan (d. 35).

He is a member of Ashra Mubashshira, whom Ibne Maghazili⁵ has narrated among the hundred reporters of Hadees Ghadeer.

21. Ameerul Momineen, Ali ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).⁶

His couplet regarding Ghadeer is well known and reliable narrators have mentioned it.

This couplet is mentioned in the section about the poets of the first century. In the same way, the incident of Imam Ali's protest on the day of Shura and Battle of Jamal through the tradition of Ghadeer and his challenge about the tradition of Ghadeer in Rahba will also be mentioned.

22. Umar Ibne Khattab (killed 23 A.H.).⁷

23. Amr Aas.⁸

He was a poet of Ghadeer, who will be mentioned in the section on the poets of Ghadeer in the first century. A man from Hamadan, named 'Burd' agitated through the tradition of Ghadeer and finally Amr Aas confessed to this tradition.⁹

24. Siddiqa Tahira, Fatima, the daughter of the Prophet.¹⁰

25. Fatima binte Hamza Ibne Abdul Muttalib.

Ibne Uqda,¹¹ and also Mansur Raazi in the book of *Al-Ghadeer*, has narrated this tradition from her.

¹ Kitab Sulaum bin Qais, [2/834, H. 42].

² *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, Hafiz Nasai: 7 [Pg. 47, H. 24]; *Sonan Kubra* [2/112, H. 8405].

³ *Jaameul Ahadees* [7/369, H. 23003]; *Taareekhul Kholafa*: 114 [Pg. 158]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:154 [11/609, H. 32950].

⁴ *Durre Mansoor*, 2:298 [3/117]; *Fathul Qadeer* [2/60]; *Ruhul Maani*, 2:348 [6/193].

⁵ *Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib* (a.s.) [Pg. 27, H. 39.]

⁶ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:152 [1/246, H. 1313]

⁷ *Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib* (a.s.) [Pg. 22, H. 31]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:202 [3/152], Mohibuddin Tabari 2:161 [3/113. 114; and 4/204].

⁸ *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, Ibne Qutaibah, 93 [1/97]; *Manaqib*, Khwarizmi: 126 [Pg. 199, H. 240].

⁹ *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, Ibne Qutaibah, 93 [1/97].

¹⁰ *Asniul Mataalib*: 50; *Mawaddatul Qurba*, Ali bin Shahbuddin Hamadani, Mawaddat 5.

¹¹ *Kitabul Wilayah*/153

Narrators of Ghadeer tradition from companions of companions¹ of the Prophet

In *Al-Ghadeer*,² Allamah Amini has mentioned eighty-four persons from companions of companions, through whom the tradition of Ghadeer is narrated. We shall only mention six of them here for the sake of brevity:

1. Abul-Qasim Asbagh bin Nubata, from the people of Kufa.³

Ajali⁴ and Ibne Moin have regarded him as a reliable companion of companions.

2. Saalim bin Abdallah bin Umar bin Khattab, Qarshi. Adawi, Madani.

In the book of *Tadhkira*,⁵ Dhahabi has given his biography and stated:

“He was an expert jurist and of those, who combined knowledge and acts; and piety and nobility.”

It is mentioned in the book of *Taqreeb*⁶ that:

“He was one of the seven jurisprudents, and he did not say a word without evidence. He was a pious man and in honesty and trustworthiness, he was like his father. He is included among well known persons of the third category. On the basis of an authentic statement, he passed away at the end of the year 106 A.H.”

3. Umar bin Abdul Aziz, Umayyad Caliph (d. 101 A.H.).⁷

4. Umar bin Ali, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

In the book of *Taqreeb*⁸, it is mentioned:

“He was reliable and was among narrators of the third category. He passed away during the reign of Walid and according to one view, he died before that.”

5. Muhammad bin Umar bin Ali, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). He passed away during the reign of Umar bin Abdul Aziz and it is said that he died in 100 A.H.

Ibne Habban⁹ has mentioned him as a reliable narrator and Ibne Hajar¹⁰

¹ [‘Sahabi’ or companion is said to be a Muslim, who has seen the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.); in addition to have seen the Prophet, he should also have narrated traditions from him; *Majmaul Bahrayn*, under the word of S-H-B. ‘Tabii’ is a Muslim, who did not see the Prophet, on the contrary, he met a companion].

² *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/145-166

³ *Usudul Ghaba*, 3/307; 5:205 [3/469, No. 3341]

⁴ *Tareekh Seqat*: 71, No. 109.

⁵ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, Zahabi 1:77 [1/88, No. 77].

⁶ *Taqreebut Tahzeeb* [1/280, No. 11, Letter ‘seen’ S].

⁷ Hilyatul Awliya, Abu Nuaim 5: 364; *Tareekh Madinatul Damishq*, 5: 320 [6/251].

⁸ *Taqreebut Tahzeeb* 281 [2/61, No. 490, Letter ‘Ain’ ‘A].

⁹ *As-Seqat* [5/353].

¹⁰ *Taqreebut Tahzeeb*, [2/194, No. 562, Letter ‘meem’ M].

says:

“He was truthful and honest; he was from the third category of narrators of traditions and he died at the age of thirty years.”¹

6. Maroof bin Kharbuz.²

Ibne Habban has regarded him as trustworthy.³

¹ [It is mentioned in *Tabaqat Ibne Saad*, 249, No. 136 that: He was alive till the beginning of the Caliphate of Abul Abbas...his tenure was between year 132 and 136 A.H.].

² In *Khulasa* [3/44, No. 7107], Khazraji has recorded his name as follows: ‘Kharraboodh’ [and it is mentioned in *Taqreebut Tahzeeb*, Ibne Hajar 2/200 as ‘Kharraboodh’ and ‘Kharboodh’].

³ As-Seqat, 5:439.

Classes of narrators from the scholars

The late Allamah Amini in the book of *Al-Ghadeer*,¹ has mentioned 360 scholars from the second to the fourteenth century, who mentioned this tradition in their books through various chains of narrators. Some of them are as follows:

1. Imam of the Shafeis, Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Idris Shafei (d. 204 A.H.).

As is mentioned in *Nihaya* of Ibne Athir², he (Idris Shafei) has narrated the tradition of Ghadeer.³

2. Muhammad bin Kathir, Abu Abdallah Abdi Basri, brother of Sulaiman Ibne Kathir, who was fifty years elder to him. Ibne Habban has said:⁴

“He was a trustworthy and an accomplished person and he died in 223 A.H. at the age of a hundred years.”

3. Imam of Hanbalis, Abu Abdallah Ahmad bin Hanbal Shaibani (d. 241 A.H.).

He has narrated the tradition of Ghadeer through numerous authentic chains in his books of *Musnad*⁵ and *Manaqib*.

4. Hafiz Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ismail Bukhari, died 256 A.H. author of *Saheeh*, which is one of the six canonical books of traditions for Ahle Sunnat.

He has narrated this tradition in his book of *Tarikh*.⁶ (It is strange that he abstain from mentioning it in his *Saheeh* and in this way, put a question mark on the authenticity of *Saheeh Bukhari*).

5. Hafiz Muhammad bin Isa Abu Isa Tirmizi (d. 279).

He is among the six authors of the Sihah Sitta and he is from every aspect of impeccable reliability.

6. Hafiz Ahmad bin Yahya Balazari (d. 279 A.H.).

Muslim Scholars have trusted him and his books and his books are quoted from that time till date. He has brought this tradition in the book of *Ansabul Ashraf*.⁷

7. Hafiz Abdullah bin Ahmad bin Hanbal, Abu Abdur Rahman Shaibani (d.

¹ *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/167-311.

² An-Nihaya fee Ghareebul Hadith wal Athar, 4: 246 [5/224].

³ *Manaqib Shafei*, Baihaqi [1/337].

⁴ As-Seqat, 9:77.

⁵ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1/84, 118, 119, 152 and 331; 4/281, 368-372; 5/347, 366, 370 and 419.

⁶ *Tareekh Bukhari*, 1: Part 1, Pg. 375.

⁷ *Ansabul Ashraf*, Balazari, [2/108-112].

290).

In his *Tarikh*,¹ Khatib Baghdadi has praised him for his reliability, honesty and perception of the subject matter. Dhahabi has said in his book of *Tadkira*:

“We always see that senior scholars testify in favor of Abdullah for his identification of reporters of traditions, and recognizing the causes of tradition [difficulties and weaknesses in traditions] and the names of the narrators and care and continuity on seeking the tradition; so much so that some of them have exaggerated and said that he was most prolific than his father - Imam of the Hanbalis.”

8. Hafiz Abu Abdur Rahman Ahmad bin Shuaib Nasai, author of *Sunan*, died in 303 A.H. at the age of eighty-eight years.

In his book of *Tadkira*,² Dhahabi has narrated from Darqutni as follows:

“He (Nasai) has narrated the tradition of Ghadeer in the books of *Sunan*³ and *Kitab Khasais*⁴ through numerous chains, all of which are authentic and narrated through reliable persons.

9. Hafiz Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari, Abu Ja’far, author of *Tafseer* and the famous *Tarikh Tabari* (d. 310 A.H.). Dhahabi has said in *Tadkira*,⁵ that he was pious and extremely religious; he has written a separate book regarding Ghadeer.

10. Abu Umar Ahmad bin Abde Rabb Qurtubi (d. 328 A.H.).

In his book of *Tarikh*,⁶ Ibne Khallikan has mentioned as follows in his biography:

“He (Qurtubi) was a learned person, who had memorized a large number of traditions and he possessed an encompassing knowledge of traditional reports. He has written *Iqdul Fareed*, which is a very useful book.”

It is mentioned in the book of *Iqdul Fareed*⁷ that:

“Ali accepted Islam at the age of 15 years. He was the first to confess that there is no god, except Allah and Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah and the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said regarding him: Ali is the master of whomsoever I am the master. O Allah, love those, who love Ali and be inimical to those, who are inimical to Ali.”

11. Hafiz Ali bin Umar bin Ahmad Darqutni⁸ (d. 385 A.H.).

His biography is mentioned in numerous books of biography and history.

¹ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, 1:237 [2/665, No. 685]

² *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, 2:268 [2/698, No. 719]

³ *Sunan Kubra*, 5/45, 108, 130-136

⁴ *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*: 50, 64, 94-96, 100 and 104

⁵ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, 1:277-283 [2/710, No. 728].

⁶ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:34 [1/110, No. 46].

⁷ *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:275 [4/122].

⁸ *Ilal Darqutni*, 3/224; 4/91

Khatib Baghdadi has mentioned in his book of *Tarikh*:¹

“He was an extraordinary man of his time. He was a senior leader and an incomparable person of his era. He was the final authority in knowledge of traditions, identification of weak traditions, names of narrators and account of tradition narrators. He was truthful, honest and just and his testimony was accepted by all. He possessed correct belief and his faith was perfect; and he possessed expertise in sciences other than the science of traditions.”

12. Mutakallim Qaazi Muhammad bin Tayyab bin Muhammad Abu Bakr Baqilani (d. 403 A.H.) was a native of Basra and had settled in Baghdad. He was a senior scholar of scholastic theology and he wrote many books on this subject.

Khatib Baghdadi in his book of *Tarikh*², has testified to his veracity and praised him.

13. Abu Ishaq Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Ibrahim Thalabi Nishapuri,³ the famous writer of Quranic exegesis (d. 427-437 A.H.).

Ibne Khallikan has written in his book of history:⁴

“He was a unique scholar of traditions of his time. He is author of *Tafseer Kabeer*, which is among most important exegeses.”

14. Hafiz Ahmad bin Husain bin Ali, Abu Bakr Baihaqi, who died 458 A.H. at the age of eighty-four years. Majority of writers of biography and history have mentioned his biography.

Ibne Athir has mentioned him in the book of *Al-Kamil*⁵ as follows:

“He was a follower of Shafei school and the Imam of traditions and jurisprudence. He has written numerous books of history, one of them being *Sunan al-Kabeer* in ten volumes. He was pure hearted and a pious man.”

15. Hafiz Abu Umar Yusuf bin Abdullah bin Muhammad bin Abde Barr Namri Qurtubi, born 368 A.H. and died 463 A.H. He is the author of *Al-Istiab*. He was proficient in the science of lineage and traditional reports.⁶

16. Abu Hasan Ali bin Muhammad Jullabi Shafei, alias Ibne Maghazili (d. 483 A.H.).

His book of *Manaqib*⁷ shows his expertise in the science of traditions and its branches.

17. Hafiz Abu Hamid bin Abu Muhammad Tusi Ghazzali, famous as

¹ Tareekh Baghdad, 12:34.

² Tareekh Baghdad, 5:379.

³ Tafseer Salabi, 4/92; 10/35

⁴ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:22 [1/79, No. 31].

⁵ *Al-Kamil fit Taareekh*, 10:20 [6/238, Incidents of year 458 A.H.].

⁶ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, Zahabi 3:324 [3/1128. No. 1013].

⁷ Zahabi in the famous book of *Qurratul Kabair*, 2:566 has quoted the book of *Manaqib Ali (a.s.)*, Pg. 16 in the chapter entitled: Chapter of the saying of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.): Of whomsoever I am the master, this Ali is also his master. In that chapter, he has narrated this tradition from nine person through 17 channels from no. 23 to 39.

Hujjatul Islam (d. 505 A.H.).

His biography and praise is mentioned in most books of biography.¹

18. Abul Qasim Jarullah Mahmud bin Umar Zamakhshari² (d. 538 A.H.).

Ibne Khallikan has mentioned his biography in his book of *Tarikh*³.

“He was a senior scholar of exegesis, tradition and rhetoric; an incomparable imam of his time. People came to him from far and near to gain from his knowledge.”

19. Abul Fath Muhammad bin Abdul Qasim Abdul Karim Shahristani Shafei:

He was among the Ashairah scholastic theologian. He died in 548 A.H.

Ibne Khallikan⁴ has described him as follows:

“He was a prominent imam, jurist and scholastic theologian.”

In his book of *Tabaqat*,⁵ Subki has mentioned his biography. Shahristani has praised him in the book of *Al-Milal wan Nihal*.⁶ He has mentioned the tradition of Ghadeer in the book of *Al-Milal wan Nihal*.

20. Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Umar bin Husain Fakhrudin Raazi Shafei (d. 606 A.H.), author of *Tafseer Kabeer*, well known exegesis. Ibne Khallikan has described him in his book of *Tarikh*⁷ as follows:

“He was a unique personality of his time and he possessed many nice qualities. He was incomparable in scholasticism, logic and *Ilme Awail*⁸ (reports of former times) and commanded precedence over the scholars of his time.”

21. Hafiz Ahmad bin Abdullah was the *Faqih* of Haram, Muhibbuddin Abu Abbas Tabari Makki Shafei (d. 694 A.H.).

In his *Tabaqat*⁹, Subki has mentioned his biography and has extolled him.

He has mentioned the tradition of Ghadeer in his two books, *Riyadhus Nazarah* and *Zakhairul Uqbah*,¹⁰ through numerous chains of narrators.

22. Hafiz Ahmad bin Ali bin Muhammad Abul Fazl Asqalani Misri Shafei, alias Ibne Hajar, born 773 A.H. and died 825 A.H. He is author of *Isabah* and

¹ Subki has mentioned his biography in *Tabaqatush Shafiyatul Kubra*, 4:101-182 [6/191. no. 694]

² Zamakhshar is a village in the province of Khwarizm [*Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 3/147].

³ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 2:197 [5/168, No. 711].

⁴ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 2:273 [1/611].

⁵ *Tabaqatush Shafiyatul Kubra*, 4:78 [6/128. no. 653].

⁶ *Al-Melal Wa al-Nehal*, 1/163

⁷ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 2:48 [4/248, No. 600].

⁸ *Ilm Awail*: It is a science if the beginning of incidents according to nativity and lineage. It includes all incidents connected to everyone and to every place. It is a branch of history. One of the books on this topic is *Kitabul Awail* by Abu Hilal Askari (d. 395); Ref: *Kashfuz Zunoon*, Haji Khalifah 1/199.

⁹ *Tabaqatush Shafiyatul Kubra*, 5:9 [8/18, No. 1046].

¹⁰ *Zakhaerul Uqbah*, 47-48; 87-88.

*Tahzibut Tahzeeb*¹.

23. Hafiz Jalaluddin Abdur Rahman bin Kamaluddin Misri Suyuti² Shafei (d. 911 A.H.).

Abdul Hayy in the book of *Shazaraatul Zahab*³, has mentioned his biography and praised him excessively. After the mention of his books, he has written: he saw the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) more than seventy times in wakefulness. He has also attributed that he possessed the power of folding the land. Ibne Idroos, in the book of *Nurus Saafir*⁴, has also mentioned and extolled him and also mentioned some of his perfections and writings.

24. Hafiz Shahabuddin Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Ali bin Hajar Haithami Saadi Ansari Shafei, born 909 A.H. and died 974 A.H. in Mecca. In the book of *Nurus Saafir*,⁵ Ibne Idroos has mentioned his biography in detail.

25. Sayyid Muhammad bin Abdullah Husaini Alusi Shahabuddin Abu Sana Baghdadi Shafei, born 1217 A.H. in Karkh and died 1270 A.H. He was one of the most noble and elder person of Iraq. He was accomplished in arts and had expertise in numerous sciences. He was from a famous Iraqi family and was rooted in knowledge and literature. He has written numerous valuable books.⁶

إِنَّ فِي ذَلِكَ لِذِكْرٍ لِمَنْ كَانَ لَهُ قَلْبٌ أَوْ أَلْقَى السَّمْعَ وَهُوَ شَهِيدٌ⁷

“Most surely there is a reminder in this for him who has a heart or he gives ear and is a witness.”⁷

¹ Sakhawi has written his detailed biography in *Zual Laame*, 3:36-40 and has mentioned his teachers and his writings; and has also praised him. Also Abdul Hayy in *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 7:270-273 [9/395, events of year 852 A.H.] has praised him in excess.

² Related to the town of Asyut in the area west of Nile from the province of Saeed [*Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 1/193].

³ *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 8:51-55 [10/74, events of year 911 A.H.].

⁴ *An-Noorus Saafir*, 54-57 [Pg. 51-54, events of year 911 A.H.].

⁵ *An-Noorus Saafir*, 287-292 [Pg. 258-263, events of year 974 A.H.]: and refer: *Al-Badrut Taale*, 1:109.

⁶ His biography can be seen in the book of *Elamul Iraq*, 21, and *Mashaheerul Iraq*, 2:198.

⁷ Surah Qaf 50:37

Writers about the tradition of Ghadeer

The attention of scholars to this tradition was to the extent that they did not stop at just quoting this incident in their books; they went a step further and wrote independent books on this tradition. With this aim, they compiled chains of authorities of this report, which end with them and have fixed the channels, which they found authentic. These efforts were exerted in order to safeguard the text from destruction and interpolation. Among such writers are:

1. Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Jarir bin Yazid bin Khalid Tabari Amili, born 224 A.H. and died 310 A.H. He has written *Kitabul Wilayah* regarding the tradition of Ghadeer, in which he has narrated this tradition through more than seventy channels. Hamawi, in *Mojamul Odaba*¹, has mentioned in the biography of Tabari as follows:

“He wrote a book regarding the excellence of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). In the beginning of this book, he has discussed the authenticity of traditional report of Ghadeer Khum and then mentioned the excellence of Ali, although he had not covered all the merits and in the end said.²

‘He kept away from any innovator that he came across.’”

2. Abu Abbas Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Saeed Hamadani Hafiz, alias Ibne Uqdah (d. 333 A.H.).

He has written the book of *Kitabul Wilayah* on the chains of narrators of tradition of Ghadeer, in which he had mentioned this tradition through 105 channels. Ibne Athir, in *Usudul Ghaba* and Ibne Hajar in his book of *Isabah* have quoted extensively from this book.

The late Allamah Amini, in his book of *Al-Ghadeer*³, has mentioned sixty-six books in this regard and at the end, he says:

Regarding Ghadeer Khum, other books also exist, which will be mentioned in the discussion of the Prayer (*Salaat*) of Ghadeer.

كَلَّا لِمَنْ شَاءَ ذَكَرَهُ فِي سُكْنَى مُكَرَّمَةٍ

“Nay! surely it is an admonishment. So let him who pleases mind it. In honored books,”⁴

¹ Mo'jamul Odaba, 18:80.

² Mo'jamul Odaba, 18:84.

³ *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/313. 325

⁴ Surah Abasa 80:11-13

Swearing by and reasoning through the tradition of Ghadeer

Always, from the early period of Islam till the present century, this tradition is counted as the complete principle of Islam. The proximate ones have faith in it and deniers narrate it, without denying its occurrence.

In debates, upon reaching this tradition, the discussion reaches its end and from this aspect there are numerous reasoning through it and challenging through it among the companions and companions of companions during the period of Ali, and after that.

Among the first of those, who argued through this tradition was Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in the Masjid of the Prophet after the passing away of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

Sulaym bin Qays Hilali has mentioned this challenge in his book.¹ One, who wishes, may refer to that book. We will also present other reasonings as well:

1. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of Shura in the year 23 A.H. or beginning of 24 A.H.

In the book of *Manaqib*², Khwarizmi Hanafi has narrated from Aamir bin Wathila:

“I was standing besides the door of the house on the day of Shura with Ali (a.s.) and I heard His Eminence tell them:

“I present such reasoning that no Arab or non-Arab can challenge it,”

Then he said: “O people, I adjure you by Allah, did any of you before me, testify to the oneness of God?”

“No,” they said.

He asked: “I adjure you by Allah, does any of you have a brother like Ja’far Tayyar, who is in Paradise with angels?”

“No, by Allah,” they said.

He asked: “I adjure you by Allah, does any of you, other than me have someone like my uncle, Hamza, the lion of God and lion of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), chief of the martyrs?”

“No, by Allah,” they said.

¹ Kitab Sulaym bin Qays [2/780, H. 39].

² *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, 217 [Pg. 313, H. 314]; also refer *Faraaezus Simtain*, Imam Hamwaini [1/319, H. 251]; and *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, Ibne Hajar: 75 [Pg. 126]; and *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed 2:61 [6/167], Sermon 73.

He asked: "I adjure you by Allah, does any of you, other than me have a wife like Fatima, daughter of Muhammad, chief of the ladies of Paradise?"

"No, by Allah," they said.

He asked: "I adjure you by Allah, does any of you, other than me have sons like my sons: Hasan and Husain, chiefs of the youths of Paradise?"

"No, by Allah," they said.

He asked: "I adjure you by Allah, did any of you, other than me, give Sadaqah before a private audience with the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)?"

"No, by Allah," they said.

He asked: "I adjure you by Allah, has the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said about anyone, other than me: Ali is the master of one, whose master I am. O Allah love those, who love him and be inimical to one, who is inimical to him and help one, who helps him and (he ordered) those, who were present to inform those, who were absent."

"No, by Allah," they said.

2. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) during the reign of Uthman bin Affan

Through his authorities, Shaykhul Islam, Abu Ishaq Ibrahim bin Saaduddin bin Hamuyi, in the book of *Faraidus Simtain*¹ in the first *Simt* (thread), in chapter fifty-eight, has narrated from the senior companion of companion, Sulaym bin Qays Hilali from Ali (a.s.) that he said in a tradition:

"I adjure you by Allah, do you know for whom was the verse of:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا أَطِيعُوا اللَّهَ وَأَطِيعُوا الرَّسُولَ وَأُولَئِكَ الْمُرْسَلُونَ

"O you who believe! obey Allah and obey the Apostle and those in authority from among you."²

...revealed? and for whom was the verse of:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيَّكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ آمَنُوا الَّذِينَ يُقِيمُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ الزَّكُوَةَ وَهُمْ رَكِعُونَ

"Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow."³

...revealed? And for whom was the following verse revealed?

¹ Faraaezus Simtain, 1:312, H. 250; and Kitab Sulaym bin Qays, 2/636, H. 11.

² Surah Nisa 4:59

³ Surah Maidah 5:55

أَمْ حِسِّبْتُمْ أَنْ تُرْكُوا وَلَمَّا يَعْلَمِ اللَّهُ الَّذِينَ جَهَدُوا مِنْكُمْ وَلَمْ يَتَخَذُوا مِنْ
دُّونِ اللَّهِ وَلَا رَسُولِهِ وَلَا الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَلِيَجْتَهِ اللَّهُ حَبِيرٌ مَا تَعْمَلُونَ ⑤

“What! do you think that you will be left alone while Allah has not yet known those of you who have struggled hard and have not taken anyone as an adherent besides Allah and His Apostle and the believers; and Allah is aware of what you do.”¹

And when people asked the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.): “Is this verse for some particular believers or for all believers generally?”

The Almighty Allah ordered His Prophet to announce the guardians for them. Just as he explained the rituals of prayer and Hajj, he also explained Mastership (*Wilayat*); and this important issue was decided by my appointment in Ghadeer Khum.”

Then the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said in his sermon: “O people, the Almighty Allah placed a message on my shoulders, due to which I was extremely worried and I thought that people would falsify me. So Almighty Allah warned me that if I did not announce it, I would be liable.”

Then as per the command of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) people were summoned for congregation prayers; after the prayers, the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said in a sermon:

“O people, do you know that Allah, the Mighty and Sublime is my master and I am the master of believers; and I have more authority on them than they have on themselves?”

They replied: “Yes, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)”

Then he asked: “O Ali, stand up.”

When I stood up, he said: “Of whomsoever I am the master, this Ali is his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.”

At that time, Salman arose and asked: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), what kind of mastership does Ali have on the believers?”

He replied: “A Mastership (*Wilayat*) like my Mastership. One, to whom I am more deserving than his own self, then Ali also is more deserving than his own self.”

At that time, the Almighty Allah revealed the verse:

الْيَوْمَ أَكْمَلْتُ لَكُمْ دِيْنَكُمْ وَأَتَمَّتُ عَلَيْكُمْ نَعْمَلَتِي وَرَضِيَتُ لَكُمْ
الإِسْلَامَ دِيَنًا

“This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed

¹ Surah Taubah 9:16

My favor on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion.”¹

Then the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) recited the *Takbeer* and said: “Allah is the greatest! Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali after me is what completes my prophethood and my religion.”

After that Abu Bakr and Umar arose and asked: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), are these verses restricted for Ali?”

“Yes,” he replied: “They are restricted for him and my successors till Judgment Day.”

They asked: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), mention your successors for us.”

He replied: “Ali is my brother, my Vizier, my successor and legatee and my representative in my Ummah and the guardian of every believer after me. And after him, his two sons. They will not separate from Quran and Quran will not separate from them till they meet me at Hauze Kauthar.”

At the end of this statement, everyone said to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.): “By Allah, yes, we confess having heard this and we testify to what you said.”

Some also said: “We remember most of what you said and some of it we have forgotten.”

3. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of Rahba² during 35 A.H.

When Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) learnt that they blame him for what is narrated about the precedence of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in praising him and they dispute about his Caliphate, he was present among people in Rahba in Kufa. He challenged those, who disputed the matter of his Caliphate through the tradition of Ghadeer.

Such is the importance of this reasoning and challenge that a large number of companions of companions have mentioned it and it is quoted in books of numerous scholars. I have found it in the statements of four companions and fourteen companions of companions.³ Among them is Abu Sulaiman Muezzin, Abul Qasim Asbagh bin Nubata⁴, companion Zaid bin Arqam Ansari⁵.

¹ Surah Maida 5:3

² Rahba or Rahaba literally means courtyard of Masjid or a house. It also denotes an open space in front of a Masjid or a house. It is an area in Kufa. References found about Rahba imply that it was a large open space near Kufa Masjid, in which Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) used to judge cases, reply to queries and deliver sermons etc. The day of Rahba refers to the day when there was a gathering in Rahba. Ref: *Taajul Oroos*, 1/268; *Majmaul Bahrayn*, 2/79; *Miraatul Uqool*, 4/298; *Kamiluz Ziyaraat*/88; *Musnad Ahmad*, 1/84, 102, 157, 158 & 159; *Wasailush Shia*, 24/388 and 28/107; *Behaarul Anwaar*, 101/356 and 398.

³ This report is very authentic and its narrators are reliable.

⁴ *Usudul Ghaba*, 3/307; 5:205 [3/469, No. 334].

⁵ *Musnad Ahmad*, [6/510, H. 22633].

Ibne Abil Hadeed in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*¹, has through his authorities narrated from Abu Sulaiman Muezzin.

Ali (a.s.) adjured the people: “Which of you have heard from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.): Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is also his master?” A group of people replied in positive, but Zaid bin Arqam, in spite of knowing, refrained from responding and Ali (a.s.) cursed him to become blind, thus he became blind and after his blindness, he mentioned this tradition to people.

4. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and his argument against Talha on the day of the Battle of Jamal in the year 36 A.H.

The great Hafiz, Abu Abdullah Hakeem, in his book of *Mustadrak*², has narrated through his chains from Rafaa Ibne Ayas Zabbi from his father from his grandfather that:

“I was with Ali (a.s.) on the day of the Battle of Jamal. The Imam sent message to Talha bin Ubaidullah to come and meet him. When he came, the Imam asked: ‘I adjure you by Allah, did you not hear from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is also his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him?’

‘Yes,’ he said.

Imam (a.s.) asked: ‘Then why have you come out to fight me?’

He replied: ‘I did not remember it.’

Then Talha went away.

Masudi has also quoted this incident in *Murujuz Zahab*³ and it is as follows:

When Zubair returned, Ali (a.s.) called out to Talha:

‘O Aba Muhammad, what brought you out to fight with me?’

He replied: ‘In revenge for the murder of Uthman.’

Ali (a.s.) said: ‘May Almighty Allah kill all, who have a role in spilling the blood of Uthman. Have you not heard that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said (about me): O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him? You were the first of those, who pledged allegiance to me and then you broke the pledge and Allah, the Mighty and Sublime says:

فَمَنْ نَكَثَ فَإِمَّا يَنْكُثُ عَلَى نَفْسِهِ

“Therefore whoever breaks (his faith), he breaks it only to the

¹ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 1-362 [4/74, Sermon 56].

² *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3/371 [3/419, H. 5594].

³ *Murujuz Zahab*, 2:382; and refer: *Manaqib Khwarizmi Hanafi*: 112 [Pg. 182, H. 221]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:83 [11/332, H. 31662]; *Jameul Jawame*, Suyuti 1:831; and 2:95.

injury of his own soul.”¹

At that time Talha said: ‘I seek the forgiveness of Allah,’ and returned.”

5. Tradition of fame

In Kufa during the year 36-37 A.H.

Imam of the Hanbalis, Ahmad bin Hanbal² has narrated from Yahya bin Adam from Hanash bin Harith bin Laqee Nakhai Ashjai from Riyah bin Harith that:³

Some people came to Ali and said:

“Peace be on you, O our master.”

He said: “How am I your master, while you are Arabs?”

They replied: “We heard from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in Ghadeer that he said:

‘Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is also his master.’”

Jamaluddin Ataullah bin Fazlullah Shirazi in his book, *Al-Arbaeen fee Fadhaail Ameerul Momineen*⁴ has said under the above mentioned of tradition of Ghadeer:

“This tradition is narrated by Zurr bin Jubaish and he said: Ali (a.s.) came out of the castle and a caravan of swordsmen with swords hanging from their necks, turbans the heads, were just setting out; they turned to His Eminence and said: ‘Peace be on you, O Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and mercy of Allah and His blessings. Peace be on you O our master.’”

After replying to the greetings, Ali (a.s.) asked:

“Which companions of Prophet are present here now?”

Twelve persons: Khalid bin Abu Ayyub Ansari, Khuzaimah bin Thabit Zuhayd, Qays bin Thabit bin Shammas, Ammaar bin Yasir, Abu Haitham bin Taihan, Hashim bin Utbah bin Abi Waqqas, Habib bin Budail bin Warqa stood up and testified that on the day of Ghadeer they heard the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) say:

“Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is also his master...”

Then Ali (a.s.) asked Anas bin Malik and Bara bin Azib:

“Why did you not stand up and testify, although you also heard like these people heard?”⁵

¹ Surah Fath 48:10

² *Musnad Ahmad* [6/583, H. 23051 and 23052]; and see *Kashful Ghumma*: 93 [1/324]; *Usudul Ghaba*, 1/368 [1/441, No. 1038].

³ The narrators of this tradition through the chains of Ahmad, Ibne Abi Shaibah, Haithami and Ibne Dizeel are all reliable.

⁴ *Al-Arbaeen fee Fazaael Ameerul Momineen* [Pg. 42, H. 13].

⁵ It is clear that here the phrase of ‘we forgot’ came into being.

Then Ali (a.s.) said: "O Allah, if these two have concealed the statement, involve them in calamities."

Thus, Bara became blind, in such a way that he had to ask others his way home and he used to say:

"How can one cursed by Ali find his way?"

Anas was involved in leprosy from his feet.

Those involved in the curse of Imam Ali (a.s.) for concealing the tradition of Ghadeer

In many traditions of challenge and his protest on the day of Rahba and the day of Rakban, it is hinted that some companions of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), who were present in Ghadeer and who concealed the testimony to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) were involved in curse of Ali (a.s.). In many collections this is clarified in detail. These people were as follows:

1. Abu Hamza Anas bin Malik (d. 90-91-93 A.H.).
2. Baraa bin Azib Ansari (d. 71-72 A.H.).
3. Jarir bin Abdullah Bajali (d. 51-54 A.H.).
4. Zaid bin Arqam Khazraji (d. 66-68 A.H.).
5. Abdur Rahman bin Madlaj.¹
6. Yazid bin Wadiya.

6. Challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of the Battle of Siffeen in 37 A.H.

A great companion of companions, Abu Sadiq Sulaym bin Qays Hilali² has narrated this argumentation in detail, in his book.³ Those who like may refer to it.

7. Protest of the respected daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.)

Shamsuddin Abul Khair Jazari Damishqi Miqri Shafei, in his book of *Asniul*

¹ [In the book of *Usudul Ghaba*, 3/492 it is considered to be the result of those, who concealed and those, who were cursed by Imam Ali (a.s.), but in the book of *Isabah*, 2/421, No. 197 it is mentioned: He was of those, who testified on the day of Rahba hearing the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) say: Of whomsoever I am the master, this Ali is also his master.].

² Kitab Sulaym bin Qays, [2/757, H. 25].

³ *Kitab Sulaym bin Qays* is among the famous books and it was well known in the past ages and the Shia and Sunni tradition writers and historians trusted it; that is why many important Sunni scholars have ended their chains of narrators till this book and have narrated from it; among them are Hakeem Haskani in *Shawahidut Tanzeel Li Qavaaidul Tafseel* [1/47, H. 41], Imam Hamwaini in *Faraaezus Simtai* [1/312, H. 250], Sayyid bin Shahab Hamadani in *Mawaddatul Qurba* [Mawaddat 10], Qunduzi Hanafi in *Yanabiul Mawaddah* [1/27-32 and 114, chap. 38] and others.

*Matalib*¹ *fee Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib*,² has narrated this tradition through his authorities and he has called that chain to be the most subtle and the most rare.

He has narrated from Fatima, daughter of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that she said:

“Have you heard the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in Ghadeer Khum: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. And have you forgotten his statement: You are to me as Harun was to Moosa?”

8. Protest of Imam Abu Muhammad Hasan (a.s.), grandson of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in 41 A.H.

The senior Hafiz scholar, Abu Abbas bin Uqdah, has narrated that when Hasan bin Ali (a.s.) decided to sign the peace accord with Muawiyah, he recited a sermon, in which, after divine praise and glorification and mention of the prophethood and messengership of his grandfather, Muhammad Mustafa, said:

“This Ummah has heard from my grandfather, that: No Ummah ever entrusts its affairs to someone, when persons more knowledgeable than him are present among them, except that they fall into decline till they regret it and they go out in search of that wiser person, whom they had deserted.”

They also heard that he said to my father:

“You are to me as Harun was to Moosa, except that there is not prophet after me.”

Also, they saw when in Ghadeer Khum, he raised the hand of my father and they heard what he said:

“Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.” Then he ordered that those present there should inform those, who were absent.³

9. Challenge of Imam Husain (a.s.), grandson of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) through the tradition of Ghadeer in 58-59 A.H.

The great companion of companions, Abu Sadiq Sulaym bin Qays Hilali⁴ has mentioned many discussion on the severity of the harassments of Muawiyah to the Shia and followers of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) after the martyrdom of the Imam. After that he says:

“Two years⁵ before the death of Muawiyah, Husain bin Ali (a.s.), Abdullah

¹ Asnaul Matalib [Pg. 49].

² Sakhawi in *Zual Laame*, 9:256 [No. 806] and Shaukani in *Al-Badrut Taale*, 2:297 [No. 513] has mentioned this about him.

³ Also refer: *Yanabiul Mawaddah*: 482 [3/150, chap. 90].

⁴ Kitab Sulaym bin Qays [2/788, H. 26].

⁵ According to some versions: One year.

bin Abbas and Abdullah bin Ja'far attended the Hajj. Imam Husain (a.s.) gathered the Muhajireen and Ansar and followers of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), who had performed the Hajj and those, who had not performed the Hajj and said: I adjure you by Allah, do you know that on the day of Ghadeer, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) appointed him and called to his Mastership (*Wilayat*) and said: Those, who are present should convey it to those, who are not present?"

They replied, "By Allah, yes."

It is possible to observe some merits of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in this report, and those who desire, may refer to it.

10. Reasoning of Amr Aas with Muawiyah through the tradition of Ghadeer

Khatib Khwarizmi Hanafi in his book of *Manaqib*¹ mentions a letter of Muawiyah to Amr Aas, in which he had requested him to help him in Battle of Siffen and then quotes the reply of Amr Aas as follows:

"As for your attributing injustice and jealousy to the brother of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and his successor, Abul Hasan with regard to Uthman, accusing him of being a transgressor and thinking that he instigated the killing of Uthman, is nothing more than a lie and a deceit.

Woe be on you O Muawiyah, do you but know that Abul Hasan risked his life to protect the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and slept in his bed. He has precedence over others in Islam and in Hijrat. And the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said regarding him: He is from me and I am from him. He also said: He is to me like Harun was to Moosa. On the day of Ghadeer, he said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. And help one, who helps him and degrade one, who causes disrespect to him."

11. Reasoning of Ammaar Yasir with Amr Aas in the Battle of Siffen

Nasr bin Muzahim Kufi², in *Kitab Siffen*³ has narrated a lengthy tradition of Ammaar addressed to Amr Aas during the Battle of Siffen that he said:

"The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) ordered me to fight the oath-breakers (*Nakiseen*), and I did that.

Also, he ordered me to confront the unjust (*Qasiteen*) and you are that same

¹ *Manaqib*, 124 [Pg. 199, H. 240]

² Ibne Abil Hadeed in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 1-183 [2/206, Sermon 35] has written that: We will mention what Nasr bin Muzahim in the book of Siffen has mentioned as he was a trustworthy and reliable person and narrated traditions accurately, and no one has attributed falsehood and dishonesty to him. He is among the narrators of traditions.

³ *Waqatus Siffen*, 176 [Pg. 338]; Ref: *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:273 [8/21, Sermon 124].

group.

And as for the apostates (*Mariqeen*), I don't know whether I will be able to reach them or not. O one, whose progeny is cut off and who is foolish, do you not know that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said regarding Ali (a.s.):

Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. So, I am the slave of God, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and Ali (a.s.), and you have no master.”¹

Amr said: “Why do you abuse me, Aba Yaqzan?”

Masudi's statement

Abul Hasan Masudi Shafei² has written in *Murujuz Zahab*³:

Following issues made companions of Prophet gain precedence over each other:

Precedence in faith and migration (*Hijrat*); supporting the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.); proximity to him, contentment, loyalty to Prophet, knowledge of Quran and its interpretation, Jihad in the path of God, piety, abstemiousness, adjudication, chastity and knowledge and Ali (a.s.) is having the largest share in all these things.

Some are special merits of Ali (a.s.); like that statement of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to Ali, when he established brotherhood among the companions:

“You are my brother,” whereas the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is without contradiction [no one has the capacity to contradict the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and there is no equal for him].

Also, the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.): “You are to me as Harun was to Moosa, except that there is no prophet after me; and his statement:

Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.”

Also, the supplication of the Prophet, when Anas brought the roasted bird for him:

“O Allah, send to me the most beloved person so that he may share this bird with me.” Suddenly Ali (a.s.) entered.

إِنَّ هُنَّهُ تَذَكُّرٌ فَمَنْ شَاءَ اتَّخِذَ إِلَيْ رَبِّهِ سَبِيلًا ^{١٩}

“Surely this is a reminder, then let him, who will take the way to

¹ Almighty Allah says in Surah Muhammad 47:11: “That is because Allah is the Protector of those who believe, and because the unbelievers shall have no protector for them.” (Surah Muhammad 47:11).

² Died 346 A.H. and his lineage reaches upto Abdullah bin Masud.

³ *Murujuz Zahab*, 2:49 [2/445].

his Lord.”¹

¹ Surah Muzzammil 73:19

Ghadeer in Quran

We mentioned previously that: Allah, the Mighty and the High desired that the tradition of Ghadeer should remain ever fresh and the passage of time should not make it obsolete.

Therefore He revealed verses regarding that, so that people recite it day and night; as if every time Allah, the Mighty and the High calls the attention of the reader to the verses of Ghadeer and places divine obligation in the matter of greater Caliphate in his heart.

Verse of announcement

Among the verses of Ghadeer is the statement of the Almighty Allah in Surah Maidah:

يَا أَيُّهَا الرَّسُولُ بَلَّغْ مَا أُنزِلَ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ رَبِّكَ وَإِنَّ رَبَّكَ لَمْ تَفْعَلْ فَمَا بَلَّغْتَ
رِسَالَتَهُ وَاللَّهُ يَعْصِمُكَ مِنَ النَّاسِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَا يَهِيءُ لِلنَّاسِ الْقَوْمَ الْكُفَّارِينَ ⑭

“O Apostle! deliver what has been revealed to you from your Lord; and if you do it not, then you have not delivered His message, and Allah will protect you from the people.”¹

This verse was revealed on 18th Zilhajj, 10 A.H. when the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) reached Ghadeer Khum and five hours of the day had passed.

Jibraeel came down with this verse and said:

“O Muhammad, the Almighty Allah sends you His greetings and says: Convey to the people what is revealed to you regarding Ali (a.s.); and if you don’t fulfill this, it would be as if you have not conveyed your message (Islam).”

There were a hundred thousand or more persons in the caravan. They halted at a place called Johfa and Almighty Allah commanded the Prophet:

“Call back those, who have gone ahead and wait for those, who are following you; to appoint Ali as the leader and guide of people; and to make this divine announcement to them.”

Jibraeel informed him that Allah will protect him from the harm of people.

Shia have consensus on all these points, but we will reason this here through Ahle Sunnat traditions.

In the book of *Al-Ghadeer*,² the late Allamah Amini has presented thirty Ahle Sunnat traditions on this point, from which we present a few over here:

1. Hafiz Abu Ja’far Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari (d. 310 A.H.)

¹ Surah Maidah 5:67

² *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/424-438.

In the book of *Al-Wilayah*, which he has written about the chains of narrators of the tradition of Ghadeer, he has narrated through his chains from Zaid bin Arqam that when the Prophet, on his return from Farewell Hajj, reached Ghadeer Khum, and it was noon and it was extremely hot climate, he ordered them to clean and sweep the place below some trees (so that some space is created).

Call for prayers was announced and after the prayer, the people gathered around the Prophet and the latter delivered a lengthy sermon and said:

Almighty Allah revealed the verse of:

يَا أَيُّهَا الرَّسُولُ بَلِّغْ مَا أُنزِلَ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ رَبِّكَ طَ وَإِنْ لَمْ تَفْعَلْ فَمَا بَلَّغْتَ
رِسَالَتَهُ طَ وَاللَّهُ يَعْصِمُكَ مِنَ النَّاسِ

“O Apostle! deliver what has been revealed to you from your Lord; and if you do it not, then you have not delivered His message, and Allah will protect you from the people.”¹

...on me and Jibreel conveyed to me the command of Allah that I should stand here and announce to all of you: Indeed, Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) is my brother, my successor, my Caliph and Imam on you after me. I requested Jibreel to ask Allah to excuse me from this duty, because I know that there are very few pious persons and those want to cause harm to me, are many. There are too many, who severely oppose my conduct and attention to Ali, and they have named me as ‘the ear’ and Almighty Allah revealed this verse:

وَمِنْهُمُ الَّذِينَ يُؤْذِنَ النَّبِيَّ وَيَقُولُونَ هُوَ أُذْنٌ طَ قُلْ أُذْنٌ حَمْرَ لَكُمْ يُؤْذِنُ مِنْ بِاللَّهِ
وَيُؤْذِنُ مِنْ لِلْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَرَحْمَةً لِلَّذِينَ أَمْنَوْا مِنْكُمْ طَ وَالَّذِينَ يُؤْذِنُونَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ
لَهُمْ عَذَابٌ أَلِيمٌ
٤١

“And there are some of them who molest the Prophet and say: He is one who believes everything that he hears; say: A hearer of good for you (who) believes in Allah and believes the faithful and a mercy for those of you who believe; and (as for) those who molest the Apostle of Allah, they shall have a painful punishment.”²

If I want, I can expose their names and introduce them to you, but I have concealed their names and protected their respect and the Almighty Allah will not be satisfied with anything other than my announcement regarding Ali.

O people, recognize this reality, because Almighty Allah has appointed him as your Master (*Wali*) and Imam and made his obedience obligatory on all. His

¹ Surah Maidah 5:67

² Surah Taubah 9:61

command is obligatorily applicable and his statement is truth; one, who opposes him is accursed and is ineligible to testify in court. Listen to me and obey the command. Because Allah Ali is your master and Imam, and after him till Judgment Day, Imamate will continue in his generations. Nothing is lawful, except what Allah and His Messenger has made lawful and nothing is unlawful, except what Allah, His Messenger and they (the Imams) have made lawful.

There is no knowledge, but that the Almighty Allah has bestowed it to me and I have transferred it to him; do not go astray from him and do not confront him due to arrogance; he it is that guides to truth¹ and he acts according to that.

Repentance will not be accepted from one, who denies him and Almighty Allah will not forgive him; Allah would indeed do this and punish him most severely. He is the most excellent of men after me, till the day would arrive and creatures would remain. One, who opposes him is accursed.

Jibraeel revealed these words from the Almighty Allah on me. Thus, everyone should see what he has sent for the morrow.²

Follow the clear (unambiguous) verses of Quran and don't follow the ambiguous ones. None can interpret them for you, except one, whose hands I hold and whom I have lifted for you and announced: Of whomsoever I am the master, this Ali is (also) his master.

His mastership is revealed to me from the Almighty Allah.

Know that I have conveyed the message of God; know that I have announced it. Know that I have conveyed it to the people. Know that I have explained it. Then he said: After me, rulership is not allowed for anyone, except him.”

Then he raised him up, till his feet reached the knees of the Prophet and he said: “O people, this Ali is my brother and successor and the holder of my standard and my successor on those, who have faith in me; and he is my authority on the interpretation of Quran after me.”

On the basis of another report, he said: “O God, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him, and curse those, who deny him; and be furious at those, who deny his rights.

O God, You revealed the verse of:

.....الْيَوْمَ أَكَلَتْ لَكُمْ دِينَكُمْ.....

“This day have I perfected for you your religion...”³

...to make clear the Imamate of Ali. Thus, one, who does not follow him

¹ Almighty Allah has said in Surah Yunus 10:35: “Is He then Who guides to the truth more worthy to be followed, or he who himself does not go aright unless he is guided?”

² Almighty Allah says in Surah Hashr 59:18: “and let every soul consider what it has sent on for the morrow”.

³ Surah Maida 5:3

and my sons through him, his acts will be invalid and he shall remain in Hell forever. Indeed, Iblees caused Adam to be expelled from Paradise due to jealousy; so do not be jealous, lest your acts become invalid and your steps deviate. Surah:

وَالْعَصْرِ ۖ إِنَّ الْإِنْسَانَ لَفِي حُسْنٍ ۝

“I swear by the time, most surely man is in loss,”¹

...is revealed about Ali (a.s.).

O people, believe in God and His Messenger and by the light, which is revealed,² with him.

مَنْ قَبْلَ أَنْ نَطَّيْسَ وُجُوهًا فَنَرْدَهَا عَلَىٰ أَدْبَارِهَا أَوْ نَلْعَنْهُمْ كَمَا لَعَنَّا أَصْلَحْبَ
السَّبْتِ

“Before We alter faces then turn them on their backs, or curse them as We cursed the violators of the Sabbath.”³

Effulgence is sent down on me from God, then Ali and then in his progeny till the Mahdi.

O people, very soon, after me will come imams, who will summon you to Hell fire and who will not help you on Judgment Day; the Almighty Allah and I are immune from them. They and their followers are in the lowest level of Hell;

سَنَفْرُغُ لَكُمْ أَيْمَانَ الشَّقَلِينِ ۝

“Soon will We apply Ourselves to you, O you two armies.”⁴

يُرْسَلُ عَلَيْكُمَا شُوَاظٌ مِّنْ نَارٍ ۚ وَنَحَّاُسٌ فَلَا تَنْتَصِرُنِ ۝

“The flames of fire and smoke will be sent on you two, then you will not be able to defend yourselves.”⁵

2. Hafiz Hakeem Haskani Abul Qasim (d. after 490 A.H.).⁶
3. Hafiz Abul Qasim bin Asakir Shafei (d. 571 A.H.).⁷
4. Abu Abdullah Fakhruddin Raazi Shafei (d. 606 A.H.).¹

¹ Surah Asr 103:1-2; In *Durre Mansoor*, 6:392 [8:622], through the channel of Ibne Marduya from Ibne Abbas and the verse: “Except those who believe and do good” was revealed about Ali and Salman.

² It is mentioned in Surah Araaf 7:157: “so (as for) those who believe in him and honor him and help him, and follow the light which has been sent down with him, these it is that are the successful.” (Surah Araaf 7:157)”

³ Surah Nisa 4:47

⁴ Surah Rahman 55:31

⁵ Surah Rahman 55:35

⁶ *Shawahidut Tanzil*, 1/255, H. 249.

⁷ Tareekh Medina Damishq, 12/237.

5. Jalaluddin Suyuti Shafei (d. 911 A.H.).²
6. Qaazi Shaukani (d. 1250 A.H.) in his *Tafseer, Fathul Kabeer*.³
7. Sayyid Shahabuddin Alusi Shafei Baghdadi (d. 1270 A.H.).⁴
8. Shaykh Sulaiman Qunduzi Hanafi (d. 1293 A.H.).⁵
9. Shaykh Muhammad Abduh Misri (d. 1323 A.H.).⁶

Conclusion

Those, who increase the scope of meanings in narration have mentioned another cause for revelation of the verse of propagation. So much so that we know that the first to mention this reason is Tabari in his *Tafseer*⁷. Then others have followed him and Fakhre Raazi⁸ has mentioned nine reasons and after that stated the reason, which is the topic of the present book; and deems it to be the tenth cause.

Fakhre Raazi has listed ten reasons in his book⁹ and has deemed the text of Ghadeer to be the tenth! All were narrated without chains of narrators and their reporters are unknown; that is why in *Tafseer* of Nizamuddin Nishapuri¹⁰ they are preceded by words: ‘it is said’; that is the reporters are unknown.

He has placed the report of declaration of Mastership (*Wilayat*) to be the first reason and its chain of narrators reaches upto Ibne Abbas, Baraa bin Azib, Abu Saeed Khudri and Muhammad bin Ali (a.s.) and it is strange that Tabari, in spite of the fact that he was the most ancient and most cognizant of these problems, has not mentioned its origin. He has not at all mentioned the tradition of Mastership (*Wilayat*), but in a separate book, he has mentioned this tradition through more than seventy channels.

Another conclusion

These justifications are unreliable; and incompatible with authentic traditions.

End of statement

Qurtubi, in his book of *Tafseer*,¹¹ under the exegesis of the verse:

يَأَيُّهَا الرَّسُولُ بَلَغْ مَا أُنْزِلَ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ رَّبِّكَ

¹ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:636 [12/49].

² *Durre Mansoor*, 2/298 [3/116].

³ *Fathul Kabeer*, 3:57 [2/60].

⁴ *Ruhul Maani*, 2:348 [6/192].

⁵ *Yanabiul Mawaddah*, 120 [1/119, Chap. 39].

⁶ *Tafir Manar*, 6:463.

⁷ *Jaameul Bayan*, No. 4, J 6:307.

⁸ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:635 [12/49].

⁹ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:635 [12/49].

¹⁰ Gharaibul Quran, [6/194].

¹¹ Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran, 6:242 [6/157].

“O Apostle! deliver what has been revealed to you from your Lord...”¹

...has said:

“May Almighty Allah blacken the face of *Rafidhis* that they say: ‘The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) concealed a matter, which they were in need of and he did not announce it to them.’”

In *Irshadus Sari*,² Qastalani adds to this allegation:

“Shia say that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) concealed some matters due to dissimulation (*Taqayyah*).”

Alas, if these two had only shown the proof of these two allegations against the Shia! Shia can never have the audacity to allege that the Prophet concealed something, whose announcement was obligatory on him, but time is fixed for everything and in that case also, the announcement cannot be made by the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) earlier. If these two pay attention to the statements of their scholars on the verses under discussion – the ten causes that Fakhre Raazi has listed - they will reach to the point for which they accuse the Shia; as some Ahle Sunnat say that this verse was revealed about Jihad, because sometimes the Prophet refrained from encouraging the hypocrites for Jihad.

Some have also said: This verse was revealed when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) refrained from condemning the gods of the idol worshippers!

A third person says: The Prophet concealed the verse of choice from his wives:

يَأَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ قُلْ لَا زَوْا جَكَ

“O Prophet! say to your wives...”³

According to them, the Prophet did not divulge this verse to his wives fearing that they would choose the world! On the basis of this the revelation of the verse under discussion shows that the Prophet refrained from announcing what was revealed about it! Indeed, the Prophet definitely did not conceal any such thing.

وَإِنَّهُ لَتَذَكَّرٌ كَرَّةٌ لِلْمُتَّقِينَ ۝ وَإِنَّالَّهَ عَلَمُ أَنَّ مِنْكُمْ مُّكَذِّبِينَ ۝

“And most surely it is a reminder for those who guard (against evil). And most surely We know that some of you are rejecters.”⁴

¹ Surah Maidah 5:67

² Irshadus Sari Ila Sharh Saheeh Bukhari, 7:101 [10/210].

³ Surah Ahzab 33:28

⁴ Surah Haqqah 69:48-49

2. Perfection of religion through Mastership (*Wilayat*)

Among the verses, revealed about Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) are the following:

الْيَوْمَ أَكْبَلْتُ لَكُمْ دِينَكُمْ وَأَتْمَمْتُ عَلَيْكُمْ نِعْمَتِي وَرَضِيَتُ لَكُمْ
الْإِسْلَامَ دِينًا

**“This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed
My favor on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion.”¹**

All Imamiyah, without exception, believe that this verse was revealed for the Ghadeer declaration about Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) by the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in clear and unequivocal terms.

This verse is clear declaration that his companions identified it, the Arabs understood and all those, who received the report, argued through it [and considered it to be a proof on Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali].

Many scholars of exegesis, imams of traditions and Hafiz scholars of Ahle Sunnat are with the Imamiyah in this matter. Validity and logical precision also supports this viewpoint. Statements of scholars of traditions present in *Tafseer* of Raazi², also strengthen this view; it is said that:

“The Prophet lived for eighty-one or eighty-two days after the revelation of this verse.”

Ahle Sunnat historians³ have written that the demise of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) occurred on 12th Rabiul Awwal.

Now, with reference to Ahle Sunnat viewpoint regarding the date of demise of Prophet, said to be eighty-two days (as narrated by Fakhre Raazi) negligence is committed; because after subtracting the day of Ghadeer and day of passing away, one day will be added to eighty-two. And in any case this is based on the viewpoint that this verse was revealed on the day of Arafah, as mentioned in *Saheeh Bukhari*, *Saheeh Muslim*⁴ and other books - is nearest to the fact, because on the basis of this view, according to the above calculation, (eighty-two days) more than ten days are added

In addition to this, the revelation of the verse of perfection on Ghadeer Khum is proved through extensive reports, such that there is no option, but to accept this conclusion as supported by the following:

1. Hafiz Abu Ja’far Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari (d. 310 A.H.).

¹ Surah Maidah 5:3

² *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:523 [11/139].

³ Refer: *Tareekh Kamil*, 2:134 [2/9 events of 11 A.H.] *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 6:332 [*Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 6/365, events of 11 A.H.]. He has considered this date to be famous for the passing away of the Prophet. *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:382 [3/353].

⁴ *Saheeh Bukhari*, [4/1600, H. 4145]; *Saheeh Muslim*, [5/517, H. 3, Kitab Tafseer].

In the book of *Wilayah*, he has narrated through his chains from Zaid bin Arqam that:

“The verse of perfection regarding Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was revealed on the day of Ghadeer Khum.”

This tradition was mentioned before this quotation.

2. Hafiz Ibne Marduya Isfahani (d. 410).

He has narrated through the chains of Abu Harun Abdi from Abu Saeed Khudri that this verse was revealed on the Prophet on the day of Ghadeer, when he said to Ali (a.s.):

“Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master.”

Then he has narrated it from Abu Huraira and in that it is mentioned that it was the 12th of Zilhajj on that day, that is on the return of the Prophet after the Farewell Hajj.¹

3. Hafiz Abu Nuaim Isfahani (d. 430 A.H.).²

4. Hafiz Abul Qasim Hakeem Haskani (d. after 490 A.H.).³

5. Hafiz Abul Qasim Ibne Asakir Shafei Damishqi (d. 571 A.H.).⁴

6. Akhtabul Khutaba Khwarizmi (d. 568 A.H.).⁵

7. Jalaluddin Suyuti Shafei (d. 911 A.H.).⁶

And a large number of other people, who have clarified that the revelation of the verse of perfection took place on day of Ghadeer regarding the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali (a.s.).⁷

In spite of this, it is astonishing that Alusi says in *Ruhul Maani*⁸:

“Shia have narrated from Abu Saeed Khudri that this verse was revealed after the statement of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) regarding Ali, may Allah ennoble his visage (*Karamullah Wajha*):

‘Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master.’

After the revelation of this verse, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

‘God is the greatest for the perfection of religion and completion of bounty and approval of the Almighty Allah with my messengership and Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali after me.’

It should be clear that this is a fabrication of the Shia and before everything,

¹ Tafseer Ibne Kaseer, 2:14.

² Ref: Maa Nazala minal Quran fee Ali [Pg. 56].

³ Shawahidut Tanzil, 1/201, H. 211.

⁴ Durre Mansoor, 2:259 [3/19].

⁵ Al-Manaqib, 80 and 94 [Pg. 135, H. 52 and Pg. 156, H. 184].

⁶ Durre Mansoor, 2:259 [3/19].

⁷ Like Khateeb Baghdadi in his *Taareekh*, 8:209 and Ibne Maghazali Shafei in the book of *Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib*, [Pg. 18, H. 24].

⁸ Ruhul Maani, 2:249 [6/61].

the weakness of the report is proof that it is fabricated.”

We don't think that Alusi was unable to access the channels of tradition and its narrators and that his shameful ignorance led him only to attribute the traditional reports to the Shia. On the contrary, his hidden objectives was to conceal this clear fact. He did not think that in future someone, who is well informed about books of Ahle Sunnat, would analyze and expose his act of deception.

Is there anyone who will ask this man: Why he attributed these reports only to the Shia, while the fact is that scholars of traditions, teachers of exegesis and historians from non-Shia have also narrated it?

Then he should be asked, why he has limited the chain of narrators to Abu Saeed, while the fact is that Abu Huraira, Jabir bin Abdullah, Mujahid, Imam Baqir (a.s.) and Imam Sadiq (a.s.) have also narrated it?

After that he should be asked why he considered this tradition weak and alleged that it was the evidence of the falsity of the Shia?

Is there weakness in its text? Whereas its words are like words of numerous other traditions without any kind of complexity and weakness of style; and is according to the rules of Arabic language.

Or is there weakness in its meaning? Whereas there is no weakness in its meaning as well.

What Alusi means to says is: “Everything narrated in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and every merit attributed to him, is weak, since it mentions his excellence!”

This is, in fact, the viewpoint of the *Nasabis* [those inimical to Ali (a.s.)], which makes a person sink into the pit of destruction.

كَلَّا إِنَّهُ تَذَكَّرٌ ۝ فَمَنْ شَاءَ ذَكَرَهُ ۝ وَمَا يَذِدُ كُرُونَ ۝ إِلَّا أَنْ يَشَاءَ اللَّهُ ۝ هُوَ أَهْلُ
الْتَّقْوَىٰ وَأَهْلُ الْمَغْفِرَةِ ۝

“Nay! it is surely an admonition. So whoever pleases may mind it. And they will not mind unless Allah please.”¹

3. Descent of divine chastisement

Among the verses revealed after the declaration of Ghadeer, are the following from Surah Maarij:

سَأَلَ سَأِلٌ بِعَذَابٍ ۝ وَاقِعٌ ۝ لِلْكُفَّارِينَ لَيْسَ لَهُ دَافِعٌ ۝ مَنْ اللَّهُ ذِي
الْمَعَارِجِ ۝

“One demanding, demanded the chastisement which must

¹ Surah Muddaththir 74:54-56

befall. The unbelievers - there is none to avert it - from Allah, the Lord of the ways of Ascent.”¹

Shia believe that this verse was revealed about Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and this is proved from books of Tafseer and a large number of Ahle Sunnat sources as well.

The late Allamah in *Al-Ghadeer*,² has listed twenty-nine persons from Ahle Sunnat among whom are:

1. Hafiz Abu Ubaid Harwi (d. 223. 224 A.H. in Mecca).

In his book of exegesis, *Ghareebal Quran*, he has narrated that when the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) announced what he was supposed to, and its news spread to all the areas, Jabir³ bin Nazar bin Harith bin Kalda Abdari came to His Eminence and said:

“You commanded us to believe in the oneness of Allah, in prayers, fast, Hajj and Zakat, but you were not content till you held the arm of your cousin and accorded him precedence over us and said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. Was this statement from you or from the Almighty Allah?”

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) replied: “By God, this statement was from Him.”

Jabir walked towards his mount saying: “O God, if what Muhammad says is truth, send down a stone on me from the sky or make us involved in a severe chastisement.”

He did not reach his mount, but that Almighty Allah dropped a rock from the sky on his head, which exited from his anus, killing him. And this verse was revealed:

سَأَلَ سَائِلٌ بَعْدَ ابْرَاقِ ۝

“One demanding, demanded the chastisement which must befall”⁴

2. Abu Bakr Yahya Qurtubi (d. 567 A.H.).⁵

وَإِنْ تُكَذِّبُوا فَقُلْ ۝ كَذَبَ أُمَّةٌ مِّنْ قَبْلِكُمْ ۝ وَمَا عَلَى الرَّسُولِ إِلَّا الْبَلْغُ

¹ Surah Maarij 70:1-3

² [Al-Ghadeer, 1/460-471].

³ In the report of Salabi, about which all scholars have consensus, name of Harith bin Noman Fehri is mentioned. And it is not unlikely that the name of Jabir bin Nazar mentioned in this report is correct, because on the day of Battle of Badr, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), as per the command of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) executed Nazar, father of Jabir, who was taken a prisoner (by cutting off his limbs). And people on that day had freshly come out of infidelity [and still the customs of Jahiliyya were current in them]. Due to this, as was customary during the period of Jahiliyya, the fire of revenge was raging in his heart.

⁴ Surah Maarij 70:1

⁵ Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran [18/181].

“And if you reject (the truth), nations before you did indeed reject (the truth); and nothing is incumbent on the apostle but a plain delivering (of the message).”¹

A glance at the tradition

We do not find any friend and enemy, who has expressed any doubt about the tradition. Whoever has studied the trustworthy reporters of this tradition, has accepted its authenticity, except for Ibne Taymiyyah² in *Minhajus Sunnah*,³ who has refuted this tradition due to the malice that he harbors in his heart. And this style was his habit in every matter, in order to create dissension in the Muslim communities, in which he was expert. We shall mention his objections in brief and rebut them.

First objection

On one side, there is consensus that the incident of Ghadeer occurred on the return of the Prophet after the Farewell Hajj and on the other side and it has come in a report that when the tradition of Ghadeer spread in all areas, Harith⁴ came to the Prophet and he was in Abtha, in Mecca at that time [thus on the basis of this traditional report, the incident of the inquirer (*saael*) occurred in Mecca] while the circumstances demand that this should have occurred in Medina. Thus the fabricator of the traditional report [incident of the inquirer (*saael*)] was ignorant of the date of the incident of Ghadeer.

Reply: Firstly:

It is mentioned in the report of Halabi in *Seerah*,⁵ Sibte Ibne Jauzi in *Tadhkira*⁶ and Shaykh Muhammad Sadrul Aalim in *Moalijul Oola*: The arrival of the questioner took place in the Masjid. [although this statement is itself a reply to the objection since ‘Masjid’ implies Masjid of Medina]. Halabi has also clarified that the arrival of the questioner was in Medina, but these statements remain concealed for Ibne Taymiyyah and in a decisive refutation he has hastened to refute the traditional report.

¹ Surah Ankabut 29:18

² Ibne Taymiyyah, in denying needs of habit, to condemn Muslims and to regard them as disbelievers and misguided, has since the beginning of statements opposed this consensus and great Ahle Sunnat scholars made him target of their criticism. Statement of Shaukani in the book of *Badrut Taale*, 2:260, [No. 515] is sufficient. Muhammad Bukhari Hanafi (d. 841 A.H.) has mentioned him as a heretic and then declared him disbeliever and then clarified in his gathering that whoever calls Ibne Taymiyyah by the title of Shaykhul Islam, will become a disbeliever himself.

³ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 4:13.

⁴ Harith bin Noman Fehri.

⁵ *Seeratul Halabiyya*, [3/274].

⁶ *Tadkira Khawasul Ummah*; [Pg. 30].

Secondly

Neglect of this person regarding grammatical facts or his blind prejudice is a barrier between him and the facts, it has cast a veil of darkness and he has sunk into this whirlpool; that is why he thinks that the term ‘Abtha’ which is restricted to the outskirts of Mecca, while the fact is that if he referred to books of traditions, encyclopedias, glossaries, books of geography and literature,¹ he would have realized that writers of these books have clarified: The term ‘Abtah’ implies every stony path having pebbles and gravel. After that they have hinted at some sources, which mention ‘batha’ of Mecca.

And he would understand that every valley, which has this specialty is called ‘batha’. So it is possible that there were other places called ‘batha’ in Arabia.

Second objection

According to the consensus of scholars, Surah Maarij is Meccan, therefore, it was revealed within ten years preceding the incident of Ghadeer.

Reply

What is confirmed from the above mentioned consensus is that when a Surah as a whole is Meccan, it is not necessary that all its verses should also be Meccan. Therefore it is possible that this verse is especially Medinan and such examples are present in many other Surahs as well.

Third objection

This verse was revealed in reply to what idolaters of Mecca said and chastisement did not descend on them due to the auspiciousness of the presence of the Prophet there, as the Almighty Allah says:

وَمَا كَانَ اللَّهُ لِيُعَذِّبَهُمْ وَأَنْتَ فِيهِمْ طَ وَمَا كَانَ اللَّهُ مُعَذِّبَهُمْ وَهُمْ يَسْتَغْفِرُونَ ^{۴۳}

“But Allah was not going to chastise them while you were among them, nor is Allah going to chastise them while yet they ask for forgiveness.”²

Reply

There is no connection between chastisement not descending on the polytheists in Mecca and descent of chastisement on this man in the captioned

¹ Ref: *Saheeh Bukhari*, 1:181 [2/556, H. 459]; 1:175 [1/183, H. 470]; *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:382 [3/154, H. 430 and 432, Kitabul Hajj] and 1:382 [3/155, H. 433, Kitabul Hajj] and 2:213, 215, 222 [*Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 444, 446 and 450]; *Lesaanul Arab*, 3:236 [1/428]; *Sihahul Lughat Jauhari*, [1/356]; *Sharh Diwan Ameerul Momineen* (a.s.), written by Mibzi [Pg. 197]; *Diwan Sharif Razi*, 191, 194, 198 and 205 [1/274, 250, 255 and 256].

² Surah Anfal 8:33; It can be said that this verse is about the sinful persons from Muslims, but for one, who apostatized and falsified Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), it is upon Almighty Allah to hasten chastisement for him.

incident; because acts of Almighty Allah change according to exigency. Since the Almighty Allah knew that some disbelievers of Mecca will embrace Islam later on or that some Muslims would be born from their loins, that is why He did not chastise them. Otherwise the aim of the declaration of prophethood would not be fulfilled.

But since Almighty Allah saw that this person had permanently turned away from guidance to his previous deviation – just as Nuh (a.s.) saw this same quality in his people and said:

إِنَّكَ إِنْ تَنْهِهُمْ يُضْلِلُوا إِلَّا فَاجْرًا ﴿٤﴾

“For surely if Thou leave them they will lead astray Thy servants, and will not beget any but immoral, ungrateful (children)”¹

He responded with the chastisement he himself demanded.

The presence of the Prophet is a blessing, which keeps chastisement away from Islamic Ummah, but perfect blessing is that it should remove the hurdles on the illuminated path of Islam. That is why Allah, the Mighty and the High destroyed that filthy man due to his opposition to the Caliphate announced by the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). Just as His Eminence, in his battles, uprooted corruption and rebellion through his sword and he used to curse those from whom there was no hope of ever embracing faith.

In *Saheeh Muslim*,² it is narrated through Ibne Masud that when Quraish made the work difficult for the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), disobeyed him and refused to accept Islam, he said: “O Allah, help me against them like You helped Prophet Yusuf (a.s.) through seven years (of drought).”

Thus, they were afflicted with drought for seven years and there was such shortage of food that they were compelled to consume carrion. So much so that they were able to see only vapor and smoke between the earth and the sky:

فَارْتَقِبْ يَوْمَ تَأْلِقِ السَّمَاءُ عَلَيْكُمْ خَانِ مُّبِينٍ ﴿٦﴾

“Therefore keep waiting for the day when the heaven shall bring an evident smoke,”³

The above verse hints at this incident. *Bukhari*⁴ has also mentioned this incident.

The book of *Isabah*⁵, quoting from Baihaqi⁶ through the channel of Malik bin Dinar has mentioned it. It is narrated from Hind bin Khadija, wife of the

¹ Surah Nuh 71:27

² *Saheeh Muslim*, 2:468 [5/342, H. 29, Kitab Sifatul Qiyyamah wal Jannah wan Naar].

³ Surah Dukhan 44:10

⁴ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 2:125 [4/1730, H. 4416].

⁵ *Al-Isabah*, 1:346.

⁶ *Dalailun Nubuwwah*, [6/240].

Prophet, that one day the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) passed before Hakam [Hakam bin Abil Aas bin Umayyah, father of Marwan] and Hakam gestured towards the Prophet with his finger [he ridiculed him]. When the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) saw him in his pose, he said: "O God, make him involved in trembling." It was at this time that his knees began to shake and the curse of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) took effect.

Fourth objection

If this is true, it would be like the incident of the people of the elephant and like the people of elephant, it would have been narrated in excess. Since authors of books of traditions, exegesists, biographers and their like have not narrated this incident in entirety - except this unacceptable chain of narrators - it shows that the story is baseless and false.

Reply

To compare this incident – which was a personal story and was such that it did not create a vacuum in the society, after those numerous objectives existed to conceal its existence, in such way that they even forgot the declaration of Ghadeer – to the incident of the people of elephant – a great event, which is regarded as a miracle of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and huge multitude was destroyed before the eyes of everyone, and a group, which was the most superior of the nations, was saved and their sacred relics remained intact, in the same way, the House which was the place of circumambulation for nations and the aim of the Hajj pilgrims, which at that time was the greatest expression of the Lord, remained secure – exaggeration is obvious in the numerosity of the objectives of its narration; because according to the rule of need, motives in the first story, by ranks are lesser than motives in the second story.

Thus, these contradictions can clearly be seen among the miracles of the Prophet; some miracles are narrated by solitary reports and some mentioned in excess and some also are having consensus among Muslims, without there being need of chain of authorities. The objective of such differences is the difference of greatness of the miracles or issues accompanying them.

As for the claim of Ibne Taymiyyah that classes of writers have not mentioned this tradition at all, is another exaggeration, because we mentioned that writers, including authorities in science, exegesists, Hafiz scholars of traditions, historians, who are highly praised in books and a large number of scholars have extolled them, they have narrated this tradition.

Till now the implication of his statement: "This chain of narrators is unknown" is not for me; because this tradition is narrated only by the great companion, Huzaifah bin Yaman¹ and Sufyan bin Uyyana, whose prominence in knowledge and tradition is clear and they are well known to be trustworthy in

¹ Ref: *Saheeh Muslim* [5/411, H. 24, Kitabul Fitn]; *Al-Taqreeb*, Ibne Hajar, 82 [1/156, No, 183]; *Tahdhibut Tahdhib*, [2/193].

traditions.¹

But Ibne Taymiyyah has considered the chains of narrators of this tradition invalid and regards its text to be a matter of dispute; as none of them is compatible with his corrupt style and crooked nature.

Fifth objection

It is concluded from this tradition that this Harith was a Muslim as he had confessed to the five principles of Islam, and it is necessary that no Muslim should have been punished during the period of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

Reply

This tradition – just as it proves his being a Muslim, also proves his apostasy, because of refuting the statement of Prophet and doubting what Almighty Allah had informed and divine chastisement did not descend on him while being a Muslim, on the contrary, he was involved in it after denial and apostasy, because after listening to the statement of the Prophet, he doubted in the prophethood of His Eminence.

In addition to that there were some individuals among Muslims as well, who were involved in divine chastisement, which was hinted at in its tradition in reply to objection number three.

Muslim, in his *Saheeh*² has narrated from Salma bin Akwa that a man was eating with his left hand in the presence of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and the latter told him to eat with the right hand. He said: "I cannot do that." The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) cursed him and said: "You will never be able to." And from that time [due to his obstinacy to the Prophet] he was unable to lift his right hand to his mouth.

Sixth objection

Harith bin Noman is not famous among the companions and in *Istiab*, Ibne Abde Barr and also Ibne Manda and Abu Nuaim Isfahani and Abu Moosa in his writings about the names of companions, have not mentioned his name. Hence, the existence of such a person becomes doubtful and it is not confirmed for us.

Reply

Books written about companions of Prophet do not contain the names of all of them. Every author has compiled them on the basis of information he was able to collect. When later writers searched through these books and sources, they managed to find new names, and added them to the names collected previously;³ so, denial of a single person that a name not mentioned in such books, is out of the pale of justice and far from rules of debate and discussion.

¹ *Tadkira Huffaz*, Zahabi, 1:61, No. 249; *Wafayatul Ayan* [2:319, No. 267].

² *Saheeh Muslim*, 4/259, H. 107, Kitabul Ashraba.

³ Refer: *Al-Isabah*, [1/2-4].

Also, it is most likely that writers of books about companions did not mention his name due to his apostasy later in life.

وَمِنَ النَّاسِ مَنْ يُجَادِلُ فِي اللَّهِ بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ وَلَا هُدًى وَلَا كِتْبٍ مُّنِيبٍ^{٤٠}

“And among men is he who disputes in respect of Allah though having no knowledge nor guidance, nor a book giving light.”¹

¹ Surah Luqman 31:20

Eid Ghadeer in Islam

Among the things, which made Eid Ghadeer perpetual and famous, and bestowed certainty and established it firmly, are: Deeming it to be a day of feast and to hold celebrations in it, worship and devotions in its nights and also performing more religious acts and helping the poor and gathering provisions for self and family, for dressing up and in putting on new garments.

In every period, whichever religious society will pay attention to these conditions, it will naturally be in pursuit of its causes and will inquire about its aspects; it would be inquisitive regarding their narrators or at least due to participating in these rituals, and will by chance be informed about its narrators or reporters. Every year this matter will lead to renewal of interest of special groups of different societies to the incident of Ghadeer. As a result of which, the chains of narrators of the incident are continuous and the channels of its narration are safe, and the text of the incident is read out from one to another and its reports are repeated.

What becomes crystal clear for the researcher of this festival (*Eid*) are the following two points:

First point

This Eid is not restricted only to Shia, although they are having special attachment to this Eid, on the contrary, other sects of Muslims have also regarded it as Eid and participated in it.

Abu Raihan Biruni in his book of *Aatharul Baqiya An Quroonil Khaliya*¹, has regarded it to be among the festivals (*Eids*) of Muslims.

Ibne Talha Shafei says in his *Matalibus Soo-ol*:²

“Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) has mentioned the day of Ghadeer Khum in his couplets and this day is a day of festival (*Eid*) and gatherings; because on this day the Prophet of Islam (s.a.w.a.) bestowed this lofty rank to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and not to others.”

He also says:

“The meaning for the term of Master (*Maula*), which is possible only for the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), the same meaning the Prophet has applied for Ali (a.s.) and this is an exalted rank and position, which is only for him and not for anyone else. That is why this is a day of Eid and celebration for followers of Ali (a.s.).”³

¹ Aatharul Baqiya An Quroonil Khaliya, 334.

² Matalibus Soo-ol, 53 [Pg. 16].

³ Matalibus Soo-ol, 56.

In a number of places in the book of *Wafayat*,¹ Ibne Khallikan has mentioned that this day is regarded as Eid by the consensus of Muslims.

After the mention of tradition of Ghadeer, Masudi says:

“Descendants of Ali (a.s.) and his Shia regard this Eid great.”²

Thalabi has also stated in *Thimarul Qulub*³ after including the eve of Ghadeer among the great and famous nights in Islam, said:

“The eve of Ghadeer is a night, on the following day of which the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) recited a sermon in Ghadeer Khum on the pulpit of camel saddles.

And in his sermon, he said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. And help those, who help him and degrade those, who insult him. Therefore the Shia regard this eve to be great and they are engrossed in worship acts on this night.

One of the evidences of it being Eid is that Abu Bakr, Umar, wives of the Prophet and other companions, upon the commands of the Prophet, congratulated Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and we all know that greetings are only offered on days of Eids and celebrations.”

Second point

History regarding this Eid is from the time of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) till date and its beginning was the day of Ghadeer from the year of the Farewell Hajj, when Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) announced the Caliphate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and made his authoritative known to all in both worldly and religious issues and he explained to them his lofty rank in religion.

The occasion of that witnessed day (a day which most of them were able to see) makes every Muslim elated, because on this day the source of Shariah and the place of glowing of illuminated laws of Islam becomes clear to all Muslims.

Which other day can exceed this blessed day? The day when the path of the clear practices (*Sunnahs*) became illuminated for all; when the smooth path became obvious to everyone, religion was perfected and the bounty was completed and Quran announced this clearly (so that it does not remain concealed for anyone).

From this aspect, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) announced to all, who were present there, including Abu Bakr and Umar, the nobles of Quraish and chiefs of Ansars and also his wives, he ordered all of them to go to Ali and congratulate him for having received the rank of Mastership (*Wilayat*) and authority to enforce commands and prohibitions in the religion of God.

¹ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:60:2:223 [1/180, No. 74: 5/230, No. 728].

² *Al-Tanbih wal Ashraf*, 221 [221-222].

³ *Thimarul Qulub*, 511 [Pg. 636, No. 1068].

Tradition of felicitation [of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)]

In the book of *Wilayah*, Imam Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari has narrated a tradition through his chains from Zaid Ibne Arqam, at the end of which, it is mentioned that the Prophet of Islam (s.a.w.a.) said:

“O people say tell me: we, on the depths of our souls make a pledge to you and with our tongues, we make a covenant to you and place the hand in your hands and give our word that we would convey the matter without any change and distortion to our descendants and we make you a witness in this matter and the testimony of Almighty Allah is sufficient.

Say what I have told you and congratulate Ali (a.s.) as the chief of the believers and say:

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي هَدَنَا إِلَيْهَا وَمَا كُنَّا لِنَهْتَدِي لَوْلَا أَنْ هَدَنَا اللَّهُ

“All praise is due to Allah Who guided us to this, and we would not have found the way had it not been that Allah had guided us.”¹

Indeed, Almighty Allah knows every call and dishonesty and every cheater;

فَمَنْ نَكَثَ فِيمَا يَنْكُثُ عَلَى نَفْسِهِ وَمَنْ أَوْفَى بِمَا عَاهَدَ عَلَيْهِ اللَّهُ فَسَيُؤْتِيهِ أَجْرًا عَظِيمًا ﴿١٠﴾

“Therefore whoever breaks (his faith), he breaks it only to the injury of his own soul, and whoever fulfills what he has covenanted with Allah, He will grant him a mighty reward.”²

Say that which will make the Almighty Allah pleased with you. Thus:

إِنَّمَا تَكُونُ كُفُورًا إِذَا غَنِيَ عَنْ كُفُورِهِ

“If you are ungrateful, then surely Allah is Self-sufficient above all need of you.”³

Zaid bin Arqam says: At this point, all the people called out: Yes, we have heard, and we obey the command of Allah and the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) with all sincerity. And among the first, who paid allegiance to Ali (a.s.) at that time were Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman, Talha, Zubair and other Muhajireen and Ansar and then people in general and this allegiance continued till the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) recited the Zuhr and Asr prayers together. Then the allegiance continued till the night so that Maghrib and Isha were recited together. The allegiance continued for three days.”

¹ Surah Araaf 7:43

² Surah Fath 48:10

³ Surah Zumar 39:7

The historian, Khawind Shah, author of *Rauzatus Safa*,¹ after the mention of tradition of Ghadeer has said in his book: Then the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) sat in his special tent and instructed Imam Ali (a.s.) to remain in the adjacent tent so that people may felicitate him. When the felicitations ended, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) directed his wives to go to Ali (a.s.) and present felicitations to him and they did that. Among the companions, who presented felicitations to him was Umar bin Khattab, who said: "Congratulations to you, O son of Abu Talib, that you have become my master and the master of all the believers."

Especially, congratulations of the two Shaykhs [Abu Bakr and Umar] is mentioned by a large number of Ahle Sunnat scholars of traditions, exegesists, historians from reporters of traditional reports, who cannot be regarded as few. Some of them have narrated it as a definite matter² and some have narrated it through authentic chains of narrators, all of whose narrators are reliable and whose chains end with different companions of Prophet, like: Ibne Abbas, Abu Huraira, Baraa bin Azib and Zaid bin Arqam.

The late Allamah Amini, in the book of *Al-Ghadeer*³, has mentioned the names of sixty persons, who have listed the names of those, who congratulated Imam Ali (a.s.) and who mentioned that Abu Bakr and Umar were at the forefront in this:

1. Ahmad bin Hanbal, chief of the Hanbalis (d. 241 A.H.).⁴
2. Hafiz Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari (d. 310 A.H.), in his book of *Tafseer*.⁵
3. Hujjatul Islam, Abu Hamid Ghazzali (d. 505 A.H.).⁶
4. Abul Fath Ashari Shahristani (d. 548 A.H.).⁷
5. Fakhruddin Raazi Shafei (d. 606 A.H.).⁸
6. Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.).⁹

Return to the beginning of the statement

Indeed, these congratulations were at the command of the Messenger of

¹ *Tareekh Rauzatus Safa*, Part 2, No. 1:173 [2/541]; Abdur Rahman Dehlavi in *Miratul Asrar*, and others have trusted this book and have quoted it.

² That is those, who regarded it as absolute and definite that is why they narrated it without chains of narrators, directly; and it does not mean that this tradition is narrated from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and therefore does not need investigation into the chains of narrators.

³ *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/510-527.

⁴ *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:281 [5/355, H. 18011].

⁵ *Tafseer Tabari*, 3:428.

⁶ *Sirrul Alamain*, 9 [Pg. 21].

⁷ On the margins of *Al-Fisal* of Ibne Hazm 1:220 [*Al-Melal Wa al-Nehal*, 1/145].

⁸ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:636 [12/49].

⁹ In *Jamaul Jawame*, he has narrated this report as mentioned in *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:397 [13/133, H. 36420].

Allah (s.a.w.a.) and their giving allegiance, was accompanied with the joy of the Prophet; because they said: “Praise of God that He bestowed upon us excellence on the whole world.”

In addition to this, revelation of the noble verse on this day, which clarified the perfection of religion, completion of favor and approval of Almighty Allah at what had occurred.

Tariq bin Shahab, a scholar from the People of the Book, called out in the gathering of Umar bin Khattab that if this verse:

الْيَوْمَ أَكْمَلْتُ لَكُمُ دِينَكُمْ وَأَتْمَمْتُ عَلَيْكُمْ نِعْمَتِي وَرَضِيَتُ لَكُمْ
الإِسْلَامَ دِينًا

**“This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed
My favor on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion.”¹**

...had been revealed in our religion, we would have regarded that day as feast². In that gathering none of those, who were present denied it and Umar also acted as if he had accepted it.

All this definitely shows that this day is having a great position in faith in such a way that it was an occasion of celebration of the seal of the prophets, the Holy Imams (a.s.) and their followers; and we regard it as Eid for no other reason.

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), in reports, which Furat bin Ibrahim Kufi has in the third century, narrated through his chains from Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) through his father through his forefathers and had announced its exalted position, when he says:

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: The day of Ghadeer Khum is the best of the festivals of my Ummah and it was the day when Allah, the Mighty and the High commanded me to appoint my brother, Ali (a.s.) as the leader of the community after me; so that after me, he may become a mode of guidance for them. And it is the day when Almighty Allah completed the religion and perfected His bounty on my Ummah; and chose for them Islam as a religion.³

After the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), emulating him, deemed this day as the day of Eid and in the year when Friday and Ghadeer occurred on the same day, he recited the sermon and in that sermon, said:

“O believers, on this day, Almighty Allah has gathered two Eids. Take this day as the day of Eid, may God have mercy on you. So you may disperse to

¹ Surah Maidah 5:3

² The five Imams of Hadith have narrated this story: Muslim, [in his *Saheeh*, 5/517, H. 3, Kitabut Tafseer] Malik, Bukhari, Tirmizi [in his *Sunan*, 5/233, H. 3043. 44], Nasai, [in his *Sunan*, 2/420, H. 3997].

³ Behaarul Anwaar, 37/109, 94/110; Bashratul Mustafa, 49.

provide for your families and do good to your brothers in faith and thank the Almighty Allah for what He has blessed you with and gather together so that the Almighty Allah may bestow unity upon you and do good towards each other so that your kindness may reach each other and strengthen. Gift bounties of Allah to each other just as Almighty has placed a great reward in it, rewards which are many times the rewards of the preceding and following Eids. Doing good on this day will increase your wealth and prolong your lives and doing a good to turn to each other will result in divine blessings and kindness. As much as you can, try to gain its merits by doing good to your brothers and family members; and make happiness apparent while meeting each other.”¹

In the same way, all the Holy Imams (a.s.) have regarded it as Eid and ordered all Muslims that they should regard it as Eid and the excellence of this Eid and rewards of this day are announced to all.

In *Tafseer* of Furat bin Ibrahim Kufi,² it is mentioned in Surah Maidah through Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) that the narrator said: I asked: “May I be sacrificed on you, is there any Eid for Muslims, having more excellence than Eidul Fitr, Eid of sacrifice, Eid of Friday and Day of Arafah?”

The narrator says: The Imam replied: “Yes, the greatest and most excellent Eid in the view of Almighty Allah is the day when He completed the religion and revealed the verse of: **“This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed My favor on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion,”** on the Prophet.”

The late Kulaini³ has narrated in *Al-Kafi* from Ali bin Ibrahim from his father from Qasim bin Yahya from his grandfather, Hasan bin Rashid that he said: I asked Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.):

“May I be sacrificed on you, are there other Eids for Muslim other than the two Eids (Fitr and Qurban)?”

He replied: “Yes, O Hasan, it is greatest of these.”

I asked: “What day is that?”

He replied: “The day of appointing of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as the leader of the community.”

I asked: “What is advisable for us to do on that day?”

He replied: “Keep fast on that day and send excessive Salawat on the Prophet and his progeny; and declare to Allah immunity from those, who oppressed Ahle Bayt (a.s.), and know that the prophets – may Allah bless them – commanded their successors to celebrate as Eid, the day the appointed their successors.”

The narrator says: I asked: “What is the reward of fasting on that day?”

¹ Late Shaykh Tusi has narrated it through his chains in *Misbahul Mutahajjid*, 524 [Pg. 698].

² *Tafseer* of Furat bin Ibrahim Kufi, [Pg. 117, H. 123].

³ *Al-Kafi*, 1:203 [4/148, H. 1].

He replied: “Reward of fasting for sixty months.”¹

In another report, through his chains from Husain bin Hasan Husaini from Muhammad bin Moosa Hamadani from Ali bin Hassan Wasti from Ali bin Husain Abdi² it is narrated from Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) that:

“Fasting on the day of Ghadeer Khum every year in the view of Allah equals a hundred Hajjs and a hundred Umrahs, which are all performed with sincerity and accepted, and that day is the great Eid of the Almighty Allah.”

As long as you live time will show surprises to you!

Nuwairi and Maqrizi say:

“In 352 A.H., Moizuddaula Ali bin Buwayh started this Eid, which was a heresy.”

In *Nihayatul Arab fee Funoonil Adab*³, Nuwairi says regarding the Eids of Islam:

“It is an Eid, which Shia have innovated and named it as Eid of Ghadeer. They regard it to be the cause of brotherhood [allegiance of brotherhood] of the Prophet of Islam (s.a.w.a.) with Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) on the day of Ghadeer Khum. The day they have started this Eid is the 18th of Zilhajj, because allegiance of brotherhood took place in the 10th year of Hijri and it was when he was in the Farewell Hajj.

They spend the nights in prayers and in the morning, before Zuhr, they pray two units of prayers. It is their custom to dress up in new garments that day, to free slaves, to do a good turn to others and to sacrifice (animals).

The first to start this heresy was Moizuddaula Abul Hasan Ali bin Buwayh, and if Allah wills, we will mention his story in the events of the year 352 A.H. After this innovation of the Shia, and declaring it to be a Sunnah, the Ahle Sunnat people also, from the year 389 A.H. started celebrating a festival eight days after the Eid of Shia and said: This day the Prophet entered the cave with Abu Bakr Siddiq. Therefore they celebrated this day through dressing up in new clothes and lighting fireworks.”

Maqrizi says in *Khataat*⁴:

“Eid Ghadeer was not a legal festival of Muslims and no Muslim leader ever deemed it to be as Eid. This Eid was celebrated for the first time in Iraq, during the reign of Moizuddaula Ali bin Buwayh; and he was the first to declare it as Eid in the year 352 A.H. From that time the Shia began to regard it as Eid.”

What can be said regarding a historian, who writes the history of Shia before

¹ Very soon regarding this reward, we will mention through Huffaz scholars all of whose narrators are reliable.

² *Tahdhibul Ahkam*, [3/143, H. 317].

³ *Nihayatul Arab fee Funoonil Adab*, 1:177 [1/184].

⁴ *Al-Khatat*, 2:222 [1/388].

being aware of their reality or he was aware of the facts, but at the time of writing, he forgot, or due to a pre-conceived plan, has ignored the facts, or that he issued statements, while he did not know what to say, or hardly knew what he was saying?

Was it not Masudi (d. 346 A.H.), who in *Tanbih wal Ashraf*¹ says: The descendants of Ali (a.s.) and his Shia commemorate this day?

Is Kulaini, who passed away in 329 A.H., not a narrator of the tradition of Ghadeer in *Kafi*?²

And before him, Furat bin Ibrahim Kufi, who is of the category of scholars of the level of Thiqatul Islam, Kulaini, was he not the narrator of another tradition of Ghadeer in his *Tafseer*³, which is present with us?"

It is absolutely clear that these books, from the aspect of history, pre-date what Nuwairi and Maqrizi claimed in 352 A.H.

Was it not Fayyaz bin Muhammad bin Umar Tusi, who informed about this in 259 A.H. and said: It was witnessed that Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) (d. 203 A.H.) had commemorated this day as Eid and explained its significance; and he has narrated it from his ancestors from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) (d. 148 A.H.) taught this Eid to his companions and informed them that it was the practice of the prophets that they made their followers celebrate as Eid the day of the appointment of their legatees. In the same way, it was the practice of rulers and kings that the day of their coronation was celebrated as festival. Imams of religion (a.s.) also in the ancient days urged their Shia to do a good turn, recite special supplications and observe its rituals.

This is the reality of Eid Ghadeer, but these two persons wanted to ridicule the Shia and with this aim in mind, they denied those righteous ancestors and declared that it was a heresy started by Moizuddaula!

فَوَقَعَ الْحُقْ وَبَطَلَ مَا كَانُوا يَعْمَلُونَ ﴿١٦﴾ فَغُلِبُوا هُنَالِكَ وَانْقَلَبُوا صَغِيرِينَ ﴿١٧﴾

**“So the truth was established, and what they did became null.
Thus they were vanquished there, and they went back abased.”⁴**

Coronation on the day of Ghadeer

We know that on the day of Ghadeer, was appointed the Caliph, who was supposed to be the ruler of the Islamic world and who was to succeed the Prophet. In this way, it was necessary that he should be crowned like kings. But since crowns of gold and silver, studded with gems were a specialty of the rulers of Iran, and in Arabs there was no replacement to it, except a turban and none, except the nobles wore turbans, therefore it is narrated from the Messenger of

¹ Tanbih wal Ashraf, 221.

² *Al-Kafi*, [4/149, H. 3].

³ *Tafseer Furat Kufi*, [Pg. 117, H. 123].

⁴ Surah Araaf 7:118-119

Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“Turbans are the crowns of Arabs.”

This report is narrated by Khuzai and Dailami, and Suyuti in *Jame Saghir*¹ has regarded it as authentic and Ibne Athir has also mentioned it in *Nihaya*.²

Therefore, on this day, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) placed the turban on the head of Ali (a.s.) and this shows that it was a mark of his greatness and majesty, because he placed on his head, his turban, which was named as ‘Sahaab’ in that huge gathering with his blessed hands.

This act hints that one, who is crowned with this turban will remain in the position of the Prophet, and that he was the missionary of the religion of the Prophet and his successor after him.

In *Kanzul Ummal*³, it is narrated from Imam Ali (a.s.) that the Prophet on the day of Ghadeer Khum placed a turban on my head and dropped one end of it on my back. And in other words, he threw one end of it on my back.

Then he said: “Indeed, the Almighty Allah helped me in Battle of Badr and Hunain through angels through this turban, which I was wearing.”

And he said: “Turban is an obstacle between denial and faith.”

Hafiz Dailami has narrated from Ibne Abbas that then the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) placed ‘Sahaab’⁴ on the head of Ali (a.s.) and he said:

“O Ali, the turban is the crown of Arabs.”⁵

Conclusion

Abul Husain Multi⁶ says in *Tanbih war Radd*⁷:

“Their [that is the *Rafidhis*’ or *Shia*’s] statement that Ali is in the clouds (*Sahaab*) is taken from the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to Ali (a.s.), when he arrived wearing the Prophet’s turban: ‘Ali has come in *Sahaab*.’ That is he came wearing the turban named *Sahaab*, but they interpreted it in a way other than what it implied.”

Halabi in his *Seerah*⁸ says:

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) had a turban named *Sahaab* and he put it on the head of Ali Ibne Abi Talib Karramallahu Wajha. When Ali wore it and came to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), he said: “Ali has come to you in

¹ *Al-Jaame’ Saghir*, 2:155 [2/193, H. 5723].

² *Al-Nihaya fee Gharibul Hadith wal Athar*, [1/199].

³ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 8:60 [15/482, H. 41909]. Also refer: *Riyazun Nazara*, 3:17; *Faraaezus Simtain*, 1:75, Chap. 12, H. 41; *Al-Fusulul Muhibima*, 41.

⁴ Ibne Asir says in *Nihaya*, 2:160 [2/345]: The turban of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) was named as ‘Sahaab’.

⁵ *Al-Firdos bi Mathurul Khitab*, [3/78, H. 4246].

⁶ Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Abdur Rahman Malti Shafei, died 377 A.H.

⁷ *Tanbih war Radd alaa Ahlal Ahwa wal Bida*, 26 [Pg. 19].

⁸ *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:369 [3/341].

Sahaab,” that is in the turban, which the Prophet gifted to him.”

Allamah Amini says: This is the meaning that Shia allude to when they say: Ali is in *Sahaab*, as opposed to the claim of Multi, no Shia has interpreted it in away other than what was intended. On the contrary, Ahle Sunnat people have interpreted it in another way and made allegation against Shia; and Almighty Allah will hold them responsible for it.

Thus, the day of crowning is the greatest day in Islam and the greatest Eid of the partisans of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). Just as this day prompts the malice and anger of his enemies.

وُجُوهٌ يَوْمَئِنٌ مُّسْفِرَةٌ ۝ ضَاحِكَةٌ مُّسْتَبْشِرَةٌ ۝ وَوُجُوهٌ يَوْمَئِنٌ عَلَيْهَا غَبَرَةٌ ۝
تَّهْقِمَهَا قَتْرَةٌ ۝

“(Many) faces on that day shall be bright, laughing, joyous. and (many) faces on that day, on them shall be dust, darkness shall cover them.”¹

¹ Surah Abasa 80:38-41

Statements of reliable Ahle Sunnat Hafiz scholars and intellectuals regarding the tradition of Ghadeer

This discussion is not with the motive of proving the veracity of the tradition of Ghadeer and that it is widely narrated (*Tawatur*), because it by itself and by its essence it is needless of every kind of discussion.

In spite of the fact that a large number of reporters from the chains of narrators of this tradition are the narrators of two books: *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim*, who can deny the authenticity of this tradition?

And with attention to the fact that every far and near was witness to this event and he has narrated it and majority of the writers of tradition, history, exegesis and scholasticism have mentioned it and some have also written separate books on it, which opponent can refute this tradition having wide narration (*Tawatur*) of its wording, leaving aside some particular disputes; having wide narration (*Tawatur*) in its ideal details; and having summarily wide narration (*Tawatur Ijimali*) in some of its aspects?¹

The late Allamah Amini, in the book of *Al-Ghadeer*,² has mentioned names of forty-three persons, who admitted to the authenticity and wide narration (*Tawatur*) of this tradition. Some of them are as follows:

1. Hafiz Abu Isa Tirmizi (d. 279 A.H.)

In his book of traditions, he has says after the mention of the tradition of Ghadeer:

“This is a good and authentic tradition”.³

2. Hafiz Ibne Abde Barr Qurtubi (d. 463 A.H.)

In the book of *Istiab*,⁴ after the mention of the tradition of brotherhood, [brotherhood of Ali (a.s.) with the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)] and two traditions of Mastership (*Wilayat*) and Ghadeer, has said:

“This whole report is authentic.”

¹ [Widely narrated (*Mutawatir*) report: *Mutawatir* reports can be divided into literal, conceptual and epigrammatic. Literally widely narrated (*Mutawatir*) report implies a report narrated word to word, for example tradition of Two heavy things (*Thaqlayn*) and tradition of Ghadeer. In conceptual widely narrated (*Mutawatir*) report the concept is narrated widely, though words might be different; for example traditions regarding the valor Imam Ali (a.s.). They are of different kinds, but they convey one and the same point: that is valor of Imam Ali (a.s.). Ref: *Usul Fiqh*, Muzaffar, 2/62-63; *Istilahat Usul*, Mishkini, 142-143; *Firhang Fiqh Farsi*, 2/649-649].

² Ref: *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/543. 572.

³ *Sonan Tirmizi*, 2: 298 [5/519, H. 3713].

⁴ *Istiab*, 2:373 [Part 3, 1098-1100, No. 1855].

3. Faqih Abul Hasan bin Maghazili Shafei (d. 483 A.H.)

In his book of *Manaqib*,¹ after quoting this tradition from his teacher, Abul Qasim Fazl bin Muhammad Isfahani, has said:

“Abul Qasim believes that this report is an authentic tradition of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and around a hundred persons, including members of Ashra Mubashshira have narrated it. And this tradition is proved and there is no doubt in it. This excellence is special to Ali (a.s.) and no one shares it with him.”

4. Hujjatul Islam Abu Hamid Ghazzali (d. 505 A.H.)

In his book of *Sirrul Alomain*², he has written:

“The proof [evidence] has removed the veil from its face and everyone has consensus on the text of the tradition from the sermon of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on the day of Ghadeer Khum. He mentioned in some part of this sermon:

‘Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master.’ And Umar [in congratulation to Ali (a.s.)] said: Bravo, bravo!”

5. Ibne Abil Hadeed Mutazali (d. 655 A.H.)

In his *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*³, he has regarded this tradition to be a well known statement about excellence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

6. Hafiz Ibne Hajar Asqalani (d. 852 A.H.)

He says in his *Fathul Bari*:⁴

“As for the tradition: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. Tirmizi and Nasai have narrated it and this tradition is having excessive chains of narrators. Ibne Uqdah has compiled a separate book on this, and many of its chains of narrators are authentic and good. It is narrated to us from Imam Ahmad that he said: For no companion are so many merits narrated as they are narrated for Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

7. Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti Shafei (d. 911 A.H.)

He says: “This tradition is widely related (*Mutawatir*) and many later scholars have narrated it from him.”

8. Hafiz Shahabuddin bin Hajar Haithami Makki (d. 974 A.H.).⁵

9. Sayyid Mahmud Alusi Baghdadi (d. 1270 A.H.).⁶

وَمَنْ كَلِمَتْ رَبِّكَ صِدْقًا وَعَدْلًا لَا مُبَدِّلٌ لِكَلِمَتِهِ وَهُوَ السَّمِيعُ الْعَلِيمُ ﴿١٥﴾

¹ *Manaqib* Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), [Pg. 27, H. 39].

² *Sirrul Alomain*, 9 [Pg. 21].

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:449 [9/166, Sermon 154].

⁴ *Fathul Bari*, 7:61 [74/7].

⁵ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 25 and 73 [Pgs. 42,43 and 123]; *Sharh Matne Hamziya fee madhe Khairul Bareeya*: 221 [Pg. 245].

⁶ *Ruhul Maani*, 2:249 [6/61].

وَإِنْ تُطِعْ أَكْثَرَ مَنْ فِي الْأَرْضِ يُضْلُلُكَ عَنْ سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ إِنْ يَتَّبِعُونَ إِلَّا الضَّلَالُ
وَإِنْ هُمْ إِلَّا يَخْرُصُونَ^{١١}

“And the word of your Lord has been accomplished truly and justly; there is none who can change His words, and He is the Hearing, the Knowing. And if you obey most of those in the earth, they will lead you astray from Allah’s way; they follow but conjecture and they only lie.”¹

¹ Surah Anaam 6:115-116

Judgment regarding the authorities of tradition

وَأَن تَحْكُمْ بَيْنَهُمْ بِمَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ وَلَا تَتَنَزَّلْ أَهُوَ أَهُمْ

“And that you should judge between them by what Allah has revealed, and do not follow their low desires.”¹

Here some senior scholars have admitted to the wide narration (*Tawatur*) of the tradition and have condemned its deniers and previously you saw that there are 110 companions of Prophet, who narrated this tradition, whose statements we were able to access. There is no tradition from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), which has come with such wide narration (*Tawatur*), certainty and proof.

Shamsuddin Jazari, especially in proving the wide narration (*Tawatur*) of this report, has written a separate treatise and regarded as ignorant those, who deny this tradition and the truth is this only.

Faqih Ziyauddin Muqbili also says:

“If this tradition, with all these sources, is not known, nothing else would be known in religion.”²

Badakhshi says: “This tradition is authentic and famous and except for a prejudiced person and a denier, whose statement cannot be relied upon, no one will argue about its authenticity.”³

However, there exist people, who harbor malice and enmity, to whom separation from our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) has impelled them that through every means, they should make this clear spring putrid and shake the foundations of this confidence.

That is why, one of them has become a denier of the tradition⁴ with the excuse that at that time Ali (a.s.) was not present with the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), and that he was in Yemen.

Another one has denied the authenticity of the central theme of the tradition and he says:⁵

“Most reporters have not narrated the main theme of the tradition.”

The third one states that the appendix to the tradition is weak⁶, he says:

“Without any doubt, the appendix to the tradition is false.”

¹ Surah Maidah 5:49

² Taleeq Hidayatul Uqool Ilaa Ghaayatus Soo-ol, 2:30

³ Nuzoolul Abraar, 21 [Pg. 54].

⁴ Tahawi [in *Mushkilul Aathaar*, 2/308] and others have quoted him and replied to him.

⁵ Taftazani in *Maqasid*, 290 [5/274]. And some of the modern scholars have also emulated him.

⁶ Ibne Taymiyyah in *Minhajus Sunnah*, 4:85.

The fourth one,¹ has expressed doubt in its origin, but regards the supplication after it to be reliable and says:

“Only Ahmad bin Hanbal has narrated it and as for others, they have only narrated this last part of: O Allah, love those, who love him...from the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).”

Whereas we say:

All have accepted its wide narration (*Tawatur*) and authenticity; they have clarified that the whole of it is authentic; therefore there is consensus on this matter and no scope remains for them to dispute it.

In this instance, there are those, who say once: our scholars have not narrated it² and the second time, say: It is not narrated through reliable narrators, therefore it is not authentic³.

Some followers from the later scholars have emulated him, they say: Trustworthy narrators have not narrated it.⁴ While this same person in another place in his book says: This tradition is widely narrated (*Mutawatir*). We conduct with such persons as per the command of the Almighty Allah:⁵ and just say ‘peace’ to them.

I don’t know whether ignorance prevented him from recognizing the scholars of his companions or he was ignorant of Sihah and Masanid books or did not accept the reliability of these personalities.

If he is ignorant, it is a calamity, but if he is aware and he issues such statement, then it is a greater calamity.

Among them are also those: that he turns this statement in his mouth that except for Ahmad in his *Musnad*, no one has narrated this tradition.⁶ And this book contains both kinds of reports: weak as well as reliable.

As if this person does not have any information about books other than *Musnad Ahmad* or his research and investigation regarding authentic and strong chains of narrators, which are excessively present in *Saheeh*, *Musnad* and *Sunan* books, have not enlightened him.

As if he is unaware of books of senior scholars written particularly about Ahmad and his *Musnad*.

As if he is unaware of the statement of Subki in *Tabaqat*⁷ that:

“Indeed, Ahmad wrote the *Musnad* and it is one of the principles of this

¹ Muhammad Mohsin Kashmiri in *Najatul Momineen*.

² Ibne Hazm has mentioned this statement in *Mafazila Bainas Sahaba*.

³ Ibne Taymiyyah in *Minhajus Sunnah*, 4:86, quoted from Ibne Hazm [in *Al-Fisl*, 4/148].

⁴ Harwi, grandson of Mirza Maqdoom bin Abdul Baqi in *As-Sahamus Thaqiba*.

⁵ In Surah Furqan 25:63, when He says: “and when the ignorant address them, they say: Peace.”

⁶ Muhammad Mohsin Kashmiri has said this in *Najatul Momineen*.

⁷ *Tabaqatush Shafiya*, 1:201 [2/27, No. 7].

Ummah.”

Imam Hafiz Abu Moosa Madini Isfahani Shafei (d. 580 A.H.) says:

“*Musnad* of Imam Ahmad is a basic and elemental principle and a firm point of reference for scholars of traditions. And it is a selection of innumerable traditional reports; that is why it is an imam and a foundation and during dispute or controversy, it is the final point of reference for the disputants.”

And on the basis of the quotation of *Kanzul Ummal*,¹ Hafiz Suyuti in his introduction to *Jamaul Jawame*, says:

“All reports of *Musnad Ahmad* are acceptable and there are weak traditional reports in it as well as good traditional reports.”

Another person appears and says:²

The tradition of Ghadeer is not mentioned in Sihah books. Unaware of the fact that it is mentioned by Tirmizi in his *Saheeh*; Ibne Majah in his *Sunan*; Darqutni has narrated it through a number of channels and Ziyauddin Maqdisi has quoted it in *Al-Mukhtara* and...have quoted it.

This shows the value of statement of a person, who tries to prove something as doubtful only because it is not mentioned in *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim*.³

Another person⁴ has also mentioned it and supported its authenticity and proved its correctness and consensus of Ahle Sunnat majority has narrated it and said:

“There are many authentic traditions, which the two Shaykhs (Bukhari and Muslim) have not narrated.”

We add that Hakeem Nishapuri has written a complete book, which is not less voluminous than *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim*, and entitled it *Mustadrak Saheehain*; and in many instances they are in agreement with traditional reports, which Dhahabi has mentioned in *Mulakhkhas*. And you will read in biographies of scholars of other ‘addenda’ (*Mustadrak*) regarding *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim*.

Hakeem Nishapuri also says in *Mustadrak*⁵:

“Bukhari and Muslim or one of them has not said that every tradition not narrated by one of them is not authentic. And I would, with the help of God, narrate traditions, whose narrators are trustworthy and through the like of which, the Shaykhs [Bukhari and Muslim, may God be pleased with them] or one of

¹ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:3 [1/10].

² Husamuddin Saharanpuri in *Marafizul Rawafidh*.

³ Qaazi Azd Eiji in *Muwafiq* [Pg. 405] and Taftazani in *Sharh Maqasid* [5/274].

⁴ Shaykh Mahmud bin Muhammad Shekhani Qadri Madani in *As-Siratas Sawi fee Manaqib Aale Nabi*.

⁵ Mustadrak Alas Saheehain, 1:2 [1/41].

them, have reasoned.”

Bukhari says:

“Every traditional report, which I have included in my collection, is authentic and there are other authentic traditions as well, which I have not included in order that it may not be prolonged.”

Muslim says:

“I have not mentioned all authentic traditions in this book; I have mentioned only some of them on which there was consensus.”

Therefore, non-mention of Bukhari and Muslim of a tradition, on whose authenticity and wide narration, there is consensus, if we don’t say that it is a defect of those two books of their authors, it does not become a cause of making that tradition doubtful.

It is not concealed from well-informed person: The first to reject this consensus was Ibne Hazm Andulusi,¹ while he himself says:

“The Islamic Ummah does not have consensus on a mistake or misunderstanding.”

Later on Ibne Taymiyyah followed him and deemed his statement as source for deeming the tradition as doubtful and other than his statement, he has not found in it an iota of doubt, except his statement that he has added to it and said:

“It is narrated that Bukhari, Ibrahim Harrani and some scholars criticized this tradition and regarded it weak.”

Unaware of his own statement in *Minhajus Sunnah*² that:

“The anecdote of Ghadeer took place on the return journey of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) from the Farewell Hajj and people have consensus on it.”

After him, some people like Taftazani, Qaazi Eiji, Qushji and Sayyid Jurjani, who thought that remoteness from truth was a nice thing, have emulated him and have added to falsehood and lies and in refutation of the tradition they did not remain content by just saying that its absence in *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim* shows that it is inauthentic. And did not remain content by quoting the lie of Ibne Taymiyyah that Bukhari and Harrani criticized it – or since Ibne Taymiyyah was not reliable according to them, yet they did not directly attribute this to Bukhari and Harrani – they just said unequivocally that: “Ibne Dawood and Abu Hatim Sajistani have expressed doubt on this traditional report.”

Following them, Ibne Hajar took a long step and in addition to Abu Dawood and Sajistani, added the term of ‘and others’. When Harwi came on the scene, he omitted the name of Sajistani, and in its place, mentioned Waqidi and Ibne Khuzaimah.

¹ You will know the general view regarding him at the end of the analysis.

² *Mihajus Sunnah*, 4:13.

He says in As-Sahamus Thaqiba:

“Many scholars of traditions have expressed doubt in the authenticity of this tradition, like Abu Dawood, Waqidi, Ibne Khuzaimah and other trusted scholars.”

I don’t know what caused them to commit such audacity to the Almighty Allah:

وَقُدْخَابٌ مَّنْ أَفْتَرَى ^④

“And he who forges (a lie) indeed fails to attain (his desire).”¹

What should I say regarding one, who utters such nonsense and fabricate attributions to imams of traditions and Hafiz scholar of the Sunnah!

Was not a single person born, who can ask them what is your source in these quotations and attributions. Have they seen it in some book? What book is that and where is that book? Why don’t you mention the title of the book? Or if the elders and well known personalities narrate the tradition, why have they not mentioned its chains of narrators and its reporters?

Should they not be asked that how condemnation of Bukhari and his associate remain unknown to the multitude of Hafiz scholars, senior traditionists and teachers of this science from the first to the seventh and eighth century till the period of Ibne Taymiyyah and his followers?

And why not even one of them spoke up against it? And this statement is not found in any book or source? Or they were aware of it, but did not see any value for it in the market of truth and that is why did not pay attention to it?

In addition to them, is the denial of its wide narration (*Tawatur*) within the arena of truth? And whether the statement that: “From one side the Shia have consensus on the reliability of wide narration (*Tawatur*) in the reasoning of Imamate and on the other side he reasons through the tradition of Ghadeer even though it is a solitary reported tradition,”² is correct?

While the fact is that he himself regards a tradition narrated by eight companions to be widely narrated (*Mutawatir*)³ and some Ahle Sunnat regard a tradition narrated by only four companions to be sufficient for wide narration (*Tawatur*) and say that it is not allowed to oppose it.⁴

And he is certain of the wide narration (*Tawatur*) of the tradition: “Imams are from Quraish,” and says: “This traditional report is narrated by Anas bin Malik, Abdullah bin Umar and Muawiyah. And Jabir bin Abdullah, Jabir bin Samra and Ubadah Ibne Samit have narrated in the same meaning.”

¹ Surah Taha 20:61

² Taftazani in *Maqasid*, 290 [5/272]; Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq*, 25 [Pg. 42] and the followers of these two.

³ Ref: *As-Sawaiq*, 13 [Pg. 23].

⁴ Ibne Hazm in *Al-Muhalli* [9/6, Question 57]. In the question regarding absence of justification of selling of water, he says: These four persons from companions (r.a.) narrated this narration: it is widely narrated (*Mutawatir*) and opposition to it is not lawful.

This is their well known viewpoint regarding the definition of wide narration (*Tawatur*), but when they come to the tradition of Ghadeer, they make a ceiling for wide narration (*Tawatur*), which even a tradition narrated by 110 persons cannot reach!

Amazing is the initiative of Ahmad Amin, who in his book of *Zuhrul Islam*,¹ says:

“Shia have narrated the tradition of Ghadeer from Baraa bin Azib.”

You yourself know that Ahle Sunnat narrations from Baraa bin Azib exceed the reports of all other companions, because almost forty persons from Ahle Sunnat scholars have narrated it, among them being Ahmad, Ibne Majah, Tirmizi, Nasai, Ibne Abi Shaibah and their like, a large part of whose chains of narrators are authentic and all their reporters trustworthy.²

But Ahmad Amin, in order to refute its veracity, wanted to attribute it only to Shia and this is a not his new antic, because he has, in his books of *Fajrul Islam*, *Dhuhaul Islam* and *Zuhrul Islam* mentioned a large number of falsehoods.

كَبُرَتْ كَلِمَةٌ تَخْرُجُ مِنْ أَفْوَاهِهِمْ ۖ إِنْ يَقُولُونَ إِلَّا كَذِبًا ۖ فَلَعْلَكَ بَاخْعَثُ
نَفْسَكَ عَلَىٰ أَثَارِهِمْ إِنْ لَمْ يُؤْمِنُوا إِنَّهُنَّا لَحَبِيبُنَا أَسْفَاقًا ۗ

“A grievous word it is that comes out of their mouths; they speak nothing but a lie. Then maybe you will kill yourself with grief, sorrowing after them, if they do not believe in this announcement.”³

¹ Addenda to *Zuhrul Islam*, Pg. 194.

² Ref: *Al-Ghadeer*, [1/49-52].

³ Surah Kahf 18:5-6

A survey of Ibne Hazm Andulasi's viewpoint (d. 456 A.H.)

What shall I write about one, on whose deviation there was consensus of all the scholars of his time and who have all condemned him and they warned people from interacting with him?

And because of deviations and nonsense present in his books and writings, they issued verdict that they should be burnt, in such a way that it is mentioned in *Lesaanul Meezaan*¹, and Alusi has mentioned the following in his biography:

“He was deviated and he misguided others.”²

“And what shall I say regarding his writings, which consist of attributing falsehood to God and His Prophet and his audacity regarding the sanctified aspects of the law of Shariah and did not exercise any restraint in attributing lewdness and corruption to Muslims, issuing invalid statements and nonsensical viewpoints.”

“What shall I say regarding an excessive talker, whose statements are baseless and viewpoint beyond the bounds of Quran and Sunnah and when he gives a verdict, it is an unjust one and when he issues a verdict, it is based on falsehood and he attributes issues to Islamic Ummah from which they are immune; he attributes statements to Imams and Hafiz scholars, which they are remote from and books and writings of this person are indications of his deviation from Islamic viewpoint.

Following are some of his viewpoints:

In his book of jurisprudence (*Fiqh*), entitled *Al-Muhalli*³, he says:

Question

If the heirs of the killed one are absent or they are young or insane, jurists have different viewpoints regarding that.

Then he quotes from Abu Hanifah that he said: The elder heir has the right of eliminating the killer and it is not necessary to wait for the children to grow up.

He narrates from Shafei that if one of the heirs of the slain is of age he cannot demand retaliation till his heir comes of age. Then he has doubted the statement of Shafei and says: Hasan bin Ali, inspite of the fact that Ali had young children, took retaliation from Abdur Rahman (and did not wait for them to come

¹ *Lesaanul Mizan*, 4:200 [4/229, No. 5737].

² Tafseer Alusi, 21:76.

³ *Al-Muhalli*, 10:482.

of age).

After that he says:

The condemnation of killing of Ibne Muljim returns to them in the same condition that Hanafis condemn the Shafeis, because in this matter they have agreement with Malikis and they say: One, who kills on the basis of whim or independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), does not have retaliation. And the whole Ummah is having consensus that Abdur Rahman Ibne Muljim slain Ali (a.s.) on the basis of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) and the belief that his act was correct.

And Imran bin Hattan, poet of the Safooriya sect, says regarding this:

‘I sometimes ponder on the slash, which a pious man delivered only seeking divine pleasure and I find that his pan of deeds is the heaviest of all in the view of God.’

Hanafis in opposition to Hasan bin Ali, fabricated this same accusation, which the Shafei fabricated and the arrow they shot returned to them and they fell into the ditch they had dug for others.’¹

Come to me and we can ask Muslim whether this statement is in conformity with the statement of the Prophet to Imam Ali (a.s.) that:

“Your killer is the most wretched of the people of the last age,” and in other words: “The most wretched of the people,” and in the third version: “The most wretched of this Ummah, like the killer of the she-camel of Prophet Salih.”?

Prominent Hafiz scholars, the elders and the imams have narrated this tradition and according to Ibne Hazm’s definition of wide narration (*Tawatur*), this tradition reaches the point of wide narration (*Tawatur*) as among narrators of this tradition are Ahmad, imam of Hanbalis in *Musnad*,² Nasai in *Khasais*,³ Ibne Qutaibah in *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*⁴ and Hakeem in *Mustadrak*⁵

Is this statement compatible with the address of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to Imam Ali (a.s.)? When he asks:

“Do you want me to inform you about one, who is punished on Judgment Day most severely?”

I said: “Yes, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).”

He said: “The most severe punishment on Judgment Day would be that of the killer of the she-camel of Salih and of one, who dyes your beard with the blood of your head.”

¹ Ibne Hajar has mentioned this point in his *Talkhisul Habir fee Naqle Ahadithe Al-Rafai al Kabeer*, Printed in India, 1303 A.H.: 416 [4/46].

² *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:263 [5/326, H. 17857].

³ *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, 39 [Pg. 162, H. 153] and in *Sonan al-Kubra* [5/153, H. 8538].

⁴ *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:135 [139].

⁵ *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, 3:140 [3/151, H. 4679] and in the same way in his *Talkhis*.

Ibne Abde Rabb has narrated this report in his *Al-Iqdul Fareed*.¹

Is it compatible with the following statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that:

“Your killer will have similitude with the Jews and he would be a Jew in fact.”?

Ibne Eddi has mentioned this report in *Kamil*, and Ibne Asakir has also narrated it as mentioned in *Tarteeb Jamaul Jawame*.²

Alas, if I can only find which independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) legalizing killing an Imam is worth obedience?!

Or which independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) had fixed the killing of that Imam as dower for a woman³ of Khawarij with whom the most wretched person from Murad tribe had fallen in love? Or as opposed to the clearest declaration (*Nass*) of Prophet, what scope is there for independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*)?

And if the door of such independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) had been open, it would approve the killing of all the prophets and caliphs, although Ibne Hazm was not at all prepared that the killer of Umar and killers of Uthman should be regarded as jurisprudents (*Mujtahid*) and we also will not say anything here.

Alas, if I only knew, which ones of the Ummah are having consensus in absolving Ibne Muljim from this terrible deed?

Alas, if he would only indicate them for us. But he can never point them out to us, because no writing is found in the Islamic Ummah in this false quotation, except from the Khwarij, who are beyond the pale of Islam and Ibne Hazm has followed them and has justified it through the couplet of Imran.

O Allah, You yourself know who Imran bin Hattan is and what is the value of his exoneration of Ibne Muljim for spilling the blood of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

What value does his statement have that it should be used as evidence and regarded as basis and foundation of Islam?

And a jurist like Ibne Hazm, what position does he have in religion? When he follows the like of Imran, and uses his viewpoint in the God’s religion and on its basis, opposes authentic traditional reports narrated from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)? He refutes them and makes Islamic Ummah a target of condemnation through a fellow, who is beyond the pale of Islam, while the fact is that his contemporary, Qaazi Abu Tayyab Tahir bin Abdullah Shafei⁴ has mentioned as

¹ *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:298 [4/155].

² *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:412 [13/195, H. 36582].

³ Ref: *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:134 [4/137]; *Tareekh Tabari*, 6:83 [5/144]; *Al-Mustadrak*, 3:143 [3/154, H. 4690].

⁴ He is a Shafei jurist. Ibne Khallikan, in his *Taareekh*, 1:253 [2/512, No, 307], says regarding him: He is reliable, truthful, honest and he was aware of principles of jurisprudence and its branches. He was a researcher in science of jurisprudence. He was honest, good natured and followed a correct faith; and has composed a couplet on the profession of jurists. He was born

follows regarding Imran:

عن ابن ملجم الملعون بهتاننا	انی لا براء مما انت قائله
الا ليهم للإسلام اركانا	يا ضربه من شقى ما اراد بها
دنيا وعن عمرانا وحطانا	انی لا ذكره يوم ما فالعنہ
لعائين الله اسرارا واعلانا	عليه ثم عليه الدهر متصل
نص الشریعه برهانا وتبیانا	فانت من كلاب النار جاء به

1. I certainly declare immunity from your false statement regarding Ibne Muljim. 2. Woe upon that strike, which the wretched one delivered with the aim of demolishing the pillars of Islam. 3. Whenever I recall him, I invoke curse on Imran and Hattan. 4. As long as the world endures, hidden and open curse be on him. 5. And according to clear declaration of Shariah; you two are dogs of Hellfire.

In addition to them the reaction of Imam Hasan (a.s.) in killing Ibne Muljim and support from Muslims, in addition to the companions and companions of companions, in such a way that each of them was eager that he should himself execute Ibne Muljim; it shows that the act of the accursed Ibne Muljim was not an act having independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), what to say that we should justify it and regard it as good?

And suppose if it was also independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), that *Ijtehaad* was opposed to numerous textual declarations (*Nusus*).

On the basis of this, the exigency of the majority of Muslims decided that this corruption should be rooted out and this was a duty of Muslims in general. But the Imam of that time and the pride of youths, Imam Mujtaba (a.s.) in this excellence, was having precedence over others in every excellence (and he uprooted mischief).

Indeed, how much is the distance between Ibne Hazm and Ibne Hajar!

Ibne Hazm has justified the act of Ibne Muljim and showed it to be correct and Ibne Hajar has, in his book of *Lesaanul Meezaan*,¹ excused himself from not stating his name and has declared him to be a killer and shedder of blood; and in *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*,² he says:

“He was among the survivors of Khawarij.”

¹ in Baghdad during 348 A.H. and he died in 450 A.H.

² *Lesaanul Mizan*, [3/534, No. 5077].

² *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 7:338 [7/297].

Other viewpoints of Ibne Hazm

In his book of *Al-Fisal*¹, he says regarding a jurist (*Mujtahid*):

“Abu Ghadiya, Yasar bin Sabah Salmi eliminated Ammaar (r.a.). Ammaar was present at the allegiance of Rizwan. He was of those, about whom Almighty Allah has informed that their hearts were informed and who had peace and contentment of the heart and from whom He was satisfied. Abu Ghadiya eliminated him according to independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*); though he committed a mistake and excess, but since he made mistake in independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), only one reward will be given to him.

But Abu Ghadiya was not like the killers of Uthman, because killers of Uthman did not dare to exercise independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), because neither had Uthman killed anyone, nor was he at war and neither. He was a defender nor an attacker and neither he had committed adultery, neither was he apostate, that fighting against him should be justified. On the contrary those people were transgressors, attackers and shedders of blood, who unjustly, deliberately and knowingly shed his blood and they were sinners and accursed people.”

I failed to find the meaning of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) of Abu Ghadiya, who was among the nameless and unknown people of the world and among the degraded people of society and backward persons of the time of the Prophet.

Nothing is mentioned about him, except for the term of ‘Juhni’ and in no book is its meaning mentioned, which would be an indication of his independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*). And except for quoting the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that: “Your blood and property is unlawful,” And also: Lest you apostasies after me and kill each other,” nothing from divine knowledge is quoted from him!

And companions of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) were also astonished at him that how having heard this from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), he killed Ammaar.² No senior religious personality till the period of Ibne Hazm has used word of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) for Abu Ghadiya.

Moreover, I don’t know what is the meaning of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) contradicting the statement of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)?

According to authentic, proved and widely narrated traditional reports, he said:³ A rebellious group shall kill you. In other words: People, who have gone astray shall kill you. Although this same report, also, does not leave any scope for independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) or justification for his killing; because his killer,

¹ *Al-Fisal*, 4:161.

² *Al-Istiab*, 2:680 [Part 4, 725, No. 3109] and *Al-Isabah*, 4:150 [No. 88].

³ Ibne Hajar in *Al-Isabah*, 2:512 [4/5704] and *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 7:409 [7/358, No. 665] has mentioned the wide narration (*Tawatur*) of this report.

in every way that he justifies, it is deviated from truth. And we also don't recognize the independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), which makes aggression and excess lawful, when a healthy sense regards it as evil and it is not having any support in divine religion as well.

Even though Muawiyah, when Abdullah bin Umar narrated the tradition for him and Amr Aas addressed him saying: O Muawiyah, did you not hear the statement of Abdullah? Muawiyah justified his crime saying: "You are a senile old man, you always recite this tradition, while you bathe in your urine; but we killed him (no, we did not kill him) on the contrary, Ali and his companions killed him, who brought him to the battlefield and threw him to our spears.]¹.

Also his statement: "You instigated the people of Shaam against us, but do you have to mention every statement you heard from the Prophet?"²

Also, I don't imply the report of Tibrani from Ibne Masud from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

"Whenever dispute occurs between people, the son of Sumayyah (Ammaar), shall be on the side of truth."³

Although this tradition does not leave any scope for argument and debate, because on the basis of this traditional report, opposition to Ammaar is, without any doubt, falsehood and after this clear report, no independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) will be found that may justify the acts of the companions of falsehood against the companions of truth.

Yes, I do not imply this tradition; I imply what Hakeem in *Mustadrak*⁴ and Dhahabi in his *Talkhis*, through his chains, from Amr Aas and certified its authenticity.

Amr Aas says: "I heard the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) say: O God, I have chosen Ammaar from Quraish (especially); indeed one, who kills Ammaar and raids his property, is in Hell fire."

Also, a tradition mentioned in *Tarreebul Jama*⁵ through the chains of Ibne Asakir,⁶ which he has quoted from *Musnad Ali (a.s.)*:

"Indeed Ammaar is with truth and truth is with Ammaar and wherever truth goes, Ammaar is with truth and the killer of Ammaar is in Hell fire."

And a tradition, which Ahmad has mentioned in *Musnad*,⁷ through his chains of narrators in the following words:

"Allah, the Mighty and Sublime will be inimical to one, who is inimical to Ammaar and Allah, the Mighty and Sublime will be infuriated with, one who

¹ *Tareekh Tabari*, 6:23 [5/41], *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 7:369 [7/299, Incidents of 37 A.H.].

² Ref: *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 2:274 [8/27, Sermon 124].

³ *Al-Mojamul Kabeer*, [10/96, H. 10071].

⁴ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:387 [3/437, H. 5661] and in its selection.

⁵ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 7:75 [13/538, H. 37411].

⁶ *Tareekh Medinatul Damishq*, [12/622].

⁷ *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:90 [5/52, H. 16380].

hates Ammaar and Allah, the Mighty and Sublime will curse those, who curse Ammaar.”

In presence of these authentic and widely narrated traditional reports¹, what scope remains for the independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) of Abu Ghadiya?

And what scope remains for the justification of Ibne Hazm that he should describe the act of Abu Ghadiya to be positive?

And what scope is there for his viewpoint regarding the independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) of Abu Ghadiya and his judgment that his act will get one divine reward? While the fact is that according to clear declaration of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), he is in Hell fire?

Is any expression of hatred and enmity greater than killing?

And in the book of *Al-Istiab*,² marginal notes of *Isabah*, it is mentioned:

“Abu Ghadiya was a supporter of Uthman and he was the killer of Ammaar and whenever he sought permission to meet Muawiyah or someone else, he used to say: ‘The killer of Ammaar is at the door.’ And whenever he was asked about the Ammaar’s killing, he used to praise it, without any restraint.”

His story is astonishing to the people of knowledge, because he has himself narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.): “You will not refrain from infidelity after me (and some of you would strike the neck of others).” In spite of that he slain Ammaar.

All this explains his aim in his precedence in killing Ammaar and his awareness of the saying of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) regarding the killer of Ammaar and his negligence to it and his absence of caution and fear from his killing.

However, he was naturally a follower of the viewpoint of his imam, Muawiyah, and he repeated his statements to the narrators of the tradition of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that:

“You are a senile old man, who always narrates this tradition, while you would wash yourself with your urine.”

You are a better judge than me to judge the depth of this statement and extent of loyalty of its sayer to the Sunnah of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and his following the reports issued from the source of divine revelation, and foundation of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) of Abu Ghadiya in committing this vile deed was also based on such statements of Muawiyah and his like.

Finally, the statement of Ibne Hazm regarding the killers of Uthman that:

“Their independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), as opposed to this text (*Nass*) that: It is not lawful to shed the blood of a Muslim, who testifies to the oneness of Allah and my prophethood, except in three cases: a married fornicator woman,

¹ On the basis of what Ibne Hazm says in definition of wide narration (*Tawatur*) in traditions.

² *Al-Istiab*, 4:151 [Part four, 1725, No. 3109].

one who commits murder and one, who goes beyond the circle of faith.”¹

But, he does not say this regarding the killer of Imam Ali (a.s.), those, who fought against him and the killer of Ammaar. Whereas you know that the situation of those, who fought against Ali (a.s.) and those, who slain him and Ammaar is same as that of the killers of Uthman.

Furthermore, according to his principle, they also committed mistake in their independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*); then why, like Abdur Rahman Ibne Muljim and his like, they should not be rewarded?

Yes, he can offer the excuse that he is the killer of Ali, but those are killers Uthman!

What we can conclude is that there is negation of discretion of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) for killers of Uthman in view of Ibne Hazm.

In addition to this, he is not pleased with those, who curse the companions as he says:

“They are transgressors and accursed people,” while the fact is that majority of his co-religionists regard as apostates or transgressors those, who curse companions and majority of the imams of sects regard cursing the companions as punishable, no matter who the curser may be and to whichever sect he may belong, without any exception, and this is the consensus of Ahle Sunnat on justice of companions.²

He himself says in *Al-Fisal*:³

“If someone talks ill of companions, may Allah be pleased with them, and is ignorant, he is excused. But if proof was established on him and he again disobeys and does not eschew talking ill of the companions, he is a transgressor, although subject to the condition that he should not bear malice, like one, who commits adultery or theft and if he is inimical to Allah and His Messenger (s.a.w.a.), he is an infidel.

It is narrated that Umar said in the presence of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), regarding Hatib, who was a emigrant (*Muhajir*) and a fighter of Badr: O Messenger of Allah, allow me to strike off the neck of this hypocrite.

Now, Umar did not become an infidel due to his attribution of infidelity to Hatib; on the contrary he committed a mistake in his independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), thus he was a jurist (*Mujtahid*), who committed mistake and not obstinate. And the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: ‘The sign of hypocrisy is malice to Ansar.’ And he said to Ali (a.s.): ‘Except for a hypocrite, no one bears enmity to you.’”

¹ Bukhari [in his *Saheeh*, 6/2521, H. 6484], and Muslim [in his *Saheeh*, 3/506, H. 25] have mentioned this traditional report.

² Ref: As-Sarimul Maslul Alaa Shatim Rasul, 572-592; Al-Ahkam fee Usulul Ahkam, of Amadi, 2:631 [2/102]; Ash-Sharafal Moayyad, 112-119.

³ *Al-Fisal*, 3:275.

In view of Ibne Hazm, jurists (*Mujtahid*) like Abdur Rahman Ibne Muljim and Abu Ghadiya are not few, who are excused for their mistakes, as he says¹ in his book of *Fisal*:

“We are sure that Muawiyah and his supporters were jurists and they committed mistake in their independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) and they are entitled to one reward.”

He regards Muawiyah and Amr Aas jurists (*Mujtahid*) and says²:

“They are like jurists (*Mujtahid*), who form independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) regarding problems of capital punishment. Among the jurists (*Mujtahid*) some apply capital punishment for the sorcerer and some do not. Some regard killing of a free person same as killing of a slave and some do not. Some regard killing of a Muslim equal to killing of a disbeliever and some do not.

Now it should be asked: If the basis of ignorance, blind-heartedness and error had not been present in between, what is the difference between independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), who deliver verdicts and the independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) of Muawiyah and Amr bin Aas and others?”

Reply

There is a lot of difference between them and Islamic jurisprudents; because the Islamic jurisprudents are those from whom the proof was unclear, or the evidence of some texts was stronger than other proofs so they deliver the verdict according to that evidence.

As opposed to this Islamic jurist, there is another jurist, who strengthens another evidence and delivers a verdict opposed to the verdict of previous jurist; on the basis of this, both these jurists have delivered verdicts according to their individual interpretation of Quran and traditions.

Now, there is a great difference between jurists and those, who fight against Ali (a.s.). Their verdict is based on Quran and Sunnah and this is their personal view as opposed to Quran and Sunnah; but was the Book of Allah, the Mighty and the High not present in the Islamic society and before the eyes of people?

The book containing the verse of Purification declaring the infallibility of Prophet, and his successor, Ali (a.s.), his prominent daughter, and her two sons.

And in that is the verse of Mubahila, revealed in their honor and which mentions Ali (a.s.) as the self of the Prophet, and other verses, which are almost number 300,³ which were revealed about Imam Ali (a.s.).

Is it possible in your view that Allah, the Mighty and the High should

¹ Ref: *Al-Fisal* of Ibne Hazm 4:161.

² *Al-Fisal* of Ibne Hazm 4:160.

³ Ref: *Tareekh Khateeb*, 6:221 [No. 3275]; Ibne Asakir, [12/309 and in the biography of Imam Ali (a.s.) in *Tareekh Damishq*, researched edition 1/273, H. 322]; *Kifayatul Kanjih*, 108 [Pg. 231]; *As-Sawaiq*, 76 [Pg. 127]; *Taareekhul Kholaifa*, Suyuti, 115 [Pg. 161]; *Al-Futuhatal Islamiyya*, 2:342; *Nurul Absar*, 81 [Pg. 164].

announce from the tongue of His Prophet that obedience to Ali (a.s.) is His obedience and disobedience of Ali is His disobedience¹, and at the same time the field should be open for independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) so taking refuge in that battle can be fought against him, or he can be killed or exiled or in view of general public, he should be abused, or cursed from pulpits or open propaganda against him should be unleashed?

Will your independent view permit you to adjudge that jurisprudence regarding this is like the jurisprudence and difference of Islamic jurisprudents regarding the execution of the sorcerer?

Ibne Hazm himself says in the book of *Al-Fisal*²:

“If a Muslim holds a view and he commits a mistake in that, since there was no proof against that and the truth was also not clear for him, he is excused and he will get a single reward; because he was in pursuit of truth and his mistake also, since it was not intentional according to the statement of the Almighty Allah:

وَلَيْسَ عَلَيْكُمْ جُنَاحٌ إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا خَطَأٌ مِّنْ بَعْدِ إِيمَانٍ قُلُوبُكُمْ

“And there is no blame on you concerning that in which you made a mistake, but (concerning) that which your hearts do purposely (blame may rest on you).”³

He would be given a single reward. And if his view is proved correct and valid, he would get two rewards: one for the correctness of his verdict and one for the efforts he exerted in it. And since the proof was evident for him, but without enmity and malice to God and His Messenger (s.a.w.a.), he had opposed the truth, such a person is a transgressor; he persisted on an unlawful act and committed audacity against God. And if it was due to enmity and malice to God and His Messenger (s.a.w.a.) he opposed truth, such a person is a disbeliever and an apostate; his life and property are lawful (he can be killed and his property seized) and in this rule, there is no difference between mistakes regarding issues of belief in every matter of the Shariah and jurisprudential mistakes.

Is it possible to deny the evidence of Quran or to deny the verses mentioned in it? Or there is possibility that all these definite evidences remained concealed on those mistaken jurists and the truth did not become clear on them and evidence was not established on them? Or independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) and interpretation have permeated these clear textual declarations also?

In addition to this, there exist clear and absolute traditional reports from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding fighting and peace with Ameerul Momineen (a.s.); some of them are as follows:

¹ Hakeem has mentioned this report in *Mustadrak*, 3:121 and 128 [3/131 H. 4617, Pg. 139, H. 4641] and Zahabi has mentioned it in his *Talkhis*, and certified its authenticity.

² *Al-Fisal*, 3:258.

³ Surah Ahzab 33:5

In *Mustadrak*¹, Hakeem has narrated from Zaid bin Arqam from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said to Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain (a.s.):

“I am at war with those, who are at war with you and I am at peace with those, who are at peace with you.”

Mohibuddin Tabari in *Riyaz*², has narrated from Abu Bakr Siddiq that he said: “I saw the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) having pitched a tent and leaning on an Arabian arch; and in tent were Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain. He said: O Muslims, I am at peace with one, who is at peace with the occupants of the tent and I am at war with one, who is at war with them. I am a friend of one, who befriends them and I do not love those, who do not love them; and none loves them, except one, who is fortunate and of legitimate birth; and no one is inimical to them, except one, who is wretched and of illegitimate birth.”

Also, Hakeem, in *Mustadrak*³ has narrated from Jabir bin Abdulla that I heard the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) say while holding the arm of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.): “He is the chief of the righteous and the killer of the transgressors; one, who supports him, would be successful and one, who deserts him, shall be degraded.”

In addition to these, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) advised regarding the same battle to his companions and Imam Ali (a.s.), about which Ibne Hazm thinks that Muawiyah, Amr Aas and their followers fought due to their mistaken independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*).

And naturally none of these advices were concealed from any of the companions; and the following are some examples of general call of the Prophet:

Hakeem, in *Mustadrak*⁴ and Dhahabi in *Talkhis*, has narrated from Abu Ayyub Ansari that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) ordered Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) to fight the Qasiteen, the Mariqeen and the Nakiseen.

And without any doubt when you gain access to truth, you would have accepted it. And soon in the life history of Amr Aas and discussion with Muawiyah, you will become aware of points, which distinguish truth from falsehood.

This was a minuscule sample of the statements regarding the views, deviations, illogical and baseless statements of Ibne Hazm. And if ignorance, blind heartedness and exaggeration is not used, you will find that most statements declaring his deviation are justified.

¹ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:149 [3/161, H. 4714] and in the same way in its *Talkhis* (Selection).

² *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:189 [3/136].

³ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:129 [3/140, H. 4644].

⁴ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:139 [3/150, H. 4674] and in the same way in its *Talkhis* (Selection).

Ibne Khallikan writes in his *Tarikh*:¹

“He has severely attacked the past scholars, in such a way that no one is safe from the slash of his tongue.

Ibne Areef says: “The tongue of Ibne Hazm and the sword of Hajjaj are twins.”

أَفَمَنْ حَقَّ عَلَيْهِ كَلِمَةُ الْعَذَابِ طَأْفَانْتَ تُنْقِدُ مَنْ فِي النَّارِ ⑯

“What! as for him then against whom the sentence of chastisement is due: What! can you save him who is in the fire?”²

¹ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:370 [3/327, No. 448].
² Surah Zumar 39:19

Meaning of the tradition of Ghadeer

Perhaps, by this point no doubt remains that the tradition of Ghadeer was indeed issued by the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Evidence of this tradition on the Imamate of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

We have no doubt whatsoever that the word of ‘Maula’ in this instance, only implies the Imamate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). It does not make a difference whether the dictionary meaning of the term of ‘Maula’ is clearly this or it has numerous meanings or other implications. Whether it is according to the rule of evidence of the meaning or without the rule; because what the people in that large and magnificent gathering concluded from it and persons, who heard it after this event and their statements; it becomes the evidence of its meaning. Without any of them denying it and after them poets and litterateurs till the present age have also understood it in the same way. And this is the strongest evidence and proof on the meaning under discussion.

The foremost of them being: Our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), who in reply to the letter of Muawiyah, wrote couplets, which shall be mentioned in the coming pages:

“On the day of Ghadeer the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) made my mastership obligatory on you.”

And among them being: Hassan bin Thabit, who was present in Ghadeer and who sought permission of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to recite couplets regarding this grand occasion and then recited couplets including:

“He said: ‘O Ali, arise, as I have appointed you as Imam and leader after me.’”

And among them is the senior companion, Qays bin Saad bin Ubadah Ansari, who says:

“Ali is our Imam and Imam of all of us as Quran mentioned it. On the day the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. And this is a great matter.”

And among them is Muhammad bin Abdullah Himyari, who said:

“They have completely forgotten his appointment on the day of Ghadeer Khum from the Almighty Allah and from the best of humans, Muhammad (s.a.w.a.).”

Among them is Amr Aas, the companion, who said:

“So many times did we hear from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) special

advices about Ali. And on the day of Ghadeer Khum, he came to the pulpit while his companions had not departed and from the side of Allah he bestowed to Ali the authority on believers from the aspect of Shariah. His hand was in the hand of Ali and he was calling aloud, by the command of God, he said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master from today.”

And among them is Kumayt bin Zaid Asadi, the martyr (126), who says:

“On the day of Ghadeer, when thick trees were shading, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) designated Ali (a.s.) with Mastership (*Wilayat*). Alas, if it had been followed. But the people sold away the Caliphate and I never saw such a prohibited act before.”

Among them is Sayyid Ismail Himyari (d. 179 A.H.) in many of his poetic couplets and Abdi Kufi from the poets of the second century in a long panegyric composed by him and the master of Arabic literature, Abu Tammam (d. 231 A.H.) in his ode, entitled *Raiyya*.

There is a series of great intellectuals, who were experts of their time and who had excellent command on knowledge and literature, all of them concluded the correct implication of the meanings of the words and proper contexts have understood the same meaning and they have used it in their couplets.

Among them being such teachers of language and literature like Dibil Khuzai, Himani Kufi, Amir Abu Faraas, Alamul Huda Sayyid Murtada, Sayyid Razi, Husain bin Hajjaj, Ibne Rumi, Kashajim Sanobari, Mufajja, Sahib bin Ubbad, Nashi, Saghur Tankhi, Zahi, Abul Alaa Sarvari, Jauhari, Ibne Alawiya, Ibne Hammad, Ibne Tabataba, Abul Faraj, Mihyar, Sulu Neeli, Fanjkardi and there is a long list of such personalities, whose literary works have reached to the present age. No expert of art and literature can dare to accuse those artists, because all of them are sources of language and pillars of classical literature.

In addition to them there are many other important personalities, who, if not in couplets, but through their statements, explained that the word of *Maula* and *Wali* means the same Imamate and leadership.

Among them Abu Bakr and Umar top the list: they said while paying allegiance to Ali (a.s.):

“O Ali, you have become my master and the master of all believing men and women.”

Respected readers know well that the rebellious Arabs never agreed to accept obedience of anyone. They did not conclude anything from mastership, except love, hate or anything else. From this they concluded supreme leadership, Imamate and Caliphate, which was a burden on their nature, but on asking about the clarification of Ameerul Momineen, it showed their humility.

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) also intended to clarify this meaning that he publicized the above mentioned question in the replies that they gave was that they have understood the clear demand of the Prophet. Yes, this meaning was also not concealed from ladies, who remained behind the veil.

Zamakhshari says in *Rabiul Abrar*:

“In the light of the statement of Daramiya Hajuniya, even ladies behind veil concluded this. Muawiyah asked them about the reasons for affection for Ali (a.s.); and they replied in protest that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) declared Mastership (*Wilayat*) for Ali on the day of Ghadeer and an incapable person like you is prepared to fight with him, that is why I hate you. Muawiyah did not refute this.”¹

Before all these things are the evidences, challenges and details of protest and arguments of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of Rahba to prove his Caliphate.

Master (*Maula*) in the meaning of foremost (*Awla*)

The dictionary meaning of *Maula* is superior (*Awla*) or it is one of the meanings of *Maula*. Regarding this the conclusions derived by the scholars can be very beneficial.

فَالْيَوْمَ لَا يُؤْخَذُ مِنْكُمْ فِدْيَةٌ وَلَا مِنَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا طَمَاؤُكُمُ النَّارُ طَهِي
مَوْلَكُمْ طَوَّبَسَ الْمَصِيرُ^⑤

“So today ransom shall not be accepted from you nor from those who disbelieved; your abode is the fire; it is your friend and evil is the resort.”²²

In Surah Hadeed, you are needless of finding evidences for the interpretation of the term of *Maula*; as some have interpreted it only as one having complete authority and some interpreted it as one most worthy.

They are as follows:

1. Ibne Abbas in his *Tafseer*³, quoted by *Tafseer Firozabadi*.
2. Farrah Yahya bin Ziyad Kufi Nahwi⁴ (d. 207 A.H.).
3. Akhfash Awsat, Abul Hasan Saeed bin Masada Nahwi (d. 251 A.H.), as quoted by Fakhre Raazi in *Nihayatul Uqul*.
4. Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ismail Bukhari (d. 215 A.H.).⁵
5. Abul Abbas Thalab Ahmad bin Yahya Nahwi Shaibani (d. 219 A.H.).⁶
6. Abu Ja’far Tabari (d. 310 A.H.) in his *Tafseer*⁷.
7. Taftazani (d. 791 A.H.).¹

¹ Ref: *Rabeeul Abraar*, Zamakhshari, 2:599; *Balagatun Nisa*, 72 [Pg. 105].

² Surah Hadeed 57:15

³ *Tafseer Ibne Abbas*, 242, [Pg. 458].

⁴ Maani al-Quran [3/134].

⁵ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 7:240 [4/1815].

⁶ Ref: *Sharahul Mualliqatus Saba*, [Pg. 106]; Qaazi Zuzani Husain bin Ahmad (d. 286).

⁷ *Jaameul Bayan*, 9:117 [No. 3, Vol. 27/228].

8. Alauddin Qushji (d. 879 A.H.).²

Second category

9. Abu Ishaq Ahmad Thalabi (d. 427 A.H.).

In *Kashful Bayan*, under the verse:

مَأْوِكُمُ النَّارُ هِيَ مَوْلِكُمْ

“Your abode is the fire; it is your friend.”³

...he says: That is your companion and most deserving for your residence. Then he has argued with the couplet of Labid, who says:

“Then Wahshi began the day thinking that everyone from behind was more deserving (*Maula*) to be fearful.”⁴

10. Farrah Husain bin Masud Baghawi (d. 510 A.H.).⁵

11. Zamakhshari (d. 538 A.H.).⁶

12. Qaazi Nasiruddin Baidhawi (d. 692 A.H.).⁷

And there are other as well, in which the implication of Maula is ‘the most deserving’, like:

The statement of Almighty Allah in Surah Baqarah:

أَنْتَ مَوْلَانَا

“Thou art our Patron.”⁸

Thalabi says in *Kashful Bayan*⁹: “That is our helper, caretaker and our ‘Wali’ (guardian) and the most capable of us all.”

Then is the statement of Almighty Allah in Surah Aale Imran:

بَلِ اللَّهُ مَوْلَكُمْ

“Nay! Allah is your Patron.”¹⁰

In his exegesis, famous as *Tafseer Zahidi*, Ahmad bin Hasan Zahid Darwajki says:

¹ Sharahul Maqasid: 228 [5/273].

² Sharhe Tajrid [Pg. 477].

³ Surah Hadeed 57:15

⁴ *Faraj* means arms and legs of quadrupeds, thus the place between the hands is called as *Faraj*. Ref: *Behaarul Anwaar*, 37/232; *Khulasa Abaqatul Anwar*, Sayyid Hamid Naqvi, 8/70-71; *Sihahul Lughah*, Jauhari 6/2529; *Lesaanul Arab*, 15/228.

⁵ Maalimut Tanzil, [4/297].

⁶ *Al-Kashaf*, 2:435 [4/476].

⁷ *Tafseer Baizaawi*, 2:497 [2/469].

⁸ Surah Baqarah 2:286

⁹ *Kashful Bayan*, Pg. 92, [Surah Hadeed 57:15].

¹⁰ Surah Aale Imran 3:150

“It implies that Almighty Allah is most worthy to be obeyed.”

And the verse of:

مَا كَتَبَ اللَّهُ لَنَا هُوَ مُؤْلِسُنَا وَعَلَى اللَّهِ فَلِيَتَوَكَّلُ كُلُّ الْمُؤْمِنُونَ ⑥

“Save what Allah has ordained for us; He is our Patron; and on Allah let the believers rely.”¹

As Abu Hayyan says in his *Tafseer*:²

Kalabi said: That is He is more deserving of us in life as well as death. And it is said that: He is our master and chief. And by the same argument, He deals with everyone like He wishes.

Raazi's statement regarding the meaning of tradition

As for Raazi, what happened to his efforts and with stammering of the tongue and hesitation and excessive deliberation has expressed the doubts, sometimes he swallows them, and sometimes he ruminates, and expresses doubts and is in apprehension that he should pose them as huge; he after quoting the meaning of *Awla*, and most deserving, says regarding a group:

Allah, the Mighty and the High says:

مَأْوِكُمُ النَّارُ هِيَ مَوْلَكُمْ وَبِئْسَ الْمُصِيرُ ⑯

“Your abode is the fire; it is your friend and evil is the resort.”³

There are a number of opinions regarding the meaning of Maula:

1. Ibne Abbas says: “Your Maula means your place of return and refuge and its interpretation is that Maula is the position of the Master (*Wali*) and it is in the meaning of proximity. Thus, the meaning is that fire is the place with which he will be near and where he will reach.”

2. Kalbi says: “That is: it is most suitable for you. The viewpoint of Zajjaj, Farrah and Abu Ubaidah is same. You should also know that what they have said is not the interpretation of the word, it is its meaning; because if the term of ‘Maula’ with ‘Awla’ (most deserving) in dictionary has been in one meaning, using each of them in place of one another had been correct and we could instead of saying: ‘He is more deserving than so and so’ we could have said: ‘This one is more *Awla* than so and so. Since this replacement is not right, we understand that what they said is the meaning and not the interpretation.

From this aspect, I make you aware of this point that Sharif Murtada, when he was proving the Imamate of Ali (a.s.) from the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

¹ Surah Taubah 9:51

² Tafseer Abu Hayyan, 5:52.

³ Surah Hadeed 57:15

“Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master.”

He (Sharif Murtada) says: “One of the meaning of *Maula* is *Awla* (most deserving).”

Regarding this, he has reasoned through the statement of Imams, which they mentioned in interpretation of this verse that *Maula* is in the meaning of *Awla* and more deserving. When it is proved that in the word of *Maula* there is possibility of the meaning of *Awla* (and the intention of this meaning from this term is correct) applying this term to this meaning (in the tradition of Ghadeer) will become obligatory; because the other meaning or its proof is clear (and does not need explanation) like the meaning of cousin¹ or helper or its ceasing to exist is clear, like *Mautiq* (freed slave) and *Muataq* (the freed one) and applying the statement of the Prophet on the first group is meaningless and on the second group, it is a lie.

But we proved through reasoning that their statement on this juncture hints at the meaning of the term and not its interpretation, therefore reasoning through their statements is incorrect.²

And the gist of his statement in *Nihayatul Uqul* is as follows:

If the term of *Maula* had come in the meaning of *Awla* [most deserving and eligible] it was definitely correct that whatever is common between the two will be same; but it is not so; that is why ‘*Maula*’ cannot be in the meaning of ‘*Awla*’... and evidence of this claim is that it cannot be said: “He is my *Maula* of so and so” but it can be said: He is the *Maula*, and the two of them are two *Maulas*, and also, without the word of ‘*min*’ it cannot be said: He is ‘*Awla*’ and they two are ‘*Awliyan*’.

If you want, you can be amazed (and listen to the astonishing statement) so be amazed that Fakhre Raazi was unaware that the conditions of derivatives in different conjugations is different from the aspects of intransitive and transitive verbs; because singularity of meaning among contradictory terms occurs in the essence of the meaning and not in their broadness, which are kinds of special constructions and seen in conjugation of terms and their grammatical forms.

So, contradiction between the terms of *Maula* and *Awla* after the fact that the term of *Awla* should come with ‘*ba*’ but *Maula* comes without ‘*ba*’ – (from the aspect that the root is not W-L-Y, except) in the aspect that it has occurred in conjugation of ‘*Afal*’. As it is a specialty of this conjugation that it is accompanied by ‘*man*’; on the basis of this, the implication of ‘so and so is *Awla* to so and so’ and ‘so and so is *Maula* of so and so’ is one of the meaning of so and so with relation to so and so is having precedence and worthier than the

¹ This statement of Raazi is a strange overlooking, because Ja’far, Aqil, Talib and all sons of Abu Talib were cousins of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), but Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is not their cousin, he is their brother. Thus, this meaning was not intended by the word of *Maula*. It is definitely a lie and not that it should become an evidence of proof.

² *Tafseer Kabeer*, 8:98 [29/227].

other.

Khalid bin Abdullah Azhari says in the chapter of elatives in his book of *Tasrih*:

“Using synonym in the place of a word is only correct if there is no obstruction between them.”

However, a hurdle exists over here and that is the use; because elative noun is not used, except with the word of ‘min’ (from), and sometimes the letter ‘min’ is omitted along with its preposition due to the presence of the context; like the verse:

وَالْآخِرَةُ خَيْرٌ وَآبَغُ^١

“While the hereafter is better and more lasting.”¹

Moreover, the objections that Raazi has relied upon, in another meaning of the term of *Maula*, is applicable to what others have mentioned as well, like the meaning of ‘Nasir’, as Raazi has taken this meaning in the tradition of Ghadeer; because instead of ‘He is the helper of the religion of Allah’ it can never be said: ‘He is the *Maula* of the religion of Allah’; and Prophet Isa (a.s.), instead of ‘Who would help me in the religion of Allah?’ did not say ‘Who would be my *Maula* in the religion of Allah?’ And the Hawaris also instead of saying: ‘we are helper of Allah’ never said: ‘we are *Maulas* of Allah’.

You know well that these contradictions are effective in a large part of similar words, which Rummani (d. 384 A.H.) has compiled on page 45 of his separate book (printed in 1321 A.H.) printed in Egypt. And no grammarian has ever denied difference of meaning only on the basis of various types of use of habits along with the word, just as on the pretext of all contradictions present in the construction, they have not denied similarity.

As for example the sentence ‘I have a dirham, which is not new’ is correct, but the statement: ‘I have a dirham, which is but not new’ is incorrect (or that the term or ‘or’ and ‘except’ is used in the same sense. And the statement: ‘indeed you are learned’ is correct, but the statement: ‘indeed you learned’ is incorrect. Same is the case of all such kind of Arabic sentences.

Raazi’s objection in the view of scholars

This useless objection of Raazi did not remain concealed from scholars of literature and experts of linguistics, and they rejected it after analysis. Their disregarding it, is proof that the meaning of *Maula* is proved to be *Awla*.

They include Taftazani in *Sharh Maqasid*,² Qushji in *Sharh Tajreed*³ and

¹ Surah Alaa 87:17

² *Sharh Maqasid*, 289 [5/273].

³ *Sharh Tajreed*, [Pg. 477].

Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq*¹ and he, with all malice and strictness, has refuted the tradition of Ghadeer, in such condition that he has accepted the clear meaning of *Maula* as *Awla* (most deserving), but questioned whether it was in that matter or all the affairs?

And he has selected the second one, and derived this meaning from the statement of Abu Bakr and Umar, when they said: "Today you became the master of us and all the believer men and women."

Shaykh Shahabuddin Ahmad bin Abdul Qaazir Shafei has also adopted the same stance in *Zakhiratul Maal*.

Another statement of Raazi

Raazi issued another statement, in which he adopted a tough stance. In *Nihayatul Uqul*, he expressed the opinion that none of the imams of syntax and language has not said: "The conjugation of 'maf-al' infinitive, which is constructed for the conjugation of place and time, has come in the meaning of 'If-al' which is made for subservience.

But you will conclude the weakness of Raazi and his followers' statement by identifying the previous clear statements that the special meaning of 'Maula' is 'Awla bi Shayyin' [most deserving for a thing].

You will also note that the root of this objection was Raazi himself without any kind of base and he has not attributed it to anyone else and others also seeing that this viewpoint was opposed to the conclusion of the Shia from the tradition, followed him blindly and accepted it in confidence.

Are the scholarly personages, who clearly said that the term of 'Maula' is sometimes used in the meaning of 'Awla' not more deserving than him, who issues statements without estimation and without any evidence; are they not more informed about lexicology?!

How they should not be most informed, while there exist persons among them, who are points of reference for grAmmaar, leaders of literature and experts of Arabic literature and exegesis?

Whether in this clear statement there is no proof for them while the fact is that sometimes 'Maf-al' is used in the meaning of 'Af-al', then with what proof do they deny it completely? Yes, [for an important task the master has cut off his nose].²

Also, the statement of Abu Walid bin Shahna Hanafi Halabi in *Rauzul Manazir*,³ in the section on the events of the year 606 A.H. is sufficient when he says:

¹ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 24 [Pg. 44].

² This idiom is used for achieving ones hidden aim. Ref: *Tareekh Tabari*, 1/443. 448 and *Jawairul Balagha*, 246-287.

³ *Rauzul Manazir*, [2/199].

“Raazi has profound knowledge of all sciences, other than the literature of Arabs.”

Abu Hayyan in *Tafseer*¹ himself says after quoting the statement of Raazi:

“His *Tafseer* is outside the style and light discourse of Arabs. His discourse is mostly of those, who call themselves wise.”

In addition to this is the evidence of conjugation of ‘Maf-al’ on time and place, like the evidence of conjugation of ‘Af-al’ on superlative and like special characteristics of every derivative, from the aspects of form and construction and not article.

This was the dominant issue and is on the basis of analogy and is not an absolute principle, on the contrary, it is most probably such that till the time that against the Arabs it would be acted upon according to this criterion only. Also, since the matter is opposed to conjecture, in this case, his statement precedes the principle and analogy.

And if for Raazi the particular connotation of Maula in the meaning of infinitive or verb was completed in a particular time or a particular place and it were clear and definite, he should also reject the term of ‘Awla’ when it comes in the meaning of active and passive participle, and adjective, whereas he clearly says: It has come in the meaning of helper, assistant and ally.

All experts of Arabic have agreed to this meaning, and all of them have consensus that the clear meaning of *Maula* is Master (*Wali*), and many have said that ‘Maula’ has also come in this meaning of partner, confidant, devotee, freed one, ally, master and owner.²

Raazi’s reply to the above statements

Raazi has replied to all the above statements, which exposes his indecency, hatefulness and inner defects.

He says in *Nihayatul Uql*:

“What scholars of language have stated is that ‘Maula’ is in the meaning of superior and one having precedence, it cannot be evidence for them, because such narrations cannot be used for reasoning. On the basis of this, we should say: If in the exegesis of the verse:

مَأْوِكُمُ النَّارُ هِيَ مَوْلِكُمْ

“Your abode is the fire; it is your Maula.”³

It is said that: It means: It is superior to you. [It means that the fire is worthy on you], and Akhfash, Zajjaj and Ali bin Isa have also mentioned it, and in order to prove it, they have reasoned through the couplet of Labid. But they have been

¹ Tafseer Abu Hayyan, 4:149.

² Discussion about this meaning will soon follow.

³ Surah Hadeed 57:15

negligent and it is not from the aspect of research, because scholars of language, like Khalil have taken this meaning, except in the exegesis of this verse and another verse and that too chainless traditional report; and they have not mentioned it in the actual book of grAmmaar.”

Alas, if I only knew who informed Raazi that these people without research and from the aspect of negligence have issued this statement? Is this in all dictionary meanings as his statement is negligent? And his reasoning through the Arabic couplet is invalid. Or he has opened another account for the term of Maula? Can the dictionary not be used for whom the meaning is proved to as reasoning? And they have done this [and to prove the meaning of Maula, they have reasoned through the couplet of Labid].

How he, after narrating this meaning from scholars of language, is without a little mention and like him, has blamed them for negligence? Whereas, it is not necessary that it should be mentioned in all books of language.

Does Raazi himself only suffices with “*Al-Ain*” and books like it? Who can in quoting the term he has laid the condition of connection (*Ittisal*) of chains of narrators?

Can Raazi get a person better than them for concluding this meaning?

What happened to him if one of the people mentions a meaning of an Arabic term for him? He will not mention this statement to him. We should say: At this point, he is in pursuit of a particular aim, which is not present in other instances.

Has he mentioned the conditions of dictionary meaning? Is the statement of only one person from experts of language sufficient? Suyuti has quoted this statement in his *Al-Mazhar*.¹

Tohfa Ithna Asharia

In his book of *Tohfa Ithna Asharia*, Ahle Sunnat scholar of Indian subcontinent, Shah Abdul Aziz Dehlavi, has tried to commit a great bluff when trying to refute that the tradition of Ghadeer implies Imamate. He says that this reasoning is not complete unless the term of *Maula* comes in the meaning of *Wali*. While the fact is that this particular adjective form has not come in the meaning of superlative.

Through this statement, he wants to invalidate the definite claim of the experts of grAmmaar that *Maula* is used to imply *Wali*. And *Wali* implies the ‘master of affair’, like the guardian of the woman, guardian of the orphan, guardian of the slave, succession of the ruler, that is one entrusted with rulership after the present ruler.

Yes, the statements of Faraa (d. 207 A.H.) in *Maaniul Quran*² and Abu Abbas Mubarrad, who says: “*Wali* and *Maula* mean the same,” has remained

¹ *Al-Mazhar*, 2:47-48 [1/79].

² *Maaniul Quran* [2/161].

concealed from Dehlavi.

He is unaware of consensus of grand scholars of language on this meaning, and from the fact that they have mentioned *Awla* as one of the meanings of *Maula* in lexicons and dictionaries.

As it is mentioned in *Mushkilul Quran* of Anbari, *Al-Kashaf wal Bayan*¹, Thalabi in the verse of:

أَنْتَ مَوْلَنَا

“Thou art our Patron.”²

Sihah of Jauhari³, *Ghareebul Quran* of Sajistani⁴, *Qamus* of Firozabadi⁵, *Al-Wasit* of Wahidi, *Tafseer Qurtubi*⁶ and *Nihaya* of Ibne Athir⁷.

Discussion regarding meaning of *Maula*

Scholars of language, regard ‘Sayyid’ – to be in the meaning of other than master and the freed slave – has included among meanings of the term of *Maula*. On the other side they include chief and ruler to be among the terms of *Wali*.

The third group has consensus that *Wali* and *Maula* mean one and the same thing, and both these meanings are not other than the meaning of precedence in the command; because the chief initiates system in the society and applies the style of training of the individuals and prevents them from encroaching on the rights of each other.

In the same way, the Sayyid is said to be one, who has precedence over everyone in the affairs of rulership. For example the circle of Wilayat is greater than administration of a province and administration of province is greater than governorship of a city. More than these is Wilayat of kings and rulers; and more than that is the Wilayat of prophet, who is sent for all the people of the world, and the Wilayat of a caliph, who is to administer the affairs after him.

If we overlook the use of ‘Maula’ in the meaning of having precedence, but we cannot deny its occurrence in the meaning of *Maula* and *Sayyid*. Thus, in the tradition it has a wider meaning. The fact is that the *Maula* has twenty-seven meanings. I am sure that not one of them can be intended in the tradition, except one; they are as follows:

1. Lord (God)
2. uncle

¹ *Al-Kashaf wal Bayan* [Pg. 92].

² Surah Baqarah 2:286

³ *As-Sihah*, 2:564 [6/2529].

⁴ *Ghareebul Quran*, 154 [Pg. 311].

⁵ *Qaamoosul Moheet*, 4:401 [Pg. 1732].

⁶ *Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran*, 3:431 [16/155].

⁷ *An-Nihaya fee Ghareebul Hadith wal Athar*, 4: 246 [5/228].

3. cousin
4. son of the son
5. son of the daughter
6. one who frees a slave
7. freed slave
8. slave
9. master¹
10. follower
11. One who takes up the bounties.
12. Partner
13. Ally
14. Companion
15. Neighbor
16. Guest
17. Son-in-law
18. Confidante
19. Giver of bounty
20. Confederate
21. Guardian
22. Most deserving
23. Sayyid in the meaning of other than owner and emancipated slave.
24. Fan
25. Supporter
26. One having discretion in matters.
27. Trustee of affairs.

As for the first meaning

To intend this meaning would make one guilty of disbelief, because except for the Almighty Allah, no one is the lord of universe (and the Prophet never said that of whomsoever I am the Lord and master...then Ali is also his Lord).

As for the meanings of 2 and 3 till 14

The implication of each of these meanings from the term of ‘Maula’ in tradition necessitates falsehood.

As for companion, neighbor, guest, son-in-law and confidante; whether it is

¹ In *Saheeh Bukhari*, 7:57 [4/1671] in its place al-Malik (king) is mentioned; and Qastalani in *Sharh Saheeh*, 7:77 [10/160] says: Maula means king, because he is authority on the people.

proximity of relationship or proximity of location: Implication of each of these meanings is frivolous, so it is not possible, especially in that grand gathering and that also on the way and in scorching heat, when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ordered that those who have gone ahead should be called back and those who are behind should be waited for. Especially in the place which lacked every kind of facility. Even if we suppose that one of those meanings were employed, what merit it held for Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) that they congratulated them saying: Bravo! Bravo!

As for 'bounty giver': This meaning also cannot be applied, because it is not necessary that Ali should also bestow to one whom the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) has bestowed; on the contrary its opposite is possible.

Its implication is that whoever was given the bounty of religion, guidance, training, and honor in the world and salvation in the hereafter, Ali (a.s.) is also having those rights, because he is the proxy of the Prophet, his defender and protector of his law and propagator of his faith. That is why Almighty Allah through that clear verse, perfected religion and completed the bounty through him; and this meaning is from the meaning of Imamate, which is the topic of our discussion.

As for being confederates: It is inevitable that it implies treaties and covenants with some tribes for peace making. And this meaning also has no scope regarding Ali (a.s.), yes, he was in all acts and styles a follower of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) [that is with whoever the Prophet was at peace, Ali (a.s.) was also at peace]. Finally, in this matter all Muslims are equal and to announce this only for Ali (a.s.) in that grand and incomparable congregation and with such elaborate arrangements, is really meaningless.

Follower and helper

Supposing 'Maula' implies these two meanings it is not beyond two possibilities: either the implication is that either people are being encouraged to follow and help Ali (a.s.) since he is one of the believers and from his defenders; or it implies that he is commanding him to help and support the people, while either it is an informative or expressive sentence.

As for the first possibility, that is informing about necessity of loving him: it is not a new thing for the people and its announcement is also not without precedence and that if he did not announce it, it is as if he has not delivered the message. And to announce it he made people wait in those unfavorable circumstances and that great crowd was told that religion was complete and the bounty was perfected.

In such a way as if he had brought something new and has framed a new rule, which did not exist before; and Muslims were unaware of it, and they also came and congratulated him; and that also in words like: "Today, you have become my master and the master of all believer men and women," statements

which show that a new incident has taken place, about which, the sayer was not informed before, because every Muslim day and night recites the following verses of Quran:

وَالْمُؤْمِنُونَ وَالْمُؤْمِنَاتُ بَعْضُهُمْ أَوْلَيَاءُ بَعْضٍ

“And (as for) the believing men and the believing women, they are guardians of each other.”¹

إِنَّمَا الْمُؤْمِنُونَ إِخْوَةٌ

“The believers are but brethren.”²

And this verse well proves the attachment of Muslims to each other like two brothers [so its announcement again in those special conditions is meaningless].

And we regard the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to be remote from such an act and Almighty Allah also regards Himself free of such vain acts.

As for the second possibility

That is making his love and affection obligatory: This possibility is also not lesser than the first, because command is not given and law is not framed regarding love and help, and there is no need to announce it.

Moreover, if the implication is existence of love (first possibility) or ordering to love him (second possibility), the Prophet would not have said: “Of whomsoever I am the master” on the contrary he should have said: One who is loyal to me, he is loyal and supporter of Ali. From this aspect, these two possibilities are out of the meaning of Maula in tradition. May be Sibte Ibne Jauzi implies this, when he says in *Tadkira*:³

“To apply the meaning of helper and supporter to the word of Maula in the tradition is incorrect.”

In addition to this loving and helping by these two reasons [new command, which was mentioned in first and second instance] is only related to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is not obligatory; on the contrary it is necessary to love all Muslims. On the basis of this, what is the justification in restricting it for Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and making preparation for that?

And if the implication, was special love and friendship, that is, which is higher than customary love among the people, like the obligation of following and obeying him and submitting before him, then this is the same meaning of Imamate and being a Divine Proof. Especially if Imamate is according to the statement of: Of whomsoever I am the master...before the specialty, which the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has placed between the meaning in the text ‘then Ali is his

¹ Surah Taubah 9:71

² Surah Hujurat 49:10

³ *Tadkiral Khawas*, 19 [Pg. 32].

Maula'.

As for the third possibility – that is informing about the obligation of love and support for Ali, if it was in this meaning, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) would have announced its emphasis to Ali and not to the people.

As for the third possibility – that is making obligatory love and regard of the people for Ali (a.s.): This also, is like the third possibility.

As for the fourth possibility: that is making obligatory love of people upon Ali (a.s.): This is also like the third possibility; since the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in that case would not make such preparations, deliver a sermon to the people and request them to listen to it; and also why he should adjure them and take their concurrence; that have I conveyed the divine message to you? All this was not required.

Except that it should be intended to demand the love of people and their affection by mention of this matter, in such a way that if they are aware that he loves them and he is their helper, they would follow him and not oppose him and would never reject his statement

As is the intention of calling people to love and affection since the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) initiated the statement with 'of whomsoever I am the Maula' we understand that the implication of the Prophet is not ordinary love between people. On the contrary his implication was special love and it is known to all that love and help of the Prophet is like the love and affection of other believers. And basically it is not like the love and help of anyone else, because the Prophet loves the Ummah and helps it as he is the leader of people in the religion and the world and he holds discretion over them, and protects them in every manner. Because if this had not been there, enemies would have destroyed them. As a result of which the aim of Almighty Allah in spreading of the call of truth and promotion of Islam in the world would be contradicted. So it is necessary to have this love for the well being of religion. And one, who has this love, is without any doubt the caliph of the Prophet on the earth.

In that case the aim is calling for strengthening of love and affection of people, the term of Maula in other meanings is not applicable.

Meaning implied in the tradition

The term Maula implies only Wali; now what remains is one having precedence, Sayyid, master, freed slave, one, who has control on the affairs and the caretaker.

As for Wali: The only meaning is what the speaker intended, because as per the explanation mentioned, taking another meanings is not correct.

As for Sayyid¹ in the mentioned meaning it is not separate from the first meaning, because Sayyid means one, having precedence over others, especially

¹ A large number of scholars have understood it in this meaning.

the statement of Prophet (s.a.w.a.) with which he introduced himself in the beginning and then mentioned his cousin in the same terms; thus it is not possible that he should not have implied the same meaning with regard to him. On the contrary, it is general leadership of the religion and the world; to follow which is obligatory on all people.

As for the one having discretion over affairs: This meaning is also like the previous one. Regarding this meaning, Raazi in his *Tafseer*,¹ while discussing the exegesis of the verse:

وَاعْتَصِمُوا بِاللَّهِ هُوَ مَوْلَكُمْ

“And hold fast by Allah; He is your Guardian”²

He has narrated from Khaffal that:

At this point implication of this meaning from the term of Maula isn't possible, except that one should conclude one having discretion as Almighty Allah has made following him obligatory, so that people may be guided on the path of success.

That is why he is worthier than all others for having discretion on all aspects of human society, like the Prophet, whose obedience is obligatory, who through the command of Allah is appointed as the Imam clearly by the Prophet. And he is always the follower of the acts and words of Prophet:

وَمَا يَنْطِقُ عَنِ الْهُوَيِّ إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا وَحْيٌ يُوحَى

“Nor does he speak out of desire. It is naught but revelation that is revealed,”³

In the same way is the meaning of guardian of affair

Abu Abbas Mubarrad,⁴ Qurtubi says in his *Tafseer*,⁵ in Surah Aale Imran under the verse:

بِلِ اللَّهِ مَوْلَكُمْ

“Nay! Allah is your Patron.”⁶

...and they are not your patron.

Ibne Athir in *Nihaya*,⁷ Zubaidi in *Tajul Uroos*,⁸ and Ibne Manzur in *Lisanul*

¹ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 6:210 [23/74].

² Surah Hajj 22:78

³ Surah Najm 53:3. 4

⁴ Sayyid Murtada in *Shafî* [2/219] has narrated from him in this meaning.

⁵ *Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran*, 4:232 [No. 2, Vol. 4/149].

⁶ Surah Aale Imran 3:150

⁷ An-Nihaya fee Ghareebul Hadith wal Athar, 4:246 [5/229].

⁸ Taajul Oroos, 10:398.

Arab¹ have considered it to be the exclusive meaning of Maula.

This meaning is also not separate from 'Awla', especially with the meaning that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) himself described him as such in condition that it should be the implication of this meaning.

It is necessary to mention that the point, which we have mentioned after being drowned in the sea of language and books of Arabic literature, was that the actual meaning of Maula is not other than *Awla bi Shayyin*. And this meaning is collection of all meanings and the meaning of 'Awla' is included in each of them in a form. And the term of 'Maula' is not used in each of the meaning, except in accordance with the existence of 'Awla'.

1. Lord; the Almighty Allah is most deserving and superior than everyone to dominate the creatures. He created the people of the world according to His wisdom and intention. He is having authority over them. [then 'rabb' from that aspect is said to be 'Maula', because he is having more authority than others.].

2. Uncle; he is most suitable of the people for protecting the nephew and to love him; and he becomes the successor of his father and he is the foremost for his son.

3. Cousin; he is having preference in cooperating with his cousin, since the two are branches of one tree.

4. Son; he is most deserving of people for obedience of the father and expression of humility before him. Almighty Allah says:

وَاحْفِظْ لَهُمَا جَنَاحَ النَّلْلِ وَمِنَ الرَّحْمَةِ

"And make yourself submissively gentle to them with compassion, and say: O my Lord! have compassion on them."²

5. Nephew (son of the sister); he is also most deserving for humility before his maternal uncle, who is equal to his mother.

6. *Motiq* [one who frees a slave]; he is also more deserving than others, as he has freed and done a good turn to the slave.

7. *Motaq* [freed slave]; he is most suitable than other for recognition of favor of his master and obedience to him is in fact thankfulness to him.

8. *Abd* [slave]; he is also most deserving than others for submission before the master, since this act is obligatory and success depends on it.

9. *Maalik*; he is also more deserving than others for guarding his properties, their administration and discretion over them, without injustice and oppression.

10. *Taabe*; he is also most deserving for companionship of his leader with relation to one, who is not under him.

11. *Mun-am Alaih* [one, who obtains the bounty]; he is also most deserving

¹ Lesaanul Arab, [15/401].

² Surah Isra 17:24

for thankfulness to the giver of the bounty.

12. *Shareek* [partner]; he is more deserving for fulfillment of the rights of partnership and initiative in preventing loss to his partner.

13. *Haleef* [ally]; it is clear that an ally is more deserving than others for protection of covenant and to repel harm from his ally.

14. *Sahib* [companions]; he is more deserving for fulfilling the rights of companionship and friendship.

15. Neighbor; he is also more deserving than others to fulfill the rights of neighbors.

16. Refuge-giver; he is also most eligible for appreciation and thankfulness from one he has given refuge.

17. Son-in-law; he is most deserving for fulfilling the rights of one, who accepted him as his son-in-law, supported him and made the foundation of his life stable. It is mentioned in a tradition that man has three fathers: The father, who gave birth to you, the father, who married you and the father, who educated you.¹

18. Near kindred; he also is most deserving to remove difficulties of the relatives, to defend them and make efforts for them.

19. Giver of bounty; he is most deserving for doing good to one, who gaven him bounty and under whose care he is and one, who continues to favor him.

20. *Ageed* [one, who has made pledge of allegiance of brotherhood with him]; he is most deserving like the ally, for fulfilling the right of one, who made a pledge with him.

21 & 22. *Mohib* and *Nasir*: these two mean ally and associate; because they are more eligible for defending the beloved and for helping those, who need help.

23. Master (*Wali*); discussion regarding was mentioned above and the matter became clear. And also the below meanings:

24. *Sayyid* (master and chief).

25. One having discretion.

26. Trustee of affairs.

Conclusion

Maula is having only one meaning and it is ‘awla bi shayyin’ [one having precedence] and most eligible than others. And this precedence is related to instances that imply changeable uses and commonality of this meaning is ideal and not literal and literal commonality is better than literal commonality.² Since

¹ I could not find this traditional report in collections of Ahle Sunnat and Shia traditions.

² *Ishtiraak Manawi* [ideal commonality] is coined for concepts having same meaning, but its meaning is different for different persons, like the word of *Haiwan*, which is used for all beings having perception, like humans and...and these beings and implications are common in the meaning of *Haiwan*].

literal commonality needs multiple situations, and here multiple situations are not proved by absolute evidence, and the rule in such cases is negation [source of absence of multiple situations].

And statement of some persons regarding the traditional report of Muslim, which he has narrated through his authentic chains¹ from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said: The slave should not say to his master: my master. And in the tradition of Abu Muawiyah the following statement is added: Because your master is Allah. It proves that when this word is without context, the meaning of superiority comes to mind. And numerous scholars of traditions have narrated this traditional report in their books.

Contexts of Maula

So far, there is no choice for researchers, except to accept that *Maula* implies *Awla*. And supposing if we regard it less than that and accept that the term of *Maula* is a shared word and this is one of the meanings, we would say: In the tradition, there are numerous contexts [joined and disjoined], which negate other meanings as will be clear from the following:

First context

The beginning of tradition, when the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) says: “Do I not have more right on you?” That is: “Do I not have absolute Mastership (*Wilayat*) on you?” Or something near to this. Then His Eminence added the following words as a continuation of his statements and says: “Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master.” This preface is narrated by many Shia and Ahle Sunnat scholars.

1. Ahmad bin Hanbal
2. Ibne Majah
3. Nasai
4. Tabari
5. Tirmizi
6. Suyuti

This preface is from the authentic and proved parts of this tradition such that there is no scope to object against it. Thus, from this statement, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) clarified the introduction of what he intended. In any case, his statement, which we believe is away from every mistake and His Eminence is most eloquent and most expressive of people; thus, there is no option, except to say that the meaning of preface continues in the discourse [and since *Maula* in the discourse of the Prophet implied *Awla bi Shayin*, thus *Maula* in the statement after that is also in this meaning.]

Ishtiraak Lafzi [literal commonality] is that one word is coined for different meanings; like the word of ‘sher’ (lion) in Farsi also means ‘milk’, and the meaning of each is different.

¹ *Saheeh Muslim*: 197 [4/436, H. 14, Kitab Alfaz minal Adab wa Ghairaha].

Also, the statement of Sibte Ibne Jauzi Hanafi¹ in his *Tadkira* completely explains the captioned matter. He has mentioned ten meanings for the word of Maula and Awla is mentioned as the tenth, and he says:

“The implication of the tradition is special obedience, on the basis of this tenth meaning, which is Awla is definite, and the meaning of the tradition is: For whomsoever I have more precedence, Ali also has precedence over him.”

Second context

At the end of the tradition, when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) says:

اللهم وال من والاه وعاد من عاده

“O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.”

And in some versions it is mentioned:

وانصر من نصره واحذل من خذله

“Help those, who help him and degrade those, who insult him.”

We mentioned its narrators and discussed the aspects before that Maula is only in the meaning of superiority necessitating Imamate:

1. When the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) holds the prominent rank, which Almighty Allah had bestowed on his successor that is general rulership on the people and absolute Imamate after the Prophet, naturally he knows that realization of this issue requires military power, supporters and obedience of governors, commanders and officials.

He also knows that as mentioned in Quran² there were some individuals among people, who were jealous of him. And His Eminence also knew that there were those, who had concealed malice to him in their hearts, and there were hypocrites, who would seek revenge in the style of enmity of Jahiliyya.

He also knew that after him, mischief would appear from those greedy individuals for rulership and wealth, and jealousy and greed will appear and they will make demands from Ali (a.s.) for which they are not eligible and Ali (a.s.) will act according to truth and not fulfill their demands, as a result they would array against him: [they would become his enemy and will take up swords against him],³

¹ Tadkiratul Khawaas: 20 [Pg. 32].

² In the verse: “*Or do they envy the people for what Allah has given them* [the Prophet and his family] *of His grace?*” (Surah Nisa 4:54). Ibne Maghzali in *Manaqib* [Pg. 267, H. 314] and Ibne Abil Hadeed in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:236 [7/220, Sermon 108] and Hadhrami Shafei in *Rashfa*: 27 have narrated that this verse was revealed about Ali (a.s.) and regarding those sciences, which he possessed.

³ An Arabic proverb for one, who is loyal to his friend once, and after that he confronts him and becomes inimical to him. Ref: *Nihaya*, Ibne Asir, 1:308; *Majmaul Bahrain*, Tarihi, 4:174; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 16/167-169.

He mentioned this briefly, saying: “If you obey Ali – and I don’t think that you will do that – you would definitely be guided,”¹ and according to another version, he said: “If you accept the Caliphate of Ali (a.s.) – and I don’t think you will accept – you would find him guiding and guided.”²

Since the Prophet knew the future, he began by praying for his supporters and helpers, and cursing his enemies and those, who insults him, so as to make the matter of Caliphate clear. That people may realize that love for him is cause of receiving love of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime and enmity to him and insulting him will cause His anger and fury, so that people may get attached to truth and folks of truth.

Such a supplication in a general form and without stipulation is not appropriate, except regarding one having such a status. That is why such a supplication is not mentioned for all believers for whom God made loving each other obligatory, and hatred among them is a part of that and it does not reach to this level.

2. This supplication is general implying that in every condition, and in every time and on everyone, his love and affection is obligatory and enmity to him, and to regard him as debased is unlawful. This shows that he is in all conditions having a quality, which is an obstacle for disobedience; he does not speak other than the truth; he does not do, but what is right; and he does not support other than the truth, because if a sin is committed by him, it is obligatory on all to disobey him and to express enmity to him.

Since the Prophet has not specified any time and condition, we conclude that Ali (a.s.) is always and in all conditions and at all times, having the same quality which we mentioned. And one having this quality is definitely the Imam because on the basis of reasonings mentioned before it is bad that a person lower than him should get precedence over him and become the Imam. When it is proved that he is the Imam, then he has precedence with relation to people and he is more worthy of discretion than others.

Third context

Statement of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.): “O people, to what do you testify?”

They replied: “We testify that there is no god, except Allah.”

He asked: “After that?”

They replied: “That Muhammad is His servant and messenger.”

Then he asked: “Who is your Master (*Wali*)?”

They replied: “Allah and His Messenger is our master.”

At that time, the Prophet raised the arm of Imam Ali (a.s.) and said: “Of whomsoever Allah and Prophet are masters, Ali is (also) his master.”

¹ Musnad Ahmad, 1/109.

² *Kanzul Ummaal*, 11/630, H. 33072.

This statement is narrated from Jarir.¹

Placing Mastership (*Wilayat*) in the context of divine monotheism (*Tauheed*) and prophethood; and its mention after absolute mastership of God and His Prophet, is not possible, except that it should imply Imamate to include precedence over the life of people [just as the Prophet is more deserving regarding the believers:

النَّبِيُّ أَوْلَى بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَنفُسِهِمْ

“The Prophet has a greater claim on the faithful than they have on themselves.”²

Ali (a.s.) is also having greater claim on believers.]

Fourth context

The statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) after the end of the tradition:

الله أكْبَرْ عَلَى أَكْمَالِ الدِّينِ وَأَقْمَامِ النَّعْيَهِ وَرَضِيَ الرَّبُّ بِرِسَالَتِي وَالْوَلَايَهِ
لَعْلَى بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ

Allah is the greatest for the completion of religion and perfection of blessing and pleasure of God by conveyance of message and Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).

In your view, which meaning other than Imamate, implies perfecting programs, completing propagation of religion, establishing bases of prophethood, completion of religion, perfecting bounty and gaining approval of the Lord in the delivery of message?

In that case, one, who becomes responsible for this sacred duty, is having more authority on people than they have on themselves.

Fifth context

Statement of the Prophet, before mention of Mastership (*Wilayat*):

“As if I have been summoned or that it is near that I will be called and I will harken to the call.”

Or: “Know that it is near that I will separate from you.”

Or: “Very soon, the caller to Lord will come and I will harken to his call.”

And as we mentioned previously, numerous scholars of tradition have mentioned this statement many times.

It explains to us that an important matter remained in the message of the

¹ Jarir, Abdullah bin Jabir Bajali, died (51, 54); his tradition is present in *Majmauz Zawaad*, Hafiz Haithami 9:106, quoting from *Mojamul Kabeer*, Tibrahi, [2/375, H. 2505].

² Surah Ahzab 33:6

Prophet and the Prophet was careful lest before announcing it, his death should approach (and he does not get an opportunity to announce it) and his messengership remains incomplete.

On the basis of the quotation of Muslim¹ after this care and preparation, other than Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and Mastership (*Wilayat*) of his pure progeny, he did not announce anything else. Whether this important matter, which is related to this Mastership (*Wilayat*), other than Mastership (*Wilayat*), which is clarified in numerous Sihah books? Is the owner of this Mastership (*Wilayat*) not more eligible with relation to people?

Sixth context

Statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) after the mention of the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Imam Ali (a.s.):

“Present felicitations to me. Present felicitations to me, because Almighty Allah has chosen me for prophethood and chosen my Ahle Bayt (a.s.) for Imamate”²

This statement clarifies that Imamate is restricted to Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and at the head of it is Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), who was implied at that time.

Also, felicitation ceremonies and congratulations, which continued for three days, as mentioned previously, are not applicable to anything, except Mastership (*Wilayat*) and Caliphate, and it is due to this when Abu Bakr and Umar met Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), they congratulated him and this explains the meaning of Maula in the statement of the Prophet; thus one, who is imbued with the quality of Maula is with relation to people most deserving of them.

Seventh context

Statement of the Prophet after the mention of Mastership (*Wilayat*):

فليبلغ الشاهد الغائب

“Those present here should convey this to those, who are absent.”

This report was mentioned previously.

Can you believe that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) urged people present there to convey it those, who were absent, a message, which was clear to all of them through Quran and Sunnah; that is love and amity among themselves?

And that he would make such elaborate arrangements to deliver this message? I don't think that your opinion would be as such; because you will doubtlessly say:

Definitely, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) had an important issue in mind, to announce which he did not have an opportunity till that moment, and people

¹ *Saheeh Muslim* [5/25, H. 36, Kitab Fazaael Sahaba].

² Hafiz Abu Saeed Kharkoshi Nishapuri, died 407 A.H. has narrated it in his book of *Sharaful Mustafa*.

present in that gathering were not aware of it, and this important issue was not, except Imamate, through which religion was perfected, bounty was complete and pleasure of Almighty Lord achieved.

Those present in that gathering did not conclude anything else from the statement of the Prophet. And no other discourse is narrated from the Prophet in that gathering, so that we can say that His Eminence commanded its propagation. And this important matter cannot be implied unless we understand the term of Maula to mean Awla.

Eighth context

Statement of the Prophet after the mention of Mastership (*Wilayat*) on the basis of the report of Abu Saeed Khudri and Jabir¹ that:

الله اکبر علی اکمال الدین و اتمام النعیم و رضی الرب برسالتی و الولایت
لعلی من بعدي

“Allah is the greatest for the perfection of religion, completion of bounty and pleasure of the Lord on my messengership and Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali after me.”

And in the words of Wahab² it is mentioned:

انه وليكم بعدي

“Indeed, he is your Master (*Wali*) after me.”

And in the words of Ali (a.s.) quoting from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that was mentioned previously:

“After me, he is the Master (*Wali*) of all believers.”

Also Tirmizi, Ahmad, Hakeem, Nasai, Ibne Abi Shaibah, Tabari and many other Huffaz with correct chains of narrators have narrated this statement from the Prophet, that he said³:

“Indeed, Ali is from me and I am from him. He is the Master (*Wali*) of every believer after me.”

It has come in another narration: “He is your Master (*Wali*) after me.”

Abu Nuaim says in *Hilyatul Awliya*⁴ and others⁵ through authentic chains of narrators that the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

¹ Ref: The book of *Maa Nazala minal Quran fee Ali (a.s.)*, Hafiz Abu Nuaim Isfahani, died 430 A.H. [Pg. 56]; *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, died (568 A.H.) 80 [Pg. 135, H. 152].

² Ref: Mojamil Kabeer Tibrani [22/135].

³ Ref: *Sunan Tirmizi* [5/590, H. 3712]; *Musnad Ahmad* [6/489, H. 22503]; *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, [3/144, H. 2652]; *Sunan Kubra* [5/45, H. 8146, Kitabul Manaqib]; *Khasais Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)* [Pg. 109, H. 89]; *Musannaf*, Ibne Abi Shaibah [12/79, H. 12170].

⁴ *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:86.

⁵ *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, [3/139, H. 4642].

“One, who likes to live like me, to die like me and to stay in the Adn Paradise, which Almighty Allah has planted with His own hands, he should love Ali after me and follow the Imams after him, because they are my progeny and created from my essence.”

Indeed, these interpretations inform us that Mastership (*Wilayat*) proved for Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is related to prophethood of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), and is same after observing the difference of the ranks of the two of them in precedence and position, as the term of ‘after me’ implies delay of time as well as lowness of rank.

So, it is not possible that in this case the implication of Maula can be understood in any other sense than superiority in all aspect of the people; because in case of its implication being help and affection, it would distort the meaning of the tradition and instead of it being an honor for Ali (a.s.), it would be a defect [because the meaning of tradition becomes that you love and help him after me, and not while I am alive].

Ninth context

Statement of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) after the announcement of Mastership (*Wilayat*):

اللهم انت شهيد علیهم اني قد بلغت و نصحت

“O Allah, be a witness that I have conveyed Your command and expressed your advice.”

Making God a witness on the people shows it to be a new issue, which he did not announce before. In addition to that all connotations of Maula, like help and love which is general for all Muslims, especially for Ali (a.s.), so there was no need to take testimonies for that. But taking testimonies for it in case of Ali (a.s.) will only be in the instance as we explained before.

Tenth context

Statement of the prophet, before stating the tradition mentioned previously:

“Indeed, Almighty Allah commanded me to convey a message, to do which, I was straitened in heart to convey (which was very difficult for me) and I thought (or I knew) that people will falsify me and Almighty Allah warned me that I should either convey it, or He would chastise me.”

With this, it is also mentioned¹: “Almighty Allah sent me with a message, which I was duty-bound to convey (my chest became straitened and I saw that there was no option, but to convey it) and I understood that people would falsify me, thus Allah warned me that either I should announce it or that He would punish me.”²

¹ Ad-Durre Mansoor, 2:298 [3/116].

² Ref: *Tafseer Mizan*, 10:337; *Miratul Uqul*, 6/199; *Sharh Usul Kafi*, Mulla Salih Mazandarani

Along with it, was mentioned¹: “Indeed, I prayed to God for the fear that I should be a target of ridicule and falsification from hypocrites, so God warned me that either I announce it to the people or He would punish me.”

All these statements inform of an important matter, to announce which the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) feared falsification of hypocrites and he was afraid that they would say: “He is partial to his cousin.” And this proves that it was due to the special position of Ali (a.s.) and not because of love and friendship, which all Muslims shared with Ali (a.s.), and this cannot, but imply “most deserving for mastership”.

Eleventh context

It is the term of ‘nasb’ (appointment); in many traditional reports, the importance of the day of Ghadeer is mentioned as ‘nasb’; for example it is narrated from Umar bin Khattab that:²

نصب رسول الله عليه عليا

“The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) appointed Ali (a.s.) as a sign and guide.”

It is also narrated from Ali (a.s.) that: “Allah commanded the Prophet to appoint me as leader.”

Also, it is narrated from Imam Husain (a.s.) that: “Do you know that on the day of Ghadeer, the Prophet appointed him with Imamate and leadership?”

These statements inform us of the bestowal of a position on that day; that before this, no one was aware of it and this was other than the position of love and friendship about which all the people knew.

In addition to this *Nasb* is used for rulership and transferring mastership, for example they say: “The ruler appointed so and so as ruler of so and so province, but regarding affection, love, support, which is for all members of the society, it cannot be said that he appointed him for all these things.”

In addition to this in many traditional reports the term of *Nasb* is mentioned with the word of Mastership (*Wilayat*), or after that the words of “appointed on the people” or “appointed on the Islamic Ummah” are mentioned.

We conclude from these points that the position bestowed to Ali (a.s.) is the position of absolute rulership on the whole Islamic Ummah, and this is in fact the meaning of Imamate necessarily accompanied with Mastership (*Wilayat*), which is our claim regarding the meaning of Maula.

Twelfth context

It is the statement of Ibne Abbas that after the mention of the tradition he

¹ 7/354.

Faraaezus Simtain [1/312, H. 250]; and Kitab Sulaym bin Qays [2/636. H. 11].

² *Mawaddatul Qurba*, Shahabuddin Hamadani: Mawaddat Five; Shaykh Qunduzi Hanafi: 249 [2/73, Chap. 56].

said:¹ “And your Wilayat, by God, became obligatory on people” and in other words, “By God your Mastership (*Wilayat*) became obligatory on people,” and this shows a new matter, other than what Muslims were knowing from before and that and it was proved for all of them.

Its emphasis through oath, shows its importance and indicates that it is as important as prophethood; since it has become obligatory on all and no one is equal to him in this matter, and this could not anything, except Caliphate, which bestowed His Eminence prominence among people of the society, and it is not other than supremacy (*Uluwwiyat*).

Thirteenth context

It is the statement, which Shaykhul Islam, Hamwaini has narrated from Abu Huraira in *Faraidus Simtain*:² “When the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) returned from the Farewell Hajj, the verse,

يَأَيُّهَا الرَّسُولُ بَلِغْ مَا أُنزِلَ إِلَيْكَ ...

“O Apostle! deliver what has been revealed to you...”³

...was revealed and when he heard the verse:

وَاللَّهُ يَعِصِّمُكَ مِنَ النَّاسِ

“And Allah will protect you from the people...”⁴

His heart was comforted.”

After the mention of the tradition, he says: “And this was the last duty, which God made obligatory on His servants, and when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) announced it:

الْيَوْمَ أَكْمَلْتُ لَكُمُ دِينَكُمْ ...

“This day have I perfected for you your religion...”⁵

...was revealed.”

Now, this statement also shows that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has clarified a duty in this message, which he had not announced previously, and this could not be the matter of ‘love and friendship’ as these were introduced a long time ago through the Quran and Sunnah.

Thus, no other meaning remains, except that of Imamate; that His Eminence, in order to remove difficulties and hurdles, and prepare the public view for

¹ Ref: *Kitabul Wilayah*, Hafiz Sajistani, which he has written especially on the tradition of Ghadeer; *Kashful Ghumma*: 49 [1/324].

² *Faraaezus Simtain* [1/77, H. 44, Chap. 13].

³ Surah Maidah 5:67

⁴ Surah Maidah 5:67

⁵ Surah Maidah 5:3

acceptance of every revelation, delayed its delivery lest as a result of its greatness and importance, rebellious selves refuse to accept it, and this is appropriate only with the meaning of ‘one having discretion’.

Fourteenth context

In the tradition of Zaid bin Arqam, it has come through numerous channels that:¹

“Son-in-law of Zaid bin Arqam asked him about the tradition of Ghadeer and he replied: There are difficulties among you people of Iraq. I said to him: Rest assured from my side, you will not face any danger. At that time he said: We were in Johfa, when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) came out...”

Furthermore, it is narrated from Abdullah bin Alaa² that when Zuhri narrated the tradition of Ghadeer to him, Abdullah said: “Do not narrate this tradition in Shaam, because you will hear that they abuse Ali.” Then he said: “By God, I know such merits of Ali (a.s.) that if I mention them, I would be killed.”

These statements show that the tradition of Ghadeer was having a meaning in view of people, such that its narrator would become involved in retribution, which enmity to successor of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) had bought in Iraq and Shaam, was not safe; and that is why Zaid bin Arqam was wary of his Iraqi son-in-law and exercised precaution; because he was aware of the hypocrisy and split present among the Iraqis during that period and from this aspect, he revealed his secret and narrated the tradition after being assured about the honesty of his son-in-law and absence of conspiracy.

With attention to this point it is not logical that the implication of ‘Maula’ should be the commonly accepted implication of the term that every Muslim was aware of; on the contrary it means that only the Imam can bear this heavy burden and as a result of that he has precedence over others and this is the same meaning of Caliphate of ‘one having discretion’.

Fifteenth context

It is the reasoning of Imam Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the day of Rahba after Caliphate returned to him, for refutation of the claim of usurpers of Caliphate and for acceptance of those present, he reasoned through that tradition. Thus, a meaning, which does not demand precedence – like love and help – how can it prove Caliphate?

Sixteenth context

In the tradition of riders (*rakban*), which was mentioned before:

Some people of Abu Ayyub Ansari greeted Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and said: “Peace be on you O our master (*Maulana*).”

¹ *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:368 [5/494, H. 18793].

² *Usudul Ghaba*, Ibne Asir 1:308 [1/364, No, 812].

The Imam asked: "How am I your master, while you are Arabs?"

They replied: "We heard the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) say: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master."

Now, the question of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in this surprised manner cannot be for the meaning of lover and helper, because in social life, the Arabs did not dislike the custom of help and love. On the contrary the Arabs understood more important meaning and it cannot be anything other than precedence and this is the absolute Wilayat and Imamate. Under this implication they replied to the Imam and reasoned through the tradition of Ghadeer.

Seventeenth context

It was mentioned before that Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) cursed those, who refused to testify for the tradition of Ghadeer on the day of his protest in Rahba and Rakban and they became afflicted with blindness, leprosy and apostasy¹ and other calamities and these were those, who were present in the gathering on the day of Ghadeer (but they denied it).

Now is there any researcher, who thinks that it is possible that the Imam would have cursed them with such intensity only for concealing the matter of love and help, which prevailed among all people of the community in general?

If it were as such, there were many Muslims, who harbored malice towards each other, they attacked and fought each other; completely disregarded love, regard and mutual support – what to say about the concealing of those two qualities among themselves – all of them should have been affected by the curse.

While we see that such a thing did not happen. On the contrary, there were only a few individuals, who were branded by this chastisement forever, and who became targets of the curse of Imam (a.s.), and it was not, except for concealing that great truth from the specialties of this great Maula – peace be on him. And it was nothing other than Imamate and precedence over others according to numerous contexts.

The matter after that: concealment of testimony by those people was not for an ordinary issue, in which Ali (a.s.) and others are equal; on the contrary it was definitely about an excellence of Ali (a.s.), which is only for His Eminence and they did not like that the Imam should be bestowed with it and that it should be accorded importance; that is why they denied it; but cursing of the Imam exposed them and made the truth clear and its disgrace remained visible on their face,

¹ [Taarab baad az Hijrat: on the basis of what is concluded from traditional reports and statement of jurists, it implies that after gaining divine recognition and belief, a person reverts to infidelity. In the tradition of Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) 'Taarab baad az Hijrat' is interpreted as abandoning the Wilayat of the Holy Imams (a.s.) after gaining their recognition. Ref: *Wasailush Shia*, Published Aalal Bayt 15/100; *Misbahul Minhaj*, Sayyid Muhammad Saeed Hakeem: 267/268; *Kalimatut Taqwa*, Shaykh Muhammad Amin Zainuddin 1/586; *Ar-Rawashe as-Samawiya fee Sharhul Ahadithul Imamiyah*, Muhaqqiq Damad/142; *Firhang Fiqh Farsi*, 2/528].

sides and eyes as long as they lived; and after their death till the Almighty will inherit the earth and whatever is in it, this report is recorded in all books and narrated by people from mouth to mouth.

Eighteenth context

Hafiz Ibne Samman has narrated from Umar¹ that two disputing Bedouins came to him and he asked Ali (a.s.) to judge between them. One of them asked: "Would this man judge between us?"

Umar came to him, caught his neck and said: "Woe on you, do you know who he is? He is the master of me and all the believers and one, who does not regard him as the master is not a believer."

Also, a person disputed with Umar. He gestured to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) and said: "This man seated here will judge between you and me."

That man asked: "This man with a huge belly?"

Umar arose, caught his neck and lifted him saying: "Do you know whom you have insulted? He is the master of me and all the Muslims."

The mastership of Ali (a.s.) that Umar confessed for himself and all the people just as he had confessed to it on the day of Ghadeer; and he negated the faith of one, who did not regard him as Maula, whether mastership is in the meaning of regarding discretionary superiority or in the meaning of love and help – it is not relevant, except in proving the Caliphate of His Eminence [and if Caliphate is not proved for Ali (a.s.), the confession of Umar for mastership of His Eminence will be incoherent] because love and friendship is customary and common between all Muslims is not to the limit that without it faith will be destroyed.

Since inspite of malice and hatred between the companions of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and companions of companions which in some instances was to the limit of abusing each other and accusing each other and fighting and bloodshed; is it possible to confess to such statement? And so much so that some of these instances and issues occurred in the presence of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), inspite of that His Eminence did not negate their faith and none of those, who believe in the justice of companions, has doubted their justice as a result of such differences.

On the basis of this, no meaning except that of Mastership (*Wilayat*) remains, and Mastership (*Wilayat*) in this meaning is also like Imamate, which is a necessary condition of absolute discretion. And it does not contradict what Umar hints at the tradition of Ghadeer in these words. Thus, the report of Hafiz Mohibuddin Tabari conveys the same and it should be regarded as such from all aspects.

¹ Ref: *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:170 [3/115]; *Zakhaerul Uqbah*, Mohibuddin Tabari: 68; *As-Sawaiq*: 107 [179].

هَذَا بَيَانٌ لِلنَّاسِ وَهُدًىٰ وَمُوَعِظَةٌ لِلْمُتَّقِينَ ^{١٣٧}

“This is a clear statement for men, and a guidance and an admonition to those who guard (against evil).”¹

¹ Surah Aale Imran 3:138

Traditions which mention the meaning of Master (Maula) and Mastership (Wilayat)

Most of the contexts mentioned above are interpretation of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) from his statements and after that are the statements of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) which are similar.

Ali bin Hamid Qarshi says in *Shamsul Akhbar*¹ quoting from the *Salwatul Aarifeen*, written by Muafiqbillah Husain bin Ismail Jurjani, father of Murshadbillah – from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that when the Prophet was asked about the meaning of:

من كنت مولاه فعليه مولا

“Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master,” he said:

“God is my Master and has more discretion on me than I have on myself and without Him, I am nothing. And I am the master of believers and I have more discretion over them than they have on themselves; without me they are nothing; and whoever’s master I am and I have more discretion over him than he has on himself, Ali is also his master and is having more discretion on him than he has on himself and without Ali (a.s.), he is nothing.”

Abdullah bin Ja’far while arguing against Muawiyah said:² “O Muawiyah, when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was on the pulpit and I, Umar bin Abu Salma, Usamah bin Zaid, Saad bin Abi Waqqas, Salman Farsi, Abu Zar, Miqdad, Zubair bin Awwam were in front on him, we heard him say:

‘Am I not more deserving with relation to believers?’

We said: ‘Yes, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)’

He asked: ‘Are my wives not your mothers?’

We replied: ‘Yes, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)’

He said: ‘Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. And he is more deserving of them,’

And he tapped the shoulder of Ali (a.s.) and said: ‘O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. O people, I have more discretion on the people than they have on themselves and in my presence they are nothing; and after me Ali (a.s.) is having more discretion on the people than they have on themselves and without him they are nothing.’”

Then Abdullah said: “In Ghadeer and in other places, our Prophet appointed one, who was the best, most deserving and most superior of people, and he

¹ *Musnad Shamsul Akhbar*: 38 [1/102, Chap. 7, quoting from *Anwaar* and *Amali* of Moyyad].
² Ref: *Kitab Sulaym bin Qays* [2/834, H. 42].

appointed him as the Divine Proof on them; and commanded them to obey him; and informed that Ali was in relation to him as Harun was to Moosa and that after him, Ali was the Master (*Wali*) of all believers, whosever's master the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is, Ali is also having absolute discretion on him and he is the Caliph and successor of the Prophet.”

It is mentioned in the traditional report of Shaykhul Islam Hamwaini that during period of Uthman, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) voiced a protest as follows:

“Then the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) delivered a sermon, and said: ‘O people, do you know that Allah, the Mighty and Sublime is my master and I am the master of believers and I have more discretion on them than they have on themselves.’

They replied, ‘Yes, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).’

He said: ‘O Ali, stand up.’

And I stood up. Then he said: ‘Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.’

At that moment Salman arose and asked: ‘O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), what kind of Mastership (*Wilayat*)?’

He replied: ‘A Mastership (*Wilayat*) like my Mastership. All on whom I am having precedence, Ali (a.s.) is also having precedence.’”

After the mention of the tradition of Ghadeer, Imam Hafiz Wahidi says:

“The Mastership (*Wilayat*), which the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) declared would be asked about on Judgment Day and in the interpretation of the verse:

وَقُفُّهُمْ إِنَّهُمْ مَسْؤُلُونَ ﴿٣﴾

“And stop them, for they shall be questioned:”¹

It is mentioned in a traditional report that the interrogation shall be about the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali (a.s.). In such a way that they would be asked whether according to recommendation of Prophet, they observed the right of Mastership (*Wilayat*) or trespassed and abandoned it, as in that case they would be interrogated and they will have to accept its retribution.²

Previously, it was narrated from Umar bin Khattab that he said: “One whose master (*Maula*) Ali is not, isn't a believer.”

Alusi in his *Tafseer*³, under the interpretation of the verse:

وَقُفُّهُمْ إِنَّهُمْ مَسْؤُلُونَ ﴿٣﴾

¹ Surah Saffat 37:24

² Ref: *Faraaezus Simtain*, Hamwaini [1/79, H. 47]; *Nazm Durarus Simtain*, Jamaluddin Zarandi [Pg. 109]; *As-Sawaiqul Mohriqa* 89 [Pg. 149].

³ *Ruhul Maani*, 23:74 [23/80].

“And stop them, for they shall be questioned:”¹

After the mention of statements, says:

“The best statement is that they would be asked about the beliefs and deeds and the chief of them being: There is no god, except Allah and the most important and greatest of them being the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali Karramallah Wajha.”

I don't think that your liberated conscience would dictate something other than the meaning of Caliphate and absolute discretion, and in that condition he regarded it to be a principle of faith and deemed it to be an article of belief and connected it to the correctness of deeds.

وَهُذَا صِرَاطُ رَبِّكَ مُسْتَقِيمًا قَدْ فَصَّلْنَا الْآيَتِ لِقَوْمٍ يَّدْكُونَ^{١٣}

“And this is the path of your Lord, (a) right (path); indeed We have made the communications clear for a people who mind.”²

¹ Surah Saffat 37:24
² Surah Anaam 6:126

Clear explanation regarding the meaning of the tradition

The factor, which impelled us to undertake this discussion is that some people¹ from those, who truly confessed to the meaning of the tradition because they found that meaning as clear as the light of the brilliant sun – or those, who, in its meaning, have concurred or have consensus,² have ignored that the requirement of its meaning is it should be Caliphate without any gap

Because if it is accepted that the Caliphate of Prophet is proved for Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), it would necessitate that it not be separated, but that immediate Caliphate will also be accepted as in case of appointment of the crown prince by the king, and successor by the deceased, and taking witness on it is also as such.

Whether the people in the gathering or others definitely think that rulership is for the first person and bequest for the second person, a long time after the death of the king or the bequest maker? Or after the appointment of Caliphate or successorship through a second group of individuals, whose name was not mentioned at the time of the pledge of Wilayat or mention of the will?!

Whether, inspite of this clarification from the king or the will maker, it is

¹ Like Abu Shakoos Muhammad bin Abdus Saeed bin Muhammad Kashshi in *At-Tamhid* see *Bayaanat Tauheed*, Pg. 167; He says: Shia say: Imamate is proved from Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) through the express declaration of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) according to proof: First argument: That the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) appointed him as his successor and Caliph after him and said: Are you not pleased that you are to me as Harun was to Moosa, except that there is no prophet after me? Since Harun was the Caliph of Moosa (a.s.), on the basis of this Ali will also be the Caliph of Prophet.

Second argument: When the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) halted at Ghadeer Khum on his return journey from Mecca, he declared the Wilayat of Ali. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ordered a pulpit to be constructed from camel saddles; then he mounted it and said: Am I not having more discretion on the believers than they have on themselves? All said: Yes. The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. And help those, who help him and degrade those, who insult him. And the following statement of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime was revealed regarding Ali (r.a.): ***“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”*** (*Surah Maidah 5:55*) and it proves that Ali (r.a.) is the most deserving after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Then Abu Shakoos replies to this saying: As for the fact that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) appointed him as Wali, its reply is that the implication of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was his Caliphate after Uthman and during the time of Muawiyah as we have also accepted. And reply to the verse of ***“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe...”*** is also the same; on the basis of this we say: Ali is the Wali and Amir, but during his own period; that is after the Caliphate of Uthman and not before that.

² Ref: *Sharh Mawaqif*, 3:271 [8/361]; *Al-Maqasid*: 290 [5/273]; *As-Sawaiq*: 26 [Pg. 43]; *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:303 [3/274].

logical that another one is selected and they entrust this responsibility to him; as in case of one, who did not leave any heir-apparent or did not specify a successor; is the custom in such cases.

God knows that it is not so and none will do this, except one away from logic and out of the ambit of truth.

Is there no one, who would stand before the selectors and ask: If the king had someone other than the heir-apparent in mind, then why he did not specify and clarify about him?!

Where are those people so that they may face those whose statements were mentioned above? Those who say: The Mastership (*Wilayat*) proved for our master on the day of Ghadeer, was realized for His Eminence during the period of his apparent Caliphate after Uthman!

Was the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) not knowing persons superior to his cousin and was aware of their status and was uninformed about the extent of their experience and practice?!

Then why inspite of concern for death, he only specified Ali (a.s.) and ordered people to pay allegiance to him and that those, who are present, should convey it to those absent¹. If he approved a share for them in Caliphate and rulership for them why did he not announce it at its time? Is not Caliphate the most important obligation of religion and the most important principle of religion?

It is natural that viewpoints in these matters, [Caliphate and successorship] would be different – as it was different – and how often instead of debate and argument, obstinacy and instead of discussion and logic, battle would take place; then by what motive and justification did the Prophet of mercy left his Ummah to its own devices in the most important principle of religion?

Although the Prophet of mercy and kindness did not do this, but it is good expectation of Ahle Sunnat from the past people, office bearers of Caliphate and its usurpers from its owner on the pretext of young age and loyalty to sons of Abdul Muttalib², was the cause that they made the meaning of traditional report to justify the vessel of sham Caliphate and make distortions.

But our certainty about the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) compels us to say that His Eminence did not omit his religious obligation; of issuing a clear and sufficient announcement, which would fulfill the need of Ummah.

May Allah guide us on the straight path.

¹ These three statements can found in many traditions mentioned above.

² In *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed 2:20 [6/50 Sermon 66; 82/12, Sermon 223] it is mentioned: Umar said: O Ibne Abbas, know that by God, this one (Ali) after the Holy Prophet (s) is most eligible for the matter of Caliphate, except that we feared two things...that he is young and his partiality to the sons of Abdul Muttalib.

Worship acts on Ghadeer Day

Since the day of Ghadeer is the day on which Almighty Allah perfected religion and completed the bounty; because He selected our Master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) for Imamate and appointed him as the standard of guidance, so that he may save them from the falling into the ravine of destruction and from deviation, that is why day of proclamation of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) was a day when wide divine mercy was spread out.

You will not find a day greater than the day of Ghadeer. A branch having a sacred root, to grant firmness to the bases of that divine call.

It is obligatory on every person in the religious society to, in order to give thanks to this bounty, and to seek proximity to Allah, the Mighty and the High, take steps through every lawful mean, for performance of prayer, fast, doing a good turn, kindness to relatives, having feasts and celebrations appropriate to that day.

Rituals for Ghadeer Day

Report of fasting on the day of Ghadeer

Hafiz Abu Bakr Khatib Baghdadi (d. 463 A.H.), in the book of his *Tarikh*¹, has narrated from Abu Huraira that whoever fasts on the 18th of Zilhajj, reward of fasting for sixty months will be recorded for him and that is the day of Ghadeer, the day when the Prophet raised the hand of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) and said: "Am I not the guardian of the believers?"

All said: "Why not, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)?"

He said: "Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master."

At this point, Umar said: "Congratulations, O son of Abu Talib, this day you have become my master and the master of all believing men and women."

After that Almighty Allah revealed the verse of:

الْيَوْمَ أَكَلَمُ لَكُمْ دِينَكُمْ ...

"This day have I perfected for you your religion..."²

One, who fasts on the twenty-seventh Rajab, the reward of fasting for sixty months will be recorded for him and the twenty-seventh Rajab is the day when Jibreel came to Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) and declared his prophethood.

Also: All narrators of this tradition are reliable and their reliability is

¹ Tareekh Baghdad, 8:290.

² Surah Maidah 5:3

absolutely clear that no kind of doubt remains, because in books of narrators of traditions they are mentioned as reliable.

In his *Tarikh*,¹ Ibne Kathir has denied this tradition and supported his stance through doubts saying: “In this traditional report the fast of the day of Ghadeer is mentioned to carry the reward of fasting for sixty months; and if it were true, it would necessitate that a recommended thing would become more meritorious than an obligatory thing, because regarding fasting on the days of the month of Ramadhan is mentioned to be equal to fasting for ten months; thus this traditional report is invalid and unacceptable.”

As for the rejection of this imaginative opinion: This objection is replied through text as well as logic:

As for the contraventional (Naqzi) reply

There are a large numbers of traditions, which refute this statement, but to mention all of them here is not possible², therefore some are presented below:

1 – Tradition: One, who fasts during the month of Ramadhan and joins them with the fasts of the six days of the month of Shawwal, it is as if he has fasted for all the days of the year.

Muslim in his *Saheeh* and Abu Dawood in his *Sunan*³ have narrated this tradition through multiple channels.

2 – The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) commanded fasting on the days of *Bayz*⁴ - 13, 14 and 15 Rajab – and said that it is equal to fasting the whole life⁵.

Ibne Majah and Darami have mentioned this traditional report in their *Sunans*⁶.

3 – Fasting three days in every month is equal to fasting and breaking the fast of all days. Ahmad has narrated this tradition in his *Musnad*.⁷

4 – Fast of the day of Arafah is equal to fasting for a thousand days as is mentioned in *Jamius Saghir*⁸ this traditional reports is narrated by Ibne Habban

¹ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 5:214 [5/133, Events of the year 10 A.H.].

² Ref: *Nuzhatul Majalis*, 1: 151-158; and 167-176.

³ *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:323 [2/524, H. 204, Kitabus Siyam]; *Sunan Abu Dawood*, 1:381 [2/324, H. 2433].

⁴ These three days are called *Ayyam Bayz*, because due to the maximum size of the moon during these nights, the nights are illuminated to the maximum. Ref: *Muntahaul Matlab*, Old edition 2/609.

⁵ Fasting for three days every month is equal to fasting the whole life, because Almighty Allah says in Quran: “**Whoever brings a good deed, he shall have ten like it**” (*Surah Anam 6:160*); thus one who fasts for three day of a month earns reward of fasting for the whole month, and if he repeats this act every month, it is as if he has fasted on all the days of his life. Ref: *Muntahaul Matlab*, Old edition 2/609; *Saheeh Muslim*, 3:163; *Nafsur Rahman fee Fazaal Salman*, Muhaddith Nuri: 369.

⁶ *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 1:522 [1/544, H. 1707]; *Sunan Darami*, 2:19.

⁷ *Musnad Ahmad*, 5:34 [3/13, H. 19858].

⁸ *Jamius Saghir*, 2:78 [2/111. H. 5119].

from Ayesha.

5 – It is mentioned in Taurat: “One, who fasts on the day of Ashura it is as if he has fasted on all days.” Safoori has mentioned this traditional report in the book of *Nuzha*¹.

As for the solutional (Halli) reply

I have not found a definite rule worthy of reasoning that definitely the reward of obligatory acts is more than the reward of recommended acts; on the contrary traditions like those mentioned above, hint at the opposite. And traditional reports regarding all recommended acts also emphasize this.

Moreover, divine rewards are given as per the nature of the acts and not between the obligatory and recommended acts, which are performed as per necessity. From this aspect it is possible that a recommended act is having a quality that would earn more reward.

It should also be mentioned that: The acts depend on faith of the doer; and the point in which there is no doubt is that doing or omitting an act is beyond specified duties, like recommended acts and detestable acts, proves reasoning for obedience and humility before the Maula and affection for him is more important than performance of obligatory acts and leaving of prohibited acts, and perfect faith is obtained through this, and as a result the servant always seeks divine proximity so that he may become the beloved of the Master, as is mentioned in the traditional reports of Bukhari in his *Saheeh*² narrated through Abu Huraira that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

Allah, the Mighty and Sublime says: “The servant seeks proximity to Me always so that he may become My loved one and when he becomes My loved one, I will become his ears through which he hears, and I will become his eyes, through which he sees and I will become his strong hands through which he may perform his acts, and I will become his legs through which he walks.”

On the contrary, it can be said: In principle of justice there is no proof that except for present bounties, like bounty of life, intellect and health, and obtaining needs of life and backgrounds of acts and relief from the fire of Hell, there is proof of another reward for performance of obligatory acts and leaving prohibited things; on the contrary all righteous acts of the servant as compared to these indescribable bounties, are very small. Thus, on this point nothing, but grace can be seen.

This fact can be verified from a large number of verses like:

إِنَّ الْمُتَّقِينَ فِي مَقَامٍ أَمِينٍ ۖ فِي جَنَّتٍ وَّعُيُونٍ ۗ يَلْبَسُونَ مِنْ سُنْدُنٍ
وَإِسْتَبْرَقٍ مُّتَقْبِلِينَ ۗ كَذَلِكَ وَزَوَّجَنُهُمْ بِحُورٍ عَيْنٍ ۗ يَدْعُونَ فِيهَا بِكُلِّ

¹ Nuzhatul Majalis wa Muntakhabun Nafais, 1:174.

² *Saheeh Bukhari*, 9:214 [5/2384, H. 6137].

فَاكِهَةٌ أَمِينِينَ ۝ لَا يَنْدُوْقُونَ فِيهَا الْمَوْتَ إِلَّا الْمَوْتَةَ الْأُولَىٰ ۚ وَوَقْفُهُمْ
عَذَابَ الْجَحِيْمِ ۝ فَضْلًا مِّنْ رَبِّكَ ۖ ذَلِكَ هُوَ الْفَوْزُ الْعَظِيْمُ ۝

“Surely those who guard (against evil) are in a secure place, in gardens and springs; they shall wear of fine and thick silk, (sitting) face to face; thus (shall it be), and We will wed them with Houris pure, beautiful ones. they shall call therein for every fruit in security; they shall not taste therein death except the first death, and He will save them from the punishment of the hell, a grace from your Lord; this is the great achievement.”¹

Thus, all these bounties and rewards, are not, but favors of Allah, the Mighty and the High.

Fakhere Raazi says in his *Tafseer*:²

“Our scholars have proved through this verses that Almighty Allah bestows divine rewards through His grace and not because of the eligibility of man, because when Allah lists types of rewards of the pious, He says that all of them are bestowed from the aspect of favor and mercy and then He says:

ذَلِكَ هُوَ الْفَوْزُ الْعَظِيْمُ ۝

“This is the great achievement.”³”

Also, our scholars have concluded from this verse that the value of divine favor is much more than what a person becomes eligible for, because:

Firstly

Allah says that this bestowal of divine reward is a favor and grace on the servant.

Secondly

He describes this favor and grace as a great success.

Another proof is that when a great king pays remuneration to a person and gifts a robe of honor to another, the value of this robe is much more than that remuneration.

Ibne Kathir himself says in the interpretation of the verse:⁴

It is narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in authentic traditional report:

“Work and strive hard, and know that no one will enter Paradise by virtue of his deeds.”

¹ Surah Dukhan 44:51-57

² *Tafseer Kabeer*, 7:459 [27/254].

³ Surah Dukhan 44:57

⁴ *Tafseer Ibne Kaseer*, 4:147.

They asked, “Not even you, O Messenger of Allah?”

He replied: “Not even me, unless Allah showers me with His mercy and grace.”

It is possible to conclude this point from the traditional report, which Bukhari has mentioned in his *Saheeh*:¹ “The right of God on people is that He should be worshipped and He should not be ascribed partners. And the right of servants on God is that He should not chastise one, who does not ascribe partners to Him.”

You are aware that this much right of the servant on God is same as perfect sense proves; but before this will not be for favor and divine blessings. And also you are witness on rulers, who perform their duties, but do not get their compensation.

In that case they are content to believe that extraordinary service and more than duties should be performed and no one can regard this as pursuit of wealth. This is the rule between master and slave, and this is from progressive and proved rules of all human beings, but Almighty Allah grants rewards from the aspect of creatures.

In the end, we are reminded: Ritual prayers are narrated for Ghadeer day, on which Abu Nasr Ayyashi and Sabuni Misri have written special books. For awareness of special features of these prayer and supplications recorded for the Day of Ghadeer, refer to the concerned books.²

وَهُنَّا كِتَابٌ آتَنَا لَنَا مُبِرٌّكٌ فَاتَّبِعُوهُ وَاتَّقُوا الْعَلَكُمْ تُرْكَمُونَ ﴿٦﴾

“And this is a Book We have revealed, blessed; therefore follow it and guard (against evil) that mercy may be shown to you.”³

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 4:264 [3/1049, H. 2701].

² [Ref: *Behaarul Anwaar*, 95/298, Chapter of the rituals of the Day of Ghadeer and its night and their supplications; and 98/359].

³ Surah Anaam 6:155

Poetry and poets

In our view, the couplets of our righteous predecessors are not mere words which come in form of poetry, and they are not absolute terms brought into a poetic form, on the contrary our belief is that from one side they comprise very lofty issues of divine recognition taken from Quran and Sunnah; and lessons from philosophy, religious teachings, history, good advices and morals, in addition to literary arts and fields of language and sources of history, which are mentioned in them.

That is why, couplets having these dimensions, are objectives of intellectuals, aims of philosophers, need of scholars of ethics, and desires of littérateurs and hope of historians; on the contrary you can say that it is the desire of all human societies.

Religious poetry has other aims, which is the most important point present in the poetry of classical poets; which comprise of: proving the veracity of religion and calling towards truth, spreading excellence of holy progeny, propagating the spirituality of the purified progeny in society, and the sweet message reaches to everyone. In royal gatherings, it is the poetical compositions, which embellish the surroundings.

These verses promote Aale Muhammad (a.s.) among people. Eloquent speeches and verses cannot compete with it. in the same way powers of neither the pen nor the sword cannot reach upto it. In religious propagation, it is the good verses, which perform the function of creating a nice atmosphere.

The Maimiya Qasida of Farazdaq, Hashimiyat of Kumayt, Ainia of Himyari, Taiya of Dibil or Mamiya of Abu Nuwas grants spirituality to the hearers.

In this book, we would mention senior personalities of Shia faith, who during the first century, were prominent poets of Islamic dominions. Through that they were able to strike at the hearts of the enemies.

They propagated the Wilayat of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) in all lands. The Holy Imams (a.s.) granted their wealth to them and spent so much that they became needless of earning their living and dedicated all their capacities for poetry writings.

The Imams encouraged the poets to pen poems in their praise and rewarded them with glad tidings. For example a tradition says:

One, who composes couplets for us, Ahle Bayt (a.s.), the Almighty Allah builds a castle for him in Paradise. They insisted on people to undertake such compositions and make one another aware of them.

For example, Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) said:

“Teach your children couplets of Abdi.”

He also said: “One, who composes verses about us, is helped by Ruhul Quds.”¹

It is mentioned in *Rijal Kishi* that Abu Qummi said:

“I recited some verses in the presence of Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) containing praises for his respected father. Then I asked the Imam if I could recite regarding His Eminence. The Imam separated the part of couplets written by me and wrote on the top:

“Well done, may God give you a good reward.”

It is mentioned another traditional report that: I sought permission from the Imam to recite an elegy for his father.

He said: All right, you may recite Marsiya for my father as well as for me.”²

¹ *Uyun Akhbar Reza* [1/15]; *Rijal Kishi*: 254 [2/704, No. 748].
² *Rijal Kishi*: 160 [2/838, No. 1074 and 1075].

Poetry and poets in Quran and Sunnah

That which we mentioned about the attention of the Holy Imams (a.s.) to the poets, is supported by their chief, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.); because His Eminence was the first of those, who showered praise on the verses of poets regarding him and his honorable family.

The Prophet himself recited couplets and urged others to do the same. He rewarded and recompensed them and also expressed joy at that. And when he noticed this singular aim in the poetry of a poet, he accorded respect and honor to him; like his pleasure and satisfaction at the couplets of his uncle, Shaykhul Abtah, Abu Talib peace be on him, when His Eminence prayed for rain and it rained; he said:

“For the sake of Allah are the good acts of Abu Talib, if he were alive, he would have been pleased. Which of you can recite his couplets?”

Umar bin Khattab stood up and said: “Your implication is as follows:

‘No camel has ever carried anyone better than Muhammad (s.a.w.a.).’

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: “This is not the couplet of Abu Talib; it was composed by Hassan bin Thabit.”

Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) stood up and said: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), it seems that you imply the following couplets:

‘And a white-faced one, with whose face it is prayed,
So that the clouds bring goodness.

He is the shelter of the orphans and guardian of widows.’”

“Yes,” said the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Also, the expression of pleasure by the Prophet at the couplet of his uncle, Abbas bin Abdul Muttalib, who said: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) I wish to praise you.” The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: “Recite, may Allah never tire your mouth.” Then he recited couplets.¹

Like the expression of joy from the poem of Hassan bin Thabit on the day of Ghadeer Khum and the supplication of Prophet for him:

“O Hassan, as long as you support us through your tongue, you will continue to be helped by Ruhul Quds.”

The Prophet arranged a pulpit for Hassan in the Masjid and he ascended it and recited couplets in praise of the Prophet and the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: “O Allah, as long Hassan continues to support the Messenger of Allah

¹ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:327 [3/369, H. 5417].

(s.a.w.a.) and recites poems for him, help him through Ruhul Quds.”¹

The Prophet always encouraged poets in this regard and commanded that their poems should be memorized, and also encouraged them to compose poems ridiculing the enemies; as the Holy Quran has encouraged this and regarded it to be support of Islam and Jihad for defending the upright religion.

He described the Jihad of the poet and clarified about it saying: Satirize the enemy through poetry and expose his defect; because a believer fights Jihad through his life and property. By the one in whose hand is the life of Muhammad, (through this act) it is as if you have made them target of your arrows.²

He also motivated poets to cast arrows and drawn swords of poetry and verses, to march forward in confrontations and created in them an eagerness to confront idolaters as their statements were in fact ridicule of divine source of the statements of the Prophet.

The Prophet spread the spirit of religious fervor and strengthened divine fervor and modesty against ignorant prejudice and created among them a freshness of spirit and an eagerness to defend the base of Islam and created in them inclination for composing verses through his statements.

So he addressed the poets, saying: “Ridicule the polytheists through your couplets, because as long as you ridicule them, Ruhul Quds would support you.”³

And: “Ridicule them through your couplets as Jibraeel is with you.”⁴

And the verse:

إِلَّا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ وَذَكَرُوا اللَّهَ كَثِيرًا وَأَنْتَصَرُوا مِنْ بَعْدِ مَا
ظُلِّمُوا

“Except those who believe and do good and remember Allah much, and defend themselves after they are oppressed.”⁵

Also, he commented about this group of poets and they are clearly excepted from the poets mentioned in the following verse:

وَالشِّعْرَ آئُتَيَّتَ بِهِمُ الْغَاؤَنَ ﴿٣﴾

“And as to the poets, those who go astray follow them.”⁶

When this verse was revealed, some poets came weeping to the Prophet and

¹ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:477 [3/554, H. 6058]. He and Zahabi in his *Talkhis* have supported the authenticity of this tradition.

² *Musnad Ahmad*, 3:460 and 456; 6:387 [4/498, H. 15369; Pg. 492, H. 15359; 7/533, H. 26633].

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:298 [5/383, H. 18168]; *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:487 [3/555, H. 6062].

⁴ *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:299 and 302 and 303 [5/384, H. 18176; Pg. 389, H. 18214; Pg. 391, H. 391, H. 18222].

⁵ Surah Shoara 26:227

⁶ Surah Shoara 26:224

said:

“We are poets and Almighty Allah has revealed this verse for us.”

At that time the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) recited this verse and said:

إِلَّا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ

“Except those who believe and do good.”¹

You are these.

وَذَكِّرُوا اللَّهَ كَثِيرًا

“And remember Allah much.”²

...you are them

وَأَنْتَصِرُ وَأَمِنْ بَعْدِ مَا ظَلِمْتُمْ

“And defend themselves after they are oppressed.”³

...you are them. That is you are the implication of this verse.

In *Tafseer Ayyashi*,⁴ it is narrated from Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) that it implies ignorant poets, who preached things and expressed views without having knowledge and in this way they are deviated and they misguide others.

On the basis of this, the verse does not completely render poetry valueless, on the contrary poetry comprising of invalid issues and nonsense is degraded. And through Shia and Ahle Sunnat channels, it is narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that:

“Some are couplets of wisdom and some are accounts of sorcery.”⁵

¹ Surah Shoara 26:227

² Surah Shoara 26:227

³ Surah Shoara 26:227; *Tafseer Ibne Kaseer*, 3:354.

⁴ Ref: Majmaul Bayan Tabarsi [7/325].

⁵ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:269 and 273 and 303 and 332 [1/444, H. 2420, Pg. 451, H. 2469, Pg. 498, H. 2756, Pg. 546, H. 3059], *Sunan Darimi*, 2:296, *Saheeh Bukhari* [5/2176, H. 5434] Book of Medicine, Chapter of what is narrated about magic.

Announcers of couplets

Some verses of the unseen are also mentioned, which are full of religious propagation. Human beings are addressed in them, but the reciter is unseen. All these are miracles of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). This shows the greatness of poetry that how truth compelled the opponents to surrender. Regarding controlling the hearts, as compared to prose, poetry is more effective.

1. During the birth of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), Amina binte Wahab heard an announcer recite:

“Almighty God and righteous servants, upon the illuminated lamp of guidance, chosen human being, best of the creatures, pure Muhammad, illuminated sign, ornament of people, the chosen one, standard of guidance, truthful, righteous, pious, well wisher, recite salutations. And also till the spring breeze blows and the pigeons through their cooing or the leaves of the trees speak, the Almighty Allah sends blessings upon him.”¹

2. Waraqah says: “On the night of the birth of the Prophet, I was asleep besides an idol, when I heard the voice of a caller from inside it, saying:

‘The Prophet has taken birth and the kings are degraded; misguidance is removed and polytheism became perplexed.’ Then that idol toppled.”²

3. Hafiz Kanji has reported in the book of *Kifaya*³ that: When Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) was born in the Kaaba, Abu Talib said:

“O Lord of the dark night and this illuminated moon has appeared, from your concealed command make it clear for us that what should I name him?”

Kanji says: “He heard the name of a caller saying:

‘O Ahle Bayt of the chosen Prophet, you are blessed with a pure child. His name from the lofty divine position is Ali, which is derived from the name of the Most High.’”⁴

Then he said: “Only Muslim bin Khalid Zanji, who is a Shafei Shaykh, has quoted this couplet.”

4. Shablanji has mentioned in *Nurul Absar*⁴: Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) visited the grave of Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) every day. One day he threw himself on the grave and recited:

“What has happened to me that I pass over the graves, while I greet on the grave of my beloved, but I do not hear any response. O grave, what has happened

¹ *Behaarul Anwaar*, 6:73 [15/325].

² *Khasaisul Kubra*, 1:52 [89/1].

³ *Kifayatut Talib*, 261 [Pg. 406].

⁴ *Nurul Absar*, 47 [Pg. 98].

that you do not reply to the caller? After separating from me have you got weary of the friendship of the friends?"

An unseen caller replied:

The beloved says: "How can I reply when I am a prisoner of stones and mud. My embellishments and decorations are smeared in dust; that is why I have forgotten you and a distance has come between me and family and friends. My salutations upon you as between me and you the connection of friendship is cut off."

5. Ibne Asakir, in his *Tarikh*,¹ and Kanji in *Kifaya*,² have narrated from Umme Salma that she heard on the eve of the martyrdom of Imam Husain (a.s.) that someone intoned:

"O one, who from the aspect of ignorance, martyred Imam Husain (a.s.). 'Glad tidings' for you of divine chastisement and edifying anguish. All dwellers of the heavens from prophets and messengers and followers and their companions recite curses upon you. Indeed, you are cursed through the tongue of Dawood, Moosa and Isa (a.s.), who brought the Injeel."³

¹ *Tareekh Madinatul Damishq*, 4:341 [5/82]; and in the biography of Imam Husain (a.s.), researched edition, No. 335.

² *Kifayatul Talib* [Pg. 443].

³ Ibne Hajar [In *Sawaaiqul Mohriqa*: 193] has mentioned two couplets of this type, and also our Shaykh Ibne Quluwayh (d. 367,368) in *Kamiluz Ziyaraat*: 30 [Pg. 97. Chapter 29] has narrated it.

Association of poets

By the blessings of Quran and Sunnah, companions having taste of poetry gathered from different areas in the presence of the Prophet and recited panegyrics and in the same way, they cut off the foundations of polytheism and deviation. And like hunting falcons, they hunted down the hearts and ears.

These associations gathered around His Eminence during journeys as well as when he was in Medina. They were like a hundred members of battalion armed with drawn swords of couplets and casting arrows of poems in defense of the realm of Islam. They debated and performed Jihad on the path of God, through their tongues. They were persons like Abbas, uncle of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), Kaab bin Malik, Abdullah bin Rawaha, Hassan bin Thabit, Nabigha Joadi, Zirar Asadi, Zirar Qarashi, Kaab bin Zubair, etc.

These religious spirits controlled the hearts of the members of the society and dominated the nerves, skin and the soul and were merged with spirit and nature of people. So much so that it dominated the selves of Muslims of that time and in religious matters, also, they showed modesty and defended it.

In spite of the fact that they were ladies behind veil, but through novel poetry, innovation and beautiful couplets themselves defended the Prophet. For example:

1. Ummul Momineen – Malika – Her Eminence, Lady Khadijatul Kubra (s.a.), daughter of Khuwailad, honorable wife of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). She composed extremely beautiful couplets. Among her poems are couplets regarding a camel, which rubbed its head on the feet of the Prophet and due to the miracle of His Eminence, spoke up and mentioned the excellence of His Eminence.

“The camel spoke up in order to mention the excellence of Ahmad. He requested and said: It is from the existence of this personality that mother of the towns – Mecca – has got nobility. This is Muhammad, and he is the best messenger prophet. He is the intercessor and the best of those who walked the earth. O those, who are jealous, die in your own jealousy and only he is the beloved of God, and except him, there is no other favorite one among the people.”¹

2. Khunsa binte Amr – granddaughter of Imrul Qays, had composed a large number of couplets and experts of poetry have consensus that before her and after her, no poet stronger than her is seen. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was amazed at her couplets and asked her to recite couplets for him.²

¹ *Behaarul Anwaar*, 6:103 [16/28].

² *Al-Istiab*, 4:295-296 [*Al-Istiab*, Part 4; 1827, No. 3317]; *Usudul Ghaba*, 5:441 [7/88, No. 6876].

3. Umme Salma – wife of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

4. Umme Ayman¹ – servant of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

5. Ayesha, wife of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.). She had memorized a large number of couplets and she used to say: “I narrate twelve thousand couplets of Labid.” The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) asked her to recite a couplet and said: “Recite your couplets.” Among the couplets that she recited, was the following:

“At that time when impure gold is tested on a touchstone; without any doubt, its impurity becomes clear; and counterfeit gold becomes clear from pure gold. Ali (a.s.), among us, is like a touchstone.”²

¹ Couplet of this person in *Tabaqat Ibne Saad*, 4:144-148 [2/326, 333]; *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, 1:169 [1/300 & 301] and is present in other books as well.

² *Al-Kanzul Madfoon*, Suyuti: 236 [Pg. 84].

Poetry and poets in the view of Imams (a.s.)

This spiritual invitation, religious assistance and encouragement of Quran and Sunnah, for Jihad through poetry and versified compositions became a practice during the period of the Holy Imams (a.s.) also in emulating the Prophet; and hearts of individuals of the society became soft through poetry and poets.

Poets from far off places of the country set out towards the Holy Imams (a.s.) and those respected ones accorded them a warm welcome. They welcomed them with great respect and arranged gatherings of poetry recitation for them and prayed for them.

They bestowed various kinds of presents to them. And if they noticed some defect in the couplets, they corrected them. From this aspect, during these periods, literature and poetry reached maturity and became as matured as many of the social sciences and arts came under its influence.

From this aspect, poetry, in the view of the protectors of religion (Ahle Bayt) have great importance. So much so that gatherings of poetry recitation and participation in them and spending to listen to them was regarded as great worship acts and divine obedience.

In the best of times, and most valuable places, it was preferred to supplications and worship, as mentioned in the statement of Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) and his conduct to the poem of Hashimiyat of Kumayt as seen at the time of his entry in Mina during the days of *Tashreeq* (11, 12 and 13 Zilhajj). He requested the Imam: "May I be sacrificed on you, please allow me to recite a poem." His Eminence replied: "These days are great days."

He said: "It is about you." When His Eminence heard this, he sent for his relatives and asked Kumayt: "Recite."

He recited the panegyric entitled 'Lamiya Hashimiya', and the Imam prayed for Kumayt. His Eminence also gifted him with a thousand gold coins (dinars) and a cloak.

And with attention to social aims, Imam (a.s.) used to overlook the acts and personal qualities of the religious poet, and if a negative act was committed by him, they used to bring them to the right path.¹

Statements like: It is not difficult for Almighty Allah to forgive the sins of our friends and admirers.² Is it difficult for God to forgive the sins of the

¹ [Three proverbs are used in text of the book. Ref: *Majmaul Amthal*, Maidani number, 2108, 2144, and 2121].

² Ref: *Akhbar Sayyid Himyari*, Hafiz Marzabani, [Pg. 159]; traditional report of Kishi in *Rijal*: 184 [2/570, No. 505], which is quoted here with slight difference.

followers of Ali (a.s.)?¹

Thus, there is no sin, which Allah does not forgive for the progeny of Ali. Indeed, follower of Ali will not stumble, except that his other foot becomes firm.² The exigency of the society is based on this step and our life and death is based on this only.

Imams of religion (a.s.) have positive thinking, which is used in this aspect; and it is like a program used for training and guiding people to service of society, enlightening folks of culture and guiding them to the ways of propagation and publicity, which make bases of the religion strong.

It is the bequest of Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) for his son, Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.):

"Ja'far, set aside this much from my property for ladies, who recite elegies to recite elegies for me during the days of Mina³ for ten years," which shows that elegies should be recited at places, where there is a large gathering.

Imam (a.s.) also fixed the place and time of mourning. Since that time and place is the only location to which Muslims flock in groups from far and near points of the earth and such a huge gathering is not there for any other purpose.

It shows that the aim, propagation of excellence and singular precedence of Ahle Bayt of revelation, Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) and conveying it to Muslim people, so that they develop attachment to it, become attentive to him, and Muslims unite on the issue of Mastership (*Wilayat*), and become proximate for acceptance of their religion.

And that the repetition of this program every year may urge attachment to truth and humility, and acceptance of Imamate of His Eminence, and to be embellished by excellence of his morals and connecting to his teachings, all of which bestow deliverance.

It is on this basis that gatherings of mourning for the martyrdom of Imam Husain (a.s.) were held and not for any other objective.

With attention to the lofty meaning of poetry, poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) were targets of the malice of opponents, their existence was very unbearable for opponents, fire of enmity burnt in them, malice with regard to them was strong, and the standard bearers of this dimension of poetry were always hopeless from life.

They were always expecting death and being killed, they lived in fear and were not able to settle down anywhere and were unable to settle down in a house and throughout their lives invited different calamities and tortures, like being

¹ It is mentioned in *Al-Aghani*, 7:241 [7/261]: What greatness does sin have in the view that He cannot forgive it for the followers of Ali?!

² Ref: *Al-Aghani*, 7:251 [7/272].

³ Shaykh Kulaini has narrated this tradition through authentic chains and through reliable narrators in *Al-Kafi*, 1:360 [5/117, H. 1].

crucified, killed, being burnt to death, cutting of the tongue, imprisonment, torture, beatings and abuses, insults, expulsion from hometown, separation from family and thousands of troubles and painful calamities, which pages of history are full of and have recorded a large number of them.

Poetry and poets in the view of elders of faith

Jurists and leaders of faith have followed the style of the Holy Imams (a.s.) and in order to protect this aspect of poetry for the service of religion and defending values of religion and survival of the heritage of the progeny of Allah and their memory remaining alive among the people, staged an uprising with this issue.

In expressing pleasure, respect and thankfulness for the poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and bestowing rewards and thanks to them through speech and character, Kulaini has adopted the same style of Imams, and followed the decorum for guarding the captioned meaning and aims when writing about verses and art of poetry, just as he left behind his writings for guarding jurisprudence and other religious sciences related to the aimed objective.

This great scholar, Kulaini, spent twenty years of his life only for writing the book of *Al-Kafi*, which is one of the four canonical books of Shia.

He also wrote a book entitled: What is mentioned about Ahle Bayt (a.s.) in poetry.

Ayyashi, who is also the author of numerous books on Imamiyah jurisprudence, and who is much worthy of attention, has written a book entitled, *Maarizush Sher*.

Our great teacher, Saduq, also was such that he dedicated his whole life writing and popularizing jurisprudence and traditions. He is also author of a book of poetry.

The teacher of Ummah, Shaykh Mufeed, who has incomparable services for revival of religion and reform of corruption as is not hidden from anyone. He has authored a book entitled, *Masailun Nazm*.

The chief of Shia, Sayyid Murtada Alamul Huda has a collection of his poems and writings on the art of poetry.

During religious festivals, birth and death anniversaries of the Holy Imams (a.s.), and the day of Eid Ghadeer, they held gatherings and feasts, and poets used to flock there from all corners, and present the fruits of their imagination from praise and extolling, as well as poems of lamentation, which led to the revival of the issue of Mastership (*Wilayat*), made people firm on it and increased affection and love in the society and among followers of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

Reciters of these panegyrics and those who gathered around them were rewarded with kindness, honor, gifts and praise; this is itself a great honor, but what is with Allah is better more lasting.

وَمَا عِنْدَ اللَّهِ خَيْرٌ وَّأَكْثَرُ

“And whatever is with Allah is better and more lasting.”¹

Our introduction from the poetry of the first century would be introduction to tradition and Sunnah. Under the couplets regarding the Progeny of Allah, some traditions are narrated through the Ahle Sunnat channels regarding this, which we shall mention. Perhaps through this researchers would be able to discover the command of poets over Quran and Sunnah.

¹ Surah Qasas 28:60

Poets of Ghadeer in the first century Hijri

1. Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.)
2. Hassan bin Thabit
3. Qays bin Saad bin Ubadah Ansari
4. Amr bin Aas bin Wael
5. Muhammad bin Abdullah Himyari

1. Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

We begin the book with our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Caliph of the chosen Messenger of God (s.a.w.a.), and through that seek auspiciousness, because he was, after his brother, the great Prophet, the most eloquent of Arabs and most knowledgeable of them about special qualities and subjects of Arabic discourse. He has understood through the statement of the Prophet:

من كنت مولاه فهذا على مولاه

“Of whomsoever I am the Maula, Ali is (also) his Maula,”

...that Maula implies one having absolute Imamate and his obedience, like the obedience of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is obligatory.

His Eminence mentioned this in the following couplets:

1. Muhammad is the Prophet, a very kind brother, and my peer.¹ And Hamza, the chief of the martyrs, is my uncle. 2. Ja'far is the same, who glides with angels day and night, he is my full brother. 3. The daughter of Muhammad is the source of my comfort and she is my wife, whose flesh is merged with my flesh and blood. 4. And the two grandsons of Ahmad (s.a.w.a.) are my sons from him (and Fatima). Thus, which of you is having the same fortune as I have? 5. I have precedence over you all in embracing Islam, in addition to perception and knowledge². 6. Thus, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on the day of Ghadeer Khum, placed the authority he is having over you upon me, and it became obligatory on you people. 7. Then hundreds of woes be on one who, on Judgment Day, meets God while he would have committed injustice upon me.

Explanation regarding the couplets

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) has mentioned these couplets in reply to the letter of Muawiyah. The letter of Muawiyah was as follows:

“I am the owner of excellence. During the period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*), my father was the chief of Arabs and I have myself obtained rulership in Islam. I am a relative of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and the maternal uncle of believers, the scribe of revelation.”

¹ In *Tareekh Ibne Asakir* [12/397], and in the biography of Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) – researched edition, No. 1328] and in other sources the word of ‘*Sanu*’ (affectionate brother) is replaced with the word of ‘*sahar*’ (father of the wife).

² In the traditional report of Ibne Abil Hadeed, [*Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 4/122, Sermon 56] and Ibne Hajar [*Sawaiqul Mohriqa*/133] and Ibne Shahr Ashob, [*Manaqib Aale Abi Talib*, 2/194] instead of the second line, it is mentioned: While I was a boy and I had not reached the age of maturity. And in the report of Ibne Shaykh [*Alif Baa*, 1/439] and other books, instead of this sentence is mentioned: I was child, who had not reached the age of maturity. The late Shaykh Tusi [*Al-Ihtijaaj*, 1/429, H. 93], after this couplet has added another couplet: During that period, when I was a child I used to pray and when I was in the womb of my mother, I used to testify for the Prophet.

After reading this letter, Imam (a.s.) said:

“Is the son of Hind, the liver-eater, being unjust to me through these merits?” Then he told the young man present with him:

“Write down, young man: **Muhammad is the Prophet, a very kind brother, and my peer...**” and then dictated the above lines and replied to the letter of Muawiyah.

When Muawiyah read this letter, he told his people to conceal it, so that no one from Shaam may read it, because as a result of it they would become inclined towards the son of Abu Talib!

Shia and Sunni scholars regard this report to be definite and they have consensus on its narration, but each of them have made it a topic of research and analysis to the extent related to their discussion, without expressing the least doubt in the fact that it was issued by His Eminence, on the contrary, we will soon mention that this is among the famous reports and narrators concerned with accuracy and trusted memorizers have narrated it.

Some senior Ahle Sunnat scholars have narrated from Baihaqi that it is obligatory on all followers of Ali (a.s.) to learn these couplets by heart, so that the world of Islam may know about the glories of His Eminence.

Some Shia scholars, who narrated these couplets, are as follows:

1. Teacher of the Islamic Ummah, Shaykh Mufeed (d. 413 A.H.).
2. Our teacher, Karajaki (d. 449 A.H.).
3. Abu Ali Fattal Nishapuri.
4. Abu Mansur Tabarsi, who is among the teachers of Ibne Shahr Ashob.
5. Ibne Shahr Ashob (d. 588 A.H.).
6. Allamah Majlisi (d. 1111 A.H.).¹

Some Ahle Sunnat scholars, who have narrated this panegyric, are as follows:

1. Hafiz Baihaqi (d. 458). He says regarding this poem:

“It is obligatory on all followers of Ali (a.s.) to learn these couplets by heart, so that the world of Islam may know about the glories of His Eminence.”

2. Abu Hajjaj, Yusuf bin Muhammad Balawi Maliki, famous as Ibne Shaykh (d. around 605 A.H.). In his book of *Alif Baa*, he says:²

“As for Ali (a.s.), he possesses a lofty rank and an exalted nobility. He was the first to embrace Islam and he was the husband of Fatima, daughter of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). When one of the enemies of His Eminence, who was unaware of his rank, showed pride over him, he replied to him with these couplets.”

¹ Al-Fusulul Mukhtara [226]; Kanzul Fawaid, 122 [1/266]; Rauzatul Waizeen, 76 [87/1]; Al-Ihtijaaj, 97 [1/429, H. 93]; Manaqib Aale Abi Talib, 1:356 [2/194]; Behaarul Anwaar, 9:375 [38/238].

² Alif Baa, 1:439.

After this, Ibne Shaykh mentions the captioned couplets and then says:

The implication of Ali (a.s.) was the obligatoriness of Mastership (*Wilayat*) of the same statement of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that: “Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.”

3. Hafiz Abu Husain Zaid bin Hasan Tajuddin Kindi Hanafi (d. 613 A.H.).¹
4. Yaqut Hamawi (d. 626 A.H.).²
5. Sibte Ibne Jauzi Hanafi (d. 654 A.H.).³
6. Ibne Abil Hadeed (d. 656 A.H.).⁴
7. Ibne Hajar (d. 974 A.H.).⁵
8. Muttaqi Hindi (d. 975 A.H.).⁶

2. Hassan bin Thabit

1. The Prophet of Muslims, on the day of Ghadeer called them in the valley of Khum. They lent their ears to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). 2. He asked: Who is your master and Prophet? None of them denied the truth and replied clearly: 3. Our master is your God and you are our Prophet; and so far you have not seen any disobedience from us. So, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to Ali (a.s.): O Ali, arise. I am pleased that you are the Imam and leader after me. 5. Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. It is obligatory for you to be his true followers. Then the Prophet prayed: O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.

Explanation of the couplets

This is the first poem, which was composed regarding this great report. Hassan composed and recited these couplets in a gathering of a hundred thousand or more Muslims. These people included orators and speakers from the Arab tribes, famous poets and elders of Quraish and those, who were conversant with the subtleties and qualities of discourse. Also, the most eloquent person from the Arabs, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), was present there.

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) supported the points and meaning, which Hassan bin Thabit understood from his statements, and which he mentioned in form of poetry. So the Prophet approved and praised him in the following words:

“O Hassan, as long as you support us, Ahle Bayt (a.s.), you will be

¹ *Al-Mujtani*, 39 [Pg. 26].

² *Mo'jamul Odaba*, 5:266 [14/48].

³ *Tadkiratul Khawaas*, 62 [Pg. 107].

⁴ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:377 [4/122, Sermon 56].

⁵ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 79 [Pg. 132].

⁶ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:392 [13/112, H. 36366].

supported by Ruhul Quds.”¹

The first book, in which this poem is narrated is *Kitab Sulaym bin Qays Hilali*.²

He was a companion of companions (*Tabaie*) and a reliable person; he was accurate in recording traditions and is trusted by Shia and Sunni scholars. A large number of Muslim scholars, whose number cannot be regarded as less, have narrated this report on his authority.

Senior tradition scholars (Huffaz), who narrated them

1. Hafiz Abu Saad Kharkoshi (d. 406 A.H.) has quoted these lines in his book of *Sharaful Mustafa*.
2. Hafiz Abu Nuaim Isfahani (d. 430 A.H.), in the book of *Maa Nazala minal Quran fee Ali*³ has narrated its chain of narrators and its text.
3. Hafiz Abu Saeed Sajistani (d. 477 A.H.) has narrated in the book of *Al-Wilayah*, through correct authorities.
4. The greatest orator, Khatib Khwarizmi Makki (d. 568 A.H.) has narrated this poem in the book of *Maqta Imam Husain (a.s.)* and in the book of *Manaqib*.⁴
5. Abul Fath Natanzi (d. 550 A.H. approx.) has narrated this poem in the book of *Al-Khasaisul Alawiya Alaa Sairul Bariyya*.
6. Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) has narrated these couplets in his treatise: *Al-Azdar feema Uqdatush Shuara min al-Ash-aar* from *Az Tadhkira* of Shaykh Tajuddin Ibne Maktum Hanafi (d. 749 A.H.).

Some notable Shia scholars, who have narrated this couplet are as follows:

1. Shaykh Saduq (r.a.), Abu Ja’far Muhammad bin Babawayh Qummi (d. 381 A.H.).
2. Sharif Razi (r.a.) (d. 406 A.H.), author *Nahjul Balagha*.
3. Teacher of Islamic Ummah, Shaykh Mufeed (d. 413 A.H.).
4. Sharif Murtada Alamul Huda (d. 436 A.H.). He has this poem in his commentary on Baiyya Qasida of Sayyid Himyari.
5. Shaykhut Taifah, Abu Ja’far Tusi (d. 460 A.H.). He has narrated it in *Talkhis Shafi*.
6. Allamah Majlisi (d. 1111 A.H.).⁵

¹ This statement of Prophet is from signs of his prophethood and from the hidden reports; because he knew that Hassan, in the last of his life, will get deviated from following the Imam and guidance of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.); therefore he qualified his supplication with the condition that he should continue to support Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

² *Kitab Sulaym bin Qays* [2/828, H. 39].

³ *Maa Nazala minal Quran fee Ali* [Pg. 57].

⁴ *Maqta Imam Husain (a.s.)* [Pg. 47]; *Al-Manaqib*: 80 [Pg. 135, H. 152].

⁵ *Amali Shaykh Saduq*: 343 [Pg. 260]; *Khasaisul Aaimma*, Sayyid Razi [Pg. 42]; *Khasais*

Collected Works (Diwan) of Hassan

In addition to the above panegyric, Hassan composed numerous poems in praise of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). It is from here that we conclude that some hands have distorted his collection and committed dishonesty. They altered his poems and same is the case of books, collected works and other collections comprising praises and excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and mention of their merits and extolling of Shia are removed from them.

The collected works of Hassan was also altered. Same was the case of Qasida Maimiya of Farazdaq, which he composed about our master, Imam Zainul Abideen (a.s.); in spite of its fame they omitted it from his collection, in spite of the fact that the publisher has hinted to it in the preface to commentary on the collection of Farazdaq and other books and collections are teeming with the mention of this poem.

They committed the same act with the collection of Kumayt and distorted some couplets and added some verses, and the collection of the chief of the poets, Abu Faras also met the same fate. Same is the case of the collection of Kashajim, from which they omitted an important part of elegies in honor of Imam Husain (a.s.).

Look at the book of *Maarif* by Ibne Qutaibah: How the selfish motives played with it. They added whatever was in accordance to their motives and whatever did not match their attitude was expunged. This matter is known through books written after it and which have quoted from it. The position in a large number of books is same; that every time it was republished or copied, it was made a target of distortion.

Couplets expunged from Hassan's collection

Here we hint at some verses from the collection of Hassan, which were subsequently deleted or expunged. However, like Qasida Yaiya, some trusted and important sources regard it to be composed by Hassan.

It is mentioned in *Tarikh Yaqubi*¹ and *Sharh Ibne Abi Hadeed*² and other books that: Ansar gathered around Hassan and requested him to only mention the name of Imam Ali (a.s.) and recite couplets about him,³ and he recited as follows:

1. May Almighty Allah, Who has the discretion for rewarding the deeds, give a good reward to Abul Hasan Ali from our side, and who is like Abul Hasan? 2. O Ali, with the excellence, which you deserved and commanded, through which you got precedence over Quraish, then your breast expanded

¹ *Ameerul Momineen*, Sayyid Razi [Pg. 6]; *Irshad*, Shaykh Mufeed: 31 and 64 [1/177]; *Rasail*, Sharif Murtada Alamul Huda, No. 4 [Pg. 131], and the verses of the Sayyid are named as 'Al-Qasidatul Mazhaba'; *Behaarul Anwaar*, 9:234 and 259 [21/388; 38/112].

² *Tareekh Yaqubi*, 2:107 [2/127].

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:14 [6/20 & 35, Sermon 66].

³ It is mentioned in *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*: Khuzaimah bin Thabit said to Hassan: Remember Ali and his family as they suffice you from everything.

and your heart is tested. 3. You protected the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) among us, and were loyal to the oath, which he entrusted you. And who can be worthier of this oath than you? Who? Were you not brother of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in guidance of mankind, and his successor and most knowledgeable regarding Quran and Sunnah?

His statements: “then your breast expanded” hints at the following verse of Quran:

أَفَمِنْ شَرَحَ اللَّهُ صَدْرَةً لِلْمُسْلِمِ

“What! is he whose heart Allah has opened for Islam...”¹

This verse is revealed about Imam Ali (a.s.) and Hamza. This point is mentioned by Hafiz Mohibuddin Tabari in the book of *Riyazun Nazara*.²

His words: “Your heart is tested” hints at the following tradition of Prophet that he said regarding Ameerul Momineen (a.s.):

“Indeed, Almighty Allah has tested his heart for faith.”³

Some Ahle Sunnat Huffaz and scholars have narrated this statement including Nasai in *Khasais*, Tirmizi in *Saheeh*, Suyuti in *Jamaul Jawame*, and also Ali Muttaqi Hindi in *Kanzul Ummal*.⁴

His statement “Were you not brother of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in guidance of mankind, and his successor” hints at the tradition of brotherhood of Ali (a.s.) with the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.); and the tradition of successorship of His Eminence.

These two traditions are so famous and widely narrated that researchers find them in majority of collections of Huffaz and great scholars.

His statement: “The most knowledgeable of men regarding the Quran and Sunnah,” implies the traditional report regarding knowledge of Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) about Quran and Sunnah.

Hafiz scholars have narrated a tradition from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), in which he addressed Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) as follows:

“I married you to the best of my relatives; he is the most learned and most forbearing, and foremost of them in accepting Islam.”

In another traditional report, he says:

“The wisest in the Ummah after me, is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

In the third tradition, he says:

¹ Surah Zumar 39:22

² *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:207 [3/157].

³ Khateeb Baghdadi has narrated in this way, but in some books, instead of ‘bil eimaan’ (with faith), ‘alal eimaan’ (over faith) is mentioned in some other ‘lil eimaan’ (for faith).

⁴ *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, 11 [Pg. 55, H. 31]; *Sunan Tirmizi*, 2:298 [5/592. H. 3715]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:393 & 396 [13/115, H. 36373 & Pg. 127, H. 36402].

“Ali is the most knowledgeable regarding God and human beings.”

He says in another tradition:

“O Ali, you have seven qualities; then he listed them; one of them is that: You are the wisest of people in dispensing justice.”¹

Mohibuddin Tabari has narrated from Ayesha in *Riyazun Nazara* that:²

“Ali (a.s.) is the most learned of men with regard to the Sunnah of Prophet.”

Ganji says in *Kifayatut Talib*:³ It is narrated from Abu Amama from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“The most knowledgeable from my followers regarding the Sunnah and dispensing of justice after me is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

In *Manaqib*,⁴ Khwarizmi has narrated from Salman from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“The wisest from my Ummah after me is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

Scholars and tradition narrators have narrated from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) that he said:

“By God, no verse was revealed, but that I know regarding what it was revealed and regarding whom it was revealed. My Lord bestowed me with a contemplative heart and a vocal tongue.”⁵

In the same way, it is narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that: “Wisdom had ten parts: nine parts were bestowed to Ali (a.s.) and one part distributed among the rest of mankind.”⁶

Abu Tufail says:

“I saw Ali (a.s.) delivering a sermon, in which he said: ‘Ask me⁷ whatever you want from the book of Allah. By God, there is no verse, but that I know whether it was revealed during the night, whether it was revealed on the plains or on mountain. And if I want I can write for you seventy camel loads on the exegesis of Surah Fatiha.’”

Ibne Abbas says: “Knowledge of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is sourced from the knowledge of Allah, the Mighty and the High and knowledge of Ali (a.s.) is sourced from knowledge of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and my knowledge is from knowledge of Ali and my knowledge and knowledge of all companions of Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) in relation to the knowledge of Ali (a.s.), is

¹ *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:66 [No. 4]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:153, 153 & 398 [11/605, H. 32926; & Pg. 617, H. 32995; 13/135, H. 36423].

² *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:193 [3/141].

³ *Kifayatut Talib*: 190 [332, Chap. 94].

⁴ *Al-Manaqib*: 49 [Pg. 82, H. 67].

⁵ *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:67 [No. 4]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:396 [13/128, H. 36404].

⁶ *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:65 [No. 4]

⁷ It is mentioned in the book of *Al-Isabah*, 2:509, No. 5688 as follows: “Ask me, ask me, ask me about the Book of Allah...”

like a drop of water with relation to the seven seas.”

It is said that Abdullah bin Abbas lamented so much on the passing away of Ali (a.s.) that he lost his eye sight and Umar bin Khattab sought the refuge of Allah from a difficulty to solve which, Abul Hasan (Ali) was not present.¹

Other compositions of Hassan regarding Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

Abu Muzaaffar Sibte Ibne Jauzi Hanafi has, in the book of *Tadkiratul Khawas*,² attributed the following verses to Hassan:

“Who is it that donated his finger ring to the beggar while bowing down in prayers. How nicely you concealed this incident in your heart? Who was it that slept in the bed of Muhammad so that he may take refuge in the cave? And who is it that is mentioned as a believer in nine oft-recited verses?”³

First line

There is hint to the incident in which Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) gave away his finger ring in genuflection of prayers and the verse of:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيْكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِيْنَ آمَنُوا ...

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe...”⁴

...was revealed about this. We will mention explanation of this point in the commentary of line number three.

Second line

The poet has hinted at a tradition on which the Islamic Ummah has consensus. According to this report on the night the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) escaped the infidels of Mecca and fled to the Cave of Thawr, Ali (a.s.) covered himself in a green Hadhrami sheet and slept on his bed, becoming a sacrifice from him. And the verse of:

وَمِن النَّاسِ مَنْ يَسْرِي نَفْسَهُ أَبْتَغِيَ مَرْضَاتِ اللَّهِ

“And among men is he who sells himself to seek the pleasure of Allah (like Ali a.s. during the night of migration, while sleeping in the bed of the Prophet).”⁵

...was revealed about him.

¹ Numerous scholars of traditions have narrated this tradition [Among them being: Ahmad in *Manaqib*/155, H. 122].

² *Tadkira Khawas*, 10 [Pg. 16].

³ Kanji has mentioned this couplet in *Kisayatut Talib*: 123 [Pg. 251, Chap. 92] and attributed it to some poets and in quoting it, instead of the last line, the following is mentioned: In nine verses of Holy Quran.

⁴ Surah Maidah 5:55

⁵ Surah Baqarah 2:207

Ibne Abil Hadeed has narrated the following from Abu Ja'far Iskafi in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*:¹

The report of Lailatul Mubeet is widely narrated and proved authentic and only a senseless fellow and one, who does not interact with Muslims, will deny it. And all commentators of Quran have narrated that the holy verse:

وَمِنَ النَّاسِ مَنْ يَشْرِي نَفْسَهُ أَبْتَغِيَ مَرْضَاتِ اللَّهِ

“And among men is he who sells himself to seek the pleasure of Allah.”²

...was revealed in the honor of Ali (a.s.) and about his sleeping in the bed of the Prophet that night (*Lailatul Mubeet*).

Third line

In this line, Hassan has hinted at nine verses of Quran, which were revealed in honor of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and in those verses, he is mentioned as ‘believer’. Although we find ten³ such verses in Quran and we don’t know exactly which nine verses Hassan implies.

It is worthy of attention that Nasr bin Muzahim has narrated from Muawiyah bin Sasa, a panegyric in *Kitab Sifteen*,⁴ in which it is mentioned that thirty verses of Quran mention Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as ‘believer’. The lines are as follows:

“He is the only one for whom thirty verses were revealed; in which he is mentioned as a sincere believer. In addition to necessitating verses in which Almighty Allah due to them and other than them made his Mastership (*Wilayat*) and friendship obligatory.”⁵

As for the captioned verses, they are as follows:

1.

أَفَمَنْ كَانَ مُؤْمِنًا كَمَنْ كَانَ فَاسِقًا لَا يَسْتَوْنَ ﴿١٦﴾

**“Is he then who is a believer like him who is a transgressor?
They are not equal.”⁶**

In his *Tafseer*,⁷ Tabari has narrated as follows from Ata bin Yasar:

“Conversation took place between Walid bin Uqbah bin Abi Muit and Ali

¹ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:27 [13/261, Sermon 238].

² Surah Baqarah 2:207

³ Imam Hasan Mujtaba (a.s.), grandson of Prophet, says in a tradition: Almighty Allah has mentioned my respected father as ‘believer’ in ten verses. [*Al-Kashshaf*, 3/246; *Behaarul Anwaar*, 35/339; 44/81].

⁴ *Waqatus Sifteen*, 31 [Pg. 27].

⁵ Quranic verses like 4:59 and 42:23.

⁶ Surah Sajdah 32:18

⁷ *Jaameul Bayan*, 21:62 [No. 11/Tr. 21/107].

(a.s.).”

Walid said: “I am more eloquent and vocal than you and my spear is sharper than you. I am more capable of chasing the enemy.”

Ali (a.s.) responded: “Shut up! As you are a transgressor.”

Almighty Allah has also revealed the following verse:

أَفَمَنْ كَانَ مُؤْمِنًا كَمَنْ كَانَ فَاسِقًا لَا يَسْتَوْنَ ﴿٤﴾

**“Is he then who is a believer like him who is a transgressor?
They are not equal.”¹**

Ibne Abil Hadeed has mentioned this report in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha* on the authority of his teacher.

This report is so clear that there is no doubt in it, because the most famous persons have narrated it and people have consensus on it.²

2.

هُوَ الَّذِي أَيَّدَكَ بِنَصْرِهِ وَبِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ ﴿٤﴾

**“He it is Who strengthened you with His help and with the
believers.”³**

In *Tarikh Medina Damishq*,⁴ Hafiz Abul Qasim Ibne Asakir has narrated from Abu Huraira that it is written on the Throne (*Arsh*): There is no god, except I, the one and without any partner. Muhammad is my servant and messenger, whom I have supported through Ali.

And it is a statement of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime in His noble Book:

هُوَ الَّذِي أَيَّدَكَ بِنَصْرِهِ وَبِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ ﴿٤﴾

**“He it is Who strengthened you with His help and with the
believers.”⁵**

...and the believers imply only Ali (a.s.).

In the eighth chapter of his book of *Mawaddatul Qurba*, Sayyid Hamadani has narrated from Imam Ali (a.s.) as follows: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said to me:

“I saw your name in four places besides my name: During the journey of my ascension to the heavens, when I reached Baitul Muqaddas, I saw inscribed on a rock: There is no god, except Allah, Muhammad is the messenger of Allah; I supported him with Ali as a vicegerent.

¹ Surah Sajdah 32:18

² *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 1:394; 2:103 [4/80, Sermon 56; 6/292, Sermon 83].

³ Surah Anfal 8:62

⁴ *Tareekh Medina Damishq* [12/307].

⁵ Surah Anfal 8:62

When I reached the Sidratul Muntaha, it was inscribed on it: Indeed, I am Allah, there is no god, except me; Muhammad is my chosen one from My creatures. I helped and supported him through his vicegerent, Ali.

And when I reached the throne of the Lord of the worlds, I saw written on its legs: Indeed, I am the Almighty Lord. There is no god, except Me. Muhammad is my beloved among My creatures. I supported him through his vicegerent, Ali.

When I reached Paradise, I saw written on its gate: There is no god, except Me. Muhammad is my beloved among My creatures. I helped and supported him through his vicegerent, Ali.”

3.

يَأَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ حَسْبُكَ اللَّهُ وَمَنِ اتَّبَعَكَ مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ﴿٤٣﴾

“O Prophet! Allah is sufficient for you and (for) such of the believers as follow you.”¹

In *Fazailus Sahaba*, Hafiz Abu Nuaim has narrated through his authorities that this verse was revealed about Ali (a.s.) and believers imply Ali (a.s.).

4.

مَنِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ رِجَالٌ صَدَقُوا مَا عَاهَدُوا اللَّهَ عَلَيْهِ فَمِنْهُمْ مَنْ قَضَى نَحْبَةً
وَمِنْهُمْ مَنْ يَنْتَظِرُ وَمَا بَلَّوْا تَبْدِيلًا ﴿٤٤﴾

“Of the believers are men who are true to the covenant which they made with Allah (and accepted martyrdom on His path): so of them is he who accomplished his vow, and of them is he who yet waits, and they have not changed in the least;”²

In *Manaqib*,³ Khatib Khwarizmi and Sadrul Huffaz Ganji writes in the book of *Kifayatut Talib*,⁴ quoting from Ibne Jarir and other commentators that the words:

فَمِنْهُمْ مَنْ قَضَى نَحْبَةً

“So of them is he who accomplished his vow.”⁵

This verse was revealed regarding Hamza and his companions. They had made a covenant to God that they would not flee from the battlefield and turn away from enemies. Thus, they continued to confront the enemies till they met martyrdom. And the words:

¹ Surah Anfal 8:64

² Surah Ahzab 33:23

³ *Al-Manaqib*: 188 [Pg. 279, H. 270].

⁴ *Kifayatut Talib*, 122 [Pg. 249, Chap. 62].

⁵ Surah Ahzab 33:23

وَمِنْهُمْ مَنْ يَنْتَظِرُ

“And of them is he who yet waits.”¹

...are regarding Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). He also continued to tread the path of Jihad and did not deviate in the least and did not change this style.

Ibne Hajar writes in the book of *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*.²

When Ali was speaking from the pulpit in Masjid Kufa, a person asked him about the verse:

وَمِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ رَجُالٌ صَدَقُوا مَا عَاهَدُوا اللَّهَ عَلَيْهِ ...

“Of the believers are men who are true to the covenant which they made with Allah...”³

He replied:

“May Almighty Allah forgive me. This verse is revealed about me, Hamza, my uncle and Harith bin Abdul Muttalib, my cousin. As for Ubaidah, he was martyred in the Battle of Badr. Hamza was also martyred during the Battle of Uhud. As for me: I am waiting for the day when I would be martyred at the most vicious person of the nation and my beard would be smeared with the blood of my head. It is a covenant, which my beloved, Abul Qasim, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) has taken from me.”

5.

إِنَّمَا وَلِيُّكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ أَمْنَوْا إِنَّمَا يُقْرِبُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيَنْهَا تُوْنَ

الرَّكْعَةَ وَهُمْ رَكِعُونَ

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”⁴

Abu Ishaq Thalabi has, in his *Tafseer*,⁵ narrated as follows quoting on the authority of Abu Zar Ghiffari:

“One day I prayed the Noon Prayer with the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). A beggar sought help from people in the Masjid, but none of them gave anything to him. He raised his hands to the heavens and said: O God, remain witness that I sought help at the Masjid of the Prophet, but no one gave anything. Meanwhile, Ali (a.s.) was engrossed in his prayers and he was presently bowing. He gestured towards the small finger of his right hand, in which he was wearing a ring. He

¹ Surah Ahzab 33:23

² *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 80 [Pg. 134].

³ Surah Ahzab 33:23

⁴ Surah Maidah 5:55

⁵ *Al-Kashf wal Bayan*: [Pg. 180; Surah Maidah:55].

stepped forward and removed the ring from his finger.

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), who was present in the Masjid witnessed this scene. At this point, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) raised his eyes to the sky and said: O Allah, my brother, Moosa requested You and said:

قَالَ رَبِّ اشْرَحْ لِي صَدْرِيٌّ وَيَسِّرْ لِي أَمْرِيٌّ
وَاحْلُلْ عَقْدَةً مِنْ لِسَانِيٍّ
يَفْقَهُوا قَوْلِيٍّ وَاجْعَلْ لِي وَزِيرًا مِنْ أَهْلِنِ
هُرُونَ أَخِيٌّ اشْدُدْ بِهَ آزِيرِيٌّ
وَأَشْرِكْهُ فِي أَمْرِيٍّ كَيْ نُسْبِحَكَ كَثِيرًا^١

“He said: O my Lord! Expand my breast for me, and make my affair easy to me, and loose the knot from my tongue, (That) they may understand my word; and give to me an aide from my family: Harun, my brother, strengthen my back by him, and associate him (with me) in my affair,”¹

You also fulfilled his supplication and said:

سَنَشِدْ عَضْدَكَ بِأَخِيكَ وَنَجْعَلْ لَكُمَا سُلْطَنًا فَلَا يَصِلُونَ إِلَيْكُمَا

“We will strengthen your arm with your brother, and We will give you both an authority, so that they shall not reach you.”²

O God, indeed I am your Prophet and chosen one. O Allah, expand my breast and ease my mission and appoint from my kinsmen a deputy from me; appoint Ali for this position and strengthen my back through him.

Abu Zar says: “The supplication of the Prophet had not concluded, but that Jibreel (a.s.) descended from Almighty Allah and said: O Muhammad, recite:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيْكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِيْنَ أَمْنَوْا إِلَيْكُمُ الْأَمْنَةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ
الرِّزْكَ وَهُمْ رَكِعُونَ^٣

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”³

A large number of scholars of traditions and Quranic exegesis have narrated the excellence of Ali (a.s.) and the revelation of the above verse in his honor. The following persons can be mentioned from them:

1. Tabari in his *Tafseer*. 2. Wahidi in *Asbabun Nuzul*. Razi in his *Tafseer*.⁴ 4.

¹ Surah Taha 20:25-32

² Surah Qasas 28:35

³ Surah Maidah 5:55

⁴ *Jaameul Bayan*, 6:165 [No. 4/vol. 6/288]; *Asbabun Nuzul*: 148 [Pg. 133]; *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:431 [12/26]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:227 [3/182, Chap. 4, Part 9; Pg. 156, Part 6]; *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7:357 [7/394, Events of Year 40 A.H.]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:391 [13/108, H.

Mohibuddin Tabari in *Riyaz*. 5. Ibne Kathir Shami in *Bidaya wa al-Nehaya*. 6. Hafiz Suyuti in *Jamaul Jawame* quoting from *Kanzul Ummal*. 7. Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*.

6.

أَجَعَلْتُمْ سَقَائِيَّةَ الْحَاجِ وَعِمَارَةَ الْمَسْجِدِ الْحَرَامِ كَمَنْ أَمْنَ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ
الْآخِرِ وَجَهَدَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ لَا يَسْتَوْنَ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ

“What! do you make (one who undertakes) the giving of drink to the pilgrims and the guarding of the Sacred Mosque like him who believes in Allah and the latter day and strives hard in Allah’s way? They are not equal with Allah.”¹

Tabari in his *Tafseer*² has narrated on the authority of Anas:

“One day Abbas and Shaibah bin Uthman (caretaker of Kaaba) were boasting about each other’s family status. Abbas said: I am better than you, because I am the uncle of the Prophet, and the successor of his father and I was the water supplier to the Hajj pilgrims. Shaibah replied: I am superior to you. Since I am the trustee of Almighty Allah, caretaker and treasurer of House of God. Why He did not make you His caretaker on Kaaba and why He made me the trustee? The two of them were thus arguing on these lines, when Ali (a.s.) reached them. Abbas said: Shaibah has boasted to me and he thinks that he is superior to me. He replied: Uncle, what did you reply? He said: I said: I am uncle of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and the successor of his father and the water supplier to the Hajj pilgrims and I am superior to you. His Eminence asked Shaibah: Shaibah, what did you say. He replied: I said that I am superior to you since I am the trustee of Almighty Allah in His House and the treasurer of Kaaba; why did He not make you the trustee instead of me?”

Anas says: “Ali (a.s.) said to them in response: Include me as well in your boasting. They said: Very well. He said: I am having precedence over both of you, because among the men of this Ummah, I am the first, who brought faith on the warnings of the Prophet; and I migrated in his company and fought Jihad. Then all three of them went to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and narrated their boasts to him. He did not give any response till they went away from there.

After some days Jibreel (a.s.) came and revealed a verse from Almighty Allah regarding this. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) summoned all three of them and recited this verse:

أَجَعَلْتُمْ سَقَائِيَّةَ الْحَاجِ وَعِمَارَةَ الْمَسْجِدِ الْحَرَامِ كَمَنْ أَمْنَ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ

¹ 36354]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 25 [Pg. 41].

² Surah Taubah 9:19

² *Jaameul Bayan*, 10:59 [No. 6, Vol. 10/95].

الْآخِرِ وَجَهَدَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ لَا يَسْتَوْنَ عَنَّ اللَّهِ وَاللَّهُ لَا يَهْدِي الْقَوْمَ
الظَّالِمِينَ ⑯

“What! do you make (one who undertakes) the giving of drink to the pilgrims and the guarding of the Sacred Mosque like him who believes in Allah and the latter day and strives hard in Allah’s way? They are not equal with Allah; and Allah does not guide the unjust people.”¹

Many Huffaz and scholars, have narrated this incident in a clear and detailed manner and mentioned the revelation of the captioned verse regarding this boasting. Among them being Wahidi in *Asbabun Nuzul*, Qurtubi in his book of *Tafseer*, Razi in *Tafseer Kabeer*, Khazin in his book of *Tafseer* and Hafiz Suyuti in *Durre Manthur*.²

In the same way, some former poets, who through their poems have kept alive the meaning and significance of the verse; they have versified the story of the boasting and the revelation of the verse regarding them. Among them can be mentioned Syed Himyari, Nashi and Bishnoi etc.

7.

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ أَمْنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ سَيَجْعَلُ لَهُمُ الرَّحْمَنُ وُدًّا

“Surely (as for) those who believe and do good deeds for them will Allah bring about love.”³

Abu Ishaq Thalabi says in the book of his *Tafseer*⁴ that Baraa bin Azib said that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to Ali (a.s.):

“O Ali, may God make a covenant about you and place your love in the hearts of believers.”

Then Almighty Allah revealed the above verse and the supplication of His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) was fulfilled.

In the book of *Riyazun Nazara*,⁵ Mohibuddin Tabari has mentioned on the authority of Hafiz Salafi from Ibne Hanafiyah regarding the verse that: Indeed, there is love for Ali (a.s.) and his family members in the heart of every believer.

8.

أَمْ حَسِبَ الَّذِينَ اجْتَرَحُوا السَّيِّئَاتِ أَنْ نَجْعَلَهُمْ كَالَّذِينَ أَمْنُوا وَعَمِلُوا

¹ Surah Taubah 9:19

² Asbabun Nuzul: 182 [Pg. 164]; Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran, 8:91 [59/8]; Tafseer Kabeer, 4:422 [16/11]; Tafseer Khazin, 2:221 [2/211]; Ad-Durre Mansoor, 3:218 [4/166].

³ Surah Maryam 19:96

⁴ *Al-Kashf wal Bayan*: [Pg. 19; Surah Maryam:96].

⁵ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:207 [3/157].

الصَّلِحُّ لَا سَوَاءٌ فِي أَهْمَّ وَمَاهُّ

“Nay! do those who have wrought evil deeds think that We will make them like those who believe and do good that their life and their death shall be equal?”¹

Abu Muzaffar Sibte Ibne Jauzi Hanafi says in the book of *Tadkiratul Khawas*:² Siddi has narrated from Ibne Abbas that this verse was revealed on the day of the Battle of Badr and in honor of Ali (a.s.) and:

الَّذِينَ اجْتَرَحُوا السَّيِّئَاتِ

“Those who have wrought evil deeds...”³

...implies Utbah, Shaibah, Walid and Mughira. And the implication of:

الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ

“Those who believe and do good...”⁴

...is Ali (a.s.).

9.

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ لَا وُلِّيَّكُمْ هُمْ خَيْرُ الْبَرِّيَّةِ⁵

“(As for) those who believe and do good, surely they are the best of men.”⁶

Tabari, in his *Tafseer*,⁶ has narrated through his authorities from Abu Jarud from Muhammad bin Ali regarding the verse:

أُولَئِكَ هُمْ خَيْرُ الْبَرِّيَّةِ⁷

“They are the best of men.”⁷

That the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“O Ali you and your Shia are the best of men (*Khairul Bariya*).”

Khwarizmi, in the book of *Manaqib*,⁸ has narrated from Jabir that he said: I was present in the company of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) when Ali (a.s.) arrived.

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “My brother has come to you.”

Then he glanced at the Kaaba and hit his hand upon it and said: “By the one

¹ Surah Jaaseyah 45:21

² Tadkira Khawas, 11 [Pg. 17].

³ Surah Jaaseyah 45:21

⁴ Surah Jaaseyah 45:21

⁵ Surah Bayyinah 98:7

⁶ *Jaameul Bayan*, 30:166 [No. 15/vol. 30/264].

⁷ Surah Bayyinah 98:7

⁸ *Al-Manaqib*, 66 [Pg. 111, H. 120; Pg. 265, H. 247].

in whose hands my life is, I swear that this person and his Shia would be successful on Judgment Day.”

Then he said: “Among you, he is first to believe in me and he the most loyal regarding the covenant to Almighty Allah and who is most steadfast in fulfilling divine commands and most equitable among you in conduct with others. He is the wisest of you in equitable distribution; and in perfections and excellence, he is greatest among all of you.”

Jabir said: At that time the verse:

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ لَا وَلِيَّكُمْ خَيْرُ الْبَرِّيَّةِ ⑥

“(As for) those who believe and do good, surely they are the best of men.”¹

...was revealed about Ali (a.s.). After that whenever Ali (a.s.) entered a gathering, companions of the Prophet used to remark: The best of men has arrived.

In *Fusulul Muhimma*,² Ibne Sabbagh Maliki has directly narrated from Ibne Abbas that when this verse was revealed, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to Ali (a.s.):

“On Judgment Day, you and your Shia will enter the field of gathering (*Mahshar*) while you have earned the satisfaction of God. And your enemies are angry and their heads would be held aloft by iron collars and they shall be in chains; and they would enter the field of gathering in this condition.”³

10.

وَالْعَصْرِ ⑦ إِنَّ الْإِنْسَانَ لَفِي خُسْرٍ ⑧ إِلَّا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ

“I swear by the time, most surely man is in loss, except those who believe and do good...”⁴

Jalaluddin Suyuti says in *Durre Manthur*:⁵ Ibne Marduya has narrated from Ibne Abbas regarding the verses:

وَالْعَصْرِ ⑦ إِنَّ الْإِنْسَانَ لَفِي خُسْرٍ ⑧

“I swear by the time, most surely man is in loss,”⁶

That they imply Abu Jahl bin Hisham and the implication of the verse:

¹ Surah Bayyinah 98:7

² Al-Fusulul Muhimma, 122 [Pg. 121].

³ [It is mentioned in Surah Yasin, verse 8: “Surely We have placed chains on their necks, and these reach up to their chins, so they have their heads raised aloft.” (Surah Yasin 36:8).]

⁴ Surah Asr 103:1-3

⁵ *Durre Mansoor*, 6:392 [8/622].

⁶ Surah Asr 103:1-2

إِلَّا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ

“Except those who believe and do good...”¹

...is Ali (a.s.) and Salman.

Another poem of Hassan regarding Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.)

While the battle was raging and Muslims were surrounding the Prophet (s.a.w.a.), Jibraeel called out in a clear and cloud voice:

لَا فِي الْأَعْلَى لَاسِيفُ الْأَذْوَافِ الْفَقَارِ

“There is no sword, except Zulfiqar and there is no valiant youth, except Ali.”

In the above poem, Hassan has hinted at the call of Jibraeel on the day of the Battle of Uhud regarding Ali and his sword. Tabari, in his *Tarikh Umam wal Muluk*, has narrated from Abu Rafe that:²

In the Battle of Uhud, after Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) eliminated the standard bearers of the enemies, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) saw some infidels of Quraish and he said to Ali (a.s.):

“Attack this battalion.”

Ali (a.s.) attacked that battalion and routed them and slew Amr bin Abdullah Jamhi.

Then the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) saw another group of the infidels of Quraish and said to Ali (a.s.):

“Attack them.”

Ali (a.s.) attacked them and scattered them and put Shaibah bin Malik to the sword. Then Jibraeel said to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.): “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), this is the meaning of similarity in all aspects.”

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “He is from me and I am from him.”

Jibraeel said: “I am also from you two.”

Abu Rafe said: “Then the fighters heard a call saying:

‘There is no sword, except Zulfiqar and no brave youth, except Ali.’”

Ibne Abil Hadeed has also mentioned this report in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha* and he says:

This report is famous and he adds that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “This is the call of Jibraeel.”³

Allamah Amini says: Various traditions show that this incident occurred a number of times, and as we mentioned, the caller on the day of the Battle of Uhud

¹ Surah Asr 103:3

² *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 3:17 [2/514, Events of year 3 A.H.].

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 1:9; 2:236; 3:281 [1/29, Preface; 13/293, Sermon 238; 14/251].

was Jibraeel; but the caller on the day of Battle of Badr was an angel, named Rizwan.¹

Another verse of Hassan

وجات بعيسى كبدار الدهى

واين مريم احصنت فرجها

وجات بسبطى نبى الهدى

فقد احصنت فاطم بعدها

“If Maryam (a.s.) lived in chastity and gave birth to Isa, who was as handsome as the full moon on a dark night. Fatima (s.a.) also, after her, gave birth to the two grandsons of Prophet: Hasan and Husain (a.s.) with absolute purity (for the guidance of humanity).”²

In these two verses, Hassan’s implication is the authentic report of the Prophet regarding his beloved daughter, Lady Zahra (s.a.), in which he said:

ان فاطمه احصنت فرجها فحرم الله ذريتها على النار

“Indeed, my Fatima guarded her chastity; that is why Allah, the Mighty and the High prohibited Hellfire from her, her progeny and descendants.”

Hakeem has mentioned this report in *Mustadrak Saheehain*³ and then commented:

“The authorities of this tradition are correct.”

Introduction to the poet

The name and parentage of this poet is mentioned as follows: Abu Walid Hassan bin Thabit bin Mundhir bin Haraam...bin Yarab bin Qahtan.⁴ Hassan belonged to a family, which had members who commanded great literary expertise and were well known poets of the Arabs. Marzabani says in *Mojamush Shuara*:⁵

Dibil and Mubarrad have said that the family of Hassan comprised of persons most deeply rooted in poetry. Six members of this family were eminent poets. Like pearls beaded in a single string including Saeed bin Abdur Rahman bin Hassan bin Thabit bin Mundhir bin Haram.

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) fixed a pulpit for him in the Masjid on which he stood and recited praises of His Eminence and the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“O God, support Hassan through Ruhul Quds as long as he defends the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) or recites his praises.”⁶

¹ Ref: *Kifayatut Talib*: 144 [277-280, Chap. 69]; *Riyazun Nazara* 2:190 [3/137].

² Ibne Shahr Ashob Saravi has mentioned this couplet in his *Manaqib*, 4:24 [3/409].

³ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:152 [3/165. H. 4726].

⁴ Abul Faraj in *Aghani*, 3:4 [4/141] has named the forefathers of Hassan in this way.

⁵ *Mojamush Shuara*: 366 [Pg. 269].

⁶ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:287 [2/555, H. 6058] Zahabi has narrated this tradition through a

During the lifetime of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), Hassan remained in the same condition, but after the passing away of Prophet, one day Hassan was busy in reciting couplets when Umar passed by and scolded him¹ saying:

“Do you recite couplets in the Masjid of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)?”

Hassan replied: “I have recited poems in this Masjid in the presence of someone, who was better than you (and he did not object).”

Abu Abdullah Ubayy Maliki says in *Shark Muslim*:

This behavior of Umar shows that he was not happy at the recitation of poems in the Masjid and that is why he provided a field outside the Masjid and said:

“One, who wants to recite praise or protest or wants to recite poems, should go out to this field.”

This instruction of the Caliph was opposed to the practice of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and in that same time Hassan was banned from reciting his compositions though before that the Prophet himself never restrained him from such conduct.²

Hassan was well known for being extremely timid. Ibne Athir has mentioned this in *Usudul Ghaba*³ and he says:

“He was among the most timid of people.”

Watwat says in *Ghurarul Khasais*⁴ that he was regarded as the most timid of the people and he writes:

Ibne Qutaibah says in the book of *Maarif*⁵ that he did not participate in any battle of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Hassan was born eight years before the birth of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and on the basis of popular view, he lived for a hundred and twenty years. The title of Hassan (wielded sword) was awarded to him. Its reason was that he defended Islam through his numerous couplets.

Hakeem⁶ has narrated from Musab from Ibne Abdullah Zubairi⁷ that Hassan lived for sixty years during the period of Jahiliyya and sixty years during Islam. At the end of his life he lost his eyesight.

¹ chain, which he considers authentic.

² Exactly as the words of Ibne Abde Barr in *Istiab* [Part 1/345; No. 507]; and Ibne Asakir in his *Taareekh*, 4:126 [4/357; and also *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 6/290]. In *Saheeh Muslim*, 2:384 [5/86, H. 151, Kitab Fadailus Sahaba] the words are: He looked at him from the corner of his eyes. And in *Musnad Ahmad*, 5:222 [6/292; H. 21431] it is mentioned: Then he said: Keep quiet.

³ Ref: *Tareekh Ibne Asakir*, 7: 391 [9/207; and *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 12/154].

⁴ *Usudul Ghaba*, 2:6 [2/7, No. 1153].

⁵ *Ghurarul Khasais*: 355 [Pg. 358].

⁶ *Al-Marif*: [Pg. 312].

⁷ Mustadrak Alas Saheehain [3/553. H. 6054].

⁷ [I have quoted this from *Mustadrak*].

According to one view, he died in the year 55 A.H. when his external and internal eyes had become blind. This point is mentioned by the prominent companion of Prophet, Qays bin Saad bin Ubadah, a senior member of the Khazraj community.

The story is that Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) deposed Qays from the governorship of Egypt and he returned to Medina. When he entered Medina, Hassan met him in order to reproach him. At that time Hassan had become a loyalist of Uthman and had renounced the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). Hassan said:

“On one side Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) deposed you from governorship and on the other side his hands are smeared with the blood of Uthman. The sin of this murder remains on his neck and Ali also did not think well of you.”

Qays scolded him in response: “O one, who is blind in the eyes as well as the heart, by God, if I had not feared initiating a war between your tribe and mine, I would have struck off your neck.” Then he drove him away.¹

3. Qays Ansari

“Ali is our and others’ Imam and leader and the Quran has mentioned this fact. On the day, when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: ‘Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master.’ And this was a lofty rank. The duty, which the Prophet made incumbent on the Ummah is a matter that is definite and certain there is no second opinion about it.”

Explanation of the verses

The above verses were recited by the senior companion and leader of Khazraj tribe, Qays bin Saad bin Ubadah, in Siffen in the honor of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

The teacher of the Ummah, Shaykh Mufeed (d. 413 A.H.) has quoted these lines in his book of *Al-Fusulul Mukhtara*.²

After that he says:

“These verses, in the addition to the admission of leadership and Imamate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), are evidence on the precedence and antiquity of Shia and they invalidate the claim of Mutazila, who due to obstinacy, deny the existence of Shia during that period.”

Abu Muzaffar Sibte Ibne Jauzi Hanafi (d. 654 A.H.) has also mentioned this report in his book of *Tadkiratul Khawaas*,³ and he says:

“Qays recited these verses in the presence of Ali in Siffen.”

¹ *Tareekh Tabari*, 5:231 [4/555, Events of Year 36 A.H.]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed 2:25 [6/64, Sermon 66].

² *Al-Fusulul Mukhtara*, 2:87 [236]

³ *Tadkiratul Khawaas*, 20 [Pg. 23].

Introduction to the poet

Abul Qasim Qays bin Saad bin Ubadah.

He was a senior companion of Prophet. He is regarded as a noble, a leader, a politician, an expert in warfare, a generous person, an orator, an ardent worshipper, an intellectual of the Arabs and among the columns of religion and pillars of faith.

Nobility of Qays

He was the chief of Khazraj tribe and a member of a noble family of this tribe. His family, whether during the period of Jahiliyya or after Islam, commanded respectability.

Sulaym bin Qays Hilali writes in his book:¹

“Indeed Qays bin Saad was a leader of Ansar and the son of the leader of this tribe.”

Mubarrad has mentioned in his book of *Al-Kamil fil Lugha wal Adab*²:

“Qays was a valiant and a generous leader. His father was one of the twelve nobles, whose Islam was guaranteed by Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) himself. He was among the leaders who had the power to provide sureties.”

For more information the book of Ibne Asakir may be referred.³

His governorship

During the lifetime of Prophet, Qays held the post of police commissioner and he was in charge of all duties that a police commissioner bears in our times.⁴

He participated in some battles of the Prophet and he was the standard bearer of Ansar. His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) deputed him to collect Zakat. He was a man of discernment.⁵

After the passing away of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) during the rule of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), the latter appointed him as the governor of Egypt and he provided a clean administration.

Qays was a Shia and well wisher of Imam Ali (a.s.). His Eminence (a.s.) appointed him as the governor of Egypt in Safar, year 36 A.H. After his return from Egypt, according to *Tarikh Yaqubi*,⁶ Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) appointed him as the governor of Azerbaijan.

¹ Kitab Sulaym bin Qays [2/778, H. 26].

² Al-Kamil fil Lugha wal Adab, 1:309 [1/419].

³ Tareekh Madinatul Damishq, 1:86 [7/112]; and in Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq [9/236 & 237].

⁴ *Saheeh Tirmizi*, 2:317 [5/648, H. 3850]; *Sunan Baihaqi*, 8:155.

⁵ *Tareekh Ibne Asakir* [14/452 & 459; and in Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, 21/102]; *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 8:99 [8/107, Events of the year 59 A.H.].

⁶ *Tareekh Yaqubi*, 2:178 [2/202].

Shrewdness and expertise of Qays

The respected reader, by studying the life history of Qays, will be able to get definite evidences of his ingenuity and diplomacy; in such a way that he had an important role and position in battles and he expressed profound views regarding occurrences.

During his governorship, he held noble views and Imam Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) also respected his intelligence, cleverness and his view in rulership.

Ibne Kathir says in the book of *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*:¹

“Ali (a.s.) appointed him as the governor of Egypt and he ruled that province confronting Muawiyah and Amr Aas with shrewdness and ingenuity.”

Qays regarded himself to be the greatest in shrewdness and politics and he remarked:

“If I had not heard the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) say that deceit and cunning are in Fire, I would have been the most cunning person of the Ummah.”²

In the same way, he says: “If I had not been a believer in Islam, I would have practiced such deceit that no one among the Arabs would have been able to compete with me.”³

Among the Arab statesmen, Qays possessed some special qualities and he is famous for his cleverness and diplomacy; but his faith in religion is also well known. He was the defender of the sanctity of Shariat and was strictly bound that his views should be in accordance to the pleasure of Allah, the Mighty and the High and he restrained his self from opposition to God. His qualities, precedence and excellence were proved for all Arabs.

Absolute control of Qays on administrative issues

The researcher of every culture may refer to all whose names are mentioned as Qays and study his life history, he would come across sentences one after another and come across his epics and his valor. He would also read a great deal about his military skills, and his nice role in battles; his steadfastness in harshest and terrifying fields.

What can I write about that brave warrior, whose name is mentioned as the swordsman of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and the most steadfast and harshest of men in defense of Prophet after Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)?⁴

And what can I say about the lion hearted one, to face whom was extremely difficult for Muawiyah and he was the singular one whom the enemies dreaded. Even the hundred thousand strong army was fearful to face him alone.

¹ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 8:99 [8/107, Events of the year 59 A.H.].

² *Usudul Ghaba*, 4:215 [4/426, No. 4648]; *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 8:101 [8/109, Events of the year 59 A.H.].

³ *Darajatul Rafia* [Pg. 335]; *Al-Isabah*, 3:249 [No. 7177].

⁴ *Irshadul Qulub*, Dailami 2:201 [Pg. 380].

In the Battle of Siffeen, Muawiyah said: "By God, if the army of elephants had not prevented Qays, he would finish us tomorrow." The conduct of Qays during the lifetime of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) shows the valor and bravery of Qays.

As for his conduct during the period of the Prophet: His important role can be seen during the battles of Badr, conquest of Mecca, Hunain, Uhud, Khyber, Bani Nuzayr and Ahzab.

As for his conduct during the period of Imam Ali (a.s.): He encouraged Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) to fight against Muawiyah and other opponents and said: "O Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), since you are on truth, there is no one more beloved to me than you on the face of the earth, because you are the star of guidance in the dark night of deviation and you are our refuge. If we lose you, our earth and sky would become pitch dark. By God, if you leave Muawiyah free to commit his vicious deeds, he would devastate Egypt, spread corruption in Yemen and annihilate Iraq. Take the people of Iraq and Hijaz with you and don't leave him at any cost. Make his life difficult in such way that he despairs from creating any mischief."

His Eminence replied: "By God, you have given a very good advice."¹

After that Ali (a.s.) sent Qays along with his son, Hasan (a.s.) and Ammaar Yasir to Kufa to mobilize the Kufians for the assistance of the Imam.

Generosity and nobility of Qays

Since the incidents of generosity and nobility of Qays are so numerous and our discussion does not have the scope to mention all of them; therefore, we would be content to narrate some of them by way of sample.²

Generosity was so ancient in the family of Qays that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

*"Generosity is a part of the nature of this clan."*³

A famous story regarding Qays is as follows:

Qays had lent out huge amounts of money to people. One day he fell ill, but very few people came to visit him. When he inquired the reason for this, he was told that they feel ashamed to come before him due to the amounts they have borrowed from him.

When Qays saw this, he said: "God does not bestow wealth so that brothers feel humiliation in visiting each other."

Then he ordered them to make a public announcement that all those, who owe money to Qays are condoned from their debt. Such a huge crowd of people rushed to his house that the steps to the house were damaged.

¹ *Amali Shaykh Tusi*: 85 [Pg. 716, H. 1518].

² *[Majmaul Amthal*, 1/348, No. 1035].

³ *Al-Isabah*, 4:254 [3/249, No. 7177].

According to another version the night did not fall, but that the threshold of his door broke due to the excess of visitors.¹

Eloquence of Qays

Qays was having distinctive qualities in this regard. This leader of the Ansar had expertise in the divine sciences, command over Quran and Sunnah and had recognition of doubtful discourse. That is why Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) used to accord respect to him. When Qays arrived from Egypt, he discussed the conspiracies of Muawiyah with him in detail, because he was well capable of discharging his duties.

He displayed great foresight in times of trouble and he was more clever than the five well known villains of Arabs: Muawiyah, Amr Aas, Qays bin Saad, Mughira and Ibne Adeel. He prepared a great plan during battle and he was also generous and valiant.²

It is mentioned *Seerah Halabiyya* that whoever reads about the conspiracies of Muawiyah and Amr Aas, would be amazed.

Ibne Kathir writes that Ali (a.s.) appointed him as the governor of Egypt and through his intelligence confronted Muawiyah.

Imam Hasan (a.s.) appointed Ubaidullah Ibne Abbas as the commander of 12000 strong army and sent him against Muawiyah and emphatically advised him to take the counsel of Qays.

He used to emerge strong against Muawiyah in every way. When he came back to Medina, Marwan and Aswad threatened Qays. Qays met Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Muawiyah wrote an angry letter to Aswad and Marwan that if you had helped Ali with a hundred thousand experts, I would not have been pained as I am on your role in making Qays meet Ali.

This was what Muawiyah said to his army in Siffeen: In fact, Qays is the orator of Ansar. Every day he delivers a new speech against us. He wants to destroy us, but the God, who granted safety against the army of elephants, has kept us safe.³

We quoted the statement of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) before that Imam Ali (a.s.) said in reply to Qays: His Eminence replied: "By God, you have given a very good advice."

With attention to this statement of His Eminence no further need remains for us and others to mention the praises of Qays.

Piety of Qays

Most expressive discourse about the piety and religiosity of Qays is

¹ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 8:100 [8/108, Events of the year 59 A.H.]

² [The writer has used the Arabic proverb, which means: That person has got the largest share].

³ Ref: *Waqatus Siffeen*, 227-240 [Pg. 445-450].

mentioned by Masudi in *Murujuz Zahab*,¹ and he says:

“From the aspect of piety, religiosity and supporting Ali (a.s.) he was having a great rank. His fear and obedience of Almighty Allah reached to such a position that one day he was praying.

When he was about to prostrate, a huge snake popped up from the place of his prostration. Without any thought Qays prostrated on the side of that snake. The snake entwined around the neck of Qays, but he did not shorten his prayer, till he concluded it. After that he removed the snake from his neck and threw it away.

Hasan bin Ali bin Abdullah bin Mughira has narrated this from Muhammad bin Khallad and Abul Hasan Ali Ibne Moosa Reza (a.s.).”

In the same way, Kishi has also narrated this tradition from Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) in his *Rijal Kishi*.²

Excellence and wisdom of Qays

Speeches, writings, debates and sayings of Qays are widely reported and recorded in books of culture and biography. All testify to his deep divine recognition and his lofty rank about his discernment regarding Quran and Sunnah of the Prophet.

At the end it should be mentioned that he was an important support and pillar of faith.

Death of Qays

Ibne Kathir in his *Tarikh*,³ and numerous other persons have mentioned that Qays died in Medina during the last year Muawiyah’s rule.

الْحَمْدُ لِلّٰهِ وَسَلَامٌ عَلٰى عِبَادِهِ الَّذِينَ اصْطَفَى

“Praise be to Allah and peace on His servants whom He has chosen.”⁴

4. Amr bin Aas

Died: 43 A.H.

وعن سبل الحق لا تعدل	معاوية الحال التجهل
على اهلها يوم لبس الاحلى	كيست احتيالي في جلق
مهاليع كالبقر الجفل	وقد اقبلوا زمرا يهرون

¹ *Murujuz Zahab*, 2:63 [3/27].

² *Rijal Kishi*: 63 [1/309, No. 151].

³ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 8:102 [8/110, Events of Year 59 A.H.]

⁴ Surah Naml 27:59

بغير وجودك لم تقبل
 ورمت النفار الى القسطل
 وفي جيشه كل مستفحلا
 الهل التغى والحجى ابتنى؟
 قتال المفضل بالافضل
 بقولى: دم طل من نعشل
 عليهما المصاحف في القسطل
 لرد الغضنفر المقبيل
 وكفوا عن المشعل المصطلي
 ونحن على دومه الجندي
 وسهين قد خاض في المقتل
 كخلع النعال من الارجل
 كلبس الخواتيم بالنيل
 بلا حدىف ولا منصل
 ورب المقام ولم تكمل
 كسير الجنوب مع الشمال
 كسير الحمير مع المجمل
 كبود لاعظم ما ابتنى
 ولو لا وجودك لم تقبل
 تعاف الخروج من المنزل
 على النبأ الاعظم الافضل
 نزلنا الى اسفل الاسفل
 وصايا مخصوصه في على

وقولى لهم: يعبأوا بالصلاه
 فولوا ولم يعبأوا بالصلاه
 ولما عصيت امام الهدى
 بالبقر الغكم اهل الشام
 فقلت: نعم قم فانى ارى
 قبى حاردوا سيد الاوصيا
 وكدت لهم آن اقاموا الرماح
 وعدة تهم كشف سواتهم
 فقام البغااه على حيدر
 كيسن محاوره الاشعري
 اليين فيطمع في جانبي
 خلعت الخلافه من حيدر
 والبسته فيك بعد الاياس
 ورقىتك المنبر المشيخ
 ولو لم تكن انت من اهله
 وسيرت جيش كفاق العراق
 وسيرت ذكرك في الخافقين
 وجهلك بيابن اكله ال
 فلولا موازرتى لم تطبع
 ولو لاى كنت كمثل النساء
 نصرناك من جهلنا يابن هند
 وحيث رفعناك فوق الروس
 وكم قد سمعنا من المصطفى

يبلغ والرَّكْبُ لَمْ يَرْحُلْ
 ينادي بأمر العزيز العلي
 باولي؛ فقالوا: بلى فافعل
 من الله مستخلف المنشل
 فهذا له اليوم نعم الولي
 لوعاده معادي اخ المرسل
 فقاطعهم بي لم يوصل
 عرى عقد حيد لم تحل
 فمدخله فيكم مدخل
 لف النار في الدرك الاسفل
 من الله في الموقف المخجل
 ويعتز بالله والمرسل
 ونحن عن الحق في معزل
 لك الويل منه غذا كملي
 بعهد عهدهت ولم توفي
 يسير الحطام من الاجzel
 لك الملك من ملك محول
 تزود الظباء عن البنهل
 بصفين مع هولها المهوول
 جذارا من البطل المقبل
 لوافاك كالاسد المبسل
 وصار بك الرحب كالفلفل
 من الفارس الغور المسبيل؛

وفي يوم "خَمْ" رق منبرا
 وفي كفه كفه معلنا
 انت بكم منكم في النفوس
 فانحله امر المؤمنين
 وقال: فمن كنت مولى له
 فوالمواليه ياذا الجلا
 ولا تنقضوا العهد من عترى
 فبخبخ شيخ لما راي
 فقال: وليكم فاحفظوه
 وانا و ما كان من فعلنا
 وما دم عثمان منج لنا
 وان عليا غدا خصينا
 يحاسبنا عن امر وجرت
 فما عندنا يوم كشف الغطا
 الا يابن هندا بعث الجنان
 واحسرت اخر ارك كيما تنا
 واصبحت بالناس حق استفهام
 وكنت كمقتنص في الشراك
 كانك انسىت ليل الهرير
 وقد بدت تذرق ذرق النعام
 وحين ازاح جيوش الضلا
 وقد ضاق منك عليك الخناق
 وقولك: يا عمرو ابن المفر

عسى حيله من عن كنيه
 وشاطرتني كل ما يستقيم
 فقيه على عجلتني رافعا
 فستر عن وجهه وانثنى
 وانت لخوفك من باسه
 ولما ملكت حماه الانام
 منحت لغيري وزن الجبال
 وانحلت مصر العبد الملك
 وان كنت تطبع فيها فقد
 وان لم تسامح الى ردها
 بخيل جياد وشم الانوف
 واكتشف عنك حجاب الغور
 فانك من امرة المؤمنين
 ومالك فيها ولا ذرة
 فان كان بينكم انسبه
 وابن الحصام من نجوم السما
 فان كنت فيها ببلغت المني

فان فوادي في عسل
 من الملك دهرك لم يكمل
 واكتشف عن سواتي اذيلي
 حياً وروعك لم يعقل
 هناك ملئت من الافكل
 ونالت عصاك يد الاول
 ولم تعطني زنه الخردل
 وانت عن الغي لم تعدل
 تخلي القطا من الا جدل
 فاني لحوبكم مصطلي
 وبالمرهفات وبالذيل
 وايقظ نائمه الاشك
 ودعوى الخلافه في معزل
 ولا جدودك بالأول
 فاين الحسام من المنجل
 وابن معاویه من على؟
 ففي عنقى علق الجلجل

1. O Muawiyah, regard my condition; don't fall into ignorance and don't deviate from the path of truth.
2. Have you forgotten the day when you put on the ornaments of kingdom; how you deceived the people of Damascus?
3. How people hastened to you in groups and their cries rose up like those of scared cattle.
4. Have you forgotten that I told them that obligatory prayer without your existence is not acceptable to God.
5. Then they turned their backs to religion and did not care for prayer and I guided this terrified flock towards the dust of war.
6. And the time when you disobeyed and rebelled against the leader of guidance, whereas his was an army of the valiant.
7. You asked: Should I go out to fight the people of piety in company of the inauspicious and evil ones, who are like lost cattle?
8. I said: Yes, arise as I regard fighting against one, whom the Almighty Allah

has given superiority, as the best of acts. 9. It was I, who instigated them, so that they may fight against the chief of successors, Ali (a.s.) on the pretext of avenging the blood of that fool (Uthman). 10. It was I, who taught your army to raise amidst dust, Qurans on points of spears. 11. And I taught your men that if you want to escape the sword of the valiant one, you should expose your genitals. 12. Thus, the sinful oppressors rose up against Haider and from the illuminated torch and warmth-giving guidance were kept away. 13. Have you forgotten how I debated with Abu Moosa Ashari at Domatul Jundal? 14. I speak in a soft tongue so that the opposite side may be fooled into accepting my proposal and I was able to make him agree to what I wanted. 15. Very easily, like removing a sandal, I made Haider give up Caliphate (and removed the cloak of Caliphate from Ali). 16. And like one puts on a finger ring, I awarded Caliphate to you, while you yourself had lost hope of it. 17. I raised you to the pulpit of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) without you sharpening the sword or facing a battle. 18. Even though you were not worthy of this elevation and precedence. 19. And I made an army of hypocrites of Iraq march, which was as if you have joined the north to the south. 20. And it was I, who conveyed your name to far horizons, which was like a donkey carrying a heavy load. 21. O son of Hind, the liver-eater, it is extremely hard for me that you have not recognized me. 22. If I had not been your minister and adviser, people would never have obeyed you. 23. If I had not been there, you would have sat in the house like women, and would not have come out. 24. O son of Hind, we supported you due to our foolishness that you are the great news and the best of men. 25. And when we appointed you as the chief of men, ourselves we sunk to the lowest levels of Hell. 26. Whereas we were aware of the numerous distinctive merits of Ali (a.s.). 27. On the day when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) mounted the pulpit at Ghadeer and delivered the command of God to all, when the caravans had not yet set out from there. 28. He had taken the hand of Ali in his hands and through this showed to everyone and under the command of God called out: 29. O people, do I not have more authority on you than you have on yourself? Yes, they replied, do what you want. 30. Thus, rulership on believers from God became obligatory on them and He is such that He bestows His Caliphate to whoever He likes. 31. And he said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. 32. And he prayed: O Allah, owner of majesty; love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. 33. O people, the covenant which you have made regarding my progeny, do not leave as whoever leaves following them, will not have access to be in the hereafter. 34. When your teacher (Abu Bakr) saw that the knot of Mastership (*Wilayat*) and leadership was not worth tying; he congratulated him saying: Bakhin, Bakhin. 35. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: Ali is your Master (*Wali*) and it is obligatory on you to protect him among yourselves; and conduct with him just as you conducted with me. 36. And we along with our deeds and character will be in the lowest levels of Hell. 37. Tomorrow the

Judgment Day would be the day of shame for us; the blood of Uthman will not get us salvation. 38. **On Judgment Day, Ali would command great respect from God and Messenger; but he would be our enemy.** 39. **At that time Allah, the Mighty and the High due to the circumstances that occurred and the fact that we were away from truth and in the party of falsehood, He would take our account.** 40. **That day when the curtain would be removed from reality, we will not have any excuse. And woe be on you and me in this condition on Judgment Day.** 41. **O son of Hind, before the covenant that you made to me, which you did not fulfill, you have sold off Paradise.** 42. **In order to obtain worldly wealth before the unlimited wealth of the hereafter.** 43. **You began the day and saw people surrounding you and rulership, which came to you from others was not strong.** 44. **You were like a hunter that throws the net and deceives people and remove the thirsty from water stream.** 45. **As if you have forgotten *Lailatul Harir* night in the Battle of Siffen with the terror that it had.** 46. **You were so helpless that due to the fear of the valiant; you soiled your pants like an ostrich.** 47. **When the army of deviation scattered and like a destructive lion they threw you into destruction.** 48. **You fell into such circumstances that the field of the battle became extremely narrow for you.** 49. **You told me: O Amr, where should I flee from the clutches of the powerful army, which surrounds me like flood waters?** 50. **Except that you, O Amr, think of a plan to deceive them. Do something, because I am extremely terrified.** 51. **At that time when your rulership was not complete, you had offered to give me half of whatever you will gain.** 52. **I also rose up and with speed set out on the mission to expose my genitals to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).** 53. **Thus, his modesty made him turn his face away and give up the idea of killing me; and it is something, which does not fit your reasoning.** 54. **But you were shaking like a cane due to the fear of his valor.** 55. **When you managed to obtain rulership, and the specter of rule came into your hands.** 56. **You gave away mountains of wealth and pelf and vast territories to others, but did not give me anything.** 57. **You gave the rule of Egypt to Abdul Malik¹ and this act of yours was nothing, but injustice to me.** 58. **Even though you were very greedy for it (the kingdom of Egypt), but know that the sand-grouse is snatched from the clutches of the eagle (and that kingdom is lost)** 59. **If you do not give kingdom of Egypt and its taxes to me, I am prepared to fight you for it.** 60. **I am ready to battle you with armed soldiers, sharp swords and raised spears.** 61. **I will tear off the curtain of your pride and instigate the orphans, whose fathers were killed at your behest.** 62. **You are distant from rulership over believers and claim of Caliphate.** 63. **You do not have the least right to kingdom and before you, your ancestors also did not have any right.** 64. **O Muawiyah, what relation is possible between you and Ali? Ali is like a wielded sword and you are like a blunt sword.** 65. **Ali, who is like the star of**

¹ Abdul Malik bin Marwan, father of Umayyad Caliphs.

the sky; how he can be compared to you, who is like a speck of dust? 66. O Muawiyah, if you were able to fulfill your wish of rulership, it is because I put on the bell of degradation around my neck (such that if I shake my neck the bell would sound).¹

Explanation

This panegyric (*Qasida*) is famous as *Qasida Juljulia*,² which comprises the matter of a letter which Amr Aas wrote to Muawiyah Ibne Abu Sufyan. He wrote this in reply to the letter of Muawiyah in which he had demanded from him taxes of Egypt, and since Amr hated transferring the monies to Muawiyah, he has condemned the latter in this poem.

In *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*,³ Ibne Abil Hadeed has narrated some couplets of this poem.

Ishaqi says in *Lataiful Akhbaarud Dawl*:⁴ Muawiyah wrote a letter to Amr Aas saying:

“I have written to you many times to transfer the tributes of Egypt to me, but you have not done so. I tell you for the last time and with emphasis to send the taxes of Egypt to me. And peace.”

In reply Amr Aas also wrote a letter to him comprising of the panegyric (*Qasida*) famous as *Qasida Juljulia* and these two couplets are from that poem:

“You do not have the least right to kingdom and before you, your ancestors also did not have any right. O Muawiyah, what relation is possible between you and Ali? Ali is like a wielded sword and you are like a blunt sword.”

When Muawiyah heard these lines, he never argued with Amr again and allowed him to keep the tithes of Egypt to himself. Zanuzi, in the second part of his book of *Riyazul Jannah*, has mentioned the whole poem and commented that:

This poem is named as *Qasida Juljulia* in accordance to its last word.

يَقُولُونَ بِأَفْوَاهِهِمْ مَا لَيْسَ فِي قُلُوبِهِمْ وَاللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ بِمَا يَكْتُمُونَ

“They say with their mouths what is not in their hearts, and Allah best knows what they conceal.”⁵

Introduction to the poet

Amr Aas bin Wael bin Hashim was one of the five most deceitful persons of

¹ Arabic proverb [for a person, who degrades himself and who throws his life in danger among the people. Amr bin Aas says to Muawiyah: I have disgraced myself and for your kingdom have cast my life into danger and I did not refrain from anything so that you may get the kingdom.]; Ref: *Majmaul Amthal*, Maidani: 195 [209/3, No. 3694].

² Amr Aas implies that your kingdom is the result of the disgrace and troubles, which I bought for my life. Or he wants to say: O Muawiyah, it was I, who conveyed you to this position.

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:522 [10/56, Sermon 178].

⁴ *Lataiful Akhbaarud Dawl*: 41 [Pg. 61].

⁵ Surah Aale Imran 3:167

Arabs, who created mischief in order to turn the circumstances in their favor. His expertise in creating mischief is confirmed and well known and his numerous deceptions are recorded in books. Writings, books of history and biography have narrated them.

If you want you speak about excess in corruption and destruction, you can speak about Amr Aas; and whatever you say, you would not have exaggerated, and no sin would be upon you. As we see the statements of senior companions regarding this fellow. Yes, this low caste man without any proper lineage was as such.¹ In any case, we shall analyze his life history from some aspects.

Lineage of Amr Aas

His father was one, about whom the Holy Quran has clearly mentioned that his generations are cut off:

إِنَّ شَائِكَ هُوَ الْكَافِرُ

“Surely your enemy is the one who shall be without posterity.”²

In the exegesis of this verse, such is the view of all scholars and commentators.³

Even though in some exegesis the implication of this verse is uncertain between Amr's father, Abu Jahl, Abu Lahab, Uqbah bin Abi Muit and others, but it can be said that the correct view is what Fakhre Razi has mentioned in the exegesis of this verse. He says:

“Although all those mentioned above condemned the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), but Aas bin Wael (father of Amr) had him insulted most from them. On the basis of this, the holy verse includes all of them; but the degradation mentioned therein with special emphasis for this accursed one. That is why it is well known among exegesist that Aas bin Wael is meant in this verse.”

Senior companion of companions, Sulaym bin Qays Hilali writes in his book:

The holy verse is regarding the named person. He was one of the critics of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). When Ibrahim, the son of Prophet passed away, he said:

“Muhammad has become heirless as he has no more male issues.”⁴

We conclude from this verse: That every son or daughter, who is related to Aas bin Wael, whether Amr Aas or others, are not legitimate born. And the merit

¹ It is an Arabic proverb for one, who has unchaste fathers and who commits evil acts. *Baghl* = mule and *Naghla* = mischief and *fulaano naghlo* means he is having corrupted ancestry. [Majmaul Amthal, 1/185, No. 533].

² Surah Kauthar 108:3

³ Ref: *Tabaqat Ibne Saad*, 1:115 [1/133]; *Maarif*, Ibne Qutaibah 124 [Pg. 285]; *Tareekh Ibne Asakir*, 7/330 [13/493; and *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 19/232].

⁴ Kitab Sulaym bin Qays [2/737, H. 22].

of Amr Aas from the aspect of ancestry is clear from this. In addition to that, his mother is Laila Anzia Jallania.

Laila, his mother was the most well known prostitute of Mecca and she was the cheapest of them. When she gave birth to Amr Aas, five persons, who had shared her bed claimed to be the father of Amr. Since Amr resembled Aas most and Aas paid her most, Laila said that Amr was his issue. When Urvi, daughter of Harith bin Abdul Muttalib came to Muawiyah, she narrated this story.¹

His Eminence, Imam Hasan Mujtaba (a.s.) in the gathering in which Muawiyah and others were present said to Amr Aas:

“As for you O son of Aas. Your lineage is shared and your mother gave birth to you through fornication. Four persons from Quraish² claimed to be your father. And lowest in rank over others emerged victorious and became your father. Later, your he stood up and said: I am one, who condemn Muhammad as childless and Almighty Allah revealed that verse about him.”³

Abu Ubaidah MuAmmaar bin Muthanna, (d.209/211 A.H.) has narrated in the book of *Ansab*:

On the day of the birth of Amr, two people disputed over his parentage: Abu Sufyan and Aas. They said: “Leave the matter to the mother.” She said: “This is the child of Aas bin Wael.”

Abu Sufyan said: “I have no doubt that I placed his seed in your womb,” but she did not accept and chose Aas instead.

When she was told said that the lineage of Abu Sufyan was nobler, she replied: “Aas bin Wael pays more and Abu Sufyan is a miser.”⁴

Amr Aas’ conversion

After referring and reconciling all what is written in history about the conduct, ups and downs of the life of Amr Aas, we conclude that he did not at all accept Islam with sincerity. On the contrary, he only pretended to have accepted Islam, and this was also due to an incident, which confronted him in Abyssinia.

He was sent along with Ammaara bin Walid in order to apprehend Ja’far and his companions, who had been sent there by the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). He went

¹ *Balaghatur Nisa*: 27 [Pg. 43]; *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 1:164 [225/1]; *Rauzatul Manazir*, 8:4 [1/229, Events of the year 60 A.H.]; *Thamaratul Awraq*, 1:132 [Pg. 152]; *Dairatul Maarif*, *Fareed Wajdi* 1:215; *Jumharatul Khatab*, 2:363 [2/382, No. 370].

² In the words of Kalbi and Sibte Ibne Jauzi [*Tadkiratul Khawas*/201]: five persons are mentioned.

³ We have taken this brief part from a lengthy tradition comprising of arguments and condemnation, which took place between Imam Hasan (a.s.) and Amr Aas, Walid bin Uqbah, Utbah bin Abu Sufyan and Mughira bin Shoba in the gathering of Muawiyah. Ibne Abil Hadeed has mentioned this tradition in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:101 [6/291, Sermon 83] quoting from the book *Mafkhirat* of Zubair bin Bakkar. Sibte Ibne Jauzi has also mentioned it in *Tadkira*:114 [Pg. 201].

⁴ *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*, 2:101 [6/285, Sermon 83].

and heard about the prophethood of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), its progress and spread. On the other hand, Najjashi, the ruler of Abyssinia said in rejection of his requests: “Do you want me to hand over to you the messenger of one, on whom the great angel (Jibraeel) descends like he descended on Moosa, and agree to your plea to have him executed?”

Amr had asked: “O king, is he really as such?” He was told: “Woe be on you O Amr, accept my statement and obey him. By God, he is really on truth and definitely he would gain dominance over all his opponents, just as Moosa (a.s.) emerged over Firon and his army men.”¹

All this impelled Amr to gain proximity to the Prophet. In other words, his whole life passed in a show of Islam, his own security and intrigues. He condemned the Prophet in seventy couplets and for each couplet the Prophet cursed him.

Imam Ali (a.s.) composed a couplet regarding him:

“When did Amr not live in the lap of sinners and enemies of Islam. Is it possible that he should not be like his mother?”²

The view of His Eminence (a.s.) was absolutely correct.

He was the implication of the statement of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) that:

“By the God, who split the seed and created the creatures, he (Amr) has only embraced apparent Islam and concealed his disbelief, so that when he meets his companions, he may display his true views.”³

Ibne Abil Hadeed says in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*⁴ that:

My teacher, Abul Qasim Balkhi has narrated a dialogue between Muawiyah and Amr. Muawiyah said: “O Abu Abdullah, I don’t like people saying that you embraced Islam for vested interests.”

Amr said: “Never mind; let the matter rest.”

My teacher says: This statement clearly shows that Amr was an apostate and a disbeliever. ‘Never mind’ shows that he had no faith in Judgment Day; Muawiyah was also like that.

Ibne Abil Hadeed says in another place that:

Our teacher, Abu Abdullah says: The first of those, who believe in the theory of ‘absolute forgiveness’ (*Rajaa Mahez*) were Muawiyah and Amr. They believed that after accepting Islam, no matter how many sins a person may commit, he shall be forgiven.

That is why when Muawiyah was told by a person: “You know well with

¹ *Seerah Ibne Hisham*, 3:319 [3/289] and many other books written on the biography of the Prophet and history.

² *Tadkira Khawasul Aaimma*: 56 [Pg. 97]; *Seeratul Halabiyya* [3/20] and other books.

³ Ref: *Waqatus Sificeen*, Ibne Muzahim: 110.

⁴ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 1:137 & 114, & 2:179 [2/65. Sermon 26, 6/321 & 325, Sermon 83; 7/58, Sermon 92].

whom you have fought and what sins you have committed.”

He replied: “I have confidence in the statement of God:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ يَغْفِرُ الذُّنُوبَ جَمِيعًا

“Surely Allah forgives the faults altogether.”¹

In the same way, Ibne Abi Hadeed says elsewhere:

“As for Muawiyah: He was a sinful man, with scant regard to religion and his deviation for Islam was well known. His friend and supporter, Amr Aas was also like that. Same is the story of all the people, who were lowly, debased, rude and unruly from the folks of Shaam and the ignorant of Arabs, who followed these two. About whom all know that fighting against them was allowed and their killing was lawful.”

Regarding this matter numerous statements are found in reliable books. That the life, soul and reality of this man (Amr Aas) should be made so clear for readers and that he may emerge as a ‘respectable person’ and all his defects also become clear.²

Below we present a sample of these statements:

1. Statement of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

One day Zaid bin Arqam came to Muawiyah and saw Amr Aas seated beside him on a throne. When he observed this, he placed himself between them. Amr Aas asked: “Did you not find any other place?”

Zaid replied: “In one of the battles, in which you two were accompanied with Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), when His Eminence saw you two together, he looked at you with anger. On the second and the third day, when he saw you two together again, he continued to stare at you for a long time. On the third day, he said: Whenever you see Muawiyah and Amr Aas together, you should cause separation between them as they will never unite on anything good.”

In *Waqatus Siffen*,³ Ibne Muzahim has also explained the incident in the above manner. You may also refer to *Iqdul Fareed* of Ibne Abde Rabb.⁴

2. Statement of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

In the book of *Al-Imtaa wal Mawanisa*,⁵ Abu Hayyan Tauhidi has reported that Shobi has narrated as follows:

Amr Aas reminisced about Ali (a.s.) and said: “He is a comical person.”

¹ Surah Zumar 39:53

² The respected author has used the Arabic proverb which means that it gives the information about each and every detail. It is used for a person all of whose defects are known. [*Majmaul Amthal*, 1/420, No. 1258].

³ *Waqatus Siffen*: 112 [Pg. 218].

⁴ *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:290 [4/145].

⁵ Ref: *Al-Imtaa wal Mawanisa*, 3:183 and *Nahjul Balagha* 1:145 [Pg. 115, Sermon 84].

When this was reported to Ali (a.s.), he said:

“The son of the wanton woman thinks that I am a comedian and funny man and that I pass my life in useless pursuits and joviality. Remembrance of death, fear of Judgment Day and accounting restrains man from nonsense. If someone has proper belief, these things serve as lessons to him and they restrain him from such acts. Indeed, lying is the worst kind of discourse and in fact Amr Aas makes a promise and then breaks it. And when he speaks, he lies. The day when the matter becomes difficult, till the time swords do not injure and cut up the bodies of people, he enjoins good and prohibits evil, but with the beginning of battle his greatest deceit in order to save his life is that he exposes his genitals.”¹

3. Letter of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) to Amr Aas

From the servant of Allah, Ali Ameerul Momineen to the one, whose generation are cut off, son of one, whose generations are cut off, Amr bin Aas bin Wael, enemy and ill-wisher of Muhammad and progeny of Muhammad during the period of Ignorance and in Islam.

Peace be on one, who follows the guidance of God. So to say: “Undoubtedly you have subordinated your religion to the worldly power, pomp and wealth provided to you by a person, whose apostatizing and skepticism are not hidden from anybody. He and his ways are known to everybody. He sullies the reputation as well as the character of those, who keep company with him. He tries to deceive sober and sedate people. For the sake of remnants and crumbs of bread left over at his table, you have attached yourself to him.

You are following him like a dog which follows a tiger, frightfully looks at its paws and waits to live upon the refuse, which it leaves of its kill. In this way you have lost your self-respect and honor in this world and your salvation in the next. You have ruined your present and future. Had you followed the true path, you would have secured success in this world as well as in the Hereafter. And peace.”²

Point

Ibne Abil Hadeed³ has quoted the above letter in the same form in *Shark Nahjul Balagha*,⁴ from *Kitabus Siffleen* by Nasr bin Muzahim, but I did not find this point there.

In the same way, if someone pays attention to the majority of the instances, which Ibne Abil Hadeed has quoted, he will conclude that this book, which is presently in our hands is not the actual book, but is a condensed version of what it originally was. The original book was much more than this.

Numerous statements about this man are mentioned in sermons of Ameerul

¹ Sayyid Razi in *Nahjul Balagha*, 1:145 [Pg. 115, Sermon 84] has narrated in another form.

² *Nahjul Balagha*, Letter 39.

³ Dr. Ahmad Zaki Sifwat has also quoted this letter in *Jamhuratur Rasail*, 1:486 [No. 454].

⁴ *Shark Nahjul Balagha*, 4:61 [16/163, Letter 39].

Momineen (a.s.); like for instance, he says:

“Son of the wanton woman, enemy of God, and helper of the enemy of God, has gone to Egypt.”

Or the statement of His Eminence: “The transgressors have conquered Egypt. The leaders of oppression and injustice, who prevent people from the path of God and who deviate them from Islam.”¹

4. Qunut of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) cursing Amr

Tabari in his book of *History*,² says:

“Ali recited in the Qunut of morning prayer: O God, curse Muawiyah, Amr, Abul Awar Salmi, Habib, Abdur Rahman bin Khalid, Zahhak bin Qays and Walid.”

When this was reported to Muawiyah, he also cursed Ali, Ibne Abbas, Malik Ashtar, Hasan and Husain.

5. Ayesha condemns Amr

When the news of the assassination of Muhammad bin Abu Bakr reached Ayesha, she lamented and bemoaned in excess. And from that time, in the Qunut and after prayer, she cursed Muawiyah and Amr Aas.

Tabari³ and Ibne Kathir⁴ have mentioned this in their books of history; as well Ibne Athir in *Al-Kamil fit Tarikh*,⁵ and Ibne Abil Hadeed in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*.⁶

6. Conversation between Muawiyah and Amr Aas

When Muawiyah realized that if Amr Aas does not pay allegiance to him, his rule will not be stable. So he told him:

“O Amr, remain with me and follow me.”

Amr replied: “Why should I remain under your command? For the hereafter? By God, you are away from the hereafter! Or for the sake of the world? And that also by God, will not fall into your share till you don’t make me your partner.”

He said: “I do that. Be my partner in the world.”

Amr said: “Then write for me the command of Egypt and neighboring areas.”

Muawiyah did that and at the end added: “In return of this, Amr will obey me absolutely.”

¹ *Tareekh Tabari*, 6:61 & 62 [5/107 & 108, events of year 38 A.H.].

² *Tareekh Tabari*, 6:61 & 62 [5/107 & 108, events of year 38 A.H.].

³ *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 6:60 [5/105, events of year 38 A.H.].

⁴ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7:314 [7/349, Events of Year 38 A.H.].

⁵ *Al-Kamil fit Taareekh*, 3:155 [2/413, events of year 38 A.H.].

⁶ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:33 [6/88, Sermon 67].

Amr said: "Also mention that this obedience of Amr will in no way reduce his power in Egypt."

Muawiyah said: "People do not pay attention to this point."

Amr replied: "Never mind that. Just mention it."

So Muawiyah wrote it down and by God, he had no option, except to write what Amr wanted.

One day Muawiyah and Amr were talking about Egypt. Amr said: "I sold my religion to you only for the rulership of Egypt."

At that moment Utbah bin Abu Sufyan entered and said: "Rely on this man for the sake of your religion, because he is a companion of Prophet."

And Amr wrote in a letter to Muawiyah: "Muawiyah, till I don't get anything in return of my religion, I will not hand it over to you. You can do whatever you like. Religion and the world are not equal and I have covered my head. I will take what you give me. If you give Egypt to me, it is a transaction of usury as against it you will get the counsel of an old man expert in intrigue."¹

'Valor' of Amr Aas

I didn't find any trace of valor or feat from the son of the wanton woman, whether during the period of Ignorance or during prophethood of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.); but during the Battle of Sifteen, only two of his antics are memorable. One of them was while fearing for his life, he exposed his genitals to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). Another was that he fled from the attack of Malik Ashtar. The humiliation of his first act remained with him for a long time in such a way that it became proverbial and people used to taunt him. Utbah bin Abu Sufyan in his couplets says regarding his degradation:

"Except for Amr that the testicles protected his life. He was saved while his heart was terrified of that situation."²

Muawiyah also, in his couplets reminded Amr of his true status.

"Amr bin Aas bin Wael (Waelli) faced Abul Hasan, Ali in the battlefield and he returned humiliated. If he had not exposed his genitals, the valiant one would have apprehended him as he humiliated every fighter."

In his couplet, Amir Abu Faras has mentioned:

"There is nothing good in that a person should fend off death through humiliation as one day Amr escaped death by exposing his genitals."

And this act was committed by this person many a times.

On the basis of this, the statement of Ibne Hajar in *Isabah*³ is of no value when he says:

¹ *Iqdul Fareed*, 2:291 [144/4].

² [According to Nasr bin Muzahim in *Waqatus Sifteen*: 418 this line is part of an elegy, which Walid bin Uqbah composed on the retreat of Amr Aas from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).]

³ *Al-Isabah*, 3:2

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) made Amr Aas proximate to himself due to his divine recognition and valor.

Glancing through history, we conclude that Amr Aas was not the first, who due to the fear of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), committed this act. He only imitated Talha bin Abi Talha in this. He also, during the Battle of Uhud, when Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) attacked in his direction, had became certain that he would be slain by him, so he exposed his genitals. For more detail one can refer to *Tarikh of Ibne Kathir*.¹

Halabi has also mentioned this incident in his *Seeratul Halabiyya*.² After that he says:

“This incident occurred with our master, Imam Ali (a.s.) twice during the Battle of Siffen. The first time, it involved Busr bin Artat and the second time, Amr bin Aas. When he saw that he would be slain, he exposed his genitals and Ali (a.s.) turned his face away.”

Lesson in religion and morals

It is clear for researchers that all evils and corruptions mentioned in authentic history regarding Amr Aas and the negative qualities and acts included: Cheapness, deviation, deceit, trickery, fraud, cheating, wantonness, breaking oaths, lying, going back on ones word, breaking off relations, malice, shamelessness, jealousy, show off, miserliness, abusing, foolishness, injustice, quarrelling, flattery, greed, enmity to Muslims, shamelessness regarding his wife and other defects of character and immoral traits.

All this shows that he was a hypocrite and lacked steadfastness on Islam, faith in God and commands of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.); because the self of man should be imbued with morals and positive traits; so that excellences may gather in him. Islam truly is the basis of every positive quality and human nobility. When faith flows from the capital of the human body, that is from heart or soul to other organs and occupies that organ, reformation of selves occurs through Islamic laws.

Explanation

Faith in the kingdom of human body, which includes all physical parts and organs is like laws of kingdoms in territories in form of particular persons. Just as laws in a kingdom are spread among the people and every person carries a particular responsibility, which he has to discharge in any case. And he observes particular limits and gradually one by one person who is reformed and has carried out the responsibility, the whole human society would be reformed and guidance and progress in the kingdoms would be obtained through this.

In the same way, faith acts in the kingdom of existence. Faith is also a set of laws framed for each and every organ and physical part and Quran clearly

¹ Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya, 4:20.

² Seeratul Halabiyya, 2:247 [2/223].

declares that each of them is having a particular duty and a specific task according to divine practice. If each organ acts according to its duty and observes limits, reform takes place. The duty of heart is different from that of the tongue. In the same way, ears, eyes, hands, feet and other organs, have a particular function and according to the Holy Quran the eyes, ears and the heart would be interrogated:

إِنَّ السَّمْعَ وَالْبَصَرَ وَالْفُؤَادُ كُلُّ أُولَئِكَ كَانُوا عَنْهُ مَسْوُلُّونَ ﴿١٧﴾

“Surely the hearing and the sight and the heart, all of these, shall be questioned about that.”¹

The same explanation is understood from the statement of the Prophet mentioned in a report, which Hafiz Ibne Majah has narrated in his *Sunan*².

“Faith implies recognition from the heart, confession by tongue and act through the limbs and organs.”³

That is why faith is having different levels and ranks: weak and strong; more and less. And man at one and the same time is having faith as well as lacking it; because it is proved for him from one aspect and disproved for him from another aspect.

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) means to say: “At the moment the fornicator is involved in the act, he does not have faith. At the moment the thief is involved in theft, he does not have faith. At the moment the drunkard is involved in drinking, he does not have faith.”⁴

On the basis of this, reformation of the kingdom of the body is alone possible if all organs are healthy and fulfill their duties.

In the same way, that non-existence of faith in every organ shows weakness of faith in the heart and signifies that Islam is uncertain in the heart of this person – because heart is the commander of the body and all organs operate under its supervision and command. Qualities of the self are also as such. Some spiritual qualities comprise of strength of the faith of the heart and some expose its weakness.

A report, which Hafiz Mundhiri has mentioned in the book of *At-Targheeb wa Tarheeb*⁵ from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) mentions the same point:

“A person is a believer, but there is something in his behavior and morals, which reduce his faith.”

Some qualities are accompanied by hypocrisy, and which do not separate from it and do not gather with faith, even though its owner may be fulfilling his

¹ Surah Isra 17:36

² *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 1:35 [1/25, Vol. 65].

³ The report is narrated in the same words from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in *Nahjul Balagha*, [Pg. 508, Saying 227].

⁴ The report is narrated by Muslim [*Saheeh Muslim*, 1/108, H. 100, Kitabul Imaan] and others.

⁵ *At-Targheeb wa Tarheeb*, 3:171 [3/114. H. 36].

duties like prayers and fasts, as the Almighty Allah has defined the hypocrites in the Holy Quran.

Death of Amr Aas

According to the prevalent view among historians, Amr Aas died in the year 43 A.H. on the eve of Eidul Fitr and he lived for around ninety years. Ajili has mentioned his age as ninety-nine years.

Yaqubi has mentioned in his history:¹

“When the death of Amr approached, he said to his son: Your father desired to have been killed in the Battle of Zatul Salasil². I did something about which I don’t know what excuse I will give to Almighty Allah.”

After that he glanced at his vast wealth and said: ‘Alas, if this wealth of mine had been in the form of a camel. And alas, if I had only died thirty years ago. I enhanced the world of Muawiyah and corrupted my religion. I chose the world over the hereafter. I was blind with regard to the path of guidance. Now when my death has approached, I can see that Muawiyah would soon take away my wealth and ill treat you after me.’”

Point

The name of Amr’s father according to many companions, is mentioned as Aasi. In the couplet of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) also it is as such.

“I will make seventy thousand persons to enter upon disobedient (Aasi), son of disobedient (Aasi).”

It is mentioned in the war poem (*Rajaz*) that Malik Ashtar used to recite:

“Woe be on you, O son of Aas. Go away to a far off place.”

Hafiz Nawawi says in the book of *Tahzibul Asma wal Lughat*³:

Famous scholars believe that this word was with ‘ya’ and eloquent language in view of experts of Arabic literature is this only...but in many books of jurisprudence, traditions and other books, it is mentioned with the omission of ‘ya’ (Aas). Although it is also linguistically correct.

¹ *Tareekh Yaqubi*, 2:198 [2/222].

² [In 8 A.H. the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) sent a battalion under the command of Amr Aas to Zatul Salasil and after that he sent another battalion to assist them, which included Abu Bakr and Umar and who were under the command of Abu Ubaidah. All of them gathered under the banner of Amr Aas, but they were unable to achieve anything. After a number of times, when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) sent battalions under the command of other than Ali (a.s.) they returned defeated. After which he sent a force under the command of Ali (a.s.) to Zatul Salasil, who defeated the enemies and Surah Adiyat was revealed.

This battle is known as Zatul Salasil, because Ali (a.s.) rendered a terrible defeat to the enemy, killing some of them and taking the rest as prisoners. They were tied to each other and seemed to be a chain. Ref: *Kanzul Ummaal* 10/564, *Sharh Muslim*, Nawawi, 15/153; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed 6/41-42; *Tafseer Majmaul Bayan*, 10/422; *Behaarul Anwaar*, 21/26].

³ *Tahzeebul Asma wal Lughat*, 2:30 [2/30, No. 18].

5. Muhammad Himyari

1. I am aloof from the degraded persons, who were inimical to Ali (a.s.) and who fought against him. 2. They forgot that Ali (a.s.) is the best of the creatures who, on day of Ghadeer Khum was appointed for Mastership (*Wilayat*) by Almighty Allah at the hands of the Prophet. 3. Till I rub in dust, the nose of one, who criticizes my statement about Ali, I will say: the excellence of Ali (a.s.) is like a limitless ocean. 4. I am aloof from those, who (usurped his right and) delayed his Caliphate; because he had precedence over all in this position. 5. Ali (a.s.) is one, who defeated the stalwarts when they saw the lightning of the sword in his hands.

Explanation of the couplets

Shaykhul Islam, Hamwaini has mentioned this panegyric in chapter sixty-eight of his book of *Faraidus Simtain*¹ and he says:

Taramma Tai came to Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan along with Hisham Muradi and Muhammad bin Abdullah Himyari. He placed a purse of gold before them and said:

“O poets of Arab, recite couplets regarding Ali Ibne Abi Talib and don’t mention anything, except the truth. I am not from the lineage of Sakhr bin Harb if I don’t give this purse of gold to one, who recites couplets about Ali.”

Taramma arose and recited a poem criticizing Ali. Muawiyah said: “Sit down, God is aware of your intention and status.”

After that Hisham Muradi rose up and spoke negatively about His Eminence. Muawiyah said: “You may also take a seat besides your friend as God knows your status and ranks.”

Amr Aas was present in the gathering. He and Muhammad bin Abdullah Himyari were among his special confidants. He said to Abdullah: “Arise and recite, but don’t mention any falsehood.”

Then he turned to Muawiyah and said: “O Muawiyah, you promised that you would give this purse of gold only to one, who mentions only truth about Ali.”

Muawiyah repeated: “Yes, I will not be from the lineage of Sakhr bin Harb, if I don’t give it to one, who speaks about the merits of Ali.”

Thus, Muhammad bin Abdullah Himyari rose up and recited the above lines. Muawiyah said:

“You are the more truthful of all. This purse is yours.”

Introduction to the poet

Muhammad bin Abdullah Himyari was the friend and companion of Amr Aas. It is possible that he was the son of Qaazi Abdullah bin Muhammad

¹ *Faraaezus Simtain* [1/375, H. 305].

Himyari, to whom Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan had entrusted the office of seals.

According to Jaishiyari in the book of *Al-Wuzra wal Kuttab*,¹ it was Qaazi. Although I think it is most likely that the composer of the above couplets is Abdullah, father of Muhammad himself. In books of history, the name of his father, which is Muhammad, precedes his own name, Abdullah and has become same as the name of his father.

Muawiyah had established the ministry of seals. Ibne Taqtaqi says regarding this in the book of *Al-Aadab was Sultania*:²

“It means that it was a ministry and office of vicegerents of Caliph, and whenever a letter was issued regarding an ordinance this letter was brought to the ministry and it was multiplied and a copy of it remained in the department. Then it was wrapped in cotton and sealed with candle and seal wax. As during our period this process is carried out with legal documents and that copy is sealed with the seal of the officer of the department.”

¹ Al-Wuzra wal Kuttab :15 [Pg. 24].
² *Al-Aadabus Sultania* : 78 [Pg. 107].

Poets of Ghadeer in the second century Hijri

6. Kumayt bin Zaid
7. Sayyid Ismail bin Muhammad Himyari
8. Abdi Sufyan bin Musab Kufi

6. Abu Mustahal Kumayt

Born 60 A.H.

Died: 126 A.H.

1. Night vigils have deprived your eyes from sleep; tears and painful sorrows have taken shelter in the heart, such that joys have become forgotten things. 2. Excess of grief has caused floods in the eyes. All sorrows of the world are included in it and tears rain as if water is being poured from huge buckets. 3. All this is there, because they lost the most generous and valiant one of Quraish and they have lost his intercession. 6. In the view of the Beneficent God, he openly announced the seven oft-repeated verses¹ (Surah Hamd) to people and for him (the Prophet) Abul Hasan was equal and chosen one. 7. Maula Ali was heedless of his pleasures and was always striving for the pleasure of his creator. 8. The Prophet chose him in such a way that he honored Ali in the presence of his detractors. 9. Alas, that day amidst the cluster of thick trees, the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali was announced. 10. Alas, if he had also been obeyed. But people broke the pledge of Mastership (*Wilayat*). I have not seen such a dangerous transaction. 11. I do not curse them, but the first one committed a very dirty trick. 12. More than him was second one; who was his fast friend and the one, who guarded his acts (he was also destroyed). 13. Those, who were their leaders and who were most steadfast in turmoil. 14. They ignored his rights and staged a rebellion giving proof of their infidelity. 15. Tell Bani Umayyah and its power that if you fear your sword and lash. 16. Yes, I am fed up of such a time in which in your obedience I am forced to assent. 17. May God starve one, whom you fed and feed the one, whom you starved. 18. God Almighty openly curses the first member² of this gamble (Muawiyah); if he rules upon the people and *Khali*.³ 19. And the disowned son (Walid bin Abdul Malik), who ruled against the evergreen Hashemite politics. 20. Bani Hashim were stalwarts in the field of the battle, whom no one in the world could defeat. 21. And regarding the reform of Ummah and its defense, they were worthiest and in times of famine, they were like the signs of abundant blessings.

¹ [Saba Mathani: Almighty Allah says in Surah Hijr: “*And certainly We have given you seven of the oft-repeated (verses) and the grand Quran.*” (Surah Hijr 15:87). Surah Hamd is called ‘seven oft-repeated verses’ because it is recited in every unit of prayer. It is called as ‘mathani’, because it is comprised of divine praise.

² Ten pronged arrow of the period of Ignorance for drawing lots [Qadah Ashra], which granted one portion to one who draws it. Here it implies Ibne Muljim, killer of Ali (a.s.). It is also used in the meaning of rare and extraordinary.

³ The dictionary meaning of Khalee is: to be sidelined and divested and dismissed. This term is mostly used for caliphs like Yazid, Abdul Malik, Walid bin Yazid bin Abdul Malik and a poet, named Husain bin Zahhak...and it is said that: In this couplet Abdul Malik is implied, who was caliph of Kumayt’s time. And perhaps it implies the tyrant rulers of that time, that is Bani Umayyah.

Explanation regarding the verses

This panegyric is the best poetical composition of Kumayt – famous as Hashimiyyat – and as the author of the book, *Al-Hadaiqul Wurdiya*¹ has clarified, it comprises of 587 couplets, but dishonest hands worked upon it and expunged a large number of lines from it. Like in case of other poets like Hassan, Farazdaq and Abu Nuwas and others.

Alas, if someone had exposed these crimes. This panegyric was printed in Leiden in 1904, containing 536 couplets. Along with the commentary of Ustad Muhammad Shakir Khayyat it had 560 couplets and with the commentary of Ustad Rafei, only 548 couplets remain.

Qasida of Ainiyya from Hashimiyyat

Shaykh Mufeed writes² in his treatise on the meaning of *Maula*:

“Kumayt is from those poets, whose couplets are understood through the Holy Quran to understand the meaning of Maula and scholars declare his absolute command on eloquence, lexicology and poetry.” They say:

وَيَوْمَ الدُّوْلَةِ دُوْلَةٌ غَدِيرٌ خَمْ أَبَانَ لِهِ الْوَلَايَةُ لَوْ اطَّبِعَا

‘He declared his Mastership (*Wilayat*) on the great day of Ghadeer Khum, but only if they had obeyed!’

Through the tradition of Ghadeer, the Imamate of Ali (a.s.) becomes obligatory and from the word of Maula, is proved his Islamic leadership. If the mentioned meaning of the word of Maula had not been explained, an expert of language like Kumayt, would never have used it in that sense – because if it were allowed for Kumayt, it were allowed for others as well and in this manner there would have been no use of lexicology and limiting only to the actual meanings of the words.

Shaykh Abul Fath writes in his *Tafseer*:³

It is narrated from Kumayt that he said: I saw Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in dream and he said:

“Recite your Qasida Ainiyya for me. “So I recited till:

وَيَوْمَ الدُّوْلَةِ دُوْلَةٌ غَدِيرٌ خَمْ أَبَانَ لِهِ الْوَلَايَةُ لَوْ اطَّبِعَا

‘He declared his Mastership (*Wilayat*) on the great day of Ghadeer Khum, but only if they had obeyed!’

His Eminence (a.s.) said: “You said the truth.”

Then he recited as follows:

¹ Al-Hadaiqul Wurdiya [2/200].

² A treatise on the meanings of Maula published in the writings of Shaykh Mufeed [8/18].

³ Tafseer Abul Fath Raazi, 2:193 [4/280].

وَلَمْ أَرْ مِثْلَ ذَلِكَ الْيَوْمَ يُومًا وَلَمْ أَرْ مِثْلَهُ حَقًا أَضْعِيَا

“I have not seen any day like that day and have not seen any right like what has been trespassed upon.”

Marzabani has mentioned in *Mojamus Shuara*¹:

“Faith of Kumayt in Shiaism and praise of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) was famous during the period of Bani Umayyah and among his couplets about Bani Umayyah are the following:

وَانْخَفَتْ الْمَهْنَدُ وَالْقَطْبِيَا

فَقَلَ لِبْنَى امِيَّهٖ حِيثُ حَلَوَا

وَاشْبَعَ مِنْ بَجُورٍ كَمْ أَجِيَا

اجْعَلَ اللَّهُ مِنْ أَشْبَعَتِيْوَهَا

“Tell the Bani Umayyah and its power that if you fear your sword and lash. Yes I am fed up of such a time in which in your obedience I am forced to assent. May God starve one, whom you fed and feed the one you starved.”

It is narrated that when Kumayt recited this Qasida for Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.), His Eminence prayed for him.

It is mentioned in the book of *As-Siratul Mustaqeem*² by Bayazi Amili:

The son of Kumayt has narrated that he saw the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in dream that he was saying:

“Recite Qasida Ainiyya of your father.”

When he reached the following verse:

“Alas, that day amidst the cluster of thick trees, the Mastership (Wilayat) of Ali was announced.”

His Eminence wept bitterly and said:

“May Almighty Allah have mercy on your father; he was right. Yes, by God, I have not seen any right, which has been trespassed like this.”

Hashemiyat

Masudi, *Murujuz Zahab*,³ has attributed this Qasida to Kumayt and Sandubi⁴ has written that:

“Kumayt was among the best poets from the period of the Umayyad rule. He was an expert on Arabic lexicon and historical events and his best and most important poems are Hashimiya Qasidas, Qasidas in which the Ahle Bayt (a.s.) of the Prophet are mentioned in lofty and reverential terms.”

¹ *Mojamus Shuara*: 348 [Pg. 239].

² *As-Siratul Mustaqeem* [1/310].

³ *Murujuz Zahab*, 2:194 [3/253].

⁴ In his addenda to *Al-Bayan wat Tabayyan* of Jahiz [1/54].

Qasida Maimiya from Qasida Hashemiya

من لقب متيهم مستهامت غير ماصبود ولا احلام

“There is nothing in this aggrieved and lonely heart, except love and hope.”

Saayed, the slave of Kumayt says: We came to Abu Ja’far, Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) and Kumayt recited this Qasida before the Imam and His Eminence said twice:

اللهم اغفر للكمبيت اللهم اغفر للكمبيت

“O God, forgive Kumayt.”¹

Qasida Baiyya from the Hashimiya Qasidas

طربت وما شوقاً إلى البيض اطرب
ولا لعباً مني وذو الشيب يلعب

“I am elated, but my elation is not due to the love of beauties. Neither am I fond of games, although even the elderly like fun and games.”

In his book of *Aghani*,² Abul Faraj has narrated through his chains of narrators from Ibrahim bin Saad Asadi that he said:

I heard my father say: I saw the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in dream; he asked: “Who are you?”

I replied: “An Arab.”

He said: “I know that. From what clan of Arabs?”

I replied: “From Bani Asad clan.”

He asked: “Are you from Bani Asad from Bani Khuzaima? Are you Hilali?”

“Yes,” I said.

He asked: “Do you know Kumayt?”

“Yes, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), I do. He is my uncle and a member of my clan.”

He asked: “Do you remember his verses?”

“Yes,” I replied.

He said: “Recite the lines:

طربت وما شوقاً إلى البيض اطرب
ولا لعباً مني وذو الشيب يلعب

‘I am elated, but my elation is not due to the love of beauties. Neither am I fond of games, although even the elderly like fun and games.’

¹ *Al-Aghani*, 15:123 [17/27].

² *Al-Aghani*, 15:124 [17/29]; also refer to *Mahaud Tansis*, by Abbasi, 2/27 [3/95, No. 148].

So I recited the poem till I reached the lines:

‘I am not, but a Shia of the progeny of Muhammad. And I have no way (belief) except the path of truth.’

Then he said: “In the morning convey greetings to him and say: Indeed, Almighty Allah has forgiven you for the sake of this Qasida.”

Suyuti has mentioned in his *Sharb*:

Ibne Asakir¹ has narrated from Jahiz: Kumayt was the one, who opened the path of protest for the Shia saying:

“If Fadak had not been deserving for a tribe other than them, then indeed the near kindred of the Prophet were most deserving and rightful for Caliphate. They say that the Prophet did not leave any heir. If he did not leave any heir, other tribes should also be given shares in his estate.”

Shaykh Mufeed has replied to this statement of Jahiz that before Kumayt, even in the period following the period of the Prophet, the Shia had raised protests. Perhaps Jahiz was unaware of that or perhaps through his statement, he wants to deny the existence of Shia during the period of Prophet, but history would respond to this audacity fully.

There are a large number of verses of companions and companions of companions since the time when Kumayt was not even born. Among them being Khuzaima Zu-Shahadatain, Abdullah Ibne Abbas, Fazal Ibne Abbas, Ammaar Yasir, Abu Zar Ghiffari etc. And before everyone else, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) completely opened this door in his letters and sermons, having this issue and numerous books contain these sermons and letters.

Qasida Lamiya from the Qasida Hashimiya

الاَهْلُ عَمِّ فِي رَأْيِهِ مُتَامِلٌ وَهُلْ مُدَبِّرٌ بَعْدَ الْاسَّائِهِ مُقْبَلٌ

“Know that one, who is blind in his view, would he contemplate? Would someone, after his destructions, return to truth?”²

In his book of *Aghani*,³ Abul Faraj has narrated from Abu Bakr Hadhrami that:

Kumayt met Abu Ja’far Muhammad bin Ali during the days of Tashreeq (11, 12 and 13 Zilhajj) in Mina.

Kumayt said: “May I be sacrificed on you, I have composed some verses which I would like to recite before you.”

Imam (a.s.) said: “Kumayt, remember God these days.”

When Kumayt insisted, the Imam had pity on him and accorded permission.

¹ Tareekh Madinatul Damishq [14/599; Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, 21/215].

² *Sharh Shawahidul Mughni*: 14 [1/38, No. 6]; and Shaykh Mufeed has mentioned the statement of Jahiz in *Fusulul Mukhtara*, 2:84 [Pg. 232].

³ *Al-Aghani*, 15:126 [17/33].

So Kumayt recited his poem till he reached the lines:

يُصِيبُ بِهِ الرَّامُونَ عَنْ قَوْسٍ غَيْرِهِمْ فِي آخِرِ اسْدِي لِهِ الْغَيْرُ اُولُ

“Archers, who shoot from the bow of others. Curse on the last of them, who created the atmosphere of destruction for the first one.”

Imam (a.s.) raised his hands up to the heavens and said:

“O God, forgive Kumayt.”

Baghdadi has narrated this report in *Khazanatul Adab*¹ and after that is mentioned: “Hundreds began to wail.”

When he recited his verses regarding Imam Husain (a.s.):

“As if I see Husain (a.s.) and his excellent companions surrounding him, ready to sacrifice their lives through their swords. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is missing from among them and his absence has become a painful calamity for all. I don’t find anyone more deserving than Husain, to rescue him from loneliness.”

Imam (a.s.) raised his hands in prayers and said:

“O Allah, forgive Kumayt his past and future sins, the apparent and the concealed and bestow him till he is satisfied.”

Then he presented him with a thousand Dinars and a robe. Kumayt said: “By God, I am devoted to you not for the sake of material wealth, otherwise, I would have gone to those, who own wealth. I am devoted to you for the sake of the hereafter. I will take the dress by way of auspiciousness, but I will not take the money.”

Introduction to the poet

Abi Mustahal Kumayt bin Zaid bin Khunais bin...bin Mudar bin Nazar.

Abu Faraj has mentioned regarding him:

He was a great poet and an expert of lexicology. He had command over the history of Arabs. He was a sharp poet of Egypt and was prejudiced against Qahtanis. He was well aware of the defects of poets and familiar with the ups and down of poetry. He spent his life during the reign of Bani Umayyah and did not witness the period of Bani Abbas. He passed away before Bani Abbas came to power. The Hashimiyat of Kumayt was well known.

Maaz Hara was asked: “Who is the greatest poet?”

He asked in reply: “Poet of the Jahiliyya or Islamic period?”

He was asked to first mention a poet of the Jahiliyya period. Maaz said: “Imrul Qays, Zuhair, Ubaid Ibnul Abras.”

Then he was asked: “Who the greatest from the Islamic period?”

Maaz replied: “Farazdaq, Jarir, Akhtal, Raayi.”

¹ *Khazanatul Adab*, 1:70 [1/145].

He was asked: “Why didn’t you mention Kumayt?”

Maaz replied: “He was the greatest from the ancient as well as the later poets.”¹

Also, Farazdaq said to him: “By God, you are the greatest from the past as well as the present poets.”

And some people have said:

Kumayt had ten such qualities, which no poet possessed: He was the orator of Bani Asad, Shia jurisprudent, memorizer of Quran, a good calligrapher, expert of genealogy, a good Shia debater,² expert archer of Bani Asad, excelled by no one else, expert horse rider and religious charity giver.³

Kumayt and his religious life

A researcher of biography clearly finds that this man from the field of loyalty, in devotion to the family of Prophet was never greedy for material wealth. Neither did he resort to flattery in order to seek rewards. He never took the recompense of his poems in material riches. He did not try to seek posts or ranks in exchange for his discourse. How it was possible? Because according to Dibil:

“Their share of booty was distributed among other and they remained deprived. Like them, their Shia were also boycotted, driven out of their homes. As if they had committed some unforgivable crime.”

If any religious minded person was concerned about world or wealth, he would have to present himself before the Umayyad regime, which had seized the rule through unlawful manner. In that case, a loyal person like Kumayt can be expected to come to the door of Bani Umayyah, who utilized fear to compel the Shia to roam the deserts. That is why we see that his heart was only attached to Aale Muhammad (a.s.) and absolutely unconcerned with others, because he believed that Aale Muhammad (a.s.) are means of his salvation in the court of Almighty Allah and loving them was the great recompense of prophethood.

Imams of religion and the senior members of Bani Hashim insisted on Kumayt to accept their rewards and presents. In addition to the fact that they regarded his rank from Mastership (*Wilayat*) to be great and had more attention towards his respect and accorded exceeding honor to him. They also sought excuse from him; like for example, Imam Sajjad (a.s.) said:

“We are helpless to recompense you for your verses of praise, but God is not helpless.”

But he insisted in not accepting the gifts and instead asked for a used garment, and through this act, expressed his sincere devotion to Aale Muhammad (a.s.). He returned 400000 dirhams to Imam Sajjad (a.s.) and begged for a robe of

¹ *Al-Aghani*, 15:115 & 127 [17/3 & 35].

² Wrongfulness attribution to Kumayt was mentioned previously.

³ *Khazanatul Adab*, 1:69 [1/144]; *Sharh Shawahidul Mughni*: 13 [1/38, No. 6].

the Imam, in order to seek auspiciousness from it.

He returned to Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) 100000 once and another time 50000 coins and asked for a used dress of the Imam. He also returned a thousand dinars and a dress and instead asked him for a dress, which had been in contact with his body.

Kumayt and the supplications of the Imams in his favor

It is clear that prayer of the one, who is having a pure soul, and who is owner of a tongue, which speaks only according to divine contingency and by the will of God, except that Almighty Allah send revelation to them. Other than that they do not utter a single word. They don't speak a single word according to their own will and wish. They will not intercede for anyone, except those whom Almighty Allah allows.

An ordinary intercession and request for well being from the Maula for every person, no matter who that may be, is not there. On the contrary, it is a hint in these supplications that that person for whom supplication is made is from the elders of faith.

There are very few persons for whom so many have prayed, as in the case of Kumayt. And the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and the Imams from his progeny have prayed for him in excess. Thus, once the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) prayed for mercy on him and the second time sought a goodly reward for God and praised him. The third time, he told him:

“You and your people (Bani Asad) are blessed.”¹

Imam Sajjad, Zainul Abideen (a.s.) prayed for him and said: “O God, keep him fortunate while alive and make him die a martyr and reward him in this world and bestow exceeding rewards in the hereafter.”

Abu Ja’far Baqir (a.s.) prayed for him on different occasions, like the *Tashreeq* days² in Mina and at other times. He had faced the Kaaba many times to seek divine forgiveness and mercy for him. Once he said:

“May you always be supported by Ruhul Quds.”

Among this supplications for Kumayt during the Ayyamul Baydh³ is one narrated by Shaykh Abul Qasim Khazzaz Qummi in his book of *Kifayatul Athar*⁴ through his chains of narrators from Kumayt.

He said: I entered the presence of my master, Abu Ja’far, Muhammad and

¹ Ref: *As-Siratul Mustaqeem*, Bayazi Amili, [1/310]; *Al-Aghani*, 15:124 [17/27]; *Sharh Shawahidul Mughni*: 13 [1/38, No. 6].

² Three days following the 10th of Zilhajj.

³ 13th, 14th and 15th of the lunar month.

[*Ayyame Bayz*: The thirteenth, fourteenth and fifteenth of every month. They are called as such because on these dates the moon shines brightly all night. Fasting during these days is especially recommended. Ref: *Al-Hadaiqul Nazira*, 13/361; *Jawahirul Kalam*, 17/94-97; *Farhang Fiqhe Farsi*, 1/740-741].

⁴ *Kifayatul Athar* [Pg. 248].

Ali, Imam Baqir (a.s.) and said: "O son of Allah's Messenger (s.a.w.a.), I have composed a poem in your honor, do you permit me to recite it?"

He said: "These are Ayyamul Baydh."

I said: "These verses are only regarding you."

He said: "Recite them." So I began to recite.

"The times make me weep and laugh and days having transition and variety (I weep) for the nine persons, who were left alone on the land of Taff (Kerbala) and all of them were placed in graves and shrouds."

His Eminence (a.s.) and Abu Abdullah [Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.)] lamented and I heard a girl lament from behind the curtain. When I reached the following couplet:

"And the six persons, whose equal no one can be; sons of Aqil, who were the best of riders. Then Ali, who is the best, was their master. And their remembrance has made me extremely aggrieved."

His Eminence (a.s.) lamented and said: "There is no one, who remembers us, or we are mentioned before him, and tears come out from his eyes equal to the wing of a housefly, but that Almighty Allah makes a house for him in Paradise and makes those tears as barrier between him and Hellfire."

When I reached the following couplet:

او شامتا يوماً من الان

من كان مسروراً بما مسكنه

ادفع ضيماً حين يغشاني

فقد ذلتكم بعذ عز فما

"One who is pleased at what befell you, or he ridicules you today. Indeed, you were caused disrespect after being respected and honored. So, I will not remove injustice and oppression when it overwhelms me."

His Eminence held my hand and said: "O God, forgive the past and future sins of Kumayt."

When I reached the following couplet:

"When will the rising of truth take place from you and when would your second Mahdi stage an uprising?"

Imam (a.s.) said: "Very soon, if Allah wills, very soon." Then he said: "O Abal Mustahal, indeed our Qaim is the ninth descendant of Husain, because the Imams after the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) are twelve, and the twelfth of them is the Qaim."

I asked: "Who are these twelve?"

He replied: "The first of them is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) and after him, Hasan and Husain; after Husain, Ali bin Husain; and after him, I and after me is this one (and he placed his hands on the shoulders of Ja'far)."

I asked: "Who is the Imam after him?"

Imam (a.s.) replied: "His son, Moosa. After Moosa, his son, Ali. And after Ali, his son, Muhammad. After Muhammad, his son, Ali and after Ali, his son, Hasan. And he is the father of the Qaim, who would stage an uprising and fill up the earth with justice and equity as it would have been fraught with injustice and oppression; and he will bestow cure to the breasts of our Shia."

I asked: "O son of Allah's Messenger (s.a.w.a.), when would he appear?"

He replied: "The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) was asked regarding this. Indeed, his simile is like the simile of Judgment Day, which would not come to pass, except all of a sudden."

Bani Asad – the tribe of Kumayt – itself acknowledged the supplication of Prophet, which informed about the auspiciousness of Kumayt and his tribe. The members of the tribe used to say:

"We have an excellence, which no other tribe has. We have received the auspiciousness of Kumayt in inheritance."

From those accepted supplications, whose signs are obvious and which left everlasting excellence for Kumayt, is the point, which Qutubuddin Rawandi has mentioned in *Al-Kharaij wal Jaraih*¹:

"When the enemies of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) wanted to apprehend and eliminate Kumayt and he fled, Imam [Muhammad bin Ali al-Baqir (a.s.)] prayed for him. He left his house in the darkness of the night and escaped though they had placed men on every route to apprehend him. When Kumayt came out, a lion barred his way from wherever he wanted to flee, thus hinting not to proceed on that path as enemies were waiting for him there. The lion accompanied him till Kumayt escaped the enemies."

Birth and martyrdom

Kumayt was born in the year 60 A.H. That is the year of the martyrdom of Imam Husain (a.s.), grandson of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). He had a good life in the world, the path which was pleasing to Allah; he taught this right path to others. So much so that through auspiciousness of the supplication of Imam Zainul Abideen (a.s.), he was honored by martyrdom in Kufa during the Caliphate of Marwan bin Muhammad, in the year 126 A.H.

7. Sayyid Himyari

Died: 173 A.H.

1.

1. O one, who sells religion in exchange for the world, God has not commanded this. 2. Why do you bear malice to Ali, the successor, whereas Ahmad was pleased with him? 3. The same whom Ahmad called out by name on the day of Ghadeer. 4. And he was surrounded by the companions.

¹ Al-Kharaij wal Jaraih [2/941].

5. Then he said: This Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) is the master of one, whose master I am. 6. So, O Allah, the Mighty and High, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.

2.

1. When the Almighty Allah said with emphasis: O Muhammad, arise and deliver a speech among the people. 2. And announce the Imamate of Abul Hasan (Ali) among your community. Indeed, he is the guide, if you do not declare his appointment, it would be as if you have not fulfilled the function of prophethood. 3. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) summoned Ali (a.s.) and the people: among those, who testify and those, who falsify, raised him and after him for every cultured person he declared the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali (a.s.). Now to regard any uncultured person as Master (*Wali*) is not correct. Such are the merits of Ali (a.s.) that uncouth persons cannot obtain even a part of them though they might make excessive efforts.

This Qasida has 112 verses and it is named as *Mazhaba*. The acclaimed scholar, Sayyid Murtada has written a gloss on this poem and it was printed in Egypt in the year 1313 A.H.¹ He writes in the commentary of the following verse:

وأنصب أباً حسن لقومك انه هاد و مَا بَلَغْتَ اَنْ تَنْصُبْ

“And announce the Imamate of Abul Hasan (Ali) among your community. Indeed, he is the guide, if you do not declare his appointment, it would be as if you have not fulfilled the function of prophethood.”

This term, ‘nasaba’ (appointment) only fits the meaning of Imamate and Caliphate and not in the meaning of love and assistance; and the statement of the poet in the fourth couplet, is a clear hint to Imamate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), because it was Imamate, which the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) declared for him after prophethood; implication of affection and help was present at that time as well and was not restricted to after his passing away.

3.

1. If I don't safeguard bequests of Muhammad Mustafa and the emphatic allegiance of Ghadeer Day. 2. It would be as if I have purchased deviation in exchange of guidance and after accepting Islam, I became a Jew or a Christian. 3. What concern do I have for Adi and Teem tribes. Only Aale Muhammad (a.s.) are bestowers of divine blessings upon me from God. 5. I complete my prayer by invoking blessings on Aale Muhammad (a.s.). If I don't recite Salawat in Tashahud, my prayer won't be complete. 6. My affection, well wishing and all capabilities of assistance are reserved for them my whole life, since I am addressed as Sayyid. 7. Indeed, if someone

¹ This book was published in 1313 A.H. along with *Masarush Shia* of Shaykh Mufeed in Cairo and in Qom in connection with the treatises of Sayyid Murtada (*Rasail Sharif Murtada*)/ 4th No./132.

condemns me for my affection towards this family, he deserves to be falsified. 8. If you like, adopt that shade of sorrow, otherwise refrain from it, so that you may remain safe and favorite.

This poem is having 25 verses.¹

4.

1. Indeed, exceeding praise is only for God, who is the owner of praise and forgiveness. 2. Indeed, Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) is the Caliph of God, who conducts with justice. 3. And indeed he is in relation to Muhammad as Harun (was to Moosa) was not a prophet. 4. But he is the successor and trustee and who received wisdom from God, according to which he acts. 5. On Ghadeer day, the best of creation stood up and addressed the people. 6. And said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master; and he is your refuge. 7. But they made a pact not to accept the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali (a.s.), the guide, and not to assist him.

5.

1. May my life be sacrificed on the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) on the day when Jibreel arrived and commanded open declaration. 2. And said: If you don't convey this, it is as if you have not fulfilled the function of prophethood. So the Prophet arose and fulfilled the command of God, the recompenser. 3. And he asked: Who was your master before the day of Ghadeer? They said: You were our master. 4. You are the Prophet and we are witnesses that you were the well wisher of the community and you nicely explained (what you were supposed to deliver). 5. This one is your guardian after me. And I have been commanded to declare his appointment. So be his supporters and followers. 6. He is the most righteous and wisest among you; and is the first to declare faith in God. 7. He is in relation to me, as Harun was to Moosa bin Imran (a.s.).

Introduction to the poet

Abu Hashim or Abu Aamir Ismail bin Muhammad bin Yazid bin Wada Himyari was having the title of Sayyid, and his agnomen was Abu Hashim. Shaykh Tusi² says that his agnomen is Abu Aamir and during his childhood he was given the title of Sayyid.³

His parents and his story in their words

Abul Faraj has narrated from Sulaiman bin Abu Shaykh in his *Aghani*⁴ that: "The parents of Sayyid were *Ibadhi*⁵ and they resided in Basra in the upper

¹ Ref: *Al-Aghani*, 7:262 [7/282].

² *Rijal Tusi*: [Pg. 148, No. 108].

³ Ref: *Rijaal Kishi*: 186 [2/573, No. 507].

⁴ *Al-Aghani*, 7:230 [7/249].

⁵ [Abaziya were followers of Abdullah bin Abaz, who staged an uprising during tenure of Marwan bin Muhammad; and they are a group of Hururiya, who regard their opponents

storey of the house of Bani Zabba. The Sayyid says that Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was frequently abused in that place. When he was asked about his Shia faith: from where he obtained it, he replied: Exceeding divine mercy descended upon me. It is narrated from the Sayyid that when I came know about the belief of my parents, I wanted to eliminate them. So he came to Uqbah bin Muslim Hanai and mentioned this. He gave refuge to him and he settled in the house that he had gifted him. He remained there till his parents died and he inherited them.”

Marzabani writes:¹

“His parents were inimical to Ali (a.s.) and when he heard his parents abusing Imam Ali (a.s.) after the morning prayer, he composed the following lines:

1. O God, curse my parents and then send them to the chastisement of Hell. 2. It is their practice to curse Ali, the gate of knowledge, after Morning Prayers. 3. They curse the most righteous of people, who ever walked the earth and circled the Kaaba in pilgrim garb. 4. Since they started hating the progeny of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), they became infidels. 5. And (also when cursing the) Wasi, due to whom the earth is stable and if he had not been there, it would have disintegrated. 6. When its folks are owners of knowledge and understanding and guides to the right path. 7. They are the representatives of God among the creatures and they act with justice during the injustice of the oppressor. 8. May continuous divine blessings, favors and well being descend on them.

His greatness and statements regarding him

Respect and love for Ahle Bayt (a.s.) is a sign of the Shia, because God and Prophet has honored them. Thus, the Shia see that Ahle Bayt (a.s.) have honored the Sayyid greatly and have deemed him proximate to them, because he endeavored in propagating the excellence of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) and wrote innumerable poems in their praise. If he was offered material recompense for his poems, he used to reject it, because he only composed poems as recompense of prophethood and attachment to Aale Muhammad (a.s.).

He also opposed his parents when he learnt that they were Ahle Bayt haters (*Nasibis*). That is why the Shia accord respect to the Sayyid from that time till now.

Ibne Abde Rabb says in *Al-Iqdul Fareed*.²

“Sayyid Himyari was the most prominent of the Shia. A special carpet was spread out for him in Masjid Kufa.”

It is mentioned in the tradition of Shaykhut Taifa¹:

¹ apostates; they regard Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and most companions as apostates].
¹ *Akhbar*, Sayyid Himyari [Pg. 176]; this point is narrated by Ibne Shakir in *Fawatul Wafayat*, 1:19 [1/88, No. 72].

² *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:289 [4/144].

“Ja’far bin Affan Tai² said to the Sayyid: O Abu Hashim, you are the most prominent of the Shia and I am your supporter.”

His works praised

Sayyid was among the three most prominent poets of Arabs, who were regarded as the best during the period of Jahiliyya and after the advent of Islam. The three are: Sayyid, Bashshar and Abul Atahiya.

Marzabani³ says: “None, except the Sayyid, has composed as many couplets. It is narrated from Abdullah bin Ishaq Hashmi that he said: I collected two thousand poems (Qasida) from the compositions of Sayyid and I thought that nothing else remained to be collected. But all the time I came across individuals, who recited verses that I was not having. So I continued to note them down till I was annoyed and I abandoned this pursuit.”

His extensive compositions regarding Ahle Bayt (a.s.)

The Sayyid was having great courage in stating the truth. He focused all his energies in praising Ahle Bayt (a.s.) to strengthen faith and in loyalty and sacrifice. By eulogizing the selected ones of God, he enlivened the dead hearts and he was a prominent poet in condemning enemies of Aale Muhammad (a.s.).

One of his verse says:

ایا رب انی لہ ارد بالذی به
مدحت علیاً غیر وجه کفار حم

“O God, I eulogize Ali only for Your pleasure, so have mercy on me.”

Abul Faraj⁴ writes that his poems are not without praise of Bani Hashim and condemnation of those, who in his view were opposed to them.

Ibne Motaz writes in his *Tabaqat*⁵:

“Sayyid was an expert in versifying traditions and traditional reports and he versified all merits of Imam Ali (a.s.). Gatherings, in which there was no mention of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) made him distraught and he was disinterested in gatherings, in which there was no mention of them.”

His religious beliefs and statements of scholars regarding him

The Sayyid followed the Kaisaniya⁶ belief for a major part of his life; which

¹ Ref: *Amali Tusi*, work of Shaykhut Taifa’s son; 124 [198, H. 339]; *Basharatul Mustafa*, Abu Ja’far Tabari [Pg. 53].

² Abu Abdullah Makfuf was a poet from Kufa, he composed elegies (*Marsiya*) regarding Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) requested him to recite them in his presence.

³ *Akhbar*, Sayyid Himyari [Pg. 152 & 153].

⁴ Ref: *Al-Aghani*, 7:236 & 237 [7/256 & 257].

⁵ *Tabaqatul Shoara*, 7: [Pg. 32].

⁶ They were companions of Mukhtar bin Abi Ubaid. It is said regarding their naming as such that: Kaysan was the title of Mukhtar from a statement of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). As Kishi has mentioned in his *Rijal*: 84 [1/341, No. 201]. It is also said that Kaysan was the title of the commissioner of police under Imam Ali (a.s.) and that is why his agnomen is such: as

comprised belief in Imamate of Muhammad bin Hanafiyyah and his occultation. He also composed couplets regarding this. After that, through the blessings of Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.), he was bestowed with good fortune, he saw strong evidences from His Eminence (a.s.) and recognized the truth. When Imam (a.s.) came to Kufa upon his return after meeting Mansur or when the Sayyid met His Eminence (a.s.) during Hajj season, he gave up his worthless Kaisaniya beliefs.

Scholar have mentioned numerous statements regarding his beliefs and religion, from which only one would have sufficed, what to say that all of them are as such; some of them being as follows:

Statement of Saduq

He writes in his book of *Kamaluddin*:¹

“Sayyid remained misguided in the matter of occultation and related it to Muhammad bin Hanafiyyah only till he met Imam Ja'far bin Muhammad al-Sadiq (a.s.). He saw the signs of Imamate in the Imam and asked him about occultation. Imam replied: It is true, but it is for the twelfth among holy Imams. Imam (a.s.) informed the Sayyid about the death of Muhammad bin Hanafiyyah and told him that his father, Muhammad bin Ali bin Husain bin Ali (a.s.) witnessed his burial. Thus, Sayyid turned away from his previous faith and repented much. He returned to the truth when it became manifest and became very close to Imamate.”

Statement of Marzabani

He writes in his book of *Akhbar Sayyid*²:

“Doubtlessly, Sayyid bin Muhammad followed the Kaisaniya religion and believed that Muhammad bin Hanafiyyah was the Mahdi and Qaim and that he lived in Mt. Razwa. But he gave up this belief and started believing in the Imamate of Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.). He says:

تَعْفَرُتْ بِاسْمِ اللَّهِ وَاللَّهِ أَكْبَرْ
وَإِقْنَتْ أَنَّ اللَّهَ يَعْفُوْ وَيَغْفِرُ
وَيَمْحُوْ وَيَقْضِي فِي الْأَمْوَارِ وَيَقْدِرُ
وَيَثْبِتْ مَهِيَا شَاعِرِي بِأَمْرِهِ

‘I have, by the name of God, adopted the Ja'fari religion and God is great; and I am certain that God will forgive me and give me salvation.’”

Whoever says that the Sayyid remained a believer in Kaisaniya religion has attributed falsehood to him. The most obvious proof for the falsification of this statement is the supplication of Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) in his favor and the

mentioned in *Rijal* of Kishi [1/342, No. 204] and in *Fasl* of Ibne Hazm [4/94] was Abu Umrah. And it is said that Kaysan was a slave of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), who urged Mukhtar to seek revenge for blood of Imam Husain (a.s.), grandson of Prophet and identified the killers of Imam (a.s.) to him and as Kishi has mentioned that is why he became a confidant of Mukhtar and his chief executive.

¹ *Kamaluddin*: 20 [Pg. 23].

² *Akhbar Sayyid* Himyari [Pg. 164].

Imam's praise about him. Among them being the report of Ibaad bin Suhaib that he said:

"I was in the company of Abu Abdullah Ja'far bin Muhammad (a.s.). He mentioned the Sayyid and prayed for him saying: My father has narrated from his father, Ali bin Husain that the followers of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) do not die, except after repenting and he (Sayyid) had repented."

Caliphs during his period

The Sayyid lived during the tenures of ten caliphs: five from Bani Umayyah and five from Bani Abbas. The first was Hisham bin Abdul Malik (d. 125) after nineteen years and nine months of Caliphate. The Sayyid was born at the beginning of his Caliphate and the reigning caliph at the end of his life was Rashid, who ruled for twenty-three years.

Birth and demise

The chief of the poets, Himyari was born in Oman,¹ in the year 105 A.H. and grew up in Basra under the care of his parents, who were followers of Ibaadi sect. When he gained understanding and maturity, he left them and lived with Uqbah bin Muslim till his parents died and he inherited them. After that he left Basra and traveled to Kufa and studied the science of traditions from Amash. He used to travel between Basra and Kufa. He died at Rumaila in Baghdad during the Caliphate of Rashid.

Expertise in knowledge and history

Whoever comes to know about the remonstrations of Sayyid Himyari and the points he mentioned in his statements to the elders of both sects, would realize what capacity the Sayyid had in understanding the meanings of Holy Quran and knowledge of holy Sunnah.

He would nicely understand that the Sayyid has used his recognition and rapture in expression of praise of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and this cannot be achieved by lack of awareness and actual emulation. He had expertise in knowledge of Quran and Sunnah and recognition proved through religious argumentations and insight, which he brought against one, who opposed him in religious principles.

He had complete command on history and he authored the book of *Tarikh Yemen*, which is quoted by Safri in his book of *Al-Wafi bil Wafayat*.²

His poetry is full of Quran and Sunnah and is the true evidence of his command over the aims, hints and clarifications of these two. Whenever an excellence is stronger and evidence has more clarity, more is his attention to composition of verses regarding that; like tradition of Ghadeer, tradition of Manzilah, verse of purification, tradition of the standard, tradition of roasted fowl and so on. Among them being the tradition of the feast of clansmen (*Dawat Zul*

¹ *Lesaanul Mizan*, 1:438 [1/488, No. 1359].

² *Al-Wafi bil Wafayat*, 1:49.

Asheera), after the revelation of the following verse:

وَأَنذِرْ عَشِيرَتَكَ الْأَقْرَبِينَ ﴿٢٦﴾

And warn your nearest relations,”¹

...which was revealed at the beginning of the mission of Prophet and the Sayyid has hinted at this in some of his panegyrics, among them being:

1. May my parents be sacrificed on you, O Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). 2. May my parents and all my relatives be sacrificed on you. 3. And my family and property and daughters and sons, all be sacrificed on you. 4. May my life be sacrificed on you O leader of the pious. 5. O trustee of God and inheritor of the knowledge of the foremost. 6. O successor of Mustafa Ahmad, who is the best of prophets. 7. And the owner of the Pool of Kauthar and you are one, who would drive away those, who created heresies after the Prophet. 8. With regard to believers, you are more eligible and the best of people from the aspect of religiosity. 9. You became his brother in the world on the day he invited his relations (for dinner). 10. So that they may harken to God’s command and they were forty persons. 11. From uncles and cousins, who were around him and each of them was powerful and prominent. 12. Thus, he got knowledge and illuminated book in inheritance. 13. You were purified in old age, youth, infancy and even in the womb. 14. And also at the time of the taking of covenant during the stage of essence (*Teenat*) of all creatures. 15. You are the trusted one and command a lofty rank and respect in view of the owner of the Throne (*Arsh*). 16. In your life, you were effulgence under the veil and the purest one.²

Tradition of the beginning of the call in history and literature

Numerous experts and scholars of traditions from both sects have mentioned this report in *Sihah* and *Musnad* books, without criticizing the chains of its narrators. Historians have also accepted its authenticity and mentioned it in full. Poets have also versified this incident.

Wording of the tradition

Tabari in his *Tarikh*,³ has narrated that Ali (a.s.) said:

“When the following verse:

وَأَنذِرْ عَشِيرَتَكَ الْأَقْرَبِينَ ﴿٢٦﴾

“And warn your nearest relations,”⁴

...was revealed, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) summoned me and said:

¹ Surah Shoara 26:214

² Ayanush Shia [3/427].

³ Tareekh Umam wal Mulook, 2:216 [2/319].

⁴ Surah Shoara 26:214

O Ali, indeed the Almighty Allah has commanded me to warn the close relatives, but I refrained from this fearing trouble. Jibreel came to me again and said: O Muhammad, if you don't carry out His instructions, God would punish you. So you procure a Saa¹ of wheat, a leg of lamb and a large container of milk. Then gather the descendants of Abdul Muttalib, so that I may convey to them what I am commanded.

So I did what I was commanded. After that I invited them, and they numbered one less or more forty. Among them being his uncles, Abu Talib, Hamza, Abbas, Abu Lahab etc. And when they gathered, he called for the food that I had prepared for them. When I placed it on the floor, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) picked a portion of the meat and cut it into pieces with his teeth and placed it around the vessel.

Then he said: "Begin in the name of Allah."

So they ate till they were fully satiated and I did not see, except the place of their hands in the vessel. And by God, in whose hands is the life of Ali, one person from them would have eaten the whole of what I had prepared.

Then the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: "Provide water to them."

I brought a large vessel of water and they drank from it till they were satisfied and by God, one person from them could have drank the whole vessel. When the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) wanted to speak to them. Abu Lahab preceded him, saying to the company, "Your host has shown a famous magic trick in satisfying you with so little provision, which still remains as it was."

They all dispersed from there. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) could not say anything that day.

He said to me: "That man anticipated me today, so I didn't say anything. Make the same preparations again, and assemble them tomorrow, so that I may announce to them my prophetical mission."

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) says that he made the same preparations the next day and when all had eaten, the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: "O sons of Abdul Muttalib, I think no one among the Arabs can have bestowed on his relatives a greater benefit than what I have brought for you. Verily, I offer you the good of this world, and of that to come. And Almighty Allah has commanded me to summon first to His worship. Thus, which of you would help me in this job, so that he may become my brother, my helper against opponents, and my successor and Caliph after me?"

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) says: "All were silent, but I, who was youngest of them, arose: my eyes bulged² more than all, my belly protruded most and my calves were thinner than most. I said: 'O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), I will render help and support to you in this mission.'

¹ Measure of weight.

² Ref: *Behaarul Anwaar*, 18/193.

He placed his hand on my shoulder and said: 'Indeed, this one is my brother, successor and Caliph among you. Listen to him and obey him.'

They dispersed smiling and saying to Abu Talib: He has commanded you to obey your son.'

All reporters of this traditional report are trustworthy, except Maryam Abdul Ghaffar bin Qasim, who is regarded unreliable by Sunnis as he was a Shia.

For example in *Lesaanul Meezaan*,¹ it is mentioned that Ibne Uqdah has certified him and exaggerated his praise. And the compilers of six canonical books, who are teachers of traditions and experts of traditional reports, and reference points in the arts and science of reporting, have reported through his authority; and none of them have regarded a tradition weak and defective only because Abu Maryam is one of its reporters.

They have argued through evidences of prophethood and special qualities of Prophet. And it is not strange that Ibne Taymiyyah regards the tradition to be fabricated, because he is prejudiced and has the habit of denying universally accepted beliefs. His statements and arguments are well known and researchers have concluded that the reason why the tradition is not correct in his view is that it contains the merits of the Purified Progeny.

Statement of Iskafi regarding the tradition in his book of Al-Naqdh alal Uthmaniya

Iskafi has replied to the like of Uthmaniya and Jahiz, who argued that the Islam of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in childhood was unlikely: He (Uthmaniya) says:

"Can a young child and an inexperienced youth arrange to prepare food and invite people? Can a five or seven years old child bear the secrets of prophethood? Is invitation issued to old people, except from those with understanding? Can the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) entrust the burden of divine mastership to such hands, who had not even reached the age of fulfilling obligatory acts? Can he appoint him as brother, successor and Caliphate; that he should bear Mastership (*Wilayat*) of God and enmity to His enemies?!"

Iskafi's reply

"How was this child, who was not aware of his own age, not attached to those of his age? And after embracing Islam, why he was not seen with children of his age? While he was [apparently] a child and not more, and in divine recognition, he was like some of them? How he did not spend his time with them? So that it should be said: childhood and worldly demands surrounded him and unawareness and young age impelled him to participate in games of children?

On the contrary, we don't see him, except that he was steadfast on his Islam,

¹ *Lesaanul Mizan*, 4:43 [4/51, No. 5229].

determined in his acts and proved his statements by his acts, and with his chastity and piety, testified to his Islam and among those, who were in the presence of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), he became proximate to His Eminence, and he was his trustee and source of his attachment in the world and hereafter.

He dominated his lust, he had removed his worldly thoughts and desires, and made himself patient on this, because he hoped for success in hereafter and reward of hereafter.

He has described his condition in the beginning and the initial matter in his words and sermons, at the time when he embraced Islam, when the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) summoned the tree and it split the earth and came forward, the Quraish said: He is an expert and powerful sorcerer.

Ali (a.s.) said: "O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), I am the first of those, who brought faith upon you, I believed in God and His Prophet, and I testify to you about what you have brought, and I testify that this tree performed this by command of God, to testify for your prophethood and that it should be an evidence upon your call."

Thus, is there a faith more correct, more confident and more steadfast than his? But anger and fury of Uthmanis and prejudice and deviation of Jahiz are the things for which there is no solution."

Felonies upon tradition

Among these felonies being what Tabari has committed in his *Tafseer*¹; after narrating it in his book of history – as you have seen – he has kept aside his loyalty to this tradition when he wrote his book of *Tafseer*, and committed dishonesty. He has brought the whole texts and chains of authorities, but condensed it and made ambiguous the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in excellence of one, who made haste in accepting the invitation and has written:

Thus, the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: "Which of you would assist me in this work, so that he may be my brother and so and so?"

Regarding the final statement of Prophet, he writes: He said: "He is my brother and so and so and so and so."

Ibne Kathir Shami, in his book of *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*,² and in his *Tafseer*³ has followed Tabari in this distortion in traditions.

At the time of writing history, Ibne Kathir was having *Tarikh Tabari* before him, on the contrary his history was based on *Tarikh Tabari* only. Because he did not like to prove the textual declaration on the mastership (*Wilayat*) and Caliphate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) or to provide support for it or even hint at it. Or the aim of Tabari at the time when he distorted the words in his exegesis

¹ *Jaameul Bayan*, 19:74 [No. 11/Vol. 19/122].

² *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 3:40 [3/53].

³ *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 3:51.

(*Tafseer*), but mentioned the full report in *Tarikh*, was this only? I don't know, but Tabari knows! And I think that you, readers also know well.

قُلْ هَلْ نَنِصِّكُمْ بِالْأَخْسَرِينَ أَعْمَالًا ۝ الَّذِينَ ضَلَّ سَعْيُهُمْ فِي الْحَيَاةِ الدُّنْيَا
وَهُمْ يَحْسَبُونَ أَنَّهُمْ يُحْسِنُونَ صُنْعًا ۝

“Say: Shall We inform you of the greatest losers in (their) deeds? (These are) they whose labor is lost in this world’s life and they think that they are well versed in skill of the work of hands.”¹

8. Abdi Kufi

In his book of *Manaqib*,² published from Iran, Ibne Shahr Ashob has mentioned the following verses composed by Abdi:

“For Ali, there is no equal among the creatures other than his brother, Muhammad. When the Quraish surrounded him at night, the Chief of believers risked his life for the Prophet; the Prophet repaid his loyalty and appointed him as his vicegerent in Ghadeer Khum.”

Introduction to the poet

Abu Muhammad Sufyan bin Musab Abdi Kufi, was among the poets of the holy Ahle Bayt of the Prophet (a.s.), who became proximate to them due to his affection and poems, and due to sincerity of intention, he became their favorite.

His verses comprise of numerous well known merits of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and he has excessively and nicely extolled His Eminence (a.s.) and his purified progeny. He has also composed tragic poetry about their calamities and the hardships, which befell them. We don't find any of his poems praising anyone other than the Purified Progeny.

Imam (a.s.) asked Abu Ammaara, the poetry reciter, to recite the verses of Abdi as is mentioned in the book of *Kamil* of Ibne Quluwayh³ through his chains of narrators from Abu Ammaara:

Abu Abdullah (a.s.) said: “O Abu Ammaara, recite the verses of Abdi regarding Imam Husain (a.s.).”

I recited them, and he wept. Again I recited and he wept. Again I recited and he wept.

Abu Ammaara continues: By God, I went on reciting and Imam (a.s.) continued to cry, till I heard lamentations from inside the house...” till the end of the report.

¹ Surah Kahf 18:103, 104

² Manaqib Aale Abi Talib, 1:81 [2/75].

³ *Al-Kamil*:105.

In his *Rijal*,¹ Shaykhut Taifa has mentioned Abdi as a companion of Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.). His faith and affection was embellished with pure Mastership (*Wilayat*); thus Imam (a.s.) ordered the Shia to teach verses of Abdi to their children and said that he is on the religion of God; as Kishi in his *Rijal*² has narrated from Samaa through his authorities.

Abu Abdullah Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) said: "O Shias, teach the verses of Abdi to your children; indeed he follows the religion of God."

His genius in literature and traditions

One, who is aware of the clarity and sweetness of the poetry of Abdi would testify for his artistic genius and will confess of his expertise and eloquence. And the praise of Himyari, who was himself a great poet, is most remarkable when he says:

"After Abdi, I am the greatest poet."³

Birth and death

We are not aware of the dates of birth and death of Abdi. We did not obtain anything that may inform us about this, except a report from Imam Ja'far bin Muhammad (a.s.) and him being visited by Sayyid Himyari (born 105 and died 178 A.H.) and with Abu Dawood Mustasriq. Attention to the date of birth and death of Abu Dawood Mustasriq, who narrates from Abdi, makes us familiar that our poet, Abdi was alive till around the year of the death of Himyari.

Abu Dawood has also narrated the events of Abdi. The death of Abu Dawood is calculated to have occurred in 231 A.H. or according to Kishi in 230 A.H. Kishi has written that Abu Dawood lived for seventy years; in this way the date of his birth according to Kishi, comes to 160 A.H. and according to Najjashi, 161 A.H. This proves that Abdi lived after the passing away of the Sayyid.

In this way the conclusion of *Ayanush Shia*⁴ that Abdi died around 120 A.H. does not fulfill the criteria of research.

Examples of his poetry

1. We narrate a report regarding this tradition, that others have narrated. 2. A man came to Umar bin Khattab and asked: What is the number of divorces of slave girls? 3. Umar replied: O Haider, tell him what is the number of divorces for slave girls (and after how many divorces does she become unlawful forever)? So, Murtada gestured 4. with his two fingers, and Umar turned towards the questioner and said: Two; and he returned. 5. He asked: Do you recognize him? No, he replied. He said: This is Ali, owner of loftiness and greatness. 6. And Akrama has narrated in a report that none

¹ *Rijal Tusi*: [Pg. 213, No. 165].

² *Rijal Kishi*: 254 [2/704, No. 748].

³ Ref: *Al-Aghani*, 7:22 [7/293].

⁴ *Ayanush Shia* 1:370 [7/267].

has doubted. 7. That Ibne Abbas passed by some people cursing Ali (a.s.). So he feared and wept. 8. And being terribly infuriated, he asked: Which one of you is cursing Allah, the Mighty and Sublime? 9. They replied: Refuge of God! He asked: Which one of you is cursing the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in audacity? 10. They replied: Refuge of God! He asked: Which one of you curses Ali, who is the best of those, who walked on pebbles? 11. They replied: Yes, we are doing this. He said: By God, I heard from the chosen Prophet. 12. He said: One, who curses Ali, has cursed me. And cursing me is cursing God. And he was content with that only. 13. Muhammad, his brother, his daughter and her two sons are the best of those, who walked barefoot or wearing sandals. 14. O Lord, who is the creator of creators and who brought creatures on the earth, has blessed him. 15. Almighty Allah made them clean and pure, accorded permission and chose them from creatures. 16. If they had not been there, Allah would not have raised the heavens, not spread the earth and had not created the creatures. 17. Allah does not accept the deed of any creature unless it is accompanied by sincere affection for them. 18. And the prayer of no one is complete and perfect, and supplication does not become pure, except with their remembrance. 19. If they had not been the best of those, who stepped on the earth, Jibreel would not have said to those below the cloak: 20. Am I from among you in excellence and greatness? When they said: 'Yes', he went to the heavens and boasted to the angels. 21. If a person meets the creator of all slaves of God with good deeds and piety; 22. but he had no affection for Ali, his deeds would be destroyed and he would be thrown headlong into Hell fire. 23. Indeed, Jibreel, the trustworthy, asked the two recording angels [of Ali (a.s.)] regarding his scroll of deeds. 24. Indeed, those two had definitely not mentioned any mistake or dishonesty from Ali, the untainted one.¹

Explanation of traditions alluded to in these verses and prominent Ahle Sunnat scholars, who have narrated them

As for the statement of the poet:

1. We narrate a report regarding this tradition, that others have narrated.

Hafiz Darqutni and Ibne Asakir² narrate:

Two persons came to Umar bin Khattab and asked him regarding divorce of slave girls. He arose and came to some people present in the Masjid and among them was a balding man.

Umar asked: "O bald one, what is your opinion regarding divorce of a slave girl?"

¹ Ayanush Shia [7/270].

² Tareekh Madinatul Damishq, [12/296]; and in the biography of Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) [No. 871].

He raised his hand showing his index and middle fingers (two fingers) and Umar said to those two men: "Two divorces."

One of them remarked: "Glory be to Allah, we came to you and you are the chief of believers; but you came with us till you stood before this man and posed the question to him and you were satisfied at his gesture."

Umar asked: "Do you know who that is?"

"No," they replied.

He said: "It is Ali Ibne Abi Talib. I testify that I heard from the Messenger of Allah (s) that: 'Indeed if the seven heavens and earths are placed in one pan of the balance and the faith of Ali is placed in the other pan, faith of Ali Ibne Abi Talib will be heavier.'"

As for the statement of the poet:

6. And Akrama has narrated in a report that none has doubted.

Abu Abdullah Mulla in his book of biography,¹ has narrated from Ibne Abbas that he passed by some people after he had lost his eyesight. They were abusing Ali (a.s.).

So he asked the one who was leading his mount: "What do you hear from them?"

He replied: "They are abusing Ali."

He said: "Take me back to them."

So he took him back and Ibne Abbas asked them: "Which of you cursed Allah, the Mighty and Sublime?"

They replied: "Glory be to Allah, one, who curses God, has become a polytheist."

He asked: "Which of you cursed the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)?"

They replied: "Glory be to Allah, one, who curses the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), has become a denier."

He asked: "Which of you cursed Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.)?"

They replied: "We are doing this."

He said: "I make God as witness and testify that I heard from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that one, who curses Ali (a.s.) has cursed me and whoever curses me, has cursed Allah, the Mighty and Sublime and one, who curses God, Almighty Allah will throw him headlong into Hell fire."

Then he turned away and asked the driver of his mount: "Did you hear what they said?"

He replied: "They did not say anything."

He asked: "What was the expression on their faces when I said that?"

¹ *Wasilatun Motabbideen* [No. 5/Part 2/176]; and Ref: *Riyazun Nazara*, Mohibuddin Tabari, 1:166 [3/110].

He recited the following couplet:

“They looked at you with reddened eyes, like a sheep looks at the knife of the butcher.”

Ibne Abbas said: “May my parents be sacrificed on you, continue.” He said:

“They were looking at you through the corner of the eyes in a humiliated manner.”

Ibne Abbas said: “May I be sacrificed on you, continue.”

He said: “I knew only this much.”

Ibne Abbas said: “These living men are shameful for the dead and the dead are lessons for their survivors.”

As for the statement of the poet:

“Muhammad, his brother, his daughter and her two sons are the best of those, who walked barefoot or wearing sandals.”

It is narrated from Abu Huraira from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said: “When Almighty Allah created Adam, the father of humanity and blew His soul into him, Adam glanced at the right side of the throne (*Arsh*) and decried five images amidst effulgence, who were in prostration and genuflection.”

Adam asked: “Did you create anyone from clay before me?”

“No, O Adam.” He said.

He asked: “Then who are these five, whom I see in my shape?”

He said: “These five are from your progeny; and if they had not been there, I would not have created you. These five are such that I have derived their names from My names. If they had not been there, I would not have created Paradise, Hell, Throne, Chair, heavens, earth, angels, humans and Jinns. Thus, I am Praiseworthy (*Mahmood*) and he is Praised (*Muhammad*) and I am the Highest (*Aali*) and this is Ali; and I am the Originator (*Fatir*) and this is Fatima; and I am the best (*Ahsaan*) and this is Hasan; and I am doer of favor (*Mohsin*) and this is Husain. I swear by My honor that if one has even the least enmity to one of them, I would throw him into Hell and will not care. O Adam, these are my chosen ones. I give salvation through their means and I destroy through their means. Thus, if you have some need from Me, contact Me through their means.”

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “We are the ark of salvation; such that whoever boarded it, was saved and those, who turn away from it, would be destroyed. Thus, whoever has a need from the Almighty Allah, he should seek through the means of us, Ahle Bayt.”

Shaykhul Islam, Hamawaini has mentioned this report in the first chapter of his book of *Faraidus Simtain*¹.

As for the statement of the poet:

¹ *Faraaezus Simtain* [1/36, H. 1].

“Allah does not accept the deed of any creature unless it is accompanied by sincere affection for them.”

It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: “If a person prays between Rukn and Maqam and keeps fast; in addition to that he meets God being inimical to the Ahle Bayt of Muhammad, he would be sent to Hell.”

Hakeem has mentioned this report in his book of *Mustadrak*.¹

In his book of *Awsat*,² Tibrani has narrated from Abu Laila from the martyred grandson of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) from his grandfather that he said:

“Love for us, Ahle Bayt (a.s.) is obligatory. Indeed if someone meets Allah, the Mighty and Sublime while he is affectionate to us, he would be admitted to Paradise through our intercession. And by the one, in whose hands my life is, the deeds of no one would benefit, except if he recognizes our rights.”

Hafiz Samman has narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) through his chains of narrators in his *Amali*:

“If a person worships God for a period equal to seven thousand years of this world and after that meets Allah, the Mighty and Sublime with malice to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), denial of his rights and non-acceptance of his mastership (*Wilayat*), Allah would destroy his goodness and throw him headlong into Hell.”³

In his book of *Manaqib*,⁴ Khwarizmi has narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said to Ali (a.s.):

“If a person worships Allah, the Mighty and Sublime for a period equal to the lifespan of Prophet Nuh (a.s.) and gives in charity, gold, equal to the weight of Mt. Uhud and his life is prolonged so much that he performs a thousand Hajjs on foot; then he dies oppressed between Safa and Marwa, while he is not devoted to you, O Ali, he will not smell the fragrance of Paradise and would not be admitted into it.”

As for the verse:

“And the prayer of no one is complete and perfect; and supplication does not become pure, except with their remembrance.”

This couplet hints that Almighty Allah has made it obligatory to invoke blessings on Muhammad and his Progeny during prayers; and there are a large number of traditions and statements regarding this in books of jurisprudence, exegesis and traditions.

¹ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 2:149 [3/161. H. 4712, and also its selection].

² *Mojamul Awsat* [3/122. H. 2251]; and refer: *Sawaiqul Mohriqa* [Pg. 232].

³ Qarashi has mentioned this report in his *Shamsul Akhbar*: 40 [*Musnad Shamsul Akhbar*, 1:107].

⁴ *Al-Manaqib*: 39 [Pg. 67, H. 40].

In his book of *Sawaiq*,¹ Ibne Hajar has mentioned the verse:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ وَمَلِكَتَهُ يُصَلُّونَ عَلَى النَّبِيِّ طَيْأَكُمَا الَّذِينَ أَمْنُوا صَلَوَاتٌ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَامٌ
تَسْلِيْجًا^②

“Surely Allah and His angels bless the Prophet; O you who believe! call for (Divine) blessings on him and salute him with a (becoming) salutation.”²

And mentioned a number of authentic reports regarding this verse. Among them being that when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was asked how salutations must be recited on him, the Prophet recited salutations on himself and his progeny. Then he writes:

“This is a clear evidence that the implication of this verse is command of invoking blessings on the Ahle Bayt of His Eminence and his surviving progeny; otherwise people would not have asked him about invoking of blessings on them after the revelation of the verse and what was mentioned in reply to them would not have been mentioned.”

Also, it is narrated that: “Do not invoke incomplete and tail-cut salutation upon me.”

They asked: “What is ‘incomplete and tail-cut salutation’?”

He replied: “It is your saying: ‘O Allah, bless Muhammad’ and that’s all. On the contrary, you should say: O Allah, bless Muhammad and the progeny of Muhammad.”

Nishapuri in his *Tafseer*,³ says regarding the exegesis of the verse:

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوَدَّةُ فِي الْقُرْبَى

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives.”⁴

It is sufficient for the pride of the progeny of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that it is obligatory to invoke blessings on them in the Tasha-hud of every prayer.

Mohibuddin Tabari has narrated from Jabir in his book of *Zakhair*:⁵

“If I recite prayers and in that I don’t invoke blessings on Muhammad and Aale Muhammad (a.s.) I don’t think it would be valid.”

Statement of the poet: “Except with their remembrance,” hints at a report mentioned by Dailami⁶ that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

¹ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 87 [Pg. 146].

² Surah Ahzab 33:56

³ *Gharaibul Quran*: [No. 11, Vol. 25/35].

⁴ Surah Shura 42:23

⁵ Al-Zakhair: 19.

⁶ Al-Firdos bi Mathurul Khitab [3/255, H. 4754]; and Ref: *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 88 [Pg. 148].

“Supplication remains behind the veil (it is not accepted) till blessings are not invoked on Muhammad and his Ahle Bayt (a.s.): O Allah, bless Muhammad and his progeny.”

In his *Awsat*,¹ Tibrani has reported from Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) that he said:

“Every supplication is under a veil (and it does not rise up to the heavens), except till blessings are invoked on Muhammad and Aale Muhammad (a.s.).”

As for the statement of the poet:

“If they had not been the best of those, who stepped on the earth, Jibreel would not have said to those below the cloak.”

This couplet hints at the tradition of the cloak, which is authentic, widely narrated and there is consensus on its veracity and is accepted by all the sects of Islam. It is that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) admitted Jibreel and Mikaeel in the cloak along with his Ahle Bayt (a.s.).²

As for the statement of the poet:

“Indeed, Jibreel the trustworthy, asked the two recording angels [of Ali (a.s.)] regarding his.”

In his book of *Tarikh*,³ Hafiz Khatib Baghdadi has narrated from Ammaar bin Yasir that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“Two recording angels appointed on Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) boast over all the other angels as they never had to report anything to God, which infuriated Him.”

Some other verses of Abdi

1. Ahle Bayt of the Messenger of Allah, Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) are folks of excellence and positive qualities. 2. They are guides from blindness (on light) and those, who save from hardships. 3. The truthful, speakers and preceders in pursuit of good intentions and acts. 4. Thus, their Mastership (*Wilayat*) is made obligatory by Almighty Allah in Quran. 5. They are the right path as opposed to the deviated one. 6. Truthful lady is created from the truthful one of a noble lineage. 7. Allah selected that man and woman while they are pure of all blemish. 8. The names of these two are inscribed in a single line under the shade of the throne (*Arsh*) near to each other. 9. Almighty Allah is her (Fatima's) guardian and her trustworthy one, Jibreel, was the reciter of her marriage formula. 10. And her dower is one-fifth of the earth and this is a gift, which is great among all the gifts. 11. And her showering is from the tree of Tooba, a purified showering.⁴

¹ *Mojamul Awsat* [1/408, H. 725].

² Ref: *Nurul Absar*: 122 [Pg. 226]; *Al-Isaaf*, Sabban (on the margins of *Nurul Absar*): 107.

³ *Tareekh Baghdadi*, 14:49

⁴ Ayanush Shia [3/270].

Explanations of traditions alluded to in these lines

Statement of the poet: 'the true ones' hints at the verse:

يَأَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا اتَّقُوا اللَّهَ وَ كُوْنُوا مَعَ الصَّدِيقِينَ ⑭

"O you who believe! be careful of (your duty to) Allah and be with the true ones."¹

It is narrated through the authorities of Hafiz Abu Nuaim, Ibne Marduya and Ibne Asakir² and numerous other scholars have narrated from Jabir and Ibne Abbas that the implication of the verse is:

"Be with Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.)."

Ganji Shafei has mentioned this report in the book of *Kifaya*³, and Hafiz Suyuti has mentioned it in *Durre Manthur*⁴.

Statement of the poet: **"Foremost and drawn nigh (to Allah)"**

...is hint at the words of Allah, the Mighty and the High:

وَالسَّبِقُونَ السَّبِقُونَ ⑩ أُولَئِكَ الْمُقَرَّبُونَ ⑪

"And the foremost are the foremost, these are they who are drawn nigh (to Allah),"⁵

This verse is revealed regarding Ali (a.s.).

Ibne Marduya has narrated from Ibne Abbas that he said: "This verse was revealed about Hizqeel, believer of the folks of Firon, Habib Najjar, who is mentioned in Surah Yasin and Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). Each of them in their nation, had precedence over others in faith and Ali is the most excellent of them."

According to Ibne Abi Hatim, Yusha bin Nun is mentioned instead of Hizqeel.

Hafiz Suyuti has mentioned this report in his book of *Ad-Durre Manthur*, Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq*, and Sibte Ibne Jauzi in *Tadkira*.⁶

Statement of the poet:

4. Thus, their Mastership (*Wilayat*) is made obligatory by Almighty Allah in Quran.

In this couplet, the poet has hinted at the following verse:

¹ Surah Taubah 9:119

² *Tareekh Medinatur Damishq* [12/307]; and in the biography of Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) – Researched edition [No. 930].

³ *Kifayatut Talib*, 111 [Pg. 236, Chapter 62].

⁴ *Ad-Durre Mansoor*, 3:290 [4/316].

⁵ Surah Waqiyah 56:10-11

⁶ *Ad-Durre Mansoor*, 6:154 [8/6]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa* 74 [Pg. 125]; *Tadkira Khawas*, 11 [Pg. 17].

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوْدَةُ فِي الْقُرْبَىٰ وَمَنْ يَقْتَرِفُ حَسَنَةً نَّزِدُهُ فِيهَا حُسْنًا طَإِنَّ اللَّهَ غَفُورٌ شَكُورٌ^{۲۳}

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives; and whoever earns good, We give him more of good therein.”¹

Remarkable reports and statement are mentioned in books and dictionaries regarding this verse, but there is no scope to mention all of them here. We shall quote only some of them:

1. Ahmad in his book of *Manaqib*, Ibne Mundhir, Ibne Abi Hatim, Tibrani, Ibne Marduya, Wahidi, Thalabi, Abu Nuaim, Bagahwi in *Tafseer*, Ibne Maghazili in *Manaqib*, through his authorities has narrated from Ibne Abbas that he said:

When this verse was revealed, it was asked from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.): “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), who are your near kindred, affection for whom is obligatory on us?”

He replied: “Ali, Fatima and their two sons.”²

2. Hafiz Tabari, Ibne Asakir³, Hakeem Haskani in *Shawahidut Tanzil la Qawaiidul Tafzil*,⁴ have narrated from Abu Amama Bahili through many chains from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“Indeed, Almighty Allah created the prophets from a tree and created me from a different tree. So, I am the root and Ali is its trunk, Fatima is its branch and Hasan and Husain are its fruits. Thus, whoever clings to one of its branches would get salvation and whoever deviates from it would be destroyed. If a person worships Allah for three thousand years between Safa and Marwa, but is not concerned with us, Allah would cast him headlong into Hellfire. At that time His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) recited:

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوْدَةُ فِي الْقُرْبَىٰ

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives.”⁵

This report is mentioned by Ganji in *Kifaya*⁶.

3. Ahmad⁷ and Ibne Abi Hatim have narrated from Ibne Abbas regarding the

¹ Surah Shura 42:23

² *Manaqib Ali* [Pg. 187, Vol. 263]; *Al-Mojamul Kabeer* [11/351/Tr. 12259]; *Al-Kashf wal Bayan* [Pg. 46, Surah Shura: 23]; *Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.)* [Pg. 307-309, H. 352].

³ *Tareekh Medinatun Damishq* [12/143]; and in the biography of Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) [No. 178 & 179].

⁴ *Shawahidut Tanzil* [2/203, H. 837].

⁵ Surah Shura 42:23

⁶ *Kifayatut Talib*: 178 [Pg. 317, Chap. 87].

⁷ *Fadailus Sahaba* [2/669, H. 1141].

verse:

وَمَنْ يَقْرَفْ حَسَنَةً نَّزِدُهُ فِيهَا حُسْنًا

“And whoever earns good, We give him more of good therein.”¹

It is affection for the progeny of Aale Muhammad (a.s.).

4. It is narrated from Abu Tufail that Hasan bin Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) delivered a sermon to us. So he praised and glorified Almighty Allah and the seal of successors, legatee of prophets, trustee of the truthful, witness over deeds: that is he mentioned Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) and after that said:

“O people, a man has left us, such that the those, who are past do not have precedence on him and the future ones do not reach him. Indeed, Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) handed the standard to him and Jibreel fought from his right and Mikaeel from his left. And he did not return till Allah did not make him victorious. And indeed, Almighty Allah captured his soul on the night the soul of the successor of Prophet Moosa (a.s.) was captured and his soul rose up to the heavens on the night the soul of Isa Ibne Maryam rose up to the heavens and on the night Allah, the Mighty and Sublime revealed the Quran. I swear by God, he did not leave behind gold and silver and when he departed, he was having only 750 dirhams, which he was saving to buy a servant for Umme Kulthum.”

After that he said: “All those, who know me, know me and all those, who do not know me, should know that I am Hasan bin Muhammad. Then he recited the following verse, i.e. statement of Prophet Yusuf (a.s.) in Quran:

وَاتَّبَعْتُ مِلَّةَ أَبَّاءِي إِبْرَاهِيمَ وَإِسْحَاقَ وَيَعْقُوبَ

“And I follow the religion of my fathers, Ibrahim and Ishaq and Yaquib.”²

Then he said: “I am the son of the giver of glad tidings and the warner, and the son of the Prophet, the son of the caller to God, I am the son of the luminous lamp, son of the mercy for the worlds, I am from a household, from which Almighty Allah had removed all impurities and purified them as they deserved to be purified, I am from a household, whose love and affection Allah, the Mighty and Sublime made obligatory and He says in revelation to Muhammad:

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوْدَةُ فِي الْقُرْبَىٰ...

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives...”³

This report is quoted by Bazzaz, Tibrani in *Kabeer*, Abul Faraj in *Maqatilut*

¹ Surah Shura 42:23

² Surah Yusuf 12:38

³ Surah Shura 42:23

Talibiyyin, Ibne Abil Hadeed in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq*.¹

Ibne Hajar says in *Sawaiq* that:² Dailami has narrated from Abu Saeed Khudri that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

وَقِفُّهُمْ إِنَّهُمْ مَسْوُلُونَ ﴿٣﴾

“And stop them, for they shall be questioned:”³

...about the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali.

As if the same was implication of Wahidi, who says regarding the verse:

وَقِفُّهُمْ إِنَّهُمْ مَسْوُلُونَ ﴿٣﴾

“And stop them, for they shall be questioned:”⁴

It is narrated that the implication of their being interrogated is regarding Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ali and Ahle Bayt (a.s.), because Almighty Allah commanded His Prophet not to ask for any recompense for delivering the message, except love and affection for his near kindred.

That is people would be asked whether they were affectionate to Ahle Bayt (a.s.), or they disobeyed the instructions. Then they would taste the result of their behavior to the family of Prophet.

Statement of the poet:

5. They are the right path as opposed to the deviated one.

Thalabi in *Kashful Bayan* narrates from Muslim bin Hayyan regarding the verse:⁵

إِهْدِنَا الصِّرَاطَ الْمُسْتَقِيمَ ﴿٥﴾

“Keep us on the right path.”⁶

I heard Abu Buraidah say: It implies the path of Muhammad and his progeny.

In *Faraid*,⁷ Hamwaini has narrated from Asbagh bin Nubata from Ali (a.s.) regarding the verse:

وَإِنَّ الَّذِينَ لَا يُؤْمِنُونَ بِالْآخِرَةِ عَنِ الصِّرَاطِ لَنَكِبُونَ ﴿٨﴾

¹ *Al-Mojamul Kabeer* [3/79-80, H. 2717-2725]; *Mojamul Awsat* [3/888, H. 1276]; *Maqatilut Talibiyyin* [Pg. 62]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 4:11 [16/30, Sermon 31]; *Al-Fusulul Muhimma* [Pg. 158-159]; *Kifayatut Talib* [Pg. 93, Chap. 11]; *Sonan Kubra* [5/112, H. 8408]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 101 & 136 [Pg. 170 & 228].

² *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 89 [Pg. 149].

³ Surah Saffat 37:24

⁴ Surah Saffat 37:24

⁵ *Al-Kashf wal Bayan* [Pg. 9, Surah Hamd, verse 6].

⁶ Surah Fatiha 1:6

⁷ *Faraaezus Simtai* [3/200, H. 556].

“And most surely those who do not believe in the hereafter are deviating from the way.”¹

...that: ‘the way’ is the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of us, Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

Khwarizmi has narrated in *Manaqib*:

“We have two paths: one in the world and one in the hereafter. As for the path in the world, it is the path of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) and the path in the hereafter is the bridge over Hell. One, who recognizes the path of the world, would pass over the path of the hereafter safely.”

The issue is clarified in the report of *Sawaiq*² that: Ibne Addi³ and Dailami have narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that:

“The most steadfast of you on the right path are those, who have more affection for my Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and companions.”

Word of the poet: ‘most truthful lady’

The implication here is Fatima, daughter of Prophet (s.a.w.a.), whom her father named with this name according to a report, which Abu Saeed has narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in the book of *Sharafun Nubuwwah*, that His Eminence said to Ali (a.s.):

“You are given three qualities, which no one else was given, not even me: you have a father-in-law like me,⁴ but I didn’t have such father-in-law; and you are given such a wife, ‘most truthful lady’, which I was not given; and you are given Hasan and Husain from your loins, but the like of those two were not given to me; but you are from me and I am from you.”⁵

Word of the poet: ‘most truthful man’

This implies Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), who is the most truthful one of the nation and this title is only for him.

Mohibuddin Tabari writes in *Riyadh*:⁶ Indeed, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) named him ‘Siddiq’.

Khajandi says: “He was given the title of the leader of Ummah and ‘Siddiqe Akbar’ (the great truthful one).”

There are a large number of traditional reports regarding this point, which we mention as follows:

1. Ibne Najjar and Ahmad in *Manaqib*,⁷ have narrated from Ibne Abbas from

¹ Surah Mominoon 23:74

² *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 111 [Pg. 187].

³ Al-Kamil fee Soafa Rijal [6/302, No. 1791].

⁴ The word ‘mathli’ is mentioned in *Al-Ghadeer*, but we have corrected it on the basis of the original source.

⁵ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:202 [3/152].

⁶ *Riyazun Nazara* [3/94 & 95].

⁷ *Manaqib Ali* [Pg. 131, H. 194].

the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said: “Three persons are ‘Siddiq’ (most truthful): Hizqeel, the believer from the people of Firon, Habib Najjar from Aale Yasin and Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

2. It is narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“Indeed, this man was the first to believe in me, and he is the first of those, who would shake hands with me on Judgment Day, and he is the *Siddiq Akbar* (the great truthful one) and the *Farooq* (one who separates truth from falsehood) of this Ummah; and he is the leader of believers.”

Tibrani has narrated this traditional report from Salman and Abu Zar. In *Kifaya*, Hafiz Ganji has narrated it through authorities of Hafiz Ibne Asakir.¹ And according to Ganji, it is mentioned at the end of the tradition:

“And he is my gate, through which one must enter and he is the Caliph after me.”

Muttaqi Hindi has quoted the report in *Ikmal Kanzul Ummal* according to the first version.

3. It is narrated from the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“My Lord said to me on the night of ascension: O Muhammad, I selected you for My message; I have chosen you for Myself. You are My Prophet and the best of the creatures. After that is the *Siddiq Akbar* (most truthful) the purified one, whom I created from your essence; and deemed him to be your Vizier and the father of two grandsons, two chiefs and two martyrs and the purified ones, and the two chiefs of Paradise; and gave in your marriage the best of the ladies of the world. You are the tree and Ali is its branch and Fatima its leaves and Hasan and Husain are its fruits; I created the two of them from the essence of High heavens (*Illiyyin*) and created your Shia from you. Indeed they are such that if they are threatened with death their affection for you would increase.”

I asked: “My Lord, who is the *Siddiq Akbar* (most truthful)?”

“Ali Ibne Abi Talib,” he replied.

Qarashi has mentioned this report in *Shamsul Akhbaar*.²

4. It is narrated from Ali (a.s.) that: “I am the slave of God, brother of Messenger of Allah and *Siddiq Akbar* (most truthful) and no one would claim this, except the greatest liar. Indeed, I prayed seven years before the people.”

This report is quoted by Ibne Abi Shaibah through correct chains of narrators and Nasai has mentioned it in *Khasais* through chains, whose narrators are trustworthy; and Ibne Majah has stated it in *Sunan*, through correct chains of narrators.³

¹ *Al-Mojamul Kabeer* [6/269/Tr. 6184]; *Kifayatut Talib*: 79 [Pg. 187, Chap. 44]; *Tareekh Madinatul Damishq* [12/130]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:56 [11/616, H. 32990].

² *Musnad Shamsul Akhbar*: 33 [1/89].

³ *Al-Musannaf* [12/65, H. 12133]; *Khasais Ameerul Momineen* (a.s.): 3 [Pg. 25, H. 7] and in *Sunan Kubra* [5/107, H. 8395]; *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 1:57 [1/44, H. 120].

The words of the poet:

8. The names of these two is inscribed in a single line under the shade of the throne (*Arsh*) near to each other.

It hints at the tradition of inscribing of the name of Fatima, her father, husband and sons under the shade of the Throne (*Arsh*) and on the gate of Paradise as Khatib Baghdadi¹ has narrated from Ibne Abbas in his *Tarikh*; that:

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“On the night of Ascension, I saw written on the gate of Paradise: There is no god, except One God, Muhammad is the messenger of God, Ali is the beloved of God and Hasan and Husain are the chosen ones of God; Fatima is the chosen one of God; curse of God is on their enemies.”

Khatib Khwarizmi has also mentioned this in his *Manaqib*.²

Statement of the poet:

9. Almighty Allah is her (Fatima's) guardian and her trustworthy one, Jibraeel, was the reciter of her marriage formula.

Is a hint that Almighty Allah Himself gave Fatima in marriage to Ali (a.s.) and He was her guardian and the Trustworthy Jibraeel recited her marriage formula as narrated from Jabir bin Samra that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“People, this is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.); you think that I gave my daughter, Fatima in marriage to him and indeed the elders of Quraish had asked me for her hand in marriage, but I did not respond. It was because I was waiting for the news from heavens till Jibraeel came on 24th of the month of Ramadhan and said: O Muhammad, Allah, the Mighty and the High has conveyed greetings to you and gathered the angels, spirits and the cherubim (*Karroobeen*) on the land called Afyah and under the Tooba tree and gave Fatima in marriage to Ali and commanded me. So I performed the marriage and Almighty Allah was the guardian.”³

Statement of the poet:

10. And her dower is one-fifth of the earth and this is a gift, which is great among gifts. 11. And her showering is from the tree of Tooba, a purified showering.

In this couplet, it is hinted at the traditional report, which Shaykh Islam, Hamwaini has narrated from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in Chapter eighteen of his *Faraidus Simtai*⁴ when the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to Ali (a.s.):

“O Ali, indeed, the earth belongs to God, and He gives it to whoever He wants. Indeed, He has revealed to me to give Fatima in marriage to you at the

¹ Tareekh Baghdadi, 1:259.

² *Al-Manaqib*: 240 [Pg. 302, H. 297].

³ Ref: *Kifayatut Talib*: 164 [Pg. 300, Chap. 79].

⁴ *Faraaezus Simtai* [1/95, H. 64].

dower of one-fifth part of the earth. Thus, it is unlawful for your enemy to walk on the earth.”

Statement of the poet:

11. And her showering is from the tree of Tooba, a purified showering.

Hints at the tradition of showering, which Bilal bin Hamama has narrated that one day we met the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) while he was smiling and in a joyful mood. So, Abdur Rahman bin Auf asked:

“O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), what is the reason of this joy?”

He replied: “It is a glad tiding from my Lord regarding my brother and cousin; and it is that Allah has given Fatima in marriage to Ali and commanded the angel, Rizwan, treasurer of Paradise, so he shook the Tooba tree and it showered certificates according to the number of devotees of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and created effulgence under every angel and gave that certificate to them. On Judgment Day they would call out among people and no follower of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) would remain, except that he would be given certificate of freedom from Hellfire. Then my brother and cousin, and my daughter would be those, who free people from Hell fire.”

Khatib has mentioned this traditional report in his *Tarikh*, and Ibne Athir in *Usudul Ghaba* and Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq*.¹

Some verses of Abdi

1. When Fatima Batool came to him weeping and constantly lamenting.
2. She said: Ladies gathered around me and criticized much. 3. They said: The Prophet has married you to Ali, who is a poor husband. 4. The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: O Fatima, be patient and thank God, indeed a great excellence is given to you. 5. Allah commanded Jibraeel, so he called out in the heavens in a clear voice. 6. Angels gathered and when they entered the House of our Lord, Baitul Mamoor. 7. Jibraeel arose, praised and glorified God and recited the same sermon. 8. One-fifth of the earth is for her, that is Fatima and one-fifth is lawful for creatures. 9. Meanwhile the beautiful Tooba tree showered Musk and ambergris and what a showering it was.⁽²⁾⁽³⁾

Explanation of couples

1. When Fatima Batool came to him weeping and constantly lamenting.

It is a hint at the traditional report, which Hafiz Abdul Razzaq has narrated through his authorities from Ibne Abbas in his *Tarikh*,⁴ that:

When the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) gave Fatima in marriage to Ali (a.s.),

¹ *Tareekh Khateeb*, 4:210; *Usudul Ghaba*, 1:206 [1/242, No. 492]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 103 [Pg. 173].

² These verses are taken from the lengthy Qasida of Ali bin Hammad Abdi, whose account will be mentioned in the coming pages; it is not the composition of Abdi Kufi.

³ Like musk and ambergris etc..

⁴ *Tareekh Abdur Razzaq*: 4:195.

Fatima said: "O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), you have married to me to a poor man, who does not have anything."

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: "Are you not pleased that Almighty Allah chose two men from the folks of the earth: one is your father and the other is your husband?"

Hakeem has mentioned this report in *Mustadrak* and regarded it as authentic.¹

It is mentioned in *Nuzhatul Majalis*² quoting from *Al-Aqaiq* that Fatima lamented on the night of her marriage. When the Prophet asked her about it, she said:

"You know that I don't prefer the world, but I considered my poverty this night and feared that Ali would say: What have you brought with you?"

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: "Rest assured, because Ali is always satisfied with God's will and Almighty Allah is also satisfied with him."

After this incident, a Jew woman, who possessed great wealth got married and invited ladies for her marriage and they dressed in very expensive clothes.

They said: "We would like to see the daughter of Muhammad and her poverty."

So they invited Her Eminence. Jibraeel brought a dress from Paradise, which she wore and also wrapped a cloth around it and when she sat among them, she unwrapped the outer robe and effulgence emanated from them. The women asked: "Fatima, where did you get this dress from?"

She replied: "From my father."

They asked: "Where did your father get it from?"

She replied: "From Jibraeel."

They asked: "From where did Jibraeel arrive?"

She replied: "From Paradise."

They said: "We testify that there is no god, except Allah and Muhammad is the messenger of Allah."

Thus, all ladies, whose husbands converted to Islam remained in marriage with them, otherwise they married others.

Before this, we explained the traditions alluded to in other verses.

Abdi's panegyric in praise of Ali (a.s.)

"And Ali often said: O world, deceive others than (not me) as I cannot be deceived."

In another panegyric, he says:

¹ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:129 [3/140. H. 4645].

² *Nuzhatul Majalis*, 2:226.

“The world with all its embellishments had not attracted him; on the contrary he said: Deceive any lowly man other than me.”¹

The poet has hinted at the tradition of Zirar bin Zumra Kanani that when Zirar described Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) to Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan, he said:

“Indeed, when the night throws a veil around and the stars are absent, I saw that holding his beard, he was writhing like man bitten by a snake, was lamenting like a one in great sorrow, and saying: O world, O world, deceive others than me. You have been aggressive to me or developed interest in me. I divorced you thrice, now there is no scope for reconciliation again. Your tenure is short, your comfort is small and your value is less...” till the end of the tradition.

This traditional report is mentioned by Abu Nuaim in *Hilya*,² Ibne Abde Barr in *Istiab*,³ and Ibne Asakir in *Tarikh*⁴ and numerous other scholars of traditions and historians have narrated it.

Other verses of Abdi

When those people came to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in that room when the pure individual (Ameerul Momineen) was stitching the sandals of His Eminence, they asked the Prophet: If something untoward happens, who is your successor, so that we may refer to him for future problems? The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) replied: “My successor is the one repairing the sandals; he is capable, intelligent and pious.”⁵

In these verses, the poet has hinted at the tradition of Umme Salma, who said to Ayesha at the beginning of the Battle of Jamal: I remind you of the time when you and I were on a journey with the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and Ali was entrusted with the job of washing the clothes of the Prophet and repairing his sandals. So the sandal of Prophet got a hole and that day Ali sat under the shade of a Lote tree and began to repair them and your father came along with Umar and sought permission from the Prophet to enter his tent. I went behind the curtain and they entered and spoke to the Prophet about whatever they wanted. After that they said:

“O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), we don’t know for how long you would remain with us; so please appoint someone as your successor upon us so that he can be a point of reference for us.”

His Eminence said: “Indeed, I know where he is and if I do that you would desert him as Bani Israel deserted Harun bin Imran.”

So they fell quiet and went away. When we came to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), you, who were the boldest from us with him asked:

¹ Ayanush Shia [7/269].

² Al-Hilya, 1:84.

³ *Istiab* (Part 2) [Pg. 1108, No. 1855].

⁴ Tareekh Madinatul Damishq [8/474]; Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq [11/158].

⁵ Ayanush Shia [7/269].

“O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), whom do you leave as your successor among them?”

He replied: “Repairer of sandals.”

So, we came out and did not see anyone other than Ali.

You said: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), I did not see anyone other than Ali.”

He said: “Only he is my successor.” [After listening to the statement of Umme Salma] she said: “I remember.”

Umme Salma asked: “Then why did you stage an uprising and fight against Ali?”

Ayesha replied: “I only fight for reform among people and if Allah wills, I hope for divine rewards.”

Umme Salma said: “You would be responsible for your acts.”¹

Abdi's verses in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

“O one, whose love and affection have captured the hearts of angels and they complain about their yearning for him. So the Lord of the worlds made your facsimile that they may remain engrossed in your Ziyarat.”

Another verse of Abdi in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

“Almighty Allah created His image for the angels of the heavens, which is great in nobility. And angels were visiting or circumambulating him. On the night of ascension, the Prophet saw him on Raff Raff in this manner.”²

These verses refer to the tradition of Yazid bin Harun, who was a reliable person and he has quoted from Hamid Tawil, who was also a trustworthy narrator, who has reported from Anas bin Malik: and Anas says:

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: I was passing through heaven during the night of ascension, when I saw an angel seated on a pulpit of light, surrounded by angels.

I asked: “O Jibreel, who is this angel?”

Jibreel replied: “Go to him and greet him.”

So I went and greeted him. When suddenly I saw my brother and cousin, Ali Ibne Abi Talib. I asked: “Jibreel, has Ali come to the fourth heaven before me?”

He replied: “No, O Muhammad, when angels mentioned their intense affection for Ali (a.s.), Allah, the Mighty and the High created this angel from effulgence in form of Ali (a.s.). So, the angels visit him seventy thousand times every Friday eve and day and praise and glorify God, and dedicate its reward to the followers of Ali (a.s.).”

¹ Sharh Nahjul Balagha, Ibne Abil Hadeed 2:78; Elamun Nisa 2:789 [An-Niza wat Takhasum Bain Bani Umayyah wa Bani Hashim, Maqrizi 25:26].

² Ayanush Shia [7/271].

Hafiz Ganji has mentioned this tradition in *Kifaya*¹ and commented:

“This tradition is good and excellent and that is why we have not narrated it, except through this chain.”

Some verses of Abdi

“They shall meet you and you would offer drinks to whoever you like from the Cistern of Kauthar and prevent whoever you like.”

In these lines, it is hinted that providing drinks from the Cistern of Kauthar is entrusted to Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) and he would provide water to his followers and devotees and drive away hypocrites and infidels.

Regarding this, numerous traditional reports are recorded in books of traditions and we shall quote some of them here:

1. Tibrani² has narrated from chains of narrators all of whose reporters are trustworthy, from Abu Saeed Khudri that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“O Ali, on Judgment Day, you will have a staff from Paradise, with which you would drive away hypocrites from the Cistern of Kauthar.”

2. Shazan Fuzaili has narrated through his authorities from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“Ali, I asked Allah, the Mighty and Sublime for five things regarding you; and He bestowed them:

Firstly, I asked Almighty Allah that when I rise up on Judgment Day, you should be there at my side; and He bestowed me.

Secondly, I asked Him to keep me near the pan of balance while you are with me and He awarded it to me.

Thirdly, I asked Him to appoint you as my standard bearer, and it is the great standard of God, under which the victorious ones and folks of Paradise would gather; and He allowed.

Fourthly, I asked Almighty Allah to provide drinks to my Ummah from the Cistern and He allowed that.

Fifthly, I asked my Lord to deem you as one, who would take my nation to Paradise, so He granted me. Thus, all praise is for God, who granted me all this.

This report is mentioned in *Manaqib* of Khatib Khwarizmi, *Faraidus Simtai*, Chapter eighteen and *Kanzul Ummal*.³

¹ *Kifayatul Talib*: 51 [132, Chap. 26].

² Al-Mojamul Saghir [2/89]; and refer Az-Zakhair: 91; Riyazun Nazara, 2:211 [3/163]; Majmauz Zawaad, 9:135; Sawaiqul Mohriqa: 104 [Pg. 174]; Kanzul Ummaal, 6:403 [13/154, H. 36479].

³ *Al-Manaqib*: 203 [Pg. 293, H. 280]; *Faraaezus Simtai* [1/106, H. 75]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:402 [13/152, H. 36476].

Among his verses is:

“Permit for crossing over (to Paradise) is in your hands and whoever you like you would admit to Paradise; and whoever you like, you would send to Hell.”

This couplet hints at the fact mentioned in numerous traditional reports, some of which are as follows:

1. In *Mawafiq*, Hafiz Ibne Samman has narrated from Qays bin Hazim that one day Abu Bakr met Ali Ibne Abi Talib and smiled at him.

Ali asked: “Why are you smiling?”

He replied: “I heard the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) say: No one would be able to cross the Siraat Bridge, except those for whom Ali writes a permit.”

This traditional report is mentioned in *Riyazun Nazara*, *Sawaiq* and *Isafur Raghibeen*.¹

2. In *Shifa*,² Qaazi Ayaz has narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that recognition of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) is immunity from Hellfire, love for Aale Muhammad (a.s.) is permit over the Siraat Bridge and Mastership (*Wilayah*) of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) is security from chastisement.

This report is mentioned in *Sawaiq*, *Ittihaaf* and *Rishfatus Sadi*.³

Other verses of Abdi

“Indeed on Araaf, you are the most capable one to recognize your followers and your enemies. You are our Imams and tomorrow on Judgment Day we shall be summoned with you when Almighty Allah would raise all creatures.”

The first couplet hints at the statement of Allah, the Mighty and the High in Surah Araaf:

وَعَلَى الْأَعْرَافِ رَجَالٌ يَعْرِفُونَ كُلَّ سَيْنَمَهُ

“And on the most elevated places there shall be men who know all by their marks.”⁴

...and the traditional report, which is reported regarding this.

Hakeem Ibne Hazza Haskani⁵ has narrated through his chains from Asbagh bin Nubata that he said: “I was with Ali (a.s.) when Ibne Kawwa inquired regarding the verse:

¹ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:177 & 244 [3/122 & 203]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 75 [Pg. 126]; *Isafur Raghibeen*: 161.

² Ash-Shifa bi Tareef Huququl Mustafa [2/105].

³ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 139 [Pg. 232]; *Al-Ittihaaf*: 15; *Rishfatus Sadi*: 459.

⁴ Surah Araaf 7:46

⁵ *Shawahidut Tanzil* [1/263, H. 256].

وَعَلَى الْأَعْرَافِ رَجَالٌ يَعْرِفُونَ كُلَّ أَسْيَمْهُمْ

“And on the most elevated places there shall be men who know all by their marks.”¹

His Eminence said: “Woe be on you, Ibne Kawwa, on Judgment Day, we would be located between Paradise and Hell; thus, we would recognize those, who supported us and admit them to Paradise and recognize whoever had been inimical to us by their faces and throw them into Hell.”

The second line hints at the verse:

يَوْمَ نَدْعُوا كُلَّ أَنَّاٍ بِإِمَامٍ مِّهُمْ

“(Remember) the day when We will call every people with their Imam.”²

They are Imams of Shia from the Purified Progeny when they would be summoned; because everyone would accompany one he was devoted to.³ And: Those, who are affectionate to a people would be raised with them.⁴ And: One, who is devoted to a people, Allah would raise him in their party.⁵

Abdi, contemporary of Abdi

Along with Abdi, there was another contemporary poet named Abdi. He was also Shia, had the same agnomen, title, address and religion. He was Abu Muhammad Yahya bin Bilal Abdi Kufi. We shall mention about him as well, because he is often confused with the other and also because he is rarely mentioned.

In his *Mojam*,⁶ Marzabani has written that he was a Kufian, who resided in Hamadan. He was a poet of a pious disposition and a Shia. He composed many poems in praise of Rashid and following are his compositions:

“Indeed, death is better than a life of poverty, refusal of grants and a pitiable condition. Thus, live with exceeding wealth or in poverty without bestowals or ask only from God and remain patient.”

He also wrote:

“I swear by my life, if Umayyah oppressed and had been unjust, indeed the first who made deviation a practice (Sunnah), is more unjust.”

¹ Surah Araaf 7:46

² Surah Isra 17:71

³ This report is mentioned by Bukhari [*Saheeh Bukhari*, 5/2283, H. 5816] and Abu Dawood [*Sunan Abi Dawood*, 4/333, H. 5127].

⁴ Hakeem has mentioned this report in *Mustadrak* [4/426, H. 8161].

⁵ Tibrani has mentioned this report in *Mojamul Kabeer* [3/19, H. 2519].

⁶ *Mojamush Shuara*: 499 [Pg. 488].

Poets of Ghadeer in the third century Hijri

9. Abu Tammam Habib bin Aws Tai
10. Dibil bin Ali bin Razeen Khuzai
11. Abu Ismail Alawi
12. Wamiq Nasrani
13. Ibne Rumi
14. Hammani al-Afwa

9. Abu Tammam Tai

Died: 231 A.H.

1. The truth became completely clear for its folks on Ghadeer day, such that no veil covered it. 2. The Messenger of Allah made him stand up and called people to his Mastership (*Wilayat*) to make them recognize so that there is no scope of denial. 3. He held his shoulders and announced: He is your guide and master, do you know that? 4. He stayed there for a day and night to explain it; the righteous and elders accompanied him. 5. He spoke up aloud to announce his right and also against usurpation of his right. 6. Would you make sharpness of the sword as his share, when his companion (Prophet) rests in his grave? 7. Or that unfortunate fellow, whose sins urged to a pasture, where deviation and sins can be grazed.

This panegyric (*Qasida*) has seventy-three couplets, which can be found in his *Diwan*.¹

Explanation of the couplets

In this panegyric, there is no option except to recognize the Ghadeer day, especially when books of traditions and biography mention an incident same as one mentioned in these verses. But Dr. Mulhim Ibrahim has, under the commentary of *Diwan* of Abu Tammam, mentioned that the lines:

1. The truth became completely clear for its folks on Ghadeer day, in such a way that there was no veil for it.

...refer to Ghadeer Day, which is a hint for a famous battle.

Then under the verse:

3. He held his shoulders and announced: He is your guide and master, do you know that?²

...he has brought another farfetched explanation and said that it was a battle for the battles of the Prophet. Then he says that 'he helped him' implies that he assisted the Prophet and the pronoun of 'he' refers to Ali, which shows that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) helped and assisted him and he knew that he was a guardian (*Wali*) in Ghadeer; the Prophet also helped him, because he knew that he would be the Master (*Wali*) and Caliph of the Ummah after him and this is the fact, do you know that?

Is there no one, who will ask this man regarding source of this? Is this battle mentioned in any books of prophetic biography or history? Have even fabricators of traditional reports narrated it?

Leave alone all this. Did you find any account of such expedition or any verse, which in your view is a description of it? Indeed, you find this writer unable to reply to these queries. But his aim is clear that he wants to conceal the

¹ Diwan Abi Tammam:143.

² Sharh Diwan Abi Tammam:381.

reality of Ghadeer and thinks that no one will become aware of this historical fact or some researchers would pass by it honorably. But constant repetition and recording of a religious fact is worthier than the imagination of this writer, who pays no attention to his writing and who regards falsehood as permanent and reliable.

He says that it was a bloody battle! When all know the position of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in battles of Prophet: Battle of Uhud, Badr, Hunain, Nuzayr, Khyber and Khandaq. Has anyone heard about the Battle of Ghadeer?!

In the verses the poet begins with the mention of an excellence, which neither the tongue can speak about nor the sword or spear can prevent: "And the day of Ghadeer..."

Introduction to the poet

Abu Tamman Habib bin Aws bin...bin Yarab bin Qahtan.¹

As Jahiz² has mentioned: He was a senior member of the Imamiyah community and among elders of Shia in literal sciences during the ancient age. He was incomparable and regarded among senior scholars of language. He was the point of reference for obtaining excellence and perfection.

The style of this poet is unique, and no two persons dispute regarding his precedence in composing verses and regarding the holy progeny of Prophet. He was an expert in memorizing (of facts) and was a very intelligent man, so much so that it is said:

"In addition to a thousand panegyrics in the meter of *Rajaz* (war songs), he wrote other poems (*Qata*) and panegyrics. He knew four thousand *Diwans* (collected poetical works) by heart."³

It is said: "He was intelligent and wise; was highly fond of poetry and famous for his good nature and nobility of self."

Husain bin Ishaq says:

"I asked Bahtari: "People think that you are a better poet than Abu Tamman."

He replied: "I swear that this statement has no benefit for me and no harm for him. By God, I only earn my livelihood. Alas, if it were true! But I am, by God, his follower, I take refuge in him, am inspired by him and my earth is much lower than his sky."⁴

Ammaara bin Aqil says in his statement, which Ibne Asakir⁵ has quoted in his *Tarikh*: When he heard the following verses:

¹ Tareekh Khateeb, 8:248.

² Ref: *Fehrist Najashi*: 102 [Pg. 141, No. 367].

³ Ref: *Miratul Jinan*, 2:102 [deaths of 231 A.H.].

⁴ Ref: *Tareekh Baghdad*, 8:248.

⁵ Tareekh Madinatul Damishq, 4:22 [4/157; Muhtarsar Tareekh Damishq, 6:181].

“And too much of remaining in the same place makes one unpopular so they keep aloof from him. Indeed, I saw that people are fond of the sun as it does remain there all the time.”

If poetical merit is the name of beauty of words and subtlety of meaning, then only Abu Tammam is the poet; if other than him there is someone else, I am unaware of that.

Collected poems of Abu Tammam

It is said that he did not compile his poetic works, except in a manner mentioned in *Baghiatul Waata* that Uthman bin Muthanna Qurtubi (d. 273 A.H.) has read out his collection to him.¹ This shows that his verses were compiled during his lifetime. And after him is the group of elders and literary experts, who arranged his work, wrote glosses on it and maintained a record of it.

Apparently, the printed copy of collected poetical works (*Diwan*) of Abu Tammam, is one by Abu Bakr Muhammad bin Yahya Sauli (d. 335 A.H.) on the basis of alphabetical order, even though many of the verses are omitted as Najjashi has mentioned in his book of *Fehrist*.²

He composed numerous verses in praise of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and Ahmad bin Husain has said that he saw an ancient copy, perhaps inscribed during the lifetime of Abu Tammam or close to that. It contained a panegyric about Holy Imams (a.s.) till it reaches upto Abu Ja’far, the second, [Imam Jawad (a.s.)], because he died during the time of this Imam.

But in the present *Diwan*, there is no trace of any panegyric other than the *Raiya Qasida*, which was mentioned previously. Like other books, the publishers made this book also a target of dishonesty or what is printed are verses that Abul Aala Muarra has explained.

Birth and death

There is no certainty according to historical records regarding the date of his birth and death, because there is much dispute in it and it is enough to believe what his son, Tammam has mentioned, as family members know the situation best. But in that also there are various versions, among them being: He was born in 172 or 188 or 190 or 192 and he died in Mosul in 228 or 231 or 232 and he was buried there.

The poet left behind a son named Tammam, who was also a poet. After the death of his father, he recited a Qasida in praise of Abdullah bin Tahir and Abdullah asked him to recite the poem of Abu Tammam and he recited:

“May the Lord of the people keep you alive; because He gave you a handsome face. Baghdad became illuminated with your effulgence and through your bestowal, the trees put on leaves.”

¹ *Baghiatul Waata*: 324 [2/136. No. 1634].

² *Rijal Najjashi*: 102 [Pg. 141, No. 367].

Abdullah was silent for a time and then recited:

“May the Lord of people keep you alive; indeed what you aspired made you commit a mistake. You came to one, whose pocket is empty and if he had something, he would have definitely given it to you.”

Tamman said: “O chief, selling a couplet in exchange of a couplet is usury. So place some money along with it.”

Abdullah smiled and said: “Although you don’t have the power of your father’s poetry, you have not lost his delicacy. And he ordered them to lavish gifts upon him.”¹

Only the valiant fall in the battlefield

It is amazing about someone as religious as Abu Tammam; how he was deceived by those enemies? Who defame the righteous and show good people as evil. Among good personalities that the enemies tried to defame is the standard bearer of guidance, the holy warrior and revolutionary, Abu Ubaidah Thaqafi. Being influenced by the propaganda of the enemies, Abu Tammam composed the following verses regarding Mukhtar.²

“The victimized caravan of the Hashemites set out from Kerbala and Mukhtar applied ointment to their wounds through revenge, although he (Mukhtar) was not on the right religion. And when his intention became clear, they declared aloofness from him.”

One, who studies history, traditions and science of narrators carefully, would understand that Mukhtar is in the foremost row of the elders of religion, guidance and sincerity and his valuable uprising was only to establish justice by destroying foundations of apostasy and uprooting Umayyad oppression, and he is far from the Kaisani religion and all allegations against him are false.

That is why the Holy Imams (a.s.): Imam Zainul Abideen (a.s.), Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) and Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) invoked divine blessings on him, Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) praised him much and his acts were always appreciated by Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

Prominent scholars have praised him and declared that he was remote from negative beliefs or acts; among them being³: our chief, Jamaluddin bin Tawus, Ayatullah Allamah in *Khulasa*, Ibne Dawood in *Rijal*, and Faqiq of Ibne Numa in a separate treatise, which he wrote about this, entitled: *Zaubun Nazar*. Muhaqqiq Ardibeli in *Hadiqatush Shia*; author of *Maalim* in *At-Tahrirut Tawusi*; Qaazi Nurullah Marashi in *Majalis*; and Shaykh Abu Ali in *Muntahiyul Maqal* and others.

¹ Ref: *Ghurarul Khasais*, Watwat: 259 [Pg. 262].

² *Diwan Abi Tammam*: 114 [Pg. 135].

³ *At-Tahrirut Tawusi* [Pg. 558, No. 418]; *Rijal*, Allamah Hilli [Pg. 168, No. 2]; *Rijal Ibne Dawood* [Pg. 277, No. 493]; *Zaubun Nazar*, published in *Behaarul Anwaar*:- [45/346]; *Hadiqatush Shia* [2/30]; *Majaalesul Momineen* [2/245]; *Muntahiyul Maqal* [Pg. 364].

Such were the positive statements of ancient scholars regarding him that our Shaykh, Shaheed Awwal, in his book of *Mazar*, has mentioned a special Ziyarat about him and in that there is clear testimony of his excellence, his well wishing in Mastership (*Wilayat*), his sincerity in divine obedience and regard for Imam Zainul Abideen (a.s.). It also contains the approval of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and their descendants. That he sacrificed his life for approval of Holy Imams (a.s.), supporting the Holy Progeny and taking revenge on their behalf.

This Ziyarat is mentioned in *Muradul Mureed* by Shaykh Ali bin Husain Haeri, which is the translation of *Mazar* of Shaheed. Shaykh Nizamuddin Sauji, author of *Nizamul Aqool* has regarded this Ziyarat authentic. This Ziyarat shows that the tomb of Mukhtar in ancient times, was a well known place of visitation for Shia as mentioned in *Rahla* of Ibne Batuta.¹ There was a famous building over his tomb.

Some senior scholars, who have written the biography of Mukhtar, or about his achievements and beliefs etc, are the following:

1. Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Ali bin Babawayh Qummi, Saduq (d. 381 A.H.) has written a book entitled *Al-Mukhtar*.
2. Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Hasan Tusi (d. 469 A.H.) has written *Mukhtasar Akhbarul Mukhtar*.
3. Sayyid Mohsin Amin Amili has written *Asdaqul Akhbar fee Qissatul Akhaza bith Thaar*, which has been published.

10. Dibil Khuzai

Martyred 246 A.H.

1. He didn't make it easy for this religion to be among them, except allegiance completed in haste and without any thought.² 2. And if this allegiance had not been there, the statement Saqifah folks was misguidance. 3. If they had entrusted Caliphate to one, in whose favor it was willed, they would have entrusted it to Ali (a.s.), administration would have been perfectly organized and people would have been secure from deviation. 4. Brother of the seal of prophets, who is immune from defects, who beheaded warriors during battles. 5. So, if they refuse Ghadeer and Badr and lofty and vast mountains of Uhud are witnesses of that. 6. And verses of Quran are witnesses to his excellence and sacrifice. 7. And prominent qualities, in which he took precedence over them, are merits with which he was imbued before all of them.

¹ *Rihla*, Ibne Batuta, 1:138 [Pg. 220].

² A reference to Umar's statement that the allegiance of Abu Bakr was hasty matter, from whose mischief, Almighty Allah kept us secure.

This Qasida has 121 verses.¹

Explanation regarding the verses from the statements of important Ahle Sunnat scholars

1. Abul Faraj writes in *Aghani*:²

The panegyric (*Qasida*) of Dibil, in which he says:

مدارس آیات خلت من تلاوہ و منزوحی مفتر العرصات

“There is the place of taking lesson from the verses of Quran, which are devoid of recitation and the place of descent of divine revelation is empty of inhabitants.”³

...is his best among his verses regarding Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and he recited this Qasida for Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) in Khorasan.

Dibil says: I came to Ali bin Moosa Reza (a.s.) and he said: Recite some verses. So I recited as follows:

مدارس آیات خلت من تلاوہ و منزوحی مفتر العرصات

“There is the place of taking lesson from verses of Quran, which are devoid of recitation and the place of descent of divine revelation is empty of inhabitants.”

Till I came to the line:

اذ و تروا مدوا الى و اتريهم اكفا عن الاوتار من قبضات

“When they became targets of victimization, they stretched their hands to their oppressors, which are tied from taking revenge.”

Dibil says: So Imam (a.s.) wept till he became unconscious. And the servant, who stood at the head of the Imam gestured me to fall quiet and I fell silent. After sometime, he (Imam) said: Recite again. So I recited again and when I came to that same verse, the same thing happened. The servant gestured me to keep quiet and I fell silent. After sometime, the Imam again told me to repeat the poem and I repeated it, till I came to the end.

Then he told me three times: Excellent! Then he ordered for ten thousand dirhams minted in his name, to be given to me. As much amount was never given to anyone. The Imam also instructed his servants to give me other valuables and ornaments and he brought them for me. I came to Iraq and sold each dirham for ten dirhams and Shia of Imam purchased them and a hundred thousand dirhams accumulated with me and this was the first money that I had accumulated.⁴

Ibne Mahruya says: Huzaifah bin Muhammad narrated to me that Dibil said:

¹ The complete Qasida is mentioned in *Ayanush Shia*, 6/418.

² *Al-Aghani*, 18:29 [20/132 & 162].

³ This is the 30th line of the Qasida and this Qasida is named after this line only.

⁴ Ref: *Mahadut Tansis*, 1:205, [2/199, No.115]; *Uyun Akhbar Reza*: 280 [2/296, H. 34].

I requested Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) for a dress he had worn, so that I may place it in my shroud. Imam (a.s.) gave me that. The people of Qom learnt about it and asked me to sell it to them for 30000 dirhams, but I refused. So they waylaid me and seized that dress from me, saying: If you want you can take cash in exchange of it, and if not, do what you like. I said: By God, I will not give it willingly and it is of no use to you if you take it by force and I will complain about it to Imam Ali Reza (a.s.). After that I offered to sell them a sleeve of that shirt for 30000 dirhams. And they agreed.

It is also said that he wrote the following Qasida on a dress:

مدارس آیات خلت من تلاوه و منزل وحی مقفِر العرصات

“There is the place of taking lesson from the verses of Quran, which are devoid of recitation and the place of descent of divine revelation, is empty of inhabitants.”

And instructed them to place it in his shroud.¹

2. Hafiz Ibne Asakir says in his *Tarikh*:²

When Mamun was established in his Caliphate and minted coins in his name, he began to gather the relics about the excellence of the progeny of Prophet, among them being the following couplet of Dibil:

**مدارس آیات خلت من تلاوه و منزل وحی مقفِر العرصات
لال رسول الله بالخیف من منی وبالرکن والتعريف والجبرات**

“The schools have become devoid of recitation and teaching of verses of Quran. The place of revelation have become deserted. The ranks of the family of Prophet are in the Masjid of Kheef, Mina and in Kaaba, Arafat and Jamarat.”

This verse was continually in the heart of Mamun till Dibil met him,³ and he said: Recite the *Taiya Qasida* for me and no harm would come to you. I guarantee you security. Indeed, I know all of it, but I want to hear from you directly.

So Dibil recited the Qasida till he reached this line:

1. Do you not see that since thirty years I am in permanent state of distress? 2. I see their share being distributed among others and their hands are devoid of their shares. 3. So, the progeny of Messenger of Allah has become emaciated and progeny of Ziyad has become obese. 4. Daughters of Ziyad are safe in their tents whereas daughters of Prophet wander in

¹ This statement is mentioned in *Mo'jamul Odaba*, 4:196 [11/103] and *Mahadut Tansis*, 1:205, [2/199, No.115] and in *Asrul Mamun*, 3:255.

² *Tareekh Madinatul Damishq*, 5/234 [6/77; and in *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 8/182].

³ From this point till the end it is mentioned in the following books: *Al-Aghani*, 18:58 [20/195]; *Zuhurul Aadaab*, 1:86 [1/134]; *Mahadut Tansis*, 1:205, [2/198, No. 115]; *Ittihaf*: 165.

wilderness. 5. When they became targets of victimization, they stretched their hands to their oppressors, which is tied from taking revenge. 6. Thus, if there had been nothing to hope for today or tomorrow, I would have also died along with them in regret.

Mamun wept till his beard was wet and his tears flowed on his chest and Dibil was first to meet him and was the last to leave him.

Shaykhul Islam, Abu Ishaq Hamawaini (d. 722 A.H.) has narrated from Ahmad bin Ziyad from Dibil Khuzai:

I recited the following panegyric for my master, Imam Ali Reza (a.s.):

“The schools have become devoid of recitation and teaching of verses of Quran. The place of revelation have become deserted.”

Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) asked: “Can I add two verses to your poem?”

“Yes, O son of Allah’s Messenger (s.a.w.a.),” said I. So he said:

وقربوس يالها من مصيبة الحشيشة بالزفران
الى الحشر حتى يبعث الله قائمًا يفرج عن الهم والكربات

**“And a tomb shall be made in Tus, by whose tragedy
The inner portion of the body will be scorched.
And this will continue till resurrection when Allah sends a Qaim
Through him would He remove the calamities from us.”¹**

Dibil says: Then I recited the remaining panegyric (*Qasida*), and when I reached the verse:

خروج امام لا محالة خارج يقوم على اسم الله و البركات

“Uprising of an Imam, which would definitely occur; he would stage an uprising with the name of God and His blessings.”

Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) wept severely and then said: “O Dibil, the Holy Spirit has spoken from your tongue. Do you know who this Imam is?”

“No,” I replied, “I only heard that an Imam will come from your progeny, who would fill up the earth with justice and equity.”

Imam (a.s.) said: “Indeed, the Imam after me is my son Muhammad and after Muhammad my son, Ali; and after Ali, his son, Hasan and after Hasan, his son, the Hujjat and the Qaim and during his occultation, people would wait for him and during his reappearance, they would obey him and he would fill up the earth with justice and equity like it would have been fraught with injustice and oppression. As for the time of his reappearance, it is like informing about time of

¹ Imam (a.s.) added the following lines to the composition of Dibil: And there is a grave in Baghdad for the purified one, and the Beneficent Lord has made it into a chamber of Paradise.

Qiyamat (which no one knows, except Almighty Allah). Indeed, my father narrated from his forefathers from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that his simile is like the simile of Qiyamat, which would not come, except of a sudden.”

Statements of prominent Shia personalities

Numerous senior Shia personalities have mentioned the story of the robbery of the dress, but we won’t mention it here as it would prolong the discussion. We shall be content only to mention statements not mentioned previously:

Shaykh Saduq in *Uyun*¹ and *Kamaluddin*² has narrated from Harwi that Dibil bin Ali Khuzai came to Abil Hasan Ali bin Moosa ar-Reza (a.s.) in Merv and said:

“O son of Allah’s Messenger, I have composed a panegyric in your honor and I vowed that I will not recite it to anyone before you. The Imam said: Recite it. And he recited as follows:

“Schools of verses empty of recitations

And the House of revelation horrendously empty.”

When I reached the verse:

“Their property has been distributed to others

Their hands are empty of their own wealth.”

Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) began to weep and said: “O Dibil you have said the truth.”

When Dibil reached to the verse:

“When they are being oppressed, they stretch to the enemies

Their hands which cannot hold the bow.”

Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) began to rub his hands and then said: By Allah my hands are tied. When Dibil reached to the verse:

“Indeed I am fearful of the world and the changing times

Thus, I hope in peace and security after my death.”

Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) said: “O Dibil, May Allah keep you in His protection till Judgment Day.”

When Dibil recited the last verse of the panegyric:

“There is a tomb of a purified personality in Baghdad

That Allah has placed in gardens of Paradise.”³

Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) said: “O Dibil, would it not be better if I add the

¹ *Uyun Akhbar Reza*: 368 [2/294, H. 34, Chap. 66].

² *Kamaluddin*: [Pg. 373, 376, Chap. 35].

³ Almighty Allah says in Surah Saba: “And not your wealth nor your children are the things which bring you near Us in station, but whoever believes and does good, these it is for whom is a double reward for what they do, and they shall be secure in the highest places.” (Surah Saba 34:37)

following two verses at the end of your panegyric?"

Dibil said: "Indeed, son of Allah's Messenger." The Imam recited:

"And a tomb shall be made in Tus by whose tragedy

The inner portion of the body will be scorched.

And this will continue till resurrection when Allah sends a Qaim

Through him would He remove the calamities from us."

Dibil asked: "O son of Allah's Messenger, whose tomb would be made at Tus?"

"Mine," said the Imam, "I would soon move to Tus, where my tomb will become a place of visitation for my Shias. So, one, who visits me in my isolation in Tus, shall be with me on Judgment Day and he shall get salvation."

After listening to the verses of Dibil, Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) arose. A servant of the Imam came to Dibil with a hundred dinars minted in the Imam's name and said: The Imam has sent these for your traveling expenses. Dibil said: I don't need it and neither did I compose the panegyric for monetary gain. But I beseech the Imam to give me a dress he has worn, so that it be a blessing and honor for me.

The Imam sent a gown to Dibil and also gave him the dinars saying that he would need them. Dibil took all the things and departed along with a caravan of Merv. When the caravan camped at Qauhan, they were attacked by robbers, who looted everything and took the travelers as hostages. Then they began to divide the loot among themselves. One of the robbers hummed the following verse of Dibil:

"Their property has been distributed to others

Their hands are empty of their own wealth."

Dibil asked him: "Whose verse is it?"

He replied: "A person of Khuzai tribe, called Dibil bin Ali."

Dibil said: "I am the same Dibil, who composed these verses."

That robber took Dibil to his leader, who was praying on top of a mound and he was a Shia. He himself came down to meet Dibil and asked: "Are you Dibil?" "Yes," Dibil said. He said: "Recite that panegyric." He recited it.

The robbers released all hostages and returned with respect everything they had looted. When Dibil reached Qom, it was announced that he would recite the panegyric composed by him in the mosque.

A time was fixed and people gathered in the Jame mosque. Dibil mounted the pulpit and presented the panegyric. People gifted him in cash and kind. When they came to know that Dibil had a gown of Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) they offered a thousand dinars for the same, but he refused. They said: "Give us a piece from this gown for a thousand dinars." But Dibil refused and he departed from Qom. He has hardly left the Qom area when a desert tribe attacked and looted the

Imam's gown also. Dibil demanded them to return it, but they refused. They asked for a ransom of 8000 dinars, but Dibil refused. At last when Dibil became helpless he told them to give only a piece from this gown. So they gave him a piece of gown and also gave him 8000 dinars.

Dibil returned to his hometown, but on the way dacoits surrounded him and looted everything he had. He was left with only a hundred dinars that the Imam had given. Dibil converted these into 10000 dirhams. At that time he remembered the Imam's statement that he would need that money.

Dibil was accompanied by a maid servant, who was seriously ill. The doctors said that her right eye was lost, but it was possible to cure the left eye. Dibil was shocked and wept much. Then he remembered that he was having a piece of that gown. In the early evening, Dibil rubbed that piece against the maid's eyes and by the following morning both her eyes were cured and by the blessings of Abul Hasan (a.s.) even the signs of disease did not remain.”¹

According to Mishkatul Anwar² and Mawajjal Ahzan:³

It is narrated that when Dibil recited the Qasida to Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) and mentioned Hazrat Hujjat (a.t.f.s.), saying:

“Uprising of an Imam, which would definitely occur; he would stage an uprising with the name of God and His blessings.”

Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) placed his hand on his head as a mark of respect while he stood and prayed for reappearance.

Introduction to the poet

Abu Ali – Abu Ja’far – Dibil bin Ali bin Razin bin Uthman bin Abdur Rahman bin Abdullah bin Budail bin Waraqah bin ...bin Rabia Khuza'i⁴

Family of Razin

Although Ibne Rashiq, in the book of *Umdah*⁵ has extolled him only as a poet, but his family was a family of knowledge, excellence and literature, because there were among them, tradition scholars and poets and by the blessings of supplications of Prophet, leadership and every kind of excellence was present in their chief ancestor, Budail bin Waraqah.

When Abbas bin Abdul Muttalib brought Budail to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and said: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), today is the day in which you exalted some people and accorded honor to them, thus what is the suggestion regarding your uncle, Budail bin Warqa, who, in your tribe has the least distance

¹ Tabarsi has mentioned this event in *Elamul Wara*: 191 [Pg. 316]; and Irbili in *Kashful Ghumma*: 275 [3/112].

² Written by Shaykh Muhammad bin Abdul Jabbar Bahrani.

³ Written by Shaykh Abdul Reza bin Muhammad Awali Bahrani.

⁴ Ref: Fehrist Najashi: 116 [Pg. 161, No. 428]; Tareekh Ibne Asakir 5:227 [Tareekh Medina Damishq 6/86; Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq].

⁵ *Al-Umdah* 2:290 [307/2, Chap. 102].

till the ancestor of the tribe? The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) replied: O Budail, move your eyebrows aside; he did that and moved his veil to one side, then he saw blackness on his cheek and asked: "What is your age, O Budail?"

He replied: "Ninety-seven years complete."

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) looked into his eyes and said: "May God enhance year elegance and make you and your family prosperous."¹

The basis of their greatness and rank was Abdullah bin Waraqa bin Budail and as mentioned in *Rijal* of Shaykh, he and his two brothers Abdur Rahman and Muhammad were two ambassadors of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to Yemen.

These three persons and their brother, Uthman were fighters in the army of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), who were martyred in the Battle of Siffeen.² And their fifth brother, Nafe bin Budail was martyred during the period of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Ibne Rawaha recited an elegy for him:

"May God have mercy on Nafe bin Nufail, like the mercy on one, who is in pursuit of reward of Jihad. He, who was patient and truthful and when people spoke much, he was steadfast and truthful in speaking."³

It is sufficient for the nobility of this family that there are five martyrs from them and they were at the side of the cousin of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and Abdullah was in the foremost rank of valor and had more precedence in warfare as well as religion.

As mentioned in *Isabah*⁴: Zuhri regards him as one of the five most intelligent persons among Arabs. As for the father of Dibil, Ali bin Razin, he was a poet of his age and Marzabani has mentioned his biography in *Mojamush Shuara*⁵; Ibne Rashiq has said in *Umdah*:⁶ Abdullah bin Razin, Uncle of Dibil was also a poet.

Abdul Hasan Ali, brother of Dibil

He was a poet and as mentioned in *Fehrist* of Ibne Nadim, his collected poetical works (*Diwan*) comprise of fifty pages. In 198 A.H. he traveled with his brother, Dibil to meet Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) and both remained with Imam for a long time. He born in the year 172 A.H. and he passed away in 283 A.H.

Dibil Khuzai

He was named as Dibil⁷ and agnomen was Abu Ali. In *Aghani*, it is narrated

¹ *Amali Shaykh*: 239 [Pg. 376, H. 805]; *Al-Isabah* 1:141 [No. 614].

² *Siffeen*, Ibne Muzahim: 126 [Pg. 245]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha* 1:486 [5/196, Sermon 65]; *Al-Isabah* 3:371 [No. 7758].

³ *Al-Isabah* 3:543 [No. 8650].

⁴ *Al-Isabah* 2:281.

⁵ *Mojamush Shuara* 1:283 [Pg. 136].

⁶ *Al-Umdah* 2:290 [307/2, Chap. 102].

⁷ 'Dibil' means a she-camel having a young one with her. Ref: *Al-Aghani* [20/134 & 135].

from Ibne Ayyub that his name was Muhammad and according to *Tarikh*¹ of Khatib, it is narrated from Ismail that his wet nurse jokingly gave him the title of Dibil. But his wet nurse had intended naming him as Zibil. But after that 'Z' was changed into 'D'.

It is said that he was originally from Kufa as mentioned in numerous books, but he mostly lived in Baghdad.

His biography is discussed from four aspects:

1. His extreme devotion for Ahle Bayt (a.s.).
2. His poetic expertise and his books.
3. His narration of traditions and those, who have quoted from him.
4. His attitude to Caliphs; his interesting and eloquent statements; and his final years and passing away.

As for the first aspect

The first part is so clear that there is no need for explanation. He was heard saying that since fifty years, he was carrying his crucifix on his shoulders, but no one was crucifying him. Muhammad bin Malik Ziyat was told that he has written a satire on him. He replied: "He is carrying his crucifix and boldly roaming about since thirty years² that someone may impale him."

All this malice and jealousy was there, because he did not refrain from lampooning enemies of Aale Muhammad (a.s.). He also did not have any supporter. His poems were famous among all. At last they caused his death. Most of his satire was directed to the enemies of family of Prophet and usurpers of their rights. They deemed that Mastership (*Wilayat*) can be sincere only when one declared immunity from enemies. Like God and Prophet declared immunity from polytheists. Almighty Allah has not bestowed two hearts in any one chest.

But often writers of biography, inimical to Ahle Bayt (a.s.) regarded it to be the unforgivable crime of Dibil as is their conduct with Shia most of the time. He was all the time roaming about in the deserts in fear of the rulers and animosity of people.

In spite of all this, he recited Qasidas to the travelers and gatherings were embellished with his presence; which was a source of pleasure for friends and anger for the enemies. It was an impetus for malice towards him and finally culminated in his killing.

What is mostly written in condemnation of Dibil is that he used satire too much. Indeed, he composed satire only about those inimical to Holy Progeny and through this sought proximity to God and basically this act is a source of proximity to God. And pure Mastership (*Wilayat*) is only possible when one declares immunity from opponents as God and His Prophet declared immunity

¹ Tareekh Baghdad 8:383.

² *Tabaqatul Shuara*, Ibne Motaz 125 [265].

from polytheists:

مَا جَعَلَ اللَّهُ لِرَجُلٍ مِّنْ قَلْبَيْنِ فِي جَوْفِهِ

“Allah has not made for any man two hearts within him.”¹

His literary expertise

Then what is more clear evidence than his famous couplets, which are intoned by everyone, found in numerous books and are source for piety and religiosity. When one hears his easy couplets one thinks that he can also compose couplets like him, but after diving into that deep sea he feels utterly helpless. Composing such couplets is beyond ones capacity and one cannot even compose something resembling it.

Muhammad bin Qasim bin Mahruya says:

“I heard from my father that: Poetry ended with Dibil.”²

Traditions narrated by him

Ibne Shahr Ashob in *Maalim*,³ has regarded him among companions of Imam Moosa Kazim (a.s.) and Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) and Najjashi in his *Fehrist*⁴ has narrated from his nephew that he saw Moosa bin Ja’far and met Abu Hasan Reza (a.s.) and lived till the time of Imam Muhammad bin Ali Jawad (a.s.) and met him as well.

Himyari in *Dalail* and Thiqatul Islam, Kulaini in *Usul Kafi*⁵ have narrated that he met Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) and His Eminence (a.s.) awarded gifts to him; but he did not praise Almighty Allah; so the Imam asked:

“Why didn’t you praise Allah, the Mighty and High?”

Then he came to Imam Jawad (a.s.) and His Eminence (a.s.) bestowed him with gifts and Dibil said: “Praise be to Allah.”

So Imam (a.s.) said: “You have become well mannered.”

Dibil has narrated from some people and some people have narrated from him.⁶

His conduct with Caliphs and ministers

This is a the broadest aspect of the life of Dibil. Regarding this books of history contain extensive incidents from his life.

Birth and death

He was born in 148 A.H. and when he was an extremely old man, he was

¹ Surah Ahzab 33:4

² Ref: *Al-Aghani* 18:18 & 37 [20/135 & 149].

³ *Maalimul Ulama*: 139 [Pg. 151].

⁴ *Rijal Najashi*: 198 [Pg. 277, No. 727].

⁵ *Usul Kafi* [1/496, H. 8].

⁶ [Ref: *Al-Ghadeer* 2:527-529].

unjustly martyred in the year 246 A.H. He was ninety-seven years and some months old at that time.

11. Abu Ismail Alawi

1. My grandfather was Ali, minister of Prophet, his cousin and a shooting star in raging battle. 2. Was he not the first in the Battle of Badr to perform many feats of valor and who slashed at those, who came into the battlefield? 3. And the first of those, who prayed and testified Almighty Allah as One with most excellent visitors of Kaaba and Zamzam. 4. And he was the protagonist of Ghadeer Day, when Ahmad arose and clearly announced: 5. O Ali, I announce you as Moosa with whom God conversed, anointed Harun. 6. God's blessings on him as long the sun shines and till Hajis come to the Kaaba.

Introduction to the poet

His name was Abu Ismail Muhammad bin Ali bin Abdullah bin Abbas bin Hasan bin Ubaidullah bin Abbas bin Imam Ameerul Momineen Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).

He was a descendant of the great tree of Caliphate and a pride of the Holy Progeny.

His excellence lies in the fact that he was a descendant of Abbas Ibne Ali and very few people can boast of such lineage.

When he went to the court of Mamun, the sentry stopped him. He said: "I will go only if I am permitted and if not, I will go back. This policy of ignoring is not correct." Then he recited a couplet to highlight his point.

He was a very witty person and firm of conviction like his grandfather. He commanded a respectable rank and his lines are used as idioms and proverbs; like his statement about a member of his family: I not pleased that his knowledge should exceed his intelligence; as I am not pleased that his talks exceed his acts.

12. Wamiq Nasrani

1. Was it not in Ghadeer Khum that Muhammad made Ali rise up in the presence of those, who had attended the Hajj. 2. And said: Of whomsoever I am the master, after me Ali son of Fatima binte Asad is (also) his master. 3. Then he said: O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those inimical to him. 4. And you created enmity to all tribes in the path of God and did not pay heed to any condemnation in God's way. 5. After Muhammad, you were the most deserving, and the ignorant people of the community are never like the wise.

Explanation of the verses

It is possible for Christians to intone the praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), because they had not embraced Islam; so how can they have faith in Islamic

Caliphate? But the fact is that even opponent of Islam were aware of the excellence of Ali (a.s.).

He possessed merits like a good nature, extensive knowledge, numerous extraordinary qualities, and his valor and miracle, regarding which the Prophet of Islam (s.a.w.a.) has mentioned. Scholars of other religions have confessed and the excellence of the Prophet and his successor are mentioned by numerous writers.

As we see, numerous books of Christian writers mention the excellence of Prophet and his successor.¹

Introduction to the poet

Buqrat bin Ashwat Wamiq Armani Nasrani was the ruler and great leader of Armenia in the third century. Ibne Shahr Ashob, in his *Maalimul Ulama*² has mentioned him among those, who were moderate in their praise for Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

A large number of Christians have praised Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and composed panegyrics about him; among them being their poet, Zainaba³ bin Ishaq Rasani Mosuli Nasrani.

Baihaqi in *Mahasin wal Masawa*⁴ and Zamakhshari in *Rabiul Abrar*⁵ have mentioned these couplets from him:

1. I don't want to condemn the family of Adi and Teem, but I am a supporter of Bani Hashim. 2. I don't care for any condemnation because of praising Ali and his family. 3. People say: What is the matter that pious ones of Arabs, non-Arabs and Christians have affection to Ali? 4. I told them that not only me, all the creatures, even the enemies love Ali.

Our Shaykh, Imaduddin Tabari, in part two of his *Basharatul Mustafa*⁶ has narrated these verses from Abu Yaqub Nasrani:

1. What to say of that tree of Paradise that no other tree can equal. 2. Mustafa is its root, Fatima its branch and the chief of humans, Ali is its trunk. 3. His two Hashemite sons: Hasnain, are its fruits and all Shias, leaves. 4. All authentic sources have mentioned this statement of Prophet. 5. I am attached to them and I hope for salvation through them. 6. And hope to be raised among them in the hereafter.

In these verses, the poet has hinted at the traditional report of Messenger of

¹ [Ref: *Al-Ghadeer* 3:16-17].

² *Maalimul Ulama* [Pg. 151].

³ [In *Nafe Tayyib* 3/137 it is mentioned as Zainab binte Ishaq, in *Isafur Raghibeen*, Zabita bin Ishaq and in *Rabeeul Abraar* 1/487, Zabina Nasrani].

⁴ *Mahasin wal Masawa* 1:50 [Pg. 69].

⁵ *Rabeeul Abraar* 1:487.

⁶ *Basharatul Mustafa* /4.

Allah (s.a.w.a.), which scholars¹ have quoted that:

“I am the tree and Fatima is its branches and Ali is its trunk and Hasan and Husain are its fruits and our Shia are its leaves and the tree is rooted in the Adn Paradise and other trees are in the rest of the Paradise.”

These are the wordings of the tradition according to Ahle Sunnat. According to our scholars, it is as follows:

“People are created from different trees; I and Ali Ibne Abi Talib are created from one and the same tree; then what is your statement regarding the tree, whose root I am and Fatima is its branch and Ali is its trunk and Hasan and Husain are its fruit and our Shia are its leaves. So, one, who attaches himself to one of its shoots, it would take him to Paradise and one, who abandons it, would fall into Hell.”²

Among the latter Christians, who composed verses in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is Abul Masih Antaki Misri in his poem entitled *Alawiya* having 5595 lines.

The first slogan of the period of Ignorance

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ ارْتَدُوا عَلَى آدَبِهِمْ مِّنْ بَعْدِ مَا تَبَيَّنَ لَهُمُ الْهُدَىٰ لَا الشَّيْطَانُ
سَوَّلَ لَهُمْ طَوَّافَ لَهُمْ^④

“Surely (as for) those who turn on their backs after that guidance has become manifest to them, the Shaitan has made it a light matter to them; and He gives them respite.”³

Those researchers, who write on the basis of the writings of orientalists their view regarding Islamic history is often unreliable and is a prey of distortion:

فَمَا أَغْنَى عَنْهُمْ سَمْعُهُمْ وَلَا أَبْصَارُهُمْ وَلَا أُفْدَتُهُمْ مِّنْ شَيْءٍ إِذْ كَانُوا
يَجْحَدُونَ لَا يُلِيقُ اللَّهُ وَحَقَّ بِهِمْ مَا كَانُوا بِهِ يَسْتَهِنُونَ^⑤

“In what We have not established you in, and We had given them ears and eyes and hearts, but neither their ears, nor their eyes, nor their hearts availed them aught, since they denied the communications of Allah, and that which they mocked encompassed them.”⁴

It seems from their ridicule of truth that though Abu Jahl is dead, his ignorance is alive; Abu Lahab is gone, but the torch of misguidance is not

¹ Hakeem in *Mustadrak* 3:160 [3/174, H. 4755] and Ibne Asakir in his *Tareekh* 4:318 [5/43; *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq* 7/123]; and Mohibuddin in *Riyaz* 2/253; and Ibne Sabbagh in *Fusul* :11 [Pg. 25].

² Basharatul Mustafa Ilaa Shia Murtada, Muhammad bin Ali Tabari /76.

³ Surah Muhammad 47:25

⁴ Surah Ahqaf 46:26

extinguished. Such writers want to bring back ignorance, and using old prejudice, make wrong interpretations.¹

One of them is Ustad Ameel Darmunghan, author of *Hayat Muhammad*.

When this person saw that today the call of Islam has spread throughout the world from the east to the west, it was very hard upon him as was the case of his predecessors, that they should have to witness this universal kingdom.

It was hard upon him to see in the place where he lives – that is in the west – the rise of eastern Islam and illumination of scientific thoughts and he saw teachers of community propagating Holy Quran in Arabic and disseminating religious theories in European capitals.

It was hard upon him that from the heart of the western world and he heard through his own ears from philosophers that Muhammad opposed duality in Godhead and advocated oneness of God.²

Or he heard someone call out: Indeed, Quran is a general law, which falsehood cannot approach from front or rear and it is valid for every time and place.³

Or hears from the third person of his community: The foundations of Islam stand on clear verses. Verses revealed one after another, and the last of the verses is as follows:

الْيَوْمَ أَكْمَلْتُ لَكُمْ دِيْنَكُمْ وَأَتْمَمْتُ عَلَيْكُمْ نِعْمَتِي وَرَضِيَتُ لَكُمْ
الإِسْلَامَ دِيْنًا

“This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed
My favor on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion.”⁴

Or hears the Quran read out from the radio morning and evening and whose verses reach the hearing of people of the world, his community or any other community.

“And the tongue of his nature calls out in the earth while its call was raised in the east and the west, and recites: O one, who worships Isa! Indeed, Isa and his party, and Moosa, all of them were servants of Muhammad.”⁵

In such conditions, prejudice of this man is apparent and he becomes angry;⁶ he looks at Islam, its books and its prophet and prepares the background to defend his religion and invalid faith. So he raised his voice, which was full of malice and which mixed truth and untruth. He does not have the intention of

¹ A proverb is used in this text for a destitute, who instead of fire uses the heat of the sun.

² Statements of Kant Henry D'castre.

³ Statement of Masio Sanais.

⁴ Surah Maidah 5:3; Statement of Dr. Armanazi.

⁵ Verses of Abu Wafa Raje Hilli (d. 627 A.H.).

⁶ It is a well known proverb.

reforming, and in the name of Islam and life of Muhammad¹ he called people to Christianity and believes that Prophet of Islam was a Christian, who brought an Arabic book and he explains that His Eminence was one of the prophets.

He believes that Christianity influenced Muhammad, Christians awakened His Eminence before declaration of prophethood and the principles of Christianity exist in Quran.

He believes that Isa's support through Ruhul Quds is personal, but support of Moosa and Muhammad is not personal.

He believes that Isa has infallibility, which Muhammad does not have and he thinks that it is mentioned in Quran.²

He thinks that Christianity comprises of Islam and is more comprehensive and some things are added to it.

He believes that Christ is alone the son of God, although in mystical meaning or with nonsensical taste.

He believes that Quran invites to true Christianity: that Isa (a.s.) is god as well as human and that both natures came together in one person. He attributes his useless views to Holy Quran and imagines that Quran does not encompass the whole reality.

He thinks that the last Quran, on which reliance should be placed was writing of Hajjaj bin Yusuf Thaqafi and it is possible to recite Quran with other than what is revealed in it.

He thinks scholars of monotheism believe Christ to be God.

He thinks that there is a great distance between Muslims and Christians as a result of misunderstanding.

He thinks that distance between two religions comprises the view of commentators of Quran and scholars of Islam.

He thinks that reason and history regards it unlikely that the crucifixion of Christ should not have taken place.

He thinks that beliefs of Muslims that Christ was not crucified, is invalid and the verse used as evidence for it is ambiguous and complex.

And the verse:

وَمَا قَتَلُوهُ وَمَا صَلَبُوهُ وَلَكِنْ شُبِّهَ لَهُمْ

“And they did not kill him nor did they crucify him, but it appeared to them so (like Isa).”³

...is interpreted by them in different way appropriate to the teachings of Christianity.

¹ *Hayat Muhammad*, Emil Darmunghan: 100-118 [124-143].

² Alas, if he would only point out to us that verse which states this.

³ Surah Nisa 4:157

He regards denial of Christ's divinity and humanity an error of Arabian Peninsula and believes that the Prophet, till he did not become aware of correct Christianity, believed his faith to be the best.

He has described the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) as a desert dweller in very prejudiced manner.

Following are some examples of his corrupted views regarding the glad tidings and call to Christianity:

إِنَّمَا يَفْتَرِي الْكَذِبُ الَّذِينَ لَا يُؤْمِنُونَ بِأَيْتِ اللَّهِ وَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الْكَذِبُونَ ﴿٦﴾

“Only they forge the lie who do not believe in Allah’s communications, and these are the liars.”¹

If you want, you can become aware of the corrupted views of this man by referring to the book of: *Al-Huda Ilaa Deen al-Mustafa*, *Rahlatal Madrasiya* and other books of our teacher, Allamah Mujahid Hujjat Haq Shaykh Muhammad Jawad Balaghi Najafi, and other books that other Muslim scholars have written.

Decline of the east or decadence of Arabs

I don't think that the aims of such books were concealed from simple-minded people of Islamic community, what to say of elders of the nation! Thus, the Arabic community, which was at the forefront of east, what need it had of translations of such kinds of books, which was without religious, scientific, pure and chaste literature, literature of truth, trustworthiness and literature of truth and reality?

How Islamic community can need such books, whereas they have a divine book in Arabic, a book, which is such that:

لَا رَيْبَ ﴿٦﴾ فِيهِ هُدًى لِلْمُتَّقِينَ

“...there is no doubt in it, is a guide to those who guard (against evil).”²

How they can be needful while they are bearers of prophetic Sunnah and who have the book of *Nahjul Balagha* of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), compiled by Sayyid Razi? A book, which philosophers of the world regard lower than discourse of Creator and higher than discourse of creatures.

May his mother mourn him!

O Muslims of east, come with me so that we may ask the Palestinian teacher, Muhammad Adil Zaitar, an extremely mischievous man,³ who mentioned nonsense and acted disgracefully in translating *Hayat Muhammad*.

¹ Surah Nahl 16:105

² Surah Baqarah 2:2

³ A proverb is used in the original text, which implies an extremely mischievous person. Ref: *Majmaul Amthal* 3/486, No. 4557.

What a great crime against the Arabic Ummah in the preface of which he writes:

No doubt, orientalists committed crimes on the facts present in biography of Prophet and this led to Arab writers translating those books into Arabic as it is and in any case leaving the Arabic language from these things should be regarded as a defect.

How did they leave the Arabic language from crimes of the hands of ignorance, committed against realities in the scientific movement, which is regarded to circulate around Quran and Sunnah as criterions of intelligence of every wise man and the aim of every eastern or western philosopher?

The author himself writes in the preface of his book:

“The most important sources of biography of Muhammad are Quran, books of traditions and biography; although Quran is the briefest of these sources, but is the most accurate of them.”

Alas, he himself followed those writers and spread corrupted views in the Islamic society whereas he himself says:

“The reader should not think that I concur with all what the author has written, because in my view, a lot of what he has written is far from truth.”

May his mother sit in mourning! At what a low price has he sold nobility and greatness of the nation, prominence of faith and sacredness of Book and Sunnah! And he writes in the preface:

“In spite of good intention of the author, his views and opinions are not without errors.”

Alas, I and my community knows what need we have of the good intention of one, who regards Christ, Isa Ibne Maryam as God and regard him as the only son of God? And what tells us of the goodness of his intention, whereas every page from his book is deadlier than paths in dangerous wilderness.¹ There are very few pages in which his bad intentions and crooked thinking is not mentioned.

Yes, what we see – and “the believer sees through the light of God – is that the translator colluded with the author in publicizing untruths and negative image of Islam, which exposes the objectives of Umayyads. They kept aside positive manners, adopted bad morals and promoted intrigue.²

Yes, he regarded it as good to mention useless things, lies and false history, which destroys the respect of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and honor of holy progeny and wounded them through his words. Statements attributed to Umayyads show the holy progeny as degraded and attributed with bad nature and morals to such an extent that human nature cannot accept it. He writes:

¹ Ref: Al-Mustaqqi fee Amthalul Arab 1/443, No. 1875; Majmaul Bahrayn 1/290.

² Three Arabic proverbs are used in the Arabic version. Ref: Majmaul Amthal 1/475, 1422.

“Fatima was bad natured; and lesser to Ruqaiyyah in beauty and in intelligence, lesser than Zainab. When her father informed her from behind the curtain Fatima did not know that Ali Ibne Abi Talib had mentioned her name (and sought her hand in marriage). She regarded Ali as lowly, wicked and unfortunate, though he was very brave and in this way, Ali was not more attracted to Fatima than she was attracted to him.”¹

Ali was not handsome due to his bulging eyes, drooping eyelids, his low nose, huge belly and his baldness and all this in spite of the fact that he was valiant, pious, truthful, determined, sincere and righteous. Although laziness and doubt...

Ali lamented his hard times and for the sake of two handfuls of dates drew water from well in the date orchard of a Jew. Then brought the dates homes and said harshly to his wife: “Eat this and feed your children...”

Often Ali was upset and went to sleep in the Masjid. Fatima’s father came after him and after consoling him brought him back home. One day Muhammad saw that Ali has punched Fatima and Fatima cried.

In spite of that Muhammad always tried to pacify Fatima, telling her about precedence of Ali in Islam, as she was not absolutely devoted to Ali. Although Muhammad had two other Umayyad sons-in-law: Uthman and Abil Aasi and he conducted with them affectionately. That is why Ali often complained against the Prophet that he was not concerned about the happiness of his daughter and that is why he was always distressed.

When the Prophet commanded Ali to eliminate someone, the latter disobeyed. So Prophet did not leave the leadership to Ali.²

More serious than this was the incident of the confrontation of Ali and Fatima with their enemies; that is wives of Prophet. Fatima became infuriated with Prophet as he did not pay attention to her, because of paying excessive attention to his wives.

Such and other historical crimes with which this man has filled the pages of his book.

Blatant falsehood

I don’t condemn the author – may God catch his ears – although he mentioned falsehoods and invalid things,³ because he is from those, who are extremely infuriated with Islam and is so weak and erring that nothing good can be expected from him.⁴ And his book reveals all his defects and all anger and condemnation is on translator, who regards himself a Muslim, an easterner and an Arab, in spite of that he is guilty of such dishonesty. Yes, severe drought spoils

¹ Hayat Muhammad 197.

² Hayat Muhammad 199.

³ Arabic proverb; Ref: *Majmaul Amthal* 1/290, No. 851.

⁴ Arabic proverb.

the good pastures as well.¹

All these false statements in this book are incompatible with historically established facts and on which there is consensus of Islamic nation and what the Prophet informed.

Are his false statements regarding Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) compatible with the statement of Prophet that:

“Fatima is a human Hourie, whenever I am eager for Paradise, I kiss her.”²

Or when he said: “My daughter is Hourie from the human beings.”³

Or when he said: “Fatima: she is the radiant one.”⁴

Or is it compatible with the statement of the mother of Anas bin Malik, that:

“Fatima was like a full moon or a sun concealed behind clouds and then it comes out from behind the clouds and she was fair inclining to red; her hair was black and she resembled Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) the most. By God, she was such that the poet said: She was so fair that when she stood, her hair swept the floor and she was concealed in it. As if she was the day rising from behind the hair, and her hair were like a dark night upon her.”

Zahra, the title of Her Eminence, on which all have consensus, clearly reveals the fact.

Are these baseless statement compatible with the statements of Lady Khadija (s.a.) regarding purity of Fatima and her birth?

Fatima spoke when she was in the womb and when she was born, she placed her face on the earth, performed prostration and raised her finger to the heavens.⁵

Or is it compatible with the Ayesha when she said:

“I have not seen anyone, who was so like the Prophet in appearance, good nature, conduct and speaking, sitting and standing. When she came to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), he stood up, kissed and welcomed her; held her hand and made her sit in his place.”⁶

Is it compatible to what is narrated regarding her? That she was beautiful like the full moon and her neck was like the neck of a silver pitcher⁷ and there was a slight gap between her teeth,⁸ when she smiled, her teeth shone like pearls

¹ Ref: *Majmaul Amthal* 1/316, No. 947.

² *Taareekh*, Khateeb Baghdadi 5:87 [No. 2481].

³ *Sawaiq*: 96 [Pg. 160]; *Isafur Raghibeen*: 172; quoted from Nasai.

⁴ Nuzhatul Majalis, 2:222.

⁵ Siratul Malaa [Vol. 5/ Part 2/211]; Zakhaaerul Uqbah: 45; Nuzhatul Majalis, 2:227.

⁶ Hafiz Ibne Habban has mentioned this [in his *Saheeh* 15/403, H. 6953] and it is mentioned in *Zakhaaerul Uqbah*: 40; and Hafiz Tirmizi [*Sonan Tirmizi* 5/657, H. 3872] has regarded this tradition good.

⁷ *Siffeen*, Ibne Muzahim: 262 [Pg. 233]; *Isitiab* 2:469 [Part three 1123, No. 1855]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:155 [3/97]; *Nuzhatul Majalis*, 2:204.

⁸ *Tahzeebul Asma wal Lughat*, Imam Nawawi [1/349, No. 429].

and were perfectly arranged.¹

How does it compare with the statement of Abul Aswad that:

“When you come face to face before Abu Turab, you will see the moon of the fourteenth night, which amazes the onlookers.”²

Yes!

They were jealous of his valor, because they could not achieve this excellence; so they became his ill wishers and enemies. Like the co-wife of a beautiful woman, who due to jealousy and malice says regarding her: She is degraded, evil and worthless.

Can your conscience accept the accusation of this man that Ali was lazy and careless in carrying out the commands of Prophet, whereas he attacked the enemy so ferociously that he cut the mercenaries into half. He removed distress from the Prophet and finally slept in the bed of Prophet, risking his life when he fled to Medina.

Was Ali not the only warrior, regarding whom the following verse was revealed:

أَجَعَلْتُمْ سَقَائَةَ الْحَاجِّ وَعَمَارَةَ الْمَسْجِدِ الْحَرَامِ كَمَنْ أَمَنَ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ
الْآخِرِ وَجَهَدَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ

“What! do you make (one who undertakes) the giving of drink to the pilgrims and the guarding of the Sacred Mosque like him who believes in Allah and the latter day and strives hard in Allah’s way?”³

...and the verse:

وَمِنَ النَّاسِ مَنْ يَتَّبِعُ نَفْسَهُ أَبْتَغِيَ مَرْضَاتِ اللَّهِ

“And among men is he who sells himself to seek the pleasure of Allah.”⁴

When was Ali careless about security of Prophet that he should be accused of sloth and carelessness?

Is it possible to imagine such negative conduct of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) regarding his chaste consort, whereas the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to him:

“You are most resembling to me in creation and conduct and you are from the same tree that I am.”⁵

¹ Hilyatul Awliya, Abu Nuaim 1: 84 [No. 4]; Tareekh Ibne Asakir 7: 35 [8/473; Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, 11/158]; Al-Mahasin wal Masawi, Baihaqi, 1:32 [Pg. 47].

² Tazkiratus Sibt 104 [Pg. 181].

³ Surah Taubah 9:19

⁴ Surah Baqarah 2:207

⁵ Tareekh Khateeb Baghdadi, 11:171 [No. 5870].

How the Prophet declared him to be most excellent of his nation, greatest of them in forbearance, most righteous in morals and conduct and he said:

“Ali is the best of my people, most intelligent of them and most excellent of them in forbearance.”¹

He said to Fatima: “Indeed, I married you to one, who embraced Islam first of all, who is the wisest of my nation and most forbearing of them.”²

He also said: “I married to one, who embraced Islam at the earliest and who is best in conduct.”³

Did the Prophet state all this while such was his conduct with his wife and that too in front of Prophet?! Liars spread falsehood, whereas Ali (a.s.) was as truthful and trustworthy as Prophet has informed.

Does your conscience accept the statement of this man – may God break his mouth – that Ali (a.s.) punched the face of Fatima? Whereas Ali is one, who walked in the footsteps of Prophet and he had heard the statement of Prophet regarding Fatima: “Indeed, Almighty Allah is infuriated at your fury and is pleased at your pleasure?”⁴

Holding Fatima’s hand, he said: “One, who recognizes her, recognizes her and one, who does not recognize her, should know that she is a part of me, she is my heart and my soul between my two sides; whoever distresses her, has distressed me.”⁵

And he said: “Fatima is a part of me; whoever annoys her, annoys me and pains me whoever pains her.”⁶

And he said: “Fatima is a part of me; whoever infuriates her, angers me.”⁷

And he said: “Fatima is a part of me; one, who angers her angers me and whoever pleases her, pleases me.”⁸

Was the praise of Prophet only restricted to his precedence in embracing Islam, that the Prophet mentioned it only to please his daughter and weaved a philosophy?!

¹ Tabari, Khateeb, Daulabi [*Dhurriyatut Tahira*, 93, No. 83] as is mentioned in *Kanzul Ummaal* 6:153, 392, 398 [11/605, H. 32926; 13/114, H. 36370; Pg. 135, H. 36423].

² *Musnad Ahmad* 5:26 [5/662, H. 19796]; *Riyazun Nazara* 2:194 [3/141]; *Zakhaerul Uqbah* 78; *Mazmauz Zawaad* 9:101, 114 and he has regarded the tradition authentic and regarded its reporters reliable.

³ Abul Khair Hakeemi has quoted this report as mentioned in *Riyazun Nazara* 2:182 [3/128].

⁴ *Mustadrak Hakeem* 3:154 [3/167, H. 4730] and he has regarded this tradition authentic; *Zakhaerul Uqbah*: 39; *Tazkiratus Sibt*: 135 [Pg. 310]; *Maqtal Khwarizmi* 1:52; *Kifayatut Talib*: 219 [Pg. 364, Chap. 99]; *Sawaiq*: 105 [Pg. 175].

⁵ *Al-Fusulul Muhimma*, 150 [Pg. 144]; *Nuzhatul Majalis* 2:228; *Nurul Absar* 45 [Pg. 96].

⁶ *Saheeh Bukhari* [5/2004, H. 4932]; *Saheeh Muslim* [5/53, H. 93, *Kitab Fadailus Sahaba*]; *Saheeh Tirmizi* [5/655, H. 3867]; and *Musnad Ahmad* 4:328 [5/430, H. 18447].

⁷ *Saheeh Bukhari* [3/1361, H. 3510]; *Khasais Nasai*: 35 [*Khasais Ameerul Momineen* 147, H. 365 and in *Sunan Kubra* 5/97, H. 8371, *Kitabul Manaqib*].

⁸ *Musnad Ahmad* 4:323, 332 [5/423, H. 18428, Pg. 435, H. 18451]; *Sawaiq*: 112 [Pg. 188].

And if this praise was only to please Fatima, he should have only mentioned it before her. Why did he hold the hand of Ali (a.s.) among his companions and remarked: “Indeed, he is the first, who brought faith in me; he is the one, who would be first to shake hands with me on Judgment Day.”

And when he addressed his companions saying: “The first of you, who would meet at the Cistern of Kauthar is the first, who embraced Islam; that is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

How did this fabricated ‘secret’ [praise of Prophet for Ali (a.s.) was only to please his daughter] remain a secret for companions present at that time and righteous companions of companions who followed them in praising Ali (a.s.) for this excellence, as is narrated from Salman Farsi, Anas bin Malik, Zaid bin Arqam, Abdullah bin Abbas, Abdullah bin Hajal, Hashim bin Utbah, Malik bin Ashtar, Abdullah bin Hashim, Muhammad bin Abi Bakr, Amr bin Hamaq, Abu Amr Adi bin Hatim, Abu Rafe, Buraidah, Jundab bin Zuhair, Umme Khair, daughter of Hareesh?¹

Is the claim that the Prophet paid scant attention to Ali (a.s.) compatible with statement of Quran that Ali is the soul of Prophet or that recompense of his prophethood is deemed as love and affection for Ali (a.s.)?

Is it compatible with the statement of the Prophet in the tradition of the roasted fowl recorded in *Saheeh* and *Musnad* books: “O God, send to me the best of Your creatures that he may share this fowl with me.” Thus, Ali (a.s.) came?²

Is it compatible with statement of Prophet to Ayesha: “Indeed, Ali is the most favorite of the males to me and the most respectable among them; so recognize his right and accord respect to him.”³

Or with his statement: “Among the men, Ali is most beloved to me.”⁴

Or with his statement: “Ali is the best of those I leave behind.”⁵

Or with his statement: “The best of your men is Ali Ibne Abi Talib and the best of women, is Fatima, daughter of Muhammad.”⁶

Or his statement: “Ali is the best of men; and one, who denies this is an infidel.”⁷

Or his statement: “One, who does not say that Ali is the best of men, has become a disbeliever.”⁸

¹ His exact words would be mentioned soon.

² Ref: *Sunan Tirmizi* 5/300, H. 3807; *Majmauz Zawaad* 9/126; *Kanzul Ummaal* 13/166, H. 36507.

³ As mentioned by Hafiz Khazanji quoting from *Riyaz* 2:161 [3/104]; *Zakhaerul Uqbah* 62.

⁴ It is mentioned in a copy: He is the dearest of my family; part of tradition of Usamah.

⁵ *Mawaqif Eji*, 3:276 [Pg. 409]; *Majmauz Zawaad*, 9:133.

⁶ *Tareekh Baghdad*, Khateeb, 4:392 [No. 2280].

⁷ *Tareekh Khateeb*, quoting from Jabir [7/421, No. 3984]; *Kunuzul Haqaiq*, marginal notes of *Al-Jamiaus Saghir*, 2:16; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:159 [11/625, H. 33045].

⁸ *Tareekh Baghdad*, Khateeb, 3:192 [No. 1234]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:159 [11/625, H. 33046].

Or his statement in the tradition of standard, which is accepted by all sects: “Tomorrow, I would give the standard to one, whom God and His Messenger love and he also loves God and His Messenger.”

Or his statement: “Ali is in relation to me as my head is to my body.”¹

Or his statement: “Ali is in relation to me as I am in relation to my Lord.”²

Or his statement: “Ali is most beloved of them in relation to me and most beloved of them with God.”³

Or his statement: “I am from you and you are from me” or “You are from me and I am from you.”⁴

Or his statement: “Ali is from me and I am from him and after me, he is the master and guardian of every believer.”⁵

Or his statement in the tradition of announcement of Surah Taubah, which is regarded as authentic by all: “None can announce it, except a man from me and I am from him.”⁶

Or his statement: “Your flesh is my flesh and your blood is my blood and the truth is with you.”⁷

Or his statement: “There is no prophet, but that he has someone like him in the Ummah and Ali is same as me.”⁸

Or is it compatible with report of Umme Salma, which is regarded as authentic and Tibrani has narrated it: “When the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) was angry, no one, except Ali, dared to speak.”⁹

Or is it compatible with the statement of Ayesha: “By God, I have not seen any man closer to Prophet than Ali and there is no woman on the earth, more beloved to Prophet than Ali’s wife.”¹⁰

Or is it compatible with the statement of Buraidah and Ubayy: “The dearest of people among females was Fatima and among the males, Ali.”¹¹

¹ *Tareekh Baghdad*, Khateeb, 7:12 [No. 3475]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:162 [3/105]; *Sawaiq*, 75 [Pg. 125].

² *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:163 [3/106]; *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:391 [3/362].

³ *Tareekh Baghdad*, Khateeb, 2:160 [No. 10].

⁴ *Musnad Ahmad*, 5:206 [6/265, H. 21270]; *Khasais Nasai*, 36 & 51 [Khasais Ameerul Momineen, 78, H. 70, Pg. 149, H. 138 and in *Sonan Kubra*, 5/127, H. 8455].

⁵ *Musnad Ahmad*, 5:365 [6/489, H. 22503].

⁶ *Khasais Nasai*, 8 [Khasais Ameerul Momineen, 49, H. 24; and in *Sonan Kubra*, 5/113, H. 8409].

⁷ *Al-Mahasin wal Masawi*, Baihaqi, 1:31 [Pg. 44]; *Kifayatut Talib*, 135 [Pg. 265, Chap. 62].

⁸ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:164 [3/108].

⁹ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:130 [3:141, H. 4674]; *Sawaiq*, 73 [Pg. 123]; *Tareekh Khulafa*, Suyuti, Pg. 116 [Pg. 161].

¹⁰ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:154 [3:167, H. 4731] and he has regarded it as authentic; *Iqdul Fareed*, 2:275 [4/123].

¹¹ *Khasais Nasai*, 29 [Khasais Ameerul Momineen, 128, H. 113; and in *Sonan Kubra*, 5/140, H. 8498]; *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:155 [3:168, H. 4735] and also in its selection]; Hakeem and

Or is it compatible with the statement of Jami bin Umair that: “I met Ayesha with my aunt and asked her: Who was the most beloved person to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). She replied: Fatima. Then it was asked: Who was his most favorite among males? She said: Fatima’s husband, and as far as I know, he used to fast during the day and pray during the night.”¹

How Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) paid attention to others and preferred them to Ali (a.s.) whereas when Almighty Allah glanced at folks of the earth, Ali was the first He selected after the Prophet? As Fatima was told by Prophet: “Indeed, God glanced at folks of the earth and after that chose your father and sent him with prophethood; then He glanced again and chose your husband. And He revealed to me to marry you to him and appoint him as my successor.”²

And he (s.a.w.a.) said: “Indeed, God chose two men from the folks of earth: one is your father and the other, your husband.”³

I don’t dare to analyze the statement of this man “two Umayyad sons-in-law of Prophet...”, but listen to the condition of Uthman in words of Anas: When Ruqaiyyah, the dear daughter of Prophet passed away, he asked before putting her in the grave: “Who among you did not co-habit with his wife last night.” “I,” said Talha. The Prophet asked him to go down into the grave.

Ibne Battal has explained that in fact the Prophet wanted to restrain Uthman from going down the grave, although he was most rightful for it and was her husband. Uthman kept quiet at the announcement of Prophet, because that night he had cohabited with his another wife. On the basis of this evidence, his right was taken away. Perhaps the Prophet was informed about this through divine revelation, but he didn’t say anything to Uthman, as he had done a lawful thing; but the calamity had not affected Uthman to the extent of occupying him [and to made him refrain from co-habiting with his wife] till he was deprived from what he was deprived.⁴

Regarding Abul Aas: what can I say, except that he was a polytheist till the year of Battle of Hudaibiyya and taken as a prisoner with polytheists and Islam separated him from his wife, Zainab for six years. Zainab, who had embraced Islam, migrated along with other Muslims, leaving him due to his polytheism. After his acceptance of Islam, not a word is narrated about him regarding his contact with or respect to Prophet; what to say that he should be compared with Ali, who became the progenitor of Prophet’s progeny?!

This author is publicizing that relations between Ali and Fatima were not good, while she was, according to clarification of Holy Quran, pure (*Tahira*) and

¹ Zahabi regard the tradition authentic; *Jaame’ Tirmizi*, 2:227 [5/655, H. 3868].

² *Jaame’ Tirmizi*, 2:227 [5/658, H. 3874], India; *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:157 [3:167, H. 4731].

² Tibrani has narrated the tradition from Abu Ayyub Ansari [*Al-Mojamul Kabeer*, 4/171, 4046]; as it is mentioned in *Ikmal Kanzul Ummaal*, 6/153 [11/604, H. 32923] and Haithami has narrated the tradition in *Majmauz Zawaad*, 9:165 from Ali Hilali.

³ *Mawaqif Eji*, 8 [Pg. 410].

⁴ Ref: *Rauzul Anaf*, 2:107 [5/362].

purified (*Mutahira*) and Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) used to come to their door and recite:

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ اللَّهُ لِيُنذِّهَ عَنْكُمُ الْرِّجَسَ أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ وَيُطَهِّرُكُمْ تَطْهِيرًا ^۱

“O people of the House! and to purify you a (thorough) purifying.”¹

And he always said: “Fatima is the most beloved of people for me.”

And he said: “The most beloved of people for me among ladies, is Fatima.”

And he said: “My most beloved family member is Fatima.”

And Umar said to Fatima: “By God, I have not seen anyone, who was so beloved to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).”²

What a bad thing this author has done to attribute this falsehood to Prophet; that he did not regard Ali worthy of any important assignment, whereas Ali (a.s.) was his supporter and helper in every aspect since beginning of the call till the last moments. And that is why the Prophet mentioned him to be his soul, brother, vizier, successor, Caliph, heir and the guardian after him and he was his only commander during battles, and according to divine revelation when the Prophet during ascension, was taken from Masjidul Haraam to Masjid Aqsa, Ali was given the title of ‘leaders of bright-faced ones’³ [he became the leader of folks of Paradise, whose foreheads, hands and feet are white and illuminated].⁴

Worse that this man regards wives of Prophet to be inimical to Ali (a.s.), and mentions the battle and claim of Ayesha to Ali and Fatima and Umme Salma; and quoting a false incident, he has divided them into groups: democracy and dictatorship and he has attributed statements, which destroys the respect of Prophet and nobility of his wives, mothers of believers, and portrays the progeny of Prophet in a very negative light.

Alas, if I only knew how the translator regarded Ayesha as enemy of Fatima, whereas she said: “I have not seen anyone more excellent than Fatima, except her

¹ Surah Ahzab 33:33

² *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:150 [3:168, H. 4736].

³ Mulla Salih Mazandarani in his gloss on *Usul Kafi*, Pg. 155, says that it is a metaphor for noble persons.

In the margins of *Behaarul Anwaar*, 10/92, it is mentioned that Jazari said in *Nihaya* that the actual meaning of Ghurra is whiteness on the head of a horse and this same meaning is present in the traditional reports.

In the book of *Nahjus Sadat fee Mustadrak Nahjul Balaghah* 1/271, it is mentioned that ‘Ghurr’ is plural of ‘Aghur’ and they are ones, on whose forehead the mark of prostration is present and ‘Ghurr’ in this report in description of Ali is in the same meaning and *Qaidul Ghurrul Muhajaleen* implies their whiteness due to the effulgence of ablution.]

⁴ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:138 [3:148, H. 4668]. And he has regarded it as authentic. *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:177 [3/122]; *Shamsul Akhbar*: 39 [1/105, Chap. 7]; *Usudul Ghaba* 1:69 [1/84, No. 92]; *Majmauz Zawaada* 9:121].

father.”¹

And Ayesha kissed Fatima’s head and remarked: “Alas, if only I had been the hair of your head.”²

And how people were pleased with such distressing statements of this man, whereas Quran has declared affection of progeny of Prophet obligatory on all? And among universally accepted principles of Islam, love and hatred for Ali (a.s.) are signs of faith and hypocrisy; as a tradition would be mentioned regarding this.

On the basis of what is mentioned in tradition of Ghadeer, the Ummah has consensus that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said regarding Ali (a.s.):

“O God, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him.”

It is authentically narrated from the Prophet that: “One, who loves Ali, has loved me and one, who is inimical to Ali, is inimical to me; and one, who has distressed Ali, has distressed me, and one, who distressed me has distressed God.”³

And His Eminence was informed by Jibraeel: “Fortunate is one, who is loyal to Ali during my lifetime and after my passing away. Know that indeed, unfortunate is one, who is inimical to Ali during my lifetime and after my passing away.”⁴

How it remain concealed from this man that attributing enmity to chief of holy progeny and wives of Prophet is an allegation and extremely bad abuse. If it is presented for evaluation in light of Islamic justice, it can be reasoned through statement of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding his progeny that:

“None has affection for them, except the fortunate and legitimate born and none is inimical to them, except the unfortunate and illegitimate by birth.”⁵

Or what is narrated through trustworthy narrators that no one would be inimical to Ali, except whose conception is shared by Shaitan.⁶

Or what Hafiz Jazari Ubadah bin Samit has narrated that: “We test the legitimacy of our children through their affection to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.); if one of them does not show affection to him, we conclude that he is not our issue.”

Then Hafiz Jazari writes that it is well known from ancient age that only

¹ *Mojamul Awsat* 3/349. H. 2742; *Sharhul Mawahib*, 3:202 from *Sharaful Moabbad*, 58 [Pg. 124].

² *Nuzhatul Majalis*, 2:227.

³ *Al-Istiab*, 2:461 [Part 3, Pg. 1101, No. 1855]; *Zakhaerul Uqbah* 65; *Al-Isabah* 3:103 [2/542, No. 5866]; *Nuzhatul Majalis* 2:207.

⁴ *Riyazun Nazara* 3:315 [3/167]; *Al-Fusulul Muhimma*, 124 [Pg. 123]; *Majmauz Zawaad* 9:132; *Kanzul Ummaal* 6:400 [3/145, H. 36458]; *Nuzhatul Majalis* 2:207.

⁵ *Riyazun Nazara* 2:189 [3/136].

⁶ *Tareekh Khateeb*, 3:289 [No. 1376].

those born of adultery are inimical to Ali (a.s.).¹

These were some improper statements from the book of *Hayat Muhammad*. How numerous are books of this kind about Quran and its distortion, and unfounded allegations on Shias!

It is amazing that Adil Zaitar regards himself excused from publicizing these deviating statements and writes in his preface:

“I would have written a gloss on this book, if I had not felt that this would take me beyond the ambit of a translator.”

Is it justice to inject such fatal arrows into the spirit of the religious society and hurt sentiments by such baseless statements?

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ يُجْبِيُونَ أَنْ تَشْيَعَ الْفَاجِحَةُ فِي الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَهُمْ عَذَابٌ أَلِيمٌ لِفِي
الدُّنْيَا وَالْآخِرَةِ

“Surely (as for) those who love that scandal should circulate respecting those who believe, they shall have a grievous chastisement in this world and the hereafter.”²

13. Ibne Rumi

Died: 283 A.H.

عشق النساء ديانه و تحرجا	يأهندلهم اعشق و مثلي لا يرى
في الصدر يسرح في الغواد توجا	لكن حبي للوصى مخيم
سبب النجاه من العذاب لمن نجا	فهو السراج المستنير و من به
يوم ابلقى ماه من ذنبى مخرجا	و اذا تركت له المحبه لم اجد
جهلا و اتبع الطريق الاعوجا	قل لي ااترك مستقيم طريقه
وارى سواه لنا قديه مبهرجا	و اراه كالتبر المصفى جوهرا
عال محل الشمس او بدر الدجا	و محله من كل فضل بين
يوم الغدير لسامعيه ممججا	قال النبي له مقالا لم يكن
مثلى و اصبح بالفخار متوجا	من كنت مولاه فذا مولى له
خطبوا و اكرمه بها اذوجا	و كذلك اذا منع البتول جماعه

¹ Ref: *Asniul Mataalib*, 8 [57 and 58].
² Surah Nur 24:19

يَغْنِي لِقَصْرِ النَّهْرِ وَانْبَرِ الْمَخْرَجِ

وَلَهُ عَجَابٌ يَوْمَ سَارَ بِجِيشِهِ

بِيَضَاءِ تَلْمِعُ وَقَدَهُو تَاجِهَا

رَدَتْ عَلَيْهِ الشَّمْسُ بَعْدَ غَرْوِهَا

1. O Hind, I don't regard love for women a religion, faith and remoteness from sin. 2. But love with relation to the successor has occupied my heart and affected my feelings too much. 3. So, he is the illuminated lamp through whom the saved ones get salvation. 4. And if I leave his love on Judgment Day, I will not have any escape from my sins. 5. Tell me, should I leave his right path due to ignorance and adopt the path of deviation? 6. And I consider him to be the most precious gem and regard others as valueless. 7. His position is loftier than that of all others like the position of the Sun or full moon on a dark night. 8. The Prophet was clear regarding him on Ghadeer day and he clearly announced without any ambiguity. 9. One, whose master I am, this Ali is also his master and began the day with the crown of pride on his head. 10. It must also be remembered that when people asked for the hand of Batool, the Prophet declined. 11. He possessed miraculous powers, which were most obvious when he routed the Kharijis in Nahrawan. 12. After the sun set, it rose up again white and bright.¹

Introduction to the poet

Abul Hasan Ali bin Abbas bin Jarih² was well known as Ibne Rumi. He was a prominent Shia poet and a leader of community.

His beautiful and numerous poems full of eloquence and literary expertise are admired by all through the ages. His poetry excels the compositions of other poets of his age.

He was an expert in different kinds of poetry. Even the most well known poets of his time are unable to reach his level.

In his love and affection for Ahle Bayt (a.s.), he had a lofty aim through his poetry to praise them as well as to defend their rights, which is the most obvious fact.

In the book of *Fusulul Muhimma*,³ Ibne Sabbagh Maliki (d. 844 A.H.) and in *Nurul Absar*,⁴ Shablanji have considered him to be among the poets of Imam Hasan Askari (a.s.).

There is no doubt that he was originally from Byzantine as mentioned in a number of places in his collection of poems with emphasis. His statement that people of Fars are my maternal uncles and people of Rum are my paternal uncles,

¹ Hint to the return of the sun for Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) upon his return from the Battle of Naharwan; Ref: *Behaarul Anwaar* 4:183.

² In *Fehrist*, Ibne Nadim [Pg. 190] and *Tareekh Khateeb* [12/23, No. 6387] and the same is mentioned in many other books.

³ *Fusulul Muhimma*, 302 [Pg. 281].

⁴ *Nurul Absar*, 166 [Pg. 338].

imply that his mother was from Fars as is also clear from his couplets. According to books, his mother was a religious, righteous and a kind lady.

His religious beliefs

The third century was a period when many religions and sects appeared and there were very few, who did not express their views on religion and did not explain their Islam in the light of other faiths. This was a common phenomenon in the educated class.

Ibne Rumi was from such readers, he was present in those gatherings and heard from his family members about his religious beliefs. Thus, he was a Muslim, whose Islam was true, but he was a Shia Mutazalite, who believed in free will and two natures. This was supposed to be the best and the most perfect religion of his time.

It is clear that Ibne Rumi inherited Shiaism from his parents; because his mother was from Iran, she followed the religion of Fars and was very close to Alawites. And because his father named him as Ali, and this is the name most liked among Shia and which extremist followers of Sunni school avoid.

As for his being Mutazalite, Ibne Rumi does not conceal it; he neither praised it nor argued in favor of it; on the contrary he made it clear and he was proud of it and he insisted upon it.

He was a believer in Mutazalite religion of Qadariyya¹, who believe in free will and regard God free from compulsion to punish those, who were forced to do something.

His satirical poetry

The third century produced two poets of satire. They were the greatest satirical poets of all times in the world of Islam: one of them being Ibne Rumi and the other, Dibil Khuzai, who wrote satire on Caliphs, rulers and everyone:

“When I open my eyes, I open them on a large number of people, but I don’t see anyone.”

Muarra has reconciled them in a single line and made it into proverb for one, who spoke ill of his children:

“If days are just they would speak ill of its folks, as the days of Rumi or Dibil.”

Date of his death

We are certain that the most correct date of his death is Wednesday, when two days remained from Jamadiul Awwal, year 283 A.H.

His martyrdom

All agree that Rumi was poisoned to death and Qasim bin Ubaidullah or his

¹ Who believe that there is no destiny and man is free to do what he likes.

father committed this act.¹

14. Himmani Afwa²

Died: 301 A.H.

His couplets:

الشمس في يوم الحجاب	ابن الذي ردت عليه
يوم المواقف والحساب	وابن القسيم العارف
برغم مرتاب وآبى	مولاهم يوم الغدير

“He was the son of the one, for whom the sun returned after it had set. He was the son of the one, who would distribute Hell on the day of difficult stations and accounting. He became their master on Ghadeer day, in spite of the doubters and those who refused.”³

He also wrote:

قلنا لهم هناء الله	قالوا: أبو بكر له فضله
يشبه العبد مولاه	نسيتم خطبه خموه
كان رسول الله مولاه	ان علياً كان مولى لمن

“They said: Abu Bakr was the most excellent. We told them: May God bless, have you forgotten the sermon of Ghadeer day? Can anyone have doubt in his being the master? Indeed Ali is the master of one, whose master the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is.”⁴

Introduction to the poet

His name Abu Husain Ali bin Muhammad bin Ja'far bin Muhammad bin Muhammad bin Zaid bin Ali bin Husain bin Ali bin Abu Talib (a.s.) Kufi Himmani, famous as Afwa.

Himman is a locality of Kufa attributed to Himman, a clan of Tamim tribe and they were descendants of Himman bin Abdul Aziz bin Kaab bin Saad bin Zaid Manat bin Tamim.

Himani was the most prominent of Iraqi jurisprudents of the first century and a defender of school of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). He was an orator as well as a poet. All have extolled his merits. Knowledge and wisdom is obvious from his

¹ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:386 [3/361, No. 463].

² For the sake of following the history writers, I have mentioned this poet in this century [In *Al-Majdi*, 1:85, his death is mentioned during the year 270 A.H.].

³ By this, he has extolled some members of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). Ibne Shahr Ashob has narrated these verses in *Manaqib* 1:462 [2/35/358].

⁴ Bayazi has mentioned these verses in *Siratul Mustaqeem* [2/72].

compositions. In addition to that he was having a great lineage.

Imam Ali Naqi (a.s.) was asked: "Who is greatest poet?" "Himani," he replied.

Our Sayyid, Himani, was outspoken and audacious to enemies in non-acceptance of oppression, hardships, determination, strength of resolve, clarity of tone, and he had inherited all these qualities from his religious ancestors and honorable family.

Among the samples of his poems is the following:

"There is a relationship between the successor and Mustafa in which greatnesses and praises are mentioned with pride. Those two were like the sun of the day, which circles the constellations, then becomes still and beautiful.¹ They have become targets of jealousy and one, who is attached to their affection becomes a target of jealousy. Time cannot be blamed or denied, if it conceals their rights, thus since it started, time is either condemned or praised."²

Perhaps by this statement, the poet alludes to the following verse of Quran:

أَمْ يَحْسُدُونَ النَّاسَ عَلَى مَا أَتَهُمُ اللَّهُ مِنْ فَضْلِهِ

"Or do they envy the people for what Allah has given them of His grace?"³

Regarding this verse, it is narrated that it implies the Imams from the progeny of Muhammad.

Ibne Abil Hadeed says in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*:⁴

"This verse was revealed about Ali and his knowledge."

In *Sawaiq*,⁵ Ibne Hajar has narrated from Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) that he said regarding this verse:

"By God, we are those persons."

In his *Manaqib*,⁶ Faqih Ibne Maghazili has narrated from Ibne Abbas that this verse was revealed about the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Ali (a.s.).

Birth and death

We are not aware of the date of birth of this poet. We only know that he passed away in the year 301 A.H. and that his father was born in 206 A.H. during the reign of Motamid⁷ - as mentioned in *Murujuz Zahab*¹ - thus, showing that the

¹ Nihayatul Arab [3/188].

² *Al-Fusulul Mukhtara*, 1:19; *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, 5:21 [4/236].

³ Surah Nisa 4:54

⁴ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:236 [7/220 Sermon 108].

⁵ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 91 [Pg. 152].

⁶ *Manaqib Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)*, Ibne Maghazali, [Pg. 267, H. 314].

⁷ Caliphate of Motamid was between the year 256 and 279 A.H. But the term of six in the text in a manuscript copy of *Murujuz Zahab* implies that poet died in that year and not his father.

Sayyid lived a long life and was present during the third century from the beginning to the end.

The poet was from the lineage of the Holy Imams (a.s.) and he held a very esteemed position among poets and orators. He was from the Qazwini clan famous for its accomplishment in knowledge and education and they had settled down in Iraq.

He had very prominent ancestors, among them being Zaid, the martyr.

Now, we would like to discuss the beliefs of Shia regarding him, so that we may expose the crimes towards him and allegations laid against him.

Zaid, the martyr and the Twelver Imamite Shia

He is of those, who never accepted persecution and injustice and he is in the first row of the scholars of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). His possessed merits from different aspects. He was extremely intelligent, he was a very pious and religious man. He was a famous valiant man of his time. He was a terrific fighter; he was so vicious on the enemies that he humiliated all of them most severely. He never accepted any injustice. All this was with prophetic nobility and Alawite majesty, Fatimid leadership and spirituality of Imam Husain (a.s.).

All Shia, without exception, have mentioned his righteousness and religiosity and they think that every act, which Zaid performed, like his beneficial confrontation, his great uprising, and calling people for approval of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) [that is their Imam, whom Allah likes and whose Imamate He approves], was commendable.

Traditions, which Shia attribute to Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Imams of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and explanation of their scholars, their praises, recitation of elegies by their poets and independent books, the Shia scholars have written on him, all prove this claim.

As for traditions

Among them being the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to Imam Husain (a.s.):

“A person named Zaid will come from your progeny. He and his companions would pass over the heads of people on Judgment Day² and enter Paradise without accounting.”³

And he said: “Indeed, he would stage an uprising, would be martyred in Kufa, would be crucified in Kinasa locality of Kufa and exhumed from the grave and the gates of heavens would open for his soul. And folks of the heavens and

¹ *Murujuz Zahab*, 2:413 [4/153].

² It is an allusion to the scene on Judgment Day, when people would be standing for accounting and some people would enter Paradise without accounting.

³ *Uyun Akhbar Reza*, Shaykh Saduq, Chap. 25 [1/226, H. 2]; *Kifayatul Athar* [Pg. 304].

the earth would be eager to meet him.”¹

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and his companions stood and wept at the place of his hanging. They asked: “What made you weep?” He replied: “Indeed, he is one of my descendants. He would be crucified here. Almighty Allah would throw headlong into Hellfire whoever glances at his private parts.”²

Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) said: “O God, strengthen my back through Zaid.”

When Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) heard the news of his martyrdom, he remarked:

إِنَّا لِلَّهِ وَإِنَّا إِلَيْهِ رَجُونَ^۴

“Surely we are Allah’s and to Him we shall surely return.”³

I deem the martyrdom of my uncle in the account of Allah and for His pleasure. Indeed, he was a nice uncle. Indeed, my uncle was a man for our world and hereafter. By God, my uncle became a martyr like those martyred with Messenger of Allah, Ali and Husain. By God, he passed away from the world as a martyr.⁴

He also said: “Indeed, Zaid was a scholar and very truthful person. He did not call you to himself. He only staged an uprising for Aale Muhammad (their Imam). If he were victorious, he would have indeed called you to them and would have been loyal. Indeed, he staged an uprising against the ruler, who had gathered his forces against him.”⁵

Statements of scholars⁶

Refer to Shaykh Mufeed in *Irshad*, Shaheed Awwal in *Qawaaid*, Allamah Majlisi in *Miratul Uqul*, Shaykh Hurre Amili in the conclusion of *Wasail*, Shaykh Noori in the conclusion of *Mustadrak*, and Shaykh Mamqani in *Tanqihul Miqal*.

All these scholar have consensus that Zaid was free from every kind of blemish and believe that his call was divine and his Jihad was in the path of God.

In view of all Shia, the statement of their great scholar Shaykh Bahai, in the treatise *Ithbate Wajudul Imamul Muntazar* proves this; when he writes:

“We, Imamiyah scholars have nothing, except positive views regarding Zaid bin Ali; and this is due to the fact that we have exceeding statements from our Imams.”

¹ *Uyun Akhbar Reza*, Shaykh Saduq, Chap. 25 [1/227, H. 4].

² *Kitabul Malahim*, Sayyid Ibne Tawus, Chap. 31, Pg. 84.

³ Surah Baqarah 2:156

⁴ *Uyun Akhbar Reza*, Shaykh Saduq [1/288, H. 6].

⁵ *Al-Kafi*, [Rauzatul Kafi, 8/264, H. 381].

⁶ *Al-Irshad*, 2/171-175; *Al-Qawaaid wal Fawaiid*, 2/207; *Miratul Uqul*, 14/162; *Khatimatul Wasail*, 20/202, No. 511; *Khatima Mustadrak*, 599, Conclusion 5; *Tanqihul Miqal*, 1/467, No. 4442.

Shia poets

In his 'Qasida Hashimiyyah', Kumayt has included panegyrics in praise of Zaid, his son, Husain bin Zaid and Bani Hashim. That Qasida begins as follows:

الاہل عمد فی رایہ متأمل
وهل مدبر بعد الاساءة مقبل

"Would one, who is blind in opinion, ponder; would one, who has turned away after oppressing turn back again?"

Regarding Zaid, he says:

"It is hard upon Ahmad what befell his descendants from the son of Yusuf. Yusuf was the most wicked and filthy. If I say that he was illegitimate born, it would not be an allegation."¹

Some senior Shia scholars have written whole books on Zaid and his excellence; among them being:

1. Ibrahim bin Saeed bin Hilal Thaqafi (d. 238 A.H.); he has written a book entitled *Akhbare Zaid*.
2. Hafiz Ahmad bin Uqdah (d. 333 A.H.); he has written a book called: *Man Ruya Akhbare Zaid wa Musnada*.
3. Shaykh Saduq Abu Ja'far Qummi (d. 381 A.H.); he has written a book on reports of Zaid.
4. Sayyid Abdul Razzaq Muqarram:² He is a prominent scholar and researcher of this age, who has written a large number of books on Shia religion. In addition to that he has expertise in knowledge and precedence in nobility.

Important and extremely beneficial writings

The book of *Al-Imamul Sibtul Mujtaba*, and the book of *Hayatul Imam asl-Sibt Shaheed wa Maqtala*, and the book *As-Sayyadatus Sakina* and treatises regarding Ali Akbar, son of Imam Husain (a.s.) and book of Zaid, the martyr and a book considering Mukhtar Ibne Abu Ubaidah Thaqafi to be sincere. It was published with the book of Zaid. Also, a book on Abul Fazl al-Abbas Ibne Ameerul Momineen.

Conclusion

This was Zaid and his rank and purity according to all the Shia. Thus, now I don't know the worth of Ibne Taymiyyah's statement when he says:

"Rafidhis regard beyond the pale of religion, all those, who regard Zaid bin Ali bin Husain as pious and everyone devoted to him and they testify for his infidelity and sinfulness."³

Sayyid Mahmud Alusi has followed the mistake of Ibne Taymiyyah in the

¹ Yusuf bin Umar Thaqafi was the governor of Hisham in Iraq and he was the killer of Zaid.

² He was born in the year 1316 A.H. and he passed away 1391 A.H.

³ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:126.

treatise printed in the book of *Al-Sunnah wash Shia*,¹ and written:

“The simile of Rafidhis is like Jews; they are inimical to a large number of Fatima’s descendants; on the contrary they even abuse them: like Zaid bin Ali, whereas he commanded a great rank in knowledge and piety.”

Qaseemi has taken this falsehood from him and repeated it in his book of *Al-Saraa Bainal Islam wal Wathniyya*.

They blame Shia for this false attribution and condemn them. Is there anyone, who would ask when Shia made such statements? And who has narrated them? And in which books is this sentence mentioned? Whereas these points are not found in any book or spoken verbally by someone.

Yes, they have no aim, except to defame Shia through these worthless statements and to reduce their rank, but it has exposed their own falsehood.

Those – like this author – who write regarding some people, but does not know anything about them. Or knows, but overlooks them completely as implied in an Arabic proverb.²

So these defenders of the honor of Zaid think that readers are ignorant from history of Islam and know nothing about it; and would the reality of this statement, decorated with falsehood remain concealed from them?

Is there no one who may ask them that if Zaid, in their view and in the view of their community, held a prominent rank in knowledge and piety, then from which Quran and which Sunnah, the rulers of his time battled with him, slain him, crucified him, burned him up and a took his head around the country?

Was Yusuf bin Umar Thaqafi, chief of his enemies and his killer, not from them and their community?

Was his commander, Abbas bin Saad, not from them?

Was Hakam bin Sult, who decapitated him not from them?

Was Hajja bin Qasim, who gave the news of the killing of Zaid to Yusuf bin Umar not from them?

Was Kharash bin Haushab, who exhumed Zaid’s body not from them?

Was Walid or Hisham bin Abdul Malik, who ordered the burning up of Zaid not their Caliphs?

Was Zahra bin Salim, who brought the severed head of Zaid to Hisham not from them?

Was Hisham bin Abdul Malik, who sent the severed head of Zaid and hung his head on the gate for a night, not their Caliph?

Was it not Hisham bin Abdul Malik, who wrote to Khalid Qasri and adjured him to pull out the tongue and cut the hands of Kumayt, the poet, for composing

¹ Al-Sunnah wash Shia, 52.

² Ref: *Majmaul Amthal*, 1:341, No. 1018; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Shaykh Muhammad Abdurrahman, 3/30-31.

a Qasida in praise of Zaid bin Ali, his father and Bani Hashim?

Was it not their agent in Medina, Muhammad bin Ibrahim Makhzumi, who held gatherings in Medina for seven days and orators present in those gatherings cursed Ali, Hasan, Husain, Zaid and their Shia?

Was Hakeem bin Awar not their poet, who wrote:

“We crucified Zaid for you on the tree trunk and we have not seen the Mahdi who was crucified on the tree trunk and compared the foolishness of Ali with Uthman while Uthman was better and purer than Ali.”?

This is the actual scenario; you can judge it in whatever way you like.

أَفَمِنْ هَذَا الْحَدِيثِ تَعْجَبُونَ ۝ وَتَضْحَكُونَ ۝ وَلَا تَبْكُونَ ۝ وَأَنْتُمْ سَمِلُونَ ۝

“Do you then wonder at this announcement? And will you laugh and not weep? While you are indulging in varieties.”¹

¹ Surah Najm 53:59-61

A survey of spurious books and writings

Since this shameful allegation to Shia regarding Zaid, the martyr is mentioned in many ancient and modern Ahle Sunnat books, allegations, which were the root cause of every mischief and corruption, created in people the feeling of religious prejudice, destroyed Islamic unity, annihilated the fabric of Muslim unity, and was against general welfare, which encouraged them to hurt the sentiments of Shia society.

All this makes us aware that we should explain some of present allegations in Ahle Sunnat books so that the reader may become aware how they hurt the sentiments of Shia, and evaluate their scholarly truthfulness and honesty.

Also, scholastic theologians have indentified different beliefs and viewpoints; exegesists are aware of the interpolated verses; for the jurist, it is clear, which divine laws have become playthings for followers of lust; tradition experts know well, which tradition they have wasted from Sunnah of Prophet; for scholars of morals sciences, it is clear how they initiated practices, which cause a human being to become so debased.

وَلَئِنْ أَتَيْتَ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْكِتَابَ كُلِّهِ أَيَّةً مَا تَبِعُوا قِبْلَتَكَ هَذِهِ أَنْتَ
بِتَابِعٍ قِبْلَتَهُمْ هَذِهِ مَا بَعْضُهُمْ بِتَابِعٍ قِبْلَةَ بَعْضٍ هَذِهِ لَيْسَ أَنَّكَ أَتَتَعَنْتَ أَهْوَاءَهُمْ
مَنْ بَعْدِ مَا جَاءَكَ مِنَ الْعِلْمِ لِإِنَّكَ إِذَا لَمْ يَعْلَمْ الظَّلِيلَيْنَ^{١٥٥}

“And even if you bring to those who have been given the Book every sign they would not follow your Qibla, nor can you be a follower of their Qibla, neither are they the followers of each other’s Qibla, and if you follow their desires after the knowledge that has come to you, then you shall most surely be among the unjust.”¹

1. Iqdul Fareed²

In the beginning, the reader regards this as a literary and not a religious book and finds it pure and unblemished; but when he reads issues related to religion, he concludes how foolish and ignorant the author is and how much he is used to lying and sinfulness.

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:145

² Written by Shahabuddin bin Abde Rabbe Maliki (d. 328 A.H.).

Some of his statements and their criticism

1. Statement One

He says:¹ “Shia are the Jews of this Ummah, because just as Jews are aloof from Christians, Shia are also aloof from Islam and they are inimical to it.”

Reply to Statement One

How can the reader accept this distressing and painful statement, whereas it is mentioned in the Holy Quran:

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ لَا وَلِيَكُمْ هُمْ خَيْرُ الرِّبِّيَّةِ

“(As for) those who believe and do good, surely they are the best of men.”²

It is narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding this verse that:

“You (Ali) and your Shia are ‘the best of men’.”

How can he accept this whereas the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said in report addressed to Ali (a.s.): “You and your Shia would be in Paradise.”?³

He also said: “On Judgment Day, people would be summoned by their names and names of their mothers, except he (Ali) and his Shia. They would be called by their name and names of their fathers, because they are of legitimate birth.”⁴

He also remarked: “O Ali, indeed, Almighty Allah has given salvation to you, your progeny, descendants, family, Shia and friends of your Shia.”⁵

He also said: “O Ali, very soon you would meet Allah, while you and your Shia would be satisfied with God and He would also be satisfied with you all.”⁶

He has also declared: “You would be the first to enter Paradise and your Shia would be seated on pulpits of effulgence; they would be bright-faced around me. I would intercede for them and tomorrow on Judgment Day they would be my neighbors in Paradise.”⁷

He said: “I am the tree, Fatima is its branch, Ali is its pollen, Hasan and Husain its fruits and the Shia, its leaves. This tree is rooted in the Adn Paradise and its other parts are in other parts of Paradise.”

He said: “Indeed, on Judgment Day Ali and his Shia would be successful.”⁸

¹ *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 1:269 [2/104].

² Surah Bayyinah 98:7

³ Tareekh Baghdad, 12:289.

⁴ Murujuz Zahab, 2:51 [3/7].

⁵ *Sawaiq*, 96, 139, 140 [161, 232 & 235].

⁶ *Nihaya*, Ibne Asir, 3:276 [4/106].

⁷ *Majmauz Zawaad*, 9:131; *Kifayatut Talib*, 135 [Pg. 265, Chap. 62].

⁸ *Tadkiratus Sibt*, 31 [Pg. 54].

He said in a sermon: “O people, one who harbors enmity to us, Ahle Bayt, on Judgment Day, Almighty Allah would raise him as a Jew. When my Ummah was in the stage of clay (before assuming their forms in the ethereal sphere)¹ they were bestowed a physical form for me and the standard bearers passed by me and at that time I prayed for salvation of Ali and his Shia.”²

He said: “My intercession is especially for those from my Ummah, who were devoted my Ahle Bayt and they are my Shia.”³

2. Statement Two

He says: “The calamity of the Shia is same as the calamity of Jews; Jews say: Rulership is restricted to the progeny of Dawood (a.s.). Shia also say that rulership is only for the progeny of Abu Talib.”

Reply to Statement Two

If this statement forebodes ill for the Shia, this prophecy is aimed at one [the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)] who through this authentic, definite, widely narrated tradition, appointed the progeny of Ali (a.s.) as his successors:

“Indeed, I leave among you two weighty things or two successors: if you remain attached to them after me, you will never be deviated; they are the Book of Allah and my Ahle Bayt. These two would not separate till they arrive to me at the Cistern of Kauthar.”

The author of *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*⁴ has narrated this tradition from twenty odd companions. The Prophet, who made truth evident, has clearly mentioned this in his sermon among his companions, who numbered more than a hundred thousand people, and in that huge gathering, he declared the Caliphate of his pure Ahle Bayt, led by Ali (a.s.), who is their progenitor and chief.

In *Sharh Mawahib*⁵, Imam Zarqani Maliki has narrated from Allamah Samhudi that:

“This traditional report shows that in every period of time, till Judgment Day, a person from the family of Prophet, who is eligible for leadership of community, exists; so that encouragement present in this report, for following him and attachment to him is directed. Just as the Holy Quran is also as such [that till Judgment Day it is worth being attached to]; from this aspect, they are security for the folks of the earth; and if they had not been there, the folks of the earth would have been destroyed.

¹ Perhaps it hints at the fact that every group sees its Imam and one, who is the standard bearer; as would be there on Judgment Day. ***“(Remember) the day when We will call every people with their Imam; then whoever is given his book in his right hand, these shall read their book; and they shall not be dealt with a whit unjustly.”*** (Surah Isra 17:71).

² Majmauz Zawaad, 9:172.

³ Tareekh Khateeb, 2:146.

⁴ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 136 [Pg. 228].

⁵ Sharh Mawahib, 7:8.

Now, after hearing these statements of the Prophet who cannot follow the progeny of Ali and not regard them as guides on the path of God? Or would they follow others and go astray from the path of God? It can be like that! Never, by Allah!

إِنَّا هَدَيْنَاهُ السَّبِيلَ إِمَّا شَاءَ كَرَّأَ وَإِمَّا كَفُورًا ④

“Surely We have shown him the way: he may be thankful or unthankful.”¹

In spite of this statement of Prophet, what is the crime of Shia?

“One, who likes to live a life like me and die like me, and to settle in eternal Garden, which Almighty Allah has planted, then he should be devoted to Ali after me and also be devoted to his followers; and after me, he should follow my Ahle Bayt, because they are my descendants and they are created from my essence; and my understanding and knowledge is given to them. Then, woe be on those people of my Ummah, who deny their excellence and who cut off their connection with me. Almighty Allah would not allow my intercession for these people.”²

We say: Amen; and blessings of God on one, who says: Amen.

With attention to the statement of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.):

“The simile of me and my Ahle Bayt is that of the Ark of Nuh (a.s.). Whoever boarded it, was saved and whoever abandoned it, was drowned.”³

Now, which objection can be laid on the belief of Shia?

How can the Shia not regard the Ahle Bayt as Caliphs, who are like Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in the Ummah? And how can their position in affection for Ahle Bayt (a.s.) be regarded as position of Jews? Who are the targets of this painful and harmful statement?

Was the following statement of the Prophet not noticed by Ibne Abde Rabbe? That:

“Star are security for the folks of the earth and my Ahle Bayt are prevention of discord in my Ummah. So, whoever opposes them, discord would develop among them and they would be from the party of Iblees.”⁴

O God, You know that such is not the case [this statement of Prophet was not unnoticed by Ibne Abde Rabbe] on the contrary the heart of this severe enemy is sealed.

¹ Surah Insan 76:3

² The following authors have narrated this tradition: Abu Nuaim, *Hilya*, 1:86 [No, 4]; Tibrani, [Mojamul Kabeer, 5/194, H. 5067]; Rafai, according to the sequence of *Jamaul Jawame*, 6:217 [Kanzul Ummaal, 12/103, H. 34198].

³ Khateeb Baghdadi has narrated this tradition in his *Taareekh*, 12:91 [No. 6507]; and Hakeem in his *Mustadrak*, 3:151 [3/163, H. 4720] and he has deemed this tradition authentic.

⁴ Hakeem has narrated this tradition in his *Mustadrak*, 3:149 [3/162, H. 4715] and has deemed it authentic.

Then how can one not be attached to Ahle Bayt, who are stars of guidance and stars of security for human beings from deviation, discord and disunity? What is the excuse of those, who have ignored them?

Selection of this noble family by Almighty Allah is done only after their obtaining all precedences necessary to gain the rank of absolute mastership (*Wilayat*), and necessary skills for administering the affairs in every time period; to whom leadership of human beings and seat of rulership is entrusted.

But opponents of Ahle Bayt, or those jealous to them, or who those greedy for rulership, seized Caliphate and leadership from them and appointed others in their place.

Rulership and leadership among the Shia, as this unaware man thinks, is not temporal rulership, on the contrary, it is divine vicegerency.

Shobi has also clarified this point on the basis of the statement of Ibne Taymiyyah in *Minhaj*,¹ and he says:

“The calamity of Shia is same as calamity of Jews. Jews say: Rulership is restricted to the progeny of Dawood (a.s.). Shia also say that rulership (*Imamate*) is only for the progeny of Ali.”

3. Statement Three

He says: “Jews delay the Maghrib Prayer, till stars become visible and the Shia also do this.”

Reply to Statement Three

In the beginning, it is necessary to first ask the Jews whether they are aware of this issue?! And whether they basically know about these matters, which are being attributed to them?

I don't know whether this man has written this statement on the basis of Shia jurisprudence and traditions of our Imams. It is mentioned in traditions from Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) that:

“I am immune from one, who deliberately delays the Maghrib Prayer till stars become visible.”²

He was asked: “People of Iraq delay the Maghrib Prayer till the stars appear?”

Imam (a.s.) replied: “This is the practice of Abul Khattab, the enemy of God.”³

Why does this man issue false statements? Perhaps he is prone to issue condemnation even before referring, which is against honesty and rules of

¹ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 1:7.

² Ref: *Wasailush Shia*, 4/176-177 and 87; *Jawahirul Kalam*, 7/151; *Riyazul Masail*, 3/64; *Farhang Fiqhe Farsi*, 1/499.

³ Ref: *Man Laa Yahzarahul Faqih* [1/220, H. 661]; *Tahzeeb*, *Shaykhut Taifa*, [2/133, 100, 102].

research.

Perhaps this matter of delaying the Maghrib Prayer came to his notice regarding the deviated Khattabiya sect and he wrongly attributed it to the Shia.

All Shia, without exception, have declared this sect to be deviated and apostates, and traditional reports of Shia Imams have rebutted the assertions of this group.

So, to attribute these doubts to the Shia while they and their Imams have declared immunity from them, is an unfounded allegation.

4. Statement Four

He says: “Jews do not accept three divorces and same is the case about Shia.”

Reply to Statement Four

Shia do not accept anything, but commands of Quran; and the Holy Quran says:

الظَّلَاقُ مَرَّتَانِ فَإِمْسَاكٌ بِمَعْرُوفٍ أَوْ تَسْرِيجٌ بِإِحْسَانٍ ۝ وَلَا يَجِدُ لَكُمْ أَنْ تَأْخُذُوا مِمَّا آتَيْتُمُوهُنَّ شَيْئًا إِلَّا أَنْ يَخَافَا لَا يُقِيمَا حُدُودَ اللَّهِ ۝ فَإِنْ خِفْتُمُ لَا يُقِيمَا حُدُودَ اللَّهِ فَلَا جُنَاحَ عَلَيْهِمَا فِيمَا افْتَدَتْ بِهِ ۝ تِلْكَ حُدُودُ اللَّهِ فَلَا تَعْتَدُوهَا ۝ وَمَنْ يَتَعَدَّ حُدُودَ اللَّهِ فَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الظَّالِمُونَ ۝ ۝ فَإِنْ طَلَّقْهَا فَلَا تَحِلُّ لَهُ مِنْ بَعْدِ حَتَّىٰ تَنْكِحَ زَوْجًا غَيْرَهُ

“Divorce may be (pronounced) twice, then keep (them) in good fellowship or let (them) go with kindness; and it is not lawful for you to take any part of what you have given them, unless both fear that they cannot keep within the limits of Allah; then if you fear that they cannot keep within the limits of Allah, there is no blame on them for what she gives up to become free thereby. These are the limits of Allah, so do not exceed them and whoever exceeds the limits of Allah these it is that are the unjust. So if he divorces her she shall not be lawful to him afterwards until she marries another husband.”¹

It is obvious that realization of the number two or three, Firstly: is in the instance that the divorce should be repeated from outside. And secondly: between two divorces, reconciliation or marriage should intervene. If not, it cannot be said about a woman, who has been divorced twice in one sitting that she is divorced; its example is that if a person gives two dirhams to someone, it is said that he gave two dirhams and not that he gave dirhams two times. Every sane person

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:229-230

understands this point well.

Another point is: Even though the preceding and following part of the verse is predicate, but it is having the meaning of imperative; like the verse:

وَالَّذِيْنَ حَوَّلْيَنَ كَامِلَيْنَ

“And the mothers should suckle their children for two whole years.”¹

And the verse:

وَالْمُظْلَقُتُ يَتَرَكَّبُنَ بِأَنْفُسِهِنَّ ثَلَاثَةَ قُرُونٍ

“And the divorced women should keep themselves in waiting for three courses.”²

And the tradition of the Prophet: “Prayer is in units of two and Tasha-hud is recited in every two units, and it should be performed with attention and sincerity.”³

Now, if the verse under discussion is predicate [and its meaning is that always externally the divorce is two times and...] then it should not be that externally the opposite of this should be seen, whereas we see that externally many a times, men divorce their wives one time. Thus, Shia regard three divorces as one on the basis of the Holy Quran.

In *Ahkamul Quran*⁴ by Abu Bakr Jassas Hanafi this issue is further explained and this verdict is much narrated from Shia Imams and the only Shafei has opposed this issue, as Abu Bakr Jassas has refuted his view in detail in his book of *Ahkamul Quran*.⁵

Imam Iraqi says in the book of *Tarahus Tasweeb*.⁶

“Malik, Awzai, Abu Hanifah, Laith are those, who have regarded combining of three divorces as heresy. Dawood and other Zahiriya also believe this.”

Abu Bakr Jassas says in *Ahkamul Quran*.⁷

“Hajjaj bin Artat often said that pronouncing three divorces in a single sitting is of no value. Muhammad bin Ishaq also often said that repetition of three divorces in a single sitting is regarded as one divorce.”

These are the verdicts of Shia; and if this verdict is the cause of similarity of Shia to Jews, then jurists and Imams of Ahle Sunnat are also similar to Shia. But Andulusi has protected the honor of his companions and has only compared Shia

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:233

² Surah Baqarah 2:228

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1/211; although the wording is slightly different.

⁴ *Ahkamul Quran*, 1:447 [1/378].

⁵ *Ahkamul Quran*, 1:449 [1/380].

⁶ *Tarahut Tasreeb*, 7:93.

⁷ *Ahkamul Quran* 4:459 [1/388].

to Jews; and he is not without one of the two conditions: either he is ignorant of jurisprudence of his own sect and has no awareness of this verdict or that he is aware of it, but he has intentionally issued a false statement.

In this issue, every view other than the view of Shia, which you read or hear is definitely heretical, which appeared after the passing away of Prophet and opposed to Quran and Sunnah. They are additions made by personal desires, which some people liked, and which Umar bin Khattab authorized.

This issue is mentioned in the authentic traditional report, which Muslim has mentioned in his *Saheeh*,¹ Abu Dawood in his *Sunan*² and *Musnad*.³ It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that he said:

“Three divorces in one sitting during the periods of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and Abu Bakr, and for two years during the Caliphate of Umar was regarded as one divorce, till Umar bin Khattab said: Verily people have begun to hasten in a matter, in which they are required to observe respite. So if we had imposed this upon them, and he imposed it upon them.”

Muslim⁴ and Abu Dawood⁵ have narrated through their chains from his father that Abu Sahba asked Ibne Abbas:

“Do you know that during the periods of Prophet and Abu Bakr, and three years of Caliphate of Umar, three divorces in one sitting was regarded as one divorce?”

“Yes,” replied Ibne Abbas.

Muslim⁶ has narrated through another chain that Abu Sahba said to Ibne Abbas:

“O Ibne Abbas, enlighten us with your information whether three divorces (pronounced at one and the same time) were not treated as one during the lifetime of Allah’s Messenger (s.a.w.a.) and Abu Bakr?”

He replied: “It was in fact so, but when during the caliphate of Umar, people began to pronounce divorce frequently, he allowed them to do so (to treat pronouncements of three divorces in a single breath as one).”

Commentators have mentioned contradictory viewpoints and expressed weak justifications regarding this issue and all reports of which are remote from knowledge, wisdom and Arabic language.

Qastalani⁷ has regarded this from the difficult traditions - and by my life, it is very difficult! – and in this instance, it is not possible to explain in detail.

¹ *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:574 [3/276, H. 15, Kitabut Talaq].

² *Sunan Abu Dawood*, 1/344 [2/261, H. 2199].

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:314 [1/517, H. 2870].

⁴ *Saheeh Muslim*, [3:277, H. 16, Kitabut Talaq].

⁵ *Sunan Abu Dawood*, [2/261, H. 2200].

⁶ *Saheeh Muslim*, [3:277, H. 17, Kitabut Talaq].

⁷ *Irshadus Sari*, [12/16 & 18].

5. Statement Five

He says: “According to the belief of Jews, women do not have waiting period, Shia also do not have waiting period.”

Reply to Statement Five

Shia regard it obligatory for women to observe the waiting period as legislated by Quran and Sunnah and it is that if the divorcee women get menses, they should observe a waiting period of three menstrual cycles; and if they don't get menses, they should observe waiting period for three months. And the waiting period of pregnant women end at the delivery.

وَأُولَاتُ الْأَنْجَمَالِ أَجْلَهُنَّ أَنْ يَضَعُنَ حَمْلَهُنَّ

“Their prescribed time is that they lay down their burden...”¹

Waiting period for widows is four months and ten days, if they are not pregnant, otherwise from the aspect of reconciliation of two verses, they observe longer of the two periods: waiting period of widow and delivery. If divorced slave girls get menses, they should observe waiting period of two menstrual cycles; and if they do not get menses, they should observe a waiting period of one month and a half.

If the husband of the slave girl dies while she is not pregnant: her waiting period would be two months and five days and if she is pregnant, she would wait for whichever is longer: delivery or waiting period. A slave mother, in the instance of the death of her master, whose child she carried, is four months and ten days; and the *Mutah* wife after having intercourse and after completion of the fixed duration or if the husband separates from her; her waiting period is two menses if she is getting menses and other than that it is forty-five days.

If the woman in Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) is not pregnant when the husband dies, or she did not have intercourse with him, she has to observe a waiting period of four months and ten days. If she is pregnant she has observe the longer of the two periods: delivery or four months and ten days.

If the woman in Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) is a slave, and her husband dies while she is not pregnant, she has to observe a waiting period of two months and five days.

These are the rules of waiting period among Shia mentioned in all books of Shia jurisprudence.

Now, it should be asked whether this man has seen such a fabricated attribution in any Shia book? The Almighty Allah is a witness that it is not so.

In most instances, his conduct is such that he bewilders people through big lies and does not exercise any restrain in this.

¹ Surah Talaq 65:4

6. Statement Six

He says: “Jews regard shedding the blood of every Muslim lawful and Shia are also as such.”

Reply to Statement Six

Has this man gained access to any Shia source, which states this?

Shia is one, who recites the Quran night and day and he is confident that its verses are divine revelation and were revealed on the Prophet from Almighty Allah; and in those verses, it is mentioned that one, who eliminates a believer is condemned to Hell forever. Also the verses of retaliation are mentioned therein.

In addition, Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Shia Imams issued numerous statements prohibiting killing of believers. They mentioned its repercussions and also explained its retaliation and blood monies. Chapters on retaliation and blood monies are invariably found in books of Shia.

In spite of all this, you will become certain that these shameful attributions and allegations have no basis, except a cheap imagination due to severe enmity and foolish prejudice.

7. Statement Seven

He says: “Jews interpolated the Taurat and Shia have also interpolated the Quran.”

Reply to Statement Seven

The sole point of reference of the Shia in exegesis and interpretation of Quran and in every law and teaching, are reliable traditions, which have reached us from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Ahle Bayt (a.s.). It is definite that the people of a house are most aware of what is there in the house and traditions of those persons are neither illogical nor do they have any contradiction with the established fundamentals of religion; neither are they taken from Qatada or Zahhak or Siddi and their like, who interpreted the Quran according to personal views and they are remote from the source of prophetic wisdom.

If you want you become familiar with distortion of statements and reversing facts, you should refer to books and commentaries of Ahle Sunnat to become aware of lifeless justifications, illogical, futile, imaginative causes, degraded viewpoints and denial of established principles of religion and judge for yourself, which sect is more resembling the Jews; and sufficient for you would be examples from *Minhajus Sunnah* of Ibne Taymiyyah and other books, which shall be mentioned.

8. Statement Eight

He says: “Jews were inimical to Jibreel and they said: Jibreel is our enemy from among the angels. The Shia are also as such and they say: ‘Jibreel made a mistake while getting divine revelation and instead of giving them to Ali

Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), delivered it to Muhammad. ^{””}

Reply to Statement Eight

Perhaps he expected the Ummah to become extinct and that days would erase its effects and no defense would remain for it. He says something and does not think that time would bring forward someone, who would read the following statement of Almighty Allah in Quran:

مَنْ كَانَ عَدُوًّا لِّلَّهِ وَمَلِكَتِهِ وَرُسُلِهِ وَجِبْرِيلَ وَمِيكَلَ فَإِنَّ اللَّهَ عَلُوٌّ
لِّلْكُفَّارِينَ ⑥

“Whoever is the enemy of Allah and His angels and His apostles and Jibraeel and Mikael, so surely Allah is the enemy of the unbelievers.”¹

How he can be inimical to Jibraeel?

At what time did the Shia began to doubt the prophethood of Muhammad or began to believe in prophethood of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)? That they should say that Jibraeel made a mistake. The Shia, who recite the following verses day and night:

وَمَا حُمَّدٌ إِلَّا رَسُولٌ ۚ قَدْ خَلَقَ مِنْ قَبْلِهِ الرُّسُلُ

“And Muhammad is no more than an apostle; the apostles have already passed away before him.”²

مَا كَانَ مُحَمَّدٌ أَبَا أَحَدٍ مِّنْ رِّجَالِكُمْ وَلِكُنْ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ وَخَاتَمُ النَّبِيِّنَ

“Muhammad is not the father of any of your men, but he is the Apostle of Allah and the Last of the prophets.”³

وَأَمُّنُوا بِمَا نَزَّلَ عَلَىٰ مُحَمَّدٍ وَهُوَ الْحَقُّ مِنْ رَبِّهِمْ

“And believe in what has been revealed to Muhammad, and it is the very truth from their Lord.”⁴

مُحَمَّدٌ رَّسُولُ اللَّهِ

“Muhammad is the Apostle of Allah.”⁵

وَمُبَشِّرٌ بِرَسُولٍ يَأْتِي مِنْ بَعْدِي أَسْمَهُ أَمْمُ

“And giving the good news of an Apostle who will come after

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:98

² Surah Aale Imran 3:144

³ Surah Ahzab 33:40

⁴ Surah Muhammad 47:2

⁵ Surah Fath 48:29

me, his name being Ahmad.”¹

...have doubt in the prophethood of Muhammad? And how can Shia, who in every obligatory and recommended prayer, in Adhan and Iqamah and in numerous supplications received from their Imams which testify for prophethood of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), believe that Jibreel made a mistake in delivering divine revelation?

Shia books of jurisprudence, traditions, scholasticism, beliefs and sects are testimonies to this.

As mentioned in this allegation, is it basically possible that Allah, the Mighty and the High sent Imam Ali (a.s.) as a Prophet, but only because Jibreel delivered the revelation to Muhammad, He accepted and authorized it? [and prophethood was transferred from Ali to Muhammad only because of the mistake of Jibreel?].

Is it possible for even a foolish person to say this? What to say about the Shia, who are prominent personalities:

فَمَالِ هُؤُلَاءِ الْقَوْمِ لَا يَكَادُونَ يَفْقَهُونَ حَدِيثًا

“But what is the matter with these people that they do not make approach to understanding what is told (them)?”²

Most amazing is that the author of *Misrul Yaum wa Aalimha*, has in refutation of Shia, repeated this worthless statement in his book and caused pain to the Shia.

فَلَا يَصُدِّنَكُ عَنْهَا مَنْ لَا يُؤْمِنُ بِهَا وَاتْبِعْ هَوْنَهُ فَتَرْدِي

“Therefore let not him who believes not in it and follows his low desires turn you away from it so that you should perish.”³

9. Statement Nine

He says: “Jews do not consume the meat of a slaughtered camel and Shia are also as such.”

Reply to Statement Nine

Read the following statement and laugh; or read it and weep.

If you are in search of shamelessness and illogical exaggeration, you should read the statements of this author. If you don't know how a liar lies, and how a dishonest man attributes false statements to others in his books, Andulusi would inform of all this.

If I only knew, what is the sin of the slaughtered camel that it should be removed from the command of slaughtered animals? Or what precedence this

¹ Surah Saff 61:6

² Surah Nisa 4:78

³ Surah Taha 20:16

animal has with Shia that they should refrain from its slaughter?

I am unaware of this [neither I found any fault of this animal nor excellence], and perhaps the fabricator of this report should be pursued in progressive philosophy for this unlawful attribution. The final statement regarding these degraded acts is found in the whole world.

Funny statement

10. Statement Ten

He says: Abu Uthman Amr bin Bahr Jahiz says:

“A chief trader told me: A bad mannered old man accompanied us on a journey on ship and whenever Shia was mentioned to him, he became infuriated and his complexion changed. One day I asked him: May God forgive you, what harm has come to you from Shia? As I see that whenever they are mentioned, you become infuriated and your face becomes aggrieved? The old man replied: Only the Arabic letter of ‘sh’ [sheen] in their name distresses me. As it stands for: *Shar* (mischief), *Shum* (evil), *Shaitan*, *Shaghab* (mischief), *Shiqa* (misfortune), *Shifar* (defect), *Sharar* (sparks), *Shayn* (evil), *Shok* (thorn), *Shikwa* (complain), *Shuhra* (degradation), *Shatam* (abuse), *Shoh* (miserliness).”

Abu Uthman says: “After this statement, no basis remains for validity of Shia religion.”

Reply to Statement Ten

It is amazing that even though this old man cannot find any defect in the Shia themselves, he invents the excuse of negative terms which begin with ‘sh’.

If this method becomes the standard to judge good and bad, there are many names from ‘sh’ which are holy: as it is mentioned in a verse of the Holy Quran:

وَإِنَّ مِنْ شَيْعَتِهِ لَا يُرْهِمُ

“And most surely Ibrahim followed his way.”¹

And other verses where the term of Shia is used.²

More foolish than that old man is Abu Uthman, who thinks that after this worthless statement, there remains no basis for the Shia. As if [with this illogical statement] he has struck lightning on the Shia or brought down a mountain upon their heads and destroyed them; or has provided a solid argument against them and exposed them. But he does not understand that the old man has exposed his own defect with these statements and has himself brought proof against himself.

Abu Uthman followed him blindly and Ibne Abde Rabbe also supported them and quoted his statement in his book.

It should be asked whether this old nasty man not approves of the ‘sh’ words

¹ Surah Saffat 37:83

² Surah Qasas 28:15.

like Shariah, *Shams* (sun), *Shuruq* (lights), *Shua* (rays), *Shahad* (honey), *Shafat* (intercession), *Sharaf* (nobility), *Shabab* (youth), *Shukr* (thankfulness), *Shahamat* (glory), *Shuja-at* (valor), *Shafaq* (morning light)? Whereas these terms are also, like the term of Shia, mentioned in the Holy Quran many times.

How do find this old liar, who sees the letter of 'Sheen' only in the word of 'Shar' and not in other words? Perhaps he is squint eyed and that is why he has not seen terms weak in his eyes.

Is it within the capacity of the Shia, that like this old man to say that they are aloof from Sunnis due to following words from 's'? Like: *Sam* (death), *Saam* (grief), *Sa-ar* (severe hunger), *Saqar* (Hell), *Sabi* (captivity), *Suqum* (disease), *Samm* (poison), *Sawat* (wantonness, unchastity, genitals), *Saham* (arrow), *Sahu* (mistake), *Sartan* (cancer), *Safah* (foolishness), *Safal* (degradation), *Sakhab* (beggary), *Sakhat* (anger), *Sakhaf* (ignorance), *Saqat* (consumption), *Salita* (shamelessness), *Samajat* (obstinacy).

But the Shia are intelligent and wise and they don't depend on foolish statements and do not hurt the feelings of others through such tactics; and through such kind of nonsense and frivolous statements, they do not demean any point of view.

These were some baseless and illogical statements of Ibne Abde Rabbe, and many others like them can be mentioned. So numerous are such statements that a books full of them can be compiled. This book also contains historical mistakes; like his statement about Zaid, the martyr:

"He lived in Khorasan and was eliminated and crucified there."

In *Minhajus Sunnah*,¹ Ibne Taymiyyah has added to these attributions and allegations and Islamic society regards him to be the greatest fabricator from among the past scholars and regard him remote from honesty and probity.

He has added: "Jews do not greet the Muslims properly and instead of saying: Peace be on you, they say: *Saam alaikum* (death be on you). And the Shia also do this."

Jews do not regard wiping on shoes correct and Shia also are as such.

Jews do not regard the property of others unlawful for themselves; Shia are also as such.

Jews, during the prayers, prostrate on the upper part of foreheads and Shia are also as such.

Jews do not prostrate and instead of that they shake their heads a few times, so that it seems to be like genuflection, Shia are also as such.

Jews regard it lawful to commit dishonesty and defraud people as lawful and Shia are also as such.

And many other nonsensical and illogical statements.

¹ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 1/7-8.

But free thinking and your awareness and familiarity with Shia jurisprudence, books, beliefs, their acts, and what is famous about them from the past and present, will suffice for refuting these false accusations and improper attributions.

I only complain to the Almighty Allah.

وَلَئِنْ اتَّبَعْتَ أَهْوَاءَهُمْ بَعْدَ الَّذِي جَاءَكَ مِنَ الْعِلْمِ ۝ مَا لَكَ مِنَ اللَّهِ مَنْ وَلِيٌّ
وَلَا نَصِيرٌ ۝

“And if you follow their desires after the knowledge that has come to you, you shall have no guardian from Allah, nor any helper.”¹

2. Kitabul Intisar²

If you call this book as the source of falsehood and allegation, you would not have exaggerated. And if it is said that according to the number of its pages, it contains 173 falsehoods, it would not be a misstatement.

We shall be content to hint at only two statements from this book, so that you may become aware of their degradation and lowliness in making allegations:

1. Shia believe that God possesses body and shape and He moves and remains immobile. He is subject to decline and is transferred from place to place. In the beginning He was not all-knowing and after that He became knowledgeable.³

2. Shias say that a hundred males can have intercourse with a single woman in a day, without allowing her a waiting period; and this is against the belief of Islam.⁴

Soon the reality of this would become clear to you and that Shia from the beginning are far from these improper attributions.

وَلَئِنْ اتَّبَعْتَ أَهْوَاءَهُمْ مِّنْ بَعْدِ مَا جَاءَكَ مِنَ الْعِلْمِ ۝ إِنَّكَ إِذَا لَمْ يَنْ
الظَّلِيلِينَ ۝

“And if you follow their desires after the knowledge that has come to you, then you shall most surely be among the unjust.”⁵

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:120

² By Abu Husain Abdur Rahim Khayyat Mutazali.

³ *Al-Intisar*, 7 [Pg. 41].

⁴ *Al-Intisar*, 89 [Pg. 142].

⁵ Surah Baqarah 2:145

3. Al-Farq bainal Firaq¹

In this book, the author has not refrained from making any allegation the Shia and his invalid allegations would alone enable him to be thrown into Hell. (He says):

“Shia do not have specialists of jurisprudence, traditional reports, language, grammar, history and biography, battles of Prophet, exegesis of Quran. Only Ahle Sunnat have experts in these fields, and I thank God for this.”²

One is really astonished at this man, because in his native place and before his eyes lived noble personalities like the teacher of Ummah: Muhammad bin Muhammad bin Noman, Shaykh Mufeed, Alamul Huda, Sayyid Murtada, Sharif Razi, Abul Hasan Najjashi, Shaykh Abul Fath Karajaki, Sharif Abu Yaala, Sallar Dailami and their like, who were leaders of Shia and there is no doubt in their leadership in the sciences.

وَلَئِنْ اتَّبَعْتَ أَهْوَاءَهُمْ بَعْدَ مَا جَاءَكَ مِنَ الْعِلْمِ لَا مَالَكَ مِنَ اللَّهِ مِنْ وَلَيٌّ وَلَا
وَاقِعٌ

“And if you follow their low desires after what has come to you of knowledge, you shall not have against Allah any guardian or a protector.”³

4. Al-Fisal fil Milal wan Nihal⁴

The foremost condition of writing about sects is that the writer should possess absolute accuracy and honesty, but regrettably, Ibne Hazm (author of this book) is lacking these qualities; on the contrary, he has observed their opposites in writing the book.

Following are some examples of his false statements:

1. First objection

He says: Shia are not Muslims; due to the fact that their first group appeared twenty-five years after the passing away of Prophet and their origin was response to a hypocritical call, which God humiliated. In lying and disbelief, they are like Jews and Christians.⁵

Reply to the first objection

By God, these are regretful statements, which shame the face of humanity.

I don't know how he denies the Islam of a group, which prays facing the

¹ By Abu Mansur Abdul Qahir bin Tahir Baghdadi (d. 429 A.H.), on pg. 355.

² *Al-Farq bainal Firaq*, 309 [Pg. 247, Chap. 5].

³ Surah Raad 13:37

⁴ By Ibne Hazm Zahiri Andulasi (d. 456 A.H.).

⁵ *Al-Fisal*, 2:78.

Qibla, recites the dual testimony of faith, reads and acts on Quran, and follows the Sunnah of Prophet; and their books on beliefs and laws have filled the world?

How can he issue such a verdict, while thousands of teachers (*Mashayakh*) of narrators of Sihah Sitta and Ahle Sunnat Musnad books, were Shia; they were points of reference for beliefs and Islamic laws, like Aban bin Taghlib Kufi, Thabit Abu Hamza Thumali, Tawus bin Keesan Hamadani, Atiyya bin Saad Kufi, Maroof Kharrabooz Karkhi, Hisham bin Ziyad Basri, Hisham bin Ammaar Damishqi¹ and so on...

And if the Shia – according to the allegations of Ibne Hazm – are outside the pale of Islam, then what is the value of their Sihah Sitta and Musnad books?

Yes, the unforgivable sin of the Shia according to Ibne Hazm is that they act according to commands of Quran and Sunnah, are followers of Imams, who are security for the folks of the earth; that is Ali and his descendants.

As for what he says that Shia religion was originated by a deceitful person whom Almighty Allah degraded, he implies Abdullah bin Saba, famous as Ibne Sauda; but what connection he has with the Alawite party?

Is it not that Ali (a.s.), due to his heretical statements, threw him into the fire? And the Shia also, on the basis of emulating Ali (a.s.), have cursed Abdullah and declared immunity from him?

In that case, how it can be said that Abdullah bin Saba was the originator of Shia? Throughout the history of Shia was it ever seen that they attributed their origin to him? If he looks at the reality with open eyes, he would certainly understand that the seed of Shiaism was sown by Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself on the day he named the loyalists of Ali as Shia and urged people to his mastership (*Wilayat*) and obedience.

2. Second objection

He says:² “One who says: ‘Ali is most knowledgeable than other companions of the Prophet,’ has lied.”

Then in proving the knowledge and precedence of Abu Bakr with relation to Ali, he has issued a detailed and illogical statement; so much so that he said:

“One, who has a part of knowledge knows that knowledge and wisdom possessed by Abu Bakr was many times that of Ali.”

And with regard to precedence of Umar with relation to Ali, he says:

“Every person having perception, knows that knowledge and wisdom of Umar was many times that of Ali.”

Reply to the second objection

I don’t know whether I should laugh at the ignorance and unawareness of

¹ For his biography and explanation of his traditions refer to the book of *Muraja-aat*, Sayyid Sharafuddin, Pg. 41, 105 [Pg. 70, 126].

² *Al-Fisal*, 4:136.

this man or weep upon it? Because, the matter about which there is no doubt at all is precedence of Ali (a.s.) in knowledge as compared to all companions, in such a way that all of them referred to him in difficulties and legal problems, whereas Ali (a.s.) never referred to them.

And the first to acknowledge the knowledge of Ali (a.s.) was Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself, when he said to Fatima (a.s.):

“Are you not pleased that I married you to one, who was the foremost of Muslims and most knowledgeable of them?”¹

And he said: “Fatima, I married you to a man, who is the best from my community, because in wisdom, he is superior to all, in forbearance, is most forbearing and in Islam, he has precedence over all.”²

And he said: “The most knowledgeable person after me in my Ummah is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.”)³

And he said: “Ali is the treasure-trove of my knowledge.”⁴

And he said: “Ali is the treasurer of my knowledge.”⁵

And he said: “Ali is superior to everyone in issuing legal judgments.”⁶

And he said: “Wisdom was divided into ten parts; nine parts were given to Ali (a.s.) and one part to rest of the people.”⁷

And when Ali (a.s.) issued judgments during the lifetime of Prophet, His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) said: “Thanks be to Allah, that He placed wisdom in the beings of our Ahle Bayt.”⁸

And after the Prophet, Ayesha is the second person, who confessed to the knowledge of Ali (a.s.) and she said:

“Ali is most well informed person about the Sunnah of Prophet.”⁹

Umar also remarked: “Ali is most superior to all of us in adjudication.”¹⁰

¹ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, [3:140, H. 4645]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:13 [11/605, H. 32925].

² Khateeb has mentioned this tradition in the book of *Muttafaq* and Suyuti in *Jamaul Jawame* as is mentioned in its sequence 6:398 [*Kanzul Ummaal* 11/605, H. 32926].

³ Dailami has narrated this tradition from Salman and also Khwarizmi in his *Manaqib* 49 [Pg. 82, H. 67] and *Maqtalul Husain* 1:43; Muttaqi in *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:153 [11/614, H. 32977].

⁴ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 2:488 [9/165, Sermon 154].

⁵ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 2:488; *Al-Jamius Saghir*, Suyuti [2/177, H. 5593]; *Jamaul Jawame*, he has mentioned in its sequence as 6:153 [*Kanzul Ummaal*, 11/603, H. 32911] and in that book instead of ‘Aibat’ the term of ‘Utbah’ is mentioned.]

⁶ *Masabih*, Baghawi, 2:277 [4/180, H. 4787]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:198 [3/147]; *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, 50 [Pg. 81, H. 66]; *Fathul Bari*, 8:136 [8/167]; *Al-Baghiyul Wa-at*, 447 [2/406, No, 21].

⁷ *Hilyatul Awliya*, Abu Nuaim 1: 65 [No. 4]; *Asniul Mataalib*, Hafiz Jazari, 14 [Pg. 71].

⁸ Ahmad, *Manaqib* [Pg. 168, H. 235] and Mohibuddin Tabari in *Riyaz*, 2:194 [3/149] have quoted this tradition.

⁹ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:193 [3/141]; *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, 54 [Pg. 91, H. 84]; *Sawaiq*, 76 [Pg. 127]; *Taareekhul Kholaifa*, 115 [Pg. 160].

¹⁰ *Hilyatul Awliya*, Abu Nuaim 1: 65 [No. 4]; *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 7:359 [7/397, Incidents of

Umar issued a famous statement, which shows that he was in dire need of wisdom of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.):

“If Ali were not there, Umar would have perished.”¹

And he said: “O Allah, do not involve me in a problem, when Ali Ibne Abi Talib is not present to solve it.”²

And he said: “O Abul Hasan, may God never involve me in a problem where you are not present.”³

And he said: “O Ali, may God not keep me alive after you.”⁴

And he said: “I seek refuge of God from a difficulty, where Abul Hasan is not present to solve it.”⁵

And he said: “O God, do not send hardships upon me when Abul Hasan is not there at my side.”⁶

Muawiyah says: “Whenever Umar encountered a difficulty, he asked Ali for its solution.”⁷

When Muawiyah received the news of the assassination of the Imam, he said:

“Indeed, by the death of the son of Abu Talib, jurisprudence and knowledge have passed away.”

Abu Hajjaj Balawi has mentioned this statement in the book of *Alif Baa*.⁸

Imam Hasan (a.s.) says regarding the knowledge of Imam Ali (a.s.) in his sermon:

“Yesterday, there passed away from among you a man, who was not preceded by those, who have passed and those, who would come in future will also not get precedence over him.”⁹

The teacher of Ummah, Ibne Abbas says: “The knowledge of me and companions of Prophet as compared to the knowledge of Ali (a.s.), was like a drop in an ocean.”

In addition to that some companions also in their couplets have praised the

¹ year 40 A.H.]; *Taareekhul Kholafa*, Suyuti, 115, [Pg. 160].

² This report is mentioned by Ahmad, Aqili and Samman and it is mentioned in *Istiab* 3:39 [Part 3/1103, No. 1855]; *Riyaz*, 2:194 [3/142].

³ *Tazkiratus Sibt*, 87 [Pg. 148]; *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, 58 [Pg. 97, H. 98]; *Maqtaal Khwarizmi*, 1:45.

⁴ *Irshadus Sari*, 3:195 [4/136].

⁵ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:197 [4/146]; *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, 60 [Pg. 101, H. 104].

⁶ *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 7:359 [7/397, Incidents of 40 A.H.]; *Al-Futuhatul Islamiyyah*, 2:306.

⁷ Ibne Bakhtari has narrated this tradition; on the basis of what is mentioned in *Riyaz*, 2:194 [3/142].

⁸ *Manaqib Ahmad*, [Pg. 155, H. 222]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:195 [3/143].

⁹ *Alif Baa*, 1:222.

⁹ Ahmad has narrated this tradition in his *Musnad*, 1/328, H. 1721; Ibne Kaseer in his *Taareekh*, 7:332 [7/368].

knowledge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). Hassan bin Thabit, Fazl bin Abbas, and following them a large number of poets of the first century have mentioned the knowledge of His Eminence in poetry.

Moreover, the whole community has consensus on the precedence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) over others in knowledge and wisdom, because he alone was the heir of the knowledge of Prophet and in reports recorded from numerous channels, it is mentioned that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said that he is his successor and heir; in that report¹ it is mentioned that Ali asked:

“O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), what would I inherit from you?”

He replied: “What did the previous prophets leave in inheritance?”

Ali (a.s.) asked: “What did the previous prophets leave as inheritance?”

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) replied: “Book of Allah and their Sunnah.”

3. Third objection

He says: “Shia Imami, from the beginning, believe in distortion in Quran and they still do so. They say that numerous verses are deleted from it, numerous verses are added to it, and numerous verses are distorted in it. Only one person from them did not have this belief as he also acted like Mutazila, because he regarded those, who believe in distortion of Quran to be infidels. He was Ali bin Hasan² bin Moosa bin Muhammad.”

Reply to the third objection

Alas, if this impudent man had shown us a single reliable Shia book, which mentions this nonsense. But if the reader investigates, he would conclude that all Shia scholars have denied this allegation.

Scholars like Shaykh Saduq in his book of *Aqaid*³, Shaykh Mufeed⁴, Shaykh Tusi in *Tibyan*⁵, Tabarsi in *Majmaul Bayan*,⁶ and Alamul Huda, Sayyid Murtada,⁷ as the author has himself confessed, and others are deniers of distortion in Quran and not only Sayyid Murtada as this foolish man thinks.

4. Fourth objection

He says: “Some Shia Imamiyah regard marrying nine women as lawful and some others say that eating cabbage is unlawful since it grew from the blood of Husain and it did not exist before his martyrdom.”⁸

¹ That is in the tradition of heirship of Ali (a.s.) from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

² In *Fisal* [4/182] also it is mentioned as such and in Ahle Sunnat books also it is narrated from him and the correct name is Ali bin Husain, that is Sayyid Murtada Alamul Huda.

³ Al-Itiqadat fil deenil Imamiyah, Pg. 59, Chap. 33.

⁴ *Awailul Maqalat*, [Pg. 93. 95].

⁵ Al-Tibyan fee Tafsir al-Quran, [1/3, Preface].

⁶ Majmaul Bayan [4/508].

⁷ *Amali*, Sayyid Murtada [2/84].

⁸ *Al-Fisal*, 4:182.

Reply to the fourth objection

Alas, if he had referred to Shia jurisprudence before laying allegation of nine marriages, which does not sanction more than four marriages at a time. And marrying nine women is regarded as one of the distinctive qualities of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). In this matter Shia and Sunni have consensus and there is no dispute among them. Also, if he had, before attributing cabbage to Shia, had conducted a survey of Shia villages and seen how cabbage is cultivated on their farms and how it is consumed by them with rice and cooked with wheat, he would have seen that scholars and laymen, and the rich and poor, all have this diet.

Till date, no Shia has ever prohibited this and it is not narrated from any tradition scholar, historian, language expert, story teller or vegetable seller that cabbage grows from the blood of Imam Husain (a.s.).

5. Fifth objection

He says: “Ali did not pay allegiance to Abu Bakr for six months and he (Abu Bakr) also did not compel him, till Ali paid allegiance to him of his own accord.”

He also says: “More interesting is the fact that in spite of Ali’s refusal to pay allegiance, Abu Bakr neither compelled him nor requested him for it.

During this period, he was free to do what he liked, but after that for the sake of protecting his religion and returning to the truth, he paid allegiance voluntarily and this shows that he regarded allegiance as obligatory, otherwise he would never have paid it.”¹

Reply to the fifth objection

Firstly: read this statement carefully, after that see the statement of the great teacher, Abdul Fatah Abdul Maqsood in the book of *Al-Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib*,² which is the extract of the matter as you would yourself conclude. He says:

“Sometimes they gathered secretly and sometimes openly and in that meeting called people to the son of Abu Talib, because they regarded him as most deserving than others for Caliphate and rulership. Then in order to create mischief, they surrounded his house and shouted to him to come out in order to recover his usurped rights...during that time people had divided into groups: opponents and supporters. When Medina was thirsty for unity, they split into two groups and nothing remained to unite them. If it has been as such, other than God, no one knew what would come to pass in future.”

Was Ali, in view of Umar bin Khattab, not worthy of being killed like Ubadah to prevent mischief and discord? Yes, that day, when Umar bin Khattab, along with his men, went to the house of Fatima to take allegiance from the

¹ *Al-Fisal*, 4:96-97.

² Al-Majmua al-Kamila lil Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib, [No. 1: Vol. 1/89-91].

cousin of Prophet in any way: willingly or forcibly. Rumors preceded the steps of Umar. Some said: Only the sword will get us absolute obedience. Some said that very soon fighting would erupt. The third group said; Fire would be the only and best means of protecting unity...Can the people be silenced through force, so that the story of gathering firewood under the orders of Umar and surrounding the house of Fatima is not repeated? The house, in which Ali and his companions were present. Would he agree to pay allegiance through such an act or they would set his house on fire?!

In that conditions, he saw Fatima is walking towards the Masjid of Prophet, tired; she reached the grave of her father. All were attentive towards her. Suddenly a sorrowful voice rose up:

“O father, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.); O father, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)! After you, what all the son of Khattab and son of Abi Qahafa made me endure.”

Hearts were shattered by this lamentation. One wished that the earth would split and swallow one.

Allamah Amini says: Refer to the following books: *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, *Tarikh Tabari*, *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, *Tareekh Abul Fida*, *Tareekh Ibne Shahna*, under the incidents of the year 11 A.H.; and *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*.¹

6. Sixth objection

He says: “We do not accept the falsehood of Shia in their interpretation and exegesis of the verse:

وَيُطْعِمُونَ الظَّعَامَ عَلَى حُبَّهِ مُسْكِيَّاً وَيَبْيَّنُوا وَآسِيَّا^④

“And they give food out of love for Him to the poor and the orphan and the captive.”²

We reject it altogether, because they say that the implication of this verse is Ali (a.s.) and this interpretation is not correct; on the contrary the generality and apparent aspect of the verse includes all those, who do this.”³

Reply to the sixth objection

This funny statement shows that this man has gone to extreme lengths in concealment of truth. In his view, he has effectively destroyed the value of this tradition by alleging that the Shia restrict the interpretation of this verse to Ali (a.s.). While the fact is that his own scholars have recorded this tradition in their books and he can refer to them.

¹ *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:13 [1/19]; *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 3:198 [3/202, incidents of 11 A.H.]; *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:257 [4/86-87]; *Tareekh Abul Fida*, 1:165; *Tareekh Ibne Shahna*, [1/189]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:19 [6/46, Sermon 66].

² Surah Insaan 76:8

³ *Al-Fisal*, 4:146.

Hafiz Abu Muhammad Asimi has written a two volume book on this issue and entitled it *Zainul Fata fee Tafseer Surah Hal Ata*.

Does this foolish and unaware author thinks that he was a Shia? Or he is ignorant the science of traditions? Or has not paid attention to traditions favoring the Shia?

In any case, some narrators of this tradition are:

1. Abu Ja'far Iskafi (d. 240 A.H.).¹
2. Hakeem Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ali Tirmizi, who according to *Nawadirul Usul*, was alive till the year 285 A.H.²
3. Hafiz Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari (d. 310 A.H.).³
4. Abul Qasim Zamakhshari (d. 538 A.H.).⁴
5. Abu Abdallah Fakhruddin Razi (d. 606 A.H.).⁵
6. Izzuddin Abdul Hamid, alias Ibne Abil Hadeed Mutazali (d. 655 A.H.).⁶
7. Qazi Nasiruddin Baidhawi (d. 685 A.H.).⁷
8. Hafiz Ibne Hajar (d. 852 A.H.).⁸
9. Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.).⁹

Text of the tradition

Ibne Abbas says that Imam Hasan and Imam Husain (a.s.) were indisposed. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) visited them with some people. He said to Ali (a.s.):

“O Abal Hasan, make a vow for the health of your children.”

So Ali, Fatima, Fizza, their servant made a vow that if Hasan and Husain regained health, they would keep three fasts. After sometime the sons recovered, but at that time they were not having anything in the house to eat. Ali (a.s.) was compelled to approach Shamun, the Jew and borrowed three Saa-a¹⁰ (nine kilos) of barley and returned home.

Fatima grinded one Saa-a and kneaded the flour and prepared five loaves of bread for five persons to break the fast. At that moment, a beggar arrived and called out:

“Peace be on you, O Ahle Bayt of Muhammad. I am a beggar, a Muslim and

¹ Naqzul Uthmaniya, Pg. 318.

² *Nawaaderul Usul*, 64 [1/154, Principle 44].

³ *Kifayatut Talib*, [Pg. 345, Chap. 97].

⁴ *Tafseer al-Kashaf*, 2:511 [4/670].

⁵ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 8:376 [30/244].

⁶ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, [13/276, Sermon 238].

⁷ Tafseer Baizaawi, [2/552].

⁸ *Al-Isabah*, 4:384.

⁹ *Durre Mansoor*, [8/371].

¹⁰ One Saa-a is three kilos.

I am needy. Please feed me, so that God may bestow you with food from Paradise.”

Those noble beings made a sacrifice and gave him their food and spent the night in hunger, only having a drink of water. The following day, again they made an intention to keep a fast and then again just as they were about to end their fast, an orphan came and sought their help.

They again gave their food to the orphan and like the previous night, slept hungry. On the third day, at the time of breaking the fast, a prisoner approached them and asked for help. Like the previous two days, they again gave him their shares. On the fourth day, when it was morning, Ali (a.s.) held the hands of Hasan and Husain (a.s.), while they were trembling like chicks, and came to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). When His Eminence saw them in this condition, he said:

“Nothing is more tragic than to see you in this condition.”

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) arose and accompanied them back home. When he entered the house of Fatima, he saw Fatima praying. Due to hunger, her stomach was clinging to her back and her eyes were sunk.

The Prophet was much aggrieved to see this and it was at that time that Jibreel descended from heavens and said to the Prophet:

“O Muhammad, Almighty Allah sends congratulations to you regarding your Ahle Bayt.”

Then he recited Surah Insan. Some commentators of Quran have narrated this tradition in this form.

7. Seventh objection

He says: “The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: ‘If I wanted to take a friend and companion for myself, I would definitely take Abu Bakr. Abu Bakr is my brother and friend.’ Other than Abu Bakr, no one else had brotherhood with the Prophet. As for Ali (a.s.); he had brotherhood only with Suhail bin Hunayn and that’s all.”¹

Reply to the seventh objection

I don’t want to argue about the tradition, which he regards as authentic and I also do not dispute its issuance and do not reject this tradition with the excuse that Umar rejected the tradition of paper and ink-pot, because as this tradition is mentioned in *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim*², is identical and same as the tradition and both were issued just before the demise of Prophet; I also don’t repeat the statement of Ibne Abil Hadeed in *Sharh Nahjul Balaghah*³ that the captioned tradition is fabricated and supporters of Abu Bakr fabricated it against the tradition of brotherhood.

I will not prolong the discussion regarding its conclusion like Ibne Qutaibah

¹ *Al-Fisal*, 4:147.

² *Saheeh Bukhari*, [4/1612, H. 168, & 4169]; *Saheeh Muslim*, [3/455, H. 22, Kitabul Wasiyyat].

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balaghah*, 3:17 [11/49, Sermon 203].

says in justification of the tradition:¹ “The implication of brotherhood in this tradition is general Islamic brotherhood, which on the basis of verse:

إِنَّمَا الْمُؤْمِنُونَ إِخْرَوَةٌ

“The believers are but brethren.”²

...and all Muslims are regarded as brothers of each other, like the report narrated from Prophet that he said to Umar: O brother,³ or said to Zaid: You are our brother.⁴ Or said to Usamah: O brother.⁵

In the same way, is the text of tradition which, Bukhari,⁶ Muslim and Tirmizi have mentioned: If I wanted to select a friend, I would have definitely selected Abu Bakr. But Islamic love and brotherhood, clarifies the implication of brotherhood in this tradition. As friendship negated in that tradition is special friendship and not general friendship, which is proved according to the verse:

الْأَخْلَالُ يَوْمَئِذٍ بَعْضُهُمْ لِبَعْضٍ عَلَوْا لَا الْمُتَّقِينَ

“The friends shall on that day be enemies one to another, except those who guard (against evil).”⁷

So, the implication of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is special brotherhood, which he established among companions on the day of brotherhood,⁸ it was established on the basis of similarity and nature of persons. That is brotherhood was established between two persons of same temperament, as numerous scholar have admitted.

In that instance, brotherhood was established between Abu Bakr and Umar, Uthman and Abdur Rahman bin Auf, Talha and Zubair, Abu Ubaidah Jarrah and Saalim, freed slave of Abu Huzaifah, Ubayy bin Kaab and Ibne Masud, Maaz and Thauban, Abu Talha and Bilal, Ammaar and Huzaifah, Abu Darda and Salman, Saad bin Abi Waqqas and Suhaib, Abu Zar and Miqdad bin Amr, Abu Ayyub Ansari and Abdullah bin Salam, Usamah and Hind, the barber of the Prophet, Muawiyah and Habbab Majashai, Fatima, daughter of Prophet and Umme Salma, Ayesha and wife of Abu Ayyub.⁹

¹ Tawil Mukhtaliful Hadith, 51 [Pg. 63].

² Surah Hujurat 49:10

³ Riyazun Nazara, 2:6 [2/272].

⁴ Khasais Nasai, 19 [Pg. 205, H. 194 and in Sonan Kubra, 5/169, H. 8579].

⁵ Tareekh Ibne Asakir, 6:9 [6/623, and in Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, 9/139].

⁶ Saheeh Bukhari, [3/1338, H. 3457]; Saheeh Muslim, [5/8, H. 3, Kitab Fadailus Sahaba]; Sonan Tirmizi [5/569, H. 3661].

⁷ Surah Zukhruf 43:67

⁸ Establishment of brotherhood took place twice (1) Before migration to Medina and (2) Five months after that as would be mentioned later.

⁹ Seerah Ibne Hisham, [2/108, 109]; Tareekh Ibne Asakir, 6:90, 200 [12/136 and in Tarjuma Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), researched edition, no. 146]; Usudul Ghaba, 2:221 [2/277, No. 1822]; Matalibus So-ool, 18; Irshadus Sari, Qastalani, 6:227 [8/467]; Sharhul Mawahib, 1:373.

After that he kept aside Ali (a.s.) for his own brotherhood and said: "By God, I have not excepted you, but for myself. You are my brother and successor; my brother and companion; you are my brother in the world and the hereafter."¹

Yes, amazing is exaggeration and selfishness that drags man to the position that he regards as correct only that tradition, which is authentic in his view, without understanding its meaning; or if he understands it, he wishes to deceive people by his unawareness; and regards as invalid, a tradition accepted by the whole Ummah and mentioned in all authentic books of traditions.

Can loyalty to something make a person blind? Is man created as such an unjust creature?

This brotherhood in a special meaning, proved in favor of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) on the basis of authentic traditions, as would be mentioned, and in view of companions it was like a famous title in every gathering, and which was used as a protest and used by poets; is the special quality of Ali (a.s.) and if anyone other than him claims this, he is indeed a liar. And if we like, we can compile all recorded traditions on this topic and make a whole book. However we shall mention only a few of them here:

1. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) established brotherhood among his companions including Abu Bakr and Umar, except Ali.

So Ali (a.s.) came to the Prophet and said: "You established brotherhood among companions, but did not make me a brother of anyone?"

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: "You are my brother in the world and the hereafter."

The chains of narrators of this tradition ends at the following persons:

1. Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.)
2. Umar bin Khattab
3. Anas bin Malik
4. Zaid bin Abi Aufa
5. Abdullah bin Abi Aufa
6. Ibne Abbas
7. Makhduj bin Yazid
8. Jabir bin Abdullah
9. Abu Zar Ghiffari
10. Aamir bin Rabia
11. Abdullah bin Umar

¹ *Manaqib Ali*, Ahmad bin Hanbal, [Pg. 94, H. 141]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:209 [3/160]; *Tareekh Medina Damishq*, 6:201 [12/136]; although in this source the tradition is as follows: By the one, who sent me with truth, I do not choose you, except as my brother; and you are to me as Harun was to Moosa, except that there is no prophet after me and you are my brother and successor.

12. Abi Amama
13. Zaid bin Arqam
14. Saeed bin Musayyab¹

Refer to the books² of *Jami Tirmizi*, *Masabih Baghawi*, *Mustadrak Hakeem*, *Istiab*, which regard tradition of brotherhood to be authentic, *Taisirul Wasul*, *Mishkatul Masabih* – on the margins of *Mirqat* – and *Riyazun Nazara*.

It is mentioned in *Riyazun Nazara*:³

The best evidence of the position of Ali (a.s.) near the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is the act of Prophet in establishment of brotherhood, because His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) joined together in brotherhood, persons having similarities and identical natures. So, he established brotherhood between Abu Bakr and Umar and selected Ali (a.s.) for himself. Now, what excellence can be greater than this?

Ustad Abdul Fattah Abdul Maqsood say in the book of *Al-Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib*.⁴

If Abu Bakr is the true vicegerent of Prophet, Ali is the shadow joined to him, because Ali (a.s.) never left the side of the Prophet. He established brotherhood between Muhajireen and Ansar; but for himself, neither selected Abu Bakr, nor Umar or Hamza – God's lion – on the contrary, he selected the youth he had himself reared; that is Ali, and gave precedence to him over everyone else.

All these writings and sources clarify that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) established brotherhood between Abu Bakr and Umar and no sign of the hollowness of Ibne Hazm is found.

2. Jabir bin Abdullah and Saeed bin Musayyab have said that the Prophet established brotherhood between all companions and only the Prophet, Abu Bakr, Umar and Ali remained. So he established brotherhood between Abu Bakr and Umar. After that he said to Ali (a.s.):

“You are my brother and I am yours. If someone is inimical to you, tell him: I am the slave of God and brother of Prophet. And if other than you, anyone claims thus, he would indeed be a liar.”

This tradition is mentioned in numerous books⁵ like *Manaqib Ahmad*,

¹ This traditional report in view of Ibne Hazm is a widely narrated report.

² *Sunan Tirmizi*, 2:213 [5/595, H. 3720]; *Masabihus Sunnah*, 2:199 [4/173, H. 4769]; *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, 3:14 [3/16, H. 4289]; *Al-Istiab*, 2:460 [Part 3/1098, No. 1855]; *Taisirul Wasul*, 3:271 [3/315, H. 2]; *Mishkatul Masabih*, 5:569 [3/356, H. 6093]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2: 167 [3/111]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, [Pg. 122]; *Taareekhul Kholafa*, [Pg. 159].

³ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:212 [3/164].

⁴ Al-Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib, 73.

⁵ *Manaqib Ali (a.s.)*, Ahmad bin Hanbal, [Pg. 78, H. 117]; *Tareekh Medina Damishq*, [12/136]; *Kifayatut Talib*, 82, 83 [Pg. 194, Chap. 47]; *Tadkiratul Khawas*, 14 [Pg. 22]; *Al-Mirqat fee Sharh Mishkat*, 5:569 [10/465, H. 6093].

Tarikh Ibne Asakir, Kifaya of Ganji, Tadkiratus Sibt, who regards this tradition as authentic and has refuted his grandfather, who considered it inauthentic; and *Mirqat fee Sharh Mishkat*.

3. Jabir bin Abdullah Ansari says: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“Two thousand years before the creation of the heavens and earth, it was inscribed on the gate of Paradise: There is no god, except Him, and Muhammad is His prophet and messenger and Ali is the brother of the Prophet.”

Manaqib Ahmad, Tarikh Khatib, Riyazun Nazara, Tadkiratus Sibt, Manaqib Khwarizmi, Kanzul Ummal have narrated from Ibne Asakir.¹

4. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said in a tradition:

“Almighty Allah derived our names through His name. Allah, the Mighty and Sublime is Mahmood and I am Muhammad, God is high (Aala) and my brother is Ali.”

Hamawaini has mentioned this report in chapter two² of his *Faraid* through chains of Abu Nuaim and Natanzi.

5. It is narrated in the book of *Al-Imamah was Siyasah* that: One day Ali came to Abu Bakr and said:

“I am the slave of Allah and brother of His Prophet.”

He was told: “Pay allegiance to Abu Bakr.”

He said: “I am more eligible for Caliphate than you and I will not pay allegiance to you; on the contrary you are more worthy of paying allegiance to me.”³

8. Eighth objection

He says: “All Shia believe that twice the sun returned for Ali (a.s.). Can inspite of so many creatures and such short period after that time, one imagine shamelessness, audacity and falsehood greater than this?”⁴

Reply to the eighth objection

How often these harmful words leave imprint on the heart that only Shia believe in the return of the sun for Ali (a.s.)? Whereas this is not the case; on the contrary a large number of reliable scholars have narrated this report through innumerable chains and many tradition experts regard it as authentic and some others have regarded some parts of it as good.

Some tradition scholars, among them being: Ibne Hazm, Ibne Jauzi, Ibne Taymiyyah and Ibne Kathir, who were staunch followers of the Umayyads, have

¹ *Manaqib Ali (a.s.)*, Ahmad bin Hanbal, [Pg. 182, H. 254]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:168 [3/112]; *Tadkiratul Khawas*, 14 [Pg. 22]; *Al-Manaqib*, 87 [144, H. 168]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:399 [11/624, H. 44043]; *Tareekh Medina Damishq*, [12/139].

² *Faraaezus Simtain*, [1/41, H. 5].

³ *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 12, 13 [1/18].

⁴ *Al-Fisal*, [4/182].

declared this tradition weak. They condemned it severely and some other scholars, who have denied this miracle of Prophet and excellence of Ali (a.s.) as it was too hard for them to digest, they wrote complete books on this issue, in which they gathered all chains of narrators of tradition on this issue: like:

1. Abul Qasim Hakeem bin Haza Haskani Nishapuri Hanafi (d. after 490 A.H.). He wrote a treatise entitled: *Masala fee Tas-hih Radde Shams wa Targhim al-Nawasibush Shams*¹ regarding writing of tradition that some of them Ibne Kathir has mentioned in *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*.² Dhahabi has also mentioned in *Tadkira*.³

2. Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) has also written a treatise entitled: *Kashfulil Bas An Hadees Radde Shams* regarding this tradition.

Now, we would mention some examples of scholar, who have quoted this tradition. Some of them have mentioned this tradition without criticizing it and some have also discussed its authenticity.

1. Hafiz Abu Ja'far Ahmad bin Salih Misri (d. 248 A.H.). He was a teacher of Bukhari in his *Saheeh* and others have consensus that it is authentic. He has narrated this tradition through two authentic channels from Asma binte Umais and he says:

“It is obligatory on people of knowledge to remember the tradition, which Asma has narrated, as it is the greatest sign of prophethood.”⁴

Hafiz Abul Qasim Tibrani (d. 360 A.H.) has mentioned this tradition in his *Mojamul Kabeer*⁵ and remarked: This tradition is good (*hasan*).

3. Hafiz Abu Bakr Baihaqi (d. 458 A.H.) has mentioned it in his *Dalail* as mentioned in *Faizul Qaazir*⁶ of Manawi.

4. Abu Muzaffar, Yusuf Qazaoghli Hanafi (d. 654 A.H.) has quoted this tradition in his *Tadkira*⁷. Then he has refuted the viewpoint of his grandfather, Ibne Jauzi, the gist of which is as follows:

“Statement of my grandfather that this tradition is fabricated is a baseless statement and his suspicion on the narrators is meaningless, because we have narrated this report from reporters, who were honest and reliable and there is no doubt about their veracity and the aim of returning of the sun is refraining it from the usual movement and not returning in the real sense; although if it is actual returning also, even then it is not surprising, as in that case it would be a miracle of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and an excellence of Ali (a.s.).”

¹ The term of Shams has plural as Shumus. It implies deep enmity.

² *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 6:80 [3/88].

³ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, [3/1200, No. 1032].

⁴ Hafiz Tahawi in *Mushkilul Aathar* [2/11] has narrated this report from him and others have followed him as would be mentioned.

⁵ *Mojamul Kabeer*, [24/145, H. 382].

⁶ *Faizul Qaazir*, 5:440.

⁷ *Tadkiratul Khawas*, 30 [Pg. 49].

And stopping of the sun is not an unprecedeted phenomenon; on the contrary according to consensus, the sun also stopped from setting for Yusha: and it is not without the following two conditions: either it was a miracle for Moosa or an excellence for Yusha. In case it is miracle of Moosa, then our Prophet is higher than him and if it is a miracle for Ali, then Ali is more superior to him, because the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: "Scholars of my Ummah are like prophets of Bani Israel." When this is regarding scholars, what to say about Ali (a.s.), who was most superior and excellent of them?

After that he proves the superiority of Ali over the prophets of Bani Israel and then quotes the couplet of Sahib bin Ubbad regarding the return of the sun.

5. Hafiz Ibne Hajar Asqalani (d. 852 A.H.) has quoted the tradition in his book of *Fathul Bari*¹ and then remarked:

"Tahawi, Tibrani in *Kabeer*, Hakeem and Baihaqi in *Dalail* have narrated from Asma binte Umais that:

'One day, the Prophet was asleep in the lap of Ali (a.s.) and he continued to sleep till the sun set and Ali (a.s.) wasn't able to pray the Asr prayer and when the Prophet awoke and realized this, he prayed for the return of the sun and Ali prayed in its time; and after that it set once more. And this is one of the most obvious miracles.'

At this point Ibne Jauzi and Ibne Taymiyyah in *Al-Radd Alal Rawafidh* have committed a mistake and regarded this report fabricated."

6. Hafiz Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) has, in the book of *Jamaul Jawame*, mentioned its sequence² among the miracles of Prophet from Ali (a.s.). He says in *Khasaisul Kubra*:³

"During Yusha's battle against tyrannical kings, the sun stopped for him from setting and this happened for our Prophet during the night of ascension; and more amazing is that it stopped for Ali (a.s.), when he missed his Asr prayer."

Text of the tradition

It is narrated from Asma binte Umais that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) prayed the Noon Prayer in Sahba locality in Khyber. He had sent Ali (a.s.) on some errand and when he returned, the Prophet had already recited the Asr prayer. So the Prophet placed his head in the lap of Ali (a.s.) and went to sleep and Ali (a.s.) did not move while the Prophet was asleep, lest he should be disturbed. When the Prophet awoke, the sun had set. Therefore he prayed:

"O God, your servant, Ali has dedicated himself for Your Prophet, so You also return the light of the sun for him."

Asma says: "At that moment the sun rose up again over the mountain. Ali (a.s.) made ablution and recited the Asr prayer. After that the sun set again."

¹ *Fathul Bari*, 16:86 [6/222].

² *Kanzul Ummaal*, 5:277 [12/349, H. 35353].

³ *Khasaisul Kubra*, 2:183 [2/310].

Moreover, is the challenge of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) through that on the day of Shura when he said:

“I adjure by God, is there anyone other than me, for whom the sun rose up again after setting, so that he may recite the Asr Prayer?”

“No,” said everyone.¹

This shows the extent of popularity of this extraordinary phenomenon among companions of Prophet.

In the same way, this incident is mentioned in numerous poems of the poets from the first century till today.

Now, with attention to these evidences and proofs, the value of Ibne Hazm and his books becomes evident for us. It is amazing that I don't have time and space to mention all the blunders from the book of *Fisal* for the information of readers, because all his volumes, especially the fourth is full of allegations, calumnies, distortion of facts and lies and abuses, in such a way that no one, even the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is spared his attacks.

As he says in *Al-Ahkam*:² “The Shia have not understood till now that the chief of prophets was born of disbeliever parents.”

What urged him to issue this hurtful statement? Etiquette of religion? Or etiquette of writing? Or etiquette of academics? Or etiquette of chastity? Which one?

ءَ الْقَيْ الِّذِي كَرِّ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ بَيِّنَنَا بَلْ هُوَ كَذَّابٌ أَشَّرٌ^⑤ سَيَعْلَمُونَ غَلَّا مِنْ
الْكَذَّابُ الْأَشَّرُ^⑥

“Has the reminder been made to light upon him from among us? Nay! he is an insolent liar! Tomorrow shall they know who is the liar, the insolent one.”³

5. Al-Milal wan Nihal

This book, although it does not reach the level of *Al-Fisal* in bad mouthing, it definitely is full of falsehoods and contradictory views. Therefore, the reader has no option, but to reject it.

Shahristani, due to intensity of malice towards the Shia, has written numerous books against them. The only thing, which impelled him to do this is his lack of awareness about issues he discusses.

He is so ill-informed that he says: “The grave of Imam Hadi (a.s.) is in Qom,”⁴ whereas his holy tomb is besides the tomb of his son, Imam Hasan

¹ This tradition was also hinted at in this book previously.

² Al-Ahkam fee Usulil Ahkam, 5:171 [5/160].

³ Surah Qamar 54:25-26

⁴ Gloss on *Fisal*, 2:5 [*Al-Melal Wa al-Nehal*, 1/150].

Askari (a.s.) in Samarrah. And from the time of his burial, the tomb is shining like stars and is alive in the books of history and collections, but Shahristani is ignorant of all this.

Among his falsehood is that he writes: "Among the distinguishing qualities of the Shia is that they believe in transmigration of soul."¹

Refutation

هُلْ أُنِّيْكُمْ عَلَى مَنْ تَنَزَّلُ الشَّيْطَيْنُ ۖ تَنَزَّلُ عَلَى كُلِّ أَفَّالِ أَثَيْمٍ ۖ يُلْقَوْنَ
السَّيْئَ وَأَكْثَرُهُمْ كُذَّبُوْنَ ۖ

**"Shall I inform you (of him) upon whom the Shaitans descend?
They descend upon every lying, sinful one, They incline their
ears, and most of them are liars."²**

Know that you will not find any Shia, who believes in transmigration of souls and then realize the value of Shahristani's book and the extent of his honesty.

Abu Muhammad Khwarizmi, contemporary of Shahristani, in the book of *Mojamul Buldan*,³ has mentioned a statement which inform us about the veracity of Shahristani. He says:

"If his deviating excesses in his beliefs and inclinations had not been towards denial, he would have definitely been an imam of Ahle Sunnat. How often we ask ourselves that how it happened with a man of intelligence and perfection? A person, who had attached his heart to something without basis and adopted something, which has no logical and textual proof. And we seek God's refuge from degradation and deprivation! The basic cause of his deviation was his desertion of the effulgence of Shariat and following philosophy. I was often present in his lectures and not once did I hear him say: God said this or the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said that, and not once did I see him reply to queries about questions on Shariah.

أَفَرَأَيْتَ مَنِ اتَّخَذَ إِلَهَهَ هَوْنَهُ وَأَضَلَّهُ اللَّهُ عَلَى عِلْمٍ وَخَتَمَ عَلَى سَمْعِهِ وَقَلْبِهِ
وَجَعَلَ عَلَى بَصِّرِهِ غِشْوَةً ۖ فَمَنْ يَهْدِي إِلَيْهِ مِنْ بَعْدِ اللَّهِ ۖ أَفَلَا تَنَزَّلَ كَرْوَنَ ۖ

"Have you then considered him who takes his low desire for his god, and Allah has made him err having knowledge and has set a seal upon his ear and his heart and put a covering upon his eye. Who can then guide him after Allah? Will you not then be

¹ Al-Melal Wa al-Nehal, 2:25 [1/147].

² Surah Shoara 26:221-223

³ *Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 5:315 [3/376].

mindful?”¹

6. Minhajus Sunnah²

If one is searching for a book, whose title is just the opposite of what the matter is, he should refer to the book of *Minhajus Sunnah*.

The title of this book is indeed the opposite of what it comprises and indeed it is amazing that the title of *Minhajus Sunnah* is used for it. Rather its proper name would be *Minhajul Bidat*, because it contains different kinds of heresies, falsehoods, denial of established principles of religion, regarding other Muslims as infidels, illogical statements, futile arguments, support for heretics and full of malice and enmity to Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and the house of revelation.

Following are some of its examples:

1. First objection

He says: Among the foolish stances of Shia is that not only they don't use the word of 'ten' they do not perform many actions related to number ten. So much so that their architects also never construct ten pillars or ten corners, because they are inimical to everyone, except Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) from 'Ashra Mubashira' (ten persons, who were given glad tidings of Paradise).³

And he says: Among the prejudices of Shia is that they never pronounce the word of 'ten'; on the contrary they say: 'nine and one'.⁴

Reply to the first objection

Is it not shameful for someone, who calls himself Shaykhul Islam to issue such baseless statement among Muslims to create mischief, and repeat it in a number of places in his book? As if he has conducted deep research, advanced philosophy, mature wisdom, and wants to bestow life to people!

He mentions about the Shia as if centuries were deducted, events have not left any traces and are not worthy of defense?

In spite of the following verses in Quran, which Shia also follow:

تُلِكَ عَشَرَةُ كَامِلَةٌ

“These (make) ten (days) complete.”⁵

And:

مَنْ جَاءَ بِالْحَسَنَةِ فَلَهُ عَشْرُ أَمْثَالِهَا

¹ Surah Jaaseyah 45:23

² By Ibne Taymiyyah Ahmad bin Abdul Halim Harrani Hanbali (d. 728 A.H.) in the prison of Morocco.

³ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 1:9.

⁴ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 2:143.

⁵ Surah Baqarah 2:196

“Whoever brings a good deed, he shall have ten like it.”¹

And:

وَالْفَجْرِ ۚ وَلَيَالٍ عَشْرٍ ۝

“I swear by the daybreak, and the ten nights,”²

And:

قُلْ فَأُنُّوا بِعَشْرِ سُورٍ مِّثْلِهِ

“Then bring ten forged chapters like it.”³

And in spite of Dua Asharat, which is recited every Friday and recommended prayers, in which Surahs of Quran are recited ten times, and ten times' recitations of different supplications etc. or verbal repetitions or recitations, which are recommended to be recited ten times or discussions of ten intellects, ten essences, dimensions, ten names of Prophet, ten-fold strength that God has bestowed to reason, ten special qualities of Imam, ten special qualities that Ali inherited from Prophet, ten qualities given to Shia as glad tidings, ten advantages of brushing teeth; and in spite of numerous lofty castles and buildings comprising of ten pillars and corners built by Shia; in other words, number of 'ten' is found in all of them, with what logic are statements of Ibne Taymiyyah compatible?

Is it not sufficient for his ill-fame, condemnation and falsehood? Futile statements, which have never entered the mind of these fabricators!

In addition to that basically the Shia do not believe that any number has any value in the abstract sense; because till a number is not linked to a thing or an idea there can be no sense in liking or hating a number in itself.

Nowhere have we heard in the world that instead of 'ten' the Shia use the term of 'nine and one'; we seek refuge of God from such foolishness.

2. Second objection

He says: Among the foolishness of the Shia is that they await for the Awaited Mahdi in a number of places: like the cellar in Samarra, where they believe he had disappeared and other locations; sometimes, some of them wait there with quadrupeds, like mule or horse etc. so that if the Imam reappears, he may mount that animal.

They appoint a man to stand there and call out during the day and at other times: O my chief, please rise up and draw your sword – please get ready for battle, whereas there is no trace of any enemy there. Some of them stand there continually, even missing to perform prayers, lest the Qaim should rise up when

¹ Surah Anaam 6:160

² Surah Fajr 89:1-2

³ Surah Hud 11:13

they are praying and they fail to be in his presence and service.

Those living in places far away from the places of awaiting, like Medina, during the last ten days of Ramadhan or at other times, they face the east and call out aloud requesting for the Qaim's advent.¹

3. Third objection

He says: The foolishness of other Shia is that they take a calf, and since Ayesha was named Humaira – meaning red complexioned – they often select a red calf; after that they subject the poor beast to torture by plucking hair from her skin, and imagine that they are torturing Ayesha.²

4. Fourth objection

He says: *Hais*³ is a dish prepared from date filled with oil. While consuming it, they cut off dates and relish the oil considering it symbolic of killing Umar and drinking his blood.

5. Fifth objection

He says: Some of them take two asses and name them Abu Bakr and Umar; after that they torture these asses imagining them to be Abu Bakr and Umar.⁴

6. Sixth objection

He says: Sometimes, they write the names of Abu Bakr and Umar below their feet and it is also heard that some of their rulers lash at ankles of such persons saying: I am lashing Umar and Abu Bakr, and continue beating till the names wear out.

7. Seventh objection

He says: Some of them name their pet dogs as Abu Bakr and Umar and curse the two of them.⁵

Replies to second till seventh objection

These are false statements that they fabricated and except for the imagination of Ibne Taymiyyah, are not found anywhere else. He has invented attributions purposely and regarded the Shia as infidels and he does not observe the decorum of religion, wisdom, writing, honesty in quoting, honesty in writing and decorum of honest reporting.

8. Eighth objection

He says: Scholars have consensus that falsehood among Shia as compared to other Muslims, is more customary, and it is more apparent and with the same

¹ *Minhajus Sunnah*, [1/24, 30].

² *Minhajus Sunnah*, [1/145].

³ *Hais* is a sweet prepared from wheat, dates and oil.

⁴ These three allegations are again repeated on 2:125 in *Minhajus Sunnah*.

⁵ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 1:11.

argument, writers of Sihah books like Bukhari, have not quoted traditions from any Shia scholar, like Asim bin Zumra, Harith Awar, Abdullah bin Salma etc. whereas they were among foremost Shia scholars.¹

Reply to the eighth objection

Indeed, with reference to the book of *Minhajus Sunnah* and *Al-Fisal* and other debased books like these, it becomes clear to us through true evidences that which of the two groups are more false, we or them?

More astonishing is that this fellow says: Authors of *Sihah* books have not narrated from Shia, whereas, as was hinted before many times, *Sihah* books of Ahle Sunnat contain numerous traditions from senior companions and companions of companions and other important personalities.

9. Ninth objection

He says: The roots of religion, according to Shia Imamiyah are four: Monotheism, divine justice, prophethood and Imamate, the last of them being the base. They regard the issues of negation of divine qualities, creatibility of Quran and impossibility of seeing God in the hereafter, to be parts of divine monotheism and the issues of negation of divine power are discussed in the principle of divine justice and they believe that Almighty Allah does not have the power of guiding or misguiding anyone; or to perform an act; as whatever He wants, does not happen and what He does not want, happens; and they do not believe that God has creatibility, power and discretion.²

Reply to the ninth objection

It is clear that this man is ignorant from the way he does not differentiate between roots of religion and roots of faith, without awareness of the beliefs of others he tries to analyze them. He has totally omitted Judgment Day, which is a root of religion, and all Shia believe in it. Whereas one, who regards Imamate as root of religion, is not deviated, since Allah, the Mighty and Sublime says:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيْكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ أَمْنَوْا إِنَّمَا يُقِيمُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ
الزَّكُوْنَةَ وَهُمْ رَكُوْنَةً^④

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”³

...in which the Almighty Allah has equated Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as His own Mastership (*Wilayat*) and Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and implication of ‘believers’ in the verse, as

¹ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 1:15.

² *Minhajus Sunnah*, 1:23.

³ Surah Maidah 5:55

was hinted before and will be mentioned again later and also it would be mentioned in detail that it is Ali (a.s.).

In the same way, in the verse:

الْيَوْمَ أَكْبَلْتُ لَكُمْ دِينَكُمْ وَأَتَمَّتُ عَلَيْكُمْ نِعْمَتِي وَرَضِيَتُ لَكُمْ
الإِسْلَامَ دِينًا

“This day have those who disbelieve despaired of your religion, so fear them not, and fear Me. This day have I perfected for you your religion and completed My favor on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion.”¹

Almighty Allah has placed perfection of religion in Mastership (*Wilayat*) of His Eminence (a.s.) and this does not mean, except that Imamate should be regarded as the basic principle of religion in such a way that without it, religion is deficient and divine bounties are incomplete on and only with that religion became the chosen one of God – that is Islam.

Also, on the basis of the verse:

يَا أَيُّهَا الرَّسُولُ بَلِّغْ مَا أُنزِلَ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ رَبِّكَ وَإِنْ لَمْ تَفْعَلْ فَمَا بَلَّغْتَ
رِسَالَتَهُ وَاللَّهُ يَعْصِمُكَ مِنَ النَّاسِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَا يَهِيءُ الْقَوْمَ الْكُفَّارِينَ²

“O Apostle! deliver what has been revealed to you from your Lord; and if you do it not, then you have not delivered His message, and Allah will protect you from the people; surely Allah will not guide the unbelieving people.”²

According to this verse, the significance of Mastership (*Wilayat*) is clear from the fact that God has deemed not announcing Mastership (*Wilayat*) to be same as non-fulfillment of the duty of prophethood!

This was hinted at previously that Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) is the condition of acceptance of deeds and meaning of it being the root, is nothing, except this and divine monotheism and prophethood being roots are also as such and do not have any branch.

As if, in view of senior companions, this meaning is natural, from this aspect when two persons argued before Umar bin Khattab, he said: This man, Ali is my master and the master of all believers; and one, whose master he is not, is not a believer.³

¹ Surah Maidah 5:3

² Surah Maidah 5:67

³ Ref: *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:170 [3/115]; *Zakhhaarul Uqbah*, Mohibuddin Tabari: 68; *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, 97 [Pg. 160, H. 191]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 107 (Pg. 179) and in *Al-Futuhatul Islamiyya*, 3:307 it is mentioned that: One day Ali (a.s.) adjudicated for a Bedouin and issued a verdict, but that man did not assent. Umar bin Khattab summoned him and said: “Woe be

And it was also natural that malice towards him was sign of hypocrisy and infidelity and his existence after the Prophet, is standard of belief and enmity to him is a sign of faithlessness, as we would soon mention some conclusive traditional reports regarding this. These reports also show that Mastership (*Wilayat*) is like prophethood and divine monotheism: that whoever deviates from them deviates from the right path.

Since many rules of divine monotheism and prophethood are applicable in Imamate, regarding it as the basic principle is more likely and absence of a small incident from rules of those two, from the aspect of wisdom and social exigency, will not be hurdle in believing mastership (*Wilayat*) to be a fundamental principle.

Denial of qualities

If his implication is same as what the Shia intend: that quality is the actual being and negation of it being added to the being, this is real monotheism. But if his implication is the incoherent view of ‘Motalla’,¹ then indeed the Shia were and are aloof from this and the pristine Shia belief is free of this.

Creatibility of Quran

In books of beliefs, according to evident proof, it is proved in detail that Quran had not been always with God that it should be as old as God.

Denial of seeing God

It is in fact, denial of corporeality of God, as correct reasonings based on Quran and Sunnah definitely testify for it.

As for other issues, which he has attributed to Shia, are all absolutely false and Shia, from the time of their origin till now regard believing in them to be deviation.

10. Tenth objection

He says: Shia regard Masjids, which according to divine command, should be respected and He should be mentioned therein, they have forsaken them and they neither pray the Friday prayer nor congregational prayer in them; on the contrary, in their view, they are not worthy of respect. Presently, if a prayer is even held there, it is in form of individual prayer; on the other hand they accord deep respect to tombs and like polytheists, observe *Etekaaf* in them; and like Hajj pilgrims, perform Hajj to these places. Some of them consider Hajj of these places more important than Hajj of Kaaba; on the contrary some them even abuse those, who regard Hajj of Kaaba and prayers as sufficient and this is from the

¹ on you, don't you know that he is the master of you and master of every believer man and woman?".

¹ *Moattala*: In Ashaira terminology it implies the Mutazila. Ref: *Rasail wa Maqalat Ayatullah Subhani* /265.

custom of the polytheists.¹

And he says: While God and Prophet have declared construction of tombs (dome) unlawful, they consider these places as idol-houses, and decorate and frequent them. Some of them regard visiting them like Hajj pilgrimage as Shaykh Mufeed has named one of his writings: *Manasik Hajj al-Mashahid* containing falsehoods and polytheism like that of Christians.²

Reply to the tenth objection

Masjids are present in developed as well as undeveloped cities; so much so that they are present even in villages and hamlets for all to see, and Shia accord utmost respect to Masjids. They regard observing their sanctity obligatory and polluting them unlawful. They regard prayers invalid before removal of impurities. They believe it to be unlawful for a person in sexual impurity, in menses or post-natal period to stay in Masjids. They regard as detestable talking about worldly matters in Masjids. If they find anyone talking about worldly matters, they object to him vehemently.

According to the Imam, narrating from the Prophet: Prayer of one, who lives besides Masjids is not valid, except that it should be performed in the Masjid. Rules of Masjid in Shia jurisprudence, and congregational prayer performed therein, are clear for anyone, who has the least awareness of them.

According respect to tombs

There is no similarity between the Shia and polytheists, because Shia do not worship the owner of the tomb; on the contrary, they seek divine proximity through their visitation and praise. Since they are the Master (*Wali*) and beloveds of God as is clear from texts of Ziyarats narrated from Imams themselves:

وَقَالُوا اتَّخَذَ الرَّحْمَنُ وَلَدًا سُبْحَانَهُ طَبْلٌ عِبَادٌ مُّكَرَّمُونٌ لَا يَسِيقُونَهُ بِالْقَوْلِ
وَهُمْ بِأَمْرِهِ يَعْمَلُونَ ^(٤٦)

“And they say: The Beneficent God has taken to Himself a son. Glory be to Him. Nay! they are honored servants; they do not precede Him in speech and (only) according to His commandment do they act.”³

As for abusing above-mentioned persons

It is the most false statement that he has made and attributed them to the Shia, because all Shia, without any exception, have narrated from their Imams that Islam is based on five fundamentals: Prayer, Zakat, Hajj, Fast and Mastership (*Wilayat*); and Shia traditions, in this matter are numerous. In the same way, Shia believe that delaying an obligatory act from the year of its

¹ Minhajus Sunnah, 1:130.

² Minhajus Sunnah, 2:39.

³ Surah Anbiya 21:26-27

becoming obligatory is a greater sin, and one, who leaves it, is regarded as a dead man and is told:

“Now, you may die as a Jew or a Christian.”

With attention to these beliefs and traditions, and according to the verdicts of scholars based on Quran and Sunnah, is it appropriate to condemn Shia as those, who regard Ziyarat equal to Hajj?

Shaykh Mufeed's book

The only point present in this book is that he has entitled this book as *Manasikus Ziyaraat* and *Manasik* is in the meaning of worship and fulfilling the rights of God; and there is a special meaning in Shariah, which is not restricted to Hajj, although people use this term only with relation to Hajj. On the basis of this every worship act in every place and at every time, which is preferred by God is called as *Manasik*. Thus, what is the problem in using the terms of *Nasak* and *Mansak* for Ziyarat of holy tombs, etiquette and supplications mentioned for it, except for prostration on grave and praying before it, and without requesting from the owner of the grave himself?

The claim of polytheism and falsehood in that book is also baseless, but he, due to severity of his enmity, did not pay attention and speaks without reasoning. The points of that book regarding Holy Imams (a.s.), except proving the rank of servitude and humility before the power of Almighty Allah, negation of ranks, which are not from them, reminder of proximity they have to Almighty Allah, is nothing else and the Book is present even today and is accessible:

فَمَالِ هُوَ لِإِلَّا الْقَوْمُ لَا يَكَادُونَ يَفْقَهُونَ حَدِيثًا ④

“But what is the matter with these people that they do not make approach to understanding what is told (them)?”¹

11. Eleventh objection

He says: Regarding the verse:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيُّكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِلَّا الَّذِينَ يُقِيمُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيَنْذُونَ
الزَّكُوَةَ وَهُمْ رَكُونَ ⑤

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”²

Some fabricators have fabricated traditions that this verse was revealed regarding Ali when he gave away his ring in alms (*Sadaqah*); whereas this

¹ Surah Nisa 4:78

² Surah Maidah 5:55

tradition, according to consensus of tradition scholars, is purely false.¹

After that he has rejected through futile statements, which are absolutely in negation of established texts and an example of it was mentioned in the discussion on the return of the sun and we would refute arguments of this author in discussions on verse of purification² verse of affection (*Mawaddah*)³ and tradition of brotherhood etc. also.

Reply to the eleventh objection

I didn't expect shamelessness and dishonesty to bring down a person to such levels that he denies reports, which end at Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Ibne Abbas, Abu Zar, Ammaar, Jabir Ansari, Abu Rafe, Anas bin Malik, Salma bin Kuhail, Abdullah bin Salam; and Imams and scholars of traditions have narrated it. And according to his false notion, he regards it as fabricated. Yes, this consensus is also, like other baseless claims, remote from facts.

I don't know how he says: Scholars have consensus on its falsehood, whereas they have argued through this tradition and verse in two places and considered them as verses of Islamic rules.⁴

One: In rules of ritual prayer that whether ritual prayer is invalidated due to little acts?

Two: Regarding recommended alms (*Sadaqah*): whether it should be named as Zakat or not?

This clearly shows their consensus on authenticity of tradition.

In the same way, scholastic theologians, who want to criticize and analyze, without any doubt in its chains of narrators, have only discussed its reasoning, so much so that in spite of the fact some of them, though they criticize its reasoning, they say: The actual tradition is proved authentic for all commentators and if there is any dispute, it is regarding its meaning. All this clearly shows that correctness of tradition is accepted in view of all commentators, scholastic theologians and jurists.

In addition, all tradition scholars have mentioned it in their writings and regarded it as valid. So much so that some of them have even discussed its correctness. With this in view, the question arises that where is the consensus, which Ibne Taymiyyah has claimed? From where has this sprouted? So, you may judge for yourself.

Following are some narrators of the tradition or those, who believe in its authenticity:

1. Abu Ja'far Iskafi Mutazali (d. 240 A.H.): He has mentioned this tradition in

¹ Minhajus Sunnah, 1:156.

² Surah Ahzab 33:33.

³ Surah Shura 42:23.

⁴ As Jassas says in *Ahkamul Quran* [2/446] and others [Like Nasafi in his *Tafseer* 1/289, Walkiya Tabari in *Ahkamul Quran* 3/84] have mentioned.

- his treatise, which he wrote in refutation of Jahiz.¹
2. Hafiz Abdur Rahman Nasai, author of *Sunan* (d. 303 A.H.) in his *Saheeh*.
 3. Ibne Jarir Tabari (d. 310 A.H.): In his *Tafseer*, he has narrated this tradition through a number of chains.²
 4. Hafiz Abu Bakr Jassas Razi (d. 370 A.H.) in *Ahkamul Quran* has quoted this tradition through a number of authorities.³
 5. Abul Qasim Jarullah Zamakhshari Hanafi (d. 538 A.H.): He has quoted the tradition in his *Tafseer Kashaf*⁴ and he says:
- If some doubts that the term of ‘believers’ used therein is a plural, and hence it cannot imply a singular, I would reply that if the giver of *Sadaqah* is only one person it is in form of a plural, so that others may be encouraged to perform this good deed and earn divine rewards.
6. Hafiz Abul Qasim Ibne Asakir Damishqi (d. 571 A.H.) has narrated this tradition through numerous channels in his *Tarikh Sham*.⁵
 7. Izzuddin Ibne Abil Hadeed Mutazali (d. 655 A.H.) in *Sharh Nahjul Balaghah*.⁶
 8. Qaazi Nasiruddin Baidhawi Shafei (d. 685 A.H.) in his *Tafseer*.⁷
 9. Jalaluddin Suyuti Shafei (d. 911 A.H.) in *Durre Manthur*⁸ has narrated this tradition through a number of chains.

Text of the tradition

It is narrated from Anas bin Malik that:

“A beggar to came to the Masjid and said: Who would help a distressed beggar? Ali (a.s.), who was in genuflection, gestured to his finger. That is he may take the ring from it.

At that moment, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) remarked: “Umar, it has become obligatory.”

Umar asked: “May my parents be sacrificed on you, what has become obligatory?”

“By God, Paradise became obligatory for him, before the beggar removed the ring from his finger” His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) replied, “Almighty Allah cleansed him of all sins and mistakes.”

¹ Naqzul Uthmaniya [Pg. 319].

² *Jaameul Bayan*, 6:186 [No. 4, Vol. 6/288].

³ *Ahkamul Quran*, 2:542 [2/446].

⁴ *Tafseer Kashaf*, 1:422.

⁵ *Tareekh Medina Damishq* [12/305 in biography of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), No. 915 and Biography of Umar bin Ali].

⁶ *Sharh Nahjul Balaghah*, 3:275 [13/277, Sermon 238].

⁷ *Tafseer Baizaawi*, 345 [1/272].

⁸ *Durre Mansoor*, 2:293 [3/105].

Anas says: Before anyone left the Masjid, Jibraeel arrived with the verse:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيْكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِنَّمَا يُقْبِلُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيَنْهَا تُنَوَّنَ
الرَّزْكُوَةَ وَهُمْ رَكِعُونَ ٦٦

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”¹

At that moment Hassan bin Thabit recited the following verses:

1. O Ali, my soul and heart be sacrificed on you; and sacrificed on you be all those, who are slow or fast on the path of guidance. 2. Would my praise and that of your followers be destroyed, indeed the praise recited about Almighty Allah will never be destroyed. 3. O the best of those, who genuflect; you donated your ring in bowing, may all be sacrificed on you. 4. O the best of the chiefs, O the best buyer and O the best seller! It was due to your blessed ring that 5. Almighty Allah sent the best of Mastership (*Wilayat*) for you, and made it evident in the basic principles of religion.

Flimsy objections

In his *Nasrul Laali Alaa Nazmul Amali*,² when Sayyid Hamiduddin Abdul Hamid Alusi reaches the verse of Mastership (*Wilayat*), he says:

This verse was not revealed particularly regarding Ali (a.s.) as they think; on the contrary it was revealed generally for all Muhajireen and Ansar, whose part Ali was. The evidence lies in the use of the plural form of the pronoun (those who). Therefore Ali alone cannot be implied.

Allamah Amini says: As if the warp and woof of his statement is same as that of Ibne Kathir and he issued these statements emulating him, as Ibne Kathir also, when he comes to this verse, he writes:³

“Not a single verse is found in the Holy Quran, which is revealed about Ali.”

As if these negligent people forgot that if a command includes all people – for encouraging the like of that act or to restrain from it – at that time to mention a condition or sign of the person under discussion is specified, it is more effective and more powerful than an order directly given to a person. And this style is not an unusual; and its numerous examples are found in language of Quran. Below are some examples:

1.

الَّذِينَ قَالُوا إِنَّ اللَّهَ فَقِيرٌ وَّكُنُّ أَغْنِيَاءُ

¹ Surah Maidah 5:55

² Nasrul Laali Alaa Nazmul Amali, 169.

³ His frivolous statements will be discussed soon under the criticism of his *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*.

“Those who said: Surely Allah is poor and we are rich.”¹

Hasan has said: The speaker of this sentence is Huyy bin Akhtab. Akrama, Siddi, Maqatil and Muhammad bin Ishaq say that it was Fanhas bin Azura. Khazin says:

Although this statement was issued from a Jew, but, since they were pleased from this statement, it was attributed to all of them.

Regarding this one may refer to *Tafseer Qurtubi*, Ibne Kathir, Khazin, etc.²

2.

لَا يَنْهَاكُمُ اللَّهُ عَنِ الَّذِينَ لَمْ يُقَاتِلُوكُمْ فِي الدِّينِ وَلَمْ يُخْرِجُوكُمْ مِّنْ دِيَارِكُمْ

“Allah does not forbid you respecting those who have not made war against you on account of (your) religion, and have not driven you forth from your homes.”³

This verse was revealed about Asma, daughter of Abu Bakr and its context of revelation is that Qatila, mother of Asma, who was daughter of Abdul Uzza and an idolater, had come to Medina and brought gifts for Asma. But Asma said: “Neither would I accept the gifts nor permit you to enter my house till I don’t take permission from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).”

Then she came to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and mentioned the issue. Following that Almighty Allah revealed the following verse and the Messenger also instructed her to provide a mat for her, seat her in the house and accord respect to her.

Bukhari, Muslim, Ahmad, Ibne Jarir and Abu Hatim have mentioned this tradition;⁴ as mentioned in *Tafseer Qurtubi*, and by Ibne Kathir and Khazin.

3.

وَالْعَصْرِ ۝ إِنَّ الْإِنْسَانَ لَفِي خُسْرٍ ۝ إِلَّا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ
وَتَوَاصَوْا بِالْحَقِّ ۝ وَتَوَاصَوْا بِالصَّبَرِ ۝

“I swear by the time, most surely man is in loss, except those who believe and do good, and enjoin on each other truth, and enjoin on each other patience.”⁵

¹ Surah Aale Imran 3:181

² Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran, 4:294 [4/187]; *Tafseer Ibne Kaseer*, 1:434; *Tafseer Khazin*, 1:322 [1/310].

³ Surah Mumtahina 60:8

⁴ *Saheeh Bukhari*, [2/924, H. 2477]; *Saheeh Muslim*, [2/391, H. 50, Kitabuz Zakat]; *Musnad Ahmad*, [7/483, H. 26375]; *Jaameul Bayan*, [No. 14/Vol. 28/66]; *Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran*, 18/59 [18/40]; *Tafseer Ibne Kaseer*, 4:349; *Tafseer Khazin*, 4:272 [4/258].

⁵ Surah Asr 103:1-3

It is narrated from Ubayy bin Kaab that he recited Surah Asr in the presence of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and asked: “May my parents be sacrificed on you, what is its interpretation?”

The Prophet replied: ‘I swear by the time’ is an oath by Allah with relation to the last day; and ‘most surely man is in loss’ implies Abu Jahl Ibne Hisham; and ‘except those, who believe’ stands for Abu Bakr Siddiq and ‘and do good’ implies Umar bin Khattab; ‘and enjoin on each other truth’ implies Uthman bin Affan; and ‘and enjoin on each other patience’ implies Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).¹

Allamah Amini says: We do not support this inappropriate statement; we quoted it only to argue against them (that is to prove that plural can be used for a single person).

4.

أَلَّذِينَ قَالَ لَهُمُ النَّاسُ إِنَّ النَّاسَ قَدْ جَمَعُوا لَكُمْ

“Those to whom the people said: Surely men have gathered against you.”²

The term ‘people’ implies Masud bin Ashjai. Nasafi says in his *Tafseer*:³

Although ‘people’ is plural, but it implies one person (singular) and it is possible that it denotes his followers, who like him, prevented people from Jihad.

Khazin says: The word of ‘people’ is general, but it implies one particular person.

Ibne Marduya has narrated through his chains of narrators from Abu Rafe that:

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) sent Ali with some people in order to pursue Abu Sufyan. They met a Bedouin from Khaza tribe and he said: “They have united against you.”

Ali (a.s.) and his companions said: “Allah is sufficient for us and He is the best of the protectors.”

At that moment the captioned verse was revealed regarding him.⁴

5.

وَهُمْ يَنْهَوْنَ عَنْهُ وَيَنْهَوْنَ عَنْهُ وَإِنْ يُهْلِكُونَ إِلَّا أَنفُسُهُمْ وَمَا يَشْعُرُونَ ۝

“And they prohibit (others) from it and go far away from it.”⁵

Ahle Sunnat believe that this verse was revealed about Abu Talib. And in

¹ Ref: *Riyazun Nazara*, 1:34 [1/49 & 50]

² Surah Aale Imran 3:173

³ Printed on the margin of *Tafseer Khazin*, 1:318 [*Tafseer Nasafi*, 1/195].

⁴ Ref: Al-Jami Ahkamul Quran, 4:279 [4/178]; Tafseer Ibne Kaseer, 1:430; Tafseer Khazin, 1:318 [1/306].

⁵ Surah Anaam 6:26

the coming discussions, we would analyze it in detail and state the correct viewpoint.

12. Twelfth objection

He says: Although Shia do not regard the faith, fairness, being in Paradise and imamate of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman to be valid, they cannot prove the faith, fairness, being in Paradise of Ali, what to say of proving his imamate. If they want to only prove his Imamate, they cannot do so, as evidences and proofs do not support; like reasoning of Christians for prophethood of Isa will be not effective without proving prophethood of Prophet of Islam (s.a.w.a.).¹

And he says:² As long as the Shia continue to follow their religion, they are helpless from proving the faith and fairness of Ali; and if they argue through widely narrated traditional reports regarding Islam, migration and Jihad of Ali, Islam, migration and Jihad of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman is also proved through widely narrated traditional reports. On the contrary, the Islam of Muawiyah, Yazid, Bani Umayyah and Bani Abbas caliphs; and their prayer and fasting and their Jihad against infidels is also proved through widely narrated reports.

Reply to the twelfth objection

As long as you are alive, time shows amazing things to you!

Alas, if I only knew, since when was the faith and fairness of Ali in need of proof and evidence? When did he express disbelief that proof for his belief should be sought? Did the Prophet at the beginning of his mission had anyone else as his brother and supporter? Whereas the above-mentioned persons were yet not Muslims. Is it not that Islam was established only through his sword and sacrifice? Is it anything, except that infidels were routed through his awe and power? Is it except that through the sword of his discourse and evident dagger of proof, he slashed through the veils of apostasy and doubts?

Did God purify the Holy Kaaba from idols by the hands of anyone else? Has God mentioned in Quran the purification of any family, except the family, whose chief he is? Is anyone other than him, according to declaration of Quran, the self of the Prophet? Is there anyone other than him, who sold his life during the night of migration? Is there anyone other than him, who, like the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), is having more authority on the lives of believers than they have on themselves? By God, no!

Indeed, Shia traditions on this subject are widely narrated and it is the same wide narration (*Tawatur*), which satisfied them that they should accept this excellence and special qualities. Although the important point here is that during debate with Ahle Sunnat, Shia argue through their own traditions in order to establish arguments against them, because their own traditions are most likely to

¹ Minhajus Sunnah, 1:162.

² Minhajus Sunnah, 1:163.

be accepted by Ahle Sunnat; otherwise Shia have no need of their traditions.

The most accepted method of debate is that you reason through the texts accepted by opponent, but Ahle Sunnat always, in every issue, argue through traditions and books of their elders and such reasoning is out of the rules of debate.

Alas, if I only knew what connection is there between faith and justice Ali and faith of above persons? Does he think that Ali Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was same as them, and no difference can be imagined between them? Or he thinks that the same spirit flows through them that they should be regarded equals?

Or this invention of Ibne Taymiyyah's mind remained concealed for companions and companions of companions, Imams, scholars and Shia elders in the past centuries in innumerable religious debates and discussions in gatherings? Or opponents of Shia forgot this connection in defending those three persons?!

Although, there is no one from them, who on one hand, compared Shia to Christians and on the other hand equates the faith of Ali (a.s.) with faith of Muawiyah the impostor, Yazid the profligate, Bani Umayyah tyrants and false claimants of Bani Abbas. This is the level of his knowledge, morals and piety.

13. Thirteenth objection

He has attributed negative traits and selfishness¹ like: omitting prayer, committing sinful acts and regarding them lawful, and not abstaining from wine and wantonness, even during the blessed month of Ramadhan, and preferring polytheism over worship of God and other sins to the teacher Ummah and supporter of religion and community, Shaykh Tusi and his followers, and against all Shia; and he believes that Shia are always as such. But every researcher knows that all these are allegations to defame the Shia and believers, forgetful that one day the criterion would be established and he would be questioned and on that day the only judge would be Almighty Allah:

مَا يَلْفِظُ مِنْ قَوْلٍ إِلَّا لَدَيْهِ رَقِيبٌ عَتِيدٌ²

“He utters not a word but there is by him a watcher at hand.”²

14. Fourteenth objection

He says: Enemies of Abu Bakr and his followers, like Musailima Kazzab and his followers and others, are the most well known apostates. In spite of that Shia and their Imams – Allamah Hilli and others – believe that they were on truth that Abu Bakr fought them unjustly.³

Reply to the fourteenth objection

Alas, if someone had asked him who told him that Shia are supporters of

¹ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:99.

² Surah Qaf 50:18

³ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:102.

Musailima and his followers? Is it not that Shia always regard him as a liar, and have narrated his calumnies? Shia books, from beginning till date, have exposed his falsehood? Shia have firm belief that prophethood ended with Muhammad, seal of prophets, and whoever claims prophethood after that is a disbeliever.

If he would only mention to us the names of scholars, who he claims follow this belief. Why has he not mentioned their names? Has he seen this in their books? What are those books? Has he seen any such point in books of Allamah Hilli. If he has, he should mention those books specifically, as numerous books of Allamah Hilli are available, some are printed and some are manuscripts. Please note that none of his books mention this illogical matter!

15. Fifteenth objection

He says: He – Allamah Hilli – has narrated false statements, which prove the ignorance of the narrator; for example, he says: Surah Hal Ataa was revealed in honor of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). This is a false statement, because Hal Ataa, according to consensus of scholars, was revealed in Mecca and the marriage of Ali and Fatima took place after Hijra in Medina and Hasan and Husain were born after the revelation of Hal Ataa; hence the falsehood of the claim is clear for all.¹

Reply to the fifteenth objection

Unawareness and ignorance of this man is not restricted to one point; on the contrary he is ignorant of beliefs, ignorant about sects, ignorant about biography, ignorant about Islamic practical laws and ignorant about traditions and in the same way, ignorant about the sciences of Quran; that is why he has not understood the following issues:

1. A Surah can be Meccan with some of its verses being Medinite and vice versa. This is a common occurrence in Quran as was mentioned before.² This is also admitted by Ibne Hassar, who says:
Sometimes, there are Medinan verses in a Meccan Surah and Meccan verses in a Medinan Surah.³
2. The most certain way to distinguish whether a Surah is Mecca or Medinan, is to see if there are authentic traditional reports regarding the revelation of those verses and not reports without chains of authorities or incomplete chains of authorities. And we mentioned some narrators of this report, on the basis of this, Shia have not fabricated the tradition that he should prove their and Allamah Hilli's ignorance and since there is doubt in that, Ahle Sunnat scholars would be equal to Allamah Hilli in that.
3. He claims that scholars have consensus that it is Meccan. This statement is not based on facts, on the contrary, the majority has said the opposite as

¹ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:117.

² Al-Ghadeer 1:255 and 288.

³ Al-Itqan, 1:23 [1/38].

Khazin in his *Tafseer*,¹ has narrated from Mujahid, Qatada and numerous Ahle Sunnat reporters.

4. Persons like Hasan, Akrama, Kalbi and others, believe that verses of this Surah are Meccan; but they have clearly stated that verses related to 'feeding' are Medinan.
5. His statement that every Meccan Surah was definitely revealed before Hijrah is incorrect; because it is possible that it was revealed after Hijrah and during the last journey of Prophet (Farewell Hajj). Especially, with attention to the statement of Ibne Jubair, Hasan, Zahhak, Akrama, Ataa and Qatada, who say that 'and the prisoners' includes all believers, so much so that even slaves are included. Ibne Jarir and others believe this.

16. Sixteenth objection

He says: His statement – Allamah Hilli – who says: According to the verse:

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوَدَّةُ فِي الْقُرْبَىٰ

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives.”²

...affection and love for Ahle Bayt (a.s.) is obligatory. It is wrong, because this verse is Meccan and during its revelation neither Ali has married Fatima, nor they had children.³

And he says:⁴ His statement – Allamah Hilli – that Allah revealed the following verse:

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوَدَّةُ فِي الْقُرْبَىٰ

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives.”⁵

...for them, is false, because these verses are placed in Surah Shura and this Surah, without any doubt is Meccan and it was revealed before the marriage of Ali with Fatima, and birth of Hasan and Husain.

Till he says: And some Ahle Sunnat writers and Shia, including followers of Ahmad, and others have narrated that when this verse was revealed they asked the Prophet:

“O Prophet of God, who are the Ahle Bayt?”

He replied: “Ali, Fatima and their two sons.”

But it should be said that this traditional report, according to the consensus

¹ *Tafseer Khazin*, 4:356 [4/337].

² Surah Shura 42:23

³ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:118.

⁴ Minhajus Sunnah, 3:250.

⁵ Surah Shura 42:23

of tradition experts, is false, due the fact that this verse, according to consensus of scholars, was revealed in Mecca and since all verses of Surah Shura are Meccan; on the contrary all Ha Mim Surahs are Meccan.

Then he goes into a detailed account of the dates of birth of Imam Hasan and Imam Husain (a.s.) to show off his expertise in history.

Reply to these statements

If there had been no other calumny in the book of Ibne Taymiyyah other than this nonsense against the family of prophethood, it would have been sufficient for his everlasting disgrace.

As for the verse being Meccan

Not even one scholar has clearly declared that this verse is Meccan, what to say of the false consensus he claims? He claims that the Surah is Mecca only on the basis of jealousy and ignorant conjecture as he has concluded from the statement of the scholars.

Scholars have excepted the four verses:

أَمْ يَقُولُونَ افْتَرَى عَلَى اللَّهِ كَذِبًا

“Or do they say: He has forged a lie against Allah?”¹

Till:

خَبِيرٌ بِصَيْرٌ^④

“He is Aware of, Seeing, His servants.”²

...also some scholars have excepted the verses from:

وَالَّذِينَ إِذَا أَصَابَهُمُ الْبُغْيَ

“And those who, when great wrong afflicts them.”³

...till

مِنْ سَبِيلٍ^⑤

“there is no way (to blame).”⁴

These are some verses; what to say about the love of affection (*Mawaddat*), all scholars deny that all verses of Surah Shura are Meccan.⁵ According to clarification of Qurtubi,⁶ Nishapuri⁷, Khazin in his *Tafseer*,¹ Shaukani in his

¹ Surah Shura 42:24

² Surah Shura 42:27

³ Surah Shura 42:39

⁴ Surah Shura 42:41

⁵ Ref: *Tafseer Khazin*, 4:49 [4/90]; *Al-Itqan*, 1:27 [1/44].

⁶ Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran, [16/3].

⁷ *Gharaibul Quran*, [No. 11/ Vol. 25/35].

*Fathul Qadeer*² and others have narrated from Ibne Abbas and Qatada that four verses:

قُلْ لَا إِسْكُنْكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرٌ إِلَّا الْمَوَدَّةُ فِي الْقُرْبَىٰ

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives.”³

...and after, are Medinite and the rest are Meccan.

Context of revelation and obligation of loving Ahle Bayt (a.s.)

We should know that Allamah Hilli and his followers are not alone, who have narrated this tradition, on the contrary all Muslims, except for some supporters of Bani Umayyah, like Ibne Taymiyyah and Ibne Kathir, have consensus on the authenticity of the tradition. If only this man had mentioned the names of some of those, who reached consensus or introduced some of their books, in which this consensus is mentioned. Previously we mentioned sufficient examples from scholars of traditions and Ahle Sunnat commentators; and Imam Shafei has issued a famous statement regarding this; he says:

“O Ahle Bayt of Prophet, God made your love incumbent in Quran.
This is sufficient for your greatness
That whoever does not invoke blessings on you,
His prayer is not correct.”

Ali's marriage to Fatima and requirement of its precedence over the verse

Ali married Fatima in Medina and supposing as this person says: This verse was revealed in Mecca; we say: since there was a delay between revelation of verse and birth of their children – if we accept that it was delayed – there is no contradiction between revelation of verse and precedence of marriage over it is also not necessary, because what is definite and there is no doubt it, is that those two noble personages were from near kindred of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), but Ali (a.s.) due to his cousin-ship and Fatima (a.s.) due to her being daughter, and as for their children, in the same way, as their marriage was recorded in the divine register, in the same way, the divine knowledge about creation of those two was destined; and it is not necessary that all persons should be present when a rule is framed. On the contrary, whenever and whichever of them will be present, the command would be issued about him/her.

In addition to that, it is possible that the verse was revealed in Mecca, but

¹ *Tafseer Khazin*, 4:49 [4/90].

² *Fathul Qadeer*, 4:510 [4/524].

³ Surah Shura 42:23

during Farewell Hajj (last pilgrimage of Prophet) and at time they (Ali and Fatima) were already married and Imam Hasan (a.s.) and Imam Husain (a.s.) were already born; being a Meccan verse does not mean that it was revealed before Hijrah.

وَيَرَى الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْعِلْمَ الَّذِي أُتْرِكَ إِلَيْكَ مِنْ رَّبِّكَ هُوَ الْحَقُّ

“And those to whom the knowledge has been given see that which has been revealed to you from your Lord, that is the truth.”¹

17. Seventeenth objection

He says: As for the tradition of establishment of brotherhood between Prophet and Ali, it is false and fabricated, because the Prophet neither selected anyone for his brotherhood, nor established brotherhood between any two members of Muhajireen or any two members of Ansar; on the contrary, what is definite is that brotherhood was established between a member of Muhajireen and a member of Ansar; like the oath of brotherhood between Saad bin Rabi, Abdur Rahman bin Auf, between Salman Farsi and Abu Darda, as is proved from authentic traditional reports.²

Reply to the seventeenth objection

Regarding as invalid the tradition of brotherhood, which is proved and established for all Muslims without any exception, either shows his absolute ignorance of tradition and biography, or his extreme malice and enmity to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.); that he had not option, except to deny excellence and precedence of His Eminence (a.s.). As if he has taken an oath that he would either deny or weaken all merits of Ali (a.s.), even though it be through frivolous arguments or without any reasoning. We previously clarified that the establishment of brotherhood took place twice:

1. Between companions, before Hijrat.
2. Between Muhajireen and Ansar after Hijrat.

And both times, the Prophet established brotherhood with Ali (a.s.).

The fiery statement of Ibne Hajar Asqalani in *Fathul Bari*:³ is sufficient to destroy his flimsy imaginations. He says after the mention of both oaths of brotherhood and some traditions:

Ibne Taymiyyah, in refutation⁴ of Ibne Mutahhar Rafidhi (Allamah Hilli) has denied the establishment of brotherhood between Muhajireen, especially, between Prophet and Ali and he says:

“The wisdom behind establishment of brotherhood is that some of them

¹ Surah Saba 34:6

² Minhajus Sunnah, 2:119.

³ *Fathul Bari*, 7:217 [7/281].

⁴ He means the same book of *Minhajus Sunnah*, regarding which we are discussing.

should cooperate with others and that they should come close to each other; on the basis of this, it is useless to establish brotherhood between Prophet and someone else or a Muhajir.”

But this statement of Ibne Taymiyyah is refutation of established text (*Nass*) through analogy (*Qiyas*) and making others unmindful of the wisdom and exigency of establishment of brotherhood, due to the fact that some Muhajireen were stronger than others from the aspect of wealth, family and power; on the basis of this, Prophet established brotherhood between the strong and weak so that friendship and companionship is established between them and the weak partner should benefit from his stronger counterpart.

With attention to this fact, he established brotherhood between himself and Ali, because he was since childhood, present at the side of Prophet and was reared by him.

18. Eighteenth objection

He says: A tradition, which he – Allamah Hilli – has narrated from the Prophet that Fatima remained absolutely chaste, therefore Almighty Allah prohibited Fire from her and her children. According to consensus of tradition experts, it is false. And it being false will now become clear for others as well. The statement that Fatima remained absolutely chaste, therefore Almighty Allah prohibited Fire from her and her children, is absolutely invalid, because Sarah was also chaste, but God did not prohibit fire from all her sons; in the same way, Safiya, aunt of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), in spite of her chastity had children some of whom were righteous and some were unjust.

Thus, there are innumerable ladies, who are chaste and their number is known to God only; and some of their sons are righteous and some sinners; some believers and some disbelievers; thus precedence of Fatima is not due to her chastity, because she is same as other believer ladies.¹

Reply to the eighteenth objection

It is amazing that this man thinks that he can have consensus on his inclination and intention to particular verse or tradition, or an issue or a belief and as if he commands the academic society to have consensus, the dead and the living would also immediately say here we are (Labbaik! Labbaik!) and have consensus and at that time he would reason through his consensus! By God, if man would not have been prohibited from making false statements, this man would not have said anything more than what he has said.

Alas, if I only knew how it is possible to believe in the invalidity of a tradition, on whose reliability many scholars, like Hakeem, Khatib Baghdadi, Bazzaz, Abu Yaala, Aqili, Tibrani, Ibne Shahin, Abu Nuaim, Mohib Tabari, Ibne Hajar, Suyuti, Muttaqi Hindi, Haithami, Zarqani, Sabban and Badakhshi,² agree

¹ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:126.

² Ref: *Mustadrak Hakeem*, [3/152]; *Tareekh Bagdad*, [3/54]; *Musnad Bazzaz*, [5/223, H.

on? Alas, if he would only hint at some of those about whom he states that they have adjudged it to be false and had mentioned their books to us.

Is it not illogical that he wants to argue against established traditions? Yes, actually, it is his habit regarding excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), which he does not like. He should be asked what is the connection between chastity, purity and fire being prohibited on descendants that it can be refuted through the like of Sarah, Safiya and other believer ladies?

On the contrary, this precedence is the special quality of Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.). And how numerous are the merits, which are restricted to her alone, and illustrious ladies like Sarah, Maryam, Hawwa and others are not endowed with it; on the basis of this, if a special precedence is restricted to her children, no difficulty would arise and such merits of theirs are not less.

Allamah Zarqani Maliki says in refutation of this imaginary requirement in *Sharh Mawahib*:

Abu Yaala, Tibrani and Hakeem have narrated this tradition from Ibne Masud and Hakeem has regarded it authentic and there are numerous testimonies for it and making fire unlawful for descendants of Her Eminence, with hint at Lady Maryam, is that: Firstly: It makes her precedence in chastity obvious; and secondly: quality of chastity is extolled and its importance is made clear, otherwise, according to Quran, Fire is prohibited on Her Eminence.¹

This tradition is supported by a large number of other traditions, like tradition of Ibne Masud: She is named as Fatima, because on Judgment Day, Almighty Allah has kept her and her descendants away from the Fire.²

And the statement of Prophet to Fatima: “Almighty Allah will not punish you or anyone from your descendants.”³

And the statement of Prophet to Ali (a.s.): “Almighty Allah has forgiven you and your descendants.”

And the statement of Prophet: “My Lord promised that He will not punish those from my Ahle Bayt, who believe in oneness of God and my messengership.”⁴

¹ 1829]; and Abu Yaala has also narrated this traditional report in *Musnad Kabeer*, [as mentioned in *Matalibul Aaliya*, 4/70, H. 3978]; *Al-Mojamul Kabeer*, Tibrani, [22/406, H. 1018]; *Thaghurul Basima*, Suyuti, 46 and...

² *Sharh Mawahib*, 3:203 and the complete discussion of Zarqani would be mentioned in criticism of *As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya*.

³ Tareekh Ibne Asakir, [17/770] and in Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, 26/286]; As-Sawaiq, 96 [Pg. 160].

⁴ Tibrani has mentioned this tradition in [Mojamul Kabeer, 11/210, H. 11685] through authorities whose narrators are reliable, and Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq*, 96 & 140 [Pg. 160 and 235] has certified its authenticity.

⁴ Hakeem in *Mustadrak*, 3:150 [3/163, H. 4718]; and some other scholars like Suyuti, have also narrated it [*Al-Jaameul Saghir*, 2/716, H. 9623; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 12/96, H. 34156].

19. Nineteenth objection

He says: The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “Ali is with truth and truth is with Ali; wherever Ali may be, truth would be present there; and the two of them shall never separate from each other, till both of them arrive to me at the Cistern of Kauthar.”

This is the greatest lie, because no one has narrated this tradition from the Prophet, either with a weak or a proper chain of authorities. Can there be a bigger liar than its narrator (Allamah Hilli), who has attributed it to companions and scholars, whereas not one of them has narrated this report. This is the most obvious falsehood. Also, if it is said that some companions narrated it; it may be true. It is possible, but such a thing does not exist; on the contrary it is a lie attributed to Prophet and His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) is free of that.¹

Reply to the nineteenth objection

As for the captioned tradition: it is narrated by numerous tradition scholars and authors, among them being: Khatib in his *Tarikh*, Hafiz Ibne Marduya in *Manaqib*, Samani in *Fadailus Sahaba*, Ibne Qutaibah in *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, Zamakhshari in *Rabiul Abrar*.² With attention to these, how does he claim that no companion and scholar has narrated it?

We ask him, why this statement cannot be correct? Is there logical impossibility in it like coming together of contradictions?

Does according to his imagination, Ali (a.s.) not have the right that truth should circle him and he should be the pivot truth?

كَبُرَتْ كَلِمَةٌ تَخْرُجُ مِنْ أَفْوَاهِهِمْ

“A grievous word it is that comes out of their mouths.”³

The following statement is narrated through authentic chains:

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said on the day of Ghadeer Khum:

“O God, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him....and make him the pivot of truth.”

Raazi says in his *Tafseer*:⁴

“Due to the fact Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) used to recite “In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful” (*Bismillaahir Rah'maanir Rah'eeem*) in a loud tone, and it is proved from widely narrated traditions and whoever follows Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) in his religion, is guided, and the proof is the statement of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that: O God, make truth turn in whichever direction Ali (a.s.) turns.”

¹ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 2:167-168.

² Tareekh Baghdad, 14:32; Al-Imamah was Siyasah, 1:68 [1/73]; Rabeeul Abraar [1/828].

³ Surah Kahf 18:5

⁴ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 1:111 [1/205].

20. Twentieth objection

He says: It is narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that: “O Fatima, Allah is infuriated due to your anger and is pleased with your pleasure.” This is false. Narrators have narrated this tradition from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and it is not possible to find it in famous books of traditions; and it does not have correct or acceptable chains of narrators going back to the Prophet.¹

Reply to the twentieth objection

If I only knew what impelled him to follow this path of destruction? Is it baseless ignorance and lack of awareness about books of traditions, that he is compelled to deny every tradition, which he has not seen? Or it is his extreme malice to the family of revelation, which has caused him to deny their excellence? In my view, both are true about this author.

As for the captioned tradition, in view of tradition scholars, it is one of the famous and well known traditions; some regard it authentic and some consider it good; and they have narrated it from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) through chains of narrators, like:

1. Imam Abul Hasan, Ali bin Moosa Reza (a.s.) in his *Musnad*, as is mentioned in *Zakhair*.²
2. Hafiz Abdullah Hakeem Nishapuri (d. 405 A.H.) in his *Mustadrak*,³ along with supporting its authenticity.
3. Hafiz Abul Qasim Ibne Asakir (d. 571 A.H.) in his *Tarikh Sham*.⁴
4. Hafiz Abul Abbas Mohibuddin Tabari (d. 694 A.H.) in *Zakhair*.⁵
5. Hafiz Abul Fazl Ibne Hajar Asqalani (d. 852 A.H.) in *Isabah*.⁶

21. Twenty-first objection

He says: Report of Prophet regarding Ali: “Ali is the criterion of distinction for my Ummah and he separates followers of truth from followers of falsehood”; and the statement of Ibne Umar that he said: “During lifetime of Prophet the criterion of distinguishing hypocrites from non-hypocrites was their enmity to Ali (a.s.)”; both these traditions are fabricated and they are wrongly attributed to Prophet; and none of them has a proper chains of authorities and they are not mentioned in reliable books.⁷

Reply to the twenty-first objection

The most comprehensive statement, which befits this ignorant man is one

¹ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:170.

² Al-Zakhair, 39.

³ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:154 [3/167, H. 4730].

⁴ Tareekh Medina Damishq, [1/434 and in Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, 2/269].

⁵ Al-Zakhair, 39.

⁶ *Al-Isabah*, 4:378.

⁷ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:179.

which was mentioned about someone else of his kind. It is: “He was given power of speech, but not given intelligence.”

Therefore, we see that in his book, he issues statements without pondering and replies without any proper context. For example, Allamah Hilli narrates a statement from Ibne Umar, but Ibne Taymiyyah says: “This tradition is false and it is wrongly attributed to Prophet.” In fact this man cannot understand that this statement is not attributed to Prophet. In addition to Ibne Umar, other companions have also made such statements, like:

1. Abu Zar Ghiffari says: During the lifetime of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), we recognized the hypocrites through three qualities: 1. Denial of God and Prophet 2. Avoidance of Prayer 3. Enmity to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).

Khatib has mentioned this in *Muttafiq* and Mohibuddin Tabari in *Riyaz*¹, and Jazari in *Asniul Matalib*,² says: The correction of this traditional report is narrated from Hakeem – and Suyuti in *Jamiul Kabeer* has narrated its sequence.³

2. Jabir Abdullah Ansari; he says: “We recognized the hypocrites only through their enmity to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

This report is quoted by Ahmad in *Manaqib*⁴ and Ibne Abde Barr in *Istiab*⁵ and on the margins of *Isabah*; and Hafiz Mohibuddin in *Riyaz*⁶ and Hafiz Haithami in *Majmauz Zawaaid*⁷ have all mentioned it.

3. Abu Darda says: “We (*Ansar*) recognized hypocrites through their enmity to Ali Ibne Abi Talib.”

As it is mentioned in *Tadhkira*⁸ of Ibne Jauzi, Tirmizi has narrated this traditional report.

And these baseless statements are not proofs, on the contrary, the basis of these statements are words of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) regarding Ali (a.s.), some of which, we would mention here:

1. It is narrated from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) that: “I swear by the God, who split the grain, and created man, indeed the unlettered Prophet swore to me that none, but the believer would be devoted to me and none, but the hypocrite would be inimical to me.”

Source of the report

The following notable Ahle Sunnat scholars have narrated this traditional report: Muslim in his *Saheeh* – as quoted in *Kifayah* – Tirmizi in his *Jami*, but

¹ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:215 [3/167].

² *Asniul Mataalib*, 8 [Pg. 57].

³ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:390 [13/106, H. 36345].

⁴ *Manaqib Ali*, Ahmad bin Hanbal [Pg. 143, H. 208].

⁵ *Al-Istiab*, 3:46 [Part 3/1110, No. 1855].

⁶ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:214 [3/167].

⁷ *Majmauz Zawaad*, 9:132.

⁸ *Tadkiratul Khawas*, [Pg. 28].

without the sentence of enmity: this report is good and authentic, Ahmad in his *Musnad*, Ibne Majah in his *Sunan*, Nasai in his *Sunan* and Khasais Ibne Hajar Haithami and in *Sawaiq* of Ibne Hajar Asqalani; in *Fathul Bari*; Suyuti in *Jamaul Jawame* and its sequence and so on...¹

Another form of this traditional report

The believer will never be inimical to me, even if I cut off his nose, with this sword; and the hypocrite will never be affectionate to me, even though I might give him the whole world; because this definite command was issued from the tongue of the Ummi Prophet and he said:

“O Ali, the believer will never be inimical to you and the hypocrite would never be friendly to you.”

This traditional report is mentioned in *Nahjul Balagha*² and Ibne Abil Hadeed says in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*:³

“From this part, the Imam wanted to remind them of the statement of the Prophet about him.”

2. It is narrated from Umme Salma that: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said

“No hypocrite is ever friendly to Ali and no believer is inimical to him.”⁴

3. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said in a sermon:

“O people, I advise you affection for Zulqarnain, my brother and my cousin, Ali Ibne Abi Talib; as only the believer is affectionate to him and only the hypocrite is inimical to him.”⁵

4. It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) glanced at Ali (a.s.) and said:

“None, but the believer is affectionate to you and none, but the hypocrite is inimical to you.”⁶

It is one of the traditional reports through which Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) argued on the day of Shura saying:

“I adjure you by Allah, is there anyone among you that the Prophet should

¹ *Saheeh Muslim*, [1/120, H. 131, Kitabul Iman]; *Kifayatul Talib* [68, Chap. 3]; *Sunan Tirmizi*, 2:299 [5/601, H. 3736]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:84 [1/35, H. 643]; *Sunan*, Ibne Majah, 1:55 [1/42, H. 114]; *Sunanul Kubraa*, 7:117 [5/47, H. 8153]; *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, 27 [118, H. 100]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*: 73 [Pg. 122]; *Fathul Bari*, 7:57 [7/72]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:394 [13/120, H. 36385].

² *Nahjul Balagha*, 277, Saying 45; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, [18/275, Saying 108].

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 4:264.

⁴ Ref: *Sunan Tirmizi*, 2:213 [5/594, H. 3717]. He has certified to the veracity of the report. *Al-Musannaf*, Ibne Abi Shaibah [12/77, H. 12163]; *Al-Mojamul Kabeer*, [23/375, H. 886]; *Riyazun Nazara*, [3/166]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, [11/599, H. 32884, 622, H. 33026].

⁵ *Manaqib Ali*, Ahmad bin Hanbal [Pg. 214, H. 292]; *Riyazun Nazara*, [3/166]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, [9/172, Sermon 154]; *Tadkiratul Khawas*, [Pg. 28].

⁶ Majmauz Zawaad, 9:133.

have mentioned about him: Only the believer loves him and only the hypocrite is inimical to him?”

All said: “By Allah, no!”¹

Yes, after noting the traditional report, the value of statement of Ibne Taymiyyah will become clear, when he says: “None of these two reports are found in any reliable book and has no proper chains of narrators.”

For one, who regards authentic traditions as inauthentic and regards his own *Sihah* and *Masanid* books as unreliable, it is sufficient to know the extent of his ignorance that one is amazed that what all he and his supporters can resort to, in spite of such degraded beliefs!

يَقُومُ أَتَّبِعُونَ أَهْدِي كُمْ سَبِيلَ الرَّشَادِ

“O my people! follow me, I will guide you to the right course;”²

22. Twenty-second objection

He says: Battles of Ali (a.s.) at Jamal and Siffeen were not by the command of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.); on the contrary they occurred due to his personal views.³

Reply to the twenty-second objection

We know his satanic motive, his motive is distortion of truth and deceiving people; because belief of Ahle Sunnat regarding opinion and independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) is that every jurist (*Mujtahid*), whether his opinion might be compatible with divine command or opposed to it, will be rewarded for it; but one, whose view is compatible, will get two rewards. And one, whose view is opposed to fact, will get one reward.

And he, with attention to this belief and view, regards that bloody battle to be caused by the view and independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), so that through it he may show that Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), firstly, fought according to his personal view and independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*); and secondly, he is equal to them in view and opinion; because both were jurists and acted according to their personal opinion; thus both of them are on truth and are worthy of divine reward.

Unaware of the fact that destiny never leaves the people free; on the contrary, it has removed the veil from facts and announced that their independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) – supposing authenticity of their dream – it is independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) before clear statement (*Nass*) of Prophet.

I am amazed how such a thing could be unknown to someone? Or how he can feign ignorance, in spite of the famous statement of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to his wives, when he says:

¹ Ref: Hadith Munashida (adjuring) in this book.

² Surah Ghafir 40:38

³ Minhajus Sunnah, 2:231.

“Which of you will mount the hairy camel and stage an uprising; and the dogs of Hawwab would bark at her; a large number of people would be killed around her and she would also narrowly escape death?”¹

Also, the statement of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to Ayesha:

“O Ayesha, as if I can see dogs of Hawwab barking on you and you would stage an unjust uprising against Ali.”²

Or the statement of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

“Very soon, after me, a group would fight against Ali; at that time, it would be necessary to fight them for the sake of Allah; and if one is unable to help him, he should at least support him with his tongue and if that is also not possible, he should support him with his heart and there is nothing above this.”

Tibrani³ has quoted this report and it is mentioned in *Majmauz Zawaaid* and *Kanzul Ummal* as well.

Tabari and others⁴ have mentioned: On way to Jamal, when Ayesha heard barking of dogs, she asked: “What place is this?” They replied: “Hawwab.” She said: “Verily, we belong to Allah and to Him we shall return. I am that wife. Because I heard the Prophet telling his wives: Alas, if I only knew, on which of you would dogs of Hawwab bark.” At that moment, Ayesha wanted to return, but Abdullah bin Zubair falsified that person, who had said that it was Hawwab, and persuaded Ayesha from returning and she continued her journey.

Allamah Amini says:

وَمَا كَانَ اللَّهُ لِيُضِلَّ قَوْمًا بَعْدَ أَذْهَلْهُمْ حَتَّىٰ يُبَيِّنَ لَهُمْ مَا يَتَّقُونَ

“It is not (attributable to) Allah that He should lead a people astray after He has guided them; He even makes clear to them what they should guard against.”⁵

لِيَهُكَلَ مَنْ هَلَكَ عَنْ بَيِّنَةٍ وَّيَحْيَ مَنْ حَيَ عَنْ بَيِّنَةٍ وَّإِنَّ اللَّهَ لَسَمِيعٌ عَلَيْهِ⁶

“That he who would perish might perish by clear proof, and he who would live might live by clear proof; and most surely Allah is Hearing, Knowing;”⁶

¹ This report is mentioned by the following: Bazzaz, Abu Nuaim, Ibne Abi Shaibah, [15/265, H. 19631]; Mawardi in *Al-Aalam*: 82 [*Elamun Nubuwah*, 136]; Zamakhshari in *Faiq*, 1:190 [1/408]; Ibne Asir in *Nihaya*, 2:10 [2/96]; Firozabadi in *Qamus*, 1:65 [Pg. 106]; Ganji in *Al-Kifaya*, 71 [Pg. 171, Chap. 37]; Qastalani in *Mawahib Liduniya*, 2:195 [3/566]; Suyuti in *Jamaul Jawame*, as is quoted in *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:83 [11/333, H. 31667].

² *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:283 [4/135].

³ *Al-Mojamul Kabeer*, [1/321, H. 955]; *Majmauz Zawaaid*, 9:134’ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:155, 7:305 [11/613, H. 32971 & 15/102, H. 40266].

⁴ *Tareekh Tabari*, 5:178 [4/469, Events of 36 A.H.]; *Tareekh Abul Fida*, 1:173.

⁵ Surah Taubah 9:115

⁶ Surah Anfal 8:42

وَكَانَ الْإِنْسَانُ أَكْثَرَ شَيْءٍ جَدَلًا

“And man is most of all given to contention.”¹

بِلِ الْإِنْسَانٍ عَلَى نَفْسِهِ بَصِيرَةٌ وَلَوْ أَلْقَى مَعَذِيرَةً

“Nay! man is evidence against himself, though he puts forth his excuses.”²

In authentic traditional reports, it is narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said to Zubair:

“You would fight an unjust battle against Ali.”

That is why in the battle of Jamal, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) argued with Zubair and asked: “Do you remember the Prophet told you: Zubair, you would fight an unjust battle against me?” Zubair replied: “Yes, by God.”

Hakeem has mentioned this report in *Mustadrak* and certified its authenticity; Tabari has also quoted it in his *Tarikh*.³

These are statements of companions, which fill pages of books and biographies. They indicate that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) encouraged his companions to support Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in the battles that were to follow and he ordered them to fight on the side of Ali (a.s.) against oath breakers (*Nakiseen*), unjust (*Qasiteen*) and apostates (*Mariqeen*); like:

1. Abu Ayyub Ansari, that dignified companion.⁴

2. Abu Yaqzan Ammaar bin Yasir, who says: “The Prophet ordered me fight against the oath breakers (*Nakiseen*), the unjust (*Qasiteen*) and apostates (*Mariqeen*).”⁵

Following reports clarify that the battle of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was under the command of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and not based on personal view:

1. Ammaar Yasir said to Abu Moosa Ashari: “I testify that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself ordered Ali to fight against the oath-breakers (*Nakiseen*) and he specified the names of some of them, and he also ordered him to fight the unjust (*Qasiteen*) and if you want, I can present witnesses, who would all testify that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) particularly warned you against entering mischief.”⁶

2. Abdullah bin Masud says: “The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) ordered Ali (a.s.) to fight against the oath breakers (*Nakiseen*), the unjust (*Qasiteen*) and the

¹ Surah Kahf 18:54

² Surah Qiyamah 75:14-15

³ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:366 [3/413, H. 5574 & 5575]; *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 5:200 & 204 [4/52 & 509, Events of 36 A.H.] and so on...

⁴ Ref: *Tareekh Ibne Asakir*, 5:41; *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 7:306 [7/339, Events of 37 A.H.]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:88 [11/352, H. 31720].

⁵ Ref: *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 7:305 [7/339, Events of 37 A.H.].

⁶ Ref: *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:293 [14/15, Letter 1].

apostates (*Mariqeen*).¹

3. Ibne Abil Hadeed says in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*:²

“This statement of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to Ali is definite: After me, you will make war against the oath breakers (*Nakiseen*), the unjust (*Qasiteen*) and the apostates (*Mariqeen*).”

23. Twenty-third objection

He says: Allamah Hilli Rafidhi has narrated from Amr bin Maimoon that Ali Ibne Abi Talib was having ten such qualities, which no one else had:

1. Statement of the Prophet regarding him that: “Now, I will appoint such a person that Almighty Allah would definitely not humiliate him; he loves Allah and His Prophet, and Allah and His Prophet also love him.” People craned their necks to see whom the Prophet implied. Suddenly the Prophet asked: “Where is Ali Ibne Abi Talib?” They said: “He has got sore eyes, he is grinding flour in the mill,” – and none of them made flour – Amr bin Maimoon said: “Ali came while he was unable to see anything and the Prophet blew on his eyes; then he waved the flag thrice and then handed it over to him. He returned after a short while bringing with himself Safiya, daughter of Huyy bin Akhtab.³

2. The Prophet appointed Abu Bakr to announce Surah Baraat, but dispatched Ali in his pursuit to take it from him and announce it himself. He said: “Only I and one, who is from me, can discharge this duty.”

3. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) asked his cousins: “Which of you want to remain with me in the world and the hereafter?” All refrained, except Ali, who said: “I want to remain with you in the world and the hereafter.” The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) did not say anything. Again the Prophet addressed each of them, saying: “Which of you accepts my Mastership (*Wilayat*) in the world and the hereafter?” Again they did not reply. Ali (a.s.) repeated his statement. The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “You are my successor (*Wali*) in the world and the hereafter.”

4. After Khadija, Ali was the first to embrace Islam.

5. The Prophet spread his garment over Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain and remarked:

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ اللَّهُ لِيُنْهِبَ عَنْكُمُ الْرِّجَسَ أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ وَيُطَهِّرُكُمْ تَطْهِيرًا ﴿١٣﴾

“Allah only desires to keep away the uncleanness from you, O

¹ Tibrani in *Mojamul Kabeer* 10/91, H. 10054; Hakeem has narrated this report through two chains of authorities in his *Arbaeen*.

² *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:245 [13/183, Sermon 283].

³ That is Amerul Momineen (a.s.) won the Battle of Khyber against the Jews of Bani Nuzayr and took as captive Safiya, daughter of Huyy bin Akhtab, the ruler of Khyber; and the Prophet chose her for himself as she was from the descendants of Prophet Harun (a.s.) and after emancipating her, got married to her; and deemed her emancipation to be her dower. Safiya was the wife of the Prophet from Bani Israel.

people of the House! and to purify you a (thorough) purifying.”¹

6. Ali risked his life to save the life of Prophet by donning his garment and sleeping in his bed.

7. The polytheist stoned Ali (a.s.).

8. When the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) set out for the Battle of Tabuk, Ali (a.s.) asked: “Shall I also not accompany you?” His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) replied: “No.” Ali (a.s.) wept, but His Eminence said: “Are you not pleased that you are to me as Harun was Moosa (a.s.)? Except that you are not a prophet? And it does not befit that I should leave, without appointing you as my representative.”

9. And he said: “You would be the guardian (*Wali*) of all believers after me.” He also said: “One whose master I am, Ali is also his master.”

10. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) closed all the door leading into the Masjid, except the door of Ali; and Ali used to come out of the Masjid in the state of ritual impurity; and his house had no access, except through the Masjid.²

Ibne Taymiyyah then mentions points, whose gist is as follows:

Firstly: Such traditional reports are not recorded from Amr bin Maimoon. Secondly: even supposing we accept it, the report is without chains of authorities. Thirdly, such points are mentioned in it that to attribute them to the Prophet is blatant falsehood: like it is not possible for me to leave Medina, without leaving you as my successor, because Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) left Medina many times without appointing Ali as representatives; on the contrary he appointed others as his representatives.

At this point, he mentions the name of some individuals, who became representatives of Prophet in Medina; and then he says:

“Representing the Prophet in Medina during expedition of Tabuk, was only over ladies, children, those, who were exempted from battle and those three, who avoided participating in Jihad, or who were alleged hypocrites; and that is all, because during that period Medina was absolutely peaceful and its residents lived in security; and representative of the Prophet was not required to perform any Jihad. In the same way the incident of closing of all doors and leaving the door of Ali (a.s.) open is fabricated, which the Shia have concocted against authentic traditions, which Abu Saeed Khudri has narrated from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). It is mentioned in that report that during his last moments, His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) said: “Abu Bakr and his companions are most trustworthy with regard to monies. If I wanted to choose the friendship of anyone other than my Lord, I would definitely choose Abu Bakr as my friend. And no window remained open into the Masjid, except the window³ of Abu Bakr...” and Ibne Abbas has also mentioned this report as quoted in *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim*.

¹ Surah Ahzab 33:33

² Minhajus Sunnah, 3:8.

³ A small opening between two chambers. (*Lesaanul Arab* 3/14).

The tradition: 'After me, you are the Master (*Wali*) of all believers,' is also according to consensus of scholars, a fabricated tradition."

At this point he mentions numerous nonsensical and fabricated points to prove that this excellence is not restricted to Ali (a.s.).

Reply to the twenty-third objection

The first nonsense is that he says: The tradition is without chains of narrators; as if a veil was spread on his eyes; so much so that he cannot even see the *Musnad* of his imam; and he does not see that Ahmad bin Hanbal has narrated this report from Yahya bin Hammad from Abu Awana from Abu Balaj from Amr bin Maimoon from Ibne Abbas.¹ And the narrators of report, other than Abu Balaj are all reliable.

Nasai has quoted it in his *Khasais* and Hakeem in *Mustadrak* through authentic narrators, all of whose reporters are reliable.²

What is the excuse of Ibne Taymiyyah in considering this tradition to be without authorities and denying its continuous chains? Can he behave with traditions in this way? Is it proper to behave in this manner with knowledge and religion?

More amazing is the fact that after all this, he has quoted traditions and tried to refute the captioned tradition through the statement that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) left Medina many times, without appointing Ali (a.s.) his representative.

If one looks at the text of this incident through the angles, which we shall mention, he would understand that it was a special incident and such a thing was present only in this and no other incident; it was that firstly: the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was aware that no battle was to take place; secondly, Medina was in severe need of a Caliph like Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), since the awe of Harqil, king of Rome and his powerful forces had cast awe in the people of Medina. So they believed that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his men did not have the power to confront them.

Moreover, hypocrites abstained from joining the Muslim army and remained in Medina. On the basis of this, it was necessary that in absence of Prophet, the hypocrites would definitely create mischief. Hence, to prevent this mischief, the Prophet found it necessary to leave someone, whose awe would prevent hypocrites from creating mischief.

This could not be anyone else, other than Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), because the people were well aware of his capacities. Otherwise, the Prophet would not have stopped Ali (a.s.) from participating in the Battle of Tabuk like he participated in all other battles.³ According to Sibte Ibne Jauzi in *Tadhkira*¹,

¹ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:331 [1/544, H. 3052].

² *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, 7 [47, H. 24]; and in *Sonanul Kubraa* [5/12, H. 8409]; *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:132 [3/143, H. 4652].

³ *Al-Istiab*, (on the margin of *Al-Isabah*, 3:34); *Al-Istiab*, Part three/1097, No, 1855. *Riyazun*

writers of prophetic biography have consensus on this point.

After the above clarifications, the point, which shouldn't be forgotten is that the statement is not speaking of absences of Prophet from Medina; that one should object against it; on the contrary, it has a special meaning restricted to the expedition of Tabuk and that is all.

From this aspect his objection that the Prophet appointed others as his representatives is invalid, because in those instances, there was no danger to Medina. On the contrary, in other battles, there was severe need of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) there; and there was no one else, who could have fulfilled his role; since no one was capable to defeat the infidel stalwarts and confront huge armies. On the basis of this, the act of Prophet in both instances was based on exigency.

Ibne Taymiyyah after reducing the value of the Caliphate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), says: "During Tabuk, his successorship was only regarding ladies, children and so on...that is all," but if someone will ponder upon it deeply, he would conclude that:

First

The statement of the Prophet: Are you not satisfied that you are to me as Harun was to Moosa? This statement comprises all ranks of Prophet, except prophethood: position, rulership and leadership; and proves all these for Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as all ranks of Moosa (a.s.) were inherited by Harun. Therefore, the aim of Prophet in issuing this statement is different as before this, whenever he appointed others, he never declared similarity to Moosa and Harun. In this case, the appointment of Ali to this rank was to show his position vis-à-vis the Prophet.

Second

The statement of Saad bin Abi Waqqas: "By God, if one of these three things were given to me, I would have preferred it to the whole world: one is the statement of Prophet when he was proceeding on the Battle of Tabuk: Are you not satisfied that you are to me as Harun was Moosa, except that there is no prophet after me?"²

In *Murujuz Zahab*,³ Masudi, after quoting this tradition, says:

When Saad mentioned this to Muawiyah he wanted to rise up from his seat. During this Muawiyah passed flatulence and then said to Saad: "Sit down, so that you may get the reply to your statement. At this moment, no one is worse than you; then why did you not help him? Why did you not pay allegiance to him? Indeed, if I had heard this from the Prophet, I would have definitely served him

¹ *Nazara*, 2:163 [3/105]; *Sawaiq*, 72 [Pg. 120]; *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:148 [3/133].

² *Tadkira Khawas*: 12 [Pg. 19].

² Khasais Nasai, 32 [Khasais Ameerul Momineen, 37, H. 11; Sonanul Kubraa, 5/107, H. 8399].

³ *Murujuz Zahab*, 2:61 [3/24].

as long as I lived.” Saad said: “By God, I am worthier for your seat.” Muawiyah replied: “Banu Azra will not be pressurized by you.” It was common knowledge that Saad was an illegitimate born and his father was a man from Bani Azra.

Third

Statement of Imam Abu Bistam Shoba bin Hajjaj regarding this tradition:

Harun was the most superior of the people of Moosa (a.s.); that is why for preservation of this clear tradition, it is necessary that Ali should be the most superior from the people of Ummah, because Moosa said to his brother, Harun:

اَخْلُفُنِي فِي قَوْمٍ وَأَصْلِحْ

“Take my place among my people, and act well.”¹

Another part of tradition that Ibne Taymiyyah falsified

He says that the sentence: “He closed all doors, except that of Ali,” is fabricated by Shia from *Saheeh of Abu Saeed*...

Reply

In my view, the only motive of attributing the fabrication of this tradition to Shia is nothing, except shamelessness, exaggeration, concealment of facts, fraud and deception; because Ahle Sunnat books, especially *Musnad Ahmad*, was before him. And this tradition is mentioned in it through chains, some of which are authentic and others good. Among companions, it was a widely known matter and a large number of them have narrated it, reaching to the level of the widely narrated (*Tawatur*), like:

1. Zaid bin Arqam, who says: “The doors of the houses of some companions opened into the Masjid and they used to enter their houses through the Masjid. One day, the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: ‘Close all these doors, except the door of Ali.’”²

2. Abdullah bin Umar bin Khattab says: “Three qualities are given to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) such that even if one was given to me, I would have preferred it to red-haired camels: First: The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) gave the hand of his daughter in marriage to him and she became the mother of his children. Secondly: All doors opening into the Masjid were closed, except the door of Ali. Thirdly: During the Battle of Khyber, the standard was handed to him (Ali).”³

Umar bin Khattab: Abu Huraira has narrated from Umar that he said: “Three qualities are given to Ali Ibne Abi Talib; even if one of them was given to me, I would have preferred it to red-haired camels.” They asked: “What are they, O chief of believers?” He replied: “His marriage to Fatima, daughter of Messenger of Allah; his staying in Masjid along with Prophet and whatever was lawful for

¹ Surah Araaf 7:142; Hafiz Ganji in *Kifaya*, 150 [Pg. 283, Chap. 70].

² *Musnad Ahmad*, [5/496, H. 18801].

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 2: 26 [2/104, H. 4782].

the Prophet was also lawful for him and handing over the standard to him during Battle of Khyber.”¹

Regarding authentic the report of Abu Bakr’s friendship and opening of a window from his room into the Masjid

As Ibne Abil Hadeed has mentioned in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*,² “This tradition was fabricated in opposition of the above-mentioned tradition.” And he says:

“The tradition of closing of doors is restricted to Ali (a.s.), but supporters of Abu Bakr (*Bakriya*) resorted to this and attributed it to Abu Bakr.”

Signs of fabrication are clear for scholars, but we shall mention some of them below:

1. The aim of closing of the doors was to guard the sanctity of Masjid that no one should pass from it in state of sexual impurity. But the door of Prophet and Ali (a.s.) was left open, because according to verse of purification, they were purified of all apparent and ideal impurities. So much so that even sexual activity, which made people impure did not cause the two of them to become impure.

For more information on this point, I present the following reports:

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) entered the Masjid, while he was in *Janabat*.³ And he passed through the Masjid while being in the state of *Janabat*.⁴ And he went to and fro in the state of *Janabat*.⁵ And the report of Abu Saeed Khudri from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said to Ali (a.s.): “It is not allowed from anyone other than you or me to become *Junub* in the Masjid.”⁶

Another statement of the Prophet: “Know that it is unlawful to enter this Masjid for those in state of sexual impurity and in menses, except for the Prophet of God, Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain. Know that I have specified these names, so that you may not be misguided.”⁷

More clear than all this is the fact that leaving that door open was because God permitted it to remain open as is known from the verse of purification according to which they were pure from every kind of impurity.

2. This report implies that after the incident of closing of the doors, except

¹ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:125 [3/135, H. 4632].

² *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:17 [11/49, Sermon 203].

³ Ref: *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, *Khasais Nasai*: 3 [Pg. 46, H. 43]; and in *Sonan Kubra*, 5:199, H. 8428].

⁴ *Mojamul Kabeer*, Tibrani, [2/246, H. 2031].

⁵ Ref: *Faraaezus Simtai*, [1/205-206 H. 160].

⁶ Tirmizi in his *Jame*, 2:214 [5/597, H. 3727] & Baihaqi in his *Sunan*, 7:66; Ibne Asakir and his *Tareekh* [12/185, and in the Biography of Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), No. 331]; Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq* [Pg. 123]; Ibne Hajar in *Fathul Bari*, 7:12 [7/15]; Suyuti in *Taareekhul Kholafa*, 115 [Pg. 161].

⁷ *Sonan Baihaqi*, 7:65.

for the doors of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and his cousin, other doors did not remain open. As for the tradition that a window of Abu Bakr was left open, it shows that other than a window there were other doors for passing through and there is a great difference between these.

Some people, in order to reconcile traditions, which prove that Ali's door remained open, with traditions in which the window of Abu Bakr, have used a justification saying: The term of 'baab' in the meaning of 'door' in traditions related to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in the real meaning of the word, but in traditions about Abu Bakr it is used in the metaphorical meaning; and from 'baab' window is implied.

They also said:¹ "When people were commanded to close their doors, they followed the orders, but each of them left a small window open for themselves and from that they continued to enter the Masjid. Later they were ordered to close that as well."

But these justifications and reconciliations are not acceptable, since this is guess work² and no reasoning exists for it. On the contrary, it refutes the attention to the aim of closing their doors; because aim of closing the doors was that the Masjid should not be the place of passing through, and they should not enter the Masjid through these doors, on the contrary, how is it possible that before the viewpoint of the Prophet and against his orders, they should invent accesses for themselves?

This is clearly opposed to the aim of the lawmaker and angering him, from this aspect, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), even his two uncles, Hamza and Abbas, who wanted him to leave a common access to them or claimed to have asked for a window to remain open in the Masjid, yet the Prophet did not permit, because the single command had a single aim, and using different terms does not alter the rules. The abstract implication of window from the term of 'baab' neither removes the obstruction, nor does it change the topic.

Another part of tradition

Another part of the tradition, which Ibne Taymiyyah has falsified, is: "You are the Master (*Wali*) of all believers after me,"³ he says: "This tradition, according to the consensus of experts, is fabricated."

Refutation of Ibne Taymiyyah

He should have said: This tradition is authentic according to consensus of all tradition experts, but due to his deviated habit, he inverts the facts and shows authentic traditions as inauthentic, which he has done in this case as well.

Was in his view, the experts of traditions, including Imam Ahmad bin

¹ This text can be found in *Fathul Bari*, 7:12 [7/15]; *Umdatul Qari*, 7:592 [16/176]; *Nuzulul Abrar*, 37 [Pg. 74].

² Something for which there is no definite reasoning.

³ *Minhajus Sunnah*, [4/103].

Hanbal, who have quoted this tradition, are not experts of traditions? Ahmad bin Hanbal has narrated through a chain of authorities all of whose reporters are reliable.¹

Similarly, Ibne Kathir in his *Tarikh*,² and Muttaqi in *Kanzul Ummal*, has mentioned it and supported its authenticity.

This was a small part of foolishness of Ibne Taymiyyah and if we want to present all his falsehoods, deviations and allegations he has mentioned in '*Minhajul Bidah*', we would have to investigate all four volumes and a multi volume book would have to be written.

I did not find any explanation, which would explain the reality of this man and expose his true face to the academic society. Here we shall only quote from Ibne Hajar in the book of *Al-Fataawa al-Hadeesiya*:

“Ibne Taymiyyah is a man whom Allah has created as degraded and blind; and imams have clarified this point about him. Whoever wants to have more information about him, should refer to the statements of scholars about him. That is Abul Hasan Subki and his son, Taj and Imam Izz bin Jama-a and his contemporary scholars and all Shafei, Maliki and Hanafi scholars may be referred. He has not only objected against the later Sufis, but raised objections against personalities like Umar bin Khattab and Ali Ibne Abi Talib (r.a.).

The conclusion is that no attention should be paid to his nonsense and his statements should be kept away from people as he was a heretic, deviated and a misguiding man. May God deal with him with justice and keep us safe from such conduct and beliefs, Amen.

وَيْلٌ لِكُلِّ أَفَالِكَ أَنِيمِ⑦ يَسْمَعُ أَيْتَ اللَّهُ تُتَلَّ عَلَيْهِ ثُمَّ يُصْرُ مُسْتَكْبِرًا كَانَ
لَمْ يَسْمَعْهَا فَبَشِّرْهُ بِعَذَابٍ أَلِيمٍ⑧

“Woe to every sinful liar, who hears the communications of Allah recited to him, then persists proudly as though he had not heard them; so announce to him a painful punishment.”³

7. Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya⁴

We should not ignore the fact that the author of this book has crossed all limits in issuing false statements and in making exaggerations. He has fabricated such exaggerations and used foul language and without any proof, has reasoned through taunting phrases. All this is for the Shia and only the Shia...from this aspect, this book, instead of being a book of history, is a book of nonsense, communalism and blind prejudice, due to which communal unity is shattered.

¹ *Musnad Ahmad*, [5/606, H. 19426].

² *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7:344 [7/344]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:154 & 300 [11/608, H. 32940].

³ Surah Jaaseyah 45:7-8

⁴ By Hafiz Imaduddin Abul Fida bin Kathir Damishqi (d. 774 A.H.).

He has so much exceeded in the enmity of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) that wherever the name of those divine personages is mentioned or there is some dimension of their excellence, he attacks with spears of satire – please note the following examples of Umayyad nature.

1. False statement one

He says: Ibne Ishaq and other biographers and historians have narrated that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) established brotherhood between himself and Ali, and numerous traditions are recorded on this topic, but none of them is authentic, whether from the aspect of weak chains of authorities or from the aspect of their text being weak.¹

Reply to false statement one

If the reader refers to the reports mentioned above, their numerous authentic chains of authorities, trustworthy narrators and its accurate narration from scholars, experts and writers of biography, he would recognize the extent of truthfulness and value of the statements of this man.

2. False statement two

The first authentic and widely narrated tradition that he mentions is that of the ‘fowl’, which scholars of traditions have certified as authentic. After that he has washed his hands from it saying: “Although this tradition has numerous chains of narrators, my heart does not accept its authenticity, and Allah knows best.”²

Reply to false statement two

Yes, this is the heart that God has sealed, otherwise, after conditions are fulfilled, is there any scope of making such statements? Soon you will become familiar with this tradition and its numerous chains of authorities.³

3. False statement three

He says: In view of some people - on the contrary majority of them believe that Ali is the provider of drinks at the Cistern of Kauthar and this view is absolutely baseless and is not narrated through reliable authorities. On the contrary, the fact is that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) would be provider of drinks.⁴

Reply to false statement three

The reader can never imagine that this report is merely an illusion of people. In fact, this statement of his is a great allegation against leaders and scholars, because the tradition is narrated through reliable authorities and prominent

¹ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7:223 [7/250, Events of 35 A.H., and Pg. 371, Events of 40 A.H.].

² *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7:353 [7/390, Events of 40 A.H.].

³ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 906.

⁴ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7:355 [7/392, Events of 40 A.H.].

tradition scholars have narrated it. They have admitted to its reliability.¹

4. False statement four

First he mentions the beginning part of the authentic tradition from Imam Ahmad and Tirmizi regarding Islam of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and that he was first to embrace Islam and pray the prayer and then says:

“In whatever way is this tradition narrated, it is not authentic; and with regard to the fact that he was the first to embrace Islam, even though numerous reports are narrated about it, but none of them is authentic.”

Reply to false statement four

Inspite of correct narrations and reporters being trustworthy, and their testimony to its correctness, and acceptance of writers of biography, is there no one, who may ask this man: “Why none of them from none of the channels is authentic?”

While the fact is that they were accepted by companions and companions of companions and if we only reason through this statement, the reader would think that this is only a frivolous claim like that of Ibne Kathir. May God keep us from such claims. As a result, the clear facts would remain concealed from him. So we think it is necessary to present some evidences in brief:

Clear statements of Prophet

1. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “The first to meet me at the Pool (*Hauz*), would be one, who embraced Islam first and that is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

Hakeem has reported this tradition and certified to its veracity in his *Mustadrak*; and Khatib Baghdadi in his *Tarikh*; it is also mentioned in *Istiab* and *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*.²

2. He said to Lady Fatima (s.a.): “I have given you in marriage to the best person of my community, because he is the wisest and most forbearing of all and most senior in Islam.”³

3. He held the hand of Ali (a.s.) and said: “This Ali is the first of those, who believed in me and on Judgment Day, he would be the first to shake hands with me; and he is the great truthful one (*Siddiq Akbar*).”⁴

4. Abu Bakr and Umar proposed for the hand of Fatima, but the Prophet declined saying that a command was not issued for him about this. When Ali (a.s.) proposed for her, the Prophet accepted without any hesitation and said to Fatima: “I give you in marriage to the first of Muslims.”

This report is narrated by some companions like Asma binte Umais, Umme

¹ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 220-221.

² *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:136, [3/147, H. 4662]; *Tareekh Baghdadi*, 2:81; *Al-Istiab*, 2:457 [Part 3/1091, No. 1855]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:258 [13/229, Sermon 238].

³ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 281.

⁴ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 214.

Aiman, Ibne Abbas and Jabir bin Abdullah.¹

Statements of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

1. He says: “I am the slave of God and brother of Prophet; I am the greatest truthful one; and after me, whoever claims thus would be a liar; and I am one, who prayed with Prophet seven years before anyone else; and I am the first of those, who prayed with the Prophet.”

This report is mentioned by Ibne Abi Shaibah², Nasai³, Ibne Majah⁴, Hakeem⁵ and Tabari⁶ through authentic chains of narrators and through trustworthy narrators.

2. He says: “I worshipped God five years before anyone else.”⁷

3. He says:

ما اعرف احدا من هذه الامه عبد الله بعد نبينا غيري، عبد الله قبل ان

يعبد احد من هذه الامه تسعة سنين

“Other than the Prophet, there was no one with me who worshipped God, because I worshiped God, nine years before anyone else from this Ummah.”⁸

4. He says: “The Prophet was appointed on his mission on Monday and I embraced Islam on Tuesday.”⁹

5. He says: “I prayed with the Prophet six years before anyone else prayed with him.” Ahmad has narrated this report through two chains of authorities.¹⁰

6. He says: In the verses, which His Eminence (a.s.) wrote to Muawiyah and which were mentioned previously, he said:

“I was a young boy and had not reached maturity, that I embraced faith and became a Muslim before all of you.”¹¹

Statement of Imam Hasan (a.s.)

7. Imam Hasan (a.s.) says in a sermon in the gathering of Muawiyah:

“O people, I adjure you by Allah, do you know whom you are abusing? He was one, who prayed towards both prayer directions (*Qibla*), whereas, you O

¹ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:257 [13/228, Sermon 238].

² *Al-Musannaf* [12/65, H. 12133].

³ *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, [Pg. 25, H. 7]; *Sonanul Kubraa* [5/107, H. 8395].

⁴ *Sonan Ibne Majah* [1/44, H. 120].

⁵ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, [3/121, H. 4584].

⁶ *Taareekhul Umam wal Mulook*, 2:213 [2/310].

⁷ *Al-Istiab*, 2:448 [Part 3, 3/1095, No. 1855]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:158 [3/100]; *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 1:288 [1/271].

⁸ Ref: *Khasais Ameerul Momineen*, Nasai: 3 [Pg. 27, H. 8 and in *Sonanul Kubraa*, 5/107, H. 8396].

⁹ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 72 [Pg. 120]; *Taareekhul Kholafa*, Suyuti, 112 [Pg. 156].

¹⁰ *Fadailus Sahaba*, Ahmad bin Hanbal [2/682, H. 1165, 1166].

¹¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 145.

Muawiyah, were disbeliever about them and regarded them as deviation and in order to deceive people, you worshipped idols of Laat and Uzza. I adjure you by God, do you know that he was present at the two great allegiances: Fatah and Rizwan, and he paid allegiance? Whereas, you, O Muawiyah, was denier in one of them and oath-breaker in the other. I adjure you by God, do you know that he was the first of those, who embraced faith; whereas you and your father, O Muawiyah, were from those, whose loyalties were attracted through gifting them money.”¹

Viewpoint of companions and companions of companions regarding the first Muslim

1. Anas bin Malik says; The Prophet was given the office of prophethood on Monday and Ali embraced Islam on Tuesday. It is mentioned in another version that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) was appointed to office on Monday and Ali prayed on Tuesday; and Tirmizi² has mentioned this report in his *Jami* and Hakeem in his *Mustadrak*; and it is also mentioned in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*.

2. Abdullah Ibne Abbas says: “Ali had three qualities, which were not shared by anyone else: he was the first among Arabs and non-Arabs, who prayed with the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).”³

3. Abdullah bin Abbas also says: As per the verse of Quran:

رَبَّنَا اغْفِرْ لَنَا وَلَا حَوْانِنَ الَّذِينَ سَبَقُونَا بِالْإِيمَانِ

“Our Lord! forgive us and those of our brethren who had precedence of us in faith.”⁴

Almighty Allah made it incumbent on all Muslims to pray for the forgiveness for Ali (a.s.). Therefore whoever became or would become a Muslim after Ali (a.s.), should pray for the forgiveness of Ali (a.s.).⁵

4. Salman Farsi says: “The first one from this Ummah to meet the Prophet at the Pool of Kauthar is the first of the Muslims, Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”⁶

5. Umar bin Khattab: Ibne Abbas says: “Some people argued in the presence of Umar regarding the foremost Muslim; and I heard Umar say: As for Ali, there are three such qualities in Ali, and I wish, that at least, one of them had been there for me. It would have been more preferable to me than all the world. One day, I, Abu Ubaidah, Abu Bakr and some companions were with the Prophet, when His Eminence placed his hand on the shoulders of Ali and said: O Ali, you

¹ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:101 [6/288, Sermon 283].

² *Sunan Tirmizi*, 2:214 [5/598, H. 3728]; *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:112, [3/121, H. 4587]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:258 [13/229, Sermon 238].

³ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:111, [3/120, H. 4582]; *Al-Istiab*, 2:457 [Part 3/1090, No. 1855].

⁴ Surah Hashr 59:10

⁵ Ref: *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:256 [13/224, Sermon 238].

⁶ Ref: *Al-Istiab*, 2:457 [Part 3/1090, No. 1855]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, [13/229, Sermon 238].

are the first, who embraced faith, and the first Muslim to embrace Islam and you are to me as Harun was to Moosa.”¹

6. Muhammad bin Abu Bakr wrote to Muawiyah in which it was mentioned: “Ali (a.s.) was the first to accept the call of Prophet, and to testify for him; he accepted Islam and became a Muslim. He was the brother and cousin of Prophet. Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.)...he had precedence in Islam and was more steadfast in intention than others. Woe be on you O Muawiyah, you are comparing yourself to Ali? Whereas he is the successor and heir of Prophet and father of his sons; and he was the first and last follower of Prophet, who regarded himself committed to his oath to him. The Prophet informed him about his secrets and shared his important affairs with him.”²

7. Imam Muhammad bin Ali al-Baqir (a.s.) says: “The first to believe in God was Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), who was eleven years old at that time.”³

Also Abu Zar Ghiffari⁴, Jabir bin Abdullah Ansari⁵, Malik bin Harith Ashtar⁶ and...

These were some of the texts and statement recorded about Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), companions and companions of companions, and all of them prove that Ali (a.s.) was the first to embrace Islam. Traditional reports and statement regarding this exceed one hundred in addition to points mentioned previously⁷ regarding the fact that Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was the most excellent of this Ummah. To this add the statement mentioned before⁸ comprising of the fact that Ali (a.s.) is the most truthful one (*Siddiq*) of this Ummah and that he is the greatest truthful one (*Siddiq Akbar*).

Now, in spite of all this, is it possible to justify the baseless obstinacy of Ibne Kathir in not regarding these reports as correct?

If lack of authenticity of these reports is accepted, then what would be the value of books, which are full of these reports?

كَلَّا إِنَّهَا كَلِمَةٌ هُوَ قَبْلُهَا وَمَنْ وَرَأَهُمْ بَرَزَخٌ إِلَيْ يَوْمٍ يُبَعَّثُونَ
⑩

“By no means! it is a (mere) word that he speaks; and before them is a barrier until the day they are raised.”⁹

The implication of Islam and faith of Ali (a.s.) and his being the first Muslim and believer is that he was the first of those, who became inclined to Prophet and

¹ Ref: *Manaqib Khwarizmi*, [Pg. 55]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:258 [13/230, Sermon 238].

² *Waqatus Siffeen*, 133 [Pg. 118].

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:260 [13/235, Sermon 238].

⁴ Ref: *Al-Istiab*, 2:456 [Part 3/1090, No. 1855].

⁵ Ref: *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 2:211 [2/310]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:258 [13/229, Sermon 238].

⁶ Ref: *Waqatus Siffeen*, 268 [Pg. 238]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 1:484 [5/190, Sermon 65].

⁷ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 211.

⁸ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 214-215.

⁹ Surah Mominoon 23:100

is in the same way as mentioned about Ibrahim (a.s.) in the Holy Quran:

وَأَنَا أَوَّلُ الْمُسْلِمِينَ ﴿٢٣﴾

“And I am the first of those who submit.”¹

Also, the statement of Almighty Allah:

إِذْ قَالَ لَهُ رَبُّهُ أَسْلِمْ ۝ قَالَ أَسْلَمْتُ لِرَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ ﴿٢٤﴾

“When his Lord said to him, Be a Muslim, he said: I submit myself to the Lord of the worlds.”²

Also, the statement of Almighty Allah in the words of Moosa (a.s.):

وَأَنَا أَوَّلُ الْبُوּمِنِينَ ﴿٢٥﴾

“And I am the first of the believers.”³

Also, the statement of Almighty Allah quoting the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

أَمِنَ الرَّسُولُ مِمَّا أُنْزِلَ إِلَيْهِ مِنْ رَّبِّهِ

“The apostle believes in what has been revealed to him from his Lord.”⁴

And the verse:

قُلْ إِنِّي أُمِرْتُ أَنْ أَكُونَ أَوَّلَ مَنْ آتَسْلَمَ

“Say: I am commanded to be the first who submits himself.”⁵

And the verse:

وَأُمِرْتُ أَنْ أَسْلِمَ لِرَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ ﴿٢٦﴾

“And I am commanded that I should submit to the Lord of the worlds.”⁶

Here, we present some sermons of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), which Sayyid Razi has mentioned in *Nahjul Balagha*,⁷ so that researchers may ponder over them and derive subtle points from them; and it is that:

“Even in my boyhood, I had lowered the chest of (the famous men) of Arabia, and broken the horn points (i.e., defeated the chiefs) of the tribes of Rabia and Mudar. Certainly, you know my position of close kinship and special

¹ Surah Anaam 6:163

² Surah Baqarah 2:131

³ Surah Araaf 7:143

⁴ Surah Baqarah 2:285

⁵ Surah Anaam 6:14

⁶ Surah Ghafir 40:66

⁷ *Nahjul Balagha*, 1:392 [Pg. 300, Sermon 192].

relationship with the Prophet of Allah - peace and blessing of Allah be upon him and his descendants.

When I was only a child, he took charge of me. He used to press me to his chest and lay me beside him in his bed, bring his body close to mine and make me smell his smell. He used to chew something and then feed me with it. He found no lie in my speaking, nor weakness in any act.

From the time of his weaning, Allah had put a mighty angel with him to take him along the path of high character and good behavior through day and night, while I used to follow him like a young camel following in the footprints of its mother.

Every day he would show me in the form of a banner some of his high traits and commanded me to follow it. Every year he used to go in seclusion to the hill of Hira,¹ where I saw him, but no one else saw him.

In those days Islam did not exist in any house, except that of the Prophet of Allah - peace and blessing of Allah be upon him and his descendants - and Khadija, while I was the third after these two. I used to see and watch the effulgence of divine revelation and message, and breathed the scent of Prophethood.

When revelation descended on the Prophet of Allah - peace and blessing of Allah be upon him and his descendants - I heard the moan of Satan. I asked, "O Prophet of Allah, what is this moan?" and he replied, "This is Satan, who has lost all hope of being worshipped. O Ali, you see all that I see and you hear all that I hear, except that you are not a Prophet, but you are a vicegerent and you are surely on (the path of) virtue."

Our viewpoint regarding the meaning of being the first Muslim, contradicts Ibne Kathir and his co-religionists, because they believe that the first Muslim, before he became a Muslim, was a disbeliever. They say: "The requirement of becoming a Muslim is that one should be a disbeliever previously." Now, we ask him and those who are of this view: When was Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) a disbeliever that he should have accepted Islam? And when did he express disbelief that after that he should have brought faith?

All know that the origin of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was absolutely pure and on the upright faith; and he grew up in the lap of prophethood and the hands of prophethood reared him, and the great prophetic morals embellished him. Whether before declaration of prophethood or after that he was always a follower of Prophet and he did not have any desire, except what he desires and had no inclination, except what he was inclined to. Indeed, he was a believer during the time he was in the womb, when he was an infant, during childhood, youth, young

¹ Hira is a hill to the north to Mecca at a distance of six kilometers and at the height of 160 meters it has a cave, in which the previous prophets and Ibrahim (a.s.) worshipped and it was place of seclusion and worship of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). It is here that the first revelation descended on the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

age, old age and while he was the Caliph and other than that.

Statement regarding the Islam of Abu Bakr

When the *Saheeh* of Muhammad bin Saad bin Abi Waqqas is placed before us, and Tabari has quoted it in his *Tarikh*¹ through authentic chains of narrators, and trustworthy reporters narrate, I cannot issue any comment about it. Ibne Saad says: I asked my father: “Was Abu Bakr from the first Muslims?” “No,” he replied: more than fifty persons embraced Islam before him, but his Islam was superior to that of ours.”

What should I say when Abu Ja’far Iskafi Mutazali, who is remote from the Shia world, says:²

“Jahiz has reasoned for the Imamate of Abu Bakr and his being the first Muslim. If this reasoning were correct, Abu Bakr himself on the day of Saqifah, would have argued through it; but he did not do that; on the contrary, he held the hands of Umar and Abu Ubaidah Jarrah and said: I choose one of them for Caliphate. You may pay allegiance to whichever of them you like.

Also, if the reasoning of Jahiz were correct, why Umar said: Allegiance of Abu Bakr was sudden and without any premeditation, and Almighty Allah kept its harm away. Why anyone, during the time of Abu Bakr or after that did not argue through it?

We don’t know of anyone who made such claim for Abu Bakr; on the contrary majority tradition scholars believe that he became Muslim after persons like Ali Ibne Abi Talib, his brother, Ja’far, Zaid bin Haritha, Abu Zar Ghiffari, Amr bin Ambasa Salmi, Khalid bin Saeed bin Aas, Khabbab bin Arat. If we ponder on authentic traditional reports with proper chains of narrators, we will see that each of them are unanimous that Ali was the first to embrace Islam.”

As for the report narrated from Ibne Abbas, in which he says: “Abu Bakr was the first to embrace faith,” we should know that there are numerous reports from Ibne Abbas as opposed to this report.³

Yes:

وَمَنْ أَظْلَمُ مِنْ افْتَرَى عَلَى اللَّهِ كَذِبًا أَوْ كَذَبَ بِالْحَقِّ لَتَّا جَاءَهُ

“And who is more unjust than one who forges a lie against Allah, or gives the lie to the truth when it has come to him?”⁴

Note: Perhaps people with discernment would notice differences in the number of years, after which Ali (a.s.) is supposed to have embraced Islam: three,

¹ Tareekh Umam wal Mulook, 2:215 [2/316].

² Ref: *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, [13/224, Sermon 238].

³ Iskafi has mentioned many statements regarding this and we have quoted from his treatises refuting Jahiz.

⁴ Surah Ankabut 29:68

five, seven and nine.¹ Therefore, we present the following justification:

As for three years

Perhaps it implies three years from declaration of prophethood till publicizing of the call², because the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) from the beginning of his call, propagated secretly and in the fourth year publicized his call.

As for five years

Perhaps it implies two years³ between revelation of verse:

إِقْرَأْ بِاسْمِ رَبِّكَ الَّذِي خَلَقَ ①

“Read in the name of your Lord Who created.”⁴

Till the revelation of the verse:

يَا أَيُّهَا الْمُدَّثِّرُ ②

“O you who are clothed!”⁵

In addition to three years of secret invitation from beginning of declaration of prophethood after time gap till revelation of:

فَاصْدِعْ مَاتُؤْمِرُ

“Therefore declare openly what you are bidden.”⁶

And:

وَأَنذِرْ عَشِيرَتَكَ الْأَقْرَبِينَ ③

“And warn your nearest relations.”⁷

During these years there was no one with the Prophet, except Khadija and Ali.

In my opinion, it implies that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) propagated secretly for five years. This is just as mentioned in the book of *Imtaa*.⁸

As for seven years

In addition to numerous reports narrated through authentic channels, there are other reports as well which support this:

One is the report from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) quoted from Abu Ayyub, who

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 325.

² *Tareekh Tabari*, 2:216 & 218 [2/318 & 322]; *Seerah Ibne Hisham*, 1:274 [1/280].

³ Maqrizi in *Imtaa*, 14, regards it to be the time gap between divine revelation.

⁴ Surah Alaq 96:1

⁵ Surah Muddaththir 74:1

⁶ Surah Hijr 15:94

⁷ Surah Shoara 26:214

⁸ *Imtaa*, 44.

says that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“Angles invoked blessings on me and Ali for seven years, because we prayed together for seven years without there being anyone else with us.”¹

Another is the tradition of Abu Rafe, who says: “Ali prayed secretly for seven years and some months before all others.”² And this period is the same as the years of the call of Prophet, which includes period from beginning of call till prayer became obligatory; because without any contradiction, prayer became obligatory on night of Meraj.

And according to Muhammad bin Shahab Zuhri, Meraj occurred three years before Hijrah and Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) also remained in Mecca for ten years. Throughout these seven years Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) worshipped God and prayed with Prophet and during that period they used to go to Shebe Abu Talib and Hira to worship, till God wanted they continued in this condition.³ This continued for three years till the verses:

فَاصْدِعْ مَا تُؤْمِنُ وَأَعْرِضْ عَنِ الْمُشْرِكِينَ ﴿٤٧﴾

“Therefore declare openly what you are bidden and turn aside from the polytheists.”⁴

And:

وَأَنذِرْ عَشِيرَتَكَ الْأَقْرَبِينَ ﴿٤٨﴾

“And warn your nearest relations,”⁵

were revealed. After that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) declared his call in the gathering of Bani Hashim, but none but Ali (a.s.), gave a positive reply. At that time Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) declared Ali (a.s.) as his brother, successor, Caliph and vizier.⁶ No one accepted his call for a long time, except for persons, countable on fingers of the hand as opposed to the enemies from Quraish and other opponents.

In addition, the faith of those, who embraced Islam during that period, was limited to dual confession of faith and abstaining from worship of idols and they had not developed the capacity to purify their selves. On the contrary, the faith of Ali (a.s.) was such that he walked step by step with Prophet, he was continuously in his company, during which the Prophet taught him the method of worship and other obligations.

¹ Ref: *Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib*, Ibne Maghazali, [Pg. 14, H. 17 & 19].

² Ref: *Al Mojamil Kabeer*, Tibrani, [1/320, H. 952].

³ *Tareekh Tabari*, 2:213 [2/313]; *Seerah Ibne Hisham*, 1:265 [1/263].

⁴ Surah Hijr 15:94

⁵ Surah Shoara 26:214

⁶ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 199 & 201.

Conclusion

The fact is that in worship, Ali (a.s.) was a monotheist and he worshipped God with perfect faith for seven years before the people and performed prayers.

If you want, you should remain amazed, come and read the statement of Dhahabi in *Talkhisul Mustadrak*,¹ when he says:

“From the beginning, when divine revelation was received by the Prophet, Khadija, Abu Bakr, Bilal, Zaid embraced faith some hours before or some hours after him and worshipped God with the Prophet. Then where are those seven years of worship, during which Ali is said to have prayed alone?”

Allamah Amini says: These seven years are definite, but where are the ‘hours’ of Dhahabi? Who has mentioned this? When was created one, who claims thus? Where is he? From what source has he quoted? Which reporter has narrated it? And before this² we quoted from *Saheeh Bukhari* that Abu Bakr embraced Islam after fifty persons.³ As if this man is a Bedouin and remote from history of Islam, or he knows, but has issued baseless statements and he is fond of lying.

As for nine years

It is possible that it implies two years of ‘Fatara’ (time gap) from the time of declaration of prophethood till the daily prayer became obligatory?

In the end, we remind that basically in such issues the base is proximity and time of exact occurrence, just as during conversation such usage is customary; from this aspect all these possibilities are correct and without any contradiction.

5. False statement five

He mentions the tradition of giving of ring in alms (*Sadaqah*) by Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) during genuflection, after which the following verse was revealed:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيْكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ أَمْنَوْا إِنَّمَا يُقِيمُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ
الزَّكُوْنَةَ وَهُمْ رَكُوْنَةً ﴿٤٤﴾

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”⁴

Then he says:⁵ This tradition is not authentic from any aspect, because its chains of authorities are weak and basically, no verse is revealed specifically for Ali. Traditional reports, which say that the verses:

¹ Talkhisul Mustadrak Alas Saheehain, 3:112 [3/121, H. 4585].

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 329.

³ Tareekh Umam wal Mulook, 2:316.

⁴ Surah Maidah 5:55

⁵ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7/357 [7/395, events of 40 A.H.].

إِنَّمَا أَنْتَ مُنذِرٌ وَلِكُلِّ قَوْمٍ هَادِيٌ^①

“You are only a warner and (there is) a guide for every people.”¹

And:

وَيُظْعِمُونَ الظَّعَامَ عَلَى حُبَّهِ مُسْكِيَّنًا وَيَتِيمًا وَآسِيرًا^②

“And they give food out of love for Him to the poor and the orphan and the captive.”²

And the verse:

أَجَعَلْتُمْ سَقَائِةَ الْحَاجِ وَعِمَارَةَ الْمَسْجِدِ الْحَرَامِ كَمَنْ أَمْنَ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ
الْآخِرِ

“What! do you make (one who undertakes) the giving of drink to the pilgrims and the guarding of the Sacred Mosque like him who believes in Allah and the latter day.”³

...etc. were revealed for Ali, are all inauthentic.

Reply to false statement five

كَبُرَتْ كَلِمَةٌ تَخْرُجُ مِنْ أَفْوَاهِهِمْ إِنْ يَقُولُونَ إِلَّا كَذِبًا^④

“A grievous word it is that comes out of their mouths; they speak nothing but a lie.”⁴

How does he claim that its chains of authorities are weak, and decides that the verse of:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيْكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ أَمْنُوا إِنَّمَا يُقِيمُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ
الزَّكُوْةَ وَهُمْ رَكِعُونَ^⑤

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”⁵

...was not revealed specifically for Ali (a.s.)? Whereas he has himself stated in his *Tafseer*⁶ from authorities of Ibne Marduya from Kalabi that he says: “There is no doubt in this chain”, and the tradition of Abu Saeed Ushaj Kufi (d. 257

¹ Surah Raad 13:7

² Surah Insaan 76:8

³ Surah Taubah 9:19

⁴ Surah Kahf 18:5

⁵ Surah Maidah 5:55

⁶ Tafseer Ibne Kaseer, 2:71.

A.H.), which he has quoted that its narrators are trustworthy.

In this book, we shall inform you of the sources where the circumstances of revelation of this verse are mentioned.¹

Regarding the verse:

إِنَّمَا أَنْتَ مُنْذِرٌ وَلَكُلُّ قَوْمٍ هَادِئٌ

“You are only a warner and (there is) a guide for every people.”²

It is narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)³ that he said: I am the warner and you, O Ali, is the guide.

6. False statement six

Then he has narrated the tradition of immunity from Imam Ahmad⁴ from Waki from Israel from Abu Ishaq from Zaid bin Yusha from Abu Bakr. Then he says:⁵

This tradition is not acceptable, since it contains the order of Prophet for Abu Bakr Siddiq to return, because the Siddiq did not return, on the contrary he became the leader of Hajj...

Reply to false statement six

Read and laugh at this baseless analogy as opposed to authentic and proven text, on whose correctness, there is consensus, and in the coming pages, we will present the tradition of immunity from numerous chains and authorities.⁶

7. False statement seven

He says: “Some Shia believe that humps of Khorasani camels grew up during captivity of the ladies of the house of revelation in order to veil them.” Then he refutes this statement.⁷

Reply to false statement seven

I don't think there is any fool, who thinks that humps of camels, whether Khorasani or Arabian, appeared after the tragedy of Kerbala.

Without any doubt, Shia never subscribe to this claim. On the contrary, one who claims thus, has in fact made allegations about those ladies and his aim is to insult them through this nonsense, because regarding the noble ladies of the

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pages. 155-156 & 285, 287, 299-301.

² Surah Raad 13:7

³ [Ref: *Behaarul Anwaar*, 35/404 ; and it is narrated from Ali (a.s.) that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is the warner and I am the guide. *Mustadrak*, Hakeem Nishapuri, 3/130].

⁴ *Musnad Ahmad*, [1/7, H. 4].

⁵ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7/356 [7/394, events of 40 A.H.].

⁶ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 583. 585.

⁷ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 8/196 [8/213, events of 61 A.H.].

family of prophethood, in spite of the fact that their clothes, accessories and their veils were plundered, no Shia believes that they were unclothed throughout the period of captivity and they were humiliated by this. This is definitely untrue, because love of God for them prevented occurrence of such circumstances.

Yes, they had to face tribulations on the path of struggle in God's way just as their men faced. But such tribulations, which the warrior faces in the path of God, for God and in the presence of God, not only are they not degradation, on the contrary it is a sign of pride and source of respect.

So, those righteous ladies participated equally in this sacred mission along with their men. A mission, which exposed the evil acts of those villains, who wanted to take the religious society back to the age of Ignorance. This is the meaning of this statement

“Indeed, the religion was Muhammadan, but its remnant is Husaini.”

And this fact is memorable, but Ibne Kathir and their like could not bear it and they attack the Shia in every possible manner.

These are a few examples of the crimes of Ibne Kathir with relation to knowledge and trusts of Islam and some distortions of facts and false and baseless allegations towards Shia personalities.

وَمَنْ يُشَاقِّ الرَّسُولَ مِنْ بَعْدِ مَا تَبَيَّنَ لَهُ الْهُدَىٰ وَيَتَّبِعُ غَيْرَ سَبِيلِ
الْمُؤْمِنِينَ نُولِهِ مَا تَوَلَّ وَنُصْلِهِ جَهَنَّمَ وَسَاءَتْ مَصِيرًا^{١٦}

“And whoever acts hostilely to the Apostle after that guidance has become manifest to him, and follows other than the way of the believers, We will turn him to that to which he has (himself) turned and make him enter hell; and it is an evil resort.”¹

8. Mahazirat Tarikh Umamul Islamiyah

Shaykh Muhammad Khizri has written this as a book of history, but has not followed the method of writing history. On the contrary, he has left everyone behind in enmity to Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and praises of Bani Umayyah. It would have been better if we had left this book alone, without paying attention to it. But there is no option, except to inform the reader about some of his mistakes.

1. Objection one

He says:² It is highly regretful that the Battle of Siffen neither had a religious aim nor a legal justification; nor was it fought to remove oppression and injustice from Muslims. On the contrary, it was fought for personal aims and individual enmities. Shia of Ali supported him from the aspect that he was the cousin of Prophet and most worthy for Caliphate; and followers of Muawiyah

¹ Surah Nisa 4:115

² Mahazirat Tareekh Umamul Islamiyah, 2:67.

supported him, because he was successor of Uthman and most rightful for taking revenge for his blood. They believed that his blood was shed unjustly and they did not regard as lawful giving refuge to the killers of Uthman.

Reply to objection one

Alas, if he had only informed us about his religious motives, so that we might have seen whether they are compatible with the Battle of Siffeen? Since he did not do this, we say:

Which motive is more important than obeying the command of Prophet, what religious motive is higher than that fighting and supporting each other for applying commands of Prophet? Did the Prophet not order Imam Ali (a.s.) to fight the rebels (*Qasiteen*), that is Muawiyah and his supporters and commanded his companions to support Ali in that?¹

And the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) made Jihad with his enemies obligatory and said: "Soon, some people would fight against Ali. Their Jihad is upon God. One, who cannot fight with hands, should fight with his tongue; and if he cannot do this, he should do so with his heart; there is nothing above that."²

Which religious motive is more important for his supporters than that they should regard him as worthy of Caliphate as Khizri has himself clarified?

Which motive is higher for supporting him than the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding him and his family: "Fighting you is same as fighting me."³

And he said: "O Ali, soon unjust people would fight against you and you would be on the right. On that day, one, who does not support you, would not be from me."⁴

Would a Muslim refrain from helping Ali (a.s.) after hearing the statement of the Prophet?

Also, what religious motive is higher than that of fighting against the rebellious group? The Prophet himself labeled those people as such, when he told Ammaar:

"A group of rebels would martyr you."⁵

Also, the day when he said: "May God forgive Ammaar, as a group of rebels would slay him, while he would be calling them to Paradise, but they would call him to Hell fire."⁶

¹ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 314-316.

² Tibrani in *Mojamul Kabeer*, [1/320, H. 955]; Ibne Marduya and Abu Nuaim have narrated it.

³ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 97-98.

⁴ Ibne Asakir in his *Taareekh*, [12/370] has narrated this.

⁵ Suyuti says in *Khasais*, 2:140 [2/239]: This tradition is widely narrated and ten odd persons have narrated it from the companions. Soon we will mention 25 different channels of this tradition.

⁶ Bukhari [in his *Saheeh*, 1/72, H. 436]; in some of his copies. And Muslim [in his *Saheeh*,

Which legal justification is stronger than fighting under the banner of the Caliph of the time? A Caliph, who was given allegiance of important people of the community and who fulfilled all conditions of Caliphate; and numerous traditional reports about his Caliphate were recorded for those, who regard Caliphate to be by appointment.

It is natural that in this condition, one, who stages an uprising against him, has rebelled against the Imam of his time and he is regarded as a traitor and on the basis of the clear command of Holy Quran:

وَإِنْ كَلَّا فَتَنَّ مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ اقْتَتَلُوا فَإِنْ بَغَتْ أَحَدُهُمَا
عَلَى الْأُخْرَى فَقَاتِلُوا إِلَيْهِ تَبِعَتْ حَتَّىٰ تَرْفَعَ أَمْرُ اللَّهِ

“And if two parties of the believers quarrel, make peace between them; but if one of them acts wrongfully towards the other, fight that which acts wrongfully until it returns to Allah’s command.”¹

Jihad becomes obligatory against such a person.

I don’t know which injustice and oppression can be worse than the conduct of Muawiyah in seizing rulership of Islamic dominions without any legal and religious justification? Which was neither through consensus, nor through consultation committee or on the basis of will. Neither was he the legal heir of Uthman that he should stage an uprising to revenge his blood, because though he himself, due to restraining the Syrian forces from assisting Uthman and being deficient towards him, was not a partner in killing him, but it is definite that he cannot have the right to demand retaliation for him.

In addition to that he neither had precedence in Islam as a result of which he should be more eligible for Caliphate; nor did he possess knowledge and intelligence, which may stop him from errors; nor he had any piety, which would restrain him from committing sinful acts.

On the contrary, in his view, Caliphate was only rulership, which he targeted in order to gain dominance over people. He established his throne through intrigue, all sorts of deceits, unlawful maneuverings, trampling upon sanctities and ignoring all rules of conduct.

Through injustice and oppression, he was able to impose his son, Yazid for rulership over Muslims. If Muawiyah had not committed any other sin than appointing Yazid as his heir, it would alone have sufficed to make it obligatory on Muslims to fight against him and purify Islam from this filth.

4/431, H. 73, Kitabul Fitnah; Tirmizi [in *Sunan*, 6/628, H. 3800] and others have mentioned it. It is mentioned in *Tareekh Tabari*, 11:357 [10/59, Events of 284 A.H.] as well.

¹ Surah Hujurat 49:9

2. Objection two

He says: Without any doubt, Muawiyah regarded himself to be among elders of Quraish since he was the son of an important leader of Quraish, Abu Sufyan bin Harb and descendant of Umayyah, the eldest son of Abde Shams bin Abde Manaf as Ali was the senior descendant of Bani Hashim bin Abde Manaf. Thus, both of them were same in lineage.¹

Reply to objection two

What can I say to this foolish and ignorant man, that the element of prophethood and factor of divinity is transferred from loins of pure ancestors and from wombs of chaste mothers, from prophets to successors, from successors to guardians (*Wali*), from guardians (*Wali*) to wise ones, from wise ones to elders, from elders to nobles, from nobles to the seal of messengership and his successor, the owner of the great mastership (*Wilayat*). How can he compare it to Umayyad, *Abshami*² element and bestow equal status to the two?!

How deep is the difference between these two family trees? The family tree of prophethood and Ali (a.s.), which is a goodly tree, whose roots are firm and whose branches grow up to heavens and the tree of Umayyads, which is the filthy tree, and whose roots are not stable.

How different are these two family trees! One is blessed olive tree and the other is accursed tree in Quran.³

According to *Tarikh Tabari*, all scholar have consensus that: On the basis of interpretation of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.),⁴ the accursed tree implies Bani Umayyah. How does he regard both of them similar, whereas Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) says:

“From the sons of Adam, God chose the Arabs and from the Arabs chose the Mudar tribe and from the Mudar tribe chose Quraish. And from Quraish, He chose Bani Hashim and from Bani Hashim, He chose me.”⁵

Also, how do they consider both same? Whereas the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) during his lifetime was harassed by this accursed family a great deal. Since the day His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) saw in dream that they were jumping up and down on his pulpit like pigs and monkeys, he was never seen smiling again.⁶ The following verse was revealed after this:

¹ Mahazirat Tareekh Umamul Islamiyah, 2:67.

² He was Abde Shams son of Abde Manaf, the ancestor of Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan.

³ Surah Isra 17:60.

⁴ *Tareekh Tabari*, 11:356 [10/58, Events of the year 284 A.H.]; *Tareekh Khateeb*, 3:343 [No. 1451]; *Tafseer Qurtubbi*, 10:286 [10/183]; *Tafseer Nishapuri*, 15:55, on the margins of *Tafseer Tabari*.

⁵ Baihaqi [in his *Sunan*, 7/134]; and Hakeem [in *Sunan Tirmizi*, 5/5544, H. 3605].

⁶ *Tafseer Tabari*, 15:77, [No. 9/ Vol. 14/112]; *Tareekh Tabari*, 11:356 [10/58, Events of the year 284]; *Tareekh Khateeb*, 9:44 [no. 4627]; 8:280 [no. 4377].

وَمَا جَعَلْنَا الرُّؤْيَا إِلَّا فِتْنَةً لِّلَّهَّ أَنْتَ أَعْلَمُ بِالْأَفْتَنَاتِ

“And We did not make the vision which We showed you but a trial for men.”¹

How does he regard the two same? Whereas Bani Umayyah enslaved people, misappropriated funds from public treasury, and made the Book of Allah a means of deception, just as the trustworthy Prophet had informed?²

How does he regard Abu Sufyan as the Shaykh of Quraish? Whereas he is the shame of Quraish. And according to absolute command of Prophet, he is accursed, because one day, when His Eminence saw Abu Sufyan with Muawiyah, he said:

“May God curse the leading one and the following one. And remove mischief of one, who is following (Muawiyah).”³

Also, one day, the Prophet saw Abu Sufyan astride a camel, Muawiyah and his brother were accompanying him: one was leading animal and the other, driving it from rear. His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) remarked:

“O God, curse the one, leading the animal, one driving it and the rider.”⁴

How does he regard Shaykh of Quraish equal to Shaykhul Abtah? Whereas Al-Qama says regarding him:

“Indeed, Abu Sufyan was not previously from Muslims; he embraced Islam fearing a degraded death, he embraced Islam in a hypocritical way. Woe be on Sakhr and his followers in the center of Hell fire, where fire is made to rage.”⁵

Alas, if Khizri had read the statement of Maqrizi in the book of *An-Niza wat Takhlasum*, where he says:⁶

“Abu Sufyan, leader of the clans – is the same, who during the Battle of Uhud, fought against Prophet and martyred seventy best companions of His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) from Muhajireen and Ansar, especially, the Lion of God, Hamza bin Abdul Muttalib. He confronted the Prophet in Battle of Khandaq and in that battle, he wrote as follows to the Prophet: O God, in your name, I swear by the idols of Laat, Uzza, Saaf, Naila and Hubal, that I have come to you in order to cut out the root. I see that you cling to the moat, as if seeing me has distressed you. Know that like the day of Uhud, I will take revenge from you today.”

He sent a letter to the Prophet through Abu Salma Jashmi and Ubayy bin

¹ Surah Isra 17:60

² An-Niza wat Takhlasum Baina Bani Umayyah wa Bani Hashim, Maqrizi 52 & 54 [Pg. 81]; Al-Khasaisul Kubra, 2:118 [2/200].

³ Baraa bin Azib says: It implies Muawiyah.

⁴ *Kitab Nazr bin Muzahim* regarding the Battle of Siffeen, 244 & 248 [Pg. 218 & 220]; *Tareekh Tabari*, 11:357 [10/58, Events of the year 284].

⁵ *Kitab Nazr bin Muzahim*, 219 [Pg. 195].

⁶ An-Niza wat Takhlasum, 28 [Pg. 52].

Kaab read out that letter to the Prophet. His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) wrote in reply:

“I received your letter. Past pride has surrounded you, O fool of Bani Ghalib and very soon Almighty Allah would put a barrier between you and your desires and He would write victory and a good end for us. O fool of Bani Ghalib, you will see a day, when I would break up the idols of Laat, Uzza, Saaf, Naila and Hubal.”

Abu Sufyan was always at war against God and Prophet till the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) set out for the conquest of Mecca. At that time Abbas bin Abdul Muttalib, a friend of Abu Sufyan since the period of Ignorance, mounted him behind himself on his animal and brought him to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

When he met the Prophet, he requested him to grant him security. When His Eminence saw him, Abu Sufyan said: “May my parents be sacrificed on you, how noble you are. By God, if I knew there was another deity other than God, it would have definitely helped me, removed my need and fulfilled my desires.”

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “Abu Sufyan, is it not time that you should accept me as Prophet of God?”

He replied: “May my parents be sacrificed on you, I still feel dislike for this in my heart.”

Abbas said: “Woe be on you. Recite the testimony of faith, before you are beheaded.”

At that moment Abu Sufyan recited the dual testimony of faith and became a Muslim.

This was the story of his acceptance of Islam and you can yourself evaluate what it was:

الَّمْ يَأْتِهِمْ نَبَأً الَّذِينَ مِنْ قَبْلِهِمْ

“Has not the news of those before them come to them.”¹

قُلْ هُوَ نَبُوَّا عَظِيمٌ ﴿٤﴾ أَنْتُمْ عَنْهُ مُعْرِضُونَ

“Say: It is a message of importance, (And) you are turning aside from it.”²

3. Objection three

He says: In my view, the determination Muawiyah in selecting a successor and Caliph was justified, because when the rules for selection of Caliph were not yet framed, it was better for him to select his successor as heir apparent before his death, as it assured that there would be no dispute after him.³

¹ Surah Taubah 9:70

² Surah Saad 38:67-68

³ Mahazirat Tareekh Umamul Islamiyah, 2:119.

Another objection

Among the objections leveled against Muawiyah is that he appointed his son for Caliphate and with this action, he laid the foundation of dynastic rule in Islam, whereas before that the selection of Caliph was through consultation committee and caliph was selected from Quraish. They also say that this practice of Muawiyah created turmoil, because he appointed a man, who was unfit and ineligible; he was mired in wantonness and profligacy.

But we say: Such selection of caliph was necessary and no other option was available; because as much broad is the circle of selection of caliph, list of nomination prolongs and to this we add the absence of selection of caliph; in any case we are unable to select a caliph.

And in the past turmoils, we see that in spite of superiority of Bani Abde Manaf in all Quraish and their acceptance by all people, only some of them were Quraish in this way, how they will fight as leaders of people destroy men. So, if people give approval to members of a clan and obey them and their capability of caliphate is accepted by them, this would be the best way to maintain unity of Muslims.

Most objection against Muawiyah for selecting his son for Caliphate are leveled from Shia; whereas they themselves believe that Caliphate is restricted to progeny of Ali and it is to be transferred from one descendant to another through heredity; same is the method followed by Bani Abbas.¹

Reply to objection three

We should know that critics of Muawiyah do not only condemn him for his selection, on the contrary he is condemned from two aspects:

First aspect

Absence of Muawiyah's eligibility to alone select a Caliph after him, because from one side, Muawiyah did not have a good precedence. As Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) clarified in statement:

“Allah, the Mighty and Sublime did not give any precedence to him in religion and past seniority. He is a freed slave, son of freed slave and a party from these parties. In the past, he and his father were always inimical to Allah, His Prophet and Muslims till both of them entered the fold of Islam unwillingly.”

On the other hand, there existed in the society persons, having influence, who had selected Abu Bakr as Caliph and through his will, selected Umar as Caliph, and after him the Caliphate of Uthman was established; then with general consensus Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was chosen as Caliph.

Through this process, the Caliphate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) was established and his obedience became obligatory. Muawiyah should also have paid allegiance to His Eminence. And all these persons or companions were

¹ Mahazirat Tareekh Umamul Islamiyah, 2:120.

present (in their presence Muawiyah was not alone eligible to choose a Caliph), as well as those, who vehemently opposed the act of Muawiyah.

Second aspect

Absence of eligibility in the person he had selected; because he was a transgressor and a profligate, even if we don't call him a disbeliever and an apostate.

As for non-specification of selectors: In his view, they were not specified; which itself is a great allegation, because most of those, who had been at the early period of Islam in the capital of Islam – Medina Munawwara – were present and they had the responsibility to appoint a Caliph. They were alive till that time. If his implication is that they did not select a Caliph after Muawiyah, we should say that the selection of Caliph takes place after the death of the present Caliph and not before that. Yes, sometimes it is possible that a short while before selection, they might have someone in mind to be worthy of Caliphate.

The question is from where Muawiyah knew that in future or when he dies, they would leave the people to their devices? That he should take it upon himself to make a selection and that too without their consent? Why he compelled some of them to consent through fear? And some through greed? And how was his selection effective in removing disputes from Ummah? Were there not different religious groups in the society which expressed their malice and enmities? And some of them even condemned him? Even some fearing the abrupt anger of Muawiyah, concealed their fury and disappointment.

If this was a guaranteed method of removing all disputes from Ummah, why did the Prophet not specify it at the time of his passing away, so that there should be no strife till Judgment Day?

These are complex questions, which Khizri cannot reply. But he claims that Muawiyah was more concerned about the welfare of people than the Prophet!

Another question is: How appointment of Yazid removed differences? Did that tragedy of Kerbala not take place during his time? After that was there no attack on Medina? And after that was Mecca not attacked and Ibne Zubair killed? Yes, all these were due to the illegal selection of Yazid.

Among the opponents, the grandson of Prophet, Imam Husain (a.s.) and also other Bani Abde Manaf, Muhajireen and Ansar in Medina were present. Moreover, if we accept that Muawiyah had no option but to appoint a caliph, then why he did not appoint a righteous and deserving person from companions, at the head of them being Imam Husain (a.s.), who had most experience, knowledge, piety and nobility and no one was his equal.

How Khizri thinks that evil selection was good for Ummah? How he did not regard it to be a crime against Ummah and dishonesty towards Prophet, Quran and Sunnah?

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: "The first one to distort my Sunnah is a

man from Bani Umayyah.”

Also, “Religion would be based on justice till the time a man from Bani Umayyah, named Yazid creates a split and defames it.”¹

Did the Prophet not issue these warnings?

As for his viewpoint regarding restriction of Caliphate in a family

From this aspect, we have no argument against him; our dispute is only with regard to the ineligibility of clans, whose Caliphate Khizri supports with all his heart. Yes, if Caliphate is restricted to a pure and noble family, which is eligible due to its precedence in religion, there is no problem, but in case of absence of eligibility, we will not accept the above mentioned limitation, because in that case it would not suffice for uprooting mischief and would be a source of discord, because people whenever they see prejudice and injustice in their caliph, they would stage an uprising against him and dismiss him from his post.

And it is natural that in that case one, who sees himself to be worthier than him would vie for caliphate. In spite of this restriction of caliphate ,which corruption would be eradicated from the society?

Belief of Shia in restriction of Caliphate to the progeny of Ali (a.s.) is not there, except after accepting infallibility of this family on the basis of widely narrated traditions of Prophet.²

4. Objection four

He says: Husain committed a great mistake in rising up against Yazid, because he created disunity and groupism among people. He made the foundation of unity weak to this day. Many people have written books on this subject, whose aim is only to create mischief and disunity. And the gist of the discussion is that he was in pursuit of something, whose background was not available and humans did not have capacity for that. And that is why between him and his desires there was a wide chasm; and that is why he was killed. And before him, his father was also killed, but writers and those, who say that his killing was bad and instigate enmity, do not achieve anything.

Now they have gone and are present before their Lord himself would take their account and history gains lesson from this and it is that one, who has lofty aims, should not step forward without sufficient preparations and possibilities. He should also keep the welfare of society in mind so that people do not have to bear untold difficulties. But when Husain rose in opposition to Yazid, people had pledged allegiance to Yazid and at that time no injustice and oppression was apparent from him.³

¹ *Khasaisul Kubra*, 2:139 [2/236]; *Tatheerul Jinan* on the margins of *Sawaiq*, 145 [Pg. 64], he says: Its narrators are trustworthy and its authorities are reliable, except that the report is broken.

² Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 270 and 271.

³ *Mahazirat Tareekh Umamul Islamiyah*, 2:129-130.

By these statements, Khizri wants to absolve Yazid from injustice and oppression and he imagines that Yazid brought Husain near to himself and accorded respect to him.

Reply to objection four

Alas, if he had written these things, after awareness of special qualities and conditions of Islamic caliphate, and conditions necessary for caliph, like experience, administration, purity of nature, unblemished character to be a role model for the people. But regrettably he is unaware of all this and he has written these points.

Neither has he recognized the tyrant Yazid, so that he may understand that Islamic caliphate is not allowed for Yazid and his like. Nor Husain's leadership and nobility, so that he may know that a personality of this lofty nature can never submit to the shameless, sinful and infidel Yazid.

Yes, the beloved one of Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) did not stage an uprising to create discord in the community, because every true follower of Islam believes it to be his primary duty that in order to defend religion from someone, who played with sanctities of religion and who created mischief in religion and distorted religious teachings, suspended divine laws.

Yazid, the transgressor was the clearest implication of these things and from the time of his father, Muawiyah, he was ill famed for injustice and oppression and all sorts of unlawful acts; just as our master, Imam Husain (a.s.) said to Muawiyah when he wanted to take allegiance for Yazid:

“Do you want to deceive people regarding Yazid and speak of him as if you are talking of an unknown man. Whereas you are aware of such facts about Yazid, which others don't know, whereas Yazid himself is more aware of himself than others, and he has expressed his views. For knowing Yazid it is sufficient that he plays with dogs, pigeons and enjoys songs, music and dance. O Muawiyah, leave your demands; O Muawiyah, are all these injustices, which you wrought, not sufficient for you and you want to meet Allah with more?”¹

He also said to Muawiyah: “It is sufficient for your unawareness that you preferred the world over the hereafter.”

Muawiyah replied: “As for your claim that you are better than Yazid; by God, Yazid is better than you for the Ummah of Muhammad.”

Imam Husain (a.s.) said: “This is a lie, is Yazid, the drunkard and profligate better than me?”

The letter of Motazid, the Abbaside, which was read out in public, said:

“Among the crimes of Muawiyah is that he sacrificed the religion of God for himself and called people to Yazid, the arrogant and wine imbibing, who passed his time with monkeys, dogs and leopards and took allegiance of influential

¹ Al-Imamah was Siyasah, 1:153 [1/161].

people through force and threats; although they were aware of Yazid's traits. When he occupied the throne, he began to take revenge for killings of polytheist of his clan and finally committed the infamy of attacking Medina. Thus, he satisfied the fire of hatred by taking revenge from divine saints. Then divulged his disbelief in the following verses:

1. Alas, if my ancestors from Battle of Badr had been present to see and heard the screams of Khazraj at the strikes we delivered upon them. 2. And had seen how we slain their stalwarts and revenged the Battle of Badr fully. 3. They would have been pleased at this act and remarked: O Yazid, may your hands never perish. 4. If I don't take revenge from descendants of Ahmad, I am not the son of Khandaf. 5. As there was neither any divine revelation nor prophethood. It was only a drama enacted by Bani Hashim to establish a kingdom.

Yes, these statements are clear indication of apostasy and disbelief and they show that the man neither believed in God, His religion, His Book or his Prophet. He did not have any faith in the message of Prophet and his commands.

In addition to this, his worst crime was shedding the blood of Husain bin Ali, son of Fatima, daughter of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). A personality whose rank in view of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was lofty and whose position in religion was supreme. According to the Prophet he and his brother was the chief of youths of Paradise. All are aware of this.

And the cause of committing such a crime was not, but audacity before God and denial of His religion, enmity to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), confrontation with his progeny and trespassing on their sanctity. In such a way that he martyred him and his family like Turk and Dailamite infidels are killed.

Neither did he fear divine retribution nor feared divine anger and Almighty Allah also did not leave him to his devices, on the contrary He made him die young and made his progeny extinct; and prepared for him a painful chastisement.¹

Whoever criticizes the allegiance of Yazid has the following statement in view and from this aspect caliphate of such a person with such views is a great danger for religion.

The rising of Husain was a sacrifice and it was not pursuit of power that it should have required preparations and provisions as Khizri says with confidence: Husain did not achieve his aims, he was killed for that...on the contrary the aim of this great warrior was only to sacrifice his life on the path of religion and that's all. So that people become aware of corruption of Bani Umayyah and their hidden disbelief.

In the same way, the religion community knows that they neither respected elders nor had mercy on the young; neither had mercy on infants or respect to ladies. On the contrary, all know that they martyred all noble personalities and no

¹ *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 11:358 [10/60, Events of year 284 A.H.].

one remained; and those noble souls did not hesitate in laying down their lives in the path of religion.

“Ask from your Kerbala and the dear ones of Muhammad, whether their hands were full or they were cut off. Full moons of 14th eve, which the debased fellows hid, and who slain the noble souls.”

Husain is not such that the passage of time should obliterate his memory, because he has a lofty rank, prominent position, unlimited wisdom, deep rooted opinion, clear justice and piety. He was the beloved grandson of Prophet, whose fame is known to one and all. No one can be found among Muslims, who can deny these merits, even though he might not agree to his caliphate. That is why the Ummah has not uttered anything against him, and except for Khizri, no one has said that Imam Husain (a.s.) did not achieve his aim.

وَإِنَّهُمْ لَيَقُولُونَ مُنَكِّرًا مِّنَ الْقَوْلِ وَزُورًا

“And most surely they utter a hateful word and a falsehood.”¹

Thus, (as opposed to what Khizri thinks) the lesson we derive from the example of Imam Husain (a.s.) is that: It is obligatory to stage an uprising against every falsehood and in defense of religion and to spread religious morals.

Yes, this teaches us that death is better than a life of degradation. It also impels us to sacrifice our lives in defense of the upright religion.

These are some of the immortal teachings, which Imam Husain (a.s.) taught to the Ummah of his grandfather and his aim was not as Khizri mentioned: History gains a lesson from this...

يَسْتَخْفُونَ مِنَ النَّاسِ وَلَا يَسْتَخْفُونَ مِنَ اللَّهِ وَهُوَ مَعْهُمْ إِذْ يُبَيِّنُونَ مَا لَا يَرَضُى مِنَ الْقَوْلِ وَكَانَ اللَّهُ بِمَا يَعْمَلُونَ هُمْ يَعْلَمُونَ ﴿٤٦﴾

“They hide themselves from men and do not hide themselves from Allah, and He is with them when they meditate by night words which please Him not, and Allah encompasses what they do.”²

9. As-Sunnah wash Shia³

The aim of this writer is not genuine criticism and true debate. Although his book is supposed to be refutation of Allamah Sayyid Mohsin Amin Amili’s (r.a.) *Husoonul Maniya*, it comprises of nothing, except nonsensical accusations, debased insults and foul language.

We do not have any option, except to expose some of his allegations:

¹ Surah Mujadila 58:2

² Surah Nisa 4:108

³ By Sayyid Muhammad Rashid Reza, editor of ‘Al-Manar’.

1. He has mentioned some beliefs of the Shia, all of which are false¹, like Shia talk ill of all companions of Prophet. That except for some few companions, they regard all apostates. They believe that divine revelation comes to their Imams. The Imams are in control of their death. They say that Quran is distorted and verses have been deleted from it. They say that when in any gathering, the Awaited Imam is mentioned, he attends that gathering, and therefore they rise up as a mark of respect.² They deny numerous fundamentals of faith.

Allamah Amini says: Yes, Shia do not regard all companions of Prophet honest, and only say what the Quran says about them. Soon we would discuss this in the evaluation of *As-Sara Bainal Islam wal Wathniya*.³ As for the other points mentioned above; all of them are false allegations and unfounded claims.

2. Then he mentions a very regretful and inappropriate thing:⁴

“Statements of Sayyid Mohsin Amili regarding Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*), are sufficient to prove the deviation of Shia. They have another Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*), called *Mutah-e-Dauri*; and they have reports extolling it. *Mutah-e-Dauri* is that a number of people marry one woman: in such manner that she is in company of one of them from dawn to sunrise, from sunrise till midday with next one, from midday till afternoon with the third, from afternoon till sunset with the fourth; and from sunset till night with the fifth; from night till midnight with the sixth and from midnight till the next morning with the seventh. And naming this kind of marriage as the strong castle by someone, who regards it lawful, is neither unlikely nor a new thing.”

Attributing Dauri marriage is blatant allegation against Shia, which makes one shudder, which infuriates and creates enmities to them. When he makes this allegation, he should provide proofs of his claim from any Shia source. Should have at least mentioned some of their own books, which attribute this to the Shia; but the fact is that he has nothing to present as evidence, except his heart, which is a victim of Satanic instigations.

As from what he thinks that the respected personality of Sayyid Mohsin Amin Amili, author of *Al-Husunul Maniyya*, regards ‘*Mutah-e-Dauri*’ as lawful; we ask him in which of his books has he approved this?

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ جَاءُوا بِالْأَفْوَى عُصْبَةٌ مِّنْكُمْ لَا تَحْسِبُوهُ شَرَّا لَّكُمْ بَلْ هُوَ خَيْرٌ

¹ As-Sunnah wash Shia, 64-65.

² Standing up of the Shia when pronouncing the name of Imam Zamana (a.t.f.s.), is not as Alusi thinks that it is due to his presence there. It is narrated that Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) and Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) used to stand up when the Imam was mentioned, whereas he was not even born at that time. It was only as a mark of respect. Like the standing up of Ahle Sunnat when the name of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is mentioned. As mentioned in *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 1:90 [1/84].

³ *Barguzida Jaame’ Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 349 & 350.

⁴ As- Sunnah wash Shia, 65-66.

لَكُمْ طِلْكُلٌ امْرِئٌ مِّنْهُمْ مَا اكْتَسَبَ مِنَ الْإِثْمِ وَالَّذِي تَوَلَّ كَبُرَةٌ مِّنْهُمْ
لَهُ عَذَابٌ عَظِيمٌ ①

“Surely they who concocted the lie are a party from among you. Do not regard it an evil to you; nay, it is good for you. Every man of them shall have what he has earned of sin; and (as for) him who took upon himself the main part thereof, he shall have a grievous chastisement.”¹

10. As-Sara Bainal Islam wal Wathniya²

Perhaps the title of book [Islam and idolatry compared], itself is a clear indication of the debased nature of the author.

His first crime on all Muslims is that he has named a great sect of Muslims, whose number reaches to millions, as idol worshippers. Among whom there are leaders, scholars, exegetes and Huffaz of Quran, and at the forefront of whom are the righteous companions.

Would such naming leave any affection between Muslims? Would it leave unity and cooperation between them? Would any friendship and amity remain among them? Can unity be achieved through such words? These are the seeds sown to create enmity and discord in society.

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ الشَّيْطَنُ أَنْ يُتَّقِّعَ بِيَنْكُمُ الْعَدَاوَةُ وَالبغْضُ

“The Shaitan only desires to cause enmity and hatred to spring in your midst.”³

لَا تَتَّبِعُوا خُطُوَّتَ الشَّيْطَنِ وَمَنْ يَتَّبِعُ خُطُوَّتَ الشَّيْطَنِ فَإِنَّهُ يَأْمُرُ
بِالْفَحْشَاءِ وَالْمُنْكَرِ

“Do not follow the footsteps of the Shaitan, and whoever follows the footsteps of the Shaitan, then surely he bids the doing of indecency and evil.”⁴

There are numerous acidic statements, invalid accusations and meaningless claims mentioned in this book of more than 1600 pages. The following are some examples from it:

1. First objection

He says: “Shia regard Ali and his descendants same as what Christians believe about Isa Ibne Maryam, like believing in his being God incarnate, his

¹ Surah Nur 24:11

² By Abdullah Ali Qaseemi of Cairo.

³ Surah Maida 5:91

⁴ Surah Nur 24:21

miracles, seeking help from him in hardships and taking refuge in him due to fear or hope. One, who has seen the Shia doing with regard to Ali, Husain and other members of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) in Najaf, Kerbala and other places will vouch for these statements as words are incapable to describe the acts this group performs at these places; from this aspect they have always been the worst enemies of monotheism and would be as such.”¹

Reply to first objection

As for transmigration of souls, it is not a Shia belief. Shia books are full of statements believing in apostasy of those, who believe in such things; and all Shia jurisprudential books comprising of rules of impurity declare that food left by them is ritually impure.

As for sacredness and miracle that is definitely not extremism; because sacredness comprises of purity of birth and purity of soul from sins and purity of essence from lowliness and ill-fame which is the requirement of divine appointed Imamate; it is a necessary condition for their Caliphate² same as the condition of prophethood of Prophet.

As for miracles: they prove the claim and exhaust the proof and basically, one who claims to have some connection with the supernatural, whether Prophet or Imam, should possess miracles. The miracle of the Imam is in fact a miracle of prophethood, who appointed him as his successor in religion and the nobility is for the Imam.

On the basis of the law of divine grace³ it is upto Allah, the Mighty and High that in order to establish proof, He should prove the veracity of Prophet or Imam so that people may believe him and follow God. And that they keep away from His disobedience, similar to the duties obligatory on a claimant of prophethood. Just as it is necessary that false claim of claimants of prophethood should be rebutted as is narrated about Musailima and his like.

In scholastic theology, the proof of miracles of divine saints is among established principles. There is no option, but to accept evidences that philosophers have brought for it. Now that miracles are proved for divine personalities, why its evidence to prove their claim should be regarded as exaggeration? Whereas Ahle Sunnat books are full of the miracles of divine personalities as they admit to the miracles of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

As for seeking help and refuge from Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and other issues, which indicate this is nothing more than seeking their mediation for divine proximity and making them as means for fulfillment of needs from Allah. It is due to their position near Allah, because they are noble and selected servants of God, and not

¹ As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 1:19.

² That is Imamate approved by Allah and the Prophet.

³ Divine grace is something, which makes one proximate to the obedience of God and Paradise and which takes him away from disobedience of God and Hell.

because their divine being is itself having independent effect. On the contrary, it is because they reached this lofty position are means between God and His creatures.

Just as is customary in every man, who is proximate to a great court: through whom they seek proximity to that great one. And this is an absolute law, effective regarding all holy personalities, although the rank of their proximity is different. And all this is according to belief of Shia that there is no effective one, except Allah, the Mighty and the High in the world of creation.

Ziyarat in forms of visiting the holy tombs is nothing, but seeking of mediation.¹ Now what contradiction does this act have with divine monotheism? What enmity do they have with monotheism and people of monotheism?

فَذَرْهُمْ وَمَا يَفْتَرُونَ ﴿٢٣﴾

“Therefore leave them and that which they forge.”²

إِنَّمَا يَفْتَرُ الْكَذِبَ الَّذِينَ لَا يُؤْمِنُونَ بِآيَاتِ اللَّهِ وَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الْكُنْجُونَ ﴿٢٤﴾

“Only they forge the lie who do not believe in Allah’s communications, and these are the liars.”³

2. Second objection

He says: “The Shia, following the Mutazila, deny the possibility of seeing God on Judgment Day, His qualities and His creatorship and that He is the creator of acts of people. Whereas scholars of traditions, Sunnah and authors of books, like the four imams believe that Almighty Allah is the creator of everything – even the acts of human beings and also that it would be possible to see God on Judgment Day.

It is amazing that Shia do not ascribe to these beliefs due to the fear of similitude (*Tash-beeh*), whereas they believe in similitude (*Tash-beeh*) and incarnation of God into human beings and describe God with defective qualities. That is why Ahle Sunnat regard Shia and Mutazila as heretics and deviant.”⁴

Reply to second objection

This man, Qaseemi, has followed Ibne Taymiyyah and his student, Ibne Qayyim regarding the being of God and His qualities, because as Zarqani Maliki has mentioned in the book of *Sharah Mawahib*,⁵ the views of those two regarding qualities of God is to prove corporeality.

He also says: “Manawi has said that the two of them are definitely heretics.” In spite of that Qaseemi has regarded them noble, argues in their favor and

¹ *Barguzida Jaame’ Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 237-239.

² Surah Anaam 6:112

³ Surah Nahl 16:105

⁴ As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 1:68.

⁵ *Sharah Mawahib*, 5:12.

accepts them. He has issued many statements about them. We did not at present aim to refute this false viewpoint and instead ask the readers to refer to books of scholastic theology; what is important for us is to inform the readers of his falsehoods and allegations against Shia.

Indeed, the Shia, in denying the possibility of seeing God and Judgment Day are not followers of Mutazila; on the contrary the Shia follow this fact, which is clear from texts as well as reason. The Shia are away from imagined beliefs like incarnation of soul, similitude of God, describing God with defective qualities and they deny the negative qualities of God.

On the contrary, all Shia regard a believer in these things to be infidels as is clear from modern and ancient Shia books of scholastic theology. Qaseemi cannot bring any evidence of his allegations. I swear by my life, if he has any evidence, he would have definitely mentioned it.

Yes, the Shia deny that qualities of Almighty Allah are other than His being and they don't believe that qualities are same His being, and they do not believe in multiplicity of origin.

As for the acts of human beings: If it implies that acts of human beings are originally created by God, it would be necessary that promise and threats and rewards and punishment of God, all should be useless, because punishing for a sin that one has been compelled to commit by God is wrong. This is one of the most difficult issues of scholastic theology and lot of discussion has gone into this, and one, who says that the acts of human beings are created by God, has in fact, unknowingly attributed wrong to God. The imagined consensus of Qaseemi is of no use before established evidences.

As for the wrong attribution of Shia to Mutazila is an old habit of Ahle Sunnat, which is clear to all.¹

3. Third objection

He says regarding Shia beliefs: “Among their beliefs is that Hell fire is unlawful upon the whole progeny of Prophet and that all of them are immaculate. The author of *Minhajus Shariah* says in part two of his book that Almighty Allah prohibited Hellfire for all descendants of Fatima, daughter of Prophet. From them whoever is without infallibility and he commits sins once in a while: firstly before his/her death Almighty Allah will give the good sense to repent and secondly: on Judgment Day they would get intercession.”

Reply to third objection

The Shia have ascribed infallibility only to the twelve Caliphs of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), who are from his family, in addition to the beloved daughter of Prophet on the basis of the verse of purification. In addition, this supported by

¹ The author has used an Arabic proverb over here. It is used for one who repeats the habits of the past people and who acts according to their behavior. *Mojamul Amthal*, No, 1933; *Lesaanul Arab*, 12/177.

other widely narrated traditions and reason.

All Shia and their scholars did not believe as such and if there is a definite statement regarding this, it should be attributed to that particular persons and that's all. In spite of the fact, other than Ahle Bayt (a.s.), there are some holy souls, who never committed sins, in spite of that Shia do not regard them infallible.

However, according to the author of *Minhajus Shariah*, there is no hint to infallibility; on the contrary it clarifies the opposite; because statement of his proves that among them are persons, who were not infallible and who commit sins; but before death, they would get the good sense of repenting and on Judgment Day also, they would be in need of intercession and they will get intercession.

It is clear that one, who commits sins and then gets divine sense for repenting, and then gets salvation through intercession, will not be called infallible and this is the distinctive quality of every believer that he makes up for his past acts through repentance.

But special distinction the members of holy progeny have is that they create repentance in the present. Qastalani in *Mawahib*¹ and Zarqani in its gloss² say:

“It is narrated from Ibne Masud directly that Fatima was named as Fatima according to inspiration from Almighty Allah to His Messenger, although she was born before prophethood and if it had been after that, perhaps a divine revelation would have been received, because Almighty Allah has protected her.

The term of ‘Fatam’ is from the root: F-T-M meaning of being prohibited. Like in the sentence of weaning a child; it is from the same root. The statement that Hell fire is prohibited from my progeny. However, in case of Fatima and her two sons, it is absolutely prohibited. But others would not remain in Hell forever. Therefore, it is possible that some of them would enter the fire for expurgation; so this report gives glad tidings to followers of Aale Muhammad (a.s.) that they would die on Islam and their hereafter would be good and none of them would leave the world on disbelief.

This is like Samhudi's statement regarding the report of those, who die in Medina, since the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) would intercede for all those, who die Muslims. Another meaning of this tradition is that for the respect of Fatima and her father Almighty Allah intends giving salvation to the sinners from her descendants. Or it implies that Allah would give them good sense of repenting and He accepts their repentance.”

Hafiz Damishqi – that is Ibne Asakir – has also mentioned this tradition.³

Ghassani⁴ and Khatib¹ say: “Unknown persons are present in this report and

¹ Mawahib Liduniya, [2:64].

² Sharhul Mawahib, 3:203.

³ Tareekh Medinatul Damishq [5:46; and in the Biography of Imam Husain (a.s.), No. 174].

⁴ Mojamush Shuyukh [Pg. 359, No. 344].

they have narrated without chains of narrators. Fatima (s.a.) is named as Fatima, because Almighty Allah saved her and her followers from Hellfire and in this report, there is a general glad tiding to all Muslims, who are devoted to Fatima.”

Hafiz Damishqi has narrated through his chains from Imam Ali (a.s.) that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to Fatima (r.a.):

“Fatima, do you know why you are named as Fatima?” Ali (a.s.) asked: “Why?” His Eminence replied: “Because on Judgment Day Allah, the Mighty and Sublime has prohibited Hell fire for her and her descendants.”

Can Qaseemi still claim that Shia have issued a statement, which senior members of the community have not issued? Or they have narrated a tradition, which his scholars have not narrated? Or they issued a statement, which is against fundamentals of Islam? Can he blame Ibne Hajar, Zarqani, and their like from the senior scholars of his school, who are having the same opinion as that of Shia? Can he blame them from regarding the infallibility of the progeny of Fatima? Can he attack them as he is attacking the Shia?

It is nothing new that Allah, the Mighty and the High should have made some people to excel others and keep them away from sins; or that He should bestow them the good sense of repenting for their sins and after all this make them eligible for intercession.

This is not in any way contradictory to principles of faith, because divine mercy precedes divine anger and it encompasses everything. This statement, which is supported by other texts, is nothing newer than belief in justice of companions, whereas Almighty Allah says in Quran in a large number of verses: in which some are declared as hypocrites and others are said to be apostates.

Don't forget reports mentioned in Sihah and Masanid books.

A report of *Saheeh Bukhari* says: “Lo! Some men from my followers will be brought and then (the angels) will drive them to the left side (Hell-Fire). I will say. My Lord! (They are) my companions!” Then a reply will come (from Almighty), ‘You do not know what they did after you.’ I will say as the pious slave (the Prophet Jesus) said: And I was a witness over them while I dwelt amongst them. When You took me up. You were the Watcher over them and You are a Witness to all things.’ (5:117) Then it will be said, “These people continued to be apostates since you left them.”

It is mentioned in another *Saheeh*: I would say: “They are my companions.” I would be told: “You don't know what they did after you!”

Moreover, you know well what disputes appeared among companions: and what enmities it created, malice, condemning each other and fighting among themselves and this definitely takes one party beyond the pale of decency. And keep aside the sins, which some companions committed, and mischief and corruption, which they created! Now, when belief in decency of all companions

¹ *Tareekh Baghdad* [12/331, No. 6772].

according to him and his community, should be followed by condemnation and ridicule, then what doubt is there in belief of that precedence, which is the practice of Almighty Allah with regard to His servants?

فَلَنْ تَجِدَ لِسُنْتَ اللَّهِ تَبَّعِيلًا

“For you shall not find any alteration in the course of Allah.”¹

4. Fourth objection

He says: “Among the wrong beliefs of Shia is that on the day of thirst in Qiyamat, Ali would drive away his enemies from the Pool and provide drinks to his followers. They also believe that he is the distributor of Hell fire and the Hell fire is under his command and he can bring out anyone he likes from it.”²

Reply to fourth objection

Previously, we mentioned the authorities of this report³ and stated that most of them have testified to its veracity and remaining scholar say that it is a good tradition. Thus, this statement is not baseless and belief in it is not restricted to Shia; on the contrary, Ahle Sunnat scholars also believe this.

But Qaseemi due to his ignorance about or malice against the family of prophethood, regards it to be among the calamities of Shia. The second tradition, also, like the first, is the most beautiful and well known excellence in view of Muslims.

Abu Ishaq bin Dizyal (d. 280/281 A.H.) has narrated from Amash, from Moosa bin Tarif from Abaya that he heard from Ali (a.s.):

“On Judgment Day, I would be the distributor of Hell fire. I would say: Take this one and leave that one.”

It is mentioned by Ibne Abil Hadeed in his *Sharh*,⁴ Hafiz Ibne Asakir in his *Tarikh*⁵ and Hafiz Abu Bakr, Khatib Baghdadi; Imam Ahmad was also asked regarding it. Muhammad bin Mansur Tusi said:

“We were with Ahmad bin Hanbal, when a person asked: O Aba Abdullah, what is your view regarding the tradition that Ali said: I am the distributor of Hell fire? He replied: Why do you deny this tradition? Is it not that it is narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said to Ali (a.s.): None would love you, except the believer and none would hate you, except the hypocrite? I said: Yes. He asked: What is the abode of the believers? I replied: Paradise. He asked: What is the abode of hypocrites? I replied: In Hell fire. He said: Then Ali is the distributor of Hell fire.”

¹ Surah Fatir 35:43

² As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 2:21.

³ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 220-221.

⁴ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 1:200 [2/260, Sermon 35].

⁵ *Tareekh Medina Damishq* [12/271 and in the biography of Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), No. 761].

The above incident is mentioned in the book of *Tabaqat Ashab Ahmad* and Hafiz Ganji has narrated it from him in his *Kifaya*.¹ Alas, if Qaseemi was aware of the statement of his Imam, Ahmad Ibne Hanbal.

5. Fifth objection

He says: “There are numerous reports in Shia books that the Awaited (*Montazar*) Imam would destroy all Masjids and therefore Shia are enemies of all Masjids. Therefore, if one surveys their areas, one would see very few Masjids.”²

Reply to fifth objection

The Awaited Divine Proof (*Hujjat Montazar*) is the chief of those, who believe in Allah and Judgment Day and who populate the Masjids. Then how can he demolish them? And Shia, who attribute this to him are not yet born.

As for what he has said regarding Shia areas, I don’t know whether he has ever gone to these places and mentioned this point or just alleged it. In either case, he has become eligible for making false allegations. One, who has visited Shia areas from developed cities to villages and hamlets, would have definitely seen small and large Masjids along with the amenities, which go along with them. They would have also seen Friday and congregation prayers being held there.

6. Sixth objection

He says: “Can the Shia produce a word from Quran to support their belief regarding transmigration of souls and incarnation of God into their Imams, belief of return (*Rajat*), infallibility of Imams, according precedence to Ali over Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman? Or can the Shia provide evidences that Ali is present among clouds or that lightning is the smile of Ali and thunder is his call?”³

Reply to sixth objection

If this man ponders over the statements of Almighty Allah:

ما يلْفِظُ مِنْ قَوْلٍ إِلَّا لَدَيْهِ رَقِيبٌ عَتِيدٌ^④

“He utters not a word but there is by him a watcher at hand.”⁴

Or the promise of God to punish those, who make false allegations:

هَمَّازٌ مَّشَّاءٌ بِنَمِيمٍ^⑤

“Defamer, going about with slander.”⁵

¹ *Kifayatut Talib*, 22 [72, Chap. 3].

² As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 2:23.

³ As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 1:72.

⁴ Surah Qaf 50:18

⁵ Surah Qalam 68:11

تَنَزَّلُ عَلَى كُلِّ أَفَّالِ أَثِيمٍ ﴿٢﴾

“They descend upon every lying, sinful one.”¹

وَيُلْلِ كُلِّ أَفَّالِ أَثِيمٍ ﴿٣﴾

“Woe to every sinful liar.”²

Or if he testifies to the promise of chastisement by Almighty Allah for those who slander, he would never slander the Shia and in reply to Shaitan, he would ask: In which period have Shia Imamiyah believed in transmigration of soul and incarnation of God into persons of the Imams? Who has faith in the presence of Ali in cloud, that they should need to prove this from Quran? Yes, Ali is in the clouds is statement of Shia in following the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in a meaning as was mentioned before.³ Finally some people have distorted the report in order to defame Shia.

As for the Shia belief regarding the Return (*Rajat*), it is based on Holy Quran. But those, who are blind in bigotry are such they are unable to see anything even in Quran. Thus, it is necessary to refer to books of Imamiyah. Some scholars have written separate books on this subject. Alas, if he had referred to some of them.

The Quran, in addition to Return (*Rajat*), also proves infallibility and it is the verse of purification, which proves the infallibility of some infallibles and the infallibility of the rest of them is also proved due to inclusion. The report which Ahmad bin Hanbal has mentioned regarding the verse is sufficient to prove this.⁴

Why should the Quran not prefer Ali (a.s.) over others, whereas Almighty Allah deemed his Mastership (*Wilayat*) equal to Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Allah and Prophet? When He says:

إِنَّمَا وَلِيْكُمُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَالَّذِينَ أَمْنُوا إِنَّمَا يُقِيمُونَ الصَّلَاةَ وَيُؤْتُونَ
الزَّكُوَةَ وَهُمْ رَكُونُ ﴿٤﴾

“Only Allah is your Guardian and His Apostle and those who believe, those who keep up prayers and pay the poor-rate while they bow.”⁵

And before that, we said:⁶ Jurists, tradition scholars and scholastic

¹ Surah Shoara 26:222

² Surah Jaaseyah 45:7

³ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 82-83.

⁴ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:331, 3:285, 4:107, 6:296, 298, 304 & 323 [1/544, H. 3052 & 4/202, H. 13626; 5/79, H. 16540, 7/421, H. 26000, Pg. 423, H. 26010, Pg. 431, H. 26057, Pg. 455, H. 26206].

⁵ Surah Maidah 5:55

⁶ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 155.

theologians have consensus that this verse was revealed about Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).

If the researcher is decent, he would find tens of verses in Quran revealed about Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and which prove his excellence over others. It is nothing new or amazing, as according to Quran Ali is the self of Prophet. Allah perfected His religion and completed His favor through his Mastership (*Wilayat*) and chose for us the religion of Islam.

We turn back the question on Qaseemi saying whether he and those having same views as him, can produce one letter from Quran to prove the precedence of Abu Bakr, Umar and Uthman over Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), the beloved one (*Wali*) of Allah?

7. Seventh objection

He says: “Time bound marriages among the Shia are of different types: The short and long. One is that man and woman decide to marry upon some money, food, cloth, no matter if it is less, and in exchange the woman stays with the man for day or more or less, according to agreement of the two parties and fulfills the desire of man. After that period each of them go their ways. As if they were never together and do not even recognize each other. And this is the simplest form of time-bound marriages among them. Another form, which is much worse, is known as *Mutah-e-Dauri*.

Mutah-e-Dauri is that a number of people marry one woman: in such manner that she is in company of one of them from dawn to sunrise, from sunrise till midday with next one, from midday till afternoon with the third, from afternoon till sunset with the fourth; and from sunset till night with the fifth; from night till midnight with the sixth and from midnight till the next morning with the seventh.

They believe this act to be sanctioned by the religion of God and worthy of divine rewards, whereas this is one of the worst prohibited things.”¹

Reply to seventh objection

Among the Shia, *Mutah* and *Seegha* is just as the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) introduced and fixed its rules; and which was lawful during lifetime of Prophet and after him till Umar bin Khattab prohibited it. After that also, it was regarded as lawful by some people, who did not consider that the orders of Umar can override commands of Quran and Prophet.

Muslim sects have consensus on principles and laws of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) and all this is mentioned in their books. There is no contradiction among them at all and these are the rules:

1. Compensation.
2. Period

¹ As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 1:119.

3. Formula of marriage: comprising offer and acceptance.
4. Separation at the end of the period or if the man condones the remaining period.
5. To observe the waiting period, whether a slave girl or a free woman; whether she is pregnant or not pregnant.
6. Spouses do not inherit each other.

Ahle Sunnat and Shia, both have clarified these rules. No other Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) is allowed among Shia, other than the one mentioned above and Shia do not know of any other Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*). There is no major *Mutah* and minor *Mutah*: all these are false allegations, because no jurist or layman of Shia since the origin of Islam till present age of falsehood and allegation – the period of Qaseemi – nor in the past centuries.

الَّذِينَ يُجَادِلُونَ فِي أَيْتِ اللَّهِ بِغَيْرِ سُلْطَنٍ أَتَهُمْ طَّاغُوتٌ مَّقْتَأْلٌ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ وَعِنْدَ
الَّذِينَ أَمْنُوا طَّاغِلٌ كَذِيلٌ يَطْبَعُ اللَّهُ عَلَى كُلِّ قَلْبٍ مُّتَكَبِّرٍ جَبَارٌ ⑩

“Those who dispute concerning the communications of Allah without any authority that He has given them; greatly hated is it by Allah and by those who believe. Thus does Allah set a seal over the heart of every proud, haughty one.”¹

11. Al-Washiya fee Naqde Aqaidush Shia²

I preferred not to mention the title of this book and wished that one knew about it at all, because among all the books, it is the most disgraceful. But its publication made it obligatory for me to inform the public about the character of its author and also present some samples of his writings.

Every page of this book is a source of shame for Islamic Ummah and more so for those of the same view! I don't know what should I write about the book of one, who has deserted the practice of Prophet and Quran, because he laid the foundation of issuing commands, making condemnations, talking nonsense and weakening, abusing and presenting disgraceful comparisons; and to play with Book of Allah and interpret it according to his corrupted view and deficient mind in any way he likes.

As if Quran is revealed today and before him, no one has understood it and no one has expressed any opinion about it. No book is compiled about this and no traditions have come down about it. As if Islam has just arrived as a new religion without being accompanied by any book or literature.

What is the value of an ignorant man and his book? One, who regards the Ummah in all specialties, merits and perfections obtained from messengership in

¹ Surah Ghafir 40:35

² By Moosa Jarullah.

most special of the specialties to be same prophethood; who regards them to be partners of Prophet and messengership of Ummah in all senses of messengership of Prophet and thinks that Surah Qadr is messengership of Ummah connected to messengership of Prophet without any gap. And by the verse:

لَقَدْ جَاءَكُمْ رَسُولٌ مِّنْ أَنفُسِكُمْ

“Certainly an Apostle has come to you from among yourselves.”¹

And the verse:

مُحَمَّدٌ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ وَالَّذِينَ مَعَهُ أَشَدُّ أَعْمَالِ الْكُفَّارِ رَحْمَانٌ بِنَفْسِهِمْ

“Muhammad is the Apostle of Allah, and those with him are firm of heart against the unbelievers, compassionate among themselves.”²

...proves the messengership to the Ummah.

Allamah Shaykh Mahdi Hajjar Najafi, residing at Mauqil³ endeavored much to refute this author.

If this man had not mentioned in his book anything, except fictional stories regarding the Ummah and no other falsehood, it would have been sufficient to prove his ignorance and ill fame. Following are some of the examples:

1. First objection

He says: “Like the Prophet, the Islamic Ummah is infallible, in the sense that in obtaining, retaining, propagation, and fulfillment of message, whatever message the Prophet delivered, they also memorized it like the Prophet and whatever the Prophet propagated, they also like Prophet, propagated. And it learnt and propagated all Islamic teachings. Islamic Ummah is more knowledgeable of Quran and Sunnah than all the imams, and today awareness and knowledge about Quran and Sunnah has reached to such a level that is more than the knowledge of Ali and his descendants. Among the great divine favor on the Prophet and then the Ummah is that a large number of their descendants have reached to the level of more than the imams and companions of Prophet.

In every circumstances that arises, this Ummah is much more knowledgeable than them, because it is the inheritor of knowledge of Prophet. I don't deny the belief of Shia regarding infallibility of the Imams, on the contrary I refute their claim that Islam was and is always deficient and till Judgment Day; that it is needful of infallible Imams, whereas Ummah is nearer to infallibility and guidance than every infallible Imam and it is a mere claim to say that Imams are infallible, however infallibility of Ummah is obvious and clear through testimony

¹ Surah Taubah 9:128

² Surah Fath 48:29

³ He is a poet of the fourteenth century, whose poems and account will be mentioned later.

of Quran. And people, after the Prophet, due to maturity of wisdom, are greater than them and they cannot remain debased forever.”

Reply to first objection

All this is nothing more than conjecture and nonsense, which is very unlikely from a wise scholar, what to say about one, who regards himself as a jurist. As if this man is talking in his dreams.

Is there no one, who can ask him: If Islamic Ummah is infallible and Hafiz of all principles and laws of religion, and Ummah in every period, conveys them to next generation without any decrease and increase and did not forget any issue or did not remain ignorant of them, what is the meaning of the statement that cognition of Ummah is more than that of the Imam and their being near to guidance? Are the Imams in his view, out of Islamic Ummah and are not protectors of religion? Is infallibility and propagation of religion not present in them?

According to his view, there should be no ignorant person in the Ummah, whereas the fact is that ignorant ones of Islamic Ummah have filled all Muslim countries of the world and their acts and statement testify to their ignorance. Also, no difference should appear in their religious issues, while the fact is that difference are present from the time of the companions till date as is clear to everyone.

Does he exclude Ali and his sons from Islamic Ummah that he says that the knowledge of Ummah is more and perfect than that of Ali and his sons?

And when did the knowledge of Ummah become so strong that he should deliver such a definite verdict?

Perhaps, I can say: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is more aware of the giver of this verdict and more aware of their knowledge, wisdom and insight; that he left two heavy things: Book of Allah and his progeny, that is the Holy Imams (a.s.) for guidance of Ummah after himself and said:

“As long as you remain attached to them, you would never be misguided after me, because they would never separate from each other till they come to me at the Pool of Kauthar.”

As for limiting guidance to attachment with those two and following their statements till Judgment Day, it informs us that they are having such sciences and awareness, which the Ummah lacks. And that it is not possible for the Ummah to be free of error, and veils of unseen are not removed for it. So much so that it can make them needless of guidance in times of perplexity. And according to this clear traditional report the progeny, in knowledge and guidance, equals Quran. They are knowers of secrets of Quran.

If Ummah or some of them had been like the Holy Imams (a.s.) in intelligence – what to say being more learned than them – definitely this clear tradition would have been a useless statement. Also, if the knowledge of Ummah

today is more than the knowledge of Ali and his sons, as this poor man has imagined – then how the Prophet was not aware of that and as if, without recognizing the Ummah, he said:

“Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) is the most knowledgeable person of my Ummah after me.”¹

How did he declare Ali (a.s.) as the vessel of his knowledge and gate of the city of his knowledge?

How can Hafiz Nishapuri, on the basis of consensus of Ummah, decide that Ali is alone the heir of the knowledge of Prophet?

These statements imply that the Ummah should also be wiser and knowledgeable than the Prophet; because Ali is the heir of all the sciences of Prophet and Ummah is more knowledgeable than Ali (a.s.), thus Ummah is more knowledgeable than Prophet!

Also, how can the Prophet order his Ummah to obey his Ahle Bayt (a.s.) after him, and introduces them saying: “They are created from my essence and they are bestowed with my understanding and knowledge.”²

If people had reached perfection and they are needless of successorship of an infallible Imam till Judgment Day, as this foolish man thinks, then why the Ummah delayed the funeral of the Prophet for three days? It is clearly mentioned in Ahle Sunnat books that the funeral of Prophet was delayed, because people were in pursuit of something of greater importance, which was choosing of a Caliph.²

The man, who thinks that people are needless of an infallible Imam till Judgment Day, how can he imagine the severe need of people of that time for a non-infallible imam?

2. Second objection

Summary of his statements about Fixed-time marriage (Mutah)

Mutah is one of the remnants of the period of Ignorance and it was not a Islamic rule; therefore its abrogation was not abrogation of an Islamic rule; it was abrogation of a remnant of the period of Ignorance.

There is consensus on prohibition of *Mutah* and verses of Quran were revealed justifying it. In books of other than Shia, no one has ever mentioned that the verse of:

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْعَمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَأُتُوهُنَّ أُجُورُهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by, give them their dowries.”³

¹ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg 151 and 152.

² Ref: *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 5 [Pg. 7].

³ Surah Nisa 4:24

...was revealed about *Mutah*.

Except for an ignorant and false claimant no one would make such a claim. Shia books attribute this statement to Baqir and Sadiq, which shows that the chains of narrators of this traditional report are fabricated, otherwise Baqir and Sadiq were ignorant.¹

Reply to second objection

This is a chain of crimes attributed to Quran, Islam and Sunnah; it is a denial of a command, which the Prophet promulgated and all past sects of Islam from companions and companions of companions and scholars have admitted to it. We have discussed this matter in a separated treatise as follows:

1. Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) in Quran

فَمَا أَسْتَهِنَّ تَعْتَمِدُ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَأُتُوهُنَّ أُجُورَهُنَّ فَرِيْضَةً طَ وَلَا جُنَاحَ عَلَيْكُمْ قِيمَةً
تَرَاضَيْتُمْ بِهِ مِنْ بَعْدِ الْفَرِيْضَةِ طَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ كَانَ عَلَيْهَا حَكِيمًا^{۩۴}

“Then as to those whom you profit by, give them their dowries as appointed; and there is no blame on you about what you mutually agree after what is appointed; surely Allah is Knowing, Wise.”²

In the most reliable sources of Quranic exegesis, it is mentioned that this verse was revealed about Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*)³. O people of discernment, are these books not points of reference for knowledge of Quran among Ahle Sunnat? Are they not prominent Ahle Sunnat scholars of Quranic exegesis?

What is the justification of his statement that: Neither the Quran mentions it nor is it mentioned in books of other than Shia? Can he dare to mention that same audacious statement regarding companions, companions of companions and Ahle Sunnat scholars that he issued against Imam Baqir and Imam Sadiq (a.s.)?

2. Rules of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) in Islam

We mentioned before⁴ that there are rules and laws for *Mutah*, which Islam has framed and during period of Ignorance, no such marriage existed and till date no one has claimed that Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) to be a type marriage of the period of ignorance.

Thus, the verdict of this man is of no value and a large number of books

¹ Al-Washiya fee Naqde Aqaidush Shia, 32:166.

² Surah Nisa 4:24

³ Ref: *Saheeh Bukhari* [4/1642, H. 4246]; *Saheeh Muslim* [3/71, H. 172, Kitabul Hajj]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:436 [5/603, H. 19406]; *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:200 [10/49 & 50]; *Tafseer Kashaf*, 1:360 [1/498]; *Al-Jamil Akhdamul Quran*, 5:130 [5/86]; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:140 [2/484].

⁴ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg 352 and 353.

contain detailed discussions about Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*).¹

3. Who was the first to prohibit Fixed-time marriage (Mutah)?

We have found twenty-five traditions in *Saheeh* and *Musnad* books, which inform us that Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) was lawful in Islamic law, and it was practiced during the period of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), reign of Abu Bakr and some part of Umar's reign. However, Umar, during the last part of his rule, prohibited it and it is well known that he was the first to have done this.²

4. Companions and companions of companions

Numerous companions and companions of companions, in spite of being aware of Umar's prohibition, considered it lawful and un-abrogated. They were persons, who commanded importance in community; among them were those, following whom is obligatory:

1. Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.).
2. Ibne Abbas, Habrul Ummah (intellectual of the Ummah).
3. Imran bin Husain Khuzai.
4. Jabir bin Abdullah Ansari.
5. Abdullah bin Masud Hazali.
6. Abdullah bin Umar Adawi.
7. Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan.
8. Abu Saeed Khudri Ansari.
9. Salma bin Umayyah Jamai.
10. Mabad bin Umayyah Jamai.
11. Zubair bin Awam Qarashi.
12. Hakam.
13. Khalid bin Muhajir Makhzumi.
14. Amr bin Hareeth Qarshi.
15. Ubayy bin Kaab Ansari.
16. Rabia bin Umayyah Thaqafi.
17. Saeed bin Jubair.
18. Tawus bin Yamani.

¹ Ref: *Saheeh Muslim* [3/194, H. 19, Kitabun Nikah]; *Ahkamul Quran*, Jassas 2:178 [2/146-148]; *Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran*, 5:132 [5/87]; *Sharh Saheeh Muslim*, Nawawi [9/181]; he has claimed that there is consensus on the mentioned rules. *Jaameul Ahadees*, Suyuti, 4:295 [6/422, H. 19685].

² It is necessary for researchers to refer to these sources: *Saheeh Bukhari*, [2/569, H. 1496]; *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:395-396 [3/193, 194, H. 15-17, Kitabun Nikah]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:436 & 3:356 [5/603 H. 19406 & 4/325, H. 14420]; *Muwattah*, Malik, 2:30 [2/542, H. 42]; *Jaameul Bayan*, Tabari, 5:9 [No. 4, H. 5/13]; *Ahkamul Quran*, Jassas 2:178 [2/152]; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:140 [2/486 & 487]; *Taareekhul Kholafa*, Suyuti, 93 [Pg. 128].

19. Ataa Abu Muhammad Yamani.

20. Siddi.

Ibne Hazm,¹ after stating the names of companions, who believed in legality of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*), says:

“From the companions of companions are: Tawus, Saeed bin Jubair and all the jurists of Mecca.”

Abu Umar says: “Companions of Ibne Abbas, whether Meccan or Medinan, all regard Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) legal.”

Qurtubi says in his *Tafseer*:² “Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) was customary among Meccans.”

In his *Tafseer*,³ Razi says under the commentary of the verse of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*):

“There is dispute whether the verse of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) was abrogated or not; many believe that it is abrogated, and some say that it is lawful and not abrogated.”

After quoting the tradition legalizing Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*), Abu Hayyan says:⁴ “A group of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and companions of companions regard it lawful.”

Allamah Amini says: In presence of these statements, what is the value of the claim of consensus of Ummah on unlawfulness of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) and its abrogation? And what is the basis of saying that only Imam Baqir and Imam Sadiq (a.s.) regarded it lawful?

Fifth discussion: regarding Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*)

Statements of Ahle Sunnat regarding Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) and its abrogation exceed twenty-two statements; these different statements contain numerous benefits and we leave it to the readers to derive their conclusions.

We don't have time to reply to absurd statements of this book, because every page of this book is full of nonsense and it shows that its author was remote from Islamic culture, unaware of Quran and traditions, without any intelligence and human qualities and he is a vulgar fellow; in spite of that he regards himself to be an Islamic jurist. If Islamic jurisprudence and jurists, and knowledge and scholars, and book and authors are as such, then we should say farewell to Islam.

Other fabricated books:⁵

12. Fajrul Islam

¹ *Al-Muhalli* [9/520, H. 1854].

² Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran, 5:132 [5/88].

³ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:200 [10/49].

⁴ *Al-Bahrul Muheet* [3/218].

⁵ If anyone wishes to learn about the falsehoods perpetrated in this book and calamities present in it, he should refer to *Al-Ghadeer*, 3:425-440.

13. Zuhoul Islam

14. Zuhru'l Islam

Ahmad Amin Misri has written these three books for a purpose known best to him and which we shall also know.

Every researcher will become aware what exaggerations he has made in it. Another thing is that one should not be fooled by these titles; they also, like the name of author – Amin (trustworthy) - do not live upto their names.

Some Shia researchers have pointed out his mistakes and false statements in their books¹ and the book of *Tahta Raiyatul Haq*² is sufficient for those in search of truth.

15. Book of *Daulat fee Rabual Sharqul Adna* by Muhammad Thabit Misri, professor of sociology in Madrasa Qubbe Thanawiya.

16. Book of *Aqidatash Shia* by the orientalist, Dwigth M. Ronaldson.

End of discussion regarding false and fabricated books.

¹ Great scholars like Sayyid Sharafuddin, Sayyid Amin, Kashiful Ghita.
² By Allamah Shaykh Abdullah Sabiti.

Poets of Ghadeer in the fourth century Hijri

15. Abul Hasan bin Tabataba Isfahani (d. 322 A.H.).
16. Abu Ja'far Ahmad bin Alawiya Isfahani (d. 320 A.H.).
17. Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Mafajja Misri (d. 327 A.H. approx).
18. Abul Qasim Ahmad bin Muhammad Sanobari (d. 334 A.H.)
19. Abul Qasim Ali bin Muhammad Tanukhi (d. 342 A.H.).
20. Abul Qasim Ali bin Ishaq Zahi (d. 352 A.H.).
21. Abu Faras Amirish Shuara Hamadani (d. 357 A.H.).
22. Abul Fatah Mahmood bin Muhammad Kashajam (d. 350/360 A.H.).
23. Abul Hasan Ali bin Abdullah Nashi Saghir (d. 365 A.H.).
24. Abu Abdulla Husain Bishnoi Qurtubi (d. after 380 A.H.).
25. Abul Qasim Wazir Sahib bin Ubbad (d. 385 A.H.).
26. Abul Hasan Ali Jauhari Jurjani.
27. Abu Abdulla bin Hajjaj Baghdadi (d. 391 A.H.).
28. Abul Abbas Wazir Ahmad Zabi (d. 398 A.H.).
29. Abu Hamid Ahmad bin Muhammad Antaki (d. 399 A.H.).
30. Abu Alaa Muhammad bin Ibrahim Sarawi.
31. Abu Muhammad Talha Ghassani Awni.
32. Abul Hasan Ali bin Hammad Abdi.
33. Abul Faraj bin Hindu Razi.
- [34. Ja'far bin Husain].
35. Abu Najib Shaddad Zahir Jazari¹ (d. 401 A.H.).

¹ His biography will be mentioned in the poets of the fifth century A.H.

15. Ibne Tabataba Isfahani

Died: 322 A.H.

واعمل بمكروهى بجهدك اوذر	يامن يسرلى العداوة ابدها
فيين يعاديني فلا تتحير	للله عندي عاده مشكورة
لابي غداه "غدير خم" فاحذر	انا واثق بدعاء جدي المصطفى
فيين يعادى او يوالى فاصبر	والله اسعدنا بارث دعائه

1. O those secretly inimical to me, make it evident and exhaust your efforts to earn my displeasure or leave this matter alone. 2. For Almighty Allah, in my view there is a good habit regarding those inimical to me, so don't be amazed. 3. I have confidence about the supplication of my ancestor, Mustafa, regarding my father on the day of Ghadeer Khum, so be careful. 4. Almighty Allah made us fortunate to inherit his prayer regarding those inimical or devoted to Ali (a.s.), so be patient.¹

Introduction to the poet

He was Abul Hasan Muhammad bin Ahmad bin (Muhammad bin Ahmad bin) Ibrahim Tabataba Ibne Ismail bin Ibrahim bin Hasan bin Imam Hasan bin Ali bin Abu Talib (s.a.), famous as Ibne Tabataba. He was a powerful scholar and an expert poet and was one of the teachers of literature.

Hamawi, in *Mojamul Odaba*² has mentioned him and says:

“He was a clever and sharp witted, he possessed a healthy mind and was famous for his righteousness, as mentioned in *Al-Majadi*³; he was born in Isfahan and according to *Ma-aahad Tansees*, he passed away there only in the year 322 A.H.”

16. Ibne Alawiya

Born: 212 A.H.

Died: 320 A.H. approx.

عبرى للحاظ سقيمه الانسان	ما بال عينك ثرثرة الاجفان
منه صلاة تعبد بحنان	صلى الله على ابن عم محمد
لم ننسها ماما دامت الملوان	وله اذا ذكر "الغدير" فضيله

¹ As is mentioned in *Thimarul Qulub* of Salabi, 511 [Pg. 637, No. 1068]. The poet has addressed this poem to Abu Ali Rustami.

² *Mo'jamul Odaba*, [17/143].

³ *Al-Majadi* fee Ansabut Talibiyyin [Pg. 74].

نزل الكتاب به من الدين	قام النبي له بشرح ولايه
منهم بعصيه كلى حنان	اذ قال بلغ ما امرت به وشق
علميا بفضل مقاله غران	فدعوا الصلاه جماعه واقامه
حقا ف قال: فذا الولى الثاني	نادى السنت وليكم: قالوا: بلى
ودعا الله على ذوى الخزلان	ودع الله ولمن اجاب بنصره
حسن ربيع الشيب والشيان	نادى ولم يك كاذبا بخ ابا
مولى انا شهم مع الذكران	اصبحت مولى البومنين جماعه
الله وعليه يتفقان	لمن الخلافه والوزاره هل هما
في حكم الايات مكتوبان	او ما هما في ماتلاه الها
ودعوا حديث فلانه وفلان	ادلو بحجتكم وقولوا قولكم
او تفهموا المقطع السلطان	هيئات ضل ضلالكم ان تهتدوا

1. Almighty Allah sends blessings on the cousin of Muhammad accompanied with mercy. 2. There was such an excellence for him on Ghadeer day when he was named that I can never forget it. 3. The Prophet stood up to announce his mastership, which was revealed in Quran. 4. When he said: Announce what you are commanded to and do not fear them, be certain of the protection of the Kind God. 5. Then call for prayer was announced and he mentioned Ali as the flag of guidance.¹ 6. He announced: Am I not your master? Yes, they replied, you are truly our master. He said: Then this is the second master. 7. He prayed for him and those, who help him. He prayed against those who would diminish his rank. 8. He called out while he was not a liar: Congratulations to you O Abul Hasan, O spring and source of hope of every elder and young. 9. From today you became the master of all male and female believers. 10. For whom is the Caliphate and vicegerency? Are these two reserved for anyone other than him? Did they have agreement on anyone else? 11. Was Caliphate and vicegerency not mentioned in clear verses, which Almighty Allah revealed for him? 12. Bring your evidence and show your proof and leave alone the statement of so and so man or woman. 13. You are involved in evil misguidance and it is unlikely that you will be guided.

Explanation

This is a part of Qasida Muhabbirah of Ibne Alawiya. This Qasida contains

¹ It is mentioned as such in *Ayanush Shia*, 3/24.

some important merits of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) narrated from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), which are used to prove his Imamate, which this poet has understood from the term of 'Maula' (master), whereas he is an incomparable littérateur and an outstanding poet. These lines prove the stand of Shia that the mastership of Ali (a.s.) is absolute.

Introduction to the poet

Abu Ja'far Ahmad bin Alawiya Isfahani Karani¹ was famous as Ibne Aswad. He is a Shia writer, whose name is mentioned repeatedly mentioned in dictionaries. He was an important scholar of traditions; great Imamiyah scholars have narrated traditions from him and have relied on him. His traditions are quoted in books like *Faqih*, *Tahzeeb*, *Kamil*, *Amali Saduq*, *Majalis Mufeed* and other books of Shia scholars. It is sufficient for his greatness that people of Qom, inspite of the fact that they criticize all writers, have considered him reliable.

Hamawi has mentioned in the first edition of *Mojamul Odba*:²

He was a lexicographer, possessed expertise in literature and composed fine verses.

He was born in 212 A.H. and passed away after 320 A.H.

17. Mufajja

Died: 327 A.H.

This poem has 160 couplets.

قُمْ ذَمِيَا إِلَى الْجَحِيمِ خَرِيَا	إِيَّاهَا الْلَّامِيَّ لِحَبِيْ عَلَيَا
مَذْوَدَا عَنِ الْهَدِيْ مَزْوِيَا	ابْخِيرَ الْأَنَامِ عَرَضَتْ لَازِلَتْ
وَفَطِيَا وَرَاضِعَا وَغَذِيَا	اَشْبَهَ الْأَنْبِيَاءَ كَهْلَاءِ وَزُولَهَا
شَرَحَ الْأَسْمَاءِ وَالْمَكَنَيَا	كَانَ فِي عِلْمِهِ كَأَدَمَ اَذْعَلَمَ
فِي الْفَلَكِ اَذْعَلَّ اَجْوَدِيَا	وَكَنُونَ حَنَاجِمَ الْهَلَكَ مِنْ سِيرَ
سَبْقَ الْحَاضِرِيْنَ وَالْبَدُوِيَا	وَعَلَى لِمَادِعَاهَا اَخْوَهَا
مَشْكُلَا عَنِ سَبِيلِهِ مَلُوِيَا	لَمْ يَكُنْ اَمْرَهُ بَدُوْحَاتٍ "خَمْ"
جَهَ كَنْتَ عَنْ سَوَاهِيْنَيَا	اَنْ عَهْدَ النَّبِيِّ فِي ثَقْلِيَّهَا
لَمْ يَكُنْ خَامِلًا هَنَاكَ دُنْيَا	نَصْبَ الْمُرْتَضِيِّ لِهِمْ فِي مَقَامِ

¹ According to Sarawi in *Tauzeehul Ishtibah*, [Pg. 36, No. 127 and in *Mojamul Muwahhid*, 1/98 and *Lughatnama*, 3/1222 it is mentioned as Allawiya].

² Mo'jamul Odaba, 2:3 [4/72].

علیاً قَائِمًا كَمَا صَدَعَ الْبَر
 قَالَ هَذَا مَوْلَیٌ لِّيْنَ كَنْتَ مُوْلَا
 وَعَادَ الَّذِي يَعَادِي الْوَصِيَا
 تَمَامًا دَجْنَهُ أَوْ دَجِيَا

1. O one, who condemns me for being devoted to Ali (a.s.): go to Hell as you deserve condemnation and are degraded. 2. Do you attack the best of creatures? You will always be away from guidance and you will be prohibited. 3. He is similar to the prophets during his youth as well as old age. And during infancy and as a grown up. 4. In his knowledge, he is like Adam when he was taught the explanation of the names and divine secrets. 5. He is like Nuh, who saved from destruction everyone who boarded the Ark, when it reached the top of Mt. Judi. 6. His story at Ghadeer Khum was not difficult and is not deviated from his path. 7. Indeed the promise of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) regarding the two heavy things and I am needless of anyone other than them. 8. He appointed Murtada at the position, which had no scope of any degraded or nameless character. 9. He handed him the standard and a sign: just as a full moon reappears from behind the clouds. 10. He said: This Ali is the master of one, whose master I am and he declared this aloud an openly. 11. O God, love those, who love him and help those, who help him and be inimical to one, who is inimical to his successor.

Explanation

This panegyric (*Qasida*) is famous as ‘Ashbah’. Hamawi has mentioned in the biography of Mufajjah that he has composed a Qasida in praise of Ali. He has taken traditions about excellence of Ali (a.s.) and composed Qasida on those issues. This Qasida comprises of 160 verses.

In *Mojamul Odba*,¹ Hamawi says at the beginning of his biography:

“He has written a Qasida named ‘Ashbah’ in which he has extolled Ali.”

Then he writes:²

“He has written a Qasida, which comprises of similarities of Ali (a.s.) with prophets; and from this aspect it is called as ‘Zaatul Ashbah’ (having similarities), which Abdul Razzaq narrated from Muammar from Zuhri from Saeed bin Musayyab from Abu Huraira, who says: The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) declared among the companions:

“If you want to see Adam in his knowledge, Nuh in his valor, Ibrahim in his morals, Moosa in his secret prayers, Isa in his practice³ and Muhammad in his conduct, manners and forbearance. Thus look at the one who is approaching.”

People looked up and did not see anyone other than Ali Ibne Abi Talib. Mufajjah has versified this incident in his poem.

¹ Mo’jamul Odaba, 17:191.

² Mo’jamul Odaba, 17:200.

³ The original source mentions: ‘Fee Sunnah’ (in Sunnah).

Tradition of ‘Ashbah’

This tradition, which Hamawi has mentioned in *Mojamul Odba* quoting from *Tarikh Ibne Bushran*, is accepted by Shia as well as Ahle Sunnat, although their words are different. Some of them are as follows:

1. Ahmad, the founder of Hanbali school of jurisprudence, has quoted from Abdur Razzaq as follows: “One who likes to see Adam in his knowledge, Nuh in his perceptiveness, Ibrahim in his morals, Moosa in his whispered prayers, Isa in his practice and Muhammad in his perfections, should look at this one, who is approaching.” People looked up and saw Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) ambling towards them.¹

2. Hafiz Ahmad bin Muhammad Asimi in his *Zainul Fatah fee Sharh Surah Hal Ataa* has narrated through his chains from Hafiz Ubaidullah bin Moosa Abasi from Abul Humra that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “One, who wants to see Adam in his knowledge, Nuh in his courage, Ibrahim in his forbearance and Moosa in his power, he should look at Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”

Through another chain of reporters, this same report is narrated from Hafiz Abasi, with the addition: “And Yahya bin Zakariya in his piety.”

Then he writes: “There are ten similarities between Adam and Murtada:

1. In nature and morals. 2. In pause and delay 3. In spouse 4. In marriage and gift 5. In knowledge and wisdom 6. In intelligence 7. In rulership and Caliphate 8. In his enemies and opposition 9. In loyalty and successorship 10. In children and family.

Then he has explained each of these similarities and then mentioned: There are eight similarities between Murtada and Nuh:

1. Understanding, 2. Call, 3. Answering 4. Ark 5. Blessing 6. Peace and security 7. Thankfulness 8. Slaying.

Then he has explained the reason of similarity and then explained each of them and then written: There are eight similarities between Murtada and Ibrahim Khalil:

1. Loyalty, 2. remaining secure 3. debate with his uncle and people 4. destroying idols 5. glad tiding to him about two sons, who were progenitors of prophets 6. different conditions of his descendants, some being righteous and some unjust 7. divine test from Almighty Allah regarding children and property 8. that Almighty Allah named him as friend (*Khalil*) and did not choose anyone over him and did not take anyone as His friend.

After that he has mentioned the details of these similarities, till he writes: There are eight similarities between Murtada and Yusuf: 1. knowledge and wisdom during childhood 2. jealousy of his brothers 3. their disregard of covenants they made for him 4. in old age knowledge and rulership was gathered

¹ Ref: *Nihaya*, Ibne Asir, 4/101; *Behaarul Anwaar*, 16/144-145.

from him 5. he was knowing the interpretation of dreams 6. his forgiveness to his brothers 7. his overlooking when he gained power on his brothers 8. His going away from his abode.

Then he has mentioned the reasons for these similarities and then says: There are eight similarities between Moosa Kalim and Murtada: 1. Determination 2. propagation 3. Staff and power 4. magnanimity 5. brotherhood and proximity 6. love and friendship 7. bearing distress 8. inheriting rulership.

Then he has mentioned the reasons for these similarities and then says: There are eight similarities between Dawood and Murtada:

1. Knowledge and wisdom 2. gaining precedence over his brothers during childhood 3. confronting and slaying Jalut 4. his inheriting the kingdom of Talut 5. softening of the iron for him 6. lifeless things recited divine praises for him 7. a righteous son 8. Articulateness (*Faslul Khitab*).

Then he has mentioned the reasons for these similarities and then says: There are eight similarities between Sulaiman and Murtada:

1. Being tested by his self 2. putting of a body on his throne¹ 3. Almighty Allah bestowed such things to him in childhood that he became eligible for Caliphate 4. return of the Sun for him after it had set 5. the wind came under his control 6. jinns came under his control 7. he understood the language of birds and other things 8. exemption from giving account.

Then he has mentioned the reasons for these similarities and then says: There are eight similarities between Ayyub and Murtada:

1. calamities on his body 2. calamities on his children 3. calamities on his property 4. patience in hardships 5. uprising of everyone against him 6. joy of enemies in his calamities 7. his calling Allah, the Mighty and the High during these instances 8. fulfillment of vow.

Then he has mentioned the reasons for these similarities and then says: There are eight similarities between Yahya bin Zakariya and Murtada:

1. infallibility 2. Book and wisdom 3. peace be on him 4. goodness to parents 5. being killed for the sake of a sinful woman 6. severe divine anger for his killing 7. fear of God 8. no one had his name and he was named by Almighty Allah.

Then he has mentioned the reasons for these similarities and then says: There are eight similarities between Isa and Murtada:

1. submission to Allah, the Mighty and the High 2. knowing the Book during infancy 3. knowledge of divine Books 4. Destruction of two sects regarding him 5. piety in the world 6. nobility and excellence 7. informing about future events 8. having eligibility of guiding the nation.

¹ The Holy Quran: “**And certainly We tried Sulaiman, and We put on his throne a (mere) body, so he turned (to Allah).**” (Surah Saad 38:34). Ref: Tafseer Mizan, 17/204; Tarjuma Tafsirul Mizan, 17/310.

Then he has mentioned the reasons for these similarities. This is the most valuable Ahle Sunnat book, which shows the knowledge of its author, but Ahle Sunnat, instead of propagating this valuable book, have issued useless and false statements against it.

Introduction to the poet

Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Abdullah¹ Katib Nahwi Misri was called by the title of Mufajjah. He was an incomparable scholar of traditions and link between experts of language and literature and regarded as an Imamite scholar. He is praised for his right religion and correct view and his full attention was focused on Holy Imams (a.s.). In his verses, he has extolled them greatly and mourned much on their tragedies. He was as such always till opponents gave him the nickname of 'Mufajjah' (one who mourns excessively) and has hinted at this in the following verse:

"If they have given a bad nickname and named me as Mufajjah I swear by my life that I became Mufajjah (grief stricken) due to calamities that descended on me."

Then as Najjashi and Allamah have said, Mufajjah began to be called as such even by his friends due to the reason mentioned above.

Mufajjah met Thalab and gained knowledge from him and as mentioned in the *Fehrist* of Ibne Nadim², and *Al-Wafi bil Wafiyat* of Safadi³: Between him and Ibne Duraid satire took place as is mentioned in *Mojamul Odaba*. Mufajjah was born in Basra and passed away there only in 327 A.H.⁴

18. Abul Qasim Sanobari

Died: 344 A.H.

This Qaisda has 42 verses:

1. The prophet raised his right hand so that the audience may see his right hand (Ali). 2. In the position occupied by the caller and the warner. 3. He declared him to be his brother in Khum and loudly announced and was not shortcoming in declaring his praise. 4. He also said that the Ali is the most excellent of you and supported all judgments of Ali (a.s.). 5. He is to me as Harun was Moosa and what a nice comparison it is.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Qasim and Abu Bakr and Abul Fazl⁵, Ahmad bin Muhammad⁶ bin Hasan bin Marrar, famous as Sanobari. He was poet of Shia faith and he left a

¹ In *Mo'jamul Odaba*, it is mentioned as Ubaidullah.

² Al-Fehrist, 91.

³ Al-Wafi bil Wafiyat, [1/129].

⁴ His biography is mentioned in *Mo'jamul Odaba*, 17:190-205.

⁵ Kashajam, who was his friend has called him by this agnomen in his couplet.

⁶ In *Fehrist* of Ibne Nadim/ 194, it is mentioned: Muhammad bin Ahmad.

large collection of poetry. What proves his Shia faith is that he was closely associated the Kushajam, who it is confirmed, was a Shia.

19. Qaazi Tanukhi

Born 278 A.H.

Died: 342 A.H.

This poem has 83 verses, some of which are as follows:

ومن قال في يوم الغدير "محمد	وقد خاف من غدر العداه النواصب
اما اني اولى بكم من نفوسكم	فقالوا: بلى قول المريب الموارب
فقال لهم: من كنت مولاه منكم	فهذا اخي مولاه بعدي وصاحبى
اطيعوه طرفا هومنى بمنزل	كهارون من موسى الكليم المخاطب

1. He is such that Muhammad on Ghadeer day when he feared the dishonesty of Nasibis, said: 2. Am I not having more authority on you than you have on yourself? Yes, they replied, like doubtful dishonest persons 3. So he said: Of whomsoever I am the master, this brother of mine is (also) his master after me. 4. All of you follow him as he is to me as Harun was to Moosa, who spoke to God.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Qasim Tanukhi Ali bin Muhammad...bin Yaarab bin Qahtan bin Ghaban bin Shalih bin Shahad bin Saam bin Nuh (a.s.)¹. He was born on Sunday, when four days remained from Zilhajj in the year 278 A.H. in Antioch. He lived there all his life till he moved to Baghdad during his youth and became an expert in Hanafite school of Islamic law.

What is concluded from different statements about him is that he was a Mutazali in belief and a Hanafite in practical law and he was a Zaidiyyah in religion. He died on the afternoon of Tuesday, 7th Rabiul Awwal, 342 A.H. in Basra.

20. Abul Qasim Zahi

Born 318 A.H.

Died: 352 A.H.

He composed the following verses regarding the Caliphate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and that this Caliphate is clear from tradition of Ghadeer:

1. Haider, who is my master, I deem him to be my chief, since it is understood from reasoning that: 2. Caliphate after the Prophet is destined for him by the command of the Beneficent Lord. 3. To whom Ahmad said on

¹ Khateeb Baghdadi has mentioned this lineage in his *Taareekh*. [12/77, No. 6487].

the day of Ghadeer: 4. Stand up O Ali, and be the standard for them after me and be pleased for the divine rewards on Judgment Day. 5. You are the master of those, who would fulfill the covenant and this is the clarification mentioned by revelation. 6. It is that Almighty Allah said: convey the Caliphate to him and appoint him for My command. 7. And if you do not, it is as if you have not conveyed any message nor fulfilled your duty to Me.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Qasim Ali bin Ishaq bin Khalaf Qattan Baghadi, famous as Zahi,¹ was a remarkable poet inclined to Ahle Bayt (a.s.); he followed their faith and fulfilled the recompense of prophethood by his loyalty to them. His best poems are in praise of the Holy Imams (a.s.).

A person like Zahi, who was aware of language and rhetoric and an expert of lexicology and literature has used the term of 'Maula' in the meaning of Caliphate and Imamate, which is strong evidence of the correctness of Shia stance regarding the tradition of Ghadeer.

According to Ibne Khallikan, Zahi was born on Monday, when ten days remained in the month of Safar in 318 A.H. and he passed away on Wednesday, when ten days remained from Jamadiul Awwal, 352 A.H. or after 360 A.H.

Since his religious poems are not mentioned in poetry collections, we present a sample as follows:

Among them being the following verses in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.):

1. He was the one, who conversed with the sun and one for whom the sun rose up again after it had set in Babel. 2. One, who kicked the ground and one, who caused a spring to flow for the army in a parched valley. 3. It is such a river that every other river is smaller than it and its waves rise up high. He takes a handful of water. 4. And he is such a lion in the thicket that at that time every lion seems smaller. 5. He is one, who disseminates divine sciences on the earth and for whose love, Almighty Allah widens sustenance. 6. His sword is such that if a child sees it during the battlefield his hair would grey due to terror. 7. He steps into the battlefield while he had deemed his sword to be his armor. And what excessive filth he has eradicated is only restricted to him and that's all.

Statement of the poet: "He was the one who conversed with the sun"

It is a hint to the report narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said to Ali (a.s.): "O Abul Hasan, speak to sun so that it may speak to you."

Ali (a.s.) said: "Peace be on you, O obedient one of Allah and His Messenger."

¹ It is a locality in Nishapur.

The sun responded: “And peace be on you O Ameerul Momineen, Imam of the pious. And leader of the folks of Paradise, whose foreheads, hands and feet (places of ablution) are illuminated and white.¹ O Ali, you and your followers shall be in Paradise. O Ali, you are the first of those for whom the earth split (an allusion of being created) it was Muhammad and then you. And the first of those, who would become alive is Muhammad and then you. And the first of those, who would be dressed is Muhammad and then you.”

So Ali (a.s.) prostrated for Allah, the Mighty and High while tears flowed from his eyes. The Prophet came to him and said: “My brother and loved one, raise your head as Almighty Allah has boasted over the folks of seven heavens regarding you.”

This report is mentioned by Shaykhul Islam Hamawaini in *Faraidus Simtain*², Khwarizmi in *Manaqib*³ and Qunduzi in *Yanabi*⁴.

Statement of the poet: “and one for whom the sun rose up again after it had set in Babel”

It is a hint to the report of returning of the sun for Ali (a.s.) in Babel, as Nasr bin Muzahim has mentioned in *Kitabus Siffreen*⁵ through his authorities from Abde Khair that he said: I traveled in Babel was with Ali (a.s.) and it was the time of Asr prayer. We toured from one place to another; each was larger than the other till Imam Ali (a.s.) arrived at a nice place and alighted. I also alighted after him, but by that time the sun had already set and the time of Asr Prayer had passed. Ali (a.s.) prayed to God and the sun rose up again, so that we may recite our prayer. After that the sun set once more.

Statement of the poet: “he caused a spring of fresh water to flow”

It is a hint to the traditional report that Nasr bin Muzahim has mentioned in *Kitabus Siffreen*⁶ through his chains of authorities from Abu Saeed Teemi Tabei, famous as Aqeesa. Aqeesa says: We were traveling in an expedition with Ali (a.s.) towards Shaam, till we reached Sawad to the rear of Kufa. People became thirsty and needed water. So Ali (a.s.) took us to a firm slab of rock the size of a goat and ordered us to dig there. We dug and a spring of water gushed up from there. People quenched their thirst. Then he ordered us to replace the slab. Then we set out from there and had moved a little when Ali (a.s.) asked if one of us remembered that place. Some of us went to search for it on foot and mounted to search for it and came to that place where the rock was. But we could not find it. When he failed to see it we came to a monastery over there and ask them about it.

¹ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 256.

² *Faraaezus Simtain* [1/185, H. 147].

³ *Manaqib*, 68 [113, H. 123].

⁴ *Yanabiul Mawaddah*, 140 [1/140, Chap. 49].

⁵ *Waqatus Siffreen*, 152, Egypt [Pg. 136].

⁶ *Waqatus Siffreen*, 162, Egypt [Pg. 145]; Khateeb in his *Taareekh*, [12:305] has also mentioned this.

They said there was no source of water nearby. How is that? We have ourselves drank water from it. They asked: “Did you really drink from that place?” “Yes,” we replied. The chief of the monastery said: “This monastery is not constructed, except for that water and no one can take that water out, except a prophet or a successor of prophet.”

Among the poems of Zahi is ‘Qasida Taiyya’, some verses of which are as follows:

1. He is the last successor and monotheism is present among creatures because of him. 2. He is the inside of unseen knowledge and one, who in exposition of hints, is apparent and is criterion of every man having envy. 3. Swiftly his sword revived religion as it destroyed the heresies of those, who talk nonsense. 4. He is the jurist of this Ummah and a scholar, who is such an expert that no one can overtake him. 5. He is the greatest news and the proof of truth and hardship for enemies and lamp in all calamities, which cause destruction.¹ 6. He is a rope connecting to God and is the door of repentance. He is one, who opens the locks of every difficulty and hardship. 7. He is the step of truth, which transforms the heart of every person, by steps, which are not deviated. 8. He is the stream of Talut and the side of God and is the spring, because of whose effulgence, intellect is destroyed. 9. The hearing ear, that is heedless to nonsense. 10. For him is the good return to the owner of Throne and he is such that if his help and guidance were not there, I would have been deviated.

Statement of the poet: “hearing ear”

It is a hint to the report, which Hafiz Abu Nuaim has mentioned in *Hilyatul Awliya*² that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

“O Ali, the Almighty Allah has commanded me that I should make you proximate and that I should train you, so that you may remember.” And the following verse was revealed:

وَتَعِيهَا أَدْنٌ وَاعِيَةٌ³

“And that the retaining ear might retain it.”³

“You are the retaining ears of my knowledge.”

Some scholar have also narrated this tradition.

Qaazi Izd Eiji writes in *Mawaqif*:⁴

Majority of the commentators believe that the verse:

وَتَعِيهَا أَدْنٌ وَاعِيَةٌ³

¹ In *Ayanush Shia*, 8/164, this verse is mentioned with some variation.

² *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:162.

³ Surah Haqqah 69:12

⁴ *Al-Mawaqif*, 3:276 [Pg. 411].

“And that the retaining ear might retain it.”¹

...implies Ali (a.s.).

Some other verses of Zahi in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

1. Be devoted to Ali and become effulgent through the lamp of guidance and his knowledge, so that you may enter Paradise and drink from his vessel. 2. So, whoever is devoted to him gets salvation and whoever is inimical to him, has neither recognized religion nor its base. 3. He is the first, who regarded Almighty Allah as one and unique and did not bow to the idols even for a day. 4. He is one, who entered the deep well and did not fear death and while the bucket was left in the well, he sought water.

Explanation: The statement of the poet in the last verse hints at the report regarding Ali (a.s.) that Imam Ahmad Hanbal has mentioned in *Manaqib*² and it is that on the eve of Badr, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) asked: “Who would give us water to drink?”

Due to fear, the people did not volunteer. Ali (a.s.) arose and placed a bucket on his shoulders and came to a well, which was deep and dark and entered it. So Almighty Allah revealed to Jibreel, Mikaeel and Israfeel that they should be ready to help Muhammad, his brother and his army. They descended from the heavens and raised a call, which was heard by all and which terrified all of them. When they came to the edge of the well, all of them saluted Ali (a.s.) as a mark of respect.³

21. Amir Abu Faras Hamadani

Born 320, 321 A.H.

Died: 357 A.H.

1. On Ghadeer day, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) established the command of Caliphate for them and Almighty Allah is a witness, as well as the angels and people. 2. Till the Caliphate reached someone other than its owner; wolves and vultures fought with each other vying for it. 3. They deemed Caliphate a consultation and for appointing a Caliph began to consult each other as if they did not know which of them is the true Master (*Wali*). 4. By God, those people were ignorant about the rank of Caliphate, but they concealed the face of one, who they knew was the true Caliph.

Introduction to the poet

Abu Faras Harith bin Abul Alaa possessed the awe of kings and delicacy of littérateurs. He was having the majesty of rulers along with subtlety of poets and he reconciled the sword to the pen.

¹ Surah Haqqah 69:12

² Tr. 171 and in *Fadailus Sahaba*, H. 1049 and in *Tareekh Ibne Asakir*, H. 868.

³ Ref: *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2/250, 9/172, Sermon 154.

Thalabi has mentioned in *Yatimatus Dhar*:¹

“Mutanabbi has testified to his prominence and always avoided facing him and never competed with him. He did not dare to confront him.”

This poet was born in 320 A.H. and was killed on Wednesday, 8th Rabius Thani.² He was beheaded and his headless body was abandoned in the desert, till some Bedouins buried him.³

Following are some of his verses:

1. My intercessor is Ahmad, my Prophet and my master; and my master is Ali, daughter of Prophet and his two grandsons. 2. In the same way, Ali and splitter of knowledge (*Baqirul uloom*) and Sadiq, then who is trustworthy in explaining religion [Moosa bin Ja'far (a.s.)] 3. And Ali and Muhammad bin Ali and Ali and Askari, who are nearest to truth. 4. and Imam Mahdi (a.s.), on the day when nothing would benefit man, except forgiveness of the merciful Lord.

لَقَدْ كَانَ فِي قَصَصِهِمْ عِبْرَةٌ لِأُلُّلَّابِ

“In their histories there is certainly a lesson for men of understanding.”⁴

22. Abul Fath Kashjam

Died: 360 A.H.

بَعْدَهُمْ جَزِيَّوْمَ الْجَمِيلِ:

وَقَدْ عَلِمُوا إِنَّ يَوْمَ الْغَدَيرِ

1. They thought that the day of Ghadeer would be followed by the day of Jamal for their deception and fraud. 2. So, O unjust people, who caused distress to Prophet for losing his child. 3. In this matter the clear statement of Quran and the clear statement of Prophet opposes you. 4. You have disregarded his bequest and attribute to him, what he did not say...

Till the end of Qasida, which in the manuscript of his collection, contains 47 verses. Since this Qasida was against the religion of publisher he has edited it and this is not the first instance of such omission.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Fath Mahmud bin Muhammad bin Husain bin Sindi bin Shahak Ramli⁵, famous as Kashjam, is a prominent member of this community and an

¹ Yatimatus Dhar, 1:27 [1/57].

² *Kamil*, Ibne Asir, [5/355, Incidents of 357 A.H.]; *Tareekh Abul Fida*, [2/108, Incidents of 357 A.H.].

³ Ref: *Tareekh Ibne Khallikan*, [2/61, No. 153]; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, [4/301, Incidents of 357 A.H.].

⁴ Surah Yusuf 12:111

⁵ Related to Ramla, an area of Palestine. [*Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 3/69].

incomparable part of it. He was a poet, calligrapher, scholastic theologian, astronomer, logician and a traditionist.

He adopted the title of Kashajam in order to express his expertise in the following sciences: 'K' is for his being a calligrapher (*Katib*), 'Sh' for his being a poet (*Shair*), 'A' for his literary accomplishments (*Adabiyat*); 'J' for his expertise in debate (*Jadal*) or due to his generosity (*Jood*) and 'M' for scholastic theologian (*Mutakallim*), logician (*Mantaqi*) or astronomer (*Munajjim*).

He was the implication of the verse:

يُنْجِي الْحَىٰ مِنَ الْمَيِّتِ

“He brings forth the living from the dead.”¹

Enmity of his ancestor (Sindi bin Shahak) towards Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and the distress he caused to Imam Moosa Kazim (a.s.) in the prison of Harun has blackened the pages of history. As for his grandson, Abul Fath Kashajam, he was having contradictory beliefs, who openly advocated the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), was prejudiced in their favor and defended them. This is not strange, because Almighty Allah brings out gems from pebbles and makes the rose to grow amidst thorns.

Birth and death

It is apparent from his verses at the beginning of the fourth century that he was aged at that time. He was born in the middle of the third century. As for his death: many dictionaries mention the date of his death between 360 and 350 A.H.

23. Nashi Saghir

Born 271 A.H.

Died: 365 A.H.

1. O progeny of Yasin, one, who is devoted to you, without any doubt is a well wisher of himself. 2. You are saviors from misguidance as every corruption is corrected due to devotion to you. 3. This is Ali, whose prominence in Caliphate was declared on Ghadeer day and his excellence was revealed. 4. When the Prophet declared holding his shoulders: 5. Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master according to divine revelation. 6. So they congratulated him and paid allegiance to him; and all those who were sincere, gained from it.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Hasan² Ali bin Abdullah bin Wasif Nashi Saghir – Asghar – Baghdadi

¹ Surah Rum 30:19

² It is mentioned as Abul Husain in *Fehrist* of Shaykh [Pg. 89, No. 373] and *Rijal Ibne Dawood*, Pg. 142, No. 1079.

– and he is called as Nashi, because as Samani has mentioned in *Ansab*:¹

“Nashi is said to be one, who is an expert in the art of versification.”

He possessed various merits and was accomplished in a number of fields. He was a great scholar, scholastic theologian, traditionist and Shia jurist. Shaykh Mufeed has narrated traditional reports from him and Shaykh Tusi has included him in *Fehrist*² upon the authority of his teacher, Shaykh Mufeed.

24. Bishnoi Kurdi

Died: After 380 A.H.

“Shall I ignore the authentic tradition that Ahmad declared in his sermon at Ghadeer Khum that: Am I not your master, and like me, Ali is your master. So be devoted to him and I have repeated an obligatory matter.”

Introduction to the poet

Abu Abdullah Husain bin Dawood Kurdi Bishnoi: As Ibne Shahr Ashob has mentioned in his *Maalimul Ulama*,³ he is among the poets, who openly declared the praise of the Holy Progeny and it can be concluded from his verses that Shia are solely devoted to the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of Imams of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and have dissociated themselves from the rest of people.

A samples of his verses

Among his verses regarding religion are as follows:

“The best of successors from the best of the families and the best of tribes; and he is secure from mistakes. When you glance at the face of the successor, you have, in fact, worshipped your Lord.”

His last line hints at the traditional report, which Mohibuddin Tabari has mentioned in *Riyaz*:⁴ It is narrated from Abu Bakr, Abdullah bin Masud, Amr Aas, Imran bin Husain and others from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that glancing at the face of Ali (a.s.) is worship.

It is mentioned in the tradition of Abu Zar that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“The simile of Ali among you – or in this Ummah – is like the simile of Kaaba, that looking at it is a worship act and Hajj to it is obligatory.”

The following are also his verses:

1. It is not important for me in which place the Almighty Allah gives me death. 2. [It is also not important] that where my grave should be located and that someone would be unjust or inimical to it. 3. If I testify that there is

¹ *Ansabul Ashraf*, Balazari, [5/445].

² *Fehrist*, 89.

³ *Maalimul Ulama*, [Pg. 149].

⁴ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:219 [3/172].

no god, except One God and what He has destined is true. 4. And that Muhammad Mustafa is the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and Ali is his brother. 5. And Fatima, the chaste one, is the daughter of Prophet. The Prophet, who guided me about what he guided (Islam) 6. And two sons of Ali and Fatima, who are my chiefs and congratulations to one, whose masters and chiefs they are.

25. Sahib bin Ubbad

Born 326 A.H.

Died: 385 A.H.

1. He said: On the day of blanket, who was his second? Tell me. I replied: He was the best of those, whom the tent covered. 2. He said: Tell me, who became the chief and Amir on Ghadeer day? I replied: One, who is the best Master (*Wali*) for Islam. 3. They asked: Did Ali get precedence? I replied: No, all the merits derive their excellence from Ali. 4. But, I say how the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said, when he had gathered all the people. 5. Know that one, whose master I am, this Ali is also is master. If one does not accept, then I am also not his master.

Introduction to the poet

Sahib, Kafiul Kufa, Abul Qasim Ismail bin Abul Hasan Ubbad bin Abbas bin Ubbad bin Ahmad bin Idris Taliqani. I have not seen any book of biography but that it has mentioned his excellence, the most famous of them being *Yateematut Dahaar*¹ of Thalabi from the ancient scholars. He has mentioned his most detailed biography reaching upto 91 pages.

Sahib was born in an area of Fars and Istakhar or Taliqan in 16 Zilqad, 326 A.H.

His expertise in literary arts is well known and all admit to this fact. So much so that Shaykh Bahai, in his treatise of *Ghuslar Rijlain wal Masahha*, regards him as a Shia scholar and an equal of Kulaini, Saduq. Shaykh Mufeed, Shaykh Tusi and Shaheed. Allamah Majlisi, at the beginning of his gloss on *Naqdur Rijal* has considered him to be the most important jurist from the ancient as well as modern period. At another place, he has included him among senior tradition scholars and scholastic theologians.

In *Fiqhatul Lughat*, Thalabi has mentioned him as an Imam of lexicology, whose books he trusted. Allamah Majlisi, in his Foreword to *Biharul Anwar*² has regarded him to be the most prominent scholar of literature, prosody and language.

¹ Yateematut Dahaar, [3/225-337].

² Behaarul Anwaar, [1/42].

His verses regarding religion

Thalabi has mentioned the following verses in his *Yateematut Dahir*:¹

“It is devotion to Ali Ibne Abi Talib, which guides towards Paradise. If regarding Ali as the most excellent is heresy then curse of God be on Sunnah.”

He has also mentioned the following verses:

“A Nasibi man said to me: Muawiyah is your maternal uncle and he is the best of the maternal uncles. Thus, he is the maternal uncle of all believers. I said: He is maternal uncle (*Khaal*), but he is devoid (*Khaali*) of every goodness.”

Jurist of the two sanctuaries, Ganji Shafei (d. 658), says in *Kifayatut Talib*,² and Khwarizmi in *Manaqib*,³ has mentioned his following verses:

- 1. Ameerul Momineen, O Murtada, indeed my heart stands before you.**
- 2. When I compose a new poem about you, the Nasibi enemy says: You have forgotten⁴ the senior companions. 3. Who is pious as my master, Ali in such a way that he divorced the world thrice and did not reconcile to it. 4. Who was invited to eat the roasted fowl? And some of these merits are sufficient for us. 5. Who is the successor of Mustafa according to you? Successor of Mustafa (chosen Prophet) is one, who is chosen.**

Sahib was having two finger rings, on one were inscribed the words:

“I rely on God and I seek mediation of the Holy Five.”

The other ring was inscribed with the words:

“Muhammad and his Purified Progeny are intercessors of Ismail in the hereafter.”

The Shaykh has mentioned the last point in his *Majalisul Momineen*⁵ and our Shaykh, Saduq has also hinted to it at the beginning of his *Uyunul Akhbar*.⁶

Sahib and religion

No scholar has expressed any doubt in Sahib being a Shia Imamiyah as proved from a large number of his poems regarding the Imams of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and also his literary prose, from which it can be concluded that he regarded them to be better than others.

“How many have labeled me as Rafidhi for being devoted to you all and prolongation of their howling has not prevented me from you.”

¹ Yateematut Dahir, 3:247 [3/321].

² *Kifayatut Talib*, 81 [Pg. 92, Chap. 26].

³ *Manaqib*, 69 [Pg. 115, H. 125].

⁴ According to Khwarizmi instead of ‘forgotten’ it is ‘condemned’.

⁵ Majaalesul Momineen, [2/449].

⁶ Uyunul Akhbar Reza, [1/16].

Sayyid Raziuddin bin Tawus, in the book of *Al-Yaqin*,¹ has clarified about his religion. We have narrated from Majlisi, the first² that he regarded him as the greatest Imamiyah jurist and his son in his foreword of *Biharul Anwar*³ has followed in his footsteps and clarified that Sahib was an Imamite.

Although there are various false attributions regarding him, which say that Sahib bin Ubbad was a Mutazalite or Shafei or Hanafite or Zaidi by religion.

Sayings of Sahib bin Ubbad, which have become proverbs in Arabic language

One, who seeks gifts from a river of potable water, is able to remove fresh pearls from it.

One, who stretches out his hand for rewards, tongues of request stretch out towards him.

One, who denies a divine favor, is eligible for chastisement.

One, whose flesh has developed of unlawful food, it will not reap, except a naked sword.

One, who is deceived by days of health, tongues of regret would also speak to him.

One, who is not affected by hints, will not benefit from more advice.

How often elegant statements are successors of prosperity and affluence.

Half a glance to the wise suffices him and seeing him once from the corner of the eye makes him needless of being spoken to.

Knowledge is obtained by exchange of views and conversation; and ignorance is due to denial and regarding others unimportant.

When words are repeated to the ears, they become entrenched in the heart.

A healthy conscience is more expressive than an eloquent tongue.

The best good turn is that which is filtered and perfect and the worst good turn is that which is delayed at the time of doing it and it is smeared.

How often refraining from a statement makes the matter more clear and conveys the aim better.

Every person has a hope and every act has a special time.

Denial of bounty is the source of chastisement.

Every seeker of truth does not reach it and every awaitee of cloud does not benefit from rain.

Thalabi in *Yateematuz Dahir*⁴, has mentioned most of these statements full

¹ Al-Yaqin fee Amr Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), [Pg. 457, Chap. 174].

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 377.

³ Behaaru Anwaar, [1/42].

⁴ *Yateematuz Dahir*, [3:281].

wisdom and in *Ayanush Shia*, our Sayyid, Amin has narrated all of them.¹

This is a remarkable example of Shia, and these are his examples. This is the minister of Shia and these are his wisdoms. This is the jurist of Shia and these are his works. This is the Shia scholar and these are his words. This is the Shia scholastic theologian and these are his statements. They were Shia men and these are their contributions. The Shia are progeny of Allah; they should be as such, otherwise they won't be Shia.

Demise

Sahib passed away on Thursday, 24th Safar, 385 A.H. in Rayy. The markets and the town was shut down and people gathered at his castle awaiting for his bier. Fakhrud Daula and other nobles attended the funeral. When his bier was brought out for funeral prayers. The people arose in his honor and a moan of grief escaped their lips, they threw themselves in the dust, tore up their garments, slapped their faces and lamented as long as they liked.

After the funeral prayer they hung his coffin from the roof by chains so that it remains safe from animals² and then it was transferred to Isfahan.

It would be clear for the reader that reasoning of a person like Sahib – who is one of the pillars of lexicology and literature – in his poetry and prose through tradition of Ghadeer about the excellence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is a strong proof that his implication of Imamate and Caliphate from the term of Maula is correct.

26. Jauhari Jurjani

Died: 380 A.H. approx.

1. Whether when I went to Ghadeer Khum with you, did I not take oath from you after taking your promise? 2. While I held the shoulders of the best of the men from Mudar and Adnan, who have walked the land of Mecca. 3. And I said: Allah forbid me to be careless or that I should leave prophethood without any hint. 4. This Ali is the master of all, to whom I am sent as a master. My hidden is same as my apparent regarding him (I mentioned what was in my mind). 5. This cousin of mine is the bearer of my office and my brother and successor; and my companions and other brothers are not as such. 6. If I compare his rank to me, it is same as what Harun was to Moosa bin Imran.³

¹ *Ayanush Shia*, [3/354-356].

² So that the corpse may not decay in the room and also that it is not attacked by animals. They placed him in a room and opened the doors so that air should circulate and it does not decay and it remains safe from the creatures of the earth as well. That is why it was hung from to the roof.

³ *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, 1:532, Iran [3/40, Darul Azwa, Beirut]; *Siratul Mustaqeem*, Bayazi Amili, [1/311].

Ibne Shahr Ashob has mentioned the following verse in his *Manaqib*:¹

“None denies the excellence of Ghadeer Khum, except a man guilty of unforgivable sins.”

Introduction to the poet

Abul Hasan Ali bin Ahmad Jurjani, famous as Jauhari: he is one of the criterions of literatures, one of the pillars of Arabic and an amazing innovator in the art of poetry. He was a disciple and friend of Sahib bin Ubbad. Thalabi has not left any praise unsung about him². The author of *Riyazul Ulama*³ has mentioned his biography, stated about his excellence and mentioned his poems.

He was born after 377 A.H. and before 385 A.H. in Jurjan, during the lifetime of Sahib bin Ubbad, who passed away in 385 A.H.

27. Ibne Hajjaj Baghdadi

Died: 391 A.H.

1. Almighty Allah will not leave those (hypocrites), who said congratulations for your superiority and excellence. 2. And pledged allegiance to you at Ghadeer, then His Eminence, Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) emphasized that allegiance to convey his message. 3. They disobeyed your command and caused distress to you;⁴ and the statement of Prophet that: This is my brother and successor, did not prevent them. 4. He is your master after me. Thus, whoever deems him to be his proof will not have any fear.

This Qasida comprises of nearly 64 verses.

Introduction to the poet

Abu Abdallah Husain bin Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Ja’far bin Muhammad bin Hajjaj Neeli Baghdadi was one of the pillars of his community and a senior scholar of his time. He was an expert of literature and the author of *Riyazul Ulama*⁵ has regarded him to be among the most senior scholars of his time.

Ibne Khallikan⁶ and Abul Fida regard him as a Shia scholar and Hamawi in *Mojamul Odba*,⁷ opines that he was a prominent Shia poet and others are of the view that he was an important writer.

He became the poet laureate twice.⁸ That is in Baghdad, which was the capital of the world at that time. It shows his extraordinary rank, his expertise in

¹ Manaqib Aale Abi Talib, 2:203 [2/355].

² Yateematu Dahir, [4:29].

³ Riyazul Ulama, [3/339].

⁴ Perhaps it implies that they prevented you from Caliphate and delayed it for you.

⁵ Riyazul Ulama, [2/11].

⁶ *Wafiyatul Ayan*, [2/171, No. 192].

⁷ Mo’jamul Odaba, [9/229].

⁸ This is mentioned in *Tareekh Ibne Khallikan* [2/168, No. 192] and *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer* [11/378, Events of 391 A.H.].

religious sciences and his fame in that period; because 'Hisba' was a very high academic post, which in those ancient times only imams of religion and senior personages of Islam and Ummah used to hold. As Mawardi has mentioned in *Ahkamus Sultaniya*,¹ 'Hisba' was a pillar of religious affairs, a post, which scholars of the early period themselves fulfilled.

'Hisba' implied enjoining of good and forbidding evil.

In other words, his appointment to the Hisba twice, is sufficient to makes us needless to praise him from his knowledge of jurisprudence, extolling his equitability and opinion, his efforts in obedience of Almighty Allah, his unambiguousness and harshness in religion and his guidance and stability: once during the reign of Muqtadar Billah, the Abbaside Caliph, as is mentioned in *Tarikh Ibne Khallikan* and *Miratul Jinan* of Yafai, and also during the period of Izzud Daula, during the ministership of Ibne Baqiya in 362 A.H. when he was appointed at this task.

Literary contribution

As we hinted, he was the most prominent Shia poet and occupied the first rows among writers. So much so, it is said that he was a poet of the caliber of Imrul Qays² and no one else has been regarded as his equal. His collected works comprise ten volumes and most his verses possess a special sweetness and new subjects in easy words and he had a good style of presentation.

Birth and death

No one has any dispute regarding the date of his passing away. He passed away in Jamadiul Thani in 391 A.H. in Neel, a place on the banks of Euphrates between Baghdad and Kufa and he was buried near the tomb of Imam Moosa Kazim (a.s.). He had made a bequest to be buried at the feet of Imam Moosa Kazim (a.s.) and that the following verse should be written on his tombstone:

وَكَلِمَهُمْ بَاسِطُ ذَرَاعَيْهِ بِأَلْوَحِيْبِ

"While their dog (lay) outstretching its paws at the entrance."³

We were unable to locate the date of his birth in books, but one, who makes efforts will definitely conclude that he was born during the third century and he lived for a ripe old age of one hundred and thirty years.

28. Abul Abbas Zabbi

Died: 398 A.H.

"There is majesty and greatness for Ali - who is pure and famous – which exceeds the height of the Saber mountain. He is the brother of

¹ *Ahkamus Sultaniya*, 224 [2/258, Chap. 20].

² This is mentioned in *Tareekh Ibne Khallikan* [2/169, No. 192] and *Mo'jamul Odaba*, [9/206].

³ Surah Kahf 18:18

Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) and his successor on Ghadeer day. He is the husband of Fatima and father of Imam Hasan and Imam Husain (a.s.).”¹

Explanation of the verse

Sabeer is tallest mountain of Mecca, situated between Mecca and Arafah. It is named after a man of Huzail tribe, who died on this mountain.

Abu Nuaim says in his book of *Maa Nazala minal Quran fee Ali*,² and Natanzi in *Khasaisul Alawiya* has narrated from Shoba bin Hakam from Ibne Abbas that when I was in Mecca, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), held my and Ali’s hand and came on top of Mt. Sabeer and prayed four units of prayers for us. Then he raised his head to the heavens and said:

“O God, Moosa bin Imran beseeched You; and I, Muhammad, Your Prophet ask You to widen my breast and ease my affair and untie the knot of my tongue, so that they may understand me and appoint a vizier from my family. Make my back strong with my brother, Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) make him assist me in my duties.”

Ibne Abbas says: I heard a caller say: “O Ahmad, you are given what you asked for.”

Introduction to the poet

The incomparable sufficer, Abu Abbas Ahmad bin Ibrahim Zabbi – related to Zabba – was a minister, who was given the title of chief (*Raees*). He succeeded Sahib bin Ubbad in literature and politics. He was his close associate and successor. He continued to be like this till Sahib bin Ubbad passed away in 385 A.H. and Fakhrud Daula Buwaihid appointed him as minister. Contemporary poets composed poems in his honor.³

29. Abu Raqamaq Antaki⁴

Died: 399 A.H.

1. In the gathering, he is like fragrant incense. After this incense do not be distressed. 2. When I remember the time of dawn, I recall my beloved. 3. Although I will be distressed, because they when they cooked the food, the pot was near. 4. They went when the bread was baked, but they could not eat fresh bread. 5. No, by the one, in whose favor the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) spoke on Ghadeer day. 6. That for my father, Imam Ali there is no equal among the creatures.⁵

¹ *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, 1:550, Iran [3/71, Darul Azwa, Beirut].

² *Maa Nazala minal Quran fee Ali*, [Pg. 138, H. 37].

³ Ref: *Yateemut Dahir*, [4:44].

⁴ Related to Antioch at a distance of one day from Aleppo. [*Mo’jamul Buldaan*, 1/267].

⁵ *Yateemut Dahir*, 1:284 [1/395-396].

Introduction to the poet

Abu Hamid Ahmad bin Muhammad Antaki, resident of Egypt, famous as Abu Raqamaq, was a famous personality, who had command over the art of poetry and his style was inimitable; his eloquence at the peak, only sometimes accompanied with humor to some extent. He grew up in Shaam, then moved to Egypt and became famous over there and achieved great prominence in the literary field.

Ibne Khallikan has mentioned his biography in his *Tarikh*¹ and after praising him, and mention of some of his verses, has written as follows:

Amir Mukhtar Masabahi has mentioned him in his *Tarikh Misr* and said: He passed away in 399 A.H...and I think that he died in Egypt.

30. Abul Aala Sarawi

1. After the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), Ali is my Imam. He would intercede for me before Almighty Allah. 2. I don't claim anything regarding Ali (a.s.), except merits, which are undoubted. 3. And I don't claim that he is a prophet, but on the basis of clear evidences, he is the Imam. 4. The statement of the Prophet, when it was issued, proved excellence for Ali. 5. Know that: Indeed, of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is without any doubt his master.²

Introduction to the poet

Abul Ala Muhammad bin Ibrahim Sarawi was an outstanding poet of Tabaristan and a standard of incomparable excellence. He has corresponded with Abul Fazal bin Umaid (d. 360 A.H.). In the same way, he has books to his credit, interesting and satirical verses and some important ones are mentioned in *Yateematut Dahaar*³.

31. Abu Muhammad Auni

1. My Imam is one, for whom the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) declared on Ghadeer day that whoever denied him, denied Islam. 2. At that time, he rose up and began to recite the sermon and after divine praise, clearly declared: 3. Know that: This Murtada, husband of Fatima, Ali, the pleased, is my son-in-law and what a good son-in-law he is. 4. He is the inheritor of my knowledge and my successor among you and I declare immunity from all his enemies. 5. Did you hear? Do you obey? Did you pay attention to me? All said: We will never disobey his commands. 6. We heard and we obeyed, so rest assured from our side, but they intended to deceive and cheat.⁴

¹ *Wafiyatul Ayan*, 1:42 [1/131, No. 54].

² Ibne Shahr Ashob has mentioned these verses in *Manaqib*, 1:531 Iran [3/39].

³ *Yateematut Dahaar*, 4:48 [4/56].

⁴ *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob 1:532, Iran [3/40].

Introduction to the poet

Abu Muhammad Talha bin Ubaidullah bin Abi Aun Ghassani¹ Aini: perhaps his fame, his eloquent verses and his satirical words, which are compiled in books, would make us needless of his introduction, expertise and creativeness. As his life history and his compact and detailed verses make the researcher needless to prove his Shia faith and his being an ardent follower of Wilayat.

His verses in praise of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) are mentioned in *Manaqib* of Ibne Shahr Ashob, *Rauzatul Waizeen* of Fattal and *Siratul Mustaqim* of Bayazi.

32. Ibne Hammad Abdi

Some of panegyrics, in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) are as follows:

1.

1. By your life, O stalwart of Ghadeer day. You are definitely having precedence over others 2. You are the brother of one, who is superior to all the creatures. You became his soul in the event of Mubahila. 3. You are his beloved brother, purified son-in-law and father of Imam Hasan (Shabbar) and Imam Husain (Shabbir). 4. And you are the man, who paid no attention to the world and there is no one like you regarding this. 5. Indeed, for a spring burst forth like the neck of a camel. 6. So, a person came with haste to convey the glad tidings of the spring. Ali said: O giver of glad tidings, glad tidings to you. 7. As I have dedicated this spring to Almighty Allah, the owner of honor and might. 8. He always remarked: O world, deceive someone else; as I won't be deceived by you. 9. He and his wife adopted patience in distress. So they earned the rewards of those, who are patient. 10. Umme Aiman said: I went to Lady Zahra (s.a.) when it was extremely hot. 11. When neared, I heard a call and saw that mill turning without anyone operating it. 12. So I came to the door and knocked, but there was no one present there. 13. I came to Mustafa and related the strange episode, which had amazed me. 14. Mustafa said: I thank God for perfecting the bounty on Zahra (s.a.). 15. The Almighty Allah saw that Zahra was exhausted, so the giver of exceeding favors made her asleep. 16. And He appointed an angel to operate the mill. So I returned while my being was full of joy. 17. He (Ali), as per the orders of God, married Fatima, whose conduct was immaculate. 18. Her dower was deemed as one-fifth of the earth with all its goodness. 19. Then he is the best of men and she is the best of women, and her dower is the best of dowers. 20. Her two sons have precedence over all creatures, according to the clarification of the kind and informed Lord. 21. Almighty Allah deemed their love to be the recompense of prophethood.

¹ Ghassan is a locality around Yemen from where the tribe of Ghassan comes. Or it is a locality besides Mashannal mountain near Johfa.

Explanation

The following merits of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) are mentioned in this poem:

1. Tradition of establishment of brotherhood between Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as was mentioned before.¹
2. Incident of Mubahila; in which, according to Quran,² he was declared to be the self of Prophet.
3. Tradition of bursting forth of the spring, which Hafiz Ibne Samman has mentioned in *Mawafiq* and Mohibuddin Tabari has quoted him in *Riyazun Nazara*.³ And it is that: Umar gave a plot of land to Ali (a.s.) in Yanba. Then Imam (a.s.) purchased a piece of land near that plot and dug a well there. When labors were digging the well, suddenly water burst forth like the neck of a camel. Someone came to Ali and conveyed the good news. He said: Convey glad tidings to the heir. Then he gave it as Sadaqah (endowed it).

Ibne Abil Hadeed writes in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*:⁴

“It is mentioned in a report that a person came to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in order to convey glad tidings to him that a water spring has burst forth on his plot of land and he repeated twice: Give glad tidings to the successor. Give glad tidings to the successor. Then Ali (a.s.) endowed that for the poor and wrote the document of endowment that very moment.”

Hamawi in *Mojamul Buldan*,⁵ Samhudi in *Wafaul Wafa*⁶ and others have hinted at the endowments of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in Yanba.

4. Statement of His Eminence: “O world, deceive someone else,” as we mentioned before.⁷ Some tradition scholars have narrated it.

5. Tradition of the mill operating on its own. Scholars of traditions have quoted this report in words of Abu Zar Ghiffari, who says that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) sent him after Ali (a.s.). He saw the mill stone rotating and grinding grain, without there being anyone to operate the mill. So he informed the Prophet of this. His Eminence said:

“O Abu Zar, do you not know that Almighty Allah has angels, who roam the earth and they are appointed to help Aale Muhammad (a.s.)?”⁸

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 287-290.

² “Then say: Come let us call our sons and your sons and our women and your women and our near people and your near people, then let us be earnest in prayer, and pray for the curse of Allah on the liars.” (Surah Aale Imran 3:61)

³ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:228 [3/183].

⁴ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 2:260 [1/290, Sermon 119].

⁵ *Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 8:256 [5/450].

⁶ *Wafaul Wafa*, 2:393 [4/1334].

⁷ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 218.

⁸ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:223 [3/177]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 105 [176]; *Isafur Raghibeen*, 158; *Aajab Maa Raita*, 1:8; *Al-Imam Ali*, Shaykh Muhammad Reza, 18.

6. Tradition of the marriage of Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.).¹
7. That love for Aale Muhammad (a.s.) is the recompense for his prophethood, as was mentioned before in detail.²

2. Another Qasida in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)

1. The day of Ghadeer is the most excellent day and having an exalted rank in Islam. 2. It is the day, on which God made our Imam caretaker of religion, my implication is successor of Prophet and leader of every Imam. 3. On Ghadeer day, the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said holding the hand of Ali (a.s.): 4. Of whomsoever I am the master, this is his master. According to revelation of the Most Powerful. 5. This Ali is my vizier on you during my lifetime, and when I pass away, he would be my successor. 6. O God, love those, who believe in his Mastership (*Wilayat*) and give death of unrightfulness to one, who is inimical to him. 7. Then hands of people stretched out to pay the oath of fealty one after another.

This poet has also written other Ghadeer Qasidas.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Hasan Ali bin Hammad bin Ubaidullah bin Hammad Adawi Abdi³ Basri.

His father was Hammad, a poet loyal to Ahle Bayt (a.s.), as our poet, his son, Ali, mentions him in his Qasida:

“Indeed, Ali bin Hammad is your slave as Hammad was your littérateur. Before me, my father composed poems in your praise and advised me not to discontinue this practice.”

Ibne Hammad was a prominent Shia personality and a great scholar and topmost poets of the first period and a tradition scholar contemporary to Shaykh Saduq.

Najjashi had met him and he wrote in his *Rijal*:⁴ I have met him, but Abu Ahmad Jaludi Basri (d. 332 A.H.) has narrated on the authority of Shaykh Abu Abdullah Husain bin Ubaidullah Ghazairi (d. 411 A.H.). From this aspect Ali bin Hammad was a teacher of these gentlemen, who are mentioned as authorities in his chains and all of them were established scholars of traditions; and this proves his reliability and expertise in science of traditions.

However with regard to poetry, no one has any doubt that he is its standard bearer and the maker of it rules. One, who arranged its verses, and among those, who are at the forefront, who urges the riders and who gathers the scattered

¹ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 215-216 & 252.

² Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 211-212.

³ Attributed to Abdul Qays.

⁴ *Rijal Najjashi* [Pg. 244, No. 640].

forces. In collections,¹ his name is mentioned as Ziyad and couplets are commonly present in books and collections.

He composed excessive and beautiful verses in favor of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). He praised and extolled them to a great extent and did that openly, in such a way that Ibne Shahr Ashob has included him among poets who praised Ahle Bayt (a.s.) openly.

Allamah Samawi has compiled his poems in his collection of poems in praise about Ahle Bayt (a.s.) comprising 2200 couplets. His couplets are far from imaginative forms, on the contrary, his couplets are expressive evidences and stable proofs based on Shiite faith.

Birth and death

We have not discovered the dates of his birth and death. We only know: that Najjashi has met, but he has not narrated from him. He was born in Safar 372 A.H. and his teacher, Jaludi Basri, from whom our poet has quoted, died in 17 Zilhajj 332 A.H. It can be concluded from these two dates that our poet was born in the beginning of the fourth century and passed away at the end of it.

He has said in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.):

1. For us the reliable Shaykh Muhammad Jarir has narrated from Sadaqah 2. A report, whose context and conclusion has no contradiction from Anas from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) 3. I saw him on Mt. Hira that he was Ali, the owner of intellect 4. He plucked from the air something like grapes. 5. So both of them ate till they were satiated. 6. And I saw that the cloud rose up and my amazement increased. 7. It was food from Paradise, which God had sent. 8. It was one of the choicest gifts for the chosen man.

In these verses, the poet has hinted at the report, which Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari has narrated through his chains from Anas.

Anas says: One day, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) mounted his beast and went towards Mt. Kada² and said:

“O Anas, go with this mount to such and such place. You will find Ali sitting there on pebbles and reciting divine praise. Convey my greetings to him and mount him on the beast and bring him here.”

Anas says: When I went there, I found Ali as I was told and I said: “The

¹ Like *Rijal* of Najjashi, 171 [244, No. 640]; *Aizahul Ishtibah*, Allamah Hilli [Pg. 218]; *Riyazul Ulama* [4/70].

² A hill to the north of Mecca, to the rear of Kada and it implies the path between two mountains. It is mentioned in Sunni and Shia books of jurisprudence that it is recommended that at the time of entering Mecca, one should enter from the rear of Kada which is located above Mecca and to leave from behind Kada as the Prophet followed this practice. It is mentioned in some Shia books of jurisprudence that it is recommended to enter Mecca from, the rear of Kada, which is located to the north of Mecca and at the time of leaving Mecca one should exit from Zee Tuwa, which is to the south of Mecca. Ref: *Fathul Aziz*, Abdul Karim Rafei, 7/268; *Taajul Oroos*, 20/118-119; *Jawahir*, 19/282.

Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) has summoned you,” and when he came to the Prophet, he said: “Take a seat, this is the place, where seventy messenger prophets have sat; and no prophet has sat here, but that I am better than him. With every prophet a brother has also sat and no brother has sat here, but that you are better than him.”

Anas says: So I saw a white cloud shading them and they began to eat grapes from it and the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “Brother, eat it, as it is a gift from Almighty Allah for me and then for you.”

Then they drank water and then the cloud rose up. Then he said: “O Anas, by the one, who creates whatever He likes, three hundred and thirteen prophets and three hundred and thirteen successors have eaten from this cloud and among them there was no prophet better than me and no successor better than Ali.”

33. Abul Faraj Razi

تجلى الهدى يوم الغدير على الشبه وبرز ابريز البیان عن الشیه

1. Guidance became clear on the day of Ghadeer and everything became crystal clear for all and no ambiguity remained. 2. The Lord of the Throne completed the religion by sending Quran and making everything clear. 3. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) rose up among people while he had raised the hand of Ali. 4. And said: Know that of whomsoever I am the master, this one is (also) his master. And what a great excellence this is!¹

Introduction to the poet

Abul Faraj Muhammad bin Hindu Razi.

Aale Hindu: A clan, which ascribed to the Shia faith and which became famous for its knowledge and literature they possessed various kinds of merits. Their writings and poems had precedence over that of others, so much so that collections are full of their compositions.

34. Ja’far bin Husain

“Indeed, Imamate is proved for one, who is the successor of someone like Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). The Prophet declared on Ghadeer day: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. Convey this to all the people.”

Allamah Amini says: It is possible that this poet was a descendant of Abu Abdullah Husain bin Hajjaj or was his contemporary. Although we mentioned him in this century, we were unable to find any details about him in books.

At the end, we would like to mention that we have found a number of Ghadeer poems of the fourth century, but since we do not know about their accounts and histories of their lives, we have refrained from mentioning them.

¹ *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, 1:531, Iran, [3/37]; *Siratul Mustaqim*, Bayazi, [1/311].

Poets of Ghadeer in the fifth century Hijri

35. Abu Najib Tahir
36. Sayyid Razi
37. Abu Muhammad Suri
38. Mahiyar Dailami
39. Sayyid Murtada
40. Abu Ali Basir
41. Abul Alaa Muarra
42. Moyyad fid Deen
43. Jabri Misri

35. Abu Najib Tahir

Died: 401 A.H.

1. Muslims consider the day of Ghadeer as an Eid (feast) and one, who is inimical to Muslims denies that it is Eid. 2. O one, who denies the rank of Muhammad, the chosen Prophet, may you be destroyed and remain in loss. 3. Allah, the Mighty and High revealed this verse: This day, I have perfected your religion for you. 4. And today I complete the favor on you and indeed divine favors are due to the appointment of the Imam.¹

Introduction to the poet

Abu Najib Shaddad bin Ibrahim bin Hasan, known by the title of Tahir Jazari is from the poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), who composed different kinds of various couplets voiced with flowing lines, having appropriate wordings and depth of meaning.

He has a collection (*Diwan*) to his credit.

Ibne Shahr Ashob says in *Mualimul Ulama*² that he is included him among poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), who openly composed poems about them.

It is mentioned in *Mojamul Odaba*³ that He passed away in 401 A.H.

36. Sayyid Razi

Born 359 A.H.

Died: 406 A.H.

1. The tongue spoke up from consciousness and a pleasing countenance is the sign of a giver of glad tiding. 2. Now, you made the hearts free of malice. 3. With the light of the bright morning darkness went to rest. 4. Happiness and ease were disloyal to you and the day of Ghadeer was occasion of its fulfillment. 5. The day when the successor encompassed it, when he was given the title of Amir. 6. Then on this day give consolation and return the trust to its owner. 7. A long life accompanied by happiness prevails on a life of sorrow. 8. We remove grief through the clear drink for a heart other than your heart. 9. At the time of demanding, do not be content with less. 10. Requesting for less is like asking for a little water, which is in a deep hole. 11. It is now time that they would fulfill the needs and change the small hopes for big. 12. So, let your soul-increasing breeze to blow upon us in excess. 13. You are not needful of a companion and servant, as you are between teats producing excess milk. 14. The effect of your thanks is in my mouth and the sign of your love is there in my heart. 15. This virgin verse is like a green and fresh garden. 16. As the owner himself becomes pleased due

¹ *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, 1:528 [3/32].

² *Mualimul Ulama*, [Pg 149].

³ *Mo'jamul Odaba*, 4:216 [11/270].

to the joy of numerous trees by the pond of water.¹

Introduction to the poet

Sayyid Razi – Zul Hasbain – Abul Hasan Muhammad bin Abu Ahmad Husain bin Moosa bin Muhammad bin Moosa bin Ibrahim Ibne Imam Abu Ibrahim Moosa Kazim (a.s.).

His mother was Sayyida Fatima, daughter of Husain bin Abu Muhammad Hasan Atrosh bin Ali bin Hasan bin Ali bin Umar bin Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).

His father, Abu Ahmad commanded great respect in the government of Abbasids and Buwaihids and he made singular contribution to Shia religion and was absolutely determined in his efforts.

He was born in 304 A.H. and passed away on Friday, 25 Jamiul Awwal, 400 A.H.²

Poets have composed numerous poems in his praise among them being his two sons: Sayyid Razi and Sayyid Murtada, and Mahiyar Dailami.

Sayyid Razi was the pride of the Holy Progeny and an expert of science of religion and literature. He was the owner of knowledge inherited from his ancestors and in morals and conduct, he was liked by all.

He possessed a dominant view, magnanimous nature, the best of morals, exceeding good manners, noble lineage, ancestry of Prophet, Alawite nobility, Fatimid greatness and Kazimite leadership of the first degree.

His teachers

Among his teachers were:

1. Abu Saeed Hasan bin Abdullah bin Marzaban Nahwi, famous as Sairafi (d. 368 A.H.). When Sayyid Razi was not even ten years old, he became his student in Arabic grammar.³
2. Abu Ali Hasan bin Ahmad Farsi Nahwi (d. 377 A.H.).
3. Abul Fatah Uthman bin Jinni Mosuli (d. 392 A.H.).
4. The great teacher, Shaykh Mufeed, Abu Abdullah bin Muallim Muhammad bin Noman (d. 413 A.H.). Sayyid and Razi and his brother, Alamul Huda, Sayyid Murtada studied traditions and jurisprudence under Shaykh Mufeed.

The author of *Ad-Darajatul Rafia*⁴ says:

“Shaykh Mufeed had a dream that he was in the Masjid in Karkh when Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.), daughter of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) came to him accompanied by Imam Hasan and Imam Husain (a.s.), who were young and she

¹ *Diwan Sayyid Razi*, 1:327 [1/427]. In this verse he has extolled his father on Ghadeer Day and mentions that in the year 396 A.H. his properties were restored to him.

² Sihahul Akhbar, 60; Darajatul Rafia, [Pg. 458].

³ Ref: *Wafayatul Ayan*, [4/416, No. 667].

⁴ *Darajatul Rafia*, 459; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 1:13 [1/41].

entrusted them to the Shaykh, saying: “Teach jurisprudence to these two.”

The Shaykh woke up and was amazed at this dream. The next morning, Fatima, daughter of Nasir, came to Shaykh Mufeed in the Masjid surrounded by her maids, with her two young sons: Ali Murtada and Muhammad Razi. The Shaykh arose from his place, welcomed and greeted her with respect.

Fatima said: ‘O Shaykh, I have brought these two sons of mine so that you may teach jurisprudence to them.’

The Shaykh cried and mentioned his dream and undertook the instruction of the two boys. Almighty Allah endowed them with a special favor and they expounded numerous topics of religion for which they have become immortal forever.”

His students and those who have narrated from him

A number of Shia and Sunni scholars have narrated from him, among them being:

1. Shaykhut Taifah, Abu Ja’far Muhammad bin Hasan Tusi (d. 460 A.H.).¹
2. Qaazi Abul Maali Ahmad bin Ali bin Qudama (d. 486 A.H.).
3. Abu Bakr Ahmad bin Husain bin Ahmad Nishapuri Khuzai.

Books and writings

1. *Nahjul Balagha*, it is a book, which the past and present scholars have memorized like memorization of Quran and through this, they seek divine rewards. From the time of Sayyid Razi, till date, around seventy commentaries are written upon it. Following are some commentators of *Nahjul Balagha*:

1. Sayyid Ali bin Nasir, contemporary of Sayyid Razi. He entitled his commentary: *Aalaame Nahjul Balagha*. It is the most ancient commentary of *Nahjul Balagha*.
2. Abul Husain Saeed bin Hibatullah Qutubuddin Rawandi (d. 573 A.H.). He entitled his commentary as *Minhajul Baraat*.
3. Kamaluddin Shaykh Mitham bin Ali bin Mitham Bahrani (d. 679). He has written a long, medium as well as a short commentary on *Nahjul Balagha*.
4. Allamah Hilli Jamaluddin Abu Mansur Hasan bin Yusuf bin Mutahhar (d. 726 A.H.).
5. Shaykh Bahai Amili (d. 1031 A.H.) – his commentary is not complete.
6. Sayyid Nimatullah bin Abdullah Jazaeri Shustari (d. 1112 A.H.). His commentary comprises of three volumes.
7. Shaykh Muhammad Abduh (d. 1323 A.H.).
8. Haaj Mirza Habibullah Musawi Khoei (d. 1326 A.H.). His detailed

¹ I often ask that when Shaykh Tusi came to Baghdad in 408 A.H. how did he narrate traditions from Sayyid Razi, who passed away in 406 A.H., inspite of the fact that this point is often mentioned in our chains of narrators. (*Translator*)

commentary is entitled *Minhajul Baraa*.

Other writings

2. *Khasaisul Aaimma*: He has mentioned this book in the beginning of *Nahjul Balaghah* and has described it.
3. Majazatul Aatahrun Nabawiya.
4. Collection of verses.

Poetry of Sayyid Razi

It is clear that one, who is aware of the personal qualities of the Sayyid and his lofty rank in knowledge and leadership, he would regard poetry to be below his dignity, and find him higher in rank than the best of poets, and conclude that poetry has not added anything to his stature, has not left any effect on his loftiness and majesty and has not brought him any greatness; because he used to compose verses during his childhood when he was not even ten years old.

Sometimes he saw himself as the best in poetry, sometimes regarded his own compositions better than those of Bahtari and Muslim bin Walid, and sometimes, he was humble and compared himself to Farazdaq or Jarir or saw himself an equal of Zuhair; sometimes he looked at his poetry with submissive eyes and regarded his compositions better than that of others, and majority of scholars have consensus that he was the most righteous from the poets of Quraish.

Birth and death

According to the consensus of historians, Sayyid Razi was born in 359 A.H. in Baghdad and lived there only. As mentioned in *Fehrist Najashi*, he passed away there only on Sunday, 6th Mohurrum 406 A.H.¹

Numerous writers² say that he was buried in his house in Karkh locality. After that his remains were shifted to Kerbala and he was buried near his father Abu Ahmad Husain bin Moosa. It is concluded from history that his grave was widely believed to be in the middle part of the shrine of Imam Husain (a.s.) [between 6th to 9th Hijri].³

37. Abu Muhammad Suri

Born 339 A.H. approx.

Died: 419 A.H.

“O Abul Hasan, oath-breaking and dishonesty of people becomes clear with regard to the covenant of God, which was taken on Ghadeer day. Indeed the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) delivered a sermon to them and guided

¹ *Rijal Najashi*, [Pg. 398, No. 1065].

² Ref: Umdatul Talib fee Ansab Aale Abi Talib, [Pg. 210].

³ Ref: Umdatul Talib fee Ansab Aale Abi Talib, [Pg. 53].

the believers to one, who would be the Amir (chief). On that day, every implication was to his Caliphate and Mastership (*Wilayat*), but they opposed one, who hinted at that (Prophet).”¹

Introduction to the poet

Abu Muhammad Abdul Mohsin bin Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Ghalib² bin Ghalbun Suri: he was a religious noble from the fourth century, who lived till the beginning of the fifth century.

Eloquence and clarity has gathered in his compositions and his collected poems (*Diwan*) is the testimony of his Shia faith. Ibne Shahr Ashob has also included him among the poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), who openly composed poems in their praise.³

Ibne Khallikan has also mentioned his biography.⁴ Therein he has extolled the merits of his poetry and written:

He passed away on Sunday, 9 Shawwal, 419 A.H. At that time he was aged eighty or more years.

38. Mahyar Dailami

Died: 428 A.H.

وَاسْأَلْهُمْ يَوْمَ خَانُوا لَمْ خَلُعوا
لَمْ يَنْفُعُ السَّيْفُ صَلَّى تَحْتَهُ طَبَعَ
لَهُ الْوَلَايَةُ لَمْ خَانُوا لَمْ خَلُعوا

1. They were asked why after pledging allegiance to Ali on Ghadeer day, they broke it? And why they shirked? 2. They issued positive statements, but harbored evil thoughts, a sharpening followed by bluntness has no benefit for the sword. 3. O Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), denial of Mastership (*Wilayat*) after they confessed to it, was a shame they chose. 4. They contradicted the oath and paid scant attention to the bequest made to them; by your life, it was a second Shariat that they founded after the Prophet.

Ustad Ahmad Amin Misri writes about the following couplet of Mahiyar:

تَضَاعَ بِيَعْتَهُ يَوْمَ الْغَدَيرِ لَهُمْ
بَعْدَ الرِّضَا وَتَحْاطَ الْرُّومُ وَالْبَيْعَ

“Their allegiance on Ghadeer day was cancelled after assent and as a result the Romans and their churches remained established.”

“Al-Ghadeer is the same Ghadeer Khum between Mecca and Medina. It is

¹ *Diwan Suri*, [1/186, No. 107].

² In the addenda to *Yateematu Dahr*, 1:35 [5/46], Talib is mentioned instead of Ghalib, which is an error.

³ *Maalimul Ulama*, [Pg. 151].

⁴ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:334 [3/232, No. 406].

said that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) delivered a sermon at that place and said: Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master.”¹

Allamah Amini says: Alas, if I only knew, how this widely narrated tradition, which is narrated by a hundred or more companions, has remained concealed from this teacher (*Ustad*) or prejudice impelled him to cast a veil of falsehood over it that it may remain concealed from readers and that facts should remain undiscovered. By using the term of ‘it is said’ he implies the weakness of the report.

قُلْ هُوَ نَبُوَّا عَظِيمٌ ۝ أَنْتُمْ عَنْهُ مُعْرِضُونَ ۝

“Say: It is a message of importance, (And) you are turning aside from it.”²

And:

الَّذِينَ أَتَيْنَاهُمُ الْكِتَابَ يَعْرِفُونَهُ كَمَا يَعْرِفُونَ أَبْنَاءَهُمْ

“Those whom We have given the Book recognize him as they recognize their sons”³

Introduction to the poet

Abul Hasan⁴ Mahiyar bin Marzuya Dailami Baghdadi. He is the highest standard, which was raised for literature in the east and the west of Arabia. He is the finest treasure of excellence, has produced the finest literature of his time, and established its foundations. The greatest proof of this is his bulky collected works (*Diwan*) comprising of four volumes.

His verses regarding religion

They are proofs; and we did not find anything in them, except definite reasonings, genuine praises or complaints against oppression. Perhaps it is this reasoning, which impelled his malicious adversaries to conceal his merits and they did not provide any hint to his worthy life. His past, when he was a Persian Majusi before, does not cause any harm to him, as today he is a Muslim in his religion, Alawite by faith and Arabic in his culture. And if it would have caused him to be held accountable due to his past, all companions should be taken to account for their past beliefs and acts. But Islam forgives the past.⁵

This poet embraced Islam at the hands of Sayyid Razi in the year 394 A.H.⁶ He studied literature and poetry under him and passed away on Saturday, 5th

¹ Diwan Mahiyar, 2:182.

² Surah Saad 38:67-68

³ Surah Baqarah 2:146

⁴ In some ancient sources, it is mentioned as Abul Husain [*Wafayatul Ayan*, 5/359, No. 755; *Maalimul Ulama*, 148].

⁵ Majmauz Zawaad, 1/31; Kanzul Ummaal, 751-752.

⁶ *Al-Kamil*, Ibne Asir, 9:170 [6/85, Events of 428 A.H.].

Jamadius Thani, 428 A.H.

39. Sayyid Murtada

Born 355 A.H.

Died: 436 A.H.

1. But the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) declared his Mastership (*Wilayat*). Alas, if his warnings had been profitable for the unjust. 2. He clearly declared his Mastership (*Wilayat*) in such a way that no excuse remained for anyone. 3. And they submitted to him and he deemed him to be the clear sign of salvation. 4. Indeed, the day of Ghadeer made some people elated and destroyed some. 5. Their malice was revealed; thus it caused breathing to stop in the chests and prevented the wail of their malice and jealousy.¹

Introduction to the poet

Sayyid Murtada Alamil Huda – owner of two nobilities² – Abul Qasim Ali bin Husain bin Moosa bin Muhammad bin Moosa bin Ibrahim bin Imam Moosa Kazim (a.s.).

He was an Imam of jurisprudence, founder of the principles of jurisprudence, teacher of scholastic theology, expert of poetry, tradition scholar, stalwart of debate, leader in language and expert of all Arabic sciences, point of reference in Quranic exegesis.

In other words, there is no excellence, but that he was having it. In addition to that his lineage was impeccable and he was imbued with prophetic fragrance and Alawite excellence and also his services and efforts in exaltation of Shia religion, to which all Imamiyah are thankful, added to his excellence. Due to this his good name and eternal greatness has remained etched in history.

Among these merits are his important books and writings; which have been used by scholars of religion at all times.

His praises

In Tatmeem Yateematu Dahr,³ Thalabi says:

“Today, majesty and nobility, knowledge and literature, excellence and leadership end with Sayyid Murtada of Baghdad. He has composed extremely beautiful verses.”

It is mentioned in *Tarikh Ibne Khallikan*:⁴

“He was a leader in scholastic theology, literature and poetry; and has writings according to Shia faith and fundamentals of religion.”

¹ *Diwan*, Sharif Murtada, [4/479].

² A Sayyid from both parents.

³ Tatmeem Yateematu Dahr, 1:53 [5/69, No. 49].

⁴ *Wafayatul Ayan*, [3/313, No. 443].

His teachers and from whom he has narrated

Among them being:

1. Shaykh Mufeed Muhammad bin Muhammad Noman (d. 412 A.H.).
2. Husain bin Ali bin Babawayh, brother of Saduq.
3. Shaykh Saduq, Muhammad bin Ali bin Husain bin Babawayh Qummi (d. 381 A.H.).

Students

Among them being:

1. Shaykhut Taifah, Abu Ja'far Tusi (d. 460 A.H.)
2. Sharif Abu Yaala Sallar bin Abdul Aziz Dailami.
3. Abu Salah Faqih bin Najm Halani, successor of the Sayyid in Halab.
4. Qaazi Abdul Aziz bin Barraj Tarabulisi (d. 481 A.H.).
5. Sharif Abu Yaala Muhammad bin Hasan bin Hamza Jafari (d. 463 A.H.).
6. Shaykh Abul Maali Ahmad bin Qadama.¹

Birth and death

Sayyid Murtada was born in Rajab, 355 A.H. and he passed away on Sunday, 25 Rabiul Awwal, year 436 A.H.

He was buried the same night in his house. Later, his last remains were transferred to Kerbala and buried in his family cemetery as mentioned in *Umdatul Talib*.²

His grave in Kerbala is famous like the graves of his father and brother, Sayyid Razi.

40. Abu Ali Basir

Died: 422 A.H.

1. Pure is God, who does not have any partner or simile in the earth and heavens. 2. He encompasses all the worlds and He is powerful. I testify that there is god, except Him. 3. Ahmad, the seal of prophets is my master. Almighty Allah specified him by this name. 4. On the day he was sent, the earth became illuminated and truth became apparent from his face. 5. On Ghadeer day, he chose Haider as brother from all the people and pledged brotherhood with him. 6. He contested the polytheists in *Mubahila* with him, his wife and his two sons. 7. They were five persons, through whom people would get divine mercy; and supplication is accepted through them.³

¹ Ref: *Behaarul Anwaar*, 25:53 [107/153].

² *Umdatul Talib fee Ansab Aale Abi Talib*, [Pg. 205].

³ Allamah Samawi has mentioned these verses in Part One of his book, *At-Taliaa fee Shuara Shia*. Formerly, he was known as Abu Ali Zarir and Hamawi [*Mojamul Odaba*, 9/192] has mentioned four lines from him and has attributed them to his son, Umar Abu Hafas; and

Introduction to the poet

Abu Ali Basir – Zarir – Hasan bin Muzaffar, was in fact Nishapuri, but he was born in Khwarizm. Ibne Shahr Ashob¹ has mentioned him among the most religious poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

He taught literature to the people of Khwarizm and was their teacher and poet; and in the first ranks of advising them. He wrote books like *Tahzeeb Diwanul Adab, Islahul Mantiq* and *Collection* of his verses.

His son, Abu Hafas, Umar was a jurist, an accomplished scholar and littérateur; and he died in 532 A.H.²

41. Abul Alaa Muarra

Born 363 A.H.

Died: 449 A.H.

“It is an effulgence invisible to the blind eyes and a statement wasted on the ears of deaf. By your life, I am not elated on the day of Eidul Fitr, Eid of sacrifice and Ghadeer Khum. How often a deviated person exposes his Shiaism for the sake of relations he has in the city of Qom.”

Explanation of the verses and account of the poet

These verses are from Abul Alaa’s Qasida quoted in *Luzum Maa laa Yalzim*.³ Its Egyptian commentator writes:

“Ghadeer Khum is located between Mecca and Medina at a distance of three miles from Johfa to the left of the road. Abul Alaa hints at his Shia faith through the words, because it was at this place that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), upon his return from the farewell Hajj said regarding Ali (a.s.): Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. And the Shia make pilgrimage to this place.”

Biographers have mentioned Abul Alaa Muarra in excess; such that his reputation among poets has scaled lofty heights. His collected works (*Diwan*) is the best testimony of his genius.

The best biography is one written by Kamaluddin Umar bin Ahmad bin Adeem Hilli (d. 606 A.H.) and entitled: *Al-Insaf wal Taharra fee Dafe Zulm wal Tajarra an Abil Alaa al-Muarra*. Its gist is mentioned in the fourth volume of *Tarikh Halab*.⁴

Allah knows best.

¹ *Maalimul Ulama* [Pg. 152].

² *Mo’jamul Odaba*, 9:191-198, Latest edition.

³ *Luzum Maa laa Yalzim*, 2:318 [2/461].

⁴ *Elamun Nubla ba Tareekh Halabush Shahba*, 4:77-180 [4/78-172, No. 63].

42. Moyyad fid Deen

Died: 470 A.H.

He has composed a Qasida of 57 lines, which is present in his collected poems.¹ Among them being the following verses:

1. That illuminated dome is the dome of Haider, who is the successor of one, whom Almighty Allah sent for guidance. 2. Successor of Holy Prophet, Mustafa and his cousin. He was one, who became the Master in Ghadeer. 3. He is the one, regarding whom his followers said what followers of Christ said about him (claim of divinity). 4. How nice it is to circle his sarcophagus, while continuously, I recite benedictions upon him. 5. How nice it is that I rub both sides of my face on the grave. And how great it is that while reciting confidential supplications, I throw myself on the tomb.

Introduction to the poet

He is Hibtullah bin Moosa bin Dawood Shirazi, Moayyad fed Deen, Dai ad-Dua. He was an exceptional scholar and among the rarest persons in the Ummah.

He was born in Shiraz around 390 A.H. and he passed away in 470 A.H. in Egypt.

His writings testify to his expertise in debates, his encompassing knowledge about religious sciences, proficiency in knowledge of Quran and Sunnah, and awareness of subtle points.

All this is mentioned in his own account of the period between 429 and 450 A.H. and this book, is source of researchers about him. This book was published in Egypt, comprising of 184 pages.

43. Jabri Misri

1. O followers, who has lost the path of their guidance. Indeed one from whom you wanted to be guided, has misguided you. 2. And you have broken the staff of Holy Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) and after the Prophet became disowned by your father. 3. You broke the pledge you made with him on Ghadeer day. What excuse do you have? 4. So, know that by this act of yours, you have turned to the past (Jahiliyya).²

Introduction to the poet

Ibne Jabar Misri is a poet of Egypt during Fatimid Caliphate of Mustansir Billah. He was born in 420 A.H. and passed away in 487 A.H.

Other Qasidas of Ghadeer exist attributed to Ibne Tuti Wasti, Khatib Manbaji, Ali bin Ahmad Maghribi, who are poets of the fifth century and these Qasidas are mentioned in *Manaqib* of Ibne Shahr Ashob, *Tafseer* of Abul Fatuh

¹ Diwan Moyyad, 245.

² These verses are quoted from an old edition inscribed in the middle ages. Nine verses from this poem are mentioned in *Ayanush Shia*, Part 15, Pg. 263 [4/63].

Razi, *Siratul Mustaqim* of Bayazi, *Durrarun Nazeem fil Aaimmatul Hameem* of Ibne Hatim Damishqi and other books.

But we have not mentioned them, since we don't know the life accounts of these poets. But in any case, they have definitely mentioned the event of Ghadeer in their poems and concluded from them: Imamate, authority in religion and precedence.

Poets of Ghadeer in the sixth century Hijri

- 44. Abul Hasan Fanjkardi
- 45. Ibne Munir Tarabulusi
- 46. Qaazi Ibne Qadoos
- 47. Malik Salih
- 48. Ibne Awdi Neeli
- 49. Qaazi Jalees
- 50. Ibne Makki Neeli
- 51. Khatib Khwarizmi
- 52. Faqih Ummara
- 53. Sayyid Muhammad Aqsasi
- 54. Qutubuddin Rawandi
- 55. Sibte Ibne Taaweezi

44. Abul Hasan Fanjkardi

Born 433 A.H.

Died: 513 A.H.

كالشيش في اشر اقهاب اظهر	لاتنكرن غدير خم انه
خير البر يا احمد لا ينكر	ما كان معروفا بأسناد الى
وجلاله حتى القيامه يذكر	فيه امامه حيدرو كماله
من يأخذ الاحكام منه ي باثر	اولى الانام بان يوالى المرضي

1. Do not deny Ghadeer Khum. Indeed it is like a brilliant sun; rather, more illuminated than it. 2. That which has come from the best of creatures – that is Ahmad (s.a.w.a.) – should not be denied. 3. Ghadeer Khum is the Imamate, perfection and glory of Haider, which shall be mentioned till Judgment Day. 4. The most eligible of all for Mastership (*Wilayat*) and friendship of Murtada are those, who take their laws from him; and who give him precedence over others.

Explanation

In *Rauzatul Waizeen*, our Shaykh, Fattal Nishapuri has attributed these verses to Fanjkardi. Fattal was his contemporary and Ibne Shahr Ashob has also mentioned these couplets in his *Manaqib*.¹

Fanjkardi was among the leaders of science of lexicology, who was mastered the meanings and conjugations of Arabic words. He was among those, who are aware of proper use of idiom, melody of discourse and tenor of euphemisms. He has understood the term of ‘Maula’ to imply Imamate and point of reference in religious laws. The same meaning is mentioned in his pearl-like couplets. These are among the evidences, which we can understand to be implications of the tradition.

Introduction to the poet

Shaykh Abul Hasan Ali bin Ahmad Fanjkardi Nishapuri² was among the teachers and masters of literature and from leaders and experts in this science. In addition to that he was regarded among the senior scholars of time and teacher of traditions (*Ahadees*).

It is mentioned in *Ansab* of Samani that:

“He passed away on Thursday, 13th of the month of Ramadhan and his

¹ Rauzatul Waizeen, 90 [Pg. 103]; *Manaqib Aale Abi Talib*, 1: 540 [3/55].

² Fanjkardi or Fanjkirdi is derived from Fanjkard, a hamlet on the outskirts of Nishapur. *Al-Ansab* [4/402].

funeral prayers were held in Old Masjid Jamia. He was buried in Hira,¹ in the cemetery of Nuh (a.s.). [Perhaps a cemetery by this name existed there].”

The author of *Riyazul Jannah* has mentioned his biography in the fourth part of his book and mentioned the following couplets:

تَنَافَرْتُ عَنْكَ الْكَلَابُ الشَّارِدَةُ

إِذَا ذَكَرْتُ الْغَرْمَ مِنْ هَاشِمٍ

خَانْتُكَ فِي مَوْلَدِكَ الْوَالِدَةُ

فَقُلْ لَمَنْ لَامَكَ فِي حَبِّهِ

“When you name the white-facedness of the progeny of Hashim, vagrant dogs will leave you. Then say to with one, who condemns you for being devoted to him: Your mother was dishonest in conceiving you.”

Allamah Amini says: In these two couplets, the poets hints at a tradition in which it is mentioned that none but an illegitimate born is inimical to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). Some of these traditions are as follows:

1. Abu Saeed Khudri says: “We, Ansar, tested our children through their devotion to Ali (a.s.). Whenever a child was born among us and he was not devoted to Ali (a.s.), we understood that he was not from our seed.”²

2. Ubadah bin Samit says: “We tested the legitimacy of our children through their devotion to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), and when we found that one of them is not devoted to Ali (a.s.), we understand that he/she is not from our seed and is not born legitimately.”³

In *Asniul Mataalib*,⁴ after quoting this tradition, Hafiz Jazari writes:

“This matter is well known since the early period of Islam that only the illegitimate born are inimical to Ali (a.s.).”

3. Hafiz Hasan bin Ali Adawi has narrated from Ahmad Abda Zabbi from Abu Uyyana from Ibne Zubair from Jabir that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) instructed us to rear our children on love for Ali (a.s.). The authorities of this tradition were authorities of *Saheeh Bukhari* and *Saheeh Muslim*, and all are regarded as trustworthy.

4. In *Kitabul Wilayah*, Hafiz Tabari has quoted the following tradition through his authorities from Ali (a.s.):

“Three persons do not have any affection for me: the illegitimate born, the hypocrite and one, whose mother became pregnant with him during menses.”

5. It is narrated from Abu Bakr that he said: “I saw the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) having pitched a tent, was leaning on an Arabian arch? Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain were present in that tent. He said: ‘O Muslims, I am at peace

¹ A big locality in Nishapur where the tomb of Nuh (a.s.) is located. It is perhaps called as Hira, because some people of Hira Kufa are settled there.

² *Asniul Mataalib*, Hafiz Jazari, 8 [Pg. 58]; *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*, 1:473 [4/110, Sermon 56].

³ *Asniul Mataalib*, Hafiz Jazari, 8 [Pg. 58]; *Nihaya*, Ibne Asir, 1:118 [1/161].

⁴ *Asniul Mataalib*, 8.

with one, who is at peace with the inmates of the tent and I am at war with one, who is at war with them. I am friendly at those, who are friends to them and none, but the fortunate legitimate born will have affection for them and except for the unfortunate illegitimate born, none will be inimical to them.”¹

Numerous poets have mentioned this issue in their compositions, to quote all of whom is not possible. One of those poems is that of Sahib bin Ubbad:²

“1. Doubts are dispelled through affection for Ali, the souls are purified, and generations cleansed. 2. So, when you see his followers, there is excellence and pride in that. 3. And when you see his enemy; then lineage is loaned to them. 4. So, prepare an excuse for his enmity and say: The wall of the house of his father was short.”

He also wrote:

“Affection for Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) is obligatory on everyone, who is present or absent. And one, who is inimical to him, his/her mother was of loose morals and presented herself to every rider and footed one.”

45. Ibne Munir Tarabulusi

Born 473 A.H.

Died: 548 A.H.

وَاللَّهُ يغْفِر لِلْمُسِيءِ إِذَا تَنْصَلُ وَاعْتَذِرُ الْأَلِمْنَ جَهْدُ الْوَصْيِ وَلَاءُهُ وَلِمَنْ كَفَرَ
وَاحْتَذِرْ كُلَّ الْحَذَرِ فَاخْشِ الْأَلِهِ بِسُوءِ فَعْلِكَ

“Allah Almighty forgives the sinful man, if he abstains from sins and seeks forgiveness. But one, who denies the Mastership (*Wilayat*) of the successor and one, who disbelieves in him – then beware of God’s conduct, be very careful and exercise precaution.”³

Explanation

This Qasida, which is famous as ‘Tatariya’ and comprises of 106 lines, is mentioned by Ibne Hajja Hamawi in *Thamaratul Awraq*.⁴

Introduction to the poet

Abul Husain Mohazzibuddin Ahmad bin Munir bin Ahmad bin Maflah Tarabulusi Shami.⁵ He was an expert of literature and a top-ranking poet, who composed a large number of verses. He composed invaluable verses in praise of the Holy Imams (a.s.), which earned him everlasting remembrance and pride.

Tarabulus reared this noble son on its soil. Then he traveled to Damascus

¹ *Riyazun Nazara*, Hafiz Mohibuddin Tabari, 2:189 [3/136].

² *Diwan*, Sahib bin Ubbad, 95.

³ *Diwan*, Ibne Munir Tarabulisi, [Pg. 160].

⁴ *Thamaratul Awraq*, 2:44-48 [Pg. 327].

⁵ Tarabulus is a place on the banks of Shaam near Damascus.

and recited the merits of the Purified Progeny in his excellent verses. And this matter was unbearable for those not inclined to Ahle Bayt (a.s.); so they made allegations against him and condemned him severely.

Some said: He has a filthy tongue; some said: He is the enemy of the companions of Prophet; some accused him of being Shia; some fabricated and attributed terrible dreams to him; but in spite of these nightmares, his apparent excellence did not give them excuse to bring him down from his lofty rank and exalted status.

He was born in 473 A.H. in Tarabulus and he passed away in Jamadius Thani in 548 A.H. in Halab.

His biography is mentioned in numerous biographical collections.¹

46. Qaazi Ibne Qadoos

Died: 551 A.H.

1. O chief of all Caliphs, whether rural or urban. 2. If they accord respect to providing water to Hajj pilgrims, then you are the giver of drinks at Kauthar. 3. You are the chosen Imam and our intercessor on Judgment Day.² 4. You are the successor of Ahmad, the chosen one of God and father of Shabbir and Shabbar. 5. Possessing lofty ranks on the clear Ghadeer day. 6. And one, who silenced the uproar in Battles of Badr, Nuzayr and Khyber.³

Introduction to the poet

Qaazi Jalaluddin Abul Fath Mahmud bin Qaazi Ismail bin Hamid, was famous as Ibne Qadoos Damyati Misri. He was a prominent expert of literature and literary criticism. He has to his credit, a two-volume collection of verses.

He passed away in Egypt in 551 A.H.⁴

47. Malik Salih

Born 495 A.H.

Martyrdom 556 A.H.

1.

“1. O rider on misguidance, remove misguidance from yourself as this guidance is place of his martyrdom in illuminated Kufa 2. He is one, for whom the sun returned after setting and he got to pray in time; angels witnessed this. 3. Remember the day of Ghadeer Khum, when the Prophet raised his arm and said to those present: 4. Of whomsoever I am the master, this is (also) his master. And an emphatic command descended regarding

¹ Ref: *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:51 [1/156, No. 64].

² *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, [2/83].

³ Ayanush Shia [10/102].

⁴ *Taareekh*, Ibne Kaseer, 12:235 [12/293, Events of 551 A.H.].

this matter. 5. One, who deserts him would be deserted by Almighty Allah and one, who helps him, would be helped by God.”¹

2.

He says in a Qasida of 44 couplets:

“On Ghadeer day, the Prophet advised about him and not about anyone else. It was when companions were present. At that time he said: This one is my successor and Caliph after me and most knowledgeable about obligatory and recommended. They said: We have heard. But when the Prophet passed away, they broke the pledge before they had buried the impeccable one, Ahmad.”²

Introduction to the poet

Abul Gharat Malik Salih Farasul Muslimeen Nasiruddin Talaya bin Razik bin Salih Irmani.³ As mentioned in *Alame Zarkali*, he was a descendant of the Imamiyah Shia of Iraq.⁴

He was among those, whom Almighty Allah bestowed material as well as spiritual favors: and who was inclined to both worlds; and knowledge as well as justice is bestowed to them.

As mentioned in *Khawasul Asrul Fatimi*, he was an expert jurist; and as mentioned in books of biography, was an expert of literature and poetry.

At the same time, he was an honest minister, who administered Cairo with absolute justice and through his grace, the people of Egypt lived in peace and through his planning in administering their kingdom, the Fatimid government conducted with the subjects nicely, to spread peace and maintain harmony.

He has written a book entitled *Al-Itimad fee Radde Alaa Ahlil Inaad*,⁵ regarding Imamate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and discussion about traditions on this subject.

His collected works (*Diwan*) comprises of two volumes containing all the skills of versification. Every year, he dispatched excessive funds where Alawites stayed in the holy places and also provided funds to Masjidul Haraam and Masjidun Nabi: like garments etc. So much so that he even donated slates, pen and ink for children in schools.

He was always at the centre of the kingdom and held influential posts and exercised great influence on the rulers; till Almighty Allah decreed a death of martyrdom for him and he was assassinated in the verandah of his castle on

¹ This Qasida has 39 couplets, some of which are quoted in *Manaqib* of Ibne Shahr Ashob, [3/40]; *Siratul Mustaqim*, Bayazi, [1/311]. The whole Qasida and the one after that is mentioned by Allamah Sayyid Ahmad Attar in his book [*Ar-Raiq min Ash-arul Khalaq*].

² Ref: *Ar-Raiq min Ash-arul Khalaq*, Allamah Sayyid Ahmad Attar.

³ Irmani is related to Armenia, which is large province.

⁴ *Al-Aalam*, [3/228].

⁵ In *Shazaratuz Zahab*, the word of jurisprudence is omitted.

Monday, 19th of the month of Ramadhan 556 A.H. He was buried in Cairo at Darul Vizara. Then his able son, transferred his last remains to 'Qarafatul Kubra' cemetery.

Birth and death

Malik Salih was born in 495 A.H. and he was assassinated in the verandah of his castle on Monday, 19th of the month of Ramadhan 559 A.H.

His account is available in numerous books and collections.¹

48. Ibne Awdi Neeli

Born 478 A.H.

Died: Around 558 A.H.

He composed a Qasida, in which the tradition of Ghadeer is mentioned and according to his belief, this tradition is declaration of Imamate and Caliphate of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Some verses of this Qasida are as follows:

1. Ahmad declared him as his brother from among the people and appointed him alone as the Imam of believers. If he does become a target of injustice. 2. He clearly declared his Caliphate and Imamate on Ghadeer day inspite of the fact that he was condemned for it. 3. And the Prophet of guidance prayed for him and said while they responded with 'Labbaik': O God, I have conveyed the message. So be a witness for that. 4. Till the Prophet passed away and they became like flies that circle eatables. 5. People, who had accepted Islam verbally and their hearts had not converted, broke their allegiance to him. 6. They passed the Caliphate among themselves like a bowl of water is passed among thirsty persons.

This Qasida has 57 couplets.

Introduction to the poet

The accomplished poet, Abul Maali Saalim bin Ali bin Salman bin Ali, famous as Ibne Awdi – Awadi – Taghlibi Neeli related to Neel, which is near the Nile river, a tributary of Euphrates to the south-east.

He was born in Neel in 478 A.H.

The year of his birth that is 478 A.H. and that Imaduddin Isfahani in the year 554 A.H. had seen him in Hamimya near Wasit does not permit one to accept that he should have lived for much long after 554 A.H.²

¹ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 1:259 [2/526, No. 311]; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 4:177 [6/296].

² Ref: Journal Ghurratul Najafiya Ghurra, No. 22 & 23, Year 7, by Dr. Mustafa Jawad Baghdadi.

49. Qaazi Jalees

Died: 561 A.H.

He composed a Qasida of 29 couplets, some of them being:

“He is the husband of Batool and Imams from the progeny of Prophet would not have guided us if Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) had not existed. The Prophet clearly announced his Imamate on Ghadeer day. Thus, none sidelined him and confined him to his house, but those, whose religion was weak and nonsensical.”

Introduction to the poet

Abul Maali Abdul Aziz bin Husain bin Habbab¹ Aghlabi Saadi Thaqli, famous as Qaazi Jalis. He was a poet of the first rank in Egypt and as is clear from his poetry, he was a supporter of the Purified Progeny to perfection.

In *Tarikh*,² Ibne Kathir and Ibne Shakir in his *Fawatul Wafiyat*³ have mentioned his biography.

50. Ibne Makki Neeli

Died: 565 A.H.

1. Don’t you know that the Holy Prophet, Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) made a bequest for Haider to bury him? 2. He said to them while all were present at Ghadeer Khum and he recited the verse in his honor and they fell silent; their voices became subdued. 3. Ali is like the button of my garment, my helper and he is in relation to me as Harun was to Moosa (a.s.). 4. Didn’t you see that huge serpent, which sought his mediation with Almighty Allah and pleaded through him? 5. Then it became like a peacock, which flies; as if conveyed harm among angels then became eligible for imprisonment. 6. Didn’t he restore the hand of a person after it was cut off? Didn’t he restore eyesight after it was lost?⁴

Introduction to the poet

He is Saeed⁵ Ibne Ahmad bin Makki Neeli Moaddab. He is among the most prominent and influential Shia poets, an ardent devotee of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and a follower of Shia religion. He composed excellent verses regarding them, openly extolled their praise and publicized their memory. So much so that narrow-minded people accused him of being radical. However, he was a moderate follower of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and he followed them to perfection.

¹ In *Mo’jamul Odaba*, 3:157 it is mentioned as Khabbab [9/48, here Habbab is mentioned].

² *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 12:251 [12/313, events of 561 A.H.].

³ *Fawatul Wafiyat*, 1:278 [2/332, No. 85].

⁴ *Manaqib*, Ibne Shahr Ashob, 1:524, Iran, [3/24, 2/305].

⁵ In *Mo’jamul Odaba*, [11/190] and *Fawatul Wafiyat*, it is mentioned as Saad, which is an error. [In the edition we trust (2/50) it is mentioned as Saeed].

In *Maalim*,¹ Ibne Shahr Ashob has described him to be among the devout poets of Shia.

In *Mojamul Odaba*,² Hamawi has written that:

“Moaddab was a Shia by religion. He was an expert of grammar, proficient in literature and fanatic in his Shiaism. He composed fine verses, most of them being in praise of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and has also written numerous fluent Ghazals.

He passed away in 565 A.H. at the age of a 100 years.”

He wrote the following verses in refutation to the couplet of Yusuf Wasti criticizing Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) for his refusal to pay allegiance:

“1. Know that and say to the one, who in his disbelief and while Almighty Allah is a witness to it, said: 2. When people had consensus on rulership of one person and only one person opposed their view. 3. Then indeed consensus of all people proves that that one person has lost his mind. 4. (Tell him:) You have lied and your statement is wrong and the All-Seeing one will recompense you for this. 5. Indeed, people of Moosa had consensus on worship of the calf. O profligate and one, who has become an apostate. 6. And one, who has continued to worship the calf, while Harun was all alone. 7. And all were in error and only one person acted in the right way.”³

51. Khatib Khwarizmi

Born 484 A.H.

Died: 568 A.H.

امام طاهر فوق التراب

الاهل من فتى كأبي تراب

“1. Is there is a valiant one and pure a Imam like Abu Turab on the face of the earth? 2. When there is pain in my eyes, the dust from the feet of Abu Turab would be antimony for them. 3. The Messenger of Allah, His Eminence, Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) is like the city of knowledge and Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is like the gate of that city. 4. He weeps much in the prayer niche, but in the battlefield he is smiling in excess. 5. Ali is the eliminator of Amr Ibne Abde Wudd, by a slash, which populates the destroyed town. 6. Tradition of immunity and (report of) Ghadeer Khum and (tradition of) the standard, Battle of Khyber is the final statement. 7. The simile of these two is like that of Harun and Moosa and this is a simile, which the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself announced: 8. The Prophet placed a special carpet from him in his Masjid, whereas he closed the doors of companions. 9. As if all people are skins and my Master, Ali (a.s.), is the kernel. 10. His Mastership (*Wilayat*) is without any doubt, in spite of all enmities, like a yoke in the necks. 11. When Umar failed to answer a question and Ali guided him to

¹ Maalimul Ulama, [Pg. 153].

² *Mojamul Odaba*, 4:230 [11/190].

³ Majaalesul Momineen, [2/571].

truth. 12. Indeed, he said: If Ali is not there, I would perish, I would perish in replying this. 13. On the basis of verses of Quran, Fatima, Ali and their sons are source of joy for me. 14. One, whose habit is building a house, then you should know that my habit is praising Ahle Bayt (a.s.). 15. If affection for them is a defect; as it is definitely not so; then indeed since I got sense I am defective. 16. They slain Ali, when he was like a fighter in majesty for the partisans of truth. 18. Indeed, they denied water to Imam Husain (a.s.) and attacked him with swords and spears and martyred him. 19. And if Zainab had not been there, they would have slain Imam Sajjad (a.s.) at that same age as easily as killing a mosquito or a fly. 20. Indeed, they crucified Zaid, the true leader; O God help us in this strange injustice. 21. Daughters of Muhammad under the sun, thirsty and the progeny of Yazid was under the shade of tents. 22. There were tents of tanned leather for the progeny of Yazid and the folks of blanket (Aale Kisa) were without garments.”¹

Introduction to the poet

Hafiz Abu Moyyad and Abu Muhammad Muwaffiq bin Ahmad bin Abu Saeed Ishaq bin Moyyad Makki Hanafi, was famous as Akhtab Khwarizm.

He was a jurist, possessing exceeding knowledge and a well known tradition scholar. He was a nice orator, an expert of Arabic sciences and someone having command over biography and history. He was a littérateur and a poet. He has written numerous sermons and couplets.²

Some of his teachers in traditional reports are as follows:

Hafiz Najmuddin Umar bin Muhammad bin Ahmad Nasafi (d. 537 A.H.) and Abul Qasim Jarullah Mahmud bin Umar Zamakhshari (d. 538 A.H.).

As mentioned in *Maqabis*,³ among those, who have narrated from him is Abu Ja’far Muhammad bin Ali bin Shahr Ashob Sarawi Mazandarani (d. 588 A.H.). And on the basis of what is mentioned in *Kitabul Manaqib*,⁴ correspondence took place between them.

His writings

He had expertise in jurisprudence, tradition, history, literature and different sciences, and his excessive fame during his time and his correspondence with masters of different arts necessitates that he should have numerous writings and I also think that it should be as such. But only seven of his books are famous and most them were also destroyed by the passing of time.

They are as follows:

1. *Kitabe Manaqib* Imam Abu Hanifah

¹ This Qasida comprises of 46 couplets, which is mentioned at the end of *Kitab Manaqib*, [Pg 399].

² Ref: *Mo’jamul Odaba*, [8/39]; *Rauzatul Jannat* by Sayyid Khwansari, 22 [8/124].

³ *Maqabisul Anwar*, [Pg. 12].

⁴ *Manaqib Aale Abi Talib*, [1/31].

2. Kitabe Radde Shams li Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.).

Abu Ja'far bin Shahr Ashob, who was his contemporary and who narrated from him, has mentioned this book in his *Manaqib*.¹

3. *Kitab Arbaeen fee Manaqib an-Nabiul Ameen wa Wasie Ameerul Momineen* (a.s.) on the basis of what is mentioned in his *Maqta*. Abu Ja'far bin Shahr Ashob has narrated this book from him.²

4. *Kitab Qazaya Ameerul Momineen* (a.s.), Ibne Shahr Ashob has mentioned this book in his *Manaqib*.³

5. *Kitabe Maqtaul Imam Sibte Shaheed* (a.s.), on the basis of what is mentioned in *Ijazaat*, Jamaluddin Moin has narrated this book from him and the book comprises of 15 parts and is of two volumes.

6. Collected poetic works: Chalbi says in *Kashfuz Zunoon*:

“His Diwan is nice and he commanded respect equal to the topmost poets of his time.”⁴

7. *Kitabe Fadhal Ameerul Momineen* (a.s.), which is famous as *Manaqib* and which was published in 1224 A.H. Numerous scholars of traditions have narrated it from the author.

Verses, sermons, date of birth and death

On the basis of what is mentioned in *Baghiyatul Waa-a*,⁵ Safadi has said that Khwarizmi is the author of sermons and poems and we do not have access to any of them, except what is mentioned in his two books: *Manaqib* and *Maqta Imamul Sibt*. Although according to Halabi, he also has a Diwan of his poetic works.⁶

On the basis of what is mentioned in *Baghiyatul Waa-a*, Khwarizmi was born in 484 A.H. and on the basis of what is narrated in the same book from Khafti, he passed away in 568 A.H.⁷

52. Faqih Ummara

Born 513 A.H.

Died: 569 A.H.

وَحَبَّكَ مَفْرُوطًا فَأَنْصَلَ مَغْنِمًا

غَدَا وَهُوَ عَنْ دَلَلِهِ غَيْرَ مَكْرُمٌ

وَلَا وَكَ مَفْرُوضٌ عَلَى كُلِّ مُسْلِمٍ

إِذَا الْمَرءُ لَمْ يَكُرِمْ بِحُبِّكَ نَفْسَهُ

¹ Manaqib Aale Abi Talib, 1:484 [2/390].

² Manaqib Aale Abi Talib, [1/31].

³ Manaqib Aale Abi Talib, 484.

⁴ Kashfuz Zunoon, 1:524.

⁵ *Baghiyatul Waa-a*, [2/308, No. 2046].

⁶ Kashfuz Zunoon, 1:518.

⁷ *Baghiyatul Waa-a*, [2/308, No. 2046].

ورثت الهدى عن نص عيسى بن مريم
وقال: اطیع الابن عمي فانه
كذلك وصى المصفى بآبن عمه
حیدر و فاطمه لانص عيسى بن مريم
اميني على سر الاله المكتم
الى منجد يوم "الغدیر" و متهم

1. Your Mastership (*Wilayat*) is obligatory on all Muslims and your friendship before my messenger (for the hereafter) is the most excellent windfall. 2. If a person does not honor himself by having affection for you, he would start the day when he is not honored by God. 3. You inherited guidance through declaration of Isa, son of Haider and Fatima and not through declaration of Isa, son of Maryam. 4. He said: Obey my cousin, because he is my trusted one on the hidden secrets of God. 5. Cousin of Ali, Muhammad Mustafa appointed Ali as his successor on the people of Najd and Tahama (Hijaz and Mecca). 6. At a place, where all the young and old were present, although precedence is for one, who is the most excellent (and Ali was the first Muslim and exceeded everyone in all positive qualities).

Introduction to the poet

He was the jurist, Najmuddin Abu Muhammad Ummara bin Abul Hasan Ali bin Zaidan bin Ahmad Hukami Yemeni: he was a Shia Imamiyah jurist, teacher, writer and a senior martyr of Shiaism.

His poetry is fluent and eloquent and it is highly interesting. More than all this, he was ever affectionate to the progeny of Prophet and was a firm believer in their Imamate. So much so that he sacrificed his life for this faith.

I end his biography with his couplets, which are in form of supplication:

يارب هي لنا من امرنا رشدا
و اجعل معونتك الحسنى لنا مددنا
ولاتكنا الى تدبیر انفسنا
فالنفس تعجز عن اصلاح ما فسنا
انت الکريم وقد جهزت من امل
الى اياديک وجهها سائل و يدا
وللرجاء ثواب انت تعلمه
فاجعل ثوابي دوام الستلى ابدا

1. O God, bestow guidance to us in our affairs and help us through Your good assistance. 2. Do not leave us to our devices as our self is unable to improve what is destroyed. 3. You are the noble one and I am a needy one. I pose before You as a suppliant with my hands asking from You. 4. Reposing hope in You is eligible for rewards: so reward me by keeping me under Your veil (and conceal my sins and forgive them).¹

¹ His biography is mentioned in *Kamil* of Ibne Asir, 11:163 [2/239, Events of 569 A.H.]; *Taareekh*, Ibne Khallikan, 1:09 [3/431, No. 489 and so on...]

53. Sayyid Muhammad Aqsasi

Died: 575 A.H. approx.

وآخر من بعد النبي قد افتخر	وحق على خير من وطأ الثرى
به شرفت عدنان وافتخرت مضر	خليفة حقاً ووارث عليه
نبي الهدى حقاً فسائل به عمر	ومن قام في يوم الغدير بعضاً

1. My God, Ali is the best of those, who walked on the earth after the Prophet; and the most honorable after the Prophet. 2. He is, by God, the Caliph of Prophet and the heir of his knowledge and through him Adnan got nobility and Mudar received honor. 3. He is the one, to whose right the Prophet guided on Ghadeer; raised his hand and ask Umar about this. 4. He is the one, who broke the idols and did not fear; whereas some had worshipped them for a long time. 5. Son-in-law of Prophet and husband of his daughter, in whose honor, verses and chapters of Quran are revealed. 6. Taking of oath by the servant befits one, who is not having any capital on Judgment Day, except affection for him. 7. I will be aggrieved on the day of farewell and your arrival with peace and a worthy victory pleases me.

Through these lines, the poet has opposed the Ahle Sunnat poet, who composed the following couplets:

“By God, Abu Bakr is the chief of humanity after Mustafa; he is the best of those on the face of the earth. Indeed, a farewell was created at the time of our farewell as love for it enflames all organs.”¹

Introduction to the poet

He was Muhammad bin Ali bin...bin Yahya bin Husain Zul-abra bin Zaid, the Martyr, bin Imam Ali bin Husain (a.s.).

The Aqsasi clan

The family of Aqsasi is the most honorable Alawite clan, as it is attached to the prophetic family tree. It spread in Iraq from a place near Kufa named as Aqsas Malik.² This family had many great scholars, reliable tradition experts, masters of Arabic language, eloquent poets, powerful administrators and elders of high moral caliber.

In his *Kamil*,³ Ibne Athir has mentioned this poet and said:

“Muhammad bin Ali bin Hamza Aqsai, senior member of the Alawites in

¹ At-Taliyah fee Shuara Shia, Vol. 2, manuscript.

² *Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 1:312 [1:236] attributed to Malik bin Abdehim bin Najm bin Mana-a bin Marjan...and Qas means to search for something and its plural Aqsas and perhaps Malik came out in search of this place and ended up in settling down there; therefore it has become famous by this name.

³ *Kamil fit Taareekh*, 11:174 [7/281, Events of 585 A.H.].

Kufa, passed away in the year 575 A.H.”

In *Riyazul Ulama*,¹ Mirza writes:

“He was a prominent Sayyid, a noble and from the scholars, littérateur and poets of Kufa. Shaykh Ali bin Ali bin Numa, who is from our teachers, has narrated traditions from him.”

In *Majalisul Momineen*,² Allamah Marashi has written a separate biography entitled Izzuddin bin Aqsasi:

“He was a senior scholar and noble of Kufa. He was a learned and accomplished expert of literature and had excellent expertise in poetry. It is narrated that one day, Mustansir Abbaside went to visit the grave of Salman and accompanying him was our poet, Aqsasi. On the way the Caliph said: There is a false traditional report, which extremist Shia narrate that when Salman passed away Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) came from Medina to Madayan and then returned to Medina the same night. Ibne Aqsasi recited the following verses extempore:

1. You deny the night, when the land folded for the successor of Prophet and he traveled to Madayan. 2. Ali gave the funeral bath to Salman and returned to Yathrib before dawn break. 3. You said: This is a statement of extremist Shia, but what is their fault if this report is not false? 4. (you also believe that) Asif Barkhiya brought the throne of Bilquis from Saba to Baitul Muqaddas in less than a wink of the eye. 5. It is strange that you have not shown extremism regarding Asif Barkhiya, but I have extremism regarding Ali! 6. If Ahmad is the best of prophets, Ali is also the best of successors; yet you say that the report is false.

Allamah Samawi has narrated these verses in *Taliya* and attributed them to Sayyid Muhammad Aqsasi and he thinks that he was an associate of Mustansir, but he has mistaken in the date of birth of Mustabsir and the Sayyid, because the Sayyid passed away in 575 A.H. and Mustansir was born in 589 A.H.; that is fourteen years after the death of the Sayyid and became the Caliph in 624 A.H.

In *Ayanush Shia*,³ Allamah Sayyid Amin has mentioned his biography under the title of Abu Muhammad Izzuddin Hasan bin Hamza Aqsasi, has quoted the same story and attributed these verses to him, but his source is not clear to us.

Hasan bin Hamza Amawi is our poet; and therefore he lived for years before this poet (composer of Ghadeeriya mentioned above) and before Mustansir.

In his *Manaqib*,⁴ Ibne Shahr Ashob has quoted these couplets with a little difference and attributed them to Abul Fazl Tamimi⁵.

On the basis of this, the quoting of these verses by Ibne Shahr Ashob proves

¹ Riyazul Ulama, 1:24.

² Majaalesul Momineen, 212 [1/507].

³ Ayanush Shia, (Part 21):233 [5/59].

⁴ Manaqib Aale Abi Talib, 1:449 [2/338].

⁵ He is a poet of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

that its composer is not Qutubuddin Aqsasi also, because Ibne Shahr Ashob died in 588 A.H. that is a year before the birth of Mustansir and 57 years before passing away of Sayyid Qutb.

Perhaps these couplets were composed, but Abul Fazl Tamini or one of his predecessors of the Aqsasi clan, and Qutubuddin had recited them to Mustansir.

Note

Behind the veil of enmity and malice, it is heard that this great miracle of our Master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is falsified and attributed to extremism, saying that traveling such a distance in such a short time is not possible.

If this man would think, he would realize that supposing this is impossible, it is a general impossibility and not logical impossibility; otherwise the tradition of Ascension (*Meraj*), which was physical; is widely narrated and a principle of religion, should it not be true?

Is the incident of Asif bin Barkhiya, mentioned in Quran, also not correct? Did not Afreeti (strong and smart) from the jinn in Sulaiman's court, make an offer, and his statement is neither refuted by Sulaiman nor Holy Quran, because Sulaiman wanted the throne to be brought faster than that?

On the other hand, it comprises of divine power on flying fast and slow, by an estimation, just as it comprises of all difficult and easy matters. And Almighty Allah has power to honor his Master (*Wali*) and grant him power over things, which others are unable to do. Allah has created people differently and each is different in his or her capacity and some have power over something, over which others don't have; and power of Allah, Mighty and High, has no limit.

So, ordinary issues of different existing things are different. For example, a rider covers more distance than a person on foot. Steam vehicles travel faster than a person riding a horse. In the same way, aircrafts travel at a much higher speed. They cover a distance in five hours what people on foot would travel in five months.

If you are amazed, it would be the amazement of one, whose mind is rusted and they deny this miracle of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), but they accept without hesitation, the same miracle from those much lower in status.

1. In his *Tarikh*,¹ Hafiz Ibne Asakir has narrated from Sirri bin Yahya that he said:

“Habib bin Muhammad Ajami Basri was seen in Basra on 8th Zilhajj; and on Arafah day he was seen in Arafat.”

2. Muhammad bin Ali Habbak, servant of Shaykh Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) says:

One day, the Shaykh asked Shaykh Abdullah Jiyushi at the afternoon nap

¹ Tareekh Medinatul Damishq, Ibne Asakir, 4:33 [12/56, No. 1193]; Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, [6/188].

time: “Do you want to pray the Asr prayer in Mecca upon the condition that you will not inform anyone about it as long as I am alive?”

“Yes,” he replied.

So he took my hand and said: “Close your eyes.” I closed my eyes. Then he led me for twenty-seven steps and then said: “Open your eyes.”

I saw that I was at Moalla Gate. We met our mother, Khadija, Fazl bin Ayaz, Sufyan bin Uyyana and others; then entered the sanctuary, performed the circumambulation (*Tawaf*), drank Zamzam water, stood behind Maqam Ibrahim and prayed the afternoon (*Asr*) prayer, performed the *Tawaf* again and drank Zamzam water again.

He said: “The folding of land was not amazing, the amazing thing was that no one from the people of Egypt around us, recognized us.”

Then said: “If you want, come with me and if you like, remain with Hajj pilgrims.”

I said: “I will come with my master.”

So we went to the Moalla Gate and he said: “Close your eyes,” and I closed my eyes.

Then he walked me seven steps at *Harwala* (jogging) pace. He said: “Open your eyes.”

Suddenly, I saw that we were near Jiyushin and we entered upon my master, Umar bin Fariz.¹

Allamah Amini says: If someone wants, he can glean innumerable such incidents from books of history and biography, however we shall be content to mention only these examples.

Therefore, it can be concluded that not only a saint can cover long distances, he can take anyone from among his companions as well.

If all these miracles are reported about anyone other than a member of Holy Progeny, no one has any problem; but when something like this is reported about a member of Holy Progeny everyone starts raising objections.

As long as you are alive, you will continue to see amazing things!

This denial before what Ahle Sunnat have mentioned in the merits of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and his progeny, is nothing new, because their habit has always been that either they ridicule it, deny it, criticize the chains of narrators, regard it as unlikely, or object against the evidence of report.

In spite of the fact that they regard such things possible for other than members of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) without any problem or being jealous to them or

¹ *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 8:50 [10/77, Events of year 911 A.H.].

without cross examining such things or without alleging that they have resorted to extremism. Following are some examples of this:

1. Tradition of returning of the sun

Numerous chains of narrators of the tradition of the return of the sun for our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) through supplication of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and testimonies of its veracity and statements of scholars regarding this were mentioned before this.¹

In spite of this, they have objected against this tradition and denied its possibility. However, Subki, Yafai, Ibne Hajar and author of *Shazaratuz Zahab* and others have believed the like of this miracle (return of sun) to be true for Ismail bin Muhammad Hadhrami (d. 676 A.H.), without any hesitation and denial.²

With a little contemplation on this matter, it is possible to conclude: Ismail Hadhrami is greater in the view of Almighty Allah than Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his successor, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), because the sun returned for Ali by the prayer of His Eminence, himself and once it happened for the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

As for Ismail, he commanded his servant to order the sun to remain there; after that told the servant to order it to go away and by this act, release the sun from captivity. According to another narration, he himself gestured to the sun to stand and it stood. If these dreams are true, it is a great miracle and true proximity; but intellectuals and narrators of the incident know when and where this incident is correct and with what aim was this story invented.

يُرِيدُونَ أَنْ يُطْفِئُوا نُورَ اللَّهِ بِأَفْوَاهِهِمْ وَيَأْبَى اللَّهُ إِلَّا أَنْ يَتَمَكَّنْ نُورَهُ وَلَوْ كَرِهَ
الْكُفَّارُونَ ۝

“They desire to put out the light of Allah with their mouths, and Allah will not consent save to perfect His light, though the unbelievers are averse.”³

2. A thousand units of prayer

It is widely narrated that our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Imam Husain (a.s.) and his virtuous son, Ali Ibnul Husain Zainul Abideen (a.s.) recited a thousand units of prayer during twenty-four hours.⁴

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 290-292.

² See *Tabaqatul Shafiya Kubra*, Subki [8/130, No. 1117]; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, Ibne Imad, [7/130, Events of year 678 A.H.]; *Al-Fatawa al-Hadithiya*, Ibne Hajar, Pg. 316.

³ Surah Taubah 9:32

⁴ *Al-Iqadul Fareed*, 2:309 & 3:39 [2/258 & 4/171]; *Tareekh Ibne Khallikan*, 1:350 [3/274, No. 425]; *Sifatus Safwa*, Ibne Jauzi, 2:56 [2/100, No. 165]; *Tabaqat Zahabi*, 171:71 [1/75, No. 71] quoting from Malik, *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, Ibne Hajar, 7:306 [7/269] quoting from Malik,

Such was the general belief and all scholars accepted it, till Ibne Taymiyyah entered the field with prejudice and thought that such a practice was detestable and there was no merit in that. He deemed it to be a sign of ignorance, because Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) did not pray more than thirteen units of prayers during the night and day; he did not pray a few units more than the fixed units. His Eminence never prayed whole nights and he did not fast every day. He says:

“It is not recommended to make it a habit of praying whole nights, on the contrary, it is detestable and is not a proven practice of Prophet. In the same way is fasting all days.”

Sometimes he regards this act impossible, and writes:

“Ali (a.s.) was more cognizant of the practice of Prophet and he emulated the Prophet more than others, it is very unlikely that he should have opposed the Sunnah of Prophet in this manner. Although, supposing that such an act (of reciting a thousand units) is possible. How is it possible when reciting a thousand units along with performance of other obligatory acts is practically impossible, because man is needful of sleep and food as well...”

Unless such act should be performed hurriedly, so as to resemble the pecking of crow; in that case it would be of no use as it would lack sincerity, which is a necessary requirement.”

Then he concludes his discourse with the following statement:

“The issue of remaining awake the whole night for prayers and reciting Quran in a single unit is a matter proved from Uthman (r.a.); from this aspect his nightly vigil and recitation of Quran is more apparent than that of others.”¹

Reply: As for regarding this act detestable and showing it to be opposed to Sunnah of Prophet; and as result of that denying its excellence, is from his exceeding ignorance about glories of worship acts, jurisprudence of Sunnah and his concealment of reality due to ignorance or malice, because thirteen units of recommended prayers of Prophet: Midnight prayer including Shafa and Watr prayer, and Nafila of Morning Prayer and also the Nafila of daily prayers, with the details mentioned in numerous traditional reports, all are Nafila of the night or the day. They do not have any connection with recommended prayers and do not contradict with the captioned tradition.

It is narrated from His Eminence that: “Prayer is the best thing, which is legislated: whether it is more or less.”²

Also: “Prayer is the best thing, which is legislated. Thus, whoever can recite more, should recite more.”³

Tabaqat, Sherani, 1:37 [1/32, No. 37]; *Rauzatur Rihayeen*, Yafai, 55 [116, No. 71]; *Mashariqul Anwaar*, Hamzawi, 94 [1/201]; *Isafur Raghibeen*, Ibne Sabban, on the margins of *Mashariq*, 196 [Pg. 218] and other books.

¹ Ref: *Minhajus Sunnah*, 2:119.

² Hafiz Abu Nuaim, *Hilya*, 1:166. He has narrated this tradition through six channels.

³ Tibrani has quoted this tradition in *Awsat*, [1/183, H. 245] as mentioned in *Targhib wa*

It is narrated by Bukhari¹ and Muslim in an authentic tradition that His Eminence stood in prayers for long durations during the night; such that his feet used to crack.

And this has been the permanent practice of those, who perform worship acts like prayer, fast, Hajj, recitation of Quran and other acts, which make one proximate to Allah and each one performs as per his capacity and does not rest content on the quantum of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). People do not have same strength and capacity and Almighty Allah says:

فَاتَّقُوا اللَّهَ مَا أُنْتُمْ كَلِّعُتُمْ

“Therefore be careful of (your duty to) Allah as much as you can.”²

لَا يُكَلِّفُ اللَّهُ نَفْسًا إِلَّا وُسْعَهَا

“Allah does not impose upon any soul a duty but to the extent of its ability.”³

From this aspect, some people recite a hundred units of prayer every day⁴ and some like Qaazi Faqih Abu Yusuf Kufi recited two hundred units every day.⁵

Some, like Ahmad bin Hanbal (d. 241 A.H.), founder of Hanbali school, recited three hundred units of prayers every day.⁶

Some, like Abu Hanifah Noman (d. 150 A.H.), leader of Hanafis, recited four hundred units of prayers every day.⁷

In biographies of numerous Ahle Sunnat persons, it is mentioned that they recited a thousand units of prayers during twenty-four hours or only during a day. Like:

1. Abdur Rahman bin Aban bin Uthman bin Affan; he prayed a thousand units of prayers every day.⁸

2. Abu Hanifah, leader of Hanafites; he prayed three hundred units of prayer every night.

One day, when he was passing by, he heard a woman say to another woman: This man prays 500 units of prayer every night. After that he began to recite 500

¹ Tarheeb, 1:109 [1/250, H. 9].

² Saheeh Bukhari, [1/380, H. 1078].

³ Surah Taghaabun 64:16

⁴ Surah Baqarah 2:286

⁵ Ref: *Manaqib Abi Hanifah*, Qari on the margins of *Jawahirul Maziya*, 2:523; *Tareekh Baghdad*, 14:6, [No. 7447]; *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 1:214 [10/233, Events of the year 193 A.H.].

⁶ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, Zahabi, 1:270 [1/292, No. 273]; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 1:298 [2/367, Events of 182 A.H.].

⁷ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 13:39 [13/47, Events of the year 600 A.H.].

⁸ *Manaqib Abi Hanifah*, Khwarizmi, 1:247; *Manaqib Kurdi*, 1:246.

⁸ *Ansabul Ashraf*, Balazari, 5:120; *Rasail*, Jahiz, 98 [Pg. 441, *Ar-Rasailus Siyasah*].

units of prayer every night.

One day, he passed by some children; one of them said: "This man recites a thousand units of prayer every night." Abu Hanifah said: "I made an intention to recite a thousand units of prayer every night and not to sleep all night."¹

If the habit of remaining awake whole nights is not recommended, on the contrary it is proved as detestable and is opposed to Sunnah of Prophet, as Ibne Taymiyyah thinks; then how Ahle Sunnat books are full of episodes, in which this act is regarded as meritorious by important personalities? Persons like:

1. Hasan Basri, companion of companions (d. 110 A.H.). For forty years, he prayed the Morning Prayer with same ablution with which he had prayed the Night (*Isha*) Prayer.²

2. Leader of Hanafites, Noman: For forty years, he prayed the Morning Prayer with the ablution, with which he had prayed the Night (*Isha*) Prayer.³

3. Abul Hasan Ashari: For twenty years, he prayed the Morning Prayer with the ablution, with which he had prayed the Night (*Isha*) Prayer.⁴

In addition to that according to Ahle Sunnat it is proved that it is not necessary for the Prophet to have performed an act in order that it should be become a Sunnah. On the contrary, if any member of Islamic Ummah performs, an act it becomes a Sunnah. On the basis of this, what is the problem if Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) should be the first to introduce the practice of praying a thousand units of prayers every twenty-four hours, as Baji, Suyuti, Sakatwari and others have mentioned?

In addition to that the first to make Tarawih prayers Sunnah was Umar bin Khattab during the year 14 A.H.⁵ The first to hold congregational Tarawih prayers was Umar.⁶ It was his innovation to hold congregational Tarawih prayers during the month of Ramadhan and he said it was a good innovation!⁷ Umar was the first to award eighty lashes for drinking liquor.⁸ There are numerous instances, in which Umar bin Khattab invented Sunnah for others to emulate.

In the same way, the practice (*Sunnah*) of wishing on Eids was started by Umar bin Abdul Aziz as mentioned by Hafiz Ibne Asakir in his *Tarikh*.⁹

Have they have not narrated the following authentic tradition of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.): "It is necessary for you to act according to my practice and practice of my Righteous Caliphs." Perhaps this tradition is correct, but there is a

¹ *Iqamatus Hajja*, Shaykh Muhammad Abdul hay Hanafi, 90 [Pg. 80].

² Rauzatul Nazireen, 21.

³ *Manaqib Abi Hanifah*, Khwarizmi, 1:236-240.

⁴ *Tabaqatul Kubra*, 2:172 [2/190, No. 87].

⁵ *Mahazaratul Awail*, 149, Printed 1311 A.H. [Pg. 98, 1300].

⁶ *Mahazaratul Awail*, 98, Printed 1300 A.H. [Pg. 149]; *Sharhul Mawahib*, Zarqani, 7:149.

⁷ Ref: *Tarahut Tasreeb*, 3:92.

⁸ *Mahazaratul Awail*, 111, Printed 1300 A.H. [Pg. 169].

⁹ *Tareekh Medina Damishq*, 2:365 [7/467, No. 581].

barrier between them and Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) and they only regard this tradition only to imply Caliphs other than Ali!¹

In order to dispel the views of Ibne Taymiyyah and those, who have spun falsehoods like him, Shaykh Muhammad Abdul Hayy Hanafi has written a treatise entitled *Iqamatul Hajjah Alaa Anna Iksar fit Tabbad Laisa bi Bidat*, in which he has listed the companions and companions of companions, who prayed excessively and spent their lives in that practice. This treatise contains many points and should not be underestimated, It was printed in 1311 in India. In this book, he writes:²

“The gist of the matter is that I have adopted the view of senior scholars, which is as follows: Remaining awake the whole nights, completing one or more Qurans during twenty-four hours, praying a thousand or more units of prayers, mortification and rigor were not heresies, and they are not prohibited in Shariah, on the contrary, they are recommended and righteous acts...”

As for the claim that such a thing is not possible, his aim in regarding this act as difficult is due to his nature and having laziness for worship, because, one, who has never tasted these acts and who is away from the acts of pious, thinks that it is impossible, but one, who has tasted the sweetness of divine obedience and worship, regards performance of these acts common place.

Difficult recitations

For those, who have the time, they can easily find that books are full of examples of people, who practiced acts longer and difficult than praying a thousand units of prayer in a night, but neither Ibne Taymiyyah nor anyone else has either objected against them or against those, who have reported this; and considered them impossible and negative. Because the reason for denying in the case of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) was not present in those cases! Below we hint at some of those acts:

1. Abu Huraira Doosi, the companion, (d. 57/58/59 A.H.): Every night, before going to sleep, he recited 12000 rosaries and every day recited divine forgiveness 12000 times.³

2. Abu Hanifah, leader of the Hanafites (d. 150 A.H.): He attended Friday prayer and before that prayed twenty units of prayer and finished the Quran in that.⁴

You know that a thousand units of prayer contains 83000 words, which is more than words of Quran. Now, compare this to the act mentioned above; you will find that it is much more than this. But loyalty to that person makes him qualified to perform this act, but enmity to one, who prays a thousand units of

¹ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 1:96 [1/175, H. 329.]

² *Iqamatul Hajjah Alaa Anna Iksar fit Tabbad Laisa bi Bidat*, 18.

³ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 8:110-112 [8/120, Events of 59 A.H.].

⁴ *Manaqib Abi Hanifah*, Khwarizmi, 1:240.

prayer from the Purified Progeny, is the cause for him being unable to perform it.

As for recitation of Quran in one unit of prayer by Uthman, who is mentioned at the end of Ibne Taymiyyah's statement, is beyond the scope of this discussion, but he has preferred to compare this excellence of Uthman to that excellence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), forgetful of the fact that the objection he laid against the prayers of Imam is applicable here as well. From this aspect, this act of Uthman, on the basis of Ibne Taymiyyah's view, is firstly opposed to Sunnah, because for the Prophet, reciting the Quran in one unit of prayer is not proved and secondly it is an impossible act, because the Quran has 77934 words and according to Ata bin Yasar, 77439 words.¹ And this one unit can be either between Maghrib and Isha or after Isha Prayer till the Morning Prayer, and in both cases to perform that in one unit is impossible.

Moreover, Bukhari and Muslim have narrated from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said to Abdullah bin Umar: "Recite the Quran in seven days and don't exceed more than that."

It is narrated from His Eminence, through correct chains of narrators that; "One, who recites the Quran in less than three days, has not understood it."

Furthermore, Uthman is regarded as a companion, who completed a recitation of Quran every week.²

The difficulty of completing recitation of Quran in books of Ahle Sunnat is mentioned in a form that is clearly false and heavier than a mountain, that ends in deviation and foolishness; they say: Some of them completed recitation of Quran in one unit: between Noon and Afternoon Prayer or between the Evening and Night Prayer or other than that; among them being:

1. Uthman bin Affan, the Umayyad finished the Quran in a night in one unit.³
2. Abu Hanifah Noman bin Thabit, leader of Hanafites: for thirty years he remained awake whole nights and recited the whole Quran in one unit.⁴

Some people completed the recitation of whole Quran every day, among them being:

1. Ahmad bin Hanbal, leader of the Hanbalis (d. 241 A.H.).⁵
2. Bukhari, author of *Saheeh* (d. 256 A.H.).⁶
3. Shafei, leader of the Shafeites (d. 204 A.H.), in other than the month of Ramadhan.⁷

¹ *Tafseer*, Qurtubbi, 1:57 [1/47]; *Itqan*, Suyuti, 1:120 [1/197].

² *Al-Tazkar*, Qurtubbi, 76; *Ehyaaul Uloom*, 1:261 [1/246]; *Khazinatul Asrar*, 77 [Pg. 55].

³ Hilyatul Awliya, 1:57.

⁴ Manaqib Abi Hanifah, Qari, 494.

⁵ *Manaqib Ahmad*, Ibne Jauzi, 287 [Pg. 384].

⁶ Tareekh Baghdad, 2:12.

⁷ *Tabaqatul Kubra*, 1:33 [1/51, No. 91].

Some people completed recitation of Quran in a single night, among them being:

1. Bukhari, author of *Saheeh* (d. 256 A.H.); he did this during the month of Ramadhan.¹
3. Shafei, leader of the Shafeites (d. 204 A.H.), did this in other than the month of Ramadhan.²

Some persons recited the whole Quran twice during twenty-four hours, like:

1. Abu Hanifah, leader of Hanafites: he performed this act during the month of Ramadhan.³
2. Shafei, leader of Shafeites, did this in during the month of Ramadhan and recited them in prayers.⁴

It is mentioned in *Sifatus Safwa*,⁵ that during the month of Ramadhan, Shafei completed the recitation of Quran sixty times and this was other than the Qurans he recited in his prayers.

Some have finished the Quran twice and some recited it thrice during twenty-four hours. Some finished the Quran four times during the day. Some recited the Quran five times between Evening (*Maghrib*) and Night (*Isha*) Prayer. Some recited the Quran eight or more times during twenty-four hours.

Nazli writes in *Khazinatul Asrar*:⁶

“Regarding Moosa Sadrani, a companion of Abi Madayan Maghribi, it is mentioned that he recited the complete Quran seventy thousand times. And regarding him, it is narrated that he began reciting it after kissing the Black Stone and when he reached before the door of Kaaba, he had finished it. In such a way that some of his companions heard each word of it, according to *Ahya* and Ali Qair in *Sharh Mishkat*.⁷”

Bukhari has narrated from Abu Huraira⁸ that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “It was easy for Dawood to recite the Quran; thus he ordered the horse to be saddled and began reciting the Quran; and before the saddle was fixed, he finished the Quran.”

Qastalani says in the explanation of this tradition:⁹

“It is concluded that a short time becomes divinely blessed to become prolonged and that more can be achieved in that time and this tradition proves

¹ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 11:26 [J11/32, Events of 256 A.H.].

² *Tareekh Baghdad*, 2:63.

³ *Manaqib Abi Hanifah*, Qari, 493. 494.

⁴ *Mawahib Liduniya*, [4/201].

⁵ *Sifatus Safwa*, 2:145 [2/255, No. 220].

⁶ *Khazinatul Asrar*, 78 [Pg. 55].

⁷ *Mirqatul Mafatih Sharh Mishkatul Masabih*, [4/702, H. 2201].

⁸ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 1:101 [3/1256, H. 3235] in *Kitabut Tafseer*, Chapter of the verse: And We gave the Zabur to Dawood and 2:164 [4/1747, H. 4436] in traditions of the prophets.

⁹ *Irshadus Sari*, 8:398 [10/412, H. 4713].

that Almighty Allah can prolong time for anyone He likes,¹ as He fold up the lands for persons to travel far off distances in a short time.”

Allamah Amini says: These are nothing, but fiction and foolishness of past writers. If Ibne Taymiyyah knew about such things, he would refrain from laying objections against Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Imam Husain (a.s.) and Imam Sajjad (a.s.), but if it is true, he should know that:

وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ قَالُوا سَمِعْنَا وَأَطْعَنَا وَأَنْظَرْنَا لَكَانَ خَيْرًا لِّلْهُمَّ وَأَقْوَمْ

“And if they had said (instead): We have heard and we obey, and hearken, and look at us, it would have been better for them and more upright.”²

3. Muhaddath in Islam

The Islamic has consensus that there are some persons in this Ummah, like in the previous nations, who are *Muhaddath* and on the basis of what is mentioned in *Saheeh* and *Musnad* books of both sects, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has informed about this matter.

Muhaddath is a person to whom the angels speak, without him or her being a prophet and without that person seeing the angel.

Or it is one to whom Almighty Allah inspires knowledge or intuition directly into his being.

Or the realities, which are concealed for others, are made known to his heart.

So, all Muslims have consensus that persons exist with this quality in this Ummah, the difference is in identifying them. Shia regard Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and the Holy Imams (a.s.) as *Muhaddath*; and Ahle Sunnat regard Umar bin Khattab as *Muhaddath*.

Following are some examples of the traditional reports of the two sects:

Ahle Sunnat reports

In his *Saheeh*, Bukhari has mentioned in the chapter of excellence of Umar bin Khattab³ from Abu Huraira from the Prophet that:

“Indeed, in Bani Israel there were people, who were not prophets, but angels spoke to them. If there is someone like that in my Ummah, it is Umar.”

Qastalani says:⁴

Statement of the Prophet: “If there is someone...” is not by way of hesitation, on the contrary, it is for emphasis. Like your saying: If I had a friend, it would be so and so; because your implication is that that persons is perfect for

¹ Folding of the tongue or stopping of the time.

² Surah Nisa 4:46

³ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 2:194 [3/1349, H. 3486].

⁴ Irshadus Sari Sharh Saheeh Bukhari, [6/99].

friendship and not that you want to say: I don't have any friend. And if it is proved that these persons existed in previous nations, whose excellence is lesser than that of this Ummah, then the existence of these persons in this Ummah is worthier.

Bukhari, after the tradition of the cave¹, has directly narrated from Abu Huraira that indeed there were in the past nations, persons, who were *Muhaddath*, and if there is someone like this from my Ummah, it is Umar bin Khattab.

Qastalani says in the explanation of this tradition:²

The author says: [*Muhaddath*] is someone who, without being a prophet, expresses the right point of view through his/her tongue. Khattabi has said that it is someone, whose existence is immersed in knowledge; as if he is spoken to. He supposes and his supposition is correct; and he thinks of something and it comes to pass, and this rank is higher than that of the saints (*Awliya*).

Qastalani says regarding the statement of His Eminence: If there was someone in my Ummah...:

And His Eminence has mentioned this in form of expectation; as if he is not aware³ that this matter is imminent, but it occurred and the story of: "O Sariya, the mountain!"⁴ And other instances are famous.

Muslim, in his *Saheeh*⁵, in the chapter of the excellence of Umar, has narrated from Ayesha from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that: there were *Muhaddath* persons in the nations before you and if there was someone in my Ummah from them, Umar bin Khattab is from them.

Ibne Wahab says: *Muhaddath* means one, who gets divine inspiration.

If someone searches in books of biography, he would come across quite a number of people with whom angels had spoken; among them being:

1. Imran bin Husain Khuzai (d. 52 A.H.).⁶
2. Abul Maali Salih (d. 427 A.H.).⁷
3. Abu Uthman Maghribi.⁸
4. In the same way is the speaking of Hauriya to Abu Yahya Naqid.⁹

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 2:171 [3/1279, H. 3282].

² Irshadus Sari Sharh *Saheeh Bukhari*, 5:431 [7/482, H. 3469].

³ How much contradiction is present between this statement of his and those who said: Indeed (*Inna*) is for emphasis and not for doubt?

⁴ It is mentioned in *Manaqib Umar* and it will be mentioned that the story of 'O Sariya, the mountain!' is fabricated and false.

⁵ *Saheeh Muslim* [5/16, H. 23], *Kitab Fadailus Sahaba*.

⁶ *Al-Istiab*, 2:455 [Part three 1208, No. 1969].

⁷ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 12:163 [12/200, Events of 496 A.H.].

⁸ Ref: *Tareekh Baghdad*, [9/113].

⁹ Ref: *Tareekh Baghdad*, 8:462 [Tr. 4577].

As for Shia traditional reports

In *Usul Kafi*,¹ Thiqatul Islam Kulaini, under the subject of Chapter of difference between messenger, prophet and *Muhaddath*, has narrated four traditions:

Among them being: A tradition narrated through Buraid from Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) and Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) regarding the words of Almighty Allah in Surah Hajj:

وَمَا أَرْسَلْنَا مِنْ قَبْلِكَ مِنْ رَّسُولٍ وَّلَا نَبِيٍّ

“And We did not send before you any apostle or prophet.”²

...or any Muhaddath.

Buraid said: “May I be sacrificed on you, we did not recite it in this way,³ thus, who is messenger and prophet and *Muhaddath*?”

He replied: “Messenger is one, to whom the angel appears and speaks to; prophet is one, who sees the angel in dream and how often prophethood and messengership gathers in a single person. *Muhaddath* is one, who hears the voice of the angel, but does not see his form.”

I said: “May God keep you in good health, how do they understand what they have seen in dream is true and from Almighty Allah?”

Imam (a.s.) replied: “He is assisted (and God bestows good sense to them), so that they may understand this point and indeed Allah, Mighty and Sublime concluded the books with your Book and the prophets with your Prophet.”

Another tradition has also mentioned this same difference between messenger, prophet and *Muhaddath*. In two other traditions, the same difference is mentioned, but instead of *Muhaddath*, Imam is mentioned.⁴

Kulaini has also quoted five traditions under the chapter of the Imam are *Muhaddath* and *Mufahham*: One of them is from Humran bin Ayyin from Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) that he said: “Ali was *Muhaddath*.”

The gist of another tradition is that:⁵ Ali Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) identified his own killer and was also aware of great issues, on the basis of the words of God:

وَمَا أَرْسَلْنَا مِنْ قَبْلِكَ مِنْ رَّسُولٍ وَّلَا نَبِيٍّ

“And We did not send before you any apostle or prophet.”⁶

And two more traditions¹, one of them saying: “The successors of

¹ *Usul Kafi*, 84 [1/177].

² Surah Hajj 22:52

³ It was mentioned before that this is present in the recitation of Ibne Abbas.

⁴ *Usul Kafi*, [1/176 & 271].

⁵ *Usul Kafi*, [Pg. 270].

⁶ Surah Hajj 22:52

Muhammad are *Muhaddath*.”

Another one says: “The Imams are knowledgeable, truthful, perceptive and *Muhaddath*.”

The fifth tradition in the meaning of *Muhaddath* is that they can hear the angel, but cannot see him; and in this chapter in *Usul Kafi*, there is no other tradition than this one.

In *Amali*,² Shaykhut Taifa has narrated through his chains of narrators from Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) that Ali (a.s.) was *Muhaddath*, and Salman was *Muhaddath*. The narrator says: I asked: “What is the sign of *Muhaddath*?” He replied: “An angel comes to them and inspires such and such on their heart.”

Traditional reports on this matter are in excess and are present throughout Shia books.³ Those mentioned above were the main traditional reports and they comprise the gist of the present and past Shia belief regarding this subject.

Its gist is: There are *Muhaddath* persons in this Ummah, just as they were present in the past nations and Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and his descendants – the Holy Imams (a.s.) – are *Muhaddath*, although they are not prophets. This quality was not restricted to the position of Imamate, on the contrary, Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) was also *Muhaddatha* as was Salman Farsi.

Yes, all Imams from the Holy Progeny are *Muhaddath*, but all *Muhaddath* are not Imams. The meaning of *Muhaddath* are those, who possesses knowledge about different things that they have obtained through one of the three ways mentioned in traditions.

This is the complete viewpoint of those two sects and their traditional reports regarding *Muhaddath*, and you may note there is no difference between them.

The Shia, in relation to other sects of Islam, do not have any extraordinary views regarding this, except that they do not regard Umar bin Khattab as *Muhaddath*. It is due to his intellectual biography recorded in pages of history and at this point, we are not on the subject of discussing that.

Then, is it correct to regard only some persons as excellent because of being *Muhaddath* and to regard it as deviation and defect in others? No, by God. Come look at the falsehood of Hijaz and the origin and base of hypocrisy and source of corruption in the society:

Abdullah Qaseemi – let’s ask him: How in his book – *As-Sara Bainul Islam wal Wathniya*⁴ - he has written that in view of Shia, the Imams of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) are prophets and they receive divine revelation and angels bring revelation to

¹ *Usul Kafi*.

² *Amali*, Tusi: 260 [207-208, H. 914-916].

³ Allamah Majlisi has compiled these traditional reports in *Behaarul Anwaar*, [26/66 Chapter of ‘They (a.s.) were *Muhaddith* and *Mufahham*’ 40/140 & 142, H. 40, 41, 43 & 44].

⁴ *As-Sara Bainul Islam wal Wathniya*, 1:1:2:35.

them and these Shia believe the same about Fatima and Imams from her progeny as they believe about the prophets!

In all these points we argue through the correspondence of Hasan bin Abbas quoted in *Al-Kafi*.¹

Does this ignorant man not know that these lies and allegations target a big group of people, whose correct viewpoint has created nobles around the world; these lies are nothing, but refuting the view of *Muhaddith* mentioned in Holy Quran and viewpoint of talking of angels to the Imams of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and their mother, Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) – as that reasoning demands - while all Muslims are same in this belief.

Can the Shia also not say: “In view of Ahle Sunnat, Umar bin Khattab and others, who were *Muhaddath*, are prophets and angels bring divine revelation upon them?”

However, the Shia are learned and wise and they don’t hurt feelings through lies, allegations and false statements.

Were these unequivocal traditional reports of the Shia, which say that the Imams are knowledgeable and are not prophets, not seen by this man? Did this man not come across in *Al-Kafi* - in the chapter that he has used to condemn the Shia – statements of Imam Muhammad Baqir (a.s.) and Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.), who said:

“Indeed, Almighty Allah ended the divine books through your Book and ended your prophets through your Prophet?”

إِنَّمَا يَفْتَرِي الْكَذِبَ الَّذِينَ لَا يُؤْمِنُونَ بِأَيْتَ اللَّهِ وَأُولَئِكَ هُمُ الْكُنْدِبُونَ ﴿٤٥﴾

“Only they forge the lie who do not believe in Allah’s communications, and these are the liars.”²

4. Knowledge of the unseen of the Shia Imams

Making fuss regarding the knowledge of Imams from Aale Muhammad (a.s.) from those, who harbor malice for the Shia and the Imams is great and clear; each of them have issued strange and false statements. Like the blind feels a camel and expresses views; as if from all Islamic sects, only the Shia have this view and the followers of other sects do not have such viewpoints, from this aspect they became deserving of every condemnation and allegation.

Sufficient for you is what Qaseemi has invented in *As-Sara Bainul Islam wal Wathniya*:

“In view of Shia, Imams have knowledge of everything and whenever they want to know about something, Allah Almighty informs them. They know the time of their death, they die at their own discretion and have knowledge of past

¹ *Al-Kafi*, [1/176].

² Surah Nahl 16:105

and future; nothing is concealed from them. (Pg. 125 & 126 of Kulaini's *Al-Kafi*)."1

Then he writes:

"Another tradition is also present in *Al-Kafi* regarding this. Thus, Imams are imbued with the quality of knowing the unseen and they are aware of past and future; nothing is concealed from them; they are partners of Almighty Allah and all Muslims know that prophets are not partners of God in this quality and verses of Quran and reports of Prophet and Imams regarding the fact that only Allah knows the unseen, are widely narrated to such an extent that it is not possible to mention all of them in this book."2

Reply: Knowledge of unseen – that is awareness of supernatural and speaking about past and future, like intuition, is a matter, possible for every human being. From the past, which he has not seen, he is informed of it and in the condition of being aware that it is source of unseen or gained through another rational being.

As for specialty of believers, thus they are more aware of the unseen, like belief in God, angels, divine books, prophets, Judgment Day, Paradise, Hell, meeting Almighty Allah, life after death, rising up on Judgment Day, blowing of the bugle, accounting, Hourul Ein, palaces and pages (youths)¹, what will occur on Judgment Day and all the things the believer has faith in, and for which he testifies, are unseen and in the Holy Quran they are called as unseen and Almighty Allah says in the verse:

الَّذِينَ يَخْشَوْنَ رَبَّهُمْ بِالْغَيْبِ

"Those, who believe in the unseen..."²

The believers are indentified through these qualities.

Also the verse:

الَّذِينَ يَخْشَوْنَ رَبَّهُمْ بِالْغَيْبِ

"(For) those who fear their Lord in secret."³

...and the verse:

إِنَّمَا تُنذِرُ الَّذِينَ يَخْشَوْنَ رَبَّهُمْ بِالْغَيْبِ

"You warn only those who fear their Lord in secret."⁴

And so on...

The position of prophethood and messengership demands that the prophet

¹ "Round about them shall go youths never altering in age," (Surah Waqiyah 56:17)

² Surah Baqarah 2:3

³ Surah Anbiya 21:49

⁴ Surah Fatir 35:18

should have knowledge of unseen from some aspects, in addition to what believers know, and the verse:

وَكُلَّاً تَقْصُّ عَلَيْكَ مِنْ أَنْبَاءِ الرَّسُولِ مَا نَهِيَّتُ بِهِ فُؤَادَكَ وَجَاءَكَ فِي هَذِهِ
الْحُقُّ وَمَوْعِظَةٌ وَذُرِّيٌّ لِلْمُؤْمِنِينَ ^{٤٢}

“And all we relate to you of the accounts of the apostles is to strengthen your heart therewith; and in this has come to you the truth and an admonition, and a reminder to the believers.”¹

...hints at this point only.

That is why Almighty Allah narrates stories to Prophet and after narrating the story of Maryam, says:

ذِلِكَ مِنْ أَنْبَاءِ الْغَيْبِ نُوَحِّي إِلَيْكَ

“This is of the announcements relating to the unseen which We reveal to you.”²

And after the incident of Nuh (a.s.), He says:

تِلْكَ مِنْ أَنْبَاءِ الْغَيْبِ نُوَحِّي إِلَيْكَ

“These are announcements relating to the unseen which We reveal to you.”³

After the story of brothers of Prophet Yusuf (a.s.), He says:

ذِلِكَ مِنْ أَنْبَاءِ الْغَيْبِ نُوَحِّي إِلَيْكَ

“This is of the announcements relating to the unseen (which) We reveal to you.”⁴

Almighty Allah, through this knowledge of unseen, which is restricted to prophets, has clarified in Quran:

عِلْمُ الْغَيْبِ فَلَا يُظْهِرُ عَلَى عَنْيَةٍ أَحَدًا ^{٤٣} إِلَّا مَنِ ارْتَضَى مِنْ رَسُولٍ

“The Knower of the unseen! so He does not reveal His secrets to any, except to him whom He chooses as an apostle”⁵

Yes:

وَلَا يُجِيِّطُونَ بِشَيْءٍ مِنْ عِلْمِهِ إِلَّا مَا شَاءَ

“And they cannot comprehend anything out of His knowledge

¹ Surah Hud 11:120

² Surah Aale Imran 3:44

³ Surah Hud 11:49

⁴ Surah Yusuf 12:102

⁵ Surah Jinn 72:26-27

except what He pleases.”¹

وَمَا أُوتِيتُم مِّنَ الْعِلْمِ إِلَّا قِيلَّا

“And you are not given aught of knowledge but a little.”²

On the basis of this, according to clarification of Holy Quran, all prophets, saints (*Awliya*) and believers have knowledge of unseen and all have a particular share, only their knowledge of unseen – of whatever magnitude it may be – is limited and temporary and not personal and it was not there from eternity. It has a beginning and an end and it is not eternal and it is obtained from Allah, the Mighty and Sublime.

وَعِنْدَهُ مَفَاتِحُ الْغَيْبِ لَا يَعْلَمُهَا إِلَّا هُوَ

“And with Him are the keys of the unseen treasures- none knows them but He.”³

The Prophet and those from his Ummah, who are inheritors of his knowledge,⁴ in acts and deeds, on the basis of their knowledge of unseen about calamities, dreams, happenings and informing people about unseen matters are needful of command of Allah, the Mighty and the High. And knowledge, acting upon it, and its informing the people about it comprises of three stages and none of them is related to the other, knowledge about one thing demands acting according to that, or that it is not needed to be told to the people, and each of these three stages have requirements and limitations, which should be observed, and it is not that everyone, who knows the unseen, acts according to it or informs others.

Is the report of the son of Nuh, report of the people of Hud, Aad and Thamud, people of Ibrahim and Lut and reminder of Zulqarnain and the news of the past prophets not from unseen?

Did the Prophet not deposit some unseen matters as secrets to his wives and they divulged them to their fathers?

فَلَمَّا نَبَّأَهَا بِهِ قَالَتْ مَنْ أَنْبَأَكَ هَذَا طَقَالْ نَبَّأْنِي الْعَلِيُّمُ الْخَبِيرُ

“So when he informed her of it, she said: Who informed you of this? He said: The Knowing, the one Aware, informed me.”⁵

...is not from unseen?

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:255

² Surah Isra 17:85

³ Surah Anaam 6:59

⁴ Islamic Ummah has consensus that the inheritor of the knowledge of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is Ameerul Momineen Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 255-257.

⁵ Surah Tahrif 66:3

Whether what Khizr informed Moosa (a.s.)¹ regarding which Moosa could not be patient, not unseen?

Whether whatever Isa (a.s.) said to his people:

وَأَنِّيْكُمْ بِمَا تَأْكُلُونَ وَمَا تَدْخِرُونَ لَا فِي بُيُوتِكُمْ

“And I inform you of what you should eat and what you should store in your houses.”²

...is not unseen?

Is the statement of Isa (a.s.) to Bani Israel:

يَعْلَمُ إِسْرَائِيلَ إِنِّي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ إِلَيْكُمْ مُّصَدِّقًا لِّمَا بَيْنَ يَدَيَّ مِنَ التَّوْرَةِ
وَمُبَشِّرًا بِرَسُولٍ يَأْتِي مِنْ بَعْدِي أَسْمَهُ أَمْرُهُ

“O children of Israel! surely I am the apostle of Allah to you, verifying that which is before me of the Taurat and giving the good news of an Apostle who will come after me, his name being Ahmad.”³

...not a part of the unseen?

And what Allah, the Mighty and the High revealed to Prophet Yusuf (a.s.):

لَتُنَبَّهُنَّمُ بِأَمْرِهِمْ هَذَا وَهُمْ لَا يَشْعُرُونَ⁴

“You will most certainly inform them of this their affair while they do not perceive.”⁴

...not a part of unseen?

And whether Adam's informing the angels about their names, as per the orders of the Almighty Allah:

لِيَادِمُ أَنِّيْهُمْ بِأَسْمَائِهِمْ

“O Adam! inform them of their names.”⁵

...not from the unseen?

And are all these glad tidings present in Old and New Testament and books of past people, regarding prophethood of Prophet of Islam (s.a.w.a.), his description, life history, mention of his Ummah is not information of the unseen?

Whether authentic reports narrated from soothsayers, monks, story-tellers narrated regarding Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) before his birth not the news of

¹ In the verse: “He said: Surely you cannot have patience with me.” (Surah Kahf 18:67)

² Surah Aale Imran 3:49

³ Surah Saff 61:6

⁴ Surah Yusuf 12:15

⁵ Surah Baqarah 2:33

unseen?

Is there any hurdle for Almighty Allah to grant to whoever He likes, knowledge of past and future, knowledge of heavens and earths, knowledge of formers and latters, and knowledge of angels and prophets? Just as nothing restrains Him from bestowing intuition and knowledge of whatever He has created to whoever He likes; as He showed to Ibrahim the kingdoms of heavens and the earth.

In this instance, it can never be construed as partnership with God no matter if the knowledge of the knower is in excess. And how much is the difference between these two knowledges, because the limits of human capacity always dictate the extent he can acquire knowledge; whether it is knowledge of unseen or knowledge of intuition. In the same way, divine knowledge about unseen and intuition is obtained from the Holy Being of Almighty Allah, which is restricted to Him.

The same applies to the knowledge of angels; if for example Almighty Allah allows Israfeel to read and become aware of the Protected Tablet – a tablet containing everything – before his eyes – he definitely does not become the partner of God in knowing everything.

On the basis of this, it is not possible to compare personal absolute knowledge with limited acquired knowledge, knowledge which has no limitation and condition with knowledge, which is limited and restricted, eternal knowledge with accidental temporary knowledge, original knowledge with knowledge obtained from another.

Just as the knowledge of Prophet cannot be compared to knowledge of human beings, because the paths of these knowledges are contradictory, and specialties and rules derived from knowledge of one do not describe the other; although commonality is possible.

On the contrary, even the knowledge of jurist cannot be compared to knowledge of following the rules of Shariah; even though the follower is aware of all laws, because the source of knowledge of both of them is different.

On the basis of this, knowledge of the unseen in the original and absolute form is from the qualities of Almighty Allah and restricted to Him and this is implied in the following verses:

قُلْ لَا يَعْلَمُ مَنْ فِي السَّمَاوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضِ غَيْرُ اللَّهُ

“Say: No one in the heavens and the earth knows the unseen but Allah.”¹

And the verse:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَلِمُ غَيْرِ السَّمَاوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضِ ۖ إِنَّهُ عَلِيمٌ بِذَاتِ الصُّدُورِ ۝

¹ Surah Naml 27:65

“Surely Allah is the Knower of what is unseen in the heavens and the earth; surely He is Cognizant of what is in the hearts.”¹

In the same way, refer to Surah Hujurat 49:18, Surah Jumua 62:8, Surah Hashr 59:82, Surah Sajdah 32:6, Surah Taghabun 64:18, Surah Hud 11:21, Surah Araaf 7:188.

From these details, which we mentioned in the cause and kinds of knowledge, it is known that there is no contradiction between reasonings of this matter in Quran and Sunnah, from the aspect of negation and proving and every reasoning, which negates or proves the knowledge of unseen has one aspect of the matter in view, a subject, which in the language of reasoning, from which the knowledge of unseen is negated, is other than a topic for which knowledge of unseen is proved and in the same way is its opposite.

Other qualities, which are restricted to Allah, the Mighty and the High are also as such; that is these qualities with particular restriction are differentiated from qualities of others; and Isa (a.s.) enlivens the dead by the leave of God as Almighty Allah has informed in this verse:

أَنِّي أَخْلُقُ لَكُمْ مِّنَ الطِّينِ كَهْيَةَ الطَّيْرِ فَانفُخْ فِيهِ فَيَكُونُ طَيْرًا بِإِذْنِ اللَّهِ

“I determine for you out of dust like the form of a bird, then I breathe into it and it becomes a bird with Allah’s permission.”²

Isa (a.s.) is not a partner of Allah, Who creates man from clay, because only Allah is the Master (*Wali*), only He revives the dead and is the All-knowing creator.

The angel, who shapes the fetus in wombs, does so according to divine exigency and will of God. He creates the ears, eyes, skin, flesh and bones³ and never does he become a partner with Almighty Allah in this, because He is the creator God, the maker of everything, without a previous model, and incomparable one, who shapes whatever is present in the wombs, as He likes.⁴

An angel goes to the fetus and writes down the sustenance, death, acts, calamities, good and evil, misfortune and good fortune that is destined for him;

¹ Surah Fatir 35:38

² Surah Aale Imran 3:49

³ It is narrated from Huzaifah directly from the Prophet that when the fetus is 42 days old, the Almighty Allah sends an angel to give a form to it; and he shapes the ears, eyes, skin, flesh and bones; then he says: O Lord, is it a male or a female? The Almighty Allah commands what He likes and the angel writes it down. Then he says: O Lord, when would it die? The Almighty Allah orders whatever He likes and the angel notes it down. Then he says: O Lord, what is the quantum of his sustenance. Thus, the Almighty Allah orders as much He likes and the angel records it. Then the angel comes out with a sheet of paper and whatever is written on it, never increases or decreases. This report is mentioned by Abul Husain Muslim in his *Saheeh* [5/202, H. 3, Kitabul Qadr].

⁴ The Almighty Allah says: “He is Allah the Creator, the Maker, the Fashioner” (Surah Hashr 59:24) and “He it is Who shapes you in the wombs as He likes.” (Surah Aale Imran 3:6)

then he blows the spirit into him.¹ He does not associate anyone with Almighty Allah and Allah does not have any partner in the kingdom. He is the creator of everything and has fixed a destiny for it.

Along with the fact that the angel takes away the souls and Almighty Allah revealed the following verse:

قُلْ يَسْوِلُكُمْ مَلَكُ الْمَوْتِ الَّذِي وُلِّيَّ لَكُمْ

“Say: The angel of death who is given charge of you.”²

But at the same time the restriction present in this verse is also correct:

الَّهُ يَتَوَفَّ الْأَنْفُسَ حِينَ مَوْتِهَا

“Allah takes the souls at the time of their death.”³

As only Almighty Allah causes death and the angel of death is not a partner of Allah in this quality. Also, attributing death to the angels in this verse is also correct:

الَّذِينَ تَتَوَفَّهُمُ الْمَلِكَةُ ظَالِمِيَّ أَنْفُسِهِمْ

“Those whom the angels cause to die while they are unjust to themselves.”⁴

And the verse:

الَّذِينَ تَتَوَفَّهُمُ الْمَلِكَةُ طَيِّبِينَ

“Those whom the angels cause to die in a good state.”⁵

There is no contradiction in any of these statement, and if we attribute causing death to anyone other than God, we would not be committing a sin.

Also, on the basis of destiny written by Almighty Allah, the angel does not sleep⁶ and does not slumber and in this way Allah has praised Himself:

لَا تَأْخُذُهُ سَنَةٌ وَلَا نَوْمٌ

“Slumber does not overtake Him nor sleep.”⁷

¹ It is narrated from Ibne Masud directly that if someone is created, he stays in the womb for forty days, then it remains as a clot for forty days; then it becomes a lump for forty days; then the Almighty Allah sends an angel with four words: sustenance, death, actions, whether he/she would be righteous or evil-doer. Then the angel blows the soul into it. Bukhari in his *Saheeh* has mentioned this report in the Chapter of the Angels [6/2713, H. 7016].

² Surah Sajdah 32:11

³ Surah Zumar 39:42

⁴ Surah Nahl 16:28

⁵ Surah Nahl 16:32

⁶ Ref: Sermon one, *Nahjul Balagha*, [Pg. 41]; its commentary [Sharh Nahjul Balagha, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 1/91].

⁷ Surah Baqarah 2:255

If Allah, the Mighty and the High makes someone able to enliven all the folks of the earth, he would not become a partner of Almighty Allah, because God is one, who enlivens the earth after its death.

Now, come, let's ask Qaseemi: Shia, who say: Whenever the Imams make an intention to understand something, Almighty Allah makes it clear to them. How can it be concluded from this that Imams are partners of God in unseen? After this, supposing their knowledge is through Allah's informing, what common point do they have?

We ask this man: How this polytheism of leaders of community remained concealed? They have narrated from Huzaifah that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) informed him about the past and the future till Judgment Day.¹

Also, a report, which Ahmad, leader of the faith that Qaseemi follows, included in his *Musnad*:² It is narrated from Abu Idris that he said: I heard from Huzaifah bin Yaman that he said:

“By God, I am the most knowledgeable of people regarding every mischief that is to take place from the present till Judgment Day.”

Qaseemi was ignorant that the knowledge of believer at the time of his death, choice of death, meeting Almighty Allah – if he is given a choice between life and death – it is not impossible, and will not be a great issue and not unlikely with the status of a believer; what to say about Imams of believers from the holy progeny?

Is this man not aware about what his co-religionists have narrated about their leaders and considered it to be their merits?

Ahmad in *Musnad*³ and Tabari has mentioned in *Riyaz*⁴ that on the basis of a dream that Umar has seen, he informed about his death and between that dream and the time he was assassinated, there was a only a gap of a Friday.

In *Riyaz*,⁵ it is narrated from Kaabul Ahbar that he said to Umar:

“O chief of believers, I swear that you will die in three days.”

Abu Lulu attacked him after three days. When people came to him – and Kaab was also present – Umar said: It was predicted by Kaab.

It is also narrated that Uyyana bin Hasan Fuzari said to Umar:

“Be careful or remove non-Arabs (Persians) from Medina, as I am not sure someone would attack you soon.” And he placed his hand at the spot where Abu Lulu hit.

If you want to be amazed, you should be amazed that during the tenure of Abu Bakr, a corpse at the time of its burial predicted the killing of Umar.

¹ *Saheeh Muslim*, Kitabul Fitn, [5/410 H. 22]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 5:386 [6/534, H. 22770].

² *Musnad Ahmad*, 5:388 [6/536, H. 22780].

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:48 & 51 [1/79 & 82, H. 343 & 364].

⁴ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:74 [2/354].

⁵ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:57 [Pg. 355].

Baihaqi¹ has narrated from Abdullah bin Ubaidullah Ansari that:

“I was from those, who participated in the burial of Thabit bin Qays, who was killed in Yamama². When they placed him in the grave, we heard him say: Muhammad is the messenger of Allah, Abu Bakr is truthful (*Siddiq*), Umar is a martyr and Uthman is the righteous merciful one. Then we looked and saw that he was dead (and speaking in that condition and informing about future).”

It is narrated from Abdullah Salam that he said: “I saw the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), Abu Bakr and Umar in dream. They said: Be patient as the following day, you would break your fast with us.”

It is narrated from Ibne Umar that: Uthman addressed the public in the morning:

“I saw the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in dream, saying: Uthman, break your fast with us tomorrow.”

So, he kept a fast and was killed the same day.³

A drop from the ocean

In numerous books of Ahle Sunnat scholars, excessive incidents are found regarding persons they consider excellent, whom they believe to have knowledge of unseen.⁴ No one considers this polytheism and nothing is heard from Qaseemi and his like regarding this. But when such things are mentioned about Shia Imams, Ahle Sunnat take a tough stance and raise a great clamor.

An amazing point

More amazing is the fact that an Ahle Sunnat man claims that he sees the Protected Tablet (*Lauhe Mahfooz*) and reads it. This lofty claim is accepted from him, is mentioned among his merits and is regarded true, without any objection.

In *Shazaratuz Zahab*,⁵ Ibne Imad says in the biography of Maula Mohibuddin Muhammad bin Mustafa Khujwi Hanafi (d. 950 A.H.), author of gloss on Baidhawi and other writings:

He says: “If I have doubt about some verse of Quran I focus my attention on Allah, the Mighty and High. Then my breast expands till it becomes as wide as the earth and two moons rise up in it, which I don’t know what they are? Then an effulgence appears, which is the path to the Protected Tablet (*Lauhe Mahfooz*) and I derive the meaning of the verse from it.”

A lot of such nonsense is mentioned in books like *Tabaqat* of Sherani, *Al-*

¹ Dalailun Nubuwwah, [6/58].

² A place in Yemen at a distance of sixteen stages from Medina and the Battle of Yamama occurred in Rabiul Awwal, 12 A.H. during the reign of Abu Bakr.

³ Ref: *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:127 [3/60].

⁴ Ref: *Tareekh Baghdad*, 7:247; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 5:16 [7/31, Events of 605 A.H.] and 5:74 [7/133, Events of 617 A.H.]; *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 12:144 [12/177, events of 486 A.H.].

⁵ Ref: *Al-Ghadeer*, 5/95-99.

⁵ *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 8:286 [10/410, events of 950 A.H.].

Kawakibut Durriya of Nawai, *Rauzul Rihayeen* of Yafai and *Rauzatun Nazireen* of Shaykh Ahmad Watari.

وَالَّذِينَ كَذَّبُوا بِآيَاتِنَا سَنَسْتَدِرُ جُهُمُّ مِنْ حَيْثُ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ ﴿٧﴾

“And (as to) those who reject Our communications, We draw them near (to destruction) by degrees from whence they know not.”¹

5. Transferring the last remains to holy tombs

There is great clamor regarding this from ignorant persons from the aspect of practical laws and due to heedless from sources of religious verdicts. They think that this issue is only restricted to Shia, therefore they have leveled objections against them.

It is concealed from these fellows that the four Ahle Sunnat schools of law are in agreement with Shia that transferring a corpse from the place the person has died to another for place for appropriate aim is lawful, whether before or after burial, whether that person had made a bequest or not.

Malikis say:

“Transferring the corpse before or after burial to another place is lawful under three conditions: First, that it should not be damaged during transfer. Secondly, it should not cause disrespect and the corpse should not be carried in a disrespectful way. Thirdly, transfer should be for some important reason, like for example that the grave is inundated by water or to shift it to a place where it would benefit from auspiciousness of that spot or to a place near his family members, or that his family members may be able to visit the grave. If none of these conditions is present, shifting is unlawful.”²

Hanbalis say:

“There is no problem in transferring a corpse from one place to another, upon the condition that this transfer should have a correct objective. For example, it should have been transferred to holy place or for burial near a devout personality and with the condition that we may remain safe from the change in smell of the corpse and there is no difference whether it is shifted before burial or after that.”³

Shafeis say:

“Transferring a corpse to another place for burial is unlawful and it is said that it is detestable, except that it should be for proximity to Mecca, Medina, Baitul Muqaddas or grave of a holy personage. If the deceased makes a bequest

¹ Surah Araaf 7:182

² Al-Fiqh Alal Mazahib Arba, 1:421 [1/537].

³ Al-Fiqh Alal Mazahib Arba, 1:422.

to be transferred to one of these places, it should be carried out. Although if we are assured that the corpse would not disintegrate and Mecca implies the whole sanctuary and not the city.”¹

Hanafis say:

“It is recommended that the corpse should be buried in the city the death has occurred and there is no problem in transferring from one city to another if we are assured security from stench. But after the burial exhumation, is unlawful, except that the ground where the burial took place is unlawful or after the burial, someone else became the owner of that place through partnership.”²

Conclusion

This act was lawful in the previous Shariats. Adam (a.s.) passed away in Mecca and was buried in the cave of Abu Qubais. Then Nuh (a.s.) placed his coffin on the Ark and when he disembarked, he buried it in Baitul Muqaddas.³ It is mentioned in Shia traditional reports that he buried him in Najaf Ashraf. Yaqub (a.s.) passed away in Egypt and was buried in Shaam.⁴

Moosa transferred the coffin of Yusuf (a.s.) after he was buried in Egypt to Palestine, where his ancestors were buried.⁵

Yusuf (a.s.) transferred the coffin of his father, Yaqub (a.s.) from Egypt and buried it in Hebron in a cave prepared for his family.⁶

Imam Hasan and Imam Husain (a.s.) transferred the remains of their holy father from Kufa to the present dome of His Eminence (a.s.) in Najaf Ashraf and this was before the burial of His Eminence; though it is mentioned in *Dalailun Nubuwwah*⁷ that:

“The first of those, whose grave was transferred, was Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). He was attacked on Friday, 19th Ramadhan and he passed away two days later and his son, Imam Hasan (a.s.) prayed his funeral prayer and he was buried in Darul Imarah and his grave was concealed.”

It was then transferred to place called Najaf. Harun Rashid discovered it and constructed a building over it; and he did this when he observed that animals were attracted to that place and sought refuge from his hunting dogs there. When he inquired about this phenomenon from natives of that village, an aged man told him that it was the grave of Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) and Nuh (a.s.).⁸

¹ *Al-Minhaj*, printed as gloss on *Al-Mughni*, 1:357 [1/365] by Mohibuddin Nawawi Shafei.

² *Al-Fiqh Alal Mazahib Arba*, 1:422 [1/537].

³ *Tareekh Tabari*, 1:80 [1/161].

⁴ Abul Ikhlas Hanafi, 1:168 gloss on *Durarul Ahkam*.

⁵ *Sharh Shamail*, Qari, 2:208, *Sharh Manawi* in its gloss.

⁶ *Taareekhul Umam wal Muluk*, 1:161 & 169 [1/230 & 364].

⁷ *Mahazratul Awail*, Saktwari, 102, 1300 A.H. [Pg. 155]; *Tamamul Matun*, Safadi, 151 [Pg. 200].

⁸ Ahle Sunnat have severe dispute regarding the place of the burial of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in order to keep the people away from the tomb.

In *Al-Ghadeer*, Allamah Amini has mentioned the last remains, which were shifted from the original place of their burials in two topics:

1. Corpses that were shifted before burial.
2. Corpses that were exhumed and transferred to another grave.¹

He has ended the discussion with the following verse:

مِنْهُمْ مَنْ قَصَصَ عَلَيْكَ وَمِنْهُمْ مَنْ نَقْصَصَ عَلَيْكَ

“There are some of them that We have mentioned to you and there are others whom We have not mentioned to you.”²

6. Visitation (Ziyarat) of tombs of the Holy Progeny, supplication at graves, seeking mediation/blessings

It has been the practice of all Muslims from the early period of Islam; that is from the period of companions and companions or companions to perform Ziyarat of the graves of prophets, imams, saints and important spiritual personalities: and finally the tomb of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Prayers and supplication near the grave and seeking blessings and mediation from it, seeking divine proximity through visiting those tombs is accepted by all Muslims, and in spite of the difference of schools, no one has denied it, and no one has condemned it.

This continued till the time of Ibne Taymiyyah Harrani and he appeared like an ignorant fool, who uttered nonsense and invented new concepts in an unrestrained manner. He denied that current Sunnah absolutely. A practice of God, in which there is no change. He opposed this natural practice and turned away from this positive custom of Islam.

Through utter nonsense and illogical arguments, he lashed out against this practice, opposing all decorum and respect and issuing a verdict declaring it unlawful to undertake a journey to visit the tomb of Prophet and regarded it a journey of divine disobedience in which the Prayer has to be recited in full.

Therefore, elders of his time and his co-religionists opposed him and they stood up to confront him in a severe manner. Some wrote detailed books on this subject.³ Some have mentioned his defects and explained his heresies and deviations.

People of Shaam issued rulings against him and Burhan bin Farkakh Fuzari

¹ Ref: *Al-Ghadeer*, 5/104-132.

² Surah Ghafir 40:78

³ Like: Shifaus Saqam fee Ziyarat Khairul Aman, Taqiuddin Subki; Durratul Maziya fee Alaa Ibne Taymiyyah, Subki; Al-Maqalatul Marziya Athar Qaaziul Quzzaat Malikiya, Taqiuddin Abu Abdullah Akhnai; Najmul Mohtadi wa Rajmal Muqtadi, Fakhr bin Muallim Qarshi; Dafae Shuba, Taqiuddin Hasani; Tohfatal Mukhtara fee Radde Alaa Munkare Ziyarah, Tajuddin Fakhani (d. 834 A.H.), compilation of Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Abdul Majid Fasi (d. 1229 A.H.).

issued a verdict about him comprising of forty lines till he declared him to be a disbeliever.

Shahab bin Jabal supported Burhan in this issue and wrote to him in a letter; that is Malikis also have the same view.

Then this verdict was presented to Badr bin Jama, Chief Qaazi of Shafei in Egypt. He wrote at the beginning of the verdict:

“Praise be to Allah, what is mentioned at the end regarding the question about statement of Ibne Taymiyyah who says: Visitation (*Ziyarat*) to prophets and righteous is innovation (heretical) and what he says that journey for visitation (*Ziyarat*) to prophets is unlawful; all these statements are invalid.

A section of scholars have stated that visitation (*Ziyarat*) of Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is rewarding and is a Sunnah according to consensus. And this Mufti – that is Ibne Taymiyyah – should be prohibited from such invalid verdicts and forbidden to issue strange verdicts; if he does not desist, he should be imprisoned and exposed before the people that they may not follow him.”

Muhammad bin Ibrahim bin Saadullah bin Jama-a Shafei also wrote similarly.

Muhammad bin Jariri Ansari Hanafi wrote: “He should be arrested and imprisoned immediately.”

Muhammad bin Abu Bakr Maliki has written: “His persecution is exaggerated so that this mischief and other evils should be warded off.”

Ahmad bin Umar Muqaddasi Hanbali also declared similarly.¹

These four scholars were present in Egypt in 726 A.H. during the time when this mischief occurred; each of them being chief Qaazis.²

That is why the heresy, written by his sinful hands; the baseless matters, heretical views and ideas opposed to Quran and Sunnah were all demolished on his head; and it was announced in Damascus that one, who follows the beliefs of Ibne Taymiyyah, his life and property can be seized.³

Qaseemi, the author of *Saraa* has followed in the footsteps of Ibne Taymiyyah, emulated his practice and obeyed his selfish desires and in the twentieth century. He has distorted facts, concealed the truth and spread false concepts.

He writes in *Saraa*:⁴

“Due to these extreme beliefs of Shia regarding their Imams, and due to the fact that they regard Ali and his descendants gods, they travel from remotest places to their graves, and make offerings, gifts and sacrifices there; and shed blood and tears over there, and express sincerity to them; and perform all these

¹ Ref: *Dafae Shuba*, 45-47.

² Ref: *Takmilatis Saif Ath-Thaqil*, Shaykh Muhammad Zahid Kauthari, 155.

³ *Ad-Durarul Kamina*, Ibne Hajar Asqalani, 1:147.

⁴ As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 1:54.

acts only for them and not for the Lord of the monotheists.”

He also written:¹

“In legal issues like invoking blessing on Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) there is no difference between proximity and distance, and it is obtained in both cases. However, glancing at the holy tomb and looking at stones has no merit. Without any dispute, all scholars agree that it carries no merit; on the contrary meeting His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) when he was alive also did not have any merit. The merit lay in believing in him, learning from him, following his path and supporting him. In other words, no one can prove the least merit for Ziyarat of the holy grave and this is clear from the practice of Muslims since the early period of Islam...”

Till the end of his nonsensical statements.

The reader knows well that these poisonous statements do not befit one, who has embraced Islam, adopted piety, submitted to the Book and the Sunnah that he brought; also righteousness and good morals do not like this conduct and the culture of the holy religion of Islam does not approve it. Is it lawful for a Muslim to equate seeing a stone to glancing at the Prophet during his lifetime?

Is it lawful for a Muslim that he should accord no value for Ziyarat of His Eminence during his lifetime and his death and not to believe in any of its merits and to announce this in a religious gathering?

Is it not the practice of all the people of all religions, who regard visiting their elders meritorious? Don’t they consider it a matter of pride for the visitor? And people are more attracted due to the excellence that this act carries. Same was the practice of people from all religions and people always had consensus on this matter; and in the past and present they regard it a sign of respecting holy personalities in seeking blessings from them.

How much is the difference between the statement Qaseemi and words of Shaykh Taqiuddin Subki in *Shifa*?²

What is concluded from religion and practice of past scholars is that seeking blessings from deceased righteous ones, what to say about prophets, is an excellent deed. One, who claims that graves of prophets and others are same, has made a serious claim and we are certain that it is invalid. This statement demotes the Prophet to level of other Muslims and this is certainly heretic, because one, who decreases the actual rank of Prophet, has renegaded from Islam.

Encouragement for visitation (Ziyarat) of the Prophet (s.a.)

Leaders and scholars of the four schools of Islamic law, in their authentic books of traditions, have mentioned numerous traditions regarding visitation (Ziyarat) to the tomb of Prophet (s.a.w.a.). We shall mention some of them here:

1.

¹ As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 1:178.

² Shifaus Saqam fee Ziyarat Khairul Aman, Taqiuddin Subki, 96 [Pg. 130].

It is narrated from Abdullah bin Umar from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), without names of intervening narrators that:

“My intercession becomes obligatory for one, who visits my grave.”

Many tradition scholar have narrated this report; among them being:

1. Hafiz Abul Hasan Ali bin Umar Darqutni (d. 385 A.H.) in *Sunan*.¹

2. Chief Qaazi, Abul Hasan Mawardi (d. 450 A.H.) in *Ahkamus Sultania*.²

3. Hafiz Abu Bakr Baihaqi (d. 458 A.H.) in his *Sunan* and other books.³

4. Hafiz Jalaluddin Abdur Rahman Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) in *Jamiul Kabeer* as it is mentioned in its sequence.⁴

5. A group of scholars from the four schools of jurisprudence in Egypt in the book: *Al-Fiqh Alal Mazahibul Arba*.⁵

2.

It is narrated from Abdullah bin Umar directly from the Prophet that:

“Whoever performs the Hajj and after that visits my grave after my passing away, is like one, who visited me during my lifetime.”

In numerous chains of report the term of ‘was habni’ (has accompanied me and is my companion) is also present. Many scholars have narrated this report, like:⁶

1. Hafiz Abul Qasim Tibrani (d. 360 A.H.).

2. Hafiz Abul Hasan Darqutni (d. 385 A.H.) in his *Sunan* and other than that.

3. Hafiz Abu Bakr Baihaqi (d. 458 A.H.) in his *Sunan*.

4. Hafiz Ibne Asakir Damishqi (d. 571 A.H.) in his *Tarikh*.

5. Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) in *Jamiul Kabeer* according to the narration of its sequence.

3.

It is narrated from Abdullah bin Umar directly from the Prophet that:

“Whoever performs the Hajj and does not visit me, has been unjust to me.”

A number of scholars have narrated this report, among them being:⁷

1. Hafiz Darqutni (d. 385 A.H.) in his book: *Ahadees of Malik not mentioned in Muwattah*.

2. Taqiuddin Subki (d. 756 A.H.), through a number of channels in *Shifaus*

¹ *Sonan Darqutni*, [2/278, H. 194].

² *Ahkamus Sultania*, 150 [2/109].

³ *Sonanul Kubraa*, [5/245].

⁴ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 8:99 [15/651, H. 42583].

⁵ *Al-Fiqh Alal Mazahibul Arba*, 1:590 [1/711].

⁶ *Al-Mojamul Kabeer*, [12/310, H. 13497]; *Sonan Darqutni*, [2/278, H. 192]; *Sonan Baihaqi*, 5:246; *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 2:406; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 8:99 [15/651].

⁷ *Shifaus Saqam*, 22 [Pg. 27]; *Tajus Uroos*, 10:74; *Neelul Autar*, 4:25 [5/108].

Siqam. He has refuted the statement of Ibne Jauzi, who regards the tradition false.

3. Sayyid Murtada Zubaidi Hanafi (d. 1205 A.H.) in *Tajul Uroos*.

4. Shaykh Muhammad Shaukani (d. 1250 A.H.) in *Neelul Autar*.

فَلَعَلَّكُمْ تَأْخُذُونَ نَفْسَكُمْ إِنَّمَا يُؤْمِنُوا بِهَذَا الْحَدِيثَ أَسْفًا ⑤

“Then maybe you will kill yourself with grief, sorrowing after them, if they do not believe in this announcement.”¹

فَبِأَيِّ حَدِيثٍ بَعْدَهُ يُؤْمِنُونَ ⑥

“What announcement would they then believe in after this?”²

Statements of scholars of four schools regarding Ziyarat of Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

1. Chief Qaazi, Abul Hasan Mawardi (d. 450 A.H.) writes in *Ahkamus Sultaniya*:³

“And when the caretaker of Hajj pilgrims returned, he took them for Ziyarat of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) to Medina, so that Hajj pilgrims may combine the two visits and this was as a mark of respect for His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) and to fulfill the rights of his obedience. Though it is not an obligatory part of Hajj, but it is among recommended points of Shariah and a good worship act of Hajj pilgrims.”

2. Qaazi Ayaz Maliki (d. 544 A.H.) has written in *Shifa*:⁴

“Ziyarat of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is Sunnat according to consensus of all Muslims, and it is an excellence, which is encouraged.”

After that he has mentioned a number of traditions in a chapter and said:

“Ishaq bin Ibrahim Faqih has said: The practice of Hajj pilgrims has always been that they pay a visit to Medina and make intention to pray in the Masjid of Prophet; and by seeing the tomb, pulpit, grave, place of sitting of His Eminence, place where his hand touched, place where he stepped, a pillar on which he reclined, place where Jibreel brought divine revelation on him, seeing the place where companions and Imams of Muslims have intended to inhabit that place by worship and prayer over there, we seek blessings from and gain lessons from all this.”

3. Ibne Hubaira (d. 560 A.H.) has written in the book of *Ittefaqul Aimma*:

“Malik, Shafei, Abu Hanifah, Ahmad bin Hanbal have consensus that

¹ Surah Kahf 18:6

² Surah Araaf 7:185

³ Ahkamus Sultaniya, 105 [2/109].

⁴ Ash-Shifa ba Tarif Huququl Mustafa, [2/194].

visitation (*Ziyarat*) of Prophet is recommended.”¹

4. Shaykh Taqiuddin Subki Shafei (d. 756 A.H.) has written a detailed book regarding visitation (*Ziyarat*) of Prophet comprising of 181 pages in refutation of Ibne Taymiyyah and entitled it: *Shifaus Siqam fee Ziyarat Khairul Anam*, in which he has mentioned a large number of traditional reports on this subject. After that he has presented a chapter on the clarification of scholars of four schools that *Ziyarat* is recommended and that this act is consensual among all Muslims.

5. Chief justice, Shahabuddin Khafaji Hanafi Misri (d. 1069 A.H.) has written in *Sharhe Shifa*:²

“Know that it is the same tradition³ that impelled Ibne Taymiyyah and his followers, like Ibne Qayyim to make negative statements that through it they may declare apostasy of others and Subki has written a separate book on that; that statement prohibits visiting the tomb of Prophet and undertaking a journey to it.”

“He thinks that through such nonsense, as even the mention of which is not appropriate, he has defended divine monotheism, while in fact these nonsensical things are not worthy from a logical person, what to say of an accomplished scholar [may God forgive him].”

As for the statement of His Eminence (s.a.w.a.): “Do not make visitation of my tomb as Eid implies that gathering there on a specified day of a year is detestable. On the contrary it should be visited often.”⁴

6. Egyptian jurists of the four schools of jurisprudence have written in the book of *Al-Fiqha Alal Mazahibul Arba*:⁵

Visitation (*Ziyarat*) of the tomb of Prophet is most important of the recommended acts and traditions have come down regarding that.

وَهُدُو إِلَى الظَّيْبِ مِنْ الْقَوْلِ وَهُدُو إِلَى صَرَاطِ الْحَمِيمِ⁶

“And they are guided to goodly words and they are guided into the path of the Praised One.”⁶

Etiquette of Visitor according to Ahle Sunnat

We shall mention statements of some sources on this point:⁷

¹ *Al-Mudkhal*, Ibnul Haaj, [1/265].

² Nasimur Riyaz fee Sharhe Shifa, 3:566 [3/514].

³ Tradition of traveling out to visit the Masjids (*Shadur rijaal ila Masajid*).

⁴ Some Ahle Sunnat scholars have mentioned this meaning.

⁵ *Al-Fiqha Alal Mazahibul Arba*, 1:59 [1/711].

⁶ Surah Hajj 22:24

⁷ Jamaluddin Abdulllah Fakihi Makki Shafei (d. 972 A.H.) has written a book on etiquette of *Ziyarat* of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and entitled it *Husnut Tawassul fee Aadaabe Ziyarate Afzalul Rusul*, in which he has collected 49 etiquettes. We ignore some of them, because they were not restricted to the visitor. This book is quoted on the margins of *Al-Ithaaf* by Shubrawi printed in Egypt in 1318 A.H. [Pg. 29].

1. Sincerity of intention and purity of conscience are necessary, because acts will be rewarded on the basis of intention.¹ Thus, in performing Ziyarat of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), the visitor should have the intention of gaining divine proximity and it is recommended that he should make an intention of traveling to the Masjid of Prophet and to pray over there for seeking divine proximity.

This point is quoted by Ibne Salah and Nawawi² from the Shafeis and Hanafite Shaykh, Kamal bin Hamam has narrated it from Hanafite teachers.

2. One should continuously be eager for Ziyarat of that beloved.

3. Throughout the journey, he should continue to invoke divine blessings on Prophet; on the contrary he should spend free times in acts that earn proximity.

4. While entering holy Medina, he should perform the ritual bath (*Ghusl*) at the well of Harra, apply perfume and dress in the best of garments.

5. When the sanctuary becomes visible, he should become extremely humble and sincere; recall its greatness and visualize the greatness and rank of Prophet with awe, tranquility and dignity.

6. It is better that the visitor should enter from the gate of Jibraeel and the practice of past people was that they entered from Babus Salam.

7. He should stand at the gate for a moment; like one, who wants to enter into someone of importance and waits to take permission. Fakihi has mentioned this in *Husnul Adab*³ and Shaykh Abdul Muti Thiqqa has written in *Irshadatus Sunniya*.⁴

8. One should neither raise the voice nor reduce it much; on the contrary it should be moderate and speaking softly is a mark of respect to His Eminence (s.a.w.a.). Qaazi Ayaz⁵ has narrated through his authorities from Ibne Hamid that:

Abu Ja'far – chief of believers – debated with Malik in the Prophet's Masjid. Malik said: O chief of believers, do not raise your voice in this Masjid, because Allah, the Mighty and High has warned some people saying:

تَرْفَعُوا أَصْوَاتُكُمْ فَوْقَ صَوْتِ النَّبِيِّ

“Do not raise your voices above the voice of the Prophet.”⁶

And praised some people saying:

إِنَّ النَّبِيَّ يَغْضُبُ عَلَى أَصْوَاتِهِمْ عِنْدَ رُسُولِ اللَّهِ

¹ Wasailush Shia, 1/34, Chapter 5 from the Chapters of obligation of intention in worship acts, H. 6 & 1097; Saheeh Bukhari, ½.

² Sharh Saheeh Muslim, [9/168].

³ Husnul Adab, 56.

⁴ Irshadatus Sunniya, 26.

⁵ Ash-Shifa ba Tareef al-Mustafa [2/92].

⁶ Surah Hujurat 49:2

“Surely those who lower their voices before Allah’s Apostle.”¹

And condemned some people saying:

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ يُنَادِونَكَ مِنْ وَرَاءِ الْحُجُّرِ

“(As for) those who call out to you from behind the private chambers.”²

And his respect after his passing away is like his respect during his lifetime. Thus, Abu Ja’far changed immediately and became humble and asked: “Should I supplicate facing the prayer direction (*Qibla*) or the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)?”

Malik said: “Why do you turn your face away from him while he is your mediation and mediation of your father, Adam (a.s.) towards God on Judgment Day? On the contrary, face him and make him as your intercessor, so that Allah, the Mighty and High may accept your request. Allah says:

وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذْ ظَلَمُوا أَنفُسَهُمْ جَاءُوكَ فَاسْتَغْفِرُوا اللَّهَ وَاسْتَغْفِرْ لَهُمْ
الرَّسُولُ لَوْ جَدُوا اللَّهَ تَوَابَارَ حِيمًا

“And had they, when they were unjust to themselves, come to you and asked forgiveness of Allah...”³

Ziyarat of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

9. Scholars of the four schools of jurisprudence have consensus on the following version:⁴

“Peace be on you, O Prophet of God, and the mercy and blessings of God be on you. I testify that you are the Prophet of God and you conveyed the message of God and discharged the trust; advised the Ummah and struggled in the command of God. Till Almighty Allah took away your most praised soul to Himself. Then may Allah give you the best of rewards as compared to our young and old and may He send the choicest and best blessings upon you. O God, make our Prophet on Judgment Day as the most proximate of prophets and allow us to drink water from his cup and grant us his intercession. Make us his companions on Judgment Day. O God, do not make this our last Ziyarat of our Prophet and allow us to return there again, O Owner of majesty and nobility.”

Supplication at the head of Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

10. One should stand at the holy head and recite:

“O God, indeed You said and your saying is truth:

¹ Surah Hujurat 49:3

² Surah Hujurat 49:4

³ Surah Nisa 4:64

⁴ In Al-Fiqha Alal Mazahibul Arba, 1:591 [1/713].

وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذْ ظَلَمُوا أَنفُسَهُمْ جَاءُوكَ فَاسْتَغْفِرُوا اللَّهُ وَاسْتَغْفِرْ لَهُمْ
الرَّسُولُ لَوْجَدُوا اللَّهَ تَوَابًا رَّحِيمًا

“And had they, when they were unjust to themselves, come to you and asked forgiveness of Allah and the Apostle had (also) asked forgiveness for them, they would have found Allah Oft-returning (to mercy), Merciful.”¹

We have come while we have heard Your statement and obeyed Your command and deemed Your Prophet as our intercessor. O God, forgive us and our brothers, who brought faith earlier and do not allow malice towards believers to remain in our hearts. O God, You are kind and merciful. O God, grant us rewards in the world and the hereafter and keep us secure from chastisement of Fire. Almighty Allah is pure of what we attribute to Him. And peace be on the prophets and praise is only for the Lord of the worlds.”

You should recite any supplication that comes to your mind. This point is mentioned by Sharanbalali Hanafi in *Miraqul Falah*,² and others have written in other books.

Invoking blessings (Salawat) on the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

11. Bukhari has narrated through chain of narrators directly from the Prophet that whoever invoked blessings on me at my tomb, Almighty Allah appoints an angel, who conveys his blessings (*Durood*) and suffices him in the matters of the world and hereafter and I will be his intercessor or witness on Judgment Day.³

Seeking mediation through the holy tomb of His Eminence

12. Then the visitor returns to his first position near the face of Prophet and seeks his mediation from Almighty Allah and seeks divine forgiveness in excess. After that he says: O the best of prophets, indeed Allah has revealed a verse regarding you:

وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذْ ظَلَمُوا أَنفُسَهُمْ جَاءُوكَ فَاسْتَغْفِرُوا اللَّهُ وَاسْتَغْفِرْ لَهُمْ
الرَّسُولُ لَوْجَدُوا اللَّهَ تَوَابًا رَّحِيمًا

“And had they, when they were unjust to themselves, come to you and asked forgiveness of Allah and the Apostle had (also) asked forgiveness for them, they would have found Allah Oft-returning (to mercy), Merciful.”⁴

A large number of Ahle Sunnat tradition scholars have discussed in detail

¹ Surah Nisa 4:64

² Miraqul Falah, 152.

³ This tradition is mentioned Khateeb Sharbini in *Al-Mughni*, 1:494 [1/12].

⁴ Surah Nisa 4:64

and written about seeking of mediation (*Tawassul*). Seeking mediation of Prophet is lawful in all circumstances, before and after the creation of His Eminence, during his lifetime as well as after his passing away, in Barzakh, Qiyamat and Paradise. They have divided seeking of mediation (*Tawassul*) into three kinds:

1. Supplicating Almighty Allah in his name or his rank or through his auspiciousness and they say that seeking of mediation (*Tawassul*) in all these instances is lawful.

2. Seeking of mediation (*Tawassul*) in the meaning of supplicating. They have said that this is also allowed in all cases.

3. I seek from the Prophet an issue, which I have intended. In the sense that he can beseech Almighty Allah and intercede and become the cause of fulfillment of that supplication; in fact this is the same second reason, which is explained in other words.

Subki writes in *Shifaus Siqam*:¹

“There are a numerous writings on this subject... and there is no doubt that it can be called as seeking mediation or seeking intercession or seeking refuge or seeking attention through rank of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) with Almighty Allah, as the meaning of all these terms is same.”

Seeking blessings from the holy grave by touching and kissing it

13. No scholar from the four schools of jurisprudence has regarded this act unlawful. Those who say it is prohibited, regard prohibition as detestability and not forbidden. It does not befit the jurist (*Faqih*) to make such deductions on the basis of such supposed matters, which has no base at all or to deliver a judgment that contradicts verdicts of others.

Yes, some² have deviated from the right path and issued verdicts of unlawfulness without any proof. Therefore, no attention should be paid to those famous for holding rare views. Also, we are not forerunners in making the facts clear for the reader and showing the correct viewpoint:

1. Hafiz Ibne Asakir in *Tohfa* has narrated through the channels of Tahir bin Yahya Husaini from his father from his grandfather from Ja’far bin Muhammad from his father from Ali (a.s.) that he said:

“When the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was buried, Fatima arrived and stood at the side of the grave, placed a handful of dust on her eyes and remarked: One, who has smelt the dust of the grave of Ahmad, he will not need to smell any other fragrance. Such calamities has descended on me that if they had descended on days, they would have turned into dark nights.”³

2. It is narrated from Dawood bin Abu Salih that one day Marwan saw that a

¹ Shifaus Saqam, [Pg. 175].

² Ibne Taymiyyah and his like.

³ Ref: *Al-Wafa fee Fazaaelul Mustafa*, Ibne Jauzi [Pg. 819, H. 1538]; *Elamun Nisa*, Umar Reza Kahala, 3:1205 [4/113].

man had placed his face and forehead on the grave of Prophet. Marwan caught his neck and said: “Do you know what you are doing?”

That man, who was Ayyub Ansari, looked at him and said: “Yes, I have not come visit stones, I have come for Ziyarat of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). I heard the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) say: Do not cry on religion when those, who are deserving get its charge; but cry on it when those, who are undeserving of it become its caretakers.”¹

Allamah Amini says: This tradition nicely explains that to prohibit seeking mediation from the holy grave is a heresy and deviation of Bani Umayyah since the time of companions and the ears of the world have never heard any companions denying seeking of mediation, except an issue from the house of Umayyah, Marwan, the unjust and the usurper.

There is a proverb in Arabic that: The cow defends itself with its horns. Another proverb says: The bird feeds on a particular kind of date.²

Yes, Bani Umayyah in general and Marwan in particular, bore great malice to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) since the day His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) did not show any respect to the Umayyad clan and did not leave any secret, but that he exposed it, he did not leave any pillar, except that he demolished it, and this was through the mention of their defects and he is one regarding whom Almighty Allah says:

وَمَا يَنْطِقُ عَنِ الْهُوَىٰ إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا وَحْيٌ يُوحَىٰ عَلَيْهِ شَدِيدُ الْقُوَىٰ³

“Nor does he speak out of desire. it is naught but revelation that is revealed, the Lord of Mighty Power has taught him,”³

It is narrated from His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) through authentic chains of narrators that when the number of Bani Umayyah reaches forty, they would enslave people, appropriate the funds of Allah and corrupt the Book of God.

Also, it is narrated from His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) through correct chains of narrators that when the descendants of Abul Aas number thirty, they will corrupt the religion of God, enslave people and pass on the wealth of God among one another.

Also, it is narrated from His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) through correct chains of narrators that: I dreamt as if the descendants of Abul Aas had climbed upon my pulpit like monkeys. The narrator says: “After that the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) never smiled till he passed away.”

Also, it is narrated from His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) through correct chains of narrators that when Hakam bin Aas sought his permission, he said: “Curse of God be on him and whoever comes out through his loins, except the progeny of

¹ Ref: *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, 4:515 [4/560, H. 8571]. He and Zahabi in his *Talkhis* have regarded this tradition as authentic.

² It implies someone who says one thing and implies another.

³ Surah Najm 53:3-5

believers, who would be few; they are noble in the world and degraded in the hereafter. They are deceptive and fraudulent and they would be bestowed in the world, but they will not have any advantage in the hereafter.”

Also, it is narrated from His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) through correct chains of narrators that when they brought Marwan bin Hakam to him, he said: “He is a lizard, son of a lizard and accursed, son of an accursed.”

It is narrated from Ayesha through correct chains of narrators that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “May God curse the father of Marwan”, and it was when Marwan was in his loins. So, Marwan is included in the divine curse.

Then it is not worthy that a Muslim should walk in the footsteps of these accursed people, repeat their statements, prefer their views and remain in pursuit of persons, who corrupted the religion of God, enslaved people and distorted the Book of Allah.

3. Izz bin Jama-a Hamawi (d. 819 A.H.) has said that in the book of *Al-Ilal was Sawlat*, Abdullah bin Ahmad bin Hanbal has narrated from his father the report of Abu Ali bin Sawwaf¹ from Abdullah that he said: “I asked my father about touching the pulpit of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), seeking blessing from it and kissing it and such acts performed expecting divine rewards; he replied: There is no problem in it.”²

4. Qaazi Ayaz Maliki says in *Ash-Shifa*³ after a long discourse about according respect to the tomb of the Prophet:

It is worthy that places, where divine revelation descended, Jibreel and Mikaeel paused over them, angels and Ruhul Quds arose from there, and called out at different places, the dust of that place accommodated the Chief of Humans within itself, from where religion and Sunnah of Prophet spread...it is a place of paying respect, and its fragrance is perceived, and that its corners, quarters and its walls should be kissed.

أُولَئِكَ الَّذِينَ هَدَى اللَّهُ فَيُهُدِّي بِهِمْ أَفْتَنِي

“These are they whom Allah guided, therefore follow their guidance.”⁴

14. Bidding farewell to the Holy Tomb: When the visitor completes all rituals and wants to leave Medina, it is recommended to come to the tomb and recite the previously mentioned Ziyarat and bid farewell to Prophet and beg

¹ In the present version of *Al-Ghadeer*, Abu Ali bin Sawaf is mentioned, but what we have mentioned is correct. *Al-Ilal wal Marifat Rijal*, Abu Ali Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Hasan Sawwaf from Abu Abdur Rahman Abdullah bin Ahmad bin Hanbal from his father it is narrated and this name is either as Ahmad bin Hanbal has named him or his son, Abdullah or the student of Abdullah, Abu Ali bin Sawwaf. Ref: Al *Al-Ilal wal Marifat Rijal*, 1/85.

² Ref: *Wafaul Wafa*, 2:443 [4/1404].

³ *Ash-Shifa bi Tareef Huququl Mustafa* [2/131-134].

⁴ Surah Anaam 6:90

Almighty Allah to make him return there again and seek safety in his journey...

Ziyarat of Imams of Baqi and other places of visitation

15. Fakhi writes:¹

“It is recommended that every day, after performing his Ziyarat, one should move to Baqi and this act is more emphasized for Fridays.”

It is mentioned in *Ihyaaul Uloom*:²

“It is recommended that one should go to Baqi every day.”

Nawawi and Fakhuri have also mentioned the same and Fakhuri has added:

“Friday is specially for visiting graves and tombs. Thus, one should perform the Ziyarat of Abbas, and along with Hasan bin Ali, Zainul Abideen, and his son, Muhammad Baqir and his son, Ja’far Sadiq should be visited; and also visits our master, chief of believers, Uthman and the grave of Ibrahim, son of Prophet (s.a.w.a.); and some wives of Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and the aunt of His Eminence, Safiya and a large number of companions and companions of companions, especially our master, Malik and our master, Nafe...”

Allamah Amini says: The graves located in Baqi Gharqad,³ before they fell to the domination of sinners and corrupt people, were worth seeing. These graves are numerous and Samhudi in *Wafaul Wafa*⁴ has mentioned them and described them in detail and important conclusions can be derived from it.

Ziyarat of the martyrs of Uhad

16. It is recommended for the Hajj pilgrim to perform Ziyarat of the martyrs of Uhad. Nawawi, Sharimali⁵ and others have written that the best day for Ziyarat is Thursday, especially for the Ziyarat of the grave of our master, Hamza.

Fakehi has mentioned in *Husnul Adab*.⁶

“It is mentioned that we should perform their Ziyarat and salute them. By the one, in whose hands my life is, no one greets them, but that on Judgment Day they would respond to the greeting. It is clear that replying to their salutation is supplication for health and their supplication is accepted.”

Hamzawi has written in *Kanzul Matalib*:⁷

“In order to get the wishes fulfilled, he makes him as medium to God, because that place is the location of descent of divine blessings...”

17. As Nawawi has mentioned, it is an emphasized recommendation that one

¹ *Husnul Adab*, [Pg. 83].

² *Ehyaaul Uloomud Deen*: [1/232].

³ Baqi Gharqad is the cemetery of Medina due to the presence of Gharqad tree (a huge tree) at this place. *Mo’jamul Buldaan*, 4:194.

⁴ *Wafaul Wafa*, 2:101-105 [3/891-924].

⁵ *Maraqiu Falah*, [Pg. 151].

⁶ *Husnul Adab*, 3.

⁷ *Kanzul Matalib*, 230.

should travel to Quba Masjid, and this act is appropriate on Saturday. It is narrated through correct chains from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that one, who travels to this Masjid - that is Quba Masjid – and prays there, is like one, who has performed the Umrah.¹

18. Seeking blessings from other relics of Prophet and holy places is mentioned in *Miraqul Falah*² and other books.

19. Fakhuri, in *Al-Kifaya Lizawil Inaya*,³ has written:

“It is recommended to take gifts from the dates of Medina and water from springs of Medina, without facing any hardship, otherwise it would be with the intention of showing off.

فَهُلْ يَنْظُرُونَ إِلَّا سُنْنَتُ الْأَوَّلِينَ فَلَنْ تَجِدَ لِسُنْنَتِ اللَّهِ تَبَرِّيئَلَّا وَلَنْ تَجِدَ
لِسُنْنَتِ اللَّهِ تَخْوِيئَلَّا

“For you shall not find any alteration in the course of Allah; and
you shall not find any change in the course of Allah.”⁴

Encouragement for visiting tombs

In reliable traditional reports accepted by all sects, there are orders for visiting graves and people are encouraged to adopt this practice and all important personalities of Muslims sects have issued verdicts regarding its benefits and regarded it recommended. On the contrary according to clarification of numerous scholars, some Zahiriya⁵ regarded it obligatory. Below, we present a number of traditional reports on this subject:

1. It is narrated in a tradition directly from Abdullah bin Masud that:

“Visit the graves, as it makes a man pious in the world and reminds one of the hereafter.”⁶

2. It is narrated from Anas bin Malik from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) through incomplete chains of narrators that:

“In the past, I prohibited you from visiting graves; but now whoever likes,

¹ Mustadrak Alas Saheehain, 3:12, [3/13, H. 4297].

² *Miraqul Falah*, [Pg. 152].

³ Al-Kifaya Lizawil Inaya, 130.

⁴ Surah Fatir 35:43

⁵ Zahiriya were followers of Dawood bin Ali bin Khalaf Isfahani Shafei Zahiri. He was born in Kufa in the year 200 A.H. and he grew up in Baghdad and he died in 270 A.H. Hence he was given the title of Zahiri as he claimed that it is necessary to derive from the meaning of Quran and apparent of traditions and not from its concealed and his slogan was denial of personal opinion and analogy in religious laws and relying on the apparent of Quran and traditions. He was more prejudiced to the Shafei school and later created a new school. Ibne Hazm Andulasi Zahiri is the greatest follower of this viewpoint: *Al-Fehrist*, Ibne Nadim, 271; Ref: *Mojamul Firaqal Islamiya*, 165.

⁶ *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 1:476 [1/501, H. 1517]; *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 1:375 [1/531, H. 1387].

may go for Ziyarat of graves as it makes the heart soft, causes tears to flow and reminds one of hereafter; but you shouldn't utter improper words."

3. Abu Walid Muhammad bin Abdullah Arzaqi has written in *Akhbar Mecca*:¹

Ibne Abi Malik narrated a tradition to me directly from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

"Go to your deceased ones and salute them – or visit them, the doubt is from Khuzai – as it would be a source of edification for you."

4. Every Friday, Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) visited the grave of her uncle, Hamza, recited prayer near the grave and lamented there.

فَلْيَأْتُو بِمَحْدِيَّتِ مَقْبَلَةٍ إِنْ كَانُوا صَدِيقِينَ

"Then let them bring an announcement like it if they are truthful."²

Etiquette for visitors of graves

1. The visitor should be ritually pure.
2. He should enter from the feet side of the deceased and not from the head side.
3. He should face the deceased during the Ziyarat.
4. He should perform the Ziyarat in standing position and in this position, supplicate for him.
5. He should recite as much Quran as he can and reading of Surah Yasin and Surah Tauheed is recommended.
6. He should supplicate for the deceased facing the Prayer direction (*Qibla*).
7. While reciting Quran, he should sit facing the Prayer direction (*Qibla*).
8. He should sprinkle pure water on the grave.
9. Give alms (*Sadaqah*) on behalf of the dead.
10. The visitor should be bare footed and he should not walk over the grave.

Statement regarding Ziyarat

1. It is narrated from Ayesha directly from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said: Jibreel came to me said: "Your Lord has commanded you to visit Baqi and pray for the forgiveness of those buried there."

Ayesha asked: "O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), what should I tell them."

He replied: Say: "Peace be on the folks of this abode from believer and Muslims; may God have mercy on our past and future people and if Allah wants,

¹ *Akhbar Mecca*, 2:170 [2/211].

² Surah Tur 52:34

we would also join you.”¹

2. Firozabadi - author of *Qamus* – has written in *Safarus Saada*.²

“Among the habits of Prophet was to visit graves and to supplicate and seek forgiveness and such Ziyarat is recommended.”

Statements in excess are present from Muslim scholars and leaders of the four schools of jurisprudence regarding visitation of graves; and it can be concluded that a visitor can visit the grave and pray for the inmate of the tomb in any words that he may like; and he can narrate his excellence and merits and whatever may enable the deceased to get divine mercy and blessings. Words that are mentioned in the Ziyarat of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) prove all this nicely.

Statements of Ahle Sunnat scholars regarding visitation of graves

There are numerous benefits in these statements:

1. Ibne Haaj Abu Abdullah Abdari Maliki (d. 737 A.H.) says in *Al-Mudkhal*:³

“The method of reciting salutation on the deceased is that you say: Peace be on you, O folks of this abode; men and women, believers and Muslims. May God have mercy on our past and future folks. And if Allah approves, we would join you. I pray to God, for your and my forgiveness. Then he says: O God, forgive us and them.”

There is no problem if one mentions something more or less; because they are most needful for supplication due to being cut off from their acts.

Then sit with your back to the Prayer direction (*Qibla*) facing the grave and one can sit near the feet or the head; and one can sit facing the deceased’s head. Then he should mention whatever comes to his mind from divine praise and glorification. Then should invoke blessings on Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and as much as possible, pray for the deceased. Also, when a calamity befalls him or Muslims, he should pray near these tombs and express humility to Allah, the Mighty and High, so that He may remove that calamity. This method of visiting the graves is general and customary.

If the deceased is someone that his blessings are hoped for [like Prophet] then one should make him as a medium with Allah, the Mighty and High. Also, one, who regards the deceased a source of blessings and makes him his medium for Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.); on the contrary, he should begin by seeking mediation of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), because the best and original seeking of mediation is from His Eminence (s.a.w.a.); after that one should seek the mediation from those who follow him till Judgment Day.

¹ *Saheeh Muslim* [2/363, H. 103, Kitabul Janaiz].

² *Safarus Saada*, 57 [1/183].

³ *Al-Mudkhal*, 1:254.

2. It is narrated from Ibne Hajar Makki Haithami (d. 973 A.H.) regarding Ziyarat of saints on special occasions and traveling to visit those tombs. It was asked whether such act was lawful, in spite the fact that near those tombs, many illegal acts were seen, like mixing of sexes, lighting of large number of lamps/candles and nonsensical things.

He replied in Al-Fatawatal Kubratul Fiqhiya:¹

“Visiting tombs of holy saints and undertaking journeys to those places is a source of gaining divine proximity and it is recommended...and the heresies that the questioner has hinted to, cannot be an excuse for omitting this sincere act. On the contrary man should perform these acts and denounce those negative acts, if he is unable to stop them entirely...one, who prohibits Ziyarat due to the fear of these mixings, should also prohibit rituals of Hajj where there are instances of mixing of sexes like in circumambulation, stoning of satans and other such occasions. The view that such a ritual was not followed by past people is invalid, and if it were a heresy, every heresy is forbidden, on the contrary, as they have explained, sometimes it becomes obligatory, what to say of it being recommended?”

Offerings for the inmates of tombs

In this matter, Ibne Taymiyyah and his cohorts created hue and cry and used improper words and attacked their opponents from Muslim sects with filthy words and it is narrated from Qaseemi that he said:

“These offerings are from the distinctive qualities of Shia and comprise extreme beliefs about their Imams, and considering Ali and his descendants as God.”

This is nothing, but mixing falsehood in statements: and in this matter the Shia do not believe anything other than what the Islamic Ummah had consensus on in the past and present.

In his *Sulahul Ikhwan*,² Khalidi has discussed this subject. The gist of that statement is:

The issue concerns the intentions of offering makers and acts will be rewarded on the basis of intentions; if the intention of the offering maker is the deceased only and gaining his/her proximity, according to general consensus, it is not lawful.

If his intention is Almighty Allah and taking benefit by the living is one of the causes, and its reward is for the deceased, whether he determines a cause from gaining of profit or is like making an absolute vow, but it is a thing, which in common parlance requires expenditure, like construction of tomb, or spending for the welfare of people of the town, or neighbors or poor or relatives of the deceased etc. In that case fulfillment of the vow is obligatory. This view is

¹ Al-Fatawatal Kubratul Fiqhiya, 2:24.

² Sulahul Ikhwan, 102-109.

followed by Azari, Zarkashi, Ibne Hajar Haithami Makki, Ramli Shafei, Khabbati Basri, Rafei, Nawawi, Alauddin Hanafi, Khairuddin Ramli Hanafi, Shaykh Muhammad Ghazzi, Shaykh Qasim Hanafi.

If common parlance did not have a command regarding this, it is effective in the opposite aspect.

First

Making a vow is not valid; because the Islamic law has not ordained it, except Kaaba and the holy chamber [where offerings are lawful according to Shariah].

Second

If it is famous as spending for welfare, it is valid; and on the basis of this, it should only be spent in the welfare of deceased, and should not be spent in any other thing.

Azzami says in *Furqanul Quran*.¹

“Ibne Taymiyyah says: One, who makes an offering to Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), other prophets or saints from the inmates of grave, or sacrifices an animal; he is like polytheists, who sacrifice animals for their idols and deem it as offering and such a person has worshipped other than God, therefore, he becomes a polytheist and in this regard many statements are issued and through these statements some modern scholars or their students have been deceived.

This statement is impersonation in religion [wrong picture of religion, and to make it doubtful for others] and returning to the meaning that no Muslim intended, because any Muslim, who does this understands that his intention is only alms for them, and deeming the reward for them. Ahle Sunnat have consensus that giving of Sadaqah by the living for the dead is beneficial and it reaches them, and authentic and famous traditional reports exist regarding this...

Thus, it is no use paying attention to the ignorance of Ibne Taymiyyah and his like.

أُولَئِكَ الَّذِينَ طَبَعَ اللَّهُ عَلَى قُلُوبِهِمْ وَاتَّبَعُوا أَهْوَاءَهُمْ ﴿٤٧﴾

“These are they upon whose hearts Allah has set a seal and they follow their low desires.”²

Tombs where one can travel with the intention of Ziyarat

Also, seeking mediation and blessings from them and supplications and prayer near those tombs, completing the Quran for those who are buried there, etc.

Tombs, to which one can travel with the intention of Ziyarat were present

¹ Furqanul Quran, 133.

² Surah Muhammad 47:16

during all periods of Islam since the early times; and leaders of the four schools of law have issued statements that people from different corners of the Islamic world can gain lessons from them and be informed about different benefits. Among them being that the practice of Muslims and their distinctive signs in all ages regarding Ziyarat of tombs, and seeking mediation and blessings from them, supplications and prayers near them, and completing the Quran for those buried there. Below we present examples of such tombs:

1. Bilal bin Hamam Habashi, Muezzin of Messenger of Allah (d. 20 A.H.): His tomb is in Damascus and above that blessed grave, a date with his name is mentioned and supplication is accepted at this blessed place. Many religious personalities have experienced this matter.¹

2. The great companion of the Prophet, Salman Farsi (d. 536 A.H.): Khatib Baghdadi has written in his *Tarikh*.²

“Today, his tomb is prominent and well known and it is near the Palace of Choesroe. A building is constructed over it, and a caretaker is appointed there to take care of it and keep it occupied and do whatever is necessary for its upkeep. I have seen the place and visited it a few times.”

3. *Raasul Husain* – head of Imam Husain (a.s.), grandson of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) – in Egypt; Ibne Jubair (d. 614 A.H.) has written in his *Rihla*.³

“The head is buried in a casket of silver under the ground and over that a building is constructed, which cannot be described and understood...and we have seen that people pass their hands over the tomb, place their eyes over it, throw themselves over the grave and rub the cloth present over the grave on their head and face and crowd and circle it. They supplicate in that condition and lament and through that seek blessings of that holy grave, show humiliation in such a way that it would scorch the heart of man and split rocks. The matter is greater than this and seeing it is more terrible. May Almighty Allah make us benefit from the blessings of this noble place of burial. I don’t think that there is a more majestic building in the world than this. May Almighty Allah purify the part of body placed there.”

Shabrawi Shaykh Abdullah Shafei (d. 1172 A.H.) in his book, *Al-Ittihaf bi Hubbil Ashraf*⁴ has dedicated a separate chapter on this and its Ziyarat and some of its miracle cures, and has mentioned the practice of visiting that place on Tuesdays. He writes:

“Blessings are witnessed at this tomb, and the benefits that reach visitors are not concealed from anyone and numerous testimonies exist for the propriety of these blessings and miracles; and acts will be rewarded on the basis of intention.”

¹ Ref: *Rihla*, Ibne Jubair, 229 [Pg. 251].

² Tareekh Baghdadi, 1:163.

³ *Rihla*, Ibne Jubair, Pg 19.

⁴ *Al-Ittihaf bi Hubbil Ashraf*, 25-40 [Pg. 75-110].

Hamzawi Adawi (d. 1303 A.H.) writes in *Mashariqul Anwaar*,¹ after a long discourse regarding the holy tomb of Imam Husain (a.s.):

“Know that this tomb is deserving that it should be visited often and one should seek divine proximity through it; and what we sought from this Imam during his lifetime, we ask from him now, as he is relief with regard to hardships and through his Ziyarat, detestable things are destroyed and every heart, which is under the veil, reaches Almighty Allah through his light and mediation. May Allah help us through the ocean of his help and through his proximity and kissing his tomb.”

Regarding this, there are so many statements that if they are compiled, they would go out to constitute a comprehensive book. Shaykh Abdul Fattah bin Abu Bakr, famous as Rassan Shafei has written an exclusive treatise on this subject, entitled: *Nurul Ainfee Madfan Raasal Husain*.

4. Abu Hanifah Noman bin Thabit, leader of Hanafites (d. 150 A.H.); his grave in Azamiya Baghdad is a famous place of visitation.²

5. Malik bin Anas, leader of Malikis (d. 17 A.H.): his grave is present in Baqi in holy Medina. Ibne Jubair in his *Rihla*³ has written that:

“A small shrine, a little building is constructed over it. Islamic jurists consider his Ziyarat to be among the etiquette of Ziyarat of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).”

6. Imam Tahir, Moosa bin Ja’far (a.s.), who is buried in Kazimiyyah and who was martyred in 83 A.H.: In his *Tarikh*,⁴ Khatib Baghdadi has narrated from Ahmad bin Ja’far bin Hamadan Qati-e that:

“It is narrated from Hasan bin Ibrahim Abu Ali Khallal, leader of Hanbalis, during his time I heard him say: When something distresses me, I visit the grave of Moosa Ibne Ja’far and through him, seek divine assistance and whatever I want, becomes easy.”

7. Imam Ali Reza (a.s.): Abul Hasan Muhammad bin Muammal says:

“We set out with the leader of Ahle Hadees, Abu Bakr bin Khuzaimah and his equal, Abu Ali Thaqafi and a number of teachers for the Ziyarat of Imam Ali bin Moosa Reza (a.s.) in Tus. The respect accorded by Ibne Khuzaima to this shrine astounded all of us.”⁵

8. Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Idris Shafei; leader of Shafeites (d. 204 A.H.): He is buried in a small cemetery at the Muqattam hills near Cairo; and it is visited by people.⁶ Jazari says in *Tabaqatul Qurra*:⁷

¹ *Mashariqul Anwaar*, 92 [1/197].

² *Wafayatul Ayan*, 2:297 [5/414, No. 765].

³ *Rihla*, Ibne Jubair, 153 [Pg. 173].

⁴ *Tareekh Baghdadi*, 1:120.

⁵ *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 7:388 [7/339].

⁶ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 2:30 [4/165, No. 558].

⁷ *Tabaqatul Qurra*, 2:97.

Supplications are accepted at his grave and when I performed his Ziyarat, I said:

“I performed Ziyarat of Imam Shafei, as this act was beneficial to me; so that I may receive his intercession; and what an affectionate noble he is.”

9. Ahmad bin Hanbal, leader of Hanbalis (d. 241 A.H.). His tomb is clear and famous. It is visited by people and blessings are sought from it.¹

Conclusion regarding visiting of tombs

This was a sample of what was customary among Muslims since the past ages and from the time of companions and companions of companions regarding Ziyarat of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and tombs of Imams, saints, scholars and holy personalities and undertaking journeys for their Ziyarat; and seeking their mediation and considering them as our intercessors.

Among these visitors were senior scholars and leaders, each of whose schools are followed in Muslims. In addition to that those, who have quoted these statements, are scholars and senior members of community, who have approved these acts, since they have narrated them by way of excellence of the owners of graves and tombs; on the basis of this, regarding this there is consensus among the Muslims sects through the ages.

If you, dear reader, have paid attention to what we discussed above, is there any value of the utterances of Ibne Taymiyyah and those of his group, like Qaseemi?

أُولَئِكَ الَّذِينَ طَبَعَ اللَّهُ عَلَى قُلُوبِهِمْ وَاتَّبَعُوا أَهْوَاءَهُمْ ^④

“These are they upon whose hearts Allah has set a seal and they follow their low desires.”²

In *Sara*,³ Qaseemi has quoted the following verse of Allamah Amin:

“There is no freshness (it is not amazing) that supplication should rise up to God at that place and not rise up from other than that place.”

Then he writes:

“This statement in view of all Muslims with all differences of faith and customs, is a source of apostasy and clear disbelief. I seek refuge of God from divine discouragement and degradation.”

He considers miracle cure and acceptance of supplications at the tomb of Imam Husain (a.s.) to be a pestilence of Shia.

كَبُرَتْ كَلِمَةً تَخْرُجُ مِنْ أَفْوَاهِهِمْ إِنْ يَقُولُونَ إِلَّا كَذِبًا ^⑤

“A grievous word it is that comes out of their mouths; they

¹ Mukhtasar Tabaqatul Hanabila, 11 [Pg. 14].

² Surah Muhammad 47:16

³ *As-Sara*, 2:648.

speak nothing but a lie.”¹

7. A close look at the tradition

The fuss regarding Shia traditions by those, who issue statements without thinking² is in excess. Some said that these traditions, are false writings attributed to the hidden Imam and some said that they are false statements fabricated in the names of Imam Muhammad Baqir and Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.).³

Neither the first group fears consequences of false rumor nor the second group is fearful of being exposed. At the end, these people emerge as liars, who raised their heads in arrogance, severely denying these traditions, creating mischief and issuing strange statements.

Abdullah Qaseemi has written in *Saraa*:⁴

“In fact, there are numerous liars among Shia tradition narrators and this is due to greed for material wealth and proximity to its folks; or due to enmity to tradition and Sunnah and malice to its folks. But Ahle Sunnat scholars have mentioned the best reason...and among narrators of traditions from Ahle Sunnat there is no one, who is blamed for fabrication and lying for the sake of material greed and helping lusts and invalids beliefs.

Yes, among them there are people, who do not have a good memory or are forgetful or are misunderstood and misinterpreted, but biographers have mentioned all these people.”

Reply

The researcher will realize that these claims are hollow and there is no iota of truth in them, and that majority of writers, who are given contract, write falsehoods and allegations. And the criterion of politics is lying and inverting facts, and many claims expressed about principles, views and beliefs, are illogical statements and useless heresies, surrounded by false and deceptive statements. There are people all over the world, whose needs are not fulfilled, except by framing lies, fabricating traditions and deceiving simple people, dragging them to paths of darkness and injustice.

If there was no warning of Allah, the Mighty and the High to the people that:

مَا يَلْفِظُ مِنْ قَوْلٍ إِلَّا لَدَيْهِ رَقِيبٌ عَتِيدٌ^⑤

“He utters not a word but there is by him a watcher at hand.”⁵

¹ Surah Kahf 18:5

² Arabic proverb implies one who does not ponder on his/her statement and speaks up without considering whether it is right or wrong.

³ The researcher will come across this point in numerous Ahle Sunnat books of the ancient and modern age.

⁴ *As-Sara*, 1:85.

⁵ Surah Qaf 50:18

And if warnings revealed in the Book of Allah regarding every liar, who makes allegations against woman, had not been there, none of these liars could have said more than what they uttered or done what they did not do!

Each one of them is a greater liar than Kharafa and Hujina¹.

Now, I want to inform you about the fact of the matter and reveal the secret of this man about Ahle Sunnat narrators of traditions. He said:

“Among them there is no one, who may be accused of fabricating and falsehood.”

Therefore, I present some people, who are identified as fabricators and liars, and some fabrications, which were resorted to for proximity to people or following base desires or invalid beliefs are fabricated, so that you may yourself see what their hands have wrought by making allegations against the sanctity of Prophet and his Sunnah.

In this way, the matter would become clear for you and it may be final statement of this discourse.

Series of liars and fabricators of traditional reports

In *Al-Ghadeer*, Allamah Amini (r.a.)² has mentioned 702 persons, who are well known for falsehood and fabrication of reports, some of them are as follows:

1. Aban bin Firoz, Abu Ayyash, freed slave of Abdul Qays, Abu Ismail Basri (d. 138 A.H.).

Shoba has said [regarding him]: “It is better for a person to commit fornication than narrate a tradition from Aban. In the same way, he said: I prefer drinking the urine of my donkey than to narrate reports from Aban. Perhaps Aban has narrated more than 1500 traditions more than Anas, most of which are baseless.”³

2. Ibrahim bin Hadba, Abu Hadba Basri.

He was a liar and a malicious person and he narrated nonsensical matters; he fabricated reports and attributed them to Anas. He was a dancer in Basra and he was called to dance in marriage parties. He was also imbibed liquor. He lived till the year 200 A.H.⁴

3. Ahmad bin Hasan bin Aban Misri. He was among the senior teachers of Tibrani. He was a liar, who attributed false traditions to trustworthy persons.⁵

4. Ahmad bin Khalil Naufali Qumasi (d. 310 A.H.). He was a liar and he

¹ A man from Banu Azra or Jahina, whom jinns had kidnapped and he returned to his people after a long time and narrated many things from them by which he amazed people and from this aspect they falsified him and it became a proverb.

² Ref: *Al-Ghadeer*, 4/301-446.

³ *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 1:99 [1/86].

⁴ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 6:201; *Mizanul Etedal*, [1/71, No. 242].

⁵ *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:41 [1/89, No. 330]; *Tadkiratul Mauzuuat*, 65 and 108 [Pg. 36 and 76].

narrated reports from persons, who never existed.¹

5. Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Sult bin Mughallis, Abu Abbas Hammani (d. 302 or 308 A.H.).

He was a fabricator of traditions and there was no one as shameful as him among the liars. He fabricated numerous false traditions in favor of Abu Hanifah, all of whom are false. In the same way, he attributed false traditions to trustworthy persons.²

6. Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Amr, Abu Bashar Kindi Maruzi, resident of Baghdad (d. 323 A.H.). He was a jurist, who excelled in Sunnah and in refutation of the folks of heresy. In the same way, he was Hafiz of Quran and possessed a nice voice, but he narrated false traditions from his father, grandfather and others. In the same way, he has issued false traditions and attributed them to trustworthy persons. He left behind numerous fabricated copies.³ Ibne Habban says about him:⁴

He fabricated text and mixed up the authorities, therefore it is necessary to avoid him. He probably attributed more than ten thousand traditions to reliable persons and I have recorded three thousand traditions from them and I have no doubt that he has inverted them.

It is mentioned in *Shazaratuz Zahab*:⁵

“In spite of the fact that he was a tradition scholar, a point of reference on Sunnah and refuter of heresy, he is regarded as a fabricator of traditions and a liar.”

7. Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Ghalib Bahili, Abu Abdullah (d. 257 A.H.).

He was the slave of Khalil and an important religious personality of Baghdad. He was a liar and a fabricator of traditions.

Hafiz Ibne Adi says regarding him:⁶

“I heard from Abu Abdullah Nahawandi in Harran in gathering of Abu Aruba that: I asked the slave of Khalil: What is this tradition you narrate? He replied: I fabricated it so that through it I may soften the hearts of people.”

Allamah Amini says: It is strange for a man to have such conduct and behavior, that due to his death, markets of Medina were closed and his last remains were transferred to Basra and he was buried there and a dome was constructed on his grave according to *Tarikh Baghdad* and *Al-Muntazam* of Ibne Jauzi.⁷

¹ Lesaanul Mizan, 1:167 [1/177, 540]; Al-Jirah wa Tadeel, [2/50].

² *Al-Muntazim*, 6:157 [13/195, No. 2167]; *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:66 [1/140, No. 555].

³ Tareekh Baghdad, 5:74.

⁴ *Kitabul Majruheen*, [1/56], in which instead of Ibne Amr, the name of his grandfather is mentioned as Musib.

⁵ Shazaratuz Zahab, 2:298.

⁶ Al-Kamil fee Zoafa Rijal, [1/195, No. 38].

⁷ Tareekh Baghdad, 5:79; Al-Muntazam, 5:95 [12/265, No. 1806].

8. Asad bin Amr Abu Manzar Bajali Qaazi – associate of Abu Hanifah (d. 190 A.H.).

He was a liar and a worthless fellow and he arranged traditions on the basis of Abu Hanifah's religion. For the Ahle Sunnat, he is same as the wind.¹

9. Ismail bin Yahya Teemi, grandson of Abu Bakr Ibne Abi Qahafa.

He was a liar and it is not allowed to narrate traditional reports from him. He was a member of fabricators, who fabricated traditions and most of his reports are absolutely invalid. He forged traditional reports and attributed them to Malik, Thawri and others, he narrated reports from reliable persons, which others have narrated from him.²

10. Husain bin Hamid bin Rafi Kufi Khazzar (d. 282 A.H.). He, his father and his grandfather, were all liars (liar son of liar son of liar).³

11. Hammad bin Abi Hanifah, leader of Hanafis, Noman bin Thabit Kufi.

Jarir has considered him a liar and it is narrated that he said to Qutaibah: Tell Hammad: "What concern do you have with traditions? Indeed, you have a habit of disputing and talking nonsense."⁴

12. Sulaiman bin Dawood Basri, Abu Ayyub, well known as Shaaz Kufi (d. 234 A.H.).

He was a Hafiz scholar of traditions, who was very malicious and an absolute liar. He fabricated traditions extempore. It is said that he used to deal in liquor and was an unreliable person.⁵

13. Ali bin Jahm bin Badr Saami Khorasani, who later settled in Baghdad and was killed in 249 A.H.

He was the greatest liar of the world and was well known enemy of Ali (Nasibi). He fabricated numerous traditions against Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and Ahle Bayt (a.s.). It is said: He cursed his father as he had named him Ali.

Allamah Amini says: This is the gist of his account. Now, pay attention to the statements of Ibne Kathir in his *Tarikh*:⁶

"He [Ali bin Jahm] is a famous poet, he was religious and a reliable person. Also, he was inimical to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.)."

As if his oppression towards Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) has made him a religious person in view of Ibne Kathir. This is the level of Ibne Kathir's perception. The return of all is to Almighty Allah. They would be answerable to

¹ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 7:17; *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:96 [1/206, No. 814]; *Lesaanul Mizan*, 1:384 [1/427, No. 1208].

² *Tareekh Baghdad*, 6:249; *Asniul Mataalib*: 209 [Pg. 424, H. 1370]; *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:117 [1/253, No. 965].

³ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 8:38; *Mizanul Etedal*, 2:28 [1/533, No. 1993].

⁴ *Lesaanul Mizan*, 2:346 [2/421, No. 2929].

⁵ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 9:47; *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:414 [2/205, No. 3451].

⁶ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 11:4 [11/8, Events of 249 A.H.].

divine justice.

14. Umar bin Sobih Khorasani¹

He was an excessive liar and he fabricated traditions. He had no peer in the world in heresy and lying.²

15. Amr bin Khaleef Abu Salih Khanawi.³

Ibne Habban says regarding him:⁴

“He fabricated traditions. Among the false traditions that he has attributed to Ibne Abbas is that: The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: They admitted me in Paradise, and I saw a wolf over there. I asked: Has the wolf entered Paradise? He replied: Yes, because I ate the son of an orderly. Ibne Abbas continued: This wolf had eaten the son of an orderly and reached that place; if he had devoured the orderly, his position would have been the highest heavens.”

Allamah Amini says: If only Ibne Abbas had clarified that if this wolf had eaten a commander, what his position would have been?⁵

16. Awana bin Hakam Kufi (d. 158 A.H.). He was Uthmani and he fabricated traditions for Bani Umayyah.⁶

17. Nuh bin Abi Maryam, Yazid Abu Asma (d. 173 A.H.). He was an excessive liar, who fabricated traditions just as Moalla bin Hilal. He fabricated a lengthy tradition on the excellence of Quran.

Hakeem says regarding him: “He fabricated traditions on excellence of Quran, and traditions on excellence of reciting chapters of Quran, which number 114; are all fabricated.”⁷

إِنَّهُوَلَا إِمْتَهَنَّ مَا هُمْ فِيهِ وَلَيُطْلَعُنَّ إِنَّمَا كَانُوا يَعْمَلُونَ

“(As to) these, surely that about which they are shall be brought to naught and that which they do is vain.”⁸

Note

This was a minuscule sample from the ocean of such dishonest Ahle Sunnat fabricators and perhaps the reader would regard them as excess, unaware of the fact that many Ahle Sunnat think that fabricating traditions and attributing falsehood to Prophet, his companions and companions of companions is not

¹ In *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb* and in some other books, the name of his father is mentioned Sobah.

² *Mizanul Etedal*, 2:262 [3/206, No. 6147]; *Tadkiratul Mauzuuat*, 77 [Pg. 54].

³ Apparently his name is Hatawi and not Khanawi and Ibne Hibban and Ibne Adi in *Al-Kamil fee Zoafa Rijaal*, 5/153 No. 1318; Ibne Jauzi in *Kitabul Zoafa wal Matrukeen*, 2/225 have mentioned in this way only.

⁴ *Kitabul Majruheen*, [2/80].

⁵ *Tadkiratul Mauzuuat*, 46 [Pg. 33]; *Mizanul Etedal*, 2:287 [3/258, No. 6362].

⁶ *Lesaanul Mizan*, 4:386 [4/446, No. 6375].

⁷ *Mizanul Etedal*, 3:187 [4/279, No. 9143]; *Asniul Mataalib*: 20 & 110 [Pg. 27 & 213, H. 56 & 675].

⁸ Surah Araaf 7:139

against piety and general honesty, on the contrary, fabricating traditions is a sign of the righteous and through it, they sought divine proximity. That is why Yahya bin Saeed Qattan says:

“I have not seen religious persons, more lying in something like traditions.”¹
Qurtubi writes in *Tadhkar*.²

“We should not pay attention to false traditions, which fabricators have fabricated regarding recitation of chapters of Quran and excellence of acts. How numerous are persons, who fabricated traditions thinking that they were seeking divine proximity through it; and in this way motivated people to perform religious acts.”

As if lies and allegations are not evil things and have no defect and are not opposed to human excellence and do not put a question mark on the honesty of a person.

There was Harb bin Maimoon, who was a pious jurist; at the same time he was the greatest liar of all times.

And there was Ibne Haitham Taymi, who spent most nights in prayer and in the morning sat down and issued false statements.

There was Hafiz Abdul Mughis Hanbali, who is described as an honest, trustworthy, religious, truthful, expert of jurisprudence, follower of Sunnah: and at the same time he has written a book on excellence of Yazid bin Muawiyah on the basis of fabricated traditions.

There was Abu Amr; also a pious man, who wrote a book on the excellence of Muawiyah bin Abu Sufyan based on fabricated traditions.

From this aspect, numerous liars can be mentioned, who were leader of people or famous Hafiz or jurists or teachers of traditions or expert orators and some of them, only to promote one way of thinking, or according respect to one leader or supporting one religion, intentionally spoke falsehood and it is for this reason that fabricated traditions came into being in excess. That is why we find so many contradictions in praises and condemnations.

Some people fabricated traditions in excellence of Abu Hanifah and attributed them to Prophet. Like the report:

“After me a man would come, whose name is Noman bin Thabit and his agnomen is Abu Hanifah. The religion of God and my Sunnah would be revived through him.”³

And the report: “There is a man in my Ummah having the name Noman, and agnomen of Abu Hanifah; he is the lamp of guidance of my Ummah; he is the

¹ Preface to *Saheeh Muslim*, [1/42]; *Tareekh Baghdad*, 2:98 [No. 493].

² Al-Tadhkar, 155.

³ Khateeb Baghdaadi has mentioned this tradition in his *Tareekh Baghdaadi*, 2:289 [No. 768] through the chains of Muhammad bin Yazid Mustamali, a liar and fabricator; then he says that this tradition is fabricated and invalid.

lamp of my Ummah.”¹

And the report: “All prophets boast over me and I boast over Abu Hanifah. He is a pious man near my Lord, as if he is a mountain of knowledge and a prophet from Bani Israel prophets. Thus, one who likes him has liked me and one, who enrages him, has enraged me.”

Ibne Jauzi has said regarding this report: “It is fabricated.”

And Ajluni says: “This report is not correct, though it has many chains of narrators.”²

Similarly: “Adam boasted upon me and I boasted over a man from my Ummah, whose name is Noman and whose agnomen is Abu Hanifah. He is the lamp of guidance of my Ummah.”

Ajluni has considered this report fabricated.³

Similarly the report: “If persons like Abu Hanifah had existed in the nations of Moosa and Isa, they would not have become Jews and Christians.”⁴

In the same way is the report of Abul Bakhtari Kazzab:

“Abu Hanifah came to Ja’far bin Muhammad Sadiq (a.s.) and when Ja’far looked at him, he said: I look at you and see that you would revive the Sunnah of my grandfather after it has become old and you are the refuge of every distressed one. Those, who are confused and backward find the path through you and you guide them to the clear path. May divine assistance be in your lot, so that the mystics may traverse the path through you.”

The extremism of some Hanafites reached such an extent that they thought that he was more knowledgeable than the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

Ali bin Jarir says: I resided in Kufa. One day I traveled to Basra and Abdullah bin Mubarak was present there. He asked: “What is the condition of people in your town?”

I replied: “I left some people in Kufa, who think that Abu Hanifah is more knowledgeable than Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).”

He said: “They have apostatized.”⁵

I said: “They have made you as their leader in apostasy.”

Abdullah wept so much that his beard became wet. It implies that he used to narrate traditions from Abu Hanifah.⁶

It is narrated from Fudhail bin Ayaz: “The hearts of these people have become mixed with Abu Hanifah and they have exaggerated so much about him

¹ Khateeb Baghdadi has mentioned this tradition in his *Tareekh Baghdadi*, 13:335 and then he says that this tradition is fabricated and invalid.

² Kashful Khafa, 1:33.

³ Kashful Khafa, 1:33.

⁴ Ajluni has considered this tradition to be fabricated: *Kashful Khafa*, 1:33.

⁵ I have added this statement from the original.

⁶ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 13:441.

that they do not regard anyone more knowledgeable than him.”¹

As opposed to this group, there were some, who condemned Abu Hanifah in every way and pointed out his defects and they also fabricated traditions against him. We cannot mention more than what we have accessed. How can we mention all of them? But we shall mentioned some of them.

Abde Barr says:² “Among those condemned by Abu Hanifah is Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Ismail Bukhari, author of *Saheeh*. In his book, under the discussion of weak and invalid traditions: Nuaim has narrated from Fuzari: I was with Sufyan bin Uyyana when they brought reports of the death of Abu Hanifah. Sufyan said: May God curse him, as he has destroyed Islam in every way and no child was born in Islam more full of mischief than him.”

Ibne Jarud says: “Most traditions of Noman bin Thabit, Abu Hanifah were imaginary and there is dispute in his being a Muslim.”

A similar statement is narrated from Malik regarding Abu Hanifah:

“He is the worst child born in Islam and if he had attacked this Ummah with a sword, it would have been easier, and his harm would have been lesser.”

It is narrated from Yusuf bin Athbat:

“Abu Hanifah rejected four thousand or more traditions from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)”

It is narrated from Malik:

“No child more harmful than Abu Hanifah was born among Muslims.”

It is narrated from Abdur Rahman bin Mahdi that:

“After the mischief of Dajjal, I don’t know of any mischief greater than the mischief of Abu Hanifah.”

It is narrated from Abdullah bin Idris:

“Abu Hanifah was deviated and he deviated others.”

It is narrated from Ibne Abi Shaibah that he said regarding Abu Hanifah:

“I regard him a Jew.”

It is narrated from Ahmad bin Hanbal:

“Abu Hanifah issued false statements and traditional reports cannot be narrated from the followers of Abu Hanifah.”

As opposed to this group, there is another group of scholars who attribute the following report to the Prophet:

“A scholar of Quraish would fill up the layers of the earth with wisdom.”

They believe that this report implies Muhammad bin Idris Imam of the

¹ *Hilyatul Awliya*, Abu Nuaim 5:358.

² In Al-Intiqaa fee Fazaael Thalathatul Aimmatul Fuqha: Malik, Shafei wa Abu Hanifah, Pg. 149.

Shafeis.¹

Muzni thinks that: He saw the Prophet in dream and asked him about Shafei: He said: "One, who my love and Sunnah, he should refer to Muhammad bin Idris Shafei Mutallabi, because he is from me and I am from him."²

Ahmad bin Nasr said:

"I saw the Prophet in dream and asked: O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), whom do you order us to follow from your Ummah in this time, so that we can follow him be confident of his statement; and that we may adopt his faith? He replied: Muhammad bin Idris Shafei; as he is from me and Almighty Allah is pleased with him, his followers and those who follow his religion till Judgment Day. I asked: Who else can I refer to? He replied: Ahmad bin Hanbal, what a nice jurist he is with piety and abstemiousness."³

Malikis have also expressed the same views: For example, they have attributed this tradition to Prophet:

"It is near that people would drive the camels fast and bear discomforts of journeys,⁴ but will not find anyone wiser than the scholar of Medina."⁵

They think that this report implies Malik bin Anas. As if Medina was not the center of Islam and there was no other scholar before and after Malik. As if Ahle Bayt (a.s.) were not present, whom Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) mentioned as equals of Quran and as his successors, and said:

"I leave among you two heavy things: Book of Allah and my progeny, my Ahle Bayt."

As if they have not inherited the knowledge of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). As if Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) was not the sole point of reference for knowledge during his lifetime. As if Malik was not the student of His Eminence.

It goes to such an extent that some⁶ claim consensus that the implication of the above mentioned fabricated traditional report is Malik bin Anas, ignoring the statement of Muhammad bin Abdur Rahman: "Ahmad is superior to Malik bin Anas."⁷

And ignorant of the statement of the leader of Hanbalis:

¹ Ibne Hoot, *Asniul Mataalib*, 14 [Pg. 37, H. 31] has mentioned that this report is not authentic.

² Tareekh Baghdad, 2:69.

³ *Tareekh Medina Damishq*, 2:48 [5/341, No. 136].

⁴ Arabic proverb implies bearing hardships of journeys as in the past people usually traveled on camels and they used to drive the camels hitting on their legs or shoulders. It is mentioned in saying no. 82 of *Nahjul Balaghah*: I want to teach you five of those things, which deserve your greatest anxiety to acquire them...

⁵ Ibne Hoot has considered this tradition fabricated in *Asniul Mataalib*, 14 [Pg. 737, H. 31] and he writes: I have heard it from the followers of Malik, but I have not seen it anywhere else.

⁶ It implies the author of *Deebajul Mazhab* [Ibrahim bin Ali bin Farhun Maliki (d. 799 A.H.)].

⁷ Tareekh Baghdad, 2:298.

“Ibne Abi Zoab is superior to Malik Ibne Anas.”¹

And the statement of Atiyya bin Asbat:

“If the earth is filled by people like Malik, the wisdom of Abu Hanifah has superiority over them.”²

And from the statement of Shafei and Ibne Bukair:

“Laith bin Saeed Fahmi – elder of Egypt – is more learned than Malik.”³

The Malikis have narrated a dream about their leader and said that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) praised Malik in dream. Some of these baseless dreams are mentioned in *Hilyatul Awliya*⁴ and other books.

Hanbalis also, for propagation of their school and their leader, exceed all limits of exaggeration and forged unbounded falsehoods to such an extent that every exaggeration is less before that [and falls short of it] some of which are as follows:

Madini says: “Almighty Allah bestowed honor to this religion through two persons and there is no third one: Abu Bakr Siddiq in the wars of apostates⁵ and Ahmad bin Hanbal in times of hardships⁽⁶⁾⁽⁷⁾ and it is said that after Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), no one established Islam as much as Ahmad bin Hanbal.”

Maimooni says: I said to Madini: “O Abul Hasan, Abu Bakr was not alone whereas Ahmad did not have any associates.”⁸

In *Al-Muntazam*,⁹ Ibne Jauzi has mentioned statements regarding prejudice of Abu Bakr Khatib Baghdaadi, author of *Tarikh Baghdaad* towards the school of Ahmad and his followers, to such an extent that he has accused him of shamelessness and lack of religion.

Muhammad bin Muhammad Abu Muzaffar Barwi (d. 567 A.H.) expressed prejudice against Hanbalis and said:

“If I had been able, I would have applied Jizya on Hanbalis.’ Due to this the Hanbalis assassinated him through poison along with his wife and young son.”¹⁰

Yes, among them were also those, who did not follow their base desires and

¹ Tareekh Baghdaad, 2:298.

² Manaqib Abu Hanifah, Shaykh Ali Qari, published with: Jawahirul Maziya fee Tabaqatul Hanafiyah, Pg 461.

³ *Khulasa Al-Khazraji*, 275 [2/371, No. 6000]; *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, 1:208 [1/224, No. 210].

⁴ *Hilyatul Awliya*, 6:317.

⁵ Apparently it concerns the incident of Khalid bin Walid and Malik bin Nuwairah, who in view of some had turned apostate and refused to pay Zakat.

⁶ These two traditions are concealed for Ibne Madini, which scholars have regarded as authentic although it is falsehood on the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

⁷ Apparently it implies the fact that Ahmad supported belief that Quran is uncreated; he defended this belief and spent his life upon this; but later some Caliphs accepted his beliefs...

⁸ Tareekh Baghdaad, 4:418.

⁹ *Al-Muntazam*, 8:267 [18/178, No. 4269].

¹⁰ *Al-Muntazam*, 10:239 [18/198, No. 4292]; and refer . *Shazaratuz Zahab*, [6/370]; *Al-Abar*, [2/52].

did not refrain from speaking the truth, like Firozabadi, author of *Qamus*; and Ajluni, Firozabadi at the conclusion of his book, *Safarus Saada*¹ and Ajluni in *Kashful Khifa*² have said regarding Abu Hanifah and Shafei:

“No authentic narration is found in support of their slander; whatever is mentioned is fabricated and false.”

Ibne Darwish Hoot says in *Asniul Matalib*:³

“No authentic or weak text (*Nass*) is recorded about any of the leaders of Ahle Sunnat.”

List of fabricated traditions

Every researcher can find a list of what is mentioned regarding liars, through which it is possible to gather fabricated and distorted traditions with which books are teeming. But to identify most of them is not possible, what to say about identifying all of them, because no registers exist about what the fabricators have recorded, and whatever is found regarding small group from these numerous people is from lost history, which is mentioned coincidentally and without conscious intention.

After mention of the list of some of these narrators, Allamah says:

“The least number of traditions fabricated by these people is mentioned as 408684.”

It is clear to the researcher that this is the least figure, because fabricators were much more prolific and for most of them – if we don’t say of all of them – have writings containing extensive falsehoods, which exceed all limits and history has recorded only a few of them and that also in the biographies of some of the writers of these false books.

The evidence, which scholars of traditions have mentioned in their collections is only a minuscule part of available traditions; for example in *Saheeh Bukhari* 2761 traditions are mentioned, without repetition, which he selected from 600000 traditions.⁴

In *Saheeh Muslim* there are 6000 traditions, without repetition, selected from 300000 traditions.⁵

Difficulty of reliable and reliability

This was the story of unreliable persons; but as for those, who were known as reliable, there is another problem; to solve which is impossible, and which puts

¹ *Safarus Saada*, [2/216].

² *Kashful Khifa*, 2:420.

³ *Asniul Mataalib*, 14 [37, H. 31].

⁴ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 2:8 [No. 424]; *Irshadus Sari*, 1:28 [1/50]; *Sifatus Safwa*, 4:143 [4/169, No. 712].

⁵ *Al-Muntazim*, Ibne Jauzi, 5:32 [12/171, No. 1667]; *Tabaqatul Huffaz*, Zahabi, 2:151 & 157 [2/589, No. 613]; *Sharh Saheeh Muslim*, Nawawi, 1:32 [1/21].

the reader into bewilderment, because no broad-minded educated person understands what trustworthy means? And what quality it is? What is intended by it? What is it present with? And which quality is opposed to it? So, remain with me so that we read collective history, in which trustworthiness is clarified:

1. Ziyad bin Abih, the great sinner and criminal. Khalifah bin Khayyat says regarding him:

“He is regarded among the abstemious persons and Ahmad bin Salih says: ‘He was in no way accused of lying.’”¹

2. Umar bin Saad bin Abi Waqqas, killer of the chief of martyrs:² Ajali says regarding him: “He is trustworthy.”³

3. Imran bin Hattan: leader of Khwarij and one, who composed the famous couplets in praise of Ibne Muljim Muradi:

“Remember the strike from the man of piety; and it was not, but to achieve divine pleasure. I remember him all the time and know that in view of Almighty Allah, the pan of his balance will be the heaviest of all.”⁴

Ajali considers him reliable⁵ and Bukhari has narrated traditions from him in his *Saheeh*.

Huraith bin Uthman; he prayed in the Masjid every day and did not leave his place, without reciting curse on Ali (a.s.) seventy times.

Ismail Ibne Ayyash says:

I accompanied Huraith on way from Egypt to Mecca. He began to curse Ali (a.s.) and said: “What people narrate that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to Ali (a.s.): You are to me as Harun was to Moosa, is correct, but the hearer made a mistake in hearing it.”

“Then what is correct?” I asked.

He replied: “It was: You are to me as Qarun was to Moosa.”

I asked: “From whom do you narrate this?”

He replied: “I heard Walid bin Abdul Malik state that from the pulpit.”⁶

Bukhari, Abu Dawood, Tirmizi and others have argued through his traditions.

It is mentioned in *Riyazun Nazara*⁷ that Huraith is reliable, but he was inimical to Ali (a.s.), may God be inimical to him.

¹ *Tareekh Medina Damishq*, 5:406-414 [19/162, No. 2309 and in *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 9/81].

² Imam Husain Ibne Ali (a.s.).

³ *Khulasa Khazraji*, 140 [2/270, No. 5165].

⁴ Ref: *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg 90-91.

⁵ *Tareekh Seqat*, [373, No. 1300].

⁶ *Tareekh Ibne Asakir*, 4:115 [12/336, No. 1254 and *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 6/278]; *Tareekh Khateeb*, 8:268 [No. 4365].

⁷ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:216 [3/169].

5. Hafiz Abdul Mugheeth Hanbali: He has written a book on the excellence of Yazid based on fabricated traditions and at the same time, he is described as pious, trustworthy, religious and truthful.¹

Yes, as Ibne Abi Hatim has said: “When Shoba heard the sound of Quran being recited in a melodious tune from the house of Minhal bin Amr Asadi, he never again narrated traditions from him.”²

Yes, Yazid bin Harun said: “Narrating traditions from Abu Yusuf is not lawful, because he used to invest the funds of orphans with other people and kept the profits for himself.”³

Yes, yes, Bukhari has omitted traditions from Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.). And Yahya bin Saeed has said regarding Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.): “I myself have negative feelings about him.” And he said: “He was not a liar.”⁴

Shafei,⁵ Ibne Moin, Ibne Abi Khaisama, Abu Hatim, Ibne Adi, Ibne Habban, Nasai and others regard him as reliable.

Yes, Abu Hatim bin Habban Busti says.⁶

“Ali bin Moosa Reza – Imame Tahir – has narrated strange things from his father; as if he has misunderstood them and talked of illogical things.”⁷

Yes, in *Mauzuaat*,⁸ Ibne Jauzi has considered the pure Imam, Hasan bin Ali bin Muhammad Askari as weak and has not regarded him reliable.

فَوَيْلٌ لَّهُمْ مِّمَّا كَتَبْتُ أَيْدِيهِمْ وَوَيْلٌ لَّهُمْ مِّمَّا يَكْسِبُونَ ﴿٤﴾

“Therefore woe to them for what their hands have written and woe to them for what they earn.”⁹

¹ *Seer Alamun Nubla*, 21/160; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 6:453, events of 583 A.H.

² *Al-Jirah wat Tadeel*, [8/357]; *Khulasa Khazraji*, 332 [3/59, No. 7223].

³ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 14:258.

⁴ *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 2:103 [2/88].

⁵ *Marifatul Rijal*, 1/110, No. 514; *Al-Jirah wat Tadeel*, 2/487; *Al-Kamil fee Zoafa Rijal*, 2/134, No. 334; *As-Seqat*, 6/131.

⁶ *Kitabul Majruheen*, [2/106].

⁷ *Ansabul Ashraf*, Balazari, [3/74]; *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 7:388 [7/338].

⁸ *Lesaanul Mizan*, 2:240 [2/298, No. 2531].

⁹ Surah Baqarah 2:79

False traditions attributed to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

It would be better to present here examples of false traditions, which these liars have fabricated in excellence of some individuals:

1. It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

“There is no tree in Paradise, but that it is inscribed on its leaf: There is no god, except Allah, Muhammad is the messenger of Allah, Abu Bakr is truthful, Umar is discriminator and Uthman is the owner of two lights.”

This tradition is from the fabrications of Ali bin Jamil Raqqi, which Tibrani has mentioned and said:¹

“This tradition is fabricated, Ali bin Jamil is a prolific forger of traditions.”

2. It is narrated from Anas, directly from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that:

“On the night of Meraj, I entered Paradise and saw an apple there, to which a Hourie was attached and she said: I am created for Uthman, who was killed unjustly.”

Dhahabi has mentioned this tradition in *Mizanul Etedal*² through the authorities of Abdullah bin Muhammad Adawi³ who was a forger of traditions

Then Dhahabi says: “This is a fabricated tradition.”

3. It is narrated from Jabir directly that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“God has made my companions excel over all people of the world, but chosen four persons over prophets: my companions: Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and Ali. They were made as the best of my companions and all my companions are good.”

This report is from the fabrications of Abdullah bin Salih, scribe of Laith.

Dhahabi says in *Mizanul Etedal*:

“Due to this report, Abdullah bin Salih was cast into a deep trouble.”

Nasai says: “This report is a forgery.”

4. It is narrated from Abdullah bin Umar without chain of narrators from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“Since Abu Bakr was born on that night, Almighty Allah looked at the Adn Paradise and said: I swear My might and honor, I will only allow those to enter you, who are affectionate to this newborn.”

¹ *Mojamul Kabeer*, Tibrani, [11/63, H. 11093].

² *Mizanul Etedal*, 2:20 [2/386, No. 4182].

³ Alawi is mentioned instead of Adawi in the original source.

Dhahabi says:¹ “This tradition is a forgery and it was fabricated by Ahmad bin Asma Nishapuri.”

Khatib Baghdadi has mentioned it in his *Tarikh*² and said: “This tradition is invalid and among its narrators are some persons, whose history is unknown.”

5. It is narrated from Abu Huraira directly from the Prophet that he said:

“There are eighty thousand angels in the sky of the world, who seek divine forgiveness for those, who are affectionate to Abu Bakr and Umar. In the second sky, there are eighty thousand angels, who curse those, who are inimical to Abu Bakr and Umar.”

This tradition is from the fabrications of Abu Saeed Hasan bin Ali Adawi Basri. Khatib has mentioned it in his *Tarikh Bagdad*³ and said:

“Adawi has falsely attributed this tradition to Kamil bin Talha.”

6. It is narrated from Anas that when the Prophet emerged from Thawr Cave, Abu Bakr held his stirrup.⁴ His Eminence glanced at him and said: “O Abu Bakr, shall I don’t give you a glad tiding.” He replied: “Yes, may my parents be sacrificed on you.” He said: “On Judgment Day, Almighty Allah would manifest Himself to all creatures in general; and for you in a special manner.”

This tradition is a forgery of Muhammad bin Abde Abu Bakr Tamimi Samarqandi. Khatib has said in his *Tarikh*:⁵

“As far as I know, this tradition is baseless in view of experts of traditions and Muhammad bin Abad has forged its chain of narrators as well as its text.

7. It is narrated from Anas that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) established brotherhood⁶ between Abu Bakr and Umar, and remarked: “You two are my viziers in the world and the hereafter.”

This tradition is from fabrications of Zakariya bin Duraid⁷ Kindi. Ibne Habban has mentioned it and said:⁸

“This tradition is a forgery and it was fabricated by Zakariya.”

8. It is directly narrated from Anas that Almighty Allah has a sword and as long as Uthman bin Affan is alive, that sword is sheathed and when Uthman is killed, that sword will come out of the sheath and will not be sheathed till Judgment Day.

¹ *Mizanul Etedal*, [1/119, No. 467].

² *Tareekh Bagdad*, 3:309.

³ *Tareekh Bagdad*, [7/383, No. 3910].

⁴ An allusion of servitude and companionship and absence of opposition and following his word and deed; he is said to have held his stirrup and walked in his footsteps.

⁵ *Tareekh Bagdad*, 2:388.

⁶ *Al-Layli Masmua*, 1/307.

⁷ The name of this man is mentioned in the same form in *Al-Layli Masmua* and in books, it is mentioned as Duwaid.

⁸ *Kitabul Majruheen*, [1/314].

Ibne Adi has mentioned this tradition and said¹:

“It is fabricated by Amr bin Faiz and his teacher Moosa bin Sayyar was also a fraud.”²

9. It is directly narrated from Abu Huraira that: “Three individuals are honest in the view of God: I, Jibreel and Muawiyah.”

Khatib, Nasai and Ibne Habban have said³: “This tradition is fabricated and invalid.”

10. It is directly narrated from Wathila that:

“Almighty Allah regarded Jibreel, me and Muawiyah trustworthy for revelation; and Muawiyah was on the verge of being appointed a prophet due to the intensity of his knowledge and being entrusted with the words of the Lord. Almighty Allah will forgive the sins of people and keep him secure from the accounting of Judgment Day. He taught His book to him and made him the guide and the guided and guided others through him.”

Ibne Asakir has narrated this tradition from a person (*Rajul*).⁴

Hakeem has said: “It is narrated about Ahmad bin Umar Damishqi – who was a scholar of traditions in Shaam – that he was asked about this tradition and he vehemently rejected it.”

Allamah Amini says: I think that dishonest traditionists wanted to scale down the rank of prophethood, and not to exalt the status of Muawiyah, because we know that there is a great distance between the rank of prophethood in which Muslims believe, and between an individual, who occupied the seat of Caliphate. We ask these people: What was the reason to attribute this exalted rank to him? Was his origin not the accursed tree mentioned by Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and Holy Quran?

Or the atrocities which he committed?

Or his apostatizing a few months, before the demise of Prophet?

Or fighting the Caliph of his time (Ali), although it was obligatory to have submitted to his commands; and the influential individuals had paid allegiance to him, and Muslims had accepted and approved his Caliphate?

Or great sins committed during his reign, like the killing of honest individuals like Hujr bin Adi Kindi and his companions, Amr bin Hamaq Khuzai and numerous other people; imprecating Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Imam Hasan and Imam Husain (a.s.). and some prominent believers in Qunut of prayers; stoking hatred for the Ahle Bayt (a.s.) of Prophet through false propaganda; encouraging tradition reporters to assassinate the character of Ahle Bayt (a.s.),

¹ Al-Kamil fee Zoafa Rijal, [5/148, No. 1312].

² *Al-Layli Masmua*, 1:64 [1/316].

³ Kitabul Majruheen, [1/146].

⁴ *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 25/6; In Layali Suyuti has mentioned the tradition with chains of narrators [1/419].

fabrication of traditions for extolling Umayyads, declaring Ziyad to be a son of Abu Sufyan in spite of a tradition proved authentic in view of all Muslims; that: “The child belongs to the bed on which it is born and the adulterer shall be lashed.” And taking allegiance for Yazid, the shedder of blood, imbiber of wine and imposing him on Muslim lands and this continued till he died?

Since when had Muawiyah acquired knowledge and awareness about Holy Quran in spite of the fact that he did not know even a single verse; like the verse:

يَأَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا أَطِيعُوا اللَّهَ وَأَطِيعُوا الرَّسُولَ وَأُولَئِكُمْ مُنْكَرٌ

“O you who believe! obey Allah and obey the Apostle and those in authority from among you...”¹

Was Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) not from the statement ‘those in authority’ according to every exegesis of the verse?

Also, the verse:

وَمَنْ يَقْتُلْ مُؤْمِنًا مُتَعَمِّدًا فَجَزَّ أَعْوَاهُ جَهَنَّمُ خَلَدًا فِيهَا

“And whoever kills a believer intentionally, his punishment is hell; he shall abide in it.”²

Or like the verse:

وَالَّذِينَ يُؤْذُنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَالْمُؤْمِنَاتِ بِغَيْرِ مَا أَكْتَسَبُوا فَقَدِ احْتَمَلُوا بُهْتَانًا
وَأَنَّمَا مُبِينًا³

“And those who speak evil things of the believing men and the believing women without their having earned (it), they are guilty indeed of a false accusation and a manifest sin.”³

As well as other numerous verses. Can one, who did not act upon even one of the verses and did not apply any of their laws, becomes trustee of Quran?

وَمَنْ يَتَعَدَّ حُدُودَ اللَّهِ فَقَدْ ظَلَمَ نَفْسَهُ

“And whoever goes beyond the limits of Allah, he indeed does injustice to his own soul.”⁴

وَمَنْ يَعْصِ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ وَيَتَعَدَّ حُدُودَهُ يُدْخَلُهُ نَارًا أَخَالِدًا فِيهَا وَلَهُ عَذَابٌ
مُّهِينٌ⁵

“And whoever disobeys Allah and His Apostle and goes beyond

¹ Surah Nisa 4:59

² Surah Nisa 4:93

³ Surah Ahzab 33:58

⁴ Surah Talaq 65:1

His limits, He will cause him to enter fire to abide in it, and he shall have an abasing chastisement.”¹

Was his excess of knowledge, which made almost qualified to be sent as a prophet, impelled him to harbor enmity to the purified progeny? Whether it was his knowledge, which urged him to commit serious crimes and practice wanton acts, which are so clear that history has recorded them for all to see? History has recorded for us in accurate details, the account of Muawiyah exterminating the followers of Imam Ali (a.s.) in Kufa and all the Islamic territories.

As for his repeated and continuous distress caused to the sincere followers of the holy progeny, whatever you say regarding that you would not have exaggerated, and no objection would be applicable to you and I will later describe the vile acts Muawiyah in detail.

Then we ask the reporters about the honesty of Muawiyah, through which he became the third person after Jibreel and Prophet and became to be considered among the trusted ones of God, whether his honesty is related to Quran, which he opposed? Or it is trustworthiness with regard to Sunnah, on which he did not act? Or trustworthiness regarding blood of Muslims, which he shed? Or trustworthiness in relation to Ahle Bayt (a.s.), whom he oppressed? Or it was to create peace and security in the nation, which he destroyed from the root? Or his truthfulness, which he gave up completely? Or falsehood, upon which he instigated others? Or believers, whose limbs he cut off? Or Islam that he destroyed? Or Islamic laws, which he distorted? Or the pulpits, which he polluted through cursing the saints of God? Or it is...?

Was it due to these crimes and their like that he should be almost qualified to be appointed as a prophet as the dishonest reporters have alleged? Kudos to such a prophethood to which he came near and whose burden, fellows like him would bear.

“Bent stature, white beard and profuse tears of Yahya

What happens if you don’t flirt in this condition.” (Poetic verse)

If the malevolent reporters did not bestow prophethood to the like of Muawiyah; this alone would have sufficed for recognizing his prophethood and excellence. The tradition is as follows:

“If rice had been an animal it would have been in the form of human being and if it had been human it would have been in form of a righteous person and if it had been a righteous person, it would have been in form of a prophet; and if it had been a prophet it would have been in form of a messenger; and if it had been a messenger it would have in my form.”²

11. It is narrated from Abu Huraira that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) came out leaning on Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). Abu Bakr and Umar went to welcome His

¹ Surah Nisa 4:14

² In *Kashaf* 2:160 [No. 2109], Sanani has considered the tradition to be a fake.

Eminence.

The Prophet asked: “O Ali, do you love these two?”

He replied: “Yes, O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)”

Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “Be affectionate to these two, so that you may enter Paradise.”

This tradition is a fabrication of Muhammad bin Abdullah Ashnani, as Dhahabi in *Mizanul Etedal*¹ has mentioned and remarked:

“The tradition is invalid, but its chains of narrators is correct.”

Ibne Jauzi has mentioned this tradition in his book of *Mauzuaat*.²

12. It is directly narrated from Ubayy bin Kaab that Jibrael said to the Prophet:

“If I sit with you as much as Nuh lived in his nation, I will not be able to narrate all the merits of Umar.”

Ibne Jauzi has mentioned this tradition in his book of *Mauzuaat*, which is a compilation of forged traditions.³

13. It is directly narrated from Abdullah that: “Abu Bakr is the crown of Islam, Umar is its dress and Uthman is its half crown and Ali is its fragrance.”

Dhahabi has mentioned this tradition in *Mizanul Etedal* and said: “This tradition is a fake.”⁴

14. It is directly narrated from Abu Huraira that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

“Almighty Allah created me from His effulgence, created Abu Bakr from my effulgence, Umar from the effulgence of Abu Bakr, Uthman from the effulgence of Umar; and Umar is the lamp of the folks of Paradise.”

Dhahabi has mentioned it in *Mizanul Etedal*, in the biography of Ahmad bin Yusuf Mabanji and said:

“This tradition is a fake.”⁵

15. It is narrated from Imam Ali (a.s.) that he said:

“The first ones to enter Paradise are Abu Bakr and Umar; and I and Muawiyah will stand for taking the account of deeds.”

Dhahabi has mentioned in the biography of Asbagh Shaibani.⁶

This is not a correct report and Ibne Jauzi has included it among nonsensical and weak traditional reports.

¹ *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:243 [1/524, No. 1954].

² *Mauzuaat*, [1/323].

³ *Mauzuaat*, [1/321].

⁴ *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:310 [1/661, No. 2545].

⁵ *Mizanul Etedal*, [1/166, No. 669].

⁶ *Mizanul Etedal*, [1/3271, No. 1015].

16. It is narrated in a chainless tradition:

“If I had not been sent as a prophet, you O Umar, would have been sent as one.”

Sanani says: “This is a fake tradition.”¹

“Whenever the Prophet became eager for Paradise, he kissed the white hair of Abu Bakr.”

Firozabadi at the conclusion of *Safarus Saada*² and Ajluni in *Kashful Khifa*³ have regarded this tradition to be among the most confirmed fabricated and invalid traditions, as is clear to every sane person.

18. It is narrated from Ibne Abbas in a chainless tradition that:

“Wherever I may be, I am with Umar and he is also present with me. Whoever is affectionate to him has been affectionate to me; and whoever is inimical to him is inimical to me.”

In *Mizanul Etedal*, Dhahabi has regarded it to be a fake.⁴

19. It is narrated from Ibne Abbas in a chainless tradition that:

“Abu Bakr with relation to me is like Harun in relation to Moosa (a.s.).”

This tradition is a fabrication of Ali bin Hasan Kalbi, whom Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari has mentioned and Dhahabi in *Mizanul Etedal* said.⁵

“This report is fake and Kalbi is accused of this falsehood.”

20. It is narrated from Anas that he said:

“When Abu Bakr was on his deathbed, I heard from Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) that he said: Four persons are wisest among the people: two ladies and two men: Safoora, daughter of Shuaib and Khadija, daughter of Khuwailad; and the Aziz of Egypt. Then he said: The second person is Abu Bakr. When his death approached he said to me: I have reached the conclusion that I should leave the Caliphate after me to Umar. I said: We will not approve if you leave to anyone else. He said: You have pleased me; by God, I am also pleased with you according to what Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said. What is that, I asked. He replied: I heard the Prophet say: There is a stage on the Siraat Bridge, which no one can pass, except without a permit of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). Then Ali said: Shall I not make you happy by reporting what I heard from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding myself and Umar? What is that, he asked. I replied: He said: O Ali, do not give one, who curses Abu Bakr and Umar, the permit; as those two are the leaders of the old folks of Paradise after the prophets. When Abu Bakr passed the Caliphate to Umar, Ali said to me: O Anas, I studied the divine will in the world and I was not able to approve, except what was issued from divine will and

¹ Kashful Khifa, 2:163.

² *Safarus Saada*, [2/211].

³ Kashful Khifa, 2:419.

⁴ Kashful Khifa, 2:158 [675, No. 5298].

⁵ *Mizanul Etedal*, 2:222 [3/122, No. 5816].

intention, lest objections be leveled against me. And I heard from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said: I am the last of prophets and you, O Ali, is the last of the successors.”

Khatib has mentioned this in history and noted:

“This tradition is fake and is a product of story-teller and was fabricated by Umar bin Wathil, or others made it up in his name. Allah knows best.¹

21. It is narrated in a chainless tradition from Ibne Masud that: There is no newborn, but that it has at its navel some dust from the time it is created; and when he reaches most undesirable old age he returns to that dust, and I, Abu Bakr, Umar are created from one dust and we shall be buried in that only.

Khatib has quoted this report in *Tareekh Baghdad* from the channel from Moosa bin Sahal from Ishaq bin Arzaq.² Dhahabi has quoted it in *Mizanul Etedal* in the account of Moosa and remarked:³ “It is an invalid report mentioned by an unknown individual for Moosa, who is also unheard of.”

22. It is narrated in a chainless traditional report that: “I am the city of knowledge, Ali is its gate; Abu Bakr is its foundation, Umar is its walls.”

Ibne Darwish Hoot says in *Asniul Matalib*:⁴ “It is not becoming that this report be mentioned in academic literature.”

23. It is narrated in a chainless traditional report from Anas that:

“Abu Bakr and Umar are the two chiefs of the folks of Paradise; and Abu Bakr in Paradise is like Pleiades star in the sky.”

Yahya bin Ambasa, who was a liar and a fabricator has fabricated this traditional report.

In *Mizanul Etedal*, Dhahabi has quoted the first half of the statement and remarked:⁵ “Yunus bin Habib said that I was with Ali bin Madini and I mentioned this report quoting from Muhammad bin Kathir Masisi. Ali bin Madini said: Previously I was eager for this person, but now I would not like to meet him.”

In the same way, Dhahabi has quoted the first sentence from Abdur Rahman bin Malik bin Maghul⁶ that he was a dishonest man and counterfeiter of traditions.

24. It is narrated from Jabir in a chainless traditional report that:

“No believer harbors malice towards Abu Bakr and Umar and no hypocrite is affectionate to them.”

Moalla bin Hilal Tahhan has faked this tradition. Ahmad remarks: “All his

¹ *Tareekh Baghdad*, 10:358-375.

² *Tareekh Baghdad*, 2:313.

³ *Mizanul Etedal*, 3:211 [4/206, No. 8873].

⁴ *Asniul Mataalib*, 73 [Pg. 137, H. 391].

⁵ *Mizanul Etedal*, 3:126 [4/18, No. 8100].

⁶ *Mizanul Etedal*, [2/585, No. 4949].

traditions are fabricated.”

In *Tadkiratul Huffaz*, Dhahabi says:¹ “This tradition is not valid and Moalla is accused of lying.”

25. It is narrated from Ayesha that:

“One night, the Prophet was in my place and we were asleep, when my glance fell on the sky, which was filled with many stars. I asked: O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is there in this world an individual, who has as many good deeds to his credit as the number of stars in the sky? Yes, he replied. Who is that, I asked. He replied: Umar. He is one of the good deeds of your father.”

Khatib Baghdadi has regarded this report to be among the faked reports of Duraiyya bin Muhammad Bayya, who was a fabricator of traditions.²

These were the fabricated and faked merits. Such kinds of traditions are present in excessive numbers reaching to thousands.

In part two of our book, *Riyazul Uns*, we have mentioned some traditions (which were mentioned here), which are not found in authentic books of traditions. The chain of narrators of many of these reports reach to Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and this statement testifies for Aamir bin Sharahil, who says:

“In the Islamic Ummah, most lies were attributed to Ameerul Momineen Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.).”³

The readers can evaluate these traditions through the statement of Firozabad, author of *Qamus* at the conclusion of *Safarus Saada*,⁴ where he says:

“Among the most well known fake traditions are traditions in excellence of Abu Bakr.”

And he writes: “There is not a single authentic tradition regarding the excellence of Muawiyah.”

From this you can conclude what they have fabricated and attributed to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding names and identities of companions. A large number of traditions, particularly regarding the excellence and defects of Abbas, uncle of the Prophet, his son and generally all Bani Abbas caliphs.

فَمَنْ أَظْلَمُ مِنْ افْتَرَى عَلَى اللَّهِ كَذِبًا لِيُضْلِلَ النَّاسَ بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ

“Who, then, is more unjust than he who forges a lie against Allah that he should lead astray men without knowledge?”⁵

¹ Tazkeratul Huffaaz, 3:112.

² Ref: *Tareekh Baghdad*, 7:135.

³ Zahabi has mentioned this tradition in *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, 1:77 [1/82].

⁴ *Safarus Saada*, [2/211-212].

⁵ Surah Anaam 6:144

Traditions fabricated regarding Caliphate

The most important topic, through which fabricators played with carnal desires and emotions is the subject of traditions and Sunnah. They wrongly attributed traditions to God and trustee of His revelations, Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.). They were aware that these traditions were contradictory to the tenets of Islam according to all sects. Some of them are as follows:

1. It is narrated from Ayesha that:

“The Prophet carried the first stone for construction of Masjid, Abu Bakr carried second, Umar the next and Uthman after that. I asked: O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), did you not see how they assisted you? He said: Ayesha, these are my Caliphs after me.”

Hakeem has mentioned this tradition in his *Mustadrak*¹ and remarked: “This tradition is authentic, but due to the fact that it is narrated by Muhammad bin Fazal bin Atiyya it is isolated.”

2. It is narrated from Abdullah bin Umar that:

“The Prophet of Islam (s.a.w.a.) said to Bilal: Bilal, announce among the people that Abu Bakr is the Caliph after me. Bilal announce that Umar would be the Caliph after Abu Bakr. Bilal announce that Uthman would be the Caliph after Umar. Bilal go as Almighty Allah will not accept anyone other than them.” And he repeated this thrice.

Abu Nuaim has mentioned this report in *Fadailus Sahaba* and Khatib has mentioned in his book of history.² Without making any objection against it, Ibne Asakir has mentioned in his *Tarikh Shaam*.³ Dhahabi has quoted it in *Mizanul Etedal* through the authorities of Darqutni and Amr bin Shahin and remarked: “This tradition is a fabrication.”⁴

3. It is narrated from a chainless tradition from Abu Saeed Khudri that the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

“When I went upto the heavens, I asked: O God, appoint Ali as Caliph after me. So the heavens shuddered and angels called out to me: O Muhammad, recite:

وَمَا تَشَاءُونَ إِلَّا أَن يَشَاءَ اللَّهُ

¹ Mustadrak Alas Saheehain, 3:97 [3/103, H. 4533].

² Tareekh Baghdad, 7:429.

³ Tareekh Medinatul Damishq, Ibne Asakir, [39/174, No. 4619; Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq, 16/144].

⁴ *Mizanul Etedal*, 1:387 [2/150, No. 3233, and here the name of the reporter is mentioned as Umar bin Shahin].

“And you do not please except that Allah please.”¹

And Almighty Allah desired Abu Bakr to be the Caliph.”

This report is a fabrication of Yusuf bin Ja’far Khwarizmi and Dhahabi has mentioned it in *Mizanul Etedal*² and remarked:

“Ibne Jauzi has said: This report is a fabrication of Yusuf.”

Allamah Amini says: I have a question for the fabricator of this tradition and his associates, that tradition scholars, who are trustees of knowledge and faith, after concluding the point that the issue of Caliphate is governed by dictates of divine will, say:

اللَّهُ يَفْعُلُ مَا يَشَاءُ ﴿٢﴾

“Even thus does Allah what He pleases.”³

وَمَا تَشَاءُونَ إِلَّا أَن يَشَاءَ اللَّهُ

“And you do not please except that Allah please.”⁴

And that Almighty Allah desired Abu Bakr to be Caliph. Now, what is the value of Prophet’s supplication and asking for something, which caused heavens and angels to shudder? This shuddering was only because this request was disliked; which is below the dignity of the Prophet to do so.

How did the Prophet remain unaware of the person, who was eligible for Caliphate and he proposed the name of such an individual due which God, heavens, its inmates and believers opposed? I seek refuge of God from such degraded and worthless statements.

After that [this question arises that] how did it happen that awareness of Prophet about this issue was delayed from knowledge of angels and heavens, whereas it was needed by His Eminence and the Ummah and he was duty bound to convey it to the Ummah and to propagate it, and the Ummah was bound to submit to it? And all angels and heavens, were not carriers of revelation for Prophet that their knowledge should have precedence over knowledge of His Eminence (s.a.w.a.).⁵

What impelled His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) to insist and repeat his plea even though Almighty Allah refused to grant it and desired the contrary?

And other numerous questions! And these are difficulties, which I don’t think is possible to reply by one, who relies on this report. Fie upon this writer

¹ Surah Insan 76:30

² *Mizanul Etedal*, 3:329 [4/463, No. 986].

³ Surah Aale Imran 3:40

⁴ Surah Insan 76:30

⁵ This statement is only for the sake of argument; whereas regarding the knowledge of Prophet, we believe that in every instance, Jibreel descended with permission to announce the message and to assure the believers.

that he wrote this false tradition and regarded it as subtle.¹ And shame on the other writer, who regarded it as strange and said:

“This tradition derives strength from authentic traditions.”²

O God, I complain (only) to you!

It is narrated from Jabir in a chainless tradition that:

“Abu Bakr is my vizier and after me, he is the Imam; Umar is my close confidant and he speaks according to my wishes. Uthman is from me and Ali is my brother and the carrier of my standard.”

In *Kanzul Ummal*,³ it is narrated from Anas that:

“Abu Bakr is my vizier and my successor; Umar speaks according to me; I am from Uthman and Uthman is from me.”

This tradition is from fabrications of Kadih bin Rahma, who was a liar. Dhahabi has brought this tradition in *Mizanul Etedal*⁴ upon the authorities of Kadih. Ibne Adi⁵ has said: Most traditions of Kadih are incorrect.

5. Hakeem has narrated from Abdur Rahman bin Abu Bakr from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that:⁶

“Bring ink and paper,⁷ so that I may leave a writing for you that you may not get deviated.” Then he said: “Allah and the believers will not accept anyone, except Abu Bakr.”

6. It is narrated from Ayesha that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to me during his last illness:

“Ask your father and brother to come to me, so that I may write a document as I fear a person, who aspired Caliphate, would vie for it and raise a claim for it and someone might say: I am more deserving of Caliphate and Almighty Allah and believers will not accept anyone for Caliphate, except Abu Bakr.”⁸

Muslim, Ahmad and others have narrated this report from various channels from Ayesha.⁹ In some reports it is mentioned:

“The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to me during his terminal illness: Call Abdur Rahman bin Abu Bakr, so that I may write a document for Abu Bakr, that no one may differ regarding him.” Then he said: “Leave him to his devices. I seek refuge of God from the fact that believers should differ about Abu Bakr.”

¹ Ref: *Nuzhatul Majalis*, 2:186.

² Ref: *Riyazun Nazara*, 1:150 [1/188].

³ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:160 [11/628, H. 63033].

⁴ *Mizanul Etedal*, [3/399, No. 6927].

⁵ Al-Kamil fee Zoafa Rijal, [6/83, No. 1616].

⁶ Mustadrak Alas Saheehain, [3/542, H. 6016],

⁷ In Arabic text the term of shoulder bone (of sheep) which was used as surface for writing documents and we have rendered it into paper for the sake of modern readers.

⁸ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:139 [11/550, H. 32583].

⁹ *Saheeh Muslim* [5/10, H. 11, Kitab Fazailus Sahaba, Musnad Ahmad, 7/153, H. 24230]; *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, 22 [Pg. 13].

7. It is narrated from Ayesha in a chainless report:

“I have decided to send someone to summon Abdur Rahman bin Abu Bakr so that I may write a pledge for him (to make a bequest that Abu Bakr should be my Caliph after me) that people should not say (because I don’t want anyone to say: I am more worthy of Caliphate) and aspirers should not aspire, that is no one should aspire that someone other than Abu Bakr should be Caliph. I said: God refuses and believers also will not accept anyone other than Abu Bakr (that is I did not make a will, because I know Almighty Allah forbids anyone else to be Caliph and believers also will not accept anyone else) or Allah will not accept (someone else) and believers disagree.”

Sanani has quoted this tradition from *Mashariqul Anwar*¹ and stated in its margins: I did not find this tradition in *Saheeh Bukhari*, so it should be referred once more and Ibne Malik in his Sharh has mentioned the tradition as I said in parentheses and has explained it and Ibne Hazm has mentioned it in *Fisal* and said.²

“This clarification from the Prophet is based on appointment of Abu Bakr after him in the Ummah. This is the distorted form of the tradition of paper and inkpot, a tradition, which is mentioned in different authentic books, especially two most important *Saheeh* books; and when they saw that there is no clear tradition, they changed it into this form; but the problem is that it is narrated from Ibne Abbas through reliable authorities that:

“At that time the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was prevented from writing a document that the Ummah should not deviate; and clamor increased and they accused His Eminence of something, which was unworthy for him; and a man said: He is talking nonsense or the illness has overpowered him. After the passing away of His Eminence, according to a pre-planned plot that correct history was distorted.”

Ibne Abil Hadeed says in *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*:³

“They fabricated this report as opposed to the tradition narrated about illness of His Eminence: Bring paper and ink, so that I may write something for you; that you may not deviate. Then a dispute arose in the presence of Prophet and some people said: Illness has overpowered him and the Book of Allah is sufficient for us.”

Allamah Amini says: This seeking of refuge⁴ can have two meanings: Either it tells about there being no dispute among believers or it implies forbidding disputes.

According to the first meaning: Its requirement is falsehood, because it is

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, [5/2145, H. 5342].

² *Al-Fisal*, 4:108.

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:17 [11/49, Sermon 203].

⁴ In the statement attributed to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) I seek refuge of Allah, indeed the believers dispute, which passed in the sixth fake tradition above.

natural that there should be disputes – and what a dispute? In which Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Bani Hashim and group of senior companions, who were his followers, leader of the Khazraj, Saad bin Ubadah and other Ansars became opponents, although the sentiments and stance of this group opposed the regime and they refused to pay allegiance.

After sometime they acquiesced to the regime, but feelings the partisans of Ali (a.s.) bore in their hearts remained forever and would remain forever. And Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and his family and partisans raised their voices at every opportunity and exposed the matter of their usurped Caliphate and rights.

According to the second meaning: Its requirement is that large group of senior companions should be transgressors; because by this they opposed the prohibition of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and began to oppose this group. And this is not compatible with justice of all companions, except that the command of justice should be specified for other than Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and his close companions. Thus, the captioned traditional report is invalid in whatever meaning it might be.

Come let us ask Ayesha regarding this report that why she did not mention this report on the day arguments arose about Caliphate? And did not mention this clarification of the Prophet to one, who disputed with her father? Perhaps she may reply: “I never heard this false report from my noble husband,” but the debased reporters, after the passing away of His Eminence, did not respect the honor of his nobility and attributed this false report to him. The testimony of this reply is the authentic traditional report narrated from her chains, and it proves the absence of appointing a successor, and this report will be mentioned soon.

وَلَيْنَ اتَّبَعْتَ أَهْوَاءَهُمْ بَعْدَ مَا جَاءَكَ مِنَ الْعِلْمِ لَا مَالَكَ مِنَ اللَّهِ مِنْ وَلَيْلٍ وَلَا
وَاقِعٍ^٢

“And if you follow their low desires after what has come to you of knowledge, you shall not have against Allah any guardian or a protector.”¹

¹ Surah Raad 13:37

Dirty falsehood

This fake traditional report remained in this community as a reminder and was transferred from generation to generation and from person to person and they based their allegations on this falsehood knowing that senior companions declared all these traditions fake.

What supports this matter is that the only argument, which people use to support Caliphate, is consensus and selection. And no one from them ever depends on traditional reports; on the contrary, they have discussed in detail regarding invalidation of texts, correction of option and its rules. Khizri has mentioned in *Mahazirat*.¹

The root is that selection of Caliph was through approval of people and it derives its strength from this only and the Muslims at the time of passing away of Prophet acted on this only and selected Abu Bakr and did not justify this selection according to Quran or statement of Prophet and after his selection paid allegiance to him. The meaning of allegiance is that they made a pledge to him that they would listen to him, in which lies approval of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime, and that they would obey his orders just as he made a pledge to them that he would govern them according to dictates of Quran and Sunnah of Prophet. This pledge between Caliph and Ummah is the meaning of allegiance in the same way as buyers and sellers conduct a transaction of sale and purchase.

So, the real strength of Caliphate is achieved from this allegiance and in the same way fulfillment of this allegiance is considered most necessary, which religion has made obligatory and which Shariat has made imminent.

Abu Bakr left behind another method of selection of Caliph and that was selection of his Caliph himself and [and after that] he took the oath of everyone that they would obey this Caliph and all Muslims accepted this method and regarded obedience to him in this regard as obligatory and this act of Abu Bakr is the same heir apparentcy.

Now, it becomes clear from these statement that this traditional report, after taking allegiance and establishment of Caliphate for someone [Abu Bakr], which he assumes is made-up, because no one neither on the day of Saqifah and nor after that has mentioned this traditional report. In spite of the fact that there occurred numerous incidents, protest and disputes.

We present such traditions, which are authentic in view of people and which are contradictory to and falsify the above mentioned reports:

1. Through authentic chains of narrators, it is narrated that when Abu Bakr was on his death bed, he remarked: "I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah

¹ Mahazirat Tareekh Umamul Islamiyah - Daulat Abbasi :46 [Pg. 41].

(s.a.w.a.) who was to be his Caliph, so that no one would have disputed. I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) if there is some share for Ansar in this issue.”¹

If Abu Bakr had heard something from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) regarding his Caliphate as mentioned in the previous reports, he would not have dared to claim that illness has overpowered him or that he was talking nonsense, as is seen in the report of paper and ink.

2. It is narrated from Ayesha that when Abu Bakr was in his deathbed, he summoned Umar and said:

“O Umar, I appoint you the Caliph upon companions of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).” and he wrote to the commanders: “I have appointed Umar as your ruler and I have not failed in endeavoring for the well being of myself and Muslims.”²

Now, if there was a textual evidence for Caliphate of Umar, what is the meaning of Abu Bakr in attributing the appointment of Umar to himself?

3. If the previous traditional reports are correct and Caliphate is a pledge of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime, through what justification did Abu Bakr say: “I have become the caretaker of this issue of Caliphate whereas I despise it. By God, I wish some of you would suffice me in this matter.”³

How can he dislike something, which Almighty Allah sanctioned for him and which Jibreel brought, and the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) informed about it? Also, he can like that others would excuse him in this matter? Whereas [on the basis of those fabricated reports] there appeared a gap between the Prophet and the desire of His Eminence, that is making Ali (a.s.) as Caliph and Almighty Allah did not accord any importance to intention of His Eminence and did not accept the Caliphate of anyone, except Abu Bakr.

4. And what is the justification of Abu Bakr asking people to divest him from Caliphate? Numerous statements regarding this are reported from him, like:

“Leave me, leave me, I am not the best among you.”⁴

Also: “I do not have need of your allegiance; take back the allegiance you gave to me.”⁵

How can he leave it at the discretion of people to take back allegiance? And how did he regard it as lawful to reject divine will?

5. How Umar considered the Shura committee of Muslims as the point of reference for selecting a Caliph and said: “If someone pledges allegiance to a

¹ Tareekh Tabari, 4:53 [3/431]; *Al-Iqdul Fareed*, 2:254 [4/93]; there is a discussion regarding this tradition in Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his master. O Allah, love those, who love him and be inimical to those, who are inimical to him. Ghadeer, Pg. 7:229-240.

² *Taisirul Wusul*, Hafiz Ibne Daiba, 1:48 [2/57].

³ *Sifatus Safwa*, Ibne Jauzi, 1:99 [1/260, No. 2].

⁴ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, Ibne Hajar: 30 [Pg. 51].

⁵ Al-Imamah was Siyasah, 1:14 [1/20].

leader, without concurrence of Muslims, his allegiance is invalid; in addition to that both shall be put to death.”¹

6. What prevented Ali Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) from paying allegiance to Uthman on the day of Shura committee after Abdur Rahman bin Auf and other members of Shura paid allegiance to him and His Eminence was standing up; after that he sat down and Abdur Rahman said: “Give allegiance, lest I strike off your neck.” That day, no one other than Abdur Rahman possessed a sword. Then it was said that Ali exited from there in fury and members of Shura came to His Eminence and said: “Pay allegiance otherwise we would battle you.” Then His Eminence returned and paid allegiance to Uthman.²

In *Tarikh Umam*,³ Tabari writes:

“People began to pledge allegiance to Uthman and Ali (a.s.) refrained. Abdur Rahman said:

فَمَنْ نَكَثَ فِي أَنَّمَا يَنْكُثُ عَلَى نَفْسِهِ وَمَنْ أَوْفَ بِمَا عَاهَدَ عَلَيْهِ اللَّهُ فَسَيُؤْتِيَهُ أَجْرًا عَظِيمًا

“Therefore whoever breaks (his oath), he breaks it only to the injury of his own soul, and whoever fulfills what he has covenanted with Allah, He will grant him a mighty reward.”⁴

Then Ali (a.s.) returned piercing through the crowd and the crowd made way for him; then he gave pledge of allegiance saying: “This is a deception and what a deception it is!”

It is mentioned in *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*:⁵ Abdur Rahman said: “O Ali, don’t leave any way open for yourself, which is only the way of force.”

It is mentioned in *Saheeh Bukhari*:⁶ “Do not leave a way for yourself (do not give us a pretext to punish you).”

Allamah Amini says: Elimination of someone, who does not pledge allegiance was at the behest of Umar as Tabari has mentioned in his *Tarikh*.⁷

أَفَمَنْ هُنَا الْحَدِيبُونَ تَعْجَبُونَ وَتَضْحَكُونَ وَلَا تَبْكُونَ

“Do you then wonder at this announcement? And will you laugh and not weep?”⁸

¹ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:56 [1/91, H. 393]; . *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 5:246 [5/267, events of 11 A.H.1.

² *Ansabul Ashraf*, Balazari, 5:22.

³ *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 5:41 [4/238, Events of year 23 A.H.].

⁴ Surah Fath 48:10

⁵ *Al-Imamah was Siyasah*, 1:25 [1/31].

⁶ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 1:208 [6/2635, H. 6781].

⁷ *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 5:35 [4/229, Events of year 23 A.H.].

⁸ Surah Najm 53:59-60

What are these rude statements and calls of confusion?

These reports are nothing, except nonsense and babble as opposed to the clear reality and rightful Caliphate based on authentic texts, which are proved for Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) and Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) had brought in form of divine revelation since the first day of his call till the last moments of his life and clearly announced in public.

This is nothing, but a racket and creating mischief, in which no creature has any discretion; and the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) at the beginning of his call clarified that the control of this Caliphate is in the hand of God and He gives it to whom He likes. And the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) mentioned this one day when he himself presented it to Bani Aamir bin Saasa and called them to God and one of them asked: "If we follow you, and Almighty Allah grants victory to you over opponents, will you leave your Caliphate to us?" The Prophet replied: "The discretion of this matter is in the control of God and He gives it whoever He intends."¹

Can those who argue in this matter find any way out of this? Is there any way from these chains and yokes, which have imprisoned these fellows? Which source of confidence lends credibility to their claim? Which verse of Quran or tradition is there on which it is possible to depend? Are these not books full of blatant lies? Are these hundreds of thousands of false traditions not spread in so many books?

What is the solution when one sees some writers, who have mentioned these traditions like authentic traditions; and some others have fabricated chains of narrators for it and at the side mentioned things in such a way that they covered the face of truth, which shows the power of these traditions?

What can one do whereas after these liar writers, lying of the fourteenth century, we see that Qaseemi raises his voice and says: "In the narrators of Ahle Sunnat traditions there is no one who is accused of lying."²

In this condition, what is the sin of the ignorant in not recognizing the truth? Who can distinguish for him the correct Sunnah from false? And which hand would save him from false statements? Is there a reformer having true religious concern who can save him from the abyss of ignorance and unawareness?

Yes:

وَكَتَبْنَا لَهُ فِي الْأَلْوَاحِ مِنْ كُلِّ شَيْءٍ مَوْعِظَةً وَتَفْصِيلًا لِكُلِّ شَيْءٍ

"And We ordained for him in the tablets admonition of every kind and clear explanation of all things."³

¹ Seerah Ibne Hisham, 1:33 [2/66]; Seeratul Halabiyya, 2:23.

² As-Saraa Baunal Islam wal Wathniya, 1:85.

³ Surah Araaf 7:145

لِيَهْلَكَ مَنْ هَلَكَ عَنْ بَيْنَةٍ وَيَحْيَى مَنْ حَيَ عَنْ بَيْنَةٍ

“That he who would perish might perish by clear proof, and he who would live might live by clear proof.”¹

وَلَقَدْ جَعَلْنَاهُمْ بِكِتَابٍ فَصَلَّنَاهُ عَلَىٰ عِلْمٍ هُدَىٰ وَرَحْمَةً لِّقَوْمٍ يُّؤْمِنُونَ ⑤

“And certainly We have brought them a Book which We have made clear with knowledge, a guidance and a mercy for a people who believe.”²

وَأَتَيْنَاهُمْ بَيِّنَاتٍ مِّنَ الْأَمْرِ ۚ فَمَا احْتَلَفُوا إِلَّا مِنْ بَعْدِ مَا جَاءَهُمُ الْعِلْمُ ۖ لَا
بَغْيًا بَيْنَهُمْ ۖ إِنَّ رَبَّكَ يَقْضِي بَيْنَهُمْ مِّنْ مَا كَانُوا فِيهِ يَخْتَلِفُونَ ⑥
ثُمَّ جَعَلْنَاكَ عَلَىٰ شَرِيعَةٍ مِّنَ الْأَمْرِ فَاتَّبِعْهَا وَلَا تَتَّبِعْ أَهْوَاءَ الَّذِينَ لَا
يَعْلَمُونَ ⑦

“And We gave them clear arguments in the affair, but they did not differ until after knowledge had come to them out of envy among themselves; surely your Lord will judge between them on the day of resurrection concerning that wherein they differed. Then We have made you follow a course in the affair, therefore follow it, and do not follow the low desires of those who do not know.”³

فَلَا يَصُدَّنَّكَ عَنْهَا أَمْرٌ لَا يُؤْمِنُ بِهَا وَاتَّبِعْ هَوَاهُ فَتَرَدِي ⑧

“Therefore let not him who believes not in it and follows his low desires turn you away from it so that you should perish;”⁴

وَالسَّلَامُ عَلَىٰ مَنِ اتَّبَعَ الْهُدَىٰ ⑨

“And peace is on him who follows the guidance;”⁵

Command regarding fabricators and liars

Jalaluddin Suyuti says in *Tahzirul Khawas*:⁶

Conclusion: “I do not know of any greater sin that Ahle Sunnat consider the doer of it infidel, except attributing a false statement on the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).”

¹ Surah Anfal 8:42

² Surah Araaf 7:52

³ Surah Jaaseyah 45:17-18

⁴ Surah Taha 20:16

⁵ Surah Taha 20:47

⁶ *Tahzirul Khawas*, 21 [Pg. 125].

Command regarding those, who memorize these invalid false statements

Order regarding traditionists, scholars of traditions and history – in the past and at present – who falsely attribute statements to Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), compile them in books and collections is mentioned in a traditional report, which Khatib has mentioned and which Ibne Jauzi regards as authentic that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“One who narrates a tradition from me, while knowing that it is false, is himself a liar.”¹

Allah Almighty says:

وَلَوْ تَقُولَ عَلَيْنَا بَعْضَ الْأَقَاوِيلِ لَاَخْدُنَا مِنْهُ بِالْيَمِينِ ثُمَّ لَقَطَعْنَا مِنْهُ الْوَتِينِ فَمَا مِنْكُمْ مِنْ اَحَدٍ عَنْهُ لَجِزِّيْنَ وَإِنَّهُ لَتُلَكِّرُهُ لِلْمُتَّقِيْنَ وَإِنَّا لَنَعْلَمُ أَنَّ مِنْكُمْ مُكَذِّبِيْنَ

“And if he had fabricated against Us some of the sayings, We would certainly have seized him by the right hand, then We would certainly have cut off his aorta. And not one of you could have withheld Us from him. And most surely it is a reminder for those who guard (against evil). And most surely We know that some of you are rejecters.”²

Do you think that these tradition scholars and historians have knowledge of these falsehoods?

They have gone astray and along with themselves, have misguided a large group of people from the path of truth.

وَمَنْ أَظْلَمُ مِنْ افْتَرَى عَلَى اللَّهِ كَذِبًا اُولَئِكَ يُعَرِّضُونَ عَلَى رَبِّهِمْ وَيَقُولُ الْأَشْهَادُ هُوَ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا إِنَّمَا كَذَبُوا عَلَى رَبِّهِمْ إِلَّا لَعْنَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَى الظَّالِمِيْنَ

“And who is more unjust than he who forges a lie against Allah? These shall be brought before their Lord, and the witnesses shall say: These are they who lied against their Lord. Now surely the curse of Allah is on the unjust.”³

Or do you think that they were ignorant of these falsehoods and had no knowledge, and resorted to lying like blind and deaf fellows?

وَيَحْسَبُوْنَ أَنَّهُمْ عَلَى شَيْءٍ

¹ Tareekh Baghdad, 4:161 [No. 1837]; Al-Muntazim, 8:268 [16/133, No. 3407].

² Surah Haqqah 69:44-49

³ Surah Hud 11:18

“And they think that they have something.”¹

وَمِنْهُمْ أُمِّيُّونَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ الْكِتَبَ إِلَّا آمَانَ وَإِنْ هُمْ إِلَّا يَظْنُونَ ④

“And there are among them illiterates who know not the Book but only lies, and they do but conjecture.”²

فَمَنْ أَظْلَمُ مَنْ افْتَرَى عَلَى اللَّهِ كَذِبًا لِيُضِلَّ النَّاسَ بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ ۖ إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَا يَهْدِي الْقَوْمَ الظَّلِيلِينَ ۝

“Who, then, is more unjust than he who forges a lie against Allah that he should lead astray men without knowledge? Surely Allah does not guide the unjust people.”³

فَوَيْلٌ لِلَّهُمَّ إِمَّا كَتَبْتَ أَيْدِيهِمْ وَوَيْلٌ لَلَّهُمَّ إِمَّا يَكُسِّبُونَ ④

“Therefore woe to them for what their hands have written and woe to them for what they earn.”⁴

54. Qutubuddin Rawandi

Died: 573 A.H.

1. The descendants of Zahra are the fathers of orphans, when they are addressed, in reply they wish peace. 2. They are proofs of God on creatures and whoever is inimical to them, has met with sins. 3. They observed fasts daily and spent nights in prayers, as you are aware. 4. Did the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) not appoint Ali (a.s.) the Imam on the day of Ghadeer? 5. Was Haider not the greatest, the valiant, generous and courageous? Was Haider not the best successor?

Introduction to the poet

His name was Qutubuddin Abul Husain Saad bin Hibtullah bin Hasan bin Isa Rawandi.⁵ He was the leader of religion and an important Shia personality. He was a foremost teacher of jurisprudence and traditions and in knowledge and literature, he was incomparable. It was not possible for anyone to acquire his numerous merits and no objection can be leveled against his excellence and efforts, his services and good deeds and valuable writings that he produced.⁶

¹ Surah Mujadila 58:18

² Surah Baqarah 2:78

³ Surah Anaam 6:144

⁴ Surah Baqarah 2:79

⁵ In many reliable sources, instead of Saad, Saeed is mentioned.

⁶ His biography and account can be seen in the following books: *Shaykh Muntazibuddin* [Pg. 87, No. 186]; *Maalimul Ulama* [Pg. 55, No. 368]; *Mustadrakul Wasail*, 3:489; *Al-Kuna Wal Alqab*, 3:58 [3/72].

His teachers

He was among the bearers of knowledge and teachers of religion, who narrated traditional reports; among them being:

1. Shaykh Abul Sadat Hibatullah bin Ali Baghdadi (d. 522 A.H.).
2. Shaykh Imaduddin Muhammad bin Abul Qasim Tabari, author of *Basharatul Mustafa Ilaa Shiatul Murtada*.
3. Shaykh Abu Ali Tabarsi, author of *Majmaul Bayan*, according to the book *Naqdur Rijal*.¹

Some well known Shia scholars also narrated from him, among them being:

1. Shaykh Babawayh Saad bin Muhammad bin Hasan bin Husain bin Babawayh.
2. His son, Abul Faraj Imaduddin Ali bin Qutubuddin Rawandi.

His valuable writings

Among them being:

1. *Qisasul Anbiya*
2. *Ayatul Ahkam*
3. *Fiqhatul Quran*²
4. *Al-Ayaatul Mushkila*

He passed away in the year 573 A.H.³ His grave is located in the shrine of Lady Masuma Qom in the new courtyard.

55. Sibte Ibne Taweezi

Born 519 A.H.

Died: 584 A.H.

“And I bathed and applied antimony to the eyes three times. And on the day of Ashura pretended to perform the rituals of the enemies of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and concealed the sorrow and grief of that day and on the day of Eid Ghadeer, I do not display my gaiety and instead of living at the tomb of Moosa,⁴ spend my life in the neighborhood of Mansur mosque.”⁵

Introduction to the poet

Abul Fath Muhammad bin Ubaidullah Baghdadi⁶ was famous as Ibne Taweezi and Sibte Ibne Taweezi.

¹ *Naqdur Rijal*, Tafrashi, [Pg. 266].

² He wrote this book in 562 A.H.

³ Ijaazaatul Bihar: 15.

⁴ That is tomb of Imam Moosa Kazim (a.s.) in Kazimiyyah.

⁵ These verses can be seen in his printed collection on Pg. 214.

⁶ In numerous sources it is mentioned as Abdullah.

He was the most prominent Shia poet and an incomparable writer. Dictionaries of poets abound with his praises.¹

¹ *Mo'jamul Odaba*, 7:31 [18/235].

Poets of Ghadeer in the seventh century Hijri

- 56. Abul Hasan Mansur billaah
- 57. Majduddeen bin Jamil
- 58. Shawwa Kufi Halabi
- 59. Kamaluddin Shafei
- 60. Abu Muhammad Mansur billaah
- 61. Abul Husain Jazzar
- 62. Shamsuddin Mahfuz
- 63. Bahaudin Irbili

56. Abul Hasan Mansur billaah

Born 561 A.H.

Died: 614 A.H.

يشهد للفارس المعلم

بني عمنا ان يوم الغدير

ومن خصه باللوا الاعظم:

ابونا على وصي الرسول

1. O cousins, the day of Ghadeer testifies for the intelligent and wise man. 2. My father, Ali, is the successor of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and is one, whom the Prophet handed the great standard. 3. You possess sanctity for being related to him, and we are from his flesh and blood. 4. If Hashim gathers all of us; but where are the humps of camels and where are his ankles?! 5. If you are like the stars of heavens, we are crescent moons. 6. And we are the sons of his daughter and you are not as such; and we are the sons of his Muslim uncle.

The poet composed this Qasida in Jamadiul Awwal, 602 A.H. in response to 'Qasida Maimiya' of Ibne Motaz. Its starting lines are as follows:

"O cousins repay our love and tour upon firm and established practices. We have source of pride and you also have source of pride and one, who chooses the truth is not regretful. You are the sons of his daughter, but we are not as such. We are the sons of his Muslim cousin."

Introduction to the poet

He was Mansur billaah Abdullah bin Hamza...bin Hasan bin Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). He was leader of the Zaidiyyah in Yemen. He had noble lineage, acquired greatness and in addition to academic nobility, possessed exceeding knowledge. He wrote valuable books on different subjects: like jurisprudence, principles of jurisprudence, scholasticism, traditions, religion and literature. Sixty pages are devoted to his biography in the book *Al-Hadaiqul Wardiya*.¹

57. Majduddeen bin Jamil

Died: 616 A.H.

ومن اعطاه يوم غدير خم صريح المجد والشرف والقدامى

ومن ردت ذكاء له فصلى اداء ابعد ما ثنيت الشاما

وآخر بالعطاء و قد توالى ثلاث لم يذق فيها طعاما:

1. One whom the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) bestowed clear honor and nobility on the day of Ghadeer Khum. 2. And one for whom, the sun returned after setting and he performed his prayer. 3. And he gave away his

¹ Al-Hadaiqul Wardiya, 2:133. 199.

food, although he had not eaten for three days. 4. He was not satisfied, except that his diet should be only a loaf of bread of unrefined grain with salt. 5. And the Prophet recalled the sun for him and added another feather to his cap.

Introduction to the poet

Majduddin Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Mansur bin Jamil Jabai – and Jabi is also mentioned – he was famous as Ibne Jamil Fuzari. He was a writer poet, an expert littérateur, who had command over Arabic grammar and prosody. He occupies numerous pages in books about accounts of important poets and in ranks of grammarians also, he has left his name among greatest personalities of this field. Aspects of the history of this poet – which were forgotten – are highlighted by Dr. Mustafa Jawad Baghdadi in his biography in the journal of Ghurra Najafiya al-Ghurra, No. 16, Year 7.¹

58. Shawwa Kufi Halabi

Born 562 A.H. approx.

Died: 653 A.H.

1. I am the guarantee of one, who is fearful of divine chastisement if he is loyal to Abu Turab, successor of Prophet. 2. That on Judgment Day he would see the forgiving Lord and on day of recompense, the interceding master. 3. The valiant man, whose nobility and valor has filled the world, his neighbors are powerful and his surroundings are green. 4. During peace, the cloud of generosity was seen with him and during war, he was a ferocious lion. 5. When he moves his sword for the battle, he would show lightning to you flashing from the clouds. 6. Successor of Mustafa and father of his sons, and among his companions, he is the husband of Fatima. 7. He has clarification of the day of Ghadeer Khum and he has the excellence, which is mentioned in Quran.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Mahasin Yusuf bin Ismail bin Ali bin Ahmad bin Husain bin Ibrahim, famous as Shawwa and having the title of Shahabuddin Halabi Kufi, was born in Aleppo. He lived there all his life and passed away there. He was a senior poet and writer and his fame had spread all over the country. He was having strong beliefs, righteous intentions, and natural flair for poetry. He possessed great expertise of versification and composed verses, which were clear as well as compact.

It is mentioned in the history of Ibne Khallikan:²

“He displayed extremist tendencies in Shiaism. He was born around 562

¹ Mujallatul Ghurra Najafiya al-Ghurra, 16:2

² Wafayatul Ayan, [7/231, No. 850].

A.H. and passed away on Friday, 19 Mohurrum, year 653 in Aleppo.”

59. Kamaluddin Shafei

Died: 652 A.H.

بأنك مني ياعلى و آخاه	وانكحه الطهر البتول وزاده
بأنك مولى كل من كنت مولاه	و شرفه يوم الغدير فخصه
كفتشر فافى مأثرات سجايها	ولولم يكن الا قضيه خير

“He married Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) and then and added: O Ali, you are from me; and deemed him to be his brother. Accorded nobility to him on the day of Ghadeer and specialized him saying: ‘You are the master of whomsoever I am the master,’ and if there was nothing, but the incident of Khyber; it would have been enough for him.”¹

Introduction to the poet

He was Abu Salim Kamaluddin Muhammad bin Talha bin Muhammad bin Hasan Qarashi Adawi Nasibani Shafei. He was a roving jurist, a prominent personality, an imam and scholar of Shafei jurisprudence; an expert in traditions, principles and *Ilme Khilaf*² He excelled all in adjudication and oratory, he was an expert in literature and writing and he was a religious man.

He was born in 582 A.H. and passed away in Aleppo on 17th Rajab 652 A.H.³ Some of his couplets regarding Ahle Bayt (a.s.) are mentioned in his book of *Matalibus So-ool*.⁴ Among his verses are:

1. He is a firm refuge for those, who seek his refuge. His merits have come down through divine revelation. 2. His excellence is mentioned in Surah Shura, Hal Ataa and Ahzab, as the reader of Quran is aware of them. 3. They are the family members of Mustafa, therefore love for them is incumbent. 4. Merits, which narrators have kept exalted; reporters, who patiently bore the hardship of recording the chains of narrators.

Through these verses, the poet has hinted at a number of distinctive merits of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) mentioned in Surah Shura, Hal Ataa and Ahzab.

As for Surah Shura:

It is mentioned in the following verse:

قُلْ لَا أَسْأَلُكُمْ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا إِلَّا الْمَوَدَّةُ فِي الْقُرْبَىٰ وَمَنْ يَقْتَرِفْ حَسَنَةً تَزِدُّهُ

¹ *Matalibus So-ool*, by the poet, [Pg. 20]; *As-Siratul Mustaqeem*, Bayazi [1/297].

² A science of the method of reasoning to arrive at a definite conclusion.

³ *Tabaqatul Shafiyatul Kubra*, [8/63. No. 1076].

⁴ *Matalibus So-ool*, [Pg. 91].

فِيهَا حُسْنًا

“Say: I do not ask of you any reward for it but love for my near relatives; and whoever earns good, We give him more of good therein.”¹

Moreover, there are traditional reports regarding the verse proving that it was revealed for the purified progeny.²

As for Surah Hal Ataa:

يُؤْفَوْنَ بِالثَّدْرِ وَيَخَافُونَ يَوْمًا كَانَ شَرُّهُ مُسْتَطِيرًا ② وَيُطْعَمُونَ الظَّاعَمَ عَلَى حُبِّهِ مِسْكِينًا وَيَتِيمًا وَآسِيرًا ⑧

“They fulfill vows and fear a day the evil of which shall be spreading far and wide. and they give food out of love for Him to the poor and the orphan and the captive:”³

In addition to this, we will explain through exegesis that these verses were revealed for Ahle Bayt (a.s.).⁴

As for Surah Ahzab:

The following verse:

مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ رِجَالٌ صَدَقُوا مَا عَاهَدُوا اللَّهَ عَلَيْهِ فَمِنْهُمْ مَنْ قَضَى نَحْبَهُ وَمِنْهُمْ مَنْ يَنْتَظِرُ ۚ وَمَا يَبْدَلُوا تَبْدِيلًا ۚ ⑨

“Of the believers are men who are true to the covenant which they made with Allah: so of them is he who accomplished his vow, and of them is he who yet waits, and they have not changed in the least;”⁵

And the verse:

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ اللَّهُ لِيُنْهِبَ عَنْكُمُ الرِّجْسَ أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ وَيُظَاهِرَ كُمْ تَنْهَيْرًا ۚ ⑩

“Allah only desires to keep away the uncleanness from you, O people of the House! and to purify you a (thorough) purifying.”⁶

Before this, we mentioned that the first verse was revealed for Ameerul

¹ Surah Shura 42:23

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi,, Pg. 211-212 and 306-307.

³ Surah Insan 76:7-8

⁴ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 285-287.

⁵ Surah Ahzab 33:23

⁶ Surah Ahzab 33:33

Momineen (a.s.), Hamza and Ubaidah.¹ Islamic Ummah has consensus that the verse of purification was revealed for Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Imam Hasan (a.s.), Imam Husain (a.s.) and Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.). Scholars and experts of traditions have recorded widely narrated authentic traditions in Sihah and Musnad books.

60. Abu Muhammad Mansur billaah

Born 596 A.H.

Died: 670 A.H.

1. Mustafa said regarding him: You are the master (*Wali*) and in the same way said: You are my vizier and successor. 2. To whom did he say: You are my brother and which other companion did he address as he addressed Ali? 3. Have you heard the tradition of his being the master on day of Ghadeer and whether the meaning of *Awla* and deserving is correct or not? 4. Did the Prophet not say anything regarding him so that there should not remain any excuse for the opponents?

Introduction to the poet

His name was Abu Muhammad Mansur billaah, Imam Hasan bin Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Yahya bin Yahya bin Yahya al-Hadi Ilal Haq Yamani. He was a leader of Zaidiyyah in Yemen and the senior most scholar of that country. He was an expert of the science and arts of traditions and in poetry and literature, he had made long strides. He possessed great expertise in the science prosody and was an accomplished debater. He was born in 569 A.H. and after the murder of Imam Ahmad bin Husain, the pledge of allegiance was given to him as an imam. His mission started from 657 A.H. and in Mohurrum, 670 A.H., he passed away in the town of Raghafa in Saada. His biography is mentioned in *Nismatus Sahar*.²

61. Abul Husain Jazzar

Born 601 A.H.

Died: 672 A.H.

1. You are the most deserving for Caliphate and there is nothing for creatures like what is expressed about you regarding Caliphate. 2. Ghadeer drops fire for those, who deny it; a fire, which is saved for them before the terrifying scream. 3. If they ridicule the statement of Ahmad that you are the master of creatures then they are themselves deserving of ridicule. 4. Your loyalists do not fear Hellfire as it passes them and apprehends those not his followers. 5. See that the fire leaves your loyalists and loyalty for you is refuge for them. 6. You would be the distributor tomorrow and this enemy

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shahroodi, Pg. 154.

² *Nismatus Sahar*, [No. 7/vol. 1/196].

of Ali is amidst flames of fire and his follower is successful in Paradise.

This Qasida can be found in some ancient manuscripts, which have collected couplets. It is a lengthy Qasida and its verses are scattered through books of literature.

Introduction to the poet

His name was Yahya bin Abdul Azim bin Yahya bin Muhammad bin Ali Jamaluddin Abul Husain Jazzar Misri. He is a forgotten Shia poet.

In *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya* of Ibne Kathir and *Shazaratuz Zahab*,¹ he is mentioned in positive terms, but his position is higher than what is mentioned and Samawi has compiled his collected works comprising of 1250 verses. His collected works was mentioned in positive terms in books of past scholars. They have mentioned that his collected works (*Diwan*) was well known.

In *Khazana*,² Ibne Hujjat says: He was born in 601 A.H. and he passed away in 672 A.H. in Egypt.

62. Qaazi Nizamuddin

Died: 678 A.H.

1. One, who is not affectionate to you for the sake of God will not get relief from fire and chastisement of grave. 2. The heavens are created for the sake of your grandfather; if it were not so, destiny and free would have been the demands of creation. 3. Who is like Ali (a.s.) in mastership (*Wilayat*)? Those, who harbor malice to him are nothing, but insane. 4. When people refer to traditions and traditional reports, the statement of Prophet: ‘O God, love those, who love him’ is sufficient for us. 5. The day of Ghadeer precedes like a flood destroying our enemies. 6. His two sons are the two blossoms of Paradise, then say: these fragrant crops have grown from a pure earth.

This Qasida comprises of 42 verses, which Qaazi Marashi has mentioned in *Majalisul Momineen*.³

The second verse hints at the report that Hakeem has mentioned in *Mustadrak*.⁴ It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that Almighty Allah sent revelation to Isa (a.s.): O Isa, acquire faith in Muhammad and whoever you meet from your Ummah, urge him to acquire faith in him, because if Muhammad had not been there, I would not have created Adam, Paradise and Hell. I created the Throne (*Arsh*) on the surface of water and water became agitated; so I wrote upon it: There is no god, except Allah, Muhammad is the messenger of Allah; then it was pacified.

¹ *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 13:293 [13/342, Events of the year 679 A.H.]; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 5:364 [7/636, Events of the year 679 A.H.].

² *Khazanatul Adab*, 338 [2/108].

³ *Majaalesul Momineen*, 226 [1/543].

⁴ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 2:615 [2/672, H. 4227].

After that Hakeem has narrated another tradition and deemed it as authentic,¹ which hints at what was mentioned above. The text of this tradition is as follows:

“The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: When Adam committed the error, he prayed: O Lord, I call You by the right of Muhammad, please forgive me. Almighty Allah said: O Adam, how can you recognize Muhammad, whereas I have not yet created him? He replied: My Lord, when You created me with Your hand and blew Your spirit into me, I raised my head and saw written on the foreleg of the Throne: There is no god, except Allah; Muhammad is messenger of Allah; and I knew that You do not bring anyone near to You name, except if he is the most proximate of Your creatures. Allah said: You are right, Adam; he is the most beloved of My creatures. Call me through his sake, in order that I may forgive you; and if Muhammad were not there, I would not have created you.”

Baihaqi has mentioned this tradition in *Dalailun Nabuwwah*,² and it is the book, regarding which Dhahabi has said:

“I recommend this book, as it is entirely effulgence and guidance.”

We mentioned this in brief, so that readers become aware of the absurdity of the statement of Ibne Taymiyyah and his followers, like Qaseemi and that they become aware of the excellence of Prophet.

Introduction to the poet

His full name was Nizamuddin Muhammad bin Qaaziul Quzzaat Ishaq bin Mazhar Isfahani; he was among senior Shia scholars of literature and possessed great expertise in fields of knowledge. He was the chief judge in Iraq. His biography is mentioned in *Majalisul Momineen*³ and it is mentioned in *Tarikh Adaabul Lughat*⁴ that died in the year, 678 A.H.

63. Shamsuddin Mahfuz

Died: Around 690 A.H.

1. They are pure, chaste, ardent worshippers and noble and chosen personages. 2. Among them is Ali from the Batha, a Hashemite in lineage, who possessed a sharp mind and an eloquent tongue, when the voices were raised. 3. He is the chief (introduced) in Ghadeer and the brother of the effulgent giver of glad tidings, that is the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). He is the one, for whom there are divine verses. 4. His ancestors were pure and chaste and in the same way, his descendants are also immaculate. 5. Can those, who describe him, encompass all his merits whereas only to mention him is his eulogy.

¹ Mustadrak Alas Saheehain, [2/672, H. 4228].

² Dalailun Nabuwwah, [5/489].

³ Majaalesul Momineen, 226 [1/543].

⁴ Tareekh Adaabul Lughat, Jurji Zaidan, 3:13 [No. 14/415].

Introduction to the poet

His name was Shaykh Shamsuddin Mahfuz bin Washah bin Muhammad Abu Muhammad Hilli Asadi. He was among pivots of jurisprudence and accomplished in knowledge and literature. He was leader of religion, final point of reference in legal problems and ultimate refuge for helpless. He delivered judgments on cases involving law and order. He had license to practice law from Shaykh Najmuddin Muhaqqiq Hilli (d. 667 A.H.).

We were unable to find the actual dates of his birth and death, but we are certain that he was alive till 680 A.H. and Allamah Samawi has estimated his death to be close to the year 690 A.H.

The Mahdūz clan lives Syria and Iraq and biographies of important personalities of this family can be found in books of *Takmilatul Amalul Amal*¹ of Sadr Kazmi and *Wafiyatul Aalaam*² of our teacher, Razi, author of *Zaria*.

64. Bahaudin Irbili

Died: 692/693 A.H.

تقضى. مجد و اعتلاء منار

واسأل بضم ع لاء فاء ها

“In Ghadeer Khum, ask about the loftiness of his rank, as it judges his status and high position. Every sinner is hopeful of salvation through his Mastership (*Wilayat*) and his greater sins are washed off.”³

Introduction to the poet

Bahauddin Abul Hasan Ali bin Fakhrudin Isa bin Abul Fatah Irbili was a resident of Baghdad and after his passing away, was buried there only. He was an incomparable person of community and a scholar of rare talent of the seventh century for poetry and literature. It was through his literary accomplishments that he gifted gems of Arabic poetry and excellent verses.

In addition to that he was also a diplomat and a politician entrusted with the post of ministership and he served this position excellently.⁴ Vacancies of jurisprudence, tradition and religion were filled by him and his book: *Kashful Ghumma* is a fine work, which comprises of the history of Imams enumerating their merits, defending them and calling people to them.⁵ Some of his teachers of traditions are as follows:

1. Sayyid Raziuddin Jamilul Millat, Sayyid Ali bin Tawus (d. 664 A.H.).

¹ *Takmilatul Amalul Amal*, [Pg. 331].

² *Wafiyatul Aalaam*, [3/979, No. 6412].

³ *Kashful Ghumma*, 78 [1/274].

⁴ The author of *Riyazul Jannah* in Rauza 4. Though Allamah Amini has also stated that Irbili acquired the post of ministership some sources do not believe it to be as such: for example: Ref: Preface to the book of *Kashful Ghumma*, 1/7-8.

⁵ His biography is mentioned in *Amalul Amal* [2/195, No. 588]; *Al-Kuna wal Alqab* [2/18]; *Rauzatul Jannat* [4/341].

2. Hafiz Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Yusuf bin Muhammad Ganji Shafei (d. 658 A.H.).

Some senior Shia and Sunni narrated traditional reports from him; among them being:

1. Jamaluddin Allamah Hilli Hasan bin Yusuf bin Mutahhar.

2. Shaykh Raziuddin Ali bin Mutahhar.

3. Shaykh Sharafuddin Ahmad bin Uthman Nasibi; jurisprudent and teacher of Maliki school.

Poets of Ghadeer in the eighth century Hijri

- 65. Abu Muhammad bin Dawood Hilli
- 66. Jamaluddin Khaliee
- 67. Sariji Awali
- 68. Safiuddin Hilli
- 69. Imam Shaibani Shafei
- 70. Shamsuddin Maliki
- 71. Alauddin Hilli

65. Abu Muhammad bin Dawood Hilli

Born 647 A.H.

“When you hear the address of Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) on the day of Ghadeer, as he occupied his seat: Of whomsoever I am the master, this Haider is (also) his master; and no sane person has any doubt about it. Then you will understand the clarification of Mustafa about Caliphate after him. It is such a clarification that there is no need of any more explanation.”¹

Introduction to the poet

Taqiuddin Abu Muhammad Hasan bin Ali bin Dawood Hilli was an expert in jurisprudence, traditions, science of narrators (*Ilme Rijal*), Arabic and other sciences. There is no dispute that he was a member of this incomparable delivered sect and from among its distinguished scholars. Dictionaries of poets and authors have extolled him. Although some have issued statements according to the reliability of his famous book of narrators of traditions. Some have relied on it.² Some of them have diverged from it,³ but the best conduct is moderation and the middle path. This is the viewpoint of most of our scholars that reliance is placed on this book as well, like other books of narrators of traditions and in some instances, criticism are also leveled against it.

As for poetry: His lofty aims impelled him to compose couplets.

He was born on 5th Jamadius Thani, year 647 A.H. and obtained his education from Sayyid Hujjat Abul Fadhl Ahmad bin Tawus Hilli (d. 673 A.H.) and he narrated traditions from him and some other scholars, among them being:

1. Muhaqqiq Najmuddin Ja’far bin Hasan Hilli (d. 676 A.H.). He was one of his teachers of recitation of Quran.
2. Shaykh Najibuddin Abu Zakariya Yahya bin Saeed Hilli (d. 698 A.H.). He was the cousin of the above mentioned scholar.
3. The great philosopher, Khwaja Nasiruddin Tusi (d. 672 A.H.).

A number of Shia teachers have narrated traditions from him, among them being Shaykh Raziuddin Abul Hasan Ali bin Ahmad Mazeedi Hilli (d. 757 A.H.) and so on.

His valuable writings

In his book of narrators of traditions, he has enumerated his own valuable writings.⁴

We do not know the exact date of his death. We only know that he completed his book of narrators of traditions in the year 707 A.H. when he was

¹ *Ayanush Shia*, 22:343 [5/191].

² Like Shaykh Husain bin Abdul Samad, father of Shaykh Bahai in the book of *Daraya*.

³ Like Shaykh Abdullah Shustari in *Sharh Tahzeeb* in the explanation of first tradition.

⁴ Ref: *Al-Zaria*, 17/155.

sixty years old. [In the same way, we know] that he was alive in the year 741 A.H. and at that time, he was aged 94 years.

66. Jamaluddin Khalai

Died: 750 A.H.

1. What a nice day is the day of Ghadeer, a day of celebration and joy.
2. When Mustafa selected the best chief after himself. 3. When he said: He is my successor during my absence and presence. 4. And he is my helper and supporter, and my vizier and assistant. 5. And he is the ruler after me on the basis of illuminated Quran. 6. He is one, whom Almighty Allah granted knowledge of every age. 7. He is one, whose obedience is obligatory for people of his time. 8. So obey him in order that you may obtain the best of treasures. 9. They responded while concealing their malice. 10. By accepting his statement, they offered congratulations. 11. O chief of the bees (leader of the community) and O one, whose friendship is tied to my conscience.¹ 12. He is the one, who gives me refuge from scorching fire. 13. He is one, whose praise is a source of affection as long as I am alive. 14. He is the one, who would convey me to Paradise on Judgment Day. 15. I have made my affections sincere for you; O owner of widespread and pouring knowledge. 16. My curse for one, who is inimical to you. 17. Convey your loyalists Khaliee to the sweet waters on the day of rising. 18. To declare immunity towards God Almighty from every thanklessness.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Hasan Jamaluddin Ali bin Abdul Aziz Abu Muhammad Khalai – Khalii – Mosuli Hilli was a powerful poet of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and he composed exceeding couplets in their favor with maximum possible eloquence. His collected poems are solely in praise and glorification of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). He was an accomplished man and a versatile artist. He possessed an elegant and a powerful rhetoric, and subtle, flowing verses.

He was a native of Hilla and passed away in the year 750 A.H. and was buried there only and his grave is well known in that area. Both his parents were Ahle Bayt haters (*Nasibi*). Qaazi Shustari in *Majalisul Momineen*² and Zanuzi in *Riyazul Jannah*, in the first Rauza, writes:

“His mother made a vow that if she got a male child, they would make him a highway robber to waylay visitors (*Zaireen*) to the tomb of Imam Husain (a.s.). When they had a male child and he reached maturity, his mother sent him as she had vowed. When he reached near Kerbala, he waited for visitors, but he had a dream: that caravans were passing and had covered him in dust. Then the last judgment was held and it was ordered for him to be thrown into Hell. But due to the pure dust that had settled on his body, the fire of Hell was not able to

¹ Alluding to the statement of the Prophet about Ali (a.s.).

² Majaalesul Momineen, 463 [2/555].

penetrate to his body. When he woke up, he changed his intention and became a loyalist of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). For a long time, he continued to reside in Kerbala.

It is said that during that time, he composed two lines of poetry, which were modified into *Mukhammas*¹ by the contemporary poet Hajj Mahdi Faluji Hilli (d. 1357). They are as follows:

1. I see you in distress that profligacy has clearly surrounded your being and carnal desires have overtaken you. 2. Thus, may your heart be tranquil and your eyes pleased, and if you want to get salvation and perform the Ziyarat of Imam Husain (a.s.), so that you meet Almighty Allah in happiness. 3. If the angels see that you intend to perform Ziyarat of His Eminence, they would record you among the visitors. 4. And definitely Hell would become unlawful upon you, because fire of Hell does not reach the body on which dust of the visitors Imam Husain (a.s.) settles.

He was absolutely sincere in his affections; so much so that he was given a special bestowal by Ahle Bayt (a.s.). In *Darus Salam*,² it is narrated from *Hablul Mateen* of Maulana Muhammad Gilani that:

“There was a competition between him and Ibne Hammad,³ another poet, as to which of them was a better poet regarding Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). Each of them wrote a Qasida and placed a copy in the Sarcophagus of Imam Ali (a.s.), so that Imam himself may adjudge. Thus, the Qasida of Khalii was chosen and it was inscribed upon it in gold water: Good and on the Qasida of Ibne Hammad, it was mentioned with silver water: Good. Ibne Hammad was disappointed and he said to Ali (a.s.): I am your old loyalist and this man is your recent follower. Later he saw Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in dream, who said: You are from us and he has freshly entered our fold and it was necessary to give concession to him.”

67. Sariji Awali⁴

Died: Around 750 A.H.

1. In Ghadeer, when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) exposed his merits so that the ridiculing enemies may be degraded. 2. when he said: Of whomsoever I am the master, then you are (also) his master as Almighty Allah guides every bewildered one through you. 3. You are in relation to me as Harun was to Moosa, except that there is no Prophet after me. 4. He is one, whose birth place is in the sanctuary of Beneficent and He has kept him secure from every kind of fear, harm and enmity.

¹ Poem having five line verses.

² *Darus Salam*, 183 [Pg. 59-60].

³ Ali bin Husain bin Hammad Laithi Wasti is a poet loyal to Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and we have found a large number of his verses in praise of the Holy Family.

⁴ Attributed to Ual, an island in Bahrain, which is surrounded by water. *Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 1/274.

Explanation of the couplets

In the last verse, the poet has hinted at the birth of Imam Ali (a.s.) in the Holy Kaaba: that the wall of the Kaaba split for his mother, Fatima binte Asad and she entered and the wall again closed. She remained inside the Kaaba till Ali (a.s.) was born. A child, who was the cause of honor for the Kaaba. He consumed fruits of Paradise and the shell of the Kaaba did not separate from its pearl, except that it filled the world with effulgence of his face and spread his fragrance in the atmosphere.

It is a reality, on which Shia and Sunni have consensus and an exceeding number of traditions prove this point and books are teeming with this fact. From this aspect, after the clarification of some important Shia and Sunni upon the excessive narration of tradition of this excellence, also I don't accord any importance to statements of those, for whom there is no difference, whether what they say is right or wrong.

Hakeem says in *Mustadrak*:¹

“Widely narrated traditional reports exist that Fatima binte Asad gave birth to Ameerul Momineen, Ali Ibne Abi Talib Karramallahu Wajhu inside the Holy Kaaba.”

Hafiz Ganji Shafei says in *Kifayatut Talib*² upon the authority of Ibne Najjar from Hakeem Nishapuri:

“Ameerul Momineen Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) was born in Kaaba on Thursday, 13th Rajab in the 30th year of the elephant (Amul feel) and other than him, no one else is born in Kaaba and it is a singular excellence for him.”

Shahabuddin Sayyid Mahmud Alusi, author of the great *Tafseer*, says in the book of *Sarahul Kharida al-Ghaibah*,³ which is exegesis of Qasida of Abdul Baqi Afandi Umri, under the verse:

بِطْنِ مَكَّةِ عَنِ الْبَيْتِ أَذْوَاضَعَا
أَنْتَ الْعَلِيُّ الَّذِي فَوْقَ الْعَلِيِّ رَفِعَا

“You have such a lofty rank that you are raised to the highest rank; when you came into the world in the Kaaba in Mecca.”

He writes: “The birth of the Amir – Karramallahu Wajhu – in Kaaba, is well known and it is mentioned in books: Shia and Sunni and no one else other than him was born in that manner. On no one else is there consensus that he was born in Kaaba. How worthy is the Imam of the Imams that his birth place should be the prayer direction (*Qibla*) of believers. Glory be to Allah, who placed the things in their proper places and He is the best of the judges.

Mulla Sayyid Reza Hindi as hinted at this through the following lines:⁴

¹ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:483 [3/550, H. 6044].

² *Kifayatut Talib*, [Pg. 407].

³ *Sarahul Kharida al-Ghaibah*, 15.

⁴ *Diwan*, Sayyid Reza Hindi, 25.

“When Almighty Allah invited you from the antiquity to take birth in the Kaaba, you harkened to His call. You thanked him among the Quraish by purifying the House of Allah from idols.”

The reader would find consensus on this excellence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in numerous Ahle Sunnat books.¹ As for the Shia; a large number of them have mentioned this incident² and numerous Shia scholars and poets have versified this event.

Introduction to the poet

His name was Sayyid Abdul Aziz bin Muhammad bin Hasan bin Abi Nasr Husaini Sariji Awali. Allamah Samawi has mentioned his biography in *At-Taliya min Shuaraush Shia* and remarked:

“He was an accomplished person, a littérateur and composed excellent and eloquent verses. He passed away in Basra in 750 A.H.”

68. Safiuddin Hilli

Born 677 A.H.

Died: 752 A.H.

تفرّغ المعاد و اهواهه	توالٰ علیاً و ابناوه
بنص النبی و اقواله	امام له عقد يوم الغدیر
مقام يخبر عن حاله	له في التشهد بعد الصلاة
و ذکر النبی سوی آلہ	فهل بعذ کر الہ السما

1. Be affectionate to Ali and his descendants, so that you may get relief on Judgment Day and in terrifying situations, 2. he is an Imam, for whom pledge was taken on Ghadeer day at the clarification and statement of Prophet. 3. There is a place for him in *Tasha-hud* at the end of the ritual prayers, which informs of his condition. 4. Is anyone other than him mentioned after the name of God and Prophet?³

Introduction to the poet

Safiuddin Abdul Aziz bin Saraya bin Ali bin Abdul Qasim bin Ahmad bin Nasr bin Abdul Aziz bin Saraya bin Baqi Abdullah bin Areez Hilli Tai Sambasi was from Bani Sambas tribe, a branch of Tai. He was one of the best poets of

¹ Ref: *Muruju Zahab*, Masudi, 2:2 [2/366]; *Tadkiratul Khawas*, Ibne Jauzi Hanafi, 7 [Pg. 10]; *Al-Fusoolul Muhimma*, Ibne Sabbagh Maliki, 14 [Pg. 29]; *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 1:150 [1/139]; *Miftahul Najah fee Manaqib Aale Aba*, Mirza Muhammad Badakhshi, [Pg. 18, Chap. 3, Part 1].

² Ref: *Safinatul Biharul*, 2:229 [6/375-376].

³ This couplet is mentioned on page 22 in his *Diwan* and in another edition it is mentioned on page 58 [Pg. 90].

Arabs, whose poetry had firmness of words, subtlety of meaning, lightness of beauty, and consistency. He commanded precedence over others. All dictionaries have consensus¹ that he was born in Baghdad in 677 A.H., but there is dispute whether he passed away in 750 or 752 A.H.

69. Imam Shaibani Shafei

Born 703 A.H.

Died: 777 A.H.

1. Don't forget the son-in-law and cousin of Mustafa, as he was an ocean of knowledge and was divinely assisted. 2. Truly, he sacrificed himself on the prophet, the night he slept in his bed. 3. Of whomsoever the Prophet is the master, Ali is also his master and a helper of truth. 4. And don't forget the other companions, Ahle Bayt (a.s.), friends and followers of guidance of His Eminence.

Explanation of the couplets

These verse are selected from a long Qasida comprising of a thousand verses and it has been published. Its poet, Imam Abu Abdullah Muhammad Shaibani Shafei, author of *Kashfuz Zunoon*,² has attributed this Qasida to him. Some senior Shafei scholars have explained its meaning.

Introduction to the poet

Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Abu Bakr bin Araam bin Ibrahim bin Yasin bin Abdul Qasim bin Muhammad Rabai Shaibani Aswani Iskandarani Shafei Taqiuddin Abu Abdullaah was an imam, traditionist, jurist and Mufti of Ahle Sunnat. He was born in 703 A.H. and passed away in 777 A.H. His biography is mentioned in *Shazaratuz Zahab*.³

70. Shamsuddin Maliki

Died: 780 A.H.

1. Indeed Ali was the sword of Prophet, having a lofty rank of His Eminence, such that majesty and greatness got loftiness through him. 2. Son-in-law and cousin of the chosen Prophet and father of Hasan and Husain, who possessed every distinction. 3. The Lord of heavens performed his marriage in the heavens and sufficient for you is the marriage, which began at the Arsh. 4. The best of ladies of Paradise, with illuminated countenance and leadership, which would make you needless of the leadership of everyone else. 5. They lived while the embellishment of those two was dress of piety and they sacrificed their own shares to whoever requested for

¹ Ref: *Majaalesul Momineen*, 471 [2/576].

² *Kashfuz Zunoon*, [2/1340].

³ *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 6:252 [8/436, Events of the year 777 A.H.]; and refer *Ad-Durarul Kamina*, Ibne Hajar Asqalani, 3:373 [No. 986].

charity. 6. Gardens of Paradise gave offering of its beauty upon the piety of those two. 7. It caused no harm to one, who sleeps in woolen garments and tomorrow on Judgment Day will be dressed in luxurious apparels. 8. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: I am city of knowledge and he is its gate and whoever seeks knowledge should enter through the door. 9. Of whomsoever I am the master, Ali is (also) his guardian (*Wali*) and master. Then aim for the love of your master, so that you may be guided. 10. You are from me, as Harun was to Moosa, except that you are not a Prophet. It is sufficient for you, so thank God. 11. He was the first child, who embraced faith and no one got precedence over him.¹ 12. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), while he expressed his approval, came to him while he was away from Zahra. 13. So he dusted his clothes and rose up while he preferred solitude. 14. Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said in a soft tone: Arise, O Abu Turab. And this was a statement of an affectionate and sincere person. 15. Mustafa remarked about his two sons: They are chiefs of abode of success. 16. The Prophet sent him as a missionary and entrusted only him for this task. 17. He said: Is there anyone eligible to propagate my message other than Ahle Bayt (a.s.)? So follow him. 18. Abdullah replied to one, who constantly inquired about rightfulness of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). 19. Note, where is the house of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and house of Ali. Recognize him, so that you may testify to his rightfulness. 20. Ali kept fasts all the time and always remembered Almighty Allah. He rose up with truth and was always in worship. 21. He was content with his share in the world and when material wealth inclined to him, he distanced himself from it and practiced piety. 22. Ali divorced the world three times and when he saw that the world was coming towards him, he said: O world, keep away from Ali. 23. In the world, he was nearest to the truth and all were owners of truth, but he was most proximate to guidance.

After describing the merits of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), he mentions Imam Hasan and Imam Husain (a.s.) and says:

“On Judgment Day, when I become alone, I will seek mediation of my chiefs, Hasnain and their grandfather. Hasan and Husain are the light of the eyes of Prophet and chiefs of everlasting Paradise. The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: Hasan and Husain are my two blossoms. I love those, who love them. So indeed be affectionate to them that you may be successful.”

Till he says:

1. Husain is such a valiant one that he attacks even when warriors get exhausted in the battle. 2. He is the facsimile of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) in battle and charity and he is the best of martyrs, who tasted the sword. 3. Eyes weep for his fall into dust and recompense of these eyes is upon

¹ Refer to the discussion about the Islam of Imam Ali (a.s.) at a young age in order to get the actual import of these words; that he embraced Islam at a tender age. Such that no one had precedence over him in this matter.

Almighty Allah, due to his sincerity and love. 4. So Yazid and Shimr, and whoever treads this degraded path, is away from divine mercy.

Explanation of couplets

Our poet, Shamsuddin Maliki has hinted at some merits of our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in these lines, which leaders and tradition scholars of Ahle Sunnat have narrated from Prophet in their books. They are as follows:

1. Tradition of the marriage of Imam Ali (a.s.) with Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) upon the command of Almighty Allah and dispersal of embellishments from Paradise for this blessed marriage was mentioned in these lines.¹

2. Tradition of I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate. We mentioned before this,² regarding knowledge of Imam Ali (a.s.) and there we hinted that Tabari, Ibne Moin, Hakeem, Khatib, Suyuti etc. have regarded this tradition authentic. Now, we shall discuss this in detail and show that this tradition is recorded by a large number of scholars of traditions.

In *Al-Ghadeer*, the late Allamah Hilli has mentioned 143 scholars from 1306 writers listed in *Abaqatul Anwar* of Mir Hamid Husain Musawi Lakhnavi (1306), who have quoted this tradition:

1. Founder of Hanbali school, Ahmad bin Hanbal (d. 241 A.H.). He has mentioned this tradition in his book of *Fazail Ali*.³

2. Hafiz Abu Isa Muhammad Tirmizi (d. 279 A.H.): He has mentioned this tradition in his *Sunan*.⁴

3. Hafiz Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari (d. 310 A.H.). He has quoted this tradition in *Tahzibul Aathar* and has deemed it to be authentic; and numerous Ahle Sunnat scholar have narrated this traditional report from him.⁵

4. Abul Qasim Zamakhshari (d. 538 A.H.). In *Al-Faqi*, he has dedicated a chapter to this report and entitled it: City of Knowledge (*Medinatul Ilm*).⁶

5. Hafiz Abu Abdullah Muhammad bin Yusuf Ganji Shafei (d. 658 A.H.). He has mentioned this tradition through a number of authorities in his *Kifaya*,⁷ after which he remarks:

We say: This tradition is good and exalted...and in this manner scholars from companions and companions of companions and his Ahle Bayt have accepted the excellence of Ali (a.s.) due his exceeding knowledge, perception and extensive wisdom and good administration and correctness of verdicts; and

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 215-216.

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 281-283.

³ *Fazail Ali*, [Pg. 138, H. 203].

⁴ *Sunan Tirmizi*, [Pg. 5/596, H. 3723, with the words: "I am the abode of wisdom..." also refer *Jaameul Usul*, 9/473, Tradition. 6489].

⁵ *Tahzeebul Aathar*, [Pg. 105, No. 173 from the *Musnad Ali (a.s.)*].

⁶ *Al-Faqi*, 1:28 [2/36].

⁷ *Kifayatut Talib*, 98-102 [Pg. 220, 222 & 223, Chap. 58].

indeed Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and other scholars from companions sought his counsel regarding practical laws of Islam and derived Islamic laws through his statements, and according to their confession he possessed knowledge, merits, inclination to knowledge, perception and correctness of verdicts.

This tradition is not an exaggeration; because his rank near Allah, Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and believers is more exalted than this.

6. Shahabuddin Abul Fazl Ahmad bin Ali, famous as Ibne Hajar Asqalani (d. 852 A.H.).

He has mentioned this tradition in *Tahzeeb*¹ and in *Lesaanul Meezaan*,² he says:

“This tradition is narrated through many authorities in *Mustadrak Hakeem*³ and at least, it should be said that it has a base and it is not proper to consider it spurious.”

7. Hafiz Jalaluddin Abdur Rahman bin Kamaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.). He has quoted this tradition in *Jamius Saghir*⁴ and in his numerous other writings and in most of them, he has deemed it to be good. In *Jamaul Jawame* he has declared that it is authentic.⁵

8. Shahabuddin Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Hajar Haithami Makki (d. 974 A.H.). He has included this tradition in *Sawaiq*.⁶

Text of the Tradition

1. It is narrated from Harth and Asim directly from Imam Ali (a.s.) from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said:

“Almighty Allah created Ali and I from a single tree. A tree, of which I am the root and Ali is its branch and Hasan and Husain are its fruits and the Shia are its leaves. Verily does anything, but the pure emerges from pure. I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate. Thus, whoever wants to enter the city, should enter through the gate.”

In the report of Huzaifah from Imam Ali (a.s.), it is narrated that: “I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate and they do not enter the city, except through its gate.”

In another report, it is narrated from Imam Ali (a.s.) that the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to him: “I am the city of knowledge and you are its gate. He has lied, who thinks that he can enter the city, except through its gate.”

In another report, it is narrated from Imam Ali (a.s.) that the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said to him: “I am the city of knowledge and you are its gate. He has

¹ Tahzeebut Tahzeeb, 7:337 [7/296].

² *Lesaanul Mizan*, [2/155, No. 2034].

³ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, [3:137, H. 4637-4638, Pg. 138; Tradition. 4639].

⁴ *Jamius Saghir*, 1:347 [1/415, H. 2705].

⁵ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:401 [13/148, H. 36463, 36464].

⁶ *Sawaiqul Mohriqa*, Ibne Hajar: 73 [Pg. 122].

lied, who thinks that he can enter the city, except through its gate; and Almighty Allah says:

وَأَنْتُ الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا

“And go into the houses by their doors.”¹

2. It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“I am the city of knowledge and you are its gate. So whoever wants knowledge, should enter from the gate of knowledge.”

In a report from Saeed bin Jubair, it is narrated from Ibne Abbas that the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

“O Ali, I am the city of knowledge and you are its gate and none can enter the city, except through its gate.”

3. It is narrated from Jabir bin Abdullah that:

During Hudaibiyya, I heard from Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that he said while holding the hand of Ali (a.s.): “This one is the chief of the righteous and eliminator of the wicked. One, who supports him will be assisted and whoever deserts him, will be abandoned.” Then he raised his voice and said: “I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate. Thus, whoever wants to enter the house, should enter through its door.”

In another traditional report, it is narrated from Jabir:

“I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate. Thus, whoever intends knowledge should come towards it.”

There are other tradition as well, which scholars have mentioned in their valuable writings and which strengthen the authenticity of this tradition; among them being:

1. “I am the city of wisdom and Ali is its gate.”²
2. “I am the city of knowledge and Ali is its gate.”³
3. “I am the criterion of knowledge and Ali is its pans.”⁴
4. “I am the city of criterion (balance) and Ali is its pan.”⁵
5. “I am the city of knowledge and you are its gate. None enters the city,

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:189

² Tirmizi has quoted this tradition in his *Jamius Saheeh*, 2:214 [Tr. 3723]; and a number of scholars of traditions who number more than sixty.

³ This tradition is quoted by Baghawi in *Masabihus Sunnah*, as Tabari in his *Zakhaerul Uqbah*: 77 and others have also mentioned it.

⁴ This tradition is quoted by Dailami directly from Ibne Abbas in *Firdosul Akhbar*,]1/44, H. 107]; and a number of scholars have followed Dailami in quoting this tradition: like Ajluni in *Kashful Khifa*, 1:204 [Tr. 618] and others.

⁵ Ghazzali has quoted this tradition in *Risala Aqaliya*, and Mibdhi has quoted from in the exegesis of the *Diwan* attributed to him, [Pg. 3].

except through its gate.”¹

6. “He is gate of the city of my knowledge.”²

7. “Ali is my brother and he is from me and I am from Ali and he is the gate of my knowledge and my successor.”

8. “Ali is gate of my knowledge and after me, he would explain whatever I am commissioned with.”³

9. “You are the gate of my knowledge.”

He issued this statement in tradition addressed to Imam Ali (a.s.). This tradition is quoted by Kharkoshi, Abu Nuaim, Dailami, Khwarizmi, Abul Alaa Hamadani, Abu Hamid Salihat, Abu Abdullah Ganji, Sayyid Shahabuddin, author of *Tauzeehud Dalail*, and Qunduzi.

10. “O Umme Salma, be a witness and listen carefully: This Ali is the chief of believers, leader of Muslims, treasurer of my knowledge and the gate of my wisdom, towards which one must aim.”

This tradition is quoted from Abu Nuaim, Khwarizmi in *Manaqib*,⁴ Rafei in *Al-Tadween*,⁵ Ganji in *Manaqib*,⁶ Hamawaini in *Faraidus Simtain*⁷ and so on.

Shaykh Muhammad Hafni says in gloss on Azizi:⁸ “The term of ‘Aiba’ in the tradition means the vessel of my knowledge, whose protector Ali is, because Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was the city of knowledge. From this aspect the companions needed him in difficult problems. Therefore our chief, Muawiyah, always during that incident [probably in the Battle of Siffreen] asked Imam Ali (a.s.) about difficult matters and His Eminence (a.s.) replied. Thus the supporters of Ali (a.s.) asked: Why are you replying to our enemy? He replied: Is it not sufficient for you that he is needful of me? And during the period of our chief, Umar also, he (Ali) solved problems and Umar remarked: O God, don’t keep me alive when Abu Hasan is not present...”

Manawi has written in *Faizul Qadeer*:⁹ “Ali is the vessel of my knowledge: that is it seems that Ali would solve the difficulties of my statements from my Ummah; he is my special one, the abode of my secrets and mine of my precious things. And vessel is something in which, one stores his precious belongings.”

¹ Asimi has quoted this report in his book, *Zainul Fata fee Sharh Surah Hal Ataa*.

² Faqih Ibne Maghazili has mentioned this report in *Manaqib Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.)*, [50, H. 73]; Abul Moayyad Khwarizmi [In *Manaqib*, 129, H. 143]; Qunduzi in *Yanabi*, 71 [1/69, Chap. 14].

³ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:156 [11/614, H. 32981]; *Kitabul Qaulal Jali fee Fazaael Ali*, Suyuti, who has placed it as number 38.

⁴ *Manaqib*, [Pg. 142, H. 163].

⁵ *Al-Tadween fee Akhbar Qazween*, [1/89].

⁶ *Kifayatut Talib*, Pg. 198, Chap. 48.

⁷ *Faraaezus Simtain*, [1/150, H. 113, Chap. 29].

⁸ Hashiya Al-Hafni Alaa Jamius Saghir, 2:417 [2/458].

⁹ *Faizul Qadeer*, 4:356.

Ibne Duraid says:¹ “This is the gist of the statement of Prophet and such a proverb is unprecedented. This proverb shows that only Ali (a.s.) was informed about the secret matters through the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), about which others were unaware. This is the peak of praise for Ali and indeed the consciences of his enemies were filled with belief in his greatness.”

It is mentioned in *Sharh Hamziya* that:² “Muawiyah often sent messengers to Ali (a.s.) inquiring about difficult problems and Ali (a.s.) replied to him. A son of Imam Ali (a.s.) asked: ‘You are replying to your enemy?’ He replied: ‘Is it not sufficient for us that he is needful of us?’”

11. “I am the city of jurisprudence and Ali is its gate.” Abu Muzaffar Sibte Ibne Jauzi has quoted this in *Tadkira*.³

¹ Jamharatul Lughat [1/369].

² *Sharh Hamziya*, [Pg. 192].

³ *Tadkira Khawasul Ummah*; 29 [Pg. 48].

The longer you live, the times show more wonders to you

What can be said about one, who regards himself a jurist of Islam, and before a large number of traditions including the authentic and good, and also statements of companions and the consensus of Islamic Ummah, decides that Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) is the heir of knowledge of Prophet and inspite of all this, he overlooks all and believes that there is someone more knowledgeable than Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in the Islamic Ummah from companions, even in this age!

What shall I say regarding one, who writes a book full of slanderous and repulsive matter and entitles its *Washia*, who does not pay attention to the repercussions of his behavior and cares not that he would be exposed and evil of his act would be known to all?

On the contrary, he has spoiled the reputation of those to whom he mentioned this. By writing this book, has exposed their own defects. Such that critics remove the veil from his false statement and show to all that he was the most dishonest writers of all times.

He says: "Umar was intelligent and knowledgeable person of his time. He more learned than others as far as subjects of Quran and Sunnah were concerned. In all his actions, throughout his life, he acted according to Quran and Sunnah. He was aware of the position of prophetic traditions and understood the meanings of Quran."

We have chosen the following four foolish and meaningless statements of this man from the part entitled: The rightly guided Caliphate.

However, what has come in majority of books does not support his view and authentic history guides us to numerous instances that this person has turned away from it. What is mentioned in this history takes us at distance from east to the west from his view. History repeats for us the statement of Caliph, which he says behind the curtain: That everyone, including ladies behind veils, are more knowledgeable than Umar.

Now, I present writings and evidences to those, who are in pursuit of truth, so that the reality is exposed.

Masterpieces of Umar's knowledge

Following are only some of examples of the supposed knowledgeability of Umar as it was not possible for us to mention all instances present in Islamic history and books of traditional reports:

1. View point of Caliph regarding one, who has no water for ablution

In his *Saheeh*, Muslim, in the chapter of Dry Ablution (*Tayammum*),¹ has narrated through four chains of narrators from Abdur Rahman bin Abza that:

“Abdul Rahman bin Abza narrated it on the authority of his father that a man came to Umar and said: I am (at times) affected by seminal emission but find no water. He (Umar) told him not to pray. Ammaar then said. Do you remember, O Commander of Faithful, when I and you were in a military detachment and we had a seminal emission and did not find water (for taking bath) and you did not say prayer, but as for myself I rolled in dust and said prayer, and (when it was mentioned before) the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: It was enough for you to strike the ground with your hands and then blow (the dust) and then wipe your face and palms. Umar said: Ammaar, fear Allah. He said: If you so like, I would not narrate it.”

Distortion in this report

Bukhari in his *Saheeh*² has mentioned this tradition in the chapter of “Can Tayammum be done after hitting hands on dust and to blow at them?” and in the chapters after that, he has narrated this report, but wanted to save the honor of the Caliph by editing the report by omitting the statement of Umar: ‘Don’t pray’ or ‘if I was there, I would not pray’, unaware of the fact that in that case the statement of Ammaar in the continuation of tradition would become incoherent.

Dhahabi has quoted this same tradition in its distorted form in his *Tadkira*, after that he says:

“Some have said how it is possible that Ammaar should issue such a statement and it was lawful for him to conceal his knowledge?” The reply is that such a statement is not implication of concealing knowledge, since he narrated this tradition at the end thanks be to God, it has reached us and he has narrated this tradition in the gathering of chief of believers. By this, Ammaar has done a favor to Umar; since he knows that Umar prohibited excessive narration of traditions fearing mistake in quoting and the people getting involved with

¹ *Saheeh Muslim*, [1/355, H. 112]; *Kitabul Haiz*; *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:265 [5/329, H. 1786].

² *Saheeh Bukhari*, [1/129, H. 331].

traditions more than Quran.

Allamah Amini says: There is an important point here that such incoherent statements misguide one from the aim and keep events concealed from people rather than inform them of the actual events, which occurred in history. Alas, if I only knew what made them oblivious from the statement of Umar that: ‘don’t pray’ or ‘I don’t pray’, whereas he regarded himself as chief of believers and solution of the problem is simple; and this problem is common.

What has made them oblivious of his statement to Ammaar: “Fear Allah, O Ammaar”; and his not praying on the day he became ritually polluted, and that also after Islam has brought ablution, ritual bath and dry ablution (*Tayammum*)?

What caused them to overlook his ignorance of the verse of dry ablution (*Tayammum*) and command of Holy Quran and his overlooking teachings of Prophet regarding method of dry ablution (*Tayammum*), and they concentrate on the method of dry ablution (*Tayammum*) explained by Ammaar? What caused them to overlook these issues and become busy with statement of Ammaar! Yes, love is indeed blind!

وَمَنْ كَانَ فِي هَذِهِ أَعْمَى فَهُوَ فِي الْآخِرَةِ أَعْمَى وَأَضَلُّ سَبِيلًا^④

“And whoever is blind in this, he shall (also) be blind in the hereafter; and more erring from the way.”¹

It is known from statements of Aini in *Umdatul Qari*² and Ibne Hajar in *Fathul Bari*³ that these two statements of Umar⁴ are regarded as his view on this matter and were part of the traditional report; that is why Aini says:

“It is mentioned in the report that Umar did not believe that a ritually impure person should perform Tayammum, because Ammaar asked: Did you not pray? And Umar regarded Tayammum to be the replacement of minor impurity and the result of his deduction was that a ritually impure person (*Junub*) cannot perform Tayammum.”

Ibne Hajar says: “This is well known opinion of Umar.”

This tradition removes the veil from the fact that this deduction of Umar was performed during the lifetime of Prophet; and it is a strange statement that time has seen and heard.

Should this person, after opposition of Ammaar and his rolling in the dust, not have asked the Prophet (s.a.w.a.)?

And what Bukhari in his *Saheeh*⁵ has narrated from Imran bin Husain

¹ Surah Isra 17:72

² *Umdatul Qari*, 2:172 [4/18-19].

³ *Fathul Bari*, 1:352 [1/443].

⁴ That is the statement of Umar: ‘do not pray’ and his words: ‘I had been there I would not have prayed till I found water’.

⁵ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 1:129 [1/134, H. 341]; *Saheeh Muslim*, [2/131, Tradition. 312, Kitabul Masajid].

remained concealed from Caliph: The Prophet saw a man waiting at the side and not praying and asked him: "O man, why did you not join the congregation?"

He replied: "O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), I have become ritually impure (*Junub*) and water was not available."

His Eminence said: "You should have used dust; it is sufficient for you."

Moreover, two verses have come in the Holy Quran regarding Tayammum; one of them being in Surah Nisa:

يَأَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَقْرُبُوا الصَّلَاةَ وَآتُنُّتُمْ سُكْرِيٍّ حَتَّىٰ تَعْمَلُوا مَا تَقْوُنَ
وَلَا جُنْبًا إِلَّا عَابِرِي سَبِيلٍ حَتَّىٰ تَغْتَسِلُوا طَ وَإِنْ كُنْتُمْ مَرْضَىٰ أَوْ عَلَىٰ سَفَرٍ
أَوْ جَاءَ أَحَدٌ مِنْكُمْ مِنَ الْغَ�يْطِ أَوْ لَمْسْتُمُ النِّسَاءَ فَلَمْ تَجْدُوا مَاءً فَتَيَمَّمُوا
صَعِيدًا طَيِّبًا فَإِمْسَحُوا بِيُوْجُوْهِكُمْ وَآيْدِيْكُمْ طَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ كَانَ عَفْوًا غَفُورًا ۝

"O you who believe! do not go near prayer when you are intoxicated until you know (well) what you say, nor when you are under an obligation to perform a bath – unless (you are) travelling on the road – until you have washed yourselves; and if you are sick, or on a journey, or one of you come from the privy or you have touched the women, and you cannot find water, betake yourselves to pure earth, then wipe your faces and your hands; surely Allah is Pardoning, Forgiving."¹

Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) says: "This verse was revealed for the traveler: that when he cannot get water, he should perform Tayammum and pray, till he gets water; when he gets water, he should perform the ritual bath."²

The next verse is in Surah Maida:

يَأَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِذَا قُمْتُمْ إِلَى الصَّلَاةِ فَاغْسِلُوا وُجُوهَكُمْ وَآيْدِيْكُمْ إِلَى
الْمَرَافِقِ وَامْسَحُوا بِرُءُوسِكُمْ وَأَرْجُلَكُمْ إِلَى الْكَعْبَيْنِ طَ وَإِنْ كُنْتُمْ جُنْبًا
فَاتَّهَرُوا طَ وَإِنْ كُنْتُمْ مَرْضَىٰ أَوْ عَلَىٰ سَفَرٍ أَوْ جَاءَ أَحَدٌ مِنْكُمْ مِنَ الْغَ�يْطِ أَوْ
لَمْسْتُمُ النِّسَاءَ فَلَمْ تَجْدُوا مَاءً فَتَيَمَّمُوا صَعِيدًا طَيِّبًا فَإِمْسَحُوا بِيُوْجُوْهِكُمْ
وَآيْدِيْكُمْ مِنْهُ

"O you who believe! when you rise up for prayer, wash your faces and your hands as far as the elbows, and wipe your heads and your feet to the ankles; and if you are under an obligation to perform a total ablution, then wash (yourselves) and if you are

¹ Surah Nisa 4:43

² Sonan Baihaqi, 1:216

sick or on a journey, or one of you come from the privy, or you have touched the women, and you cannot find water, betake yourselves to pure earth and wipe your faces and your hands therewith.”¹

Because the implication of ‘Malamisa’ in the verse is absolute mixing; as this meaning is narrated from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Ibne Abbas and Abu Moosa Ashari. And in this viewpoint Hasan, Ubaidah, Shobi and others have followed them. And this is not the viewpoint of all, who believe in the necessity of ablution after sexual intercourse; like Abu Hanifah, Abu Yusuf, Muhammad, Zafar, Noori, Awzai and others.

On the basis of this, with attention to the discussion above, it is known that the viewpoint of Caliph regarding Almighty Allah, Sunnah of Prophet and consensus of Ummah, is an unusual view and personal deduction; as opposed to confirmed texts: from the aspect that whole Ummah, since the beginning till now, has opposed him, and has consensus on dry ablution (*Tayammum*) in case of absence of water.

2. The Caliph was ignorant about rules of doubts in prayer

Imam of the Hanbalis, in his book of *Musnad*, has narrated from Makhul that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said:

“When one of you prays and has doubt in his prayer, then if the doubt is between one and two, you should consider that unit (*rakat*) as the first; and if the doubt is between two and three, you should consider that unit (*rakat*) at the second; and if it is between three and four, you should consider that unit (*rakat*) at the third, till the doubt in that unit (*rakat*) may be more; then perform two prostrations before the salutation (*Salam*) and then perform the salutation (*Salam*).”

Muhammad bin Ishaq says: Husain bin Abdullah asked me: Did he mention the authorities of this report? No, he replied. Then he said: But he narrated to me that Karib, the freed slave of Ibne Abbas narrated to him from Ibne Abbas:

“I was in the gathering of Umar, when he asked: O Ibne Abbas, what is the rule when a worshipper has doubt whether he prayed more or less units in prayer? I replied: O chief of believers, I have not heard anything about this. Umar said: By God, I am also ignorant of this.

In the words of Baihaqi, it is mentioned: “No, by God, I didn’t hear anything from Prophet regarding this and neither did I ask him about it.”

We were discussing this when Abdur Rahman bin Auf came and asked: “What are you discussing?” Umar replied: “Regarding what should a person do, when he has doubt about the numbers of units (*rakat*).” Abdur Rahman said: I heard the Prophet say as follows:...”

¹ Surah Maidah 5:6

Are you not amazed at the Caliph, who is unaware about doubts in prayers, whereas it is a common issue and is related to a worship act performed five times a day. Why the Caliph did not arrange for this issue and did not ask the Prophet about it, so that if some youth asked him about it, he should not say: I don't know? Till Abdur Rahman bin Auf informed him about that.

I don't know what such a Caliph, who led Muslims in prayer, would do in case he happened to have doubt in prayer? Naturally such a thing occurs for everyone. I am amazed at the statement of one, who says that Umar was a knowledgeable man! This example informs us about the expertise of Umar regarding Islamic laws. Farewell to the Ummah, whose most knowledgeable person is as such!

كَبُرُّتْ كَلِمَةً تَخْرُجُ مِنْ أَفْوَاهِهِمْ إِنْ يَقُولُونَ إِلَّا كَذِبًا^٥

“A grievous word it is that comes out of their mouths; they speak nothing but a lie.”¹

3. The Caliph's ignorance about Quran

Hafiz Abdur Razzaq,² Abad bin Hamid and Ibne Mudhir have narrated through their chains of narrators from Dauli that: A woman was brought to Umar, who had delivered a child after six months of pregnancy and Umar ordered her to be stoned to death.

Her sister came to Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) and said: “Umar wants to stone my sister to death. I adjure you by God that if there is any excuse for her, let me know.” Ali (a.s.) said: “There is an excuse for her.” So the woman recited: “God is the greatest (*Takbeer*),” which Umar and those around him heard. Then she came to Umar and said: “Ali (a.s.) believes that I have an excuse for my sister.” Umar sent someone to Ali (a.s.) and asked what the excuse was. Ali (a.s.) replied: Allah Almighty says:

وَالْوَالِدَاتُ يُرِضِّعْنَ أَوْلَادَهُنَّ كَامِلَيْنِ

“And the mothers should suckle their children for two whole years...”³

And also says:

وَحَمَلَهُ وَفِصْلَهُ ثَلَاثُونَ شَهْرًا

“And the bearing of him and the weaning of him was thirty months.”⁴

And God says:

¹ Surah Kahf 18:5

² *Al-Musannaf*, [7/350, H. 13444]

³ Surah Baqarah 2:233

⁴ Surah Ahqaf 46:15

وَفِضْلَةٌ فِي عَامَيْنِ

“And his weaning takes two years.”¹

Now, even if we keep aside this report, it can be concluded that the period of pregnancy in the verse:

وَحَمْلَةٌ وَفِضْلَةٌ ثَلَثُونَ شَهْرًا

“And the bearing of him and the weaning of him was thirty months.”²

...is supposed to be six months, [because, the period of weaning is 24 months and subtracting this from thirty months, six months remain.

At this point Umar released that woman. The narrator says: After that we came to know that the woman delivered another child after six months' pregnancy.

Most amazing

Scholars of tradition have narrated from Baja³ bin Abdullah Jehni that: A man from our clan married a woman from the Jehina tribe. She gave birth to a child after six months of pregnancy. Her husband went to Uthman and the latter ordered them to stone her to death. This was reported to Ali (a.s.). He came to Uthman and said: “What are you doing? It is not justifiable to condemn her to stoning, because Allah, the Mighty and the High says:

وَحَمْلَةٌ وَفِضْلَةٌ ثَلَثُونَ شَهْرًا

“And the bearing of him and the weaning of him was thirty months.”⁴

He also says:

وَالْوَالِدَاتُ يُرْضَعْنَ أَوْلَادُهُنَّ حَوْلَيْنَ كَامِلَيْنِ

“And the mothers should suckle their children for two whole years...”⁵

On the basis of this, the period of weaning is 24 months and what remains is the period of pregnancy: that is six months. Uthman said: “By God, I never noticed this.” Then he ordered her to be released, but they found that by that time she had already been stoned to death. And the words of that lady to her sister were: “Sister, don't worry, by God, no one, other than my husband has touched me.”

¹ Surah Luqman 31:14

² Surah Ahqaf 46:15

³ In *Tafseer Ibne Kaseer*, Muammar is mentioned instead of Baja.

⁴ Surah Ahqaf 46:15

⁵ Surah Baqarah 2:233

The narrator says that the boy grew up and resembled the father and the latter admitted that he was indeed his son, and I saw that man after that on his sick bed and each of his limbs fell off.¹

Is it not shameful that in the absence of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) some persons become his successors, who have such a level in adjudication? Is it justice that a person having such lack of knowledge should get power on life and property of Muslims? Is it justice that honor of Muslims, public treasury and their women should come under control of someone, whose behavior is as such? No, by God:

وَرَبُّكَ يَخْلُقُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَيَخْتَارُ مَا كَانَ لَهُمُ الْخِيَرَةُ سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ وَتَعَالَى عَمَّا يُشَرِّكُونَ ④

“And your Lord creates and chooses whom He pleases; to choose is not theirs; glory be to Allah, and exalted be He above what they associate (with Him).”²

وَمَا كُنْتَ لَدَيْهِمْ إِذَا جَمَعُوا أَمْرَهُمْ وَهُمْ يَمْكُرُونَ ④

“And you were not with them when they resolved upon their affair, and they were devising plans.”³

فَذَاقُوا وَبِالْأَمْرِهِمْ وَلَهُمْ عَذَابٌ أَلِيمٌ ⑤

“Then tasted the evil result of their conduct, and they had a painful punishment.”⁴

4. Everyone is more knowledgeable than Umar!

In *Sunan Kubra*,⁵ Baihaqi has narrated from Shobi that Umar delivered a speech and after divine praise and glorification, said: “Do not fix higher amounts as dowers and if I hear that a woman has taken dower more than the dower of the wives of Prophet, I will recover it from her and deposit it in Public Treasury.”

Then he came down from the pulpit. A Quraish lady asked: “O chief of believers, is the Book of Allah more worthy to be followed or your statement?” He replied: “The Book of Allah, what do you imply?” She said: “You prohibited heavy dowers, whereas Almighty Allah says in Quran:

وَآتَيْتُمْ لِأَخْدِيْهِنَّ قِنْطَارًا فَلَا تَخُلُّوْا مِنْهُ شَيْئًا

¹ Malik has quoted this tradition in *Muwattah*, 2:176 [2/825, H. 11]; Baihaqi in *Sunan Kubra*, 7:442; Ibne Kaseer in his *Tafseer*, 4:157; Suyuti in *Durre Mansoor*, 6:40 [7/441].

² Surah Qasas 28:68

³ Surah Yusuf 12:102

⁴ Surah Taghaabun 64:5

⁵ *Sunan Kubra*, 7:233; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 8:298 [16/536, H. 45796].

“And you have given one of them a heap of gold, then take not from it anything.”¹

Umar said twice or thrice: “Everyone is more learned than Umar,” and according to another version, he said: “Everyone, except Umar is most learned, even ladies in seclusion.”

Are you not amazed at an Imam, who makes a mistake and a woman, who rectifies him?²

It is mentioned in the words of Khazin that:

“A woman, who states the right thing and a ruler, who commits a mistake.”³

And in the words of Razi in his book of *Arbaeen*:

“All people are more learned than Umar, even ladies at home.”⁴

5. Umar did not know the meaning of ‘Abb’

Anas bin Malik says: Umar recited the following verse from the pulpit:

فَانْبُتُنَا فِيهَا حَبَّاً ۝ وَعِنَّبَا ۝ وَقَضْبَا ۝ وَزَيْتُونًا ۝ وَنَخْلًا ۝ وَحَدَّافِقَ عُلْبَيَا ۝
وَفَاكِهَةً ۝ وَأَبَّا ۝

“Then We cause to grow therein the grain, and grapes and clover, and the olive and the palm, and thick gardens, and fruits and herbage”⁵

Then he said: “I know meaning of all these terms, but what is this ‘Abb’?” Then he left the staff he was holding and said: “My God, this is a duty and what is the problem if you don’t know the meaning of ‘Abb’? Follow that whose guidance is clear to you from Quran and act upon it, and leave the knowledge of what you don’t know to Almighty Allah.”

It is narrated from Thabit that a man asked Umar about the term of ‘abb’ in the verse:

وَفَاكِهَةً ۝ وَأَبَّا ۝

“And fruits and herbage”⁶

Umar replied: We are forbidden from excessive precaution and to penetrate deeply. This tradition is also narrated in different words.⁷

¹ Surah Nisa 4:20

² *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 1:61 & 3:96 [1/182, Sermon 3:12/17].

³ *Tafseer Khazin*, 1:353 [1/339].

⁴ *Al-Arbaeen*, Razi, 467.

⁵ Surah Abasa 80:27-31

⁶ Surah Abasa 80:31

⁷ This report is mentioned in Hakeem in *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 2:514 [2/559, H. 3897]; Zamakhshari in *Kashaf*, 3:253 [4/704]; Suyuti in *Durre Mansoor*, 6:317 [8/421]; *Kanzul*

Ibne Hajar says in *Fathul Bari*:¹ “It is said: ‘Abb’ is not an Arabic term. And it is supported by the fact that its meaning was unknown to the like of Abu Bakr and Umar.”

Allamah Amini says: This statement, which Ibne Hajar mentioned is nonsense! Because this word was known to all lexicologists and it is mentioned in all glossaries, without any remark that this term is borrowed from some other language into Arabic.

Supposing we accept that ‘Abb’ is not an Arabic term, is the statement of Allah in its explanation, which follows it:

مَتَاعًا لَكُمْ وَلَا تَعَامِلُوهُ

“A provision for you and for your cattle.”²

...also not Arabic? Then what is the excuse of Abu Bakr and Umar for not knowing the meaning of these terms? And in that case, how is it possible for Ibne Hajar’s justification to stand?

Yes, it is clear for Ibne Hajar that those two had to be defended in any way, even if he had to resort to wild interpretation of the language of Arabs and denying the actual import of language.

Note

Bukhari has mentioned the captioned traditional report in his *Saheeh*,³ but in order to conceal the Caliph’s ignorance of meaning of ‘Abb’ he has omitted the initial statements. But in this way, he has put himself into a difficult situation, whereas according to demands of traditions, which he has quoted, it is prohibited to suffer undue trouble! And it was not important for him that others should know actual statements of Umar.

The report is mentioned in *Saheeh Bukhari* as follows: Anas said: We were with Umar and he said, “We have been forbidden to undertake a difficult task beyond our capability.”

How numerous are such instances in *Saheeh Bukhari*, where the compiler has distorted reports according to his beliefs!

6. Caliph’s order regarding the insane female, who committed fornication

It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that a mentally incompetent woman, accused of adultery was brought to Umar. Umar discussed this with some people and declared that she must be stoned to death. Ali (a.s.) passed from there and inquired what was going on about that female. They replied: “She is mentally

¹ *Ummaal*, 1:227 [2/328, H. 4154].

² *Fathul Bari*, 13:230 [13/270-272].

² Surah Abasa 80:32

³ *Saheeh Bukhari*, in Kitabul Itisam, Chapter of what should not be asked. [6/2659, H. 6863].

deranged from some tribe and is accused of having committed adultery and Umar has ordered her to be stoned to death.”

Ali (a.s.) said: “Release her.” Then he came to Umar said: “Chief of believers, do you not remember that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: Three people are absolved of religious responsibility: the insane, till he regains sanity; the child, till he reaches maturity and the sleeping one, till he wakes up?”

At that time, Umar released the woman and began to recite *Takbeer*.¹

Reminder

In his *Saheeh*,² Bukhari has mentioned this report. But whenever Bukhari feels that a report casts aspersion on Caliph, he edits that report in order to save the honor of Caliph, and he does not like that people should be allowed know the truth about ignorance of Caliph regarding well known Sunnah or his forgetting it at the time of delivering judgment.

He has narrated the report as follows: Ali said to Umar: “Do you not know that legal penalty is not applicable to the insane till they regains sanity, and the child till he gains maturity and the sleeping one, till he wakes up?”

7. Caliph's ignorance about interpretation of Quran

It is narrated from Abu Saeed Khudri that:

“I performed Hajj in the company of Umar bin Khattab. When he was circumambulating Kaaba, he addressed Hajar al-Aswad: ‘No doubt, I know that you are a stone and can neither benefit anyone nor harm anyone. Had I not seen Allah’s Apostle kissing you, I would not have kissed you.’ Then he kissed it. Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) said: ‘On the contrary, it gives benefits and harm, if you only knew from the interpretation of Book of Almighty Allah, in which He says:

وَإِذَا أَخْذَرَ رَبُّكَ مِنْ يَنِيَّ أَدَمَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهِمْ دُرْيَتَهُمْ وَأَشْهَدَهُمْ عَلَىٰ أَنفُسِهِمْ

“And when your Lord brought forth from the children of Adam, from their backs, their descendants, and made them bear witness against their own souls.”³

Then when they confessed that He is the Lord and they are servants, He wrote their covenant on a white sheet and placed it in the mouth of this stone. Indeed, on Judgment Day, this stone will be raised and it would be having a pair of eyes, tongue and lips; and it will testify in favor of those, who honored the covenant. Thus, on the basis of Quran, this stone is the trustee of Almighty Allah.’

Umar said: ‘O Abul Hasan, may God not keep me alive in the land, where

¹ *Sunan Abi Dawood*, 2:227 [4/140, H. 4399 & 4401]; *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 2:227 [1/659, H. 2042]; *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, 2:59, 4:389 [2/68, H. 2351 & 4/430, H. 8169].

² *Kitabul Maheribeen*, Chapter of not stoning the insane, [6/2499].

³ Surah Araaf 7:172

you are not present.””

It is mentioned in another version that he said: “O Abul Hasan, I seek refuge of God from living in a nation, in which you are not present.”¹

8. Everyone is more knowledgeable than Umar

One day, Umar was thirsty and he passed by a youth of Ansa. So he asked for water. The boy mixed some honey in water and brought it to Umar. Umar did not drink it, saying: Almighty Allah says:

أَذْهَبْتُمْ طَيْبَتِكُمْ فِي حَيَاةِكُمُ الدُّنْيَا

“You did away with your good things in your life of the world...”²

The youth said: O chief of believers, this verse is not for you or any other Muslim. Recite its preceding words:

وَيَوْمَ يُعَرِّضُ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا عَلَى النَّارِ أَذْهَبْتُمْ طَيْبَتِكُمْ فِي حَيَاةِكُمُ
الدُّنْيَا وَاسْتَمْتَعْتُمْ بِهَا

“And on the day when those who disbelieve shall be brought before the fire: You did away with your good things in your life of the world and you enjoyed them for a while.”³

Umar remarked: “Everyone is more learned than Umar.”⁴

9. The Caliph's ignorance of tenors and metaphors

1. It is narrated from Huzaifah bin Yaman that he saw Umar bin Khattab and Umar asked: “How did you begin the day, O Ibne Yaman?”

He replied: “Do you want to know how I began the day? I began the day displeased with truth and pleased with mischief; and testifying for what I have not seen; and memorizing the uncreated; and prayed without ablution; and I have on the earth what God does not have in the heavens.”

Umar became infuriated and went away on some important errand, but decided to punish Huzaifah for these statements. On the way, he met Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). His Eminence saw that Umar was infuriated and he asked: “What has infuriated you, Umar?”

He replied: “I met Huzaifah bin Yaman and asked: How did you begin your

¹ Mustadrak Alas Saheehain, 1:457 [1/628, H. 1682]; Tareekh Umar bin Khattab, Ibne Jauzi, 106 [Pg. 115]; Kanzul Ummaal, 3:35 [5/177, H. 12521]; Sharh Nahjul Balagha, 3:122 [12/100, Sermon 223].

² Surah Ahqaf 46:20

³ Surah Ahqaf 46:20

⁴ Sharh Nahjul Balagha, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 1:61 [1/182, Sermon 3].

day? He replied: I began the day while not being pleased with truth.”

Ali (a.s.) said: “He is right. Since he is not pleased with death, whereas it is truth.”

Then Umar said: “He says: And I liked temptation.” Ali (a.s.) said: “He is right; since he likes wealth and children and the Almighty Allah says:

أَمَّا آمُوْلُكُمْ وَأَوْلَادُكُمْ فِتْنَةٌ

“Your property and your children are a temptation.”¹

Umar said: “O Ali, he says: I testify for what I have not seen.” Ali (a.s.) said: “He is right; since he testifies for the oneness of Almighty Allah, death, rising up on Judgment Day, Paradise and Hell, Siraat Bridge, whereas he has not seen any of them.”

Umar said: “O Ali, he says: I memorize the uncreated.” Ali (a.s.) said: “That is true, he learns the Quran, whereas it is uncreated.”²

Umar said: “And he says: I pray without ablution.” Ali (a.s.) said: “He is right, he recites benedictions on my cousin, the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), without ablution and that is allowed.”

Umar said: “He also claims something more serious.” Ali (a.s.) asked: “What does he say?” Umar replied: “He says: There is something for me in the earth which is not there for God in the heavens.” Ali (a.s.) said: “He is right, he has family and dependants and Almighty Allah has no spouse or issues.”

At this point Umar said: “If Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) had not there, the son of Khattab would have perished.”

Hafiz Ganji has narrated this tradition in *Kifaya*,³ and he remarks:

“According to tradition scholars this report is authentic and numerous biographer have narrated it.”

2. Hafiz scholars: Ibne Abi Shaibah, Abd bin Hamid, Ibne Mundhir have narrated from Ibrahim Tamimi that a man said in the presence of Umar: “O Allah, make me from the small.” Umar asked: “What supplication is this?” He replied: I heard Almighty Allah say:

وَقَلِيلٌ مِّنْ عِبَادِي الشَّكُورُ

“And very few of My servants are grateful.”⁴

And I beseeched Almighty Allah to make me of those few. Umar said: “All the people are more knowledgeable than Umar.”

¹ Surah Anfal 8:28

² This part is interpolated as the fact is that the Quran is a creation and it is not uncreated as some sects believe.

³ *Kifayatut Talib*, 96 [Pg. 218]; *Al-Fusoolul Muhimma*, Ibne Sabbagh Maliki, 18 [Pg. 34].

⁴ Surah Saba 34:13

Qurtubi has mentioned as follows: “All the people are more knowledgeable than you, O Umar.”

Zamakhshari has narrated as follows:

“All people are more knowledgeable than Umar.”¹

10. Opinion of Caliph regarding recitation in prayer

1. It is narrated from Abdur Rahman bin Hanzala bin Rahib that Umar bin Khattab prayed the Maghrib Prayer and in the first unit (*rakat*), did not recite the Surahs; when he reached the second unit (*rakat*), he recited Surah Hamd twice and when the prayer was concluded and salutation recited, he performed two prostrations of forgetfulness (*Sajdah Sahv*).

Ibne Hajar has quoted this report in *Fathul Bari*,² after which he says:

“The authorities of this report are reliable and it seems as if this practice was the viewpoint of Umar.”

2. It is narrated from Abu Salma bin Abdur Rahman that Umar bin Khattab led people in Maghrib Prayer and he did not recite the chapters of Quran (*Qirat*). After the prayer, he was asked: “You did not recite the chapters?” He asked: “How were the genuflections and prostrations?” They said they were all right. He said: “Then there is no problem.”³

3. It is narrated from Shobi that Abu Moosa Ashari said to Umar bin Khattab: “Chief of believers, did you recite the chapters of Quran softly in prayers?” He replied: “No.” Then he ordered and the Muezzin recited the Adhan and Iqamah and the prayer was repeated.⁴

From these instances and repetition of these incidents, it is learnt that the Caliph did not observe the most necessary rules of prayer; so much so that he did not recite the chapters of Quran in the first unit (*rakat*) and made up for it by reciting it in the second unit. And before the salutation or after that, he performed two prostrations of forgetfulness (*Sajdah Sahv*).

Sometimes he was content with genuflections and prostrations being perfect and he did not think that it was necessary to repeat the prayer. Sometimes he resorted to precaution and repeated the prayer. Sometimes he considered the prayer invalid and repeated it along with his followers. Are these occasional guesses?! Or he had no capacity to solve problems? This also shows how sincere the Caliph was in prayers.

¹ *Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran*, 14:227 [14/178]; *Tafseer Kashaf*, 2:445 [3/573]; *Durre Mansoor*, 5:229 [6/682].

² *Fathul Bari*, 3:69 [3/90]; Baihaqi has mentioned this report in *Sunanul Kubraa*, 2:382.

³ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 2:347 & 381; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 4:213 [8/133, H. 22256].

⁴ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 2:382; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 4:213 [8/133, H. 22256].

11. The Caliph's opinion about inheritance

It is narrated from Masud Thaqafi that:

"I was a witness when Umar bin Khattab made brothers of the father and mother share the third with maternal brothers. A man remarked: You delivered a different judgment in this issue before. He asked: How did I decide? He replied: You gave to the maternal brothers and did not give anything to paternal brothers.

Umar said: That was a judgment [of that time] and this is another judgment [which I give] now."¹

On the basis of another narration, he said: "It was on the basis of judgment of that day and this is on the basis of judgment of today."¹

Allamah Amini says: As if religious adjudication depends on personal whims of the Caliph, whether he wants to follow the Shariah or oppose it. As if that Caliph has the right to deliver any judgment and issue any order. As if there is no rules and law in Islam! Perhaps this viewpoint is worse than the viewpoint of *Taswib*,² which is refutable through definite evidences.

12. Ignorance of Caliph about divorce of slave girl

Hafiz Darqutni and Hafiz Ibne Asakir³ have narrated that:

"Two men came to Umar and inquired about the divorce of slave girl. Umar arose from there till he came to the Masjid, where a man, bald from the front was present. Umar asked: O bald one, what is your opinion regarding divorce of slave maid? He raised his head and gestured with his index and middle finger. So, he told those two men: Two divorces. One of them remarked: Great! We came to you as you were chief of believers; but you brought us to a man and asked him and were satisfied with his gesture...till the end."⁴

¹ Sonanul Kubraa, 6:255; Sonan Darimi, I:154.

² *Taswib* is one of the viewpoints of Ahle Sunnat. It is that the verdict of every jurisprudent is correct. *Tasweeb* is of two types:

1. *Taswib Ashari*; which is the worst kind. It is that it is said that the Almighty Allah has no laws in the Protected Tablet (*Lauhe Mahfuz*) and when a jurisprudent delivers a judgment it is written in the Tablet and as a result in favor of the ignorant man there is in fact no order.

2. *Taswib Mutazali* is: Almighty Allah in the protected tablet has laws in which the ignorant and the knowledgeable are equal. But on the stage of practicality it is on the basis of knowledge or imagination of the Mujtahid and rulers, which has reached the hands of duty bound.

Any sane person knows that where is the source of these statements. These frivolous and baseless statement were invented to justify the views and acts of the jurisprudents so that they may justify the evils acts of the undeserving Caliphs; and not only regard their conduct to be according to command of God; on the contrary their ignorant followers may also follow them to the letter.

³ *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 17/380; and in Biography of Imam Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) from the *Tareekh Ibne Asakir*, researched edition, no. 871.

⁴ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 206.

13. If Ali hadn't been there, Umar would have perished

They brought to Umar, a woman who had confessed that she became pregnant through fornication and Umar ordered her to be stoned to death. Ali (a.s.) learnt of this and asked: "What is the story of this woman?"

They replied: "Umar has ordered her to be stoned to death."

Ali (a.s.) sent her away and said: "You have the discretion to punish her, but what power do you have on the unborn child? Perhaps her confession was forced."

Umar said: "It was like this." Ali (a.s.) said: "Have you not heard that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: There is no penalty who confesses after torture? And confession is not acceptable from one, who is chained and imprisoned. Or one who is threatened."

Umar released that woman and remarked: "Women are helpless to give birth to the like of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). If Ali had not been there, Umar would have perished."¹

14. The Caliph's ignorance about the Sunnah

Ibne Mubarak has narrated from Ashath from Shobi from Masruq that: Umar learnt that a man from the Thaqif had married a girl from Quraish, while she was during her waiting period. So Umar sent a messenger to that woman and had the couple separated and punished them and said to that man: Don't marry this woman at all. [she has become unlawful for you forever] and he seized the dower of that woman and placed it in the Public Treasury.

This matter became public. When it came to the notice of Imam Ali (a.s.), he said: "May God forgive the chief of believers; how can he seize the dower and place it in Public Treasury?" This couple married in unawareness and the recourse was not as Umar acted. The imam should allow them to reconcile according to the Sunnah.

His Eminence was asked: "O Ali, how did you arrive at the solution?" He replied: "The dower is related to amount that woman takes from the man; and they should separate from each other. Since they were unaware, they cannot be punished. The woman should complete the waiting period of her previous husband and also complete the waiting period of this husband. Then this man can propose to her."

When Umar came to know about the verdict of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), he said: "O people, you should refer to the Sunnah, when you don't know the solution to some problem."²

Allamah Amini says: What was the justification of the Caliph in lashing

¹ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:196 [3/143]; *Al-Manaqib*, Khwarizmi, 48 [Pg. 81, H. 65].

² *Sonan Kubra*, Baihaqi, 7:441-442; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:196 [3/144]; *Zakhaerul Uqbah*, 81.

them? And why did he seize the dower from the woman? Under the authority of which verse or traditional report did he deposit the dower in Public Treasury and considered it Sadaqah? Why he declared the partners as unlawful to each other forever ?

I don't know:

فَسْأَلُوا أَهْلَ الذِّكْرِ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ لَا تَعْلَمُونَ ﴿٢٣﴾

“So ask the followers of the Reminder if you do not know.”¹

Alas, if the Caliph had not forgotten himself and before adjudicating the matter against Quran and Sunnah, had acted according to his words: “Turn back the ignorant to the Sunnah.”

15. Deduction of Caliph regarding the grandfather

In his *Sunan*, Darami² has narrated from Shobi that the first grandfather, who got inheritance, was Umar, as he obtained all the property. At that time Ali (a.s.) and Zaid objected to him saying that all of it was not his share as he should inherit like one of the two brothers (which is the second rank of inheritance).

It is narrated from Saeed bin Musayyab that Umar said: I asked the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) about inheritance of grandfather. The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: “Why do you ask me about this again and again, I am afraid that you would die, before you know this.” Saeed bin Musayyab said: “Umar died before he could understand this issue.”³

In *Sunanul Kubra*,⁴ Baihaqi has also narrated from Ubaidah: “I remember a hundred incidents about Umar, in which he committed errors regarding inheritance of grandfather.”

In *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*,⁵ Ibne Abil Hadeed says:

Umar often delivered a judgment and after that contradicted himself and delivered a verdict against it. Regarding inheritance of grandfather with the brother he issued varied laws, then he feared delivering a judgment regarding this and said:

“One who wants to fall into the pit of Hell should express his personal opinion regarding inheritance of grandfather.”

Allamah Amini says: I don't know how it is lawful for the Caliph of Muslims to be ignorant regarding something, which Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) had explained; and that too to such an extent that his ignorance made him contradict! Whereas in view of the author of *Washiya*, he was during his time, the most

¹ Surah Nahl 16:43

² Sonan Darami, 2:354.

³ *Mojamul Awsat*, Tibrani [15/135, H. 3914].

⁴ Sonanul Kubraa, 6:245.

⁵ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, I:61 [1/181, Sermon 3].

learned among companions of Prophet!

16. The Caliph and the female singer¹

It is narrated from Hasan that he said: Umar bin Khattab sent for a female singer, whose assemblies men attended. So Umar regarded it as crime and sent someone in pursuit of that woman. They told her: Umar has summoned you, reply to him.

On hearing this, she was extremely terrified and she said: "Woe upon me, what has happened to him?" Then she set out to meet Umar, but due to excess of trepidation, she developed premature labor pains and she entered a house and delivered an immature infant, which cried for sometime then died.

Umar was informed of this and he sought the counsel of companions in this matter. Some suggested that Umar was not liable to any penalty. Indeed, you are the guide, teacher and trainer. Ali (a.s.) was silent during this. Umar turned to him and asked: "Ali, what is your opinion concerning this?"

Ali (a.s.) replied: "If they delivered a judgment according to their personal opinion, indeed their opinion is an error. And if they expressed their view to please you, know that they were not concerned for you and did not offer good advice to you. My view is that the blood money of that child is your responsibility; because you terrified that woman and she aborted the child on the way."

Umar said: "Distribute the blood money of that child among Quraish." That is recover the blood money from Quraish: since Umar is from Quraish and the mistake was from him. [and blood money of murder by mistake is upon the sane killer; that is the paternal relatives.]

Another instance

Umar summoned a pregnant fornicator woman in order to question her. Due to terror she aborted the child she was carrying. After that Umar asked the companions of Prophet to present their views about it. They said: "O Umar, you have no liability and you are only a punisher."

But Ali (a.s.) said: "If they are fearful of you, indeed they deceive you and if they give this opinion seriously, they are making a mistake. It is obligatory on you to free a slave."

Thus Umar and companions acted according to the verdict of Ali (a.s.).

Allamah Amini says: What kind of a Caliph is this, who does not have any beneficial knowledge in the religion of God, so that it may save him from being thrown into a ditch, does it prevent him from inappropriate adjudication?

With what justification did he rely on the views of people in every easy and

¹ In *Kanzul Ummaal* and also in *Musannaf* of Abdul Razzaq instead of the term Mughniyya, Mughiba is mentioned and it implies a woman, whose husband has disappeared.

difficult problem in Islamic laws, even to the extent of important issues, like sexual relations and blood monies? And those people, due to his fear, deceived him and even their guesses were wrong.

17. Condemning the rape victim

It is narrated from Abdur Rahman Salmi that a woman was brought to Umar, who had been extremely weak due to thirst and in that condition she met a shepherd and asked him for a drink of water. The shepherd refused to give water to her unless she submitted to him sexually.

The woman was helpless and she agreed. The Caliph sought the counsel of companions regarding this. Ali (a.s.) said: "She was under compulsion and in my view, you must free her, without penalizing her in any way." So, the Caliph freed her.¹

Explanation

They brought to Umar bin Khattab, a woman accused of fornication and she had also confessed to the crime. Umar sentenced her to be stoned to death.

Ali (a.s.) said: "She might have an excuse." Then he asked her: "What impelled you to fornicate?"

She replied: "I was traveling with a companion, who had water and milk in his litter, whereas I did not have anything. I was extremely thirsty, so I asked him for a drink of water. He refused to give water unless I allowed him sexual favors. I pleaded to him three times, but he did not relent. When I was overpowered by thirst and feared for my life, I surrendered to him. Then he gave me water."

Ali (a.s.) said in the position of adjudication: God is the greatest:

فَمَنِ اضْطُرَّ غَيْرَ بَاغٍ وَلَا عَادِ فَلَا إِثْمَ عَلَيْهِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ غَفُورٌ رَّحِيمٌ^④

"But whoever is driven to necessity, not desiring, nor exceeding the limit, no sin shall be upon him; surely Allah is Forgiving, Merciful."²

Allamah Amini says: Alas, if the Caliph knew something about Quran and Sunnah he would have given rulings according to command of Almighty Allah.

Alas, if I only knew that if Ali Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) had not been present in the Ummah and if he had not corrected their deviation, what would have befallen him, and where the consequences of this wrong rulings would have taken him?

How true was his confession: "If Ali hadn't been there, Umar would have perished."

¹ Sonan Baihaqi, 8:236; Riyazun Nazara, 2:196 [3/144].

² Surah Baqarah 2:173; Kanzul Ummaal, 3:96 [5/456, H. 13596].

18. The Caliph doesn't know what he is saying

An African couple came to Umar and the husband said: "As you see, I am black with black ancestry and my wife is also black, but she has given birth to a red skinned child!"

The woman said: "O chief of believers, I swear by God, I have not been unfaithful and this child is his only."

Umar was confused, so he asked Ali (a.s.) about it. His Eminence (a.s.) asked that black man: "Would you tell me the truth, if I ask you about something?"

He replied: "Yes, by God."

He asked: "Did you copulate with your wife when she was in menses?"

"Yes," he replied.

Ali (a.s.) said: "God is the greatest! The seed mixed with blood and Allah, the Mighty and Sublime created from it a red colored child. So don't disown the infant as you have oppressed yourself."¹

19. Incidents of the Caliph patrolling in the nights and spying on people

1. Umar bin Khattab roamed through the streets and spied on activities of people. He passed by a house, from which he heard some voices. He became suspicious and climbed over the wall into the house. He saw a man, drinking liquor in company of a woman.

Umar said: "O enemy of God, you thought that if you sinned in secret, God will keep your sin concealed?"

That man said: "Chief of believers, don't make haste in punishing me! If I committed one error, you committed three! Allah says in Quran:

وَلَا تَجْسِسُوا

"And do not spy."²

And you spied. And He says:

وَأُنُوا الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا

"And go into the houses by their doors."³

You climbed over the wall. And He says:

فَإِذَا دَخَلْتُمْ بُيُوتًا فَسَلِّمُوا

¹ Al-Tarqul Hukmiya, 47.

² Surah Hujurat 49:12

³ Surah Baqarah 2:189

“So when you enter houses, greet your people with a salutation from Allah.”¹

And you did not greet?”

Umar asked: “Have you performed some other good deed, so that I may overlook this mistake?”

He replied: “Yes, by God and I will not repeat this act.”

“Go, I have forgiven you,” said Umar.

2. Umar bin Khattab came to some people, who were drinking liquor and had lighted a fire in a hut, and said:

“I forbade you to drink liquor and you drank it; and I forbade you to make a fire in a hut and you made it.” He decided to penalize them.

They said: “Chief of believers, Almighty Allah has forbidden you from spying and you spied and forbidden you from entering, without taking permission and you entered.”

Umar said: “Your two offences against my two offenses!” He returned from there saying to himself: “O Umar, all the people are more knowledgeable than you.”²

20. The Caliph’s view on liquor

It is narrated from Anas bin Malik that they brought an inebriated man to the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), and His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) had him lashed with a couple of green branches. Anas says: Abu Bakr also acted according to this rule during his tenure. But Umar, during his Caliphate, counseled with the people regarding this and Abdur Rahman bin Auf said: The minimum penalty is eighty lashes, and Umar adjudicated according to it.

Allamah Amini says: What is the value of the viewpoint of Abdur Rahman before that of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), and Umar who regarded himself as the Caliph of Muslim, what right he has to seek counsel and seek verdict of people against a proven definite legal point?

21. The Caliph and a falsely accused woman

A woman was brought to Umar; who being infatuated by an Ansari youth had tried to entice him to have relations with her. But the man was not attracted to her. So that female devised a plot thereby, in which she brought an egg, broke it; then threw away its yolk and applied the white to her legs and garments.

She came with other ladies and complained to Umar: “Chief of believers, this man forced me to commit fornication and degraded me among my people.”

Umar asked the ladies to investigate the matter. After examining the girl,

¹ Surah Nur 24:61

² *Iqdul Fareed*, 3:416 [6/278].

they concluded that traces of semen were visible on her body and clothes. Umar decided to punish the youth. The young man wailed: “Chief of believers, hold your hand, by God, I am not guilty. On the contrary this woman invited me to sleep with her, but I declined.”

Umar asked Ameerul Momineen (a.s.): “O Abul Hasan, what is your opinion?” His Eminence (a.s.) glanced at the garments of that woman and said: “Get some boiling water.”

Then he poured the hot water on the dress and suddenly the white albumen thickened and all could smell it. They even tasted it and found that it was egg. At this moment His Eminence (a.s.) reproached the female and she confessed.¹

22. Caliph and the rule of Kalalah

1. It is narrated from Madan bin Abu Talha Yamari that:

Umar delivered a sermon on Friday and reminisced about the Prophet and Abu Bakr and then said: “Nothing is as important to me as the issue of Kalalah that I should leave after me: because I did not ask the Prophet regarding Kalalah and His Eminence also did not warn me about anything other than Kalalah. So much so that he hit at my chest and asked me if the last verse of Surah Nisa was not sufficient for me?”²

2. It is narrated from Masruq that he asked Umar bin Khattab regarding the inheritance of Kalalah. He held his beard and said: “Kalalah...Kalalah...then said after a moment: if I had understood it, it would have been better than all what is present in the world.”³

3. In *Sunanul Kubra*, Baihaqi has narrated from Umar bin Khattab that: “If I the Prophet had clarified three important issues for me, I would have preferred it over having red-haired camels: Caliphate, Kalalah and usury.”⁴

4. In his *Tafseer*,⁵ Tabari has narrated from Umar that he said: “If I come to know the rule of Kalalah, it would be preferable to me than the palaces of Shaam.”

5. It is narrated from Shobi that they asked Abu Bakr about Kalalah and he said: “At this moment, I am expressing my view about Kalalah; if it is right it is

¹ Al-Tarqul Hukmiya, 47.

² The verse of Kalalah is also called as the verse of Saif, because it was revealed in summer in the year of the Farewell Hajj and it is: “They ask you for a decision of the law. Say: Allah gives you a decision concerning the person who has neither parents nor offspring; if a man dies (and) he has no son and he has a sister, she shall have half of what he leaves, and he shall be her heir if she has no son; but if there be two (sisters), they shall have two-thirds of what he leaves; and if there are brethren, men and women, then the male shall have the like of the portion of two females; Allah makes clear to you, lest you err; and Allah knows all things.” (Surah Nisa 4:176)

³ *Tafseer Tabari*, 6:30 [No. 4, Vol. 6/44]; *Tafseer Durre Mansoor*, 2:251 [2/757].

⁴ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 6:225.

⁵ *Jaameul Bayan*, [No. 4, Vol. 6/43]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:20 [11/80, H. 30692].

from Almighty Allah and if it is an error, it is from myself and from Satan.” In my view, Kalalah are heir other than the parents and children. When Umar came to power, he said: “I am ashamed to reject Abu Bakr’s ruling.”¹

Allamah Amini says: What has made the issue of Kalalah so difficult and why its meaning and rule was so ambiguous, whereas its connotation is clear?

When Umar asked the Prophet many times about this issue, did the latter reply to him or not? If he replied, then why he did not remember? Perhaps he failed to understand. An issue, which was more precious for him than red-haired camels, the whole world or the palaces of Shaam.

If they say that the Prophet did not reply, we would say: A Prophet, who knows that he would become his successor and queries would be posed to him, and the most obvious of them being the matter of Kalalah, how he did not clarify it and delayed explaining its rule.

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) definitely did not commit this error. But the fact is that he told Hafasa: “In my view your father will not remember it.”² Or: “In my view, he would not apply it.”³

This statement has clarified the facts and the reader, provided he is honest, will become aware of the truth. His great humiliation is that he, after all this, and after his own statement that: The facts about Kalalah have not become clear to me, yet he did not refrain from giving decisions, without paying attention to the command of Almighty Allah:

وَلَا تَقْفُ مَا لَيْسَ لَكَ بِهِ عِلْمٌ ۖ إِنَّ السَّمْعَ وَالْبَصَرَ وَالْفُؤَادُ كُلُّ أُولَئِكَ كَانَ
عَنْهُ مَسْئُولًا ﴿١٣﴾

“And follow not that of which you have not the knowledge; surely the hearing and the sight and the heart, all of these, shall be questioned about that.”⁴

And the words of Almighty Allah:

وَلَوْ تَقُولَ عَلَيْنَا بَعْضَ الْأَقَاوِيلِ ﴿١٤﴾ لَا خَدْنَا مِنْهُ بِالْيَمِينِ ﴿١٥﴾ ثُمَّ لَقَطَعْنَا مِنْهُ
الْوَتِينِ ﴿١٦﴾ فَمَا مِنْكُمْ مَنْ أَحَدٌ عَنْهُ لِجِزِيرَتِينِ ﴿١٧﴾

“And if he had fabricated against Us some of the sayings, We would certainly have seized him by the right hand, Then We would certainly have cut off his aorta. And not one of you could have withheld Us from him.”⁵

¹ Sonan Darami, 2:365; Sonanul Kubraa, 6:223.

² Kanzul Ummaal, 6:2 [11/78, H. 30688].

³ Tafseer Ibne Kaseer, 1:594.

⁴ Surah Isra 17:36

⁵ Surah Haqqah 69:44-47

And he acted according to personal opinion and regarded it as following Abu Bakr, whereas he was himself aware that Abu Bakr was similar to him and he heard him say: "I express my opinion about it. If it is correct, it is from Almighty Allah and if it is wrong it is from myself and Satan."

إِنَّ يَتَّبِعُونَ إِلَّا الظَّنَّ وَإِنَّ الظَّنَّ لَا يُغْنِي مِنَ الْحَقِّ شَيْئًا ⑩

"They do not follow anything but conjecture, and surely conjecture does not avail against the truth at all."¹

23. The Caliphs viewpoint about retaliation

It is narrated from Ibne Abi Husain that:

"A man hit at the head of a person from the People of the Book. Umar bin Khattab decided to take retaliation from him. Maaz bin Jabal asked:

'Do you know that you have no right to this? And it has come down from the Prophet.'

So Umar bin Khattab gave a dinar to that man and he was satisfied."²

24. The Caliph's opinion regarding the slain from the People of Book

The following incident is narrated from Mujahid:

When Umar bin Khattab entered Shaam, he learnt that a Muslim man had slain a person from the People of Book.

So Umar decided to take retaliation from him. At this point Zaid bin Thabit asked:

"Do you want to take retaliation from your brother for the sake of your slave?

So instead of taking retaliation from him, Umar paid him blood money.³

25. The Caliph's verdict regarding human fingers

Saeed bin Musayyab says:

Umar bin Khattab fixed 13 percent of the whole blood money for the thumb; 12 percent for the index finger, 10 percent for middle finger, 9 percent for the finger next to it and 6 percent for the small finger.

It is narrated from Abu Ghatfan that: Ibne Abbas said: The blood money of each finger is one-tenth. (that is one-tenth of blood money of a complete man). Marwan came to know about the verdict of Ibne Abbas. He summoned him and asked:

¹ Surah Najm 53:28

² *Kanzul Ummaal*, 7:304 [15/97, H. 40243].

³ *Al-Musannaf*, Abdul Razzaq, [10/100, H. 18509]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 7:304 [15/97, H. 40242].

“O Ibne Abbas, why do you give uniform verdict about fingers? Have you not heard the verdict of Umar?”

Ibne Abbas said: “May God forgive Umar; the statement of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is having precedence over the decision of Umar.”¹

Allamah Amini says: As Ibne Abbas has given the verdict, in the Sihah and Musnad books, there are definite traditional reports from the Prophet that he said: “The blood money of each and every finger is one-tenth.”

This is the proven practice of Prophet and the verdict of Umar is his personal view and the matter is as Ibne Abbas said:

“The statement of Prophet is more worthy to be followed than the decision of Umar.”

I don't know if the Caliph was even aware of the statement of Prophet and had opposed it unintentionally or he was ignorant of it.

“If he was ignorant it is a calamity, and if he was aware, then it is a greater calamity.”

26. The Caliph's view regarding the thief

It is narrated from Abdur Rahman bin Ayez that a thief with an amputated hand and a foot was brought to Umar.

He ordered them to cut off his foot. Ali (a.s.) said: Allah, the Mighty and Sublime says:

إِنَّمَا جَزْوُ الَّذِينَ يُحَارِبُونَ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ وَيَسْعَوْنَ فِي الْأَرْضِ فَسَادًا أَنْ يُقْتَلُوا
أَوْ يُصْلَبُوا أَوْ تُقْعَدَ أَيْمَانُهُمْ وَأَزْجَلُهُمْ مِنْ خَلَافٍ أَوْ يُنْفَوْ مِنَ الْأَرْضِ
ذَلِكَ لَهُمْ خَزْيٌ فِي الدُّنْيَا وَلَهُمْ فِي الْآخِرَةِ عَذَابٌ عَظِيمٌ^٣

“The punishment of those who wage war against Allah and His apostle and strive to make mischief in the land is only this, that they should be murdered or crucified or their hands and their feet should be cut off on opposite sides or they should be imprisoned; this shall be as a disgrace for them in this world, and in the hereafter they shall have a grievous chastisement,”²

Now his one hand and one foot was amputated, so it is not proper that his another foot, with which he moved about, should also be amputated and that he should be left without any foot. Instead, he should be lashed or imprisoned.

So, he was made a prisoner.³

¹ *Kitabul Umm*, Shafei, 1:58 & 134 [1/151]; *Sunan Baihaqi*, 8:93.

² Surah Maidah 5:33

³ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:118 [5/553, H. 13928].

27. All, even elderly ladies are more knowledgeable than Umar

When Umar returned to Medina from Shaam, he went among the people to learn about their condition, he passed by the tent of an aged lady. He went to her and she asked:

“O man, what has Umar achieved?”

Umar replied: “He has just returned from Shaam.”

She said: “May God not keep him secure.”

Umar asked: “Woe on you, why?”

She replied: “Because since he came on the seat of Caliphate, till now, by God, I have not received any stipend from him.”

Umar said: “Woe upon you, how can Umar know about your condition, while you are living in this remote place?”

The old woman said: “How nice of a person to be the ruler when he does not know what goes in his kingdom!”

He (the narrator) says: Umar came out from there while wailing:

“Woe on Umar! Woe upon him for the complaints. O Umar all are more knowledgeable than you.”

It is mentioned in another report:

“O Umar, all are knowledgeable, except you; even old ladies.”¹

Allamah Amini says: The lesson we learn from this story is that the viewpoint of knowledge of Imam regarding everything or more than that, what to say about laws of religion, is a clear belief and known by all. It is a natural thing and is not concealed from anyone. The Caliph lacked this specialty and on the basis of his own confession, all people, even old ladies, were more knowledgeable than him.

28. Viewpoint of Caliph regarding the tree of Rizwan

It is narrated from Nafe that: People went to the tree of allegiance of Rizwan, under which they had paid allegiance to the Prophet, in order to pray and seek benediction from it.

Umar was informed of this and he warned the people to desist. Then he ordered that tree to be removed.²

Ibne Abil Hadeed has mentioned this in *Sharh*, and he says:³

¹ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:57 [2/332]; *Al-Futuhatul Islamiyya*, 2:408 [2/261]; *Nurul Absar*, 65 [Pg. 133].

² *Tabaqatul Kubra*, Ibne Saad, 607 [2/100]; *Tareekh Umar bin Khattab*, Ibne Jauzi, 107, [Pg. 115].

³ *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 1:60 [1/78, Sermon. 3].

“After the passing away of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), people went to the tree of the allegiance of Rizwan and prayed there. Umar said: ‘O people, I see that you have worshipped the idol of Uzza! Know that after this, if anyone does this again I would strike off his head as punishment for apostasy.’ After that he ordered them to cut off the tree.”

29. Caliph's view regarding the relics of the prophets

It is narrated from Maroor that:

“I performed the pilgrimage of the House of God in company of Umar. In the Morning Prayer, he recited Surah Feel and Surah Quraish. When the prayer ended, people looked at the Masjid and gathered there. Umar asked: What place is this? They replied: It is the Masjid, in which the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) prayed. Umar said: Before you, the People of the Book did the same and they were destroyed, because they build churches at the locations of the relics of prophets. When it is time of prayer, you may pray there or just pass by [and this Masjid has no specialty that you should seek benediction from it].”¹

Allamah Amini says: I don't know how according respect to relics of prophets - and the foremost of them, Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) - is against monotheism, like: prostrating to an idol or deeming it as the prayer direction (*Qibla*) - what is the problem in that?

وَمَنْ يُعَظِّمْ شَعَابَ اللَّهِ فِي أَنَّهَا مِنْ تَقْوَى الْقُلُوبِ²

“And whoever respects the signs of Allah, this surely is (the outcome) of the piety of hearts.”²

When were the nations destroyed as a result of constructing buildings over the relics of prophets?

Praying in which Masjid brings one closer to God than praying in the Masjid of Prophet?

Which place is more blessed than the place where Prophet entered and where people paid allegiance to him and obtained nobility of divine pleasure?

Does it not bring auspiciousness to the place, so that praying there would make one proximate to God?

What was the sin of the tree that it was uprooted? Did that tree not have any supporter and defender?

Is it not disrespect to the place where Prophet had been present?

Does religious etiquette allows the Caliph to say: I see that you have turned back to the worship of Uzza? Because one, who frequented those places and

¹ *Seerah Umar*, Ibne Jauzi, 107 [Pg. 116]; Sharh Nahjul Balagha, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 3:122 [12/101, Sermon 223], here instead of Maroor, Mughira bin Suwaid is mentioned; *Fathul Bari*, 1:450 [1/569].

² Surah Hajj 22:32

considered it unlawful to destroy the relics, and accorded honor to them and prayed over there, all were people of knowledge and just companions of Prophet and responsibility of answering to the Caliph rested upon them.

When he was unable to reply to a question, he referred to them and remarked: "O Umar, all people are more knowledgeable than you." And among companions, who sought benedictions from these places and who prayed over there, was Abdullah bin Umar.¹

One, who refers to the *Sihah* and *Musnad* books, would come across numerous such reports and understand that it was only the viewpoint Caliph and undeserving to be followed.

30. The Caliph beat up people without any reason

Ibne Asakir has narrated from Akrama bin Khalid that:

"A son of Umar bin Khattab dressed up in nice garments and went to see Umar. When Umar noticed this, he suddenly began to lash him with whip or a stick and he started weeping. Hafasa asked: Why are you beating him Father? Umar replied: I saw that he had become conceited, so I wanted to degrade his self."²

Allamah Amini says: I don't argue about how the Caliph was aware of the inner thoughts of the boy and that he was conceited and proud; I also don't argue against his personal deduction about method of punishing his son. And whether there was possibility of guidance in case of presence of conceit and there was no need to warn and beat him. On the contrary, I ask those two great tradition scholars how they regard this story to be among merits and positive traits of the Caliph?

31. The Caliph prohibited weeping for the dead

It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that:

"When Zainab,³ daughter of Prophet, passed away, Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said: Join her with our righteous one, Uthman bin Mazun, who has passed away. So the ladies began to lament and Umar beat them with a lash. Suddenly the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) caught his hand and said: 'Umar, stop this and allow them to lament.' He also told the ladies: 'Don't make satanic statements when you lament.'

Then Ibne Abbas says: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) wept at the side of the grave along with Fatima and His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) wiped Fatima's tears

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, Kitabus Salat, Chapter of Masjids enroute to Medina where the Prophet prayed. [1/183, H. 269].

² *Taareekhul Kholaqa*, 96 [Pg. 133].

³ Zainab died during the eighth year of Hijra and the Prophet was extremely aggrieved on her death.

with his garment.”¹

Allamah Amini says: I don’t know that when the owner of the Shariah (Prophet) was present and himself aware of what was going on, how Umar committed the affront and lashed those ladies? If there was some illegality in their weeping, the Prophet was most deserving to make them desist [and in presence of Prophet, others do not have the right to command and prohibit]. And in spite the Prophet’s opposition to him, how he concluded that weeping of ladies was unlawful?

Why he did not consult the Prophet before threatening them? What was the motivation of his nasty behavior? And how he dared to beat up the ladies to such an extent that the Prophet had to seize his hand and make him desist? Were the ladies, who had gathered there, not relatives and wives of Prophet? I don’t know whether Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.), who was among the weeping ladies, also suffered the audacity of Umar or not. She was in any case seated beside her father, lamenting.

During the lifetime of Prophet, Umar is reported to have committed many such acts, which were opposed to the directions of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.).

Among them being: A report which Hakeem has narrated from Abu Huraira and which he regards as authentic.² And Dhahabi has also admitted that one day, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) attended a funeral. When Umar heard the lamentation of ladies, he forbade them. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: Umar, leave them in their condition, because they are aggrieved and the tragedy is fresh; that is why the eyes weep.

History narrates that these statements about the conduct of the Prophet did not reform him and he continued to hold on to his personal opinion and did not refrain from making conclusions based on his own views. Arguing through fabricated reasonings opposed to intellect, justice and nature, he attributed falsehood to the Prophet that: “Weeping of the survivors causes chastisement of the dead,” and used that same lash to whip people.

As for the report that Umar said: “The dead is punished due to the weeping of the living.” According to the narration of Hakeem in *Mustadrak*, this was refuted by Ayesha.³

Hakeem says: Both the two ‘Shaykhs’ (Bukhari and Muslim) have narrated from Ayyub Sakhtiyani from Abdullah bin Abu Malika that:

There was an argument between Abdullah bin Umar and Abdullah bin Abbas regarding weeping on the dead and they went to seek the advice of Ayesha. She said: By God, the Prophet never forbade weeping, because the dead

¹ *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:335-337 [1/393, 551, H. 2128 & 3093]; . *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:190 [3/210, H. 48691 and he has regarded this report as authentic.

² *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 1:381 [1/537, H. 14061.

³ *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 1:381 [1/537, H. 14071.

is punished due to weeping of someone else. On the contrary, he said that when the survivors of a dead disbeliever are weeping for him, the chastisement is increasing on the dead. Because:

وَأَنَّهُ هُوَ أَضْحَكَ وَأَبْكَى ﴿٢﴾

“And that He it is Who makes (men) laugh and makes (them) weep;”¹

And also:

وَلَا تَتِرُّ وَأَزِرَّ وَوَزَرَ أُخْرَى

“And no bearer of burden shall bear the burden of another.”²

Shafei says in Ikhtelaaful Hadees:³

According to the evidence of Quran and Sunnah, the quotation of Ayesha from the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) is most correct and reliable, because Almighty Allah says:

وَلَا تَتِرُّ وَأَزِرَّ وَوَزَرَ أُخْرَى

“Nor can the bearer of a burden bear the burden of another.”⁴

وَأَنْ لَيْسَ لِلْإِنْسَانِ إِلَّا مَا سَعَى ﴿٥﴾

“And that man shall have nothing but what he strives for;”⁵

فَمَنْ يَعْمَلْ مِثْقَالَ ذَرَّةٍ خَيْرًا أَيْرَهٌ وَمَنْ يَعْمَلْ مِثْقَالَ ذَرَّةٍ شَرًّا أَيْرَهٌ ﴿٦﴾

“So he who has done an atom’s weight of good shall see it. And he who has done an atom’s weight of evil shall see it.”⁶

لِتُجْزِي كُلُّ نَفْسٍ بِمَا تَسْعَى ﴿٧﴾

“So that every soul may be rewarded as it strives.”⁷

And if you ask which Sunnah proves this matter, it would be said: The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) asked a man: “Is he your son?” “Yes,” he replied. His Eminence said: “His sin would not be placed on your neck and your sins would not be on your neck.”

Through this statement, the Prophet has like Almighty Allah announced that the crime of everyone shall be upon the doer and not anyone else, just as the

¹ Surah Najm 53:43

² Surah Anaam 6:164

³ This book is printed on the margin of his *Kitabul Umm*, 7:267 [Pg. 537].

⁴ Surah Isra 17:15

⁵ Surah Najm 53:39

⁶ Surah Zilzal 99:7-8

⁷ Surah Taha 20:15

reward of a good deed is given to the doer and not to anyone else.

In addition to the above, the weeping of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), his companions and righteous companions of companions, who wept on their dead, is the best evidence of legality of weeping.

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) wept upon the passing away of his son, Ibrahim, and remarked: “The eyes weep and the heart is aggrieved, but we don’t say, but what Almighty Allah approved. Indeed, O Ibrahim, we are shattered at your loss.”¹

Moreover, the Prophet also lamented on the passing away of his son, Tahir and remarked: “The eyes weep and the heart is aggrieved, but we definitely do not commit disobedience of Almighty Allah.”²

Also, during the tragedy of Hamza, when Safiya binte Abdul Muttalib (sister of Hamza and aunt of Prophet) was searching him and Ansar stood between her and the body of Hamza such that she was unable to see the body. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) told the Ansar: “Allow Safiya to come to Hamza’s body.”

She went and sat besides the corpse; she wept and Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) also wept with her. When she wailed aloud, the Prophet also wailed aloud. Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) also wailed and along with her the Prophet wailed and he said: “I never faced a tragedy more serious than your tragedy.”³

When the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) returned from the Battle of Uhad, the women of Ansar began to lament upon their martyrs. This was reported to the Prophet, and he said: “But is there no one, who may lament for Hamza?”

When Ansar learnt of the Prophet’s wish, they told their ladies: “From now on you don’t have the right to lament on your relatives, except after first lamenting on Hamza.”

He says: This became customary among Ansar and continues to this day. Whenever they wish to mourn ones dead, they first lament Hamza and then lament for their dead.⁴

Also, when His Eminence visited the grave of his respected mother, he wept and those present with him, too wept.⁵ In the same way, when Uthman bin Mazun passed away, His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) kissed him and tears flowed upon his face.⁶

Similarly, Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) wept on the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and remarked:

“O father, who have become proximate to Almighty Allah. O father, who harkened to the call of the Lord. O father, we present our complaints to Jibreel.

¹ *Sunan Abi Dawood*, 3:58 [3/193, H. 3126]; *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 1:482 [1/506, H. 1589].

² Majmauz Zawaad, 3:18.

³ *Imta*, Miqrizi, 154.

⁴ Majmauz Zawaad, 6:120.

⁵ *Sunan Baihaqi*, 4:70; *Tareekh Khateeb Baghdadi*, 7:289 [No. 3791].

⁶ *Sunan Abu Dawood*, 2:63 [3/201, H. 3163]; *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 1:445 [1/468, H. 1456].

O father, who has occupied the Firdos Paradise.”¹

Moreover, Fatima stood at the grave of the Prophet, picked up a handful of dust, placed it over her eyes, wept and said:

“One, who smells the dust of the grave of Prophet, how can he ever smell another fragrance? Such calamities have befallen me; that if they had fallen on days, they would have turned into nights.”

This is the Sunnah of Prophet, which was followed by companions of Prophet as well; but the Caliph, through his tradition: “The dead is punished because of weeping of living,” has opposed them. This view was only followed by him and his son, Abdullah. Whereas following the truth is worthier.²

32. Sacrifice and deduction of the Caliph

It is narrated from Huzaifah bin Usaid that:

“Abu Bakr and Umar, fearing that lest the sacrifice should be attributed to someone else, did not offer sacrifice from their families; but my family learnt about Sunnah of Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and compelled me to take the trouble to present sacrifice from their side.”³

Shafei says in his *Al-Umm*.⁴

“It has reached us that Abu Bakr and Umar refrained from sacrificing, lest people follow them thinking that it was obligatory.”

“It is narrated from Shobi that Abu Bakr and Umar participated in rituals of Hajj, but did not slaughter animals.”⁵

Allamah Amini says: Were those two aware of a command about which the Prophet was unaware? And [due to unawareness], he gave sacrifice and also ordered others to do so and encouraged them for it? And whether the point that: It is possible that people imagined this act to be obligatory, remained concealed from the Prophet and those two were aware of that?!

Or that they were more kind on the people than the Prophet? And they wanted that people should not fall into trouble to pay for the cost of sacrifice? Or that those two feared that a heresy would be formed in religion and people would regard it as obligatory?

But all these reasonings are invalid: because the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), when he ordered the giving of sacrifice, he also mentioned the absence of its incumbency and his companions also understood and they acted according on this basis. The companions of companions received this command in the same way; and this issue exists in its originality as the Prophet stated and acted. If the

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, [4/1619, H. 4193], Chapter of the illness and death of the Prophet.

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 444-445.

³ *Al-Mojamul Kabeer*, Tibrani, [3/182, H. 3058].

⁴ *Kitabal Umm*, 2:182 [2/224].

⁵ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:45 [5/219, H. 12664].

belief of Abu Bakr and Umar is correct, all recommended acts would have to be given up.

Is it justified to forsake a practice of Prophet fearing that people would come to regard it as incumbent? Because the Sunnah belongs to him and the religion is one, which he has brought. And there is nothing in his statements, which can justify such a conduct. Then why these two, who call themselves Caliphs of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), have not acted like him?

More amazing is the fact that the second Caliph, fearing that people would regard it as incumbent, opposed the proven Sunnah of Prophet. On the other hand, he has innovated so many practices, which have no basis at all. Like Zakat on horses, Tarawih prayer and hundreds of other heresies; and in any of these, he neither had fear, nor hesitation or consideration.

33. Viewpoint of Caliph regarding puberty

Abu Malika says: Umar wrote to the people of Iraq regarding the boy, who committed theft; that his height should be measured; and if it was six spans, his hand should be amputated. So they measured his height and it came to be one finger less; so they freed him.¹

Allamah Amini says: The signs of puberty according to authentic traditions of Prophet, is ejaculation. Thus, His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) says regarding persons, who are exempted: The youth, before they have ejaculation or hair growth in pubic region or reaching specified age as is mentioned in Saheeh books from Abdullah bin Umar.² There is no fourth sign of puberty. As for measuring the height of the boy; it is an innovation of Caliph and that's all and he was himself aware of his caliber.

34. Reducing the penalty

It is narrated from Abu Rafe that they brought a drunkard to Umar. Umar said:

“I am sending you to a person, who would be severe with you and he will not leave you easily.”

Then he sent him to Muti bin Aswad Adawi and said: Apply the punishment on him tomorrow morning. The following morning when Muti was busy in carrying out the orders Umar arrived and saw that he was lashing hard.

Umar said: “You have almost killed him. How many lashes have you delivered so far?”

“Sixty,” he replied.

Umar said: “Reduce twenty lashes (from eighty).”

Abu Ubaidah says: It means that the severity of lashes was considered in

¹ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:116 [5/5444, H. 13887].

² For reports on this chapter refer *Sonanul Kubraa*, Baihaqi, 6:54-59.

lieu of the remaining twenty lashes.¹

Allamah Amini says: Ponder well upon his conduct and you will see how he modifies orders. When the penalty for drinking wine, which according to Ahle Sunnat is forty lashes, he increases to eighty lashes² and when his heart was moved for the accused, he reduced twenty lashes and that also after handing him over to a man, who was cruel and merciless and about whose ferocity he was aware.

It is remarkable that he later compensated the ferocity with reduction in number of lashes. Now, all this is beyond commands of Allah and Sunnah of Prophet.

It is mentioned in traditions that:

On Judgment Day, a person will brought, who had given more lashes than legal punishment prescribed for a crime. Almighty Allah would ask: "Why did you give more lashes than prescribed?"

He will say: "My Lord, I was enraged on him for Your sake."

Allah would ask: "Does your rage surpass Mine?"

In case, he reduced punishment, Allah would ask: "Why did you punish less than what was prescribed?"

He would say: "I had pity on the accused."

Allah would ask him: "Does your mercy surpass Mine?"

This report contains a number of views, which scholars of traditions have discussed in detail.³

35. "O Abul Hasan, may God not put me in a difficulty, where you are not there to solve it."

It is narrated by Ibne Abbas that:

"The case of Bughr Naji was brought to Umar bin Khattab. He went up and down; became anxious and nervous. In other words, no matter how much he tried, he could not solve it. Till he summoned the companions and mentioned the problem to them and asked them to solve it.

They said: 'O chief of believers, you are the refuge and point of reference.'

Umar was infuriated and he said: 'Have fear of God and say that, which may be beneficial to you.'

They said: 'Chief of believers, we don't have the reply to your question.'

Umar said: 'But, I know someone, who is the source of wisdom and who can solve all difficulties. And he knows the perfect solution to this problem.'

¹ *Sonanul Kubraa*, 8:317; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, Ibne Abil Hadeed, 3:133 [12/136, Sermon 223].

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 526.

³ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:196, [5/854, H. 14551-14556].

They said: 'Perhaps you imply the son of Abu Talib?'

He replied: 'Yes, by God, has any free woman ever given birth to a son like him and has brought such a perfect man in this world? Come let us go and consult him.'

They asked: 'Do you want to approach him? Let it be, he would come to you.'

Umar said: 'Never! Don't you know that in that house is a branch and section of Bani Hashim and a branch and section of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and a sign of knowledge and it is necessary to go towards him. He does not go to anyone, and wisdom is taken from his house, so let us hasten to his place.'

In the company of Umar, they went to His Eminence and saw him seated against a wall, reciting the verse:

أَيْخَسَبَ الْإِنْسَانُ أَنْ يُنْزَكَ سُدًّى

"Does man think that he is to be left to wander without an aim?"¹

He was repeating it and weeping.

Umar said to Shuraih: 'Mention the issue to Abul Hasan.'

Shuraih said: I was a judge, when this person came to me and entrusted to me a woman, who was married at a heavy dower and another female, who was a slave mother, and said: "Provide ration to them till I return." On the first night, both women delivered a child each. One gave birth to a male and another to a female; and both claimed a higher inheritance. Each claiming that the male child was hers and each of them disowned the female child.

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) asked: How did you judge between them?

Shuraih said: If I had been able to judge between them, we would not have approached you.

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) picked up a straw and showed it to Shuraih, saying: The solution to this enigma is simpler than this straw. Then he asked for a vessel, and told one of the women: Put a little of your breast milk in this, which he weighed and then asked the second woman to put her milk, which was also weighed and found that the milk of one of them was twice heavier than the milk of the other. His Eminence (a.s.), told the second woman: Pick up your daughter and said to the first one: You may also take your son.

Then he asked Shuraih: Do you not know that the weight of the milk of a female child is half in weight to that of the male? And the inheritance of female is also half that of a male? And that her intellect is half that of male? And her testimony is also half that of male? And her blood money is also half that of a male? And in all matters she is half that of male?

¹ Surah Qiyamah 75:36

Umar was absolutely bewildered; he said: O Abul Hasan, may Allah not put me in a problem, where you not present to solve it and may He not put me in a town, where you are not present.”¹

36. Viewpoint of the caliph about three divorces

It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that:

“Pronouncing three divorces in one sitting was counted as one divorce during the lifetime of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), during the reign of Abu Bakr and initial years of Umar’s reign. But Umar said: Verily people have begun to hasten in a matter, in which they are required to observe respite. So we imposed this upon them, and he imposed it upon them.”²

Allamah Amini says: Indeed, it is amazing that haste of people should be an impetus to disregard Book of God and to act according to wish of people. It is the Holy Quran, which clearly says:

الْطَّلاقُ مَرْتَّنٌ فِي مَسَالِكِ الْمَعْرُوفِ أَوْ تَسِيرٌ حَجَّيْرَانِ

“Divorce may be (pronounced) twice, then keep (them) in good fellowship or let (them) go with kindness.”³

Till it says:

فِإِنْ طَلَّقَهَا فَلَا تَحِلُّ لَهُ مِنْ بَعْدِ حَقْتِ تَنْكِحَ زَوْجًا غَيْرَهُ

“So if he divorces her she shall not be lawful to him afterwards until she marries another husband.”⁴

In this verse, Almighty Allah considers pronouncing two divorces necessary and deemed unlawfulness after third divorce. This cannot be combined by reconciling the divorces with the term ‘thrice’ (that the man should say: I divorce you thrice) or recitation of the formula of divorce one after another and without any gap of marriage contract.

As for the first case: Since one divorce is not more and by getting the term of ‘three times’ in the formula of divorce; three divorces are not achieved. It is similar to the case of Prayer, in which it is obligatory to recite Surah Fatiha once in every unit, now if someone recites it once and after that adds the condition of ‘five times’ or ‘ten times’; it cannot be said that he repeated the recitation and that he recited the Surah five or ten times.

Every command, in which repetition and number is the condition, is the same. Like the stoning of satans during Hajj, in which it is necessary to cast

¹ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:179, [5/830, H. 14508].

² *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:314 [1/516, H. 2870]; *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:574, [3/276, H. 15, Kitabut Talaq].

³ Surah Baqarah 2:229

⁴ Surah Baqarah 2:230

seven pebbles and throwing a number of pebbles once won't be sufficient. Or four testimonies during cursing, in which one testimony is given and then adding the condition of 'four' is not sufficient. On the contrary, the cursing should be repeated four times.

Also, in case of *Adhan*, each part is supposed to be recited twice or four times: and reciting Allahu Akbar once and saying 'four' will not suffice and it will not be counted as four. Also, like recitation of Allahu Akbar five times in the Eid Prayer according to us and seven times according to Ahle Sunnat before Qiraat.¹ To say once and then add 'five times' or 'seven times' is not saying it five times or seven times.

In case of *Tasbih Prayer*², in which glorifications are recited ten or fifty times. Hence, to recite the glorification once and then say: 'ten times' or 'fifty times' will not suffice; and it cannot be said that the worshipper has recited ten or fifty times. There is no difference in what is mentioned.

As for the second one (recitation of divorce formula in one sitting): Divorce is achieved by the first word and the formula of marriage is deployed and the husband and wife are separated from each other. And the contract of marriage does not remain in force that formula of divorce should be effective upon it. Thus, recitation of formula of divorce the second and the third time would be useless.

Because for the woman, who is divorced, it is meaningless for her to be divorced twice and the tie, which is deployed, is not deployed the second time. And the repetition which is the conditions here, will not be established in this manner. On the contrary, when it is repeated after contract of marriage, even though this contract of marriage took place by reconciling with a stranger male, otherwise the later divorce will be void

Thus, according to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.): There is no divorce, except after marriage. And: There is no divorce before marriage. And: One, who has no wife, cannot divorce³⁴.

Till the time there is no contract of marriage, the second divorce would be meaningless.

Jassas says in *Ahkamul Quran*:⁵

The verse of divorce:

آل طلاق مرتضي

¹ *Sonanul Kubraa*, Nasai, 3:285-291 [Pg. 554, H. 1804].

² In our sect, *Tasbih Prayer* is known as *Namaz Ja'far Tayyar*: and there is no difference in its form and importance between *Shia* and *Ahle Sunnat*, except for some differences, which *Ahle Sunnat* have narrated from *Ibne Abbas*.

³ *Sonan Darami*, 2:161, *Sonan Abu Dawood*, 1:342; [2/258, H. 2190].

⁴ *Sonan Darami*, 2:161, *Sonan Abu Dawood*, 1:342; [2/258, H. 2190].

⁵ *Ahkamul Quran*, 1:447 [1/378].

“Divorce may be (pronounced) twice.”¹

Divorce, in which reconciliation is possible, is two times: Firstly, it is commanded that there should be a gap between two divorces. And secondly, while pronouncing the command, reconciliation is in less than three divorces; because He says:

الطلاق مرتان

“Divorce may be (pronounced) twice.”²

And the requirement of:

الطلاق مرتان

“Divorce may be (pronounced) twice.”³

...is that there should be a gap between two divorces; because if someone recites the divorce formula twice without any gap, it is incorrect to say: Divorce has occurred twice. Just as when two dirhams are given to a person, it is not said that he is paid two times, except when he is paid twice.

This was the command of Quran and every command and its like other than that is playing with Book of God. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has clarified this in a tradition narrated in *Sunan Nasai* through Mahmud bin Lubaid:

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was informed that a person his divorced his wife through three divorces in a single sitting. His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) was infuriated. He stood up and said: “Are they playing with the Book of Allah in my presence?”

A person asked: “Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), would you execute this man?”

Some Ahle Sunnat personalities have daringly and without fear discussed this matter in detail and more amazing is the statement of Aini, who says in his *Umdatul Qari*:⁴

“The divine command mentioned in Quran is abrogated.”

Now, if it is asked: In spite of the fact that Umar cannot abrogate, what is the reason of this abrogation? And how abrogation took place after the Prophet?

In reply, we say: As Umar mentioned it to companions and they did not deny, consensus is achieved. And according to some scholars, abrogation of verse of Quran is possible through consensus of companions; as it is said that consensus is similar to definite traditional report and it brings certainty; thus abrogation of Quranic verse is lawful by it.

If you say: This consensus is not valid, because they have themselves

¹ Surah Baqarah 2:229

² Surah Baqarah 2:229

³ Surah Baqarah 2:229

⁴ *Umdatul Qari*, 20:233.

fabricated this consensus.

We would say: "There is possibility that they had access to a definite traditional report abrogating this verse, which has not reached us."

What reasoning?!

The report of this abrogation has not reached to any of the past scholars till the arrival of Aini and he came and claimed what no one claimed before him!

He blindly followed a path and played with Book of Allah and does not believe in any value of Allah's Book and traditions of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.)!

If consensus abrogated the verse, then how Abu Hanifah, Malik, Awzai and Laith believe that combining three divorces is heretical?

How Shafei, Ahmad and Abu Thawr say: It is not unlawful, but it is better not to combine them and keeping them separate is preferable?

How Sanadi says: The apparent connotation of tradition proves that combining of divorces is unlawful.¹

Also, the imagined possibility that perhaps there reliable consensus or definite traditional report existed, which have not reached us, is just nonsense as clear cut statements of caliph himself and other companions as well, clearly falsify that.

In addition to that, the viewpoint of the caliph was his personal opinion and a political stance.

How apt is the statement of Shaykh Salih Muhammad Umari Fulani (d. 1298 A.H.) in his *Humam Ulul Absar*:²

"It was well known among the companions, companions of companions and righteous followers till Judgment Day and among all Muslim scholars that whenever the judgment of religious judge is opposed to clear injunction of Quran or statement of Prophet it is obligatory to oppose that order and to resist its application. And with logical possibilities, selfish thoughts and satanic prejudices, it is not possible to oppose Quran and traditions and to say: Perhaps this jurist was having access to this text and with a proof, which was clear to him, he has abandoned it, or he was aware of some other proof and statements like this, which some foolish jurists have issued and which their stupid followers have followed."

37. The caliph's view about non-Arabs

Malik – the leaders of the Malikis – has narrated from a trustworthy person that he heard from Saeed bin Musayyab that:

"Umar bin Khattab deprived the non-Arabs from inheritance, except that he

¹ Gloss of Imam Sanadi on the margins of *Sunan Nasai*, 6:143.

² Iqaz *Humam Ulul Absar*: 9.

or she should be born among the Arabs.”

Malik says: If a pregnant woman comes from enemy land to Arab lands and she delivers the child there, it would be regarded as her child and if she dies that child would inherit her, and if the child dies, the mother would inherit from it, and its inheritance is specified in the Book of Allah.¹

Allamah Amini says: This command is the product of concealed prejudice, because it is from the needs of religion that inheritance is there for all Muslims, whether they are Arabs or non-Arabs, wherever they may be born and wherever they might reside; and the declarations of Quran and Sunnah also prove this point

And generalities of Quran are not restricted, and it is not from the conditions of inheritance that one should be an Arab or that one should be born among Arabs. Neither is it necessary to be born among Arabs in order to be able to inherit and neither is being an Arab a condition of Islam. And such prejudices are numerous, which destroy social ties and create disunity among Muslims. But it is not on the basis of statement of Almighty Allah:

إِنَّمَا الْمُؤْمِنُونَ إِخْوَةٌ

“The believers are but brethren.”²

And:

إِنَّ أَكْرَمَكُمْ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ أَتْقَلْكُمْ

“Surely the most honorable of you with Allah is the one among you most careful (of his duty).”³

And:

وَلَوْ جَعَلْنَاهُ قُرْآنًا أَعْجَمِيًّا لَقَالُوا لَوْلَا فَصَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ

“And if We had made it a Quran in a foreign tongue, they would certainly have said: Why have not its communications been made clear? What! a foreign (tongue) and an Arabian!”⁴

Muslims are also like the teeth of a comb (equal) and they are not superior to each other, except in piety.

This is the message that the great Prophet delivered in his sermon to the huge crowd when he said:

“O people, indeed the believers are brothers and the property of none of the believers is lawful for another, except through his inner approval...O people, your Lord is one and your father is one, all of you are the children of Adam, and Adam was created from dust, the most honorable among you in the sight of God

¹ *Muwattah Malik*, 2:12 [2/520, H. 14, Kitabul Faraid].

² Surah Hujurat 49:10

³ Surah Hujurat 49:13

⁴ Surah Fussilat 41:44

is one, who is the most pious, and no Arab has any precedence over a non-Arab, except through piety...”¹

It is mentioned in the report of Ahmad that:²

“Know that no Arab has any superiority over a non-Arab and no non-Arab has any superiority over an Arab; and no black skinned one has any superiority over a red skinned one and no red skinned one has any superiority over a black skinned one, except through piety.”

Haithami says:³ “The chain of narrators of the above tradition is authentic.”

The teachings and exhortations of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and restriction of His Eminence to personalities imbued with different virtues was placed before the view of everyone; like: “Salman is from us, Ahle Bayt.”⁴

And: “Even if knowledge were to be placed on the Pleiades, some people of Persia would access it.”⁵

And many of his statements are as such.

On the basis of this, it is incumbent on every Muslim to avoid such divisive views and to not forget the statement of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), when he says:

“One, who invites to racial prejudice is not from us and one, who confronts through prejudice is not from us, and one, who dies with prejudice is not from us.”⁶

Also:

“One, who fights blindly under a standard in such a manner that his anger, call and help is from the aspect of prejudice, he is killed on the belief of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*).”⁷

38. Taking permission from Ayesha

It is narrated from Amr bin Maimoon that:

Umar bin Khattab said to his son, “Abdullah: Go to Ayesha, mother of believers and say: Umar conveys his greetings to you – and don’t say ‘chief of believers’, because today I am not the chief of believers – and seeks your permission for my burial besides Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and his friend, Abu Bakr.”

¹ *Al-Bayan wat Tabaiyyan*, 2:25 [2/23]; *Iqdul Fareed*, 2:85 [3/238]; *Tareekh Yaqubi*, 2:91 [2/111].

² *Musnad Ahmad*, [6/570, H. 22978].

³ *Majmauz Zawaad*, 3:266.

⁴ *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 3:598 [3/691, H. 6539].

⁵ *Musnad Ahmad*, 2:420 & 422 [3/149, H. 9153; & 153, H. 9177] Ibne Qane has narrated through his authorities: If knowledge was hanging from the Pleiades star, people of Persia would definitely have obtained it.” *Al-Isabah*, 3:459 [No. 8211].

⁶ *Sonan Abi Dawood*, 2:332 [4/332, H. 5121].

⁷ *Sonan Baihaqi*, 8:156.

Abdullah went to Ayesha and greeted her and sought permission to enter. When he entered, he saw Ayesha weeping and said:

“Umar conveys greetings to you and asks your permission for burial besides Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and Abu Bakr.”

Ayesha said: “I myself wanted to be buried at that place, but now I prefer him over myself.”

So, Abdullah returned from there. When people saw him, they remarked: Abdullah has returned. Umar said: “Raise me up.”

People helped him to rise up. Umar asked: “What happened?”

Abdullah replied: “Permission is granted for what the chief of believers requested.”

Umar said: “Praise be to Allah, nothing was more important to be than this place of burial; thus, when I pass away, carry my body there and if Ayesha changes her view and prevents the burial, take me to the cemetery of Muslims and bury me there.”¹

Allamah Amini says: Alas, if the Caliph had only mentioned for us the reason of seeking permission from Ayesha. Did Ayesha inherit the chamber of Prophet and became its owner? If it is as such, then what will happen to the imaginary and fabricated tradition attributed to Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) that:

“We prophets do not leave anything in inheritance; and whatever we leave is charity.”²!

The same tradition, on which they based their argument for usurpation of Fadak from Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) and Abu Bakr deprived Ayesha and other wives of Prophet from their one-eighth share of their inheritance.²

If Umar had understood at that time that this traditional report was not authentic, he would have changed his previous view, then why did he not take permission from heirs of daughter of Prophet? Because taking permission from them was more important than taking permission from others. As they were the actual owners and Ayesha was eligible for only one-ninth from one-eighth of inheritance.

Because the Prophet was survived by nine wives and from this aspect one-ninth from one-eighth of the chamber would come in share of Ayesha and perhaps her share was only one hand-span or less than two hand-spans and this much was not sufficient to accommodate the body of Caliph.

Supposing even if the share of his daughter, Hafasa, is added to it, even then, it will not have the capacity to accommodate his body. On the basis of this, for Ayesha to exercise discretion over that house, owned by the holy progeny of

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 2:263; and 5:226 [1/469, H. 1328; and 3/1355, H. 3497].

² *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:390 [3/361].

Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and the mothers of believers, was not compatible to Islamic law.

How often at this point the reader sees the statement of Ibne Battal, who says:

“Umar sought permission of Ayesha, as her house was located at that place and she had a right to it.”¹

And he imagines that Ayesha had a right in that house and from this aspect her permission was necessary. But one should know that Ayesha only had the right to live in that house and the house was only attributed to her and this does not make her the owner of that place!

Ibne Hajar says in *Fathul Bari*:² “In order to prove that Ayesha owned that house, by her residence there and her inheriting, they have argued it through Umar’s taking permission from her for burial over there.

But this reasoning is invalid; because at the most the right Ayesha had was only the right of residing over there and to benefit from that. And right to benefit is not like right to inherit (that she may allow it for Abu Bakr) and the order for the wives of Prophet is same as order for women during waiting period, because after passing away of Prophet, they cannot remarry. [That is why, they, like wives during waiting period, had only the right of residence in the house of husband].

Thus, the mother of believers, like wives during waiting period, only had the right of residence in the chamber of Prophet and she had no right of ownership.”

The great tragedy is that scholars, without paying attention to the general law of Islam regarding discretion on property, regard this taking of permission and burial of Caliph there as an excellence of Umar!

And I don’t know by which right the holy grandson of Prophet – Imam Hasan (a.s.) – made a bequest to be buried in that chamber?

Did Ayesha prevent the burial of Imam Hasan (a.s.) there Or not? Or she gave permission, but they did not obey her?

And ‘one, who is not obeyed has no opinion’; because Bani Umayyah took up arms and said:

“We will not allow him to be interred besides Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.),” and discord was about to appear.³

39. The Caliph’s sermon at Jabiya

It is narrated from Ali bin Rabah Nakhai that:

Umar delivered a sermon saying: “One, who has a query about the Holy

¹ *Fathul Bari*, 3:200 [7/66].

² *Fathul Bari*, 7:53 [7/66].

³ *Tareekh Ibne Kaseer*, 8:44 [8/48, Incidents of the year 49 A.H.].

Quran, should address it to Ubayy bin Kaab; and one, who has a query regarding the lawful and the unlawful, should address it to Maaz bin Jabal; and one, who has a query about obligations (inheritance) should ask Zaid bin Thabit; and one, who has a query about monies should refer to me, because I am the treasurer.”

It is mentioned in another version: “Because Allah, the Mighty and High has appointed me as caretaker and distributor of monies.”¹

In this authentic and narrated sermon from the Caliph, which is narrated through correct chains of authorities and its narrators also being reliable, and Hakeem and Dhahabi have also considered it authentic, the admission is that in those three sciences, only those three mentioned were point of reference for Caliph and the Caliph had no duty, except to control funds.

Is it logical that someone, who is ignorant of these three sciences, whose points of reference were some other people – as is clear from his account – and that he should be regarded as successor of Prophet in matters concerning religion and issues related to Quran and Sunnah, and its branches?

How much is the disparity between the issuer of this statement one, who, always cast himself into intricate problems and intellectual difficulties and without any qualms solved issues of religion! One, who declared from the pulpit:

“Ask me, before you are deprived of me. As after me, you will not get anyone like me whom you can ask.”²

And he says: “You will not ask me about any verses of Quran and tradition of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), except that I would reply to you.”³

He also says: “O people, ask me. By God, you will not ask me of the reports of future till Judgment Day, but that I would reply to you; and ask me about Book of Allah, by Allah, there is not a verse in it, but that I know whether it was revealed during the night or day; in the plains or on mountain.”⁴

He also says: “Is there no one, who would ask me, so that he would benefit himself and his companions?”⁵

He also says: “By God, no verse was revealed, but that I know about whom it was revealed and where it was revealed; because my Lord has bestowed me with a very grasping mind and a very vocal tongue.”⁶

¹ *Kitabul Amwal*, Abu Ubaid (d. 224 A.H.): 223 [Pg. 285, H. 548], through authorities whose narrators are trustworthy; *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:271 & 272 [3/305, H. 5187; and 306, H. 5191].

² Hakeem has mentioned this traditional report in his *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 2:466 [2/506, H. 3736] and he and Zahabi regard it as authentic.

³ Ibne Kaseer, in his *Tafseer* 4:231, has narrated this through two chains of narrators and remarked: It is narrated through many channels.

⁴ *Jami Bayanul Ilm*, Abu Amr, 1:114 [Pg. 137, H. 673]; *Riyazun Nazara*, Mohib Tabari, 2:198 [3/147].

⁵ *Jami Bayanul Ilm*, Abu Amr, 1:114 [Pg. 137, H. 671]; [Mukhtasar Jaameul Bayanul Ilm, 104, No. 82].

⁶ Abu Nuaim has narrated this in *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:68 and has also mentioned it in *Miftahus*

He also says: "Ask me before you are deprived of me. Ask me about Book of Allah and know that there is no verse in it, except that I know the place of its revelation; whether it was revealed on mountain or on plains. And ask me about calamities and mischiefs, because there is no mischief, except that I know, who would create it and who would be killed in it."

This tradition is mentioned by Ahmad, the imam of Hanbalis, who adds the remark:

"Many such statements are narrated from him."¹

Also, when His Eminence was seated on the pulpit at Kufa, wearing the coat of mail of Prophet, carrying sword of His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) and had the Prophet's turban on his head, he pulled up his garments and declared:

"Ask me, before you are deprived of me. Indeed, there is excess of knowledge in my breast. This is the casket of perfume of knowledge, this is the syrup of knowledge of Prophet, and this is knowledge, which Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) placed in my breast grain by grain. By Allah, if I occupy the chair of knowledge, I would definitely reply to Jews through their Taurat and Christians through their Injeel till Almighty Allah makes Taurat and Injeel speak up: Ali is right, indeed your reply is according to what is revealed in me. *While you read the Book; have you then no sense?*"²

Saeed bin Musayyab says: "Except for Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), no companion ever declared: 'Ask me.'"³

Note

Before our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), his brother, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), time and again declared: "Ask me whatever you like." And his statement: "Ask me, ask me"; and his words: "Ask me; you will not ask me anything, except that I would inform you of it."⁴

In history, I have not seen anyone, who places himself before most intricate problems and difficult issues and numerous queries, and on gatherings of knowledge, announces aloud and with courage says: "Ask me, whatever you like."

And after His Eminence, no one uttered this statement, except that he was humiliated and caught in quagmire of disgrace and with his own hands removed the veil; persons like:

1. Moosa bin Harun Hammal says:

It was reported to me that Qatada entered Kufa and organized a gathering for

¹ *Saada*, 1:400.

² *Yanabiul Mawaddah*: 274 [1/72, Chapter 14].

³ *Faraaezus Simtain*, [1/341, H. 263, Chapter 63].

³ Ahmad has narrated this in *Manaqib*, [Pg. 153, H. 220]; and Mohib Tabari in *Riyaz*, 2:198 [3/146]; and Ibne Hajar in *Sawaiq*, 76 [Pg. 127].

⁴ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 2:46; 10:240 & 241 [1/200, H. 515; & 6/2660, H. 6864].

himself, in which he said: “Ask me about Sunnah of Prophet so that I may reply to you.”

Some people said to Abu Hanifah: “Get up and ask a question.”

Abu Hanifah rose up and asked: “Abu Khattab, what do you say regarding the person, who disappears from his family and his wife marries someone else and after that he returns and tells her: You fornicatress, in spite of the fact that I am alive, you got married? At this point the second husband arrives and asks: What has happened?”

Qatada said: “I will not reply to such questions. Ask me about Quran.”

Abu Hanifah asked: “What do you say about the statement of Almighty Allah:

قَالَ الَّذِي عِنْدَهُ عِلْمٌ مِّنْ الْكِتَبِ أَكَانَتِكَ بِهِ

“One who had the knowledge of the Book said: I will bring it to you.”¹

And what was the implication of that person?

Qatada said: “He was the cousin of Sulaiman bin Dawood, who knew the great name of Allah (*Isme Aazam*).”

Abu Hanifah asked: “Was Sulaiman also knowing the great name of Allah (*Isme Aazam*)?”

“No,” replied Qatada.

Abu Hanifah said: “God forbid, how is it possible that there should be someone more knowledgeable than a prophet in his presence?”

Qatada said: “I will also not reply to queries related to Quranic exegesis. Ask me about what the people differ in.”

Abu Hanifah asked: “Are you a believer?”

He replied: “I hope so.”

Abu Hanifah asked: “Then why didn’t you reply like Prophet Ibrahim (a.s.) as Allah has mentioned in Holy Quran?

أَوَلَمْ تُؤْمِنْ طَقَالَ بَنِي

“What! and do you not believe? He said: Yes.”²

Qatada said: “Take my hand and lift me up, as by Allah, I will never come back to this place!”³

2. It is narrated about Qatada that: He arrived in Kufa and people gathered around him and he said: “Ask me whatever you like.”

¹ Surah Naml 27:40

² Surah Baqarah 2:260

³ *Al-Intifa*, Abu Amr, 156.

Abu Hanifah, who was a youth at that time was present in that gathering, and he said: “Ask him about the ant of Prophet Sulaiman (a.s.), whether it was a male or a female?”

People asked him and Qatada was unable to reply. But Abu Hanifah said: “It was female.”

They asked: “What is the proof?”

He replied: “On the basis of statement Allah: ‘She said’; if it had been a male, it would have been ‘he said’; like in case of ‘Hamama’ and ‘Shaha’, that in spite of ‘ta’ of femininity being used in the masculine as well as feminine.”¹

3. Ubaidullah bin Muhammad bin Harun says:

I heard Shafei saying in Mecca: “Ask me, whatever you want, so that I may reply through Quran and Sunnah.” They asked: What is your opinion about the person in Ihram, who kills a wasp? He replied:

وَمَا أَتَكُمُ الرَّسُولُ فَخُذُوهُ

“And whatever the Apostle gives you, accept it.”²

40. The Caliph and learning of Surah Baqarah

Khatib in *Ruwatul Malik* and Baihaqi in *Shaabul Imaan*,³ and Qurtubi in his *Tafseer*, have narrated through reliable channels from Abdullah bin Umar that:

“Umar memorized Surah Baqarah in twelve years and when he accomplished it, he sacrificed a camel.”⁴

In his *Tafseer*, Qurtubi says:⁵ “Umar learnt Surah Baqarah and obtained its understanding and knowledge in twelve years.”

Allamah Amini says: This shows that he was not having attachment to Quran, which is the most important source of Islam and encompassing knowledge regarding the needs of humanity and he did not give any importance to it; that he took such a long time to memorize a chapter from it.

Perhaps, as it is mentioned in numerous writings; and which he himself and some companions have admitted that his excessive interest and time spent in the market prevented him from learning the Quran.

Or it was due to lack of capability and weak memory that he could not remember the issues properly and that is why he needed to repeat and practice a great deal to retain the verses.

¹ *Hayatul Haiwan*, 2:368 [2/377].

² Surah Hashr 59:7; *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, Zahabi, 2:288 [2:755, No. 756].

³ *Shaabul Imaan*, [2/331, H. 1957].

⁴ *Tafseer Qurtubbi*, 1:34 [1/30; and it is mentioned on Pg. 31: He memorized Surah Baqarah in ten years.]; *Seerah Umar*, Ibne Jauzi: 165 [Pg. 171]; Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed, 3:111 [12/66, Sermon 223]; *Durre Mansoor*, 1:21 [1/54].

⁵ Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran, 1:132 [1/107].

The previous statement¹ of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), which he addressed to him: “Indeed, I think that you will leave the world before learning that.”

And the statement of His Eminence² regarding him, addressed to Hafasa: “I don’t think your father would learn that.”

And the above-mentioned statement of His Eminence to him: “I think that you would pass away before learning that.”

And statement of Prophet regarding him when he said to Hafasa: “I don’t think your father would remember that.”

And the statement of His Eminence (s.a.w.a.): “I don’t think that he would learn it.”

All of them support the second possibility. And the support of this point is mentioned in books:

“Umar was more intelligent and knowledgeable than Uthman, but memorizing Quran was difficult for him.”³

Whatever the reason may be, it is certain that he was unable to memorize Surah Baqarah during lifetime of Prophet, because Surah Baqarah, except for some verses revealed in Farewell Hajj, according to the opinion of all exegists, was revealed in Medina, and Ayesha says:

“Surah Baqarah and Surah Nisa were not revealed, but that I was with Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).”⁴

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), according to Ahle Sunnat, passed away in Rabiul Awwal of 11th year of Hijra. From this aspect, he had not learnt Surah Baqarah from the Prophet. On the contrary, he learnt it from one or more companions; and they were the same persons about whom the sayer says:

“The Caliph was generally the most knowledgeable of companions.”

Also, this shows that he was unaware of most of the sciences present in other Surahs, and memorizing Quran in this manner, keeping in mind its length, would have required at least 130 years.

Thus, by this calculation the Caliph would have needed a period of 150 years to memorize the whole Quran. And the age of Caliph was not sufficient for him to memorize Quran; especially when rules contained in other Surahs are more than what is contained in Surah Baqarah.

So, he was the Caliph as well as a learner, whereas the Caliph is supposed to be a teacher and not a learner. That is why he was unaware of numerous laws present in the Quran. And he regarded the simplest issue to be most difficult and claimed:

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 523.

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 528.

³ *Umdatul Qari*, 2:733 [5/203] quoting from *Nihaya*.

⁴ *Fathul Bari*, 8:130 [8/160].

“It is prohibited to discuss or analyze this issue.”¹

He often mentioned the statement: “One, who wants to inquire something related to Quran, should contact Ubayy bin Kaab...” till the end as was mentioned above.²

This was the condition of the Caliph, before he was involved in forgetfulness. As for after forgetting:

Muhammad bin Sirrin narrates that Umar, in the last part of his life, became so absent-minded that he used to forget the number of units in prayers. Therefore, he used to make a person stand beside him who may remind him when he is in doubt. So, when that person gestured for Umar to arise, he rose up and when he hinted to him to perform genuflection, he used to genuflect.³

Indeed, man should be amazed at the fact that he, with all these conditions, and inspite of excessive errors committed by him, and which became clear; how he did not restrain from issuing decrees and commands??!

Like father like son

In *Muwattah*, Malik narrates that:⁴

“Abdullah Ibne Umar spent eight years in learning Surah Baqarah by heart.”

Aini says in *Umdatul Qari*:⁵

“It took twelve years for Abdullah Ibne Umar to learn Surah Baqarah by heart.”

Viewpoint of Caliph regarding Hajje Tamatto and Fixed time marriage

41. Hajje Tamatto

1. It is narrated from Abu Rijaa that Imran bin Husain said:

“The verse of Hajje Tamatto was revealed in Quran and following it the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ordered us to act upon it. And after that neither any verse was revealed abrogating it, nor the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) prohibited it till he passed away. On the contrary, a man according to his wish, issued an opinion.”⁶

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 517.

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 542.

³ *Seerah Umar bin Khattab*, Ibne Jauzi, 135 [169]; *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*, 3:110 [12/65, Sermon 223].

⁴ *Muwattah*, Malik, 1:162 [1/205, H. 11]; *Al-Jaameul Akhakul Quran*, 1:34 [1/30, 107].

⁵ *Umdatul Qari*, 2:732 [5/203].

⁶ *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:474 [3/71, H. 172, Kitabul Hajj]; also Ref: *Saheeh Muslim* [3/71, H. 169-171, Kitabul Hajj]; Qurtubbi has also mentioned it in the same words in his *Tafseer*, 2:365 [2/258]. Also refer to *Saheeh Bukhari*, 3:151 [2/569, H. 1496], published 1272 A.H. and *Saheeh Bukhari*, Kitabul Tafseer, Surah Baqarah, 7:24 [4/1642, H. 4246], published 1277 A.H.

It is mentioned in some copies of *Saheeh Bukhari* that Muhammad Bukhari said: ‘That person’ implies Umar.

Qastalani says in *Irshad*:¹

“Since it was he (Umar), who prohibited it.”

Ibne Kathir in his *Tafseer*,² quoting from *Bukhari*, says:

“This issue, which *Bukhari* has said in concealed manner, in another place, he has clearly mentioned that Umar forbid Hajje Tamatto.”

2. It is narrated from Abu Moosa that he issued verdict for the lawfulness of Hajje Tamatto. A person said to him: Exercise restraint in delivering some of your religious verdicts, for you do not know what the Commander of Believers has introduced in the rites (of Hajj) after you (when you were away in Yemen). He (Abu Moosa) met him (Umar) subsequently and asked him (about it), whereupon Umar said: I know that Allah’s Apostle (s.a.w.a.) and also his companions did that (observed Tamatto’), but I do not approve that married persons should have intercourse with their wives under the shade of the trees, and then set out for Hajj with water trickling down from their heads.”³

3. It is narrated from Saalim that:

“I was seated in the Masjid with Ibne Umar when a Syrian arrived and inquired about Hajje Tamatto. Ibne Umar said: “It is a good thing.” The Syrian said: “Your father prohibited it?” Ibne Umar said: “Woe upon you, my father may have prohibited it, but the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself acted upon it and commanded it. Should I act on the orders of my father or on the commands of the Prophet? Arise and go away from here.”⁴

4. It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that he said to someone, who argued with him regarding Hajje Tamatto through the acts of Abu Bakr and Umar:

“It is near that a stone would crash on your head from heavens. I am saying: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) said this and you are saying: Abu Bakr and Umar said such and such?”⁵

42. Fixed time marriage

1. It is narrated from Jabir bin Abdullah that: “We used to contract Fixed time marriage with women during lifetime of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and Abu Bakr and even during a long time in the tenure of Umar, in exchange for a handful of dates or flour for a few days, till Umar prohibited it in the incident of Amr bin Huraith.”⁶

¹ *Irshadus Sari*, [10/61, H. 4518].

² *Tafseer Ibne Kaseer*, 1:223.

³ *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:472 [3/67, H. 157, *Kitabul Hajj*]; *Sunan Ibne Majah*, 2:229 [2/992, H. 2979]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:50 [1/81, H. 353]; *Sunanul Kubraa*, 5:153 [2/348, H. 3715].

⁴ *Tafseer Qurtubbi*, 2:365 [2/258] quoting from *Darqutni*.

⁵ *Zaadul Maad*, Ibne Qayyim, 1:215 [1/209]; gloss on *Sharahul Mawahib*, 2:328.

⁶ *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:395 [3/194, H. 16, *Kitabun Nikah*]; *Jaameul Usul*, Ibne Asir, [12/135, H.

2. Hakam says: Ali (a.s.) said: “If Umar had not prohibited Fixed time marriage, no one would have committed fornication, except one who is absolutely wretched.”¹

3. It is narrated from Ibne Jarih from Ataa that: I heard Ibne Abbas say: “May God have mercy on Umar, Fixed time marriage is nothing, but a divine mercy on the Ummah of Muhammad; and if Umar had not prohibited it, only a very few persons would have committed fornication.”²

4. Umar said: “By God, I will one leave one, who regards Fixed time marriage (*Mutah*) as lawful, but that I will have him stoned.”³

It is narrated from Nafe from Abdullah bin Umar that he was asked regarding Fixed time marriage (*Mutah*).

He replied: “It is unlawful. Know that if Umar bin Khattab apprehended anyone in this act, he invariably had him stoned to death.”⁴

Two Mutahs: Mutah of Hajj and Mutah of women

1. It is narrated from Umar that he said in a sermon:

“Two Mutahs existed during the lifetime of Prophet and they were lawful, but I prohibit both, and I would punish whoever performs them: i.e. Hajje Tamatto and Fixed time marriage.”

It is mentioned in the words of Jassas:

“If I had prohibited them before this I would have stoned to death one, who performed them.”⁵

Mamun argued its lawfulness through this same traditional report and decided to issue orders for its legality.⁶

The sermon of Umar regarding these two Mutahs in the words mentioned above is accepted by all through consensus.

2. Tabari in the book of *Mustabayyan*, has narrated from Umar that:

“Three things were lawful during lifetime of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.); but I declared them unlawful, and I will punish whoever practices them: Hajje Tamatto, Fixed time marriage and *Hayya Alaa Khairil Amal*⁷ in *Adhan*.”

These were some of the traditions of two Mutahs, which exceed more than

¹ 8953]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 8:294 [16/523, H. 45732].

² *Tafseer Tabari*, 5:9 [*Jaameul Bayan*, No. 4/ Vol. 5-13]; *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:200 [10/50]; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:140 [2/486].

³ *Ahkamul Quran*, Jassas, 2:179 [2/147]; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:140 [2/487].

⁴ This report is mentioned Bani Umayyah Sibte Ibne Jauzi in *Miratuz Zaman*.

⁵ *Sonanul Kubraa*, Baihaqi, 7:206.

⁶ *Al-Bayan wa Tabaiyyan*, Jahiz, 2:223 [2/193]; *Ahkamul Quran*, Jassas, 1:342 & 345; 2:184 [1/290 & 293 & 2/152]; *Tafseer Kabeer*, 2:167 & 3:201-202 [5/153 & 10/52-53]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 8:293 [16/519, H. 45715 and Pg. 521, H. 45722].

⁷ *Wafayatul Ayan*, 2:359 [6/150, No. 793].

⁷ A line from *Adhan*: “Hasten to the best of deeds.”

forty. Some of them are authentic and some are good. All of them prove that both the Mutahs were allowed during lifetime of Prophet according to verses of Quran revealed regarding them and according to Sunnah of Prophet, and Umar was first to prohibit them.

Other opinions regarding two Mutahs

These were some traditions, which are narrated regarding *Mutah* of Hajj and *Mutah* of women. And as you will note, this same Quran and Sunnah is sufficient to prove lawfulness of those two during lifetime of Prophet and absence of their abrogation.

But other than these, there are other numerous traditions as well, which prove their lawfulness, but I have refrained from mentioning them due to the fact that prohibition of Umar is not mentioned in them. And without any doubt, prohibition of Umar regarding these two Mutahs was only his personal opinion and deduction without proof as opposed to clear textual declaration.

Hajje Tamatto

The only reason of his prohibition is that he was not pleased at the condition of people that after concluding the Umrah, with water of ritual bath dripping from their hair and faces, they should begin to perform rituals of Hajj. He is oblivious of the fact that Allah, the Mighty and High is more cognizant of the condition of people. And Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) also, according to declaration of the above mentioned tradition and traditions soon to be mentioned, was also aware of the situation of this definite command and its permanence till Judgment Day.

Thus, whatever Umar presented, was only a kind of *Istihsaan* (application of discretion) and a baseless command lacking proof. In opposition to Quran and Sunnah, it cannot be relied upon in any way.

What was mentioned till now is the personal opinion of Caliph as he himself admitted that they were his own opinions. But in Ahle Sunnat books, in order to support these baseless verdicts and to strengthen the viewpoint of Caliph, they have provided many baseless arguments, which are not compatible with the explanation of Caliph; and all are imaginary excuses, which cannot prove that view and basically cannot make one needless of truth.

Also, the severity of Uthman on anyone, who performed Hajje Tamatto reached to such an extent that he almost had our master, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) eliminated.

Those, who wish to learn more on this subject may refer to the book of *Zaadul Maad* of Ibne Qayyim Jauzi.¹

Fixed-time marriage

It is concluded from the statements of Umar that he regarded Fixed time

¹ *Zaadul Maad*, Ibne Qayyim, 1:177-225 [1/171-219].

marriage as fornication. That is why he has mentioned in a traditional report that:

“Narrate the command so that lawful marriage may be identified from fornication.”

At that time and during the time of companions of Prophet there no sign of abrogation of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) existed and whenever there was a discussion among companions regarding this, those who believed in its lawfulness, argued through Quran and Sunnah of Prophet and those who believed in its unlawfulness, only based their arguments on the statement and prohibition of Umar.

The statement of Umar himself: “I prohibit the two,” clearly negates their abrogation.

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and Ibne Abbas also clearly refuted its invalidity and attributed its invalidation only to Umar and each of companions and companions of companions, who regarded them as lawful, have also argued through this.

In *Al-Ghadeer*,¹ Allamah Amini has mentioned the names of twenty companions and companions of companions, who regarded Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) lawful. Among them being:

1. Jabir bin Abdullah.²

2. Abdullah bin Masud. Alusi, in his *Tafseer*,³ has mentioned the tradition of Ibne Masud regarding the verse of:

فَمَا أَسْتَهِنَّ تَعْتَمِدُ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَاتُوهُنَّ أُجُورَهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by, give them their dowries as appointed.”⁴

Ibne Hazm in *Al-Mahalli*,⁵ and Zarqani in *Shark Muwattah*⁶ have included Ibne Masud among those, who believed in lawfulness of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*).

Scholar of traditions have also narrated from him that:

“When we participated in battles with Prophet, women used not to accompany us. So, we petitioned the Prophet if he would permit us to masturbate. His Eminence prohibited us from this, but allowed us to contract Fixed time marriages with at least a dower of a piece of cloth. Then he said:

لَا تُحِرِّمُوا طَيِّبَاتَ مَا أَحَلَّ اللَّهُ لَكُمْ

¹ *Al-Ghadeer*, 6/311-314.

² *Umdatul Qari*, Aini, 8:310 [17/246]; *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:395 [3/194, H. 17, Kitabun Nikah].

³ *Tafseer Alusi*, 5:5.

⁴ Surah Nisa 4:24

⁵ *Al-Mahalli*, [9/519, Question 1854].

⁶ *Shark Zarqani* on *Muwattah* of Malik, [3/154, H. 1178, Kitabul Nikah].

“Do not forbid (yourselves) the good things which Allah has made lawful for you.”¹

At this point, Jassas says after mentioning this verse:

لَا تُحِرِّمُوا طَيِّبَاتَ مَا أَحَلَّ اللَّهُ لَكُمْ

“Do not forbid (yourselves) the good things which Allah has made lawful for you.”²

That this is the verse, which Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) recited at the time of legalizing Fixed time marriage.

3. Abdullah Ibne Umar.³

4. Ubayy bin Kaab, whose recitation will be mentioned further on.⁴

Yes, afterwards, some people arrived and wished to justify the prohibition of Umar. Therefore, sometimes they claimed that the verse was abrogated with another verse; and sometimes claimed that the verse was abrogated by Sunnah. So they confronted each other regarding this and falsified each other; each of them tried to refute the statements of others. Some of them said that the verse was abrogated by the verse:

يَا أَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ إِذَا طَلَّقْتُمُ النِّسَاءَ فَطَلِّقُوهُنَّ لِعِدَّتِهِنَّ

“O Prophet! when you divorce women, divorce them for their prescribed time.”⁵

Some of them said: It was abrogated through the verse:

وَالَّذِينَ هُمْ لِفُرُوجِهِمْ حَفِظُونَ ۝ إِلَّا عَلَىٰ أَزْوَاجِهِمْ أَوْ مَا مَلَكَتْ أَيْمَانُهُمْ
فَإِنَّهُمْ عَيْنُ مَلُوْمِينَ ۝

“And who guard their private parts, except before their mates or those whom their right hands possess, for they surely are not blameable,”⁶

Because a *Mutah* wife is neither a lawful wife nor a slave girl.

Some have also said: This verse was abrogated through the verse of inheritance, because the *Mutah* wife does not inherit.

These are all nonsensical statements, because in the contrary case, we will

¹ Surah Maidah 5:87; *Saheeh Bukhari*, 8:7 [2/1953, H. 4787], *Kitabun Nikah*; *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:354 [3/192, H. 11, *Kitabun Nikah*]; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:307 [3/140] quoting from nine scholars (imams and Huffaz) of traditions.

² Surah Maidah 5:87

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 2:95 [2/225, H. 5661].

⁴ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 553.

⁵ Surah Talaq 65:1

⁶ Surah Mominoon 23:5-6

have to believe that these verses, which abrogated the verse of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) were those about whom the companions were unaware. That also despite the presence of those, who believed in its lawfulness most prominent of them being our chief, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), who was knowledgeable about all aspects of Quran.

In addition to this, the objective of Allah, the Mighty and the High in the first verse is separation through divorce and not every separation; otherwise it would have also included slave girls and it would abrogate that as well, whereas no one believes that and no one regards that as fornication.

As for the second verse

To make it as evidence for negation of wifehood of *Mutah* wife is a penalty; because all who believe in the lawfulness of Fixed time marriage believe that it is a legal marriage. On the basis of this, to reason lawfulness of Fixed-time marriage by this verse is worthier than reasoning the abrogation of verse of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*).

As for the verse of inheritance: It basically has no connection with this issue, because traditional reports, especially about Fixed time marriage have negated inheritance and this has no connection with the tie of marriage. It example is that in traditional reports, inheritance is negated for the killer or disbeliever son, without negating his 'son-ship'.

As for the claim of its abrogation through Sunnah

Discussions regarding this are very lengthy and comprehensive, and there are numerous views about this, but none of them is compatible with other and the reader is also helpless to get proper awareness from traditions fabricated to oppose authentic traditions and reliable history.

It is interesting that each of those fabricators, who fabricated traditions of abrogation of this verse, were unaware of fabrications of their brothers. That is why each of them created fabrications according to their personal view.

The late Allamah Amini, in *Al-Ghadeer*, has mentioned fifty of these statements.¹

The worst of them is the author of *Al-Washiya*, Moosa Jarullah of the twentieth century, who caused a great calamity on Quran and Sunnah, which no other player of the past centuries have done. He has invented a new kind of belief, which is opposed to the views of all past scholars. Neither is it compatible with Quran or Sunnah or any source of religion.

He says:² "The Ummah has issued numerous statements about Fixed time marriage, but in my view, Fixed time marriage is from the marriage of the period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*) and it is possible that in the early period of Islam, some

¹ *Al-Ghadeer*, 6/315-320.

² *Al-Washiya*, 32, 121, 132, 149, 165 & 166.

people acted upon it and the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) also allowed it that instance. And verse was also revealed regarding that...and this is not extraordinary, because regarding the worst prohibited things verse is revealed and what occurred before the revelation of the verse was excepted.¹

And Fixed-time marriage is a historical issue and not a legal command through permission of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and if someone claims that it was through permission of Prophet and it was absolutely lawful according to Shariat, I will say: Let it be, there is no problem, and we also don't argue in its refutation, but our question is that whether the verse of Fixed-time marriage is mentioned in Quran or not?

Shia books claim that the statement of Allah, the Mighty and Sublime:

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْتُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَأُتُوهُنَّ أُجُورُهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by, give them their dowries as appointed.”²

...was revealed about Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*), but in my view the context and the fact that this verse is in Arabic, I don't believe it was revealed about Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*), because in that case the structure of the verse will be confused and its arrangement would be destroyed.

Thus, regarding Fixed time marriage (*Mutah*), nothing is revealed in Quran and we have formed this chapter to clarify this point so that I may refute the gossip mentioned in Shia books, who say that the captioned verse was revealed about Fixed time marriage (*Mutah*). Basically, Fixed time marriage (*Mutah*) was not lawful in Islam. On the basis of this, abrogation of Fixed time marriage (*Mutah*) is not abrogation of law of Shariah; it is in fact abrogation of rule of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*) and its prohibition is forever.

The tradition of Fixed time marriage (*Mutah*) is also from unacceptable traditions, which some companions believed in; so much so that even some companions of companions believed in it like Tawus, Ataa, Saeed bin Jubair and some jurists of Mecca...and the jurist of Mecca, Ibne Jarih in his statement, regarding lawfulness of *Mutah* has committed excess, just as he committed excess in its practice. So much so that he willed to his sons regarding seventy ladies; that they should not marry them as they were their mothers...

¹ In Surah Nisa, verse 22 & 23 it is mentioned that: “And marry not woman whom your fathers married, except what has already passed; this surely is indecent and hateful, and it is an evil way. Forbidden to you are your mothers and your daughters and your sisters and your paternal aunts and your maternal aunts and brothers’ daughters and sisters’ daughters and your mothers that have suckled you and your foster-sisters and mothers of your wives and your step-daughters who are in your guardianship, (born) of your wives to whom you have gone in, but if you have not gone in to them, there is no blame on you (in marrying them), and the wives of your sons who are of your own loins and that you should have two sisters together, except what has already passed...” (Surah Nisa 4:22-23)

² Surah Nisa 4:24

In my view, it is highly unlikely that one, who is a believer, who is aware of specialties of Quran, who believes in its miracle and who correctly understands its arrangement, and then says that the verse of:

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْعُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَأُتُوهُنَّ أُجُورَهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by, give them their dowries as appointed.”¹

...was revealed regarding Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) of women, has in fact issued this statement in unawareness. In books of Shia, they have attributed traditions to Baqir and Sadiq that they said: “This verse was revealed about Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) of women;” and the best probability regarding this tradition is that it is fabricated. Otherwise it would have to be said that Baqir and Sadiq were (God forbid) ignorant.

In other than Shia books, you will not find anyone, who says that the captioned verse was revealed about Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) and Islamic Ummah has consensus on unlawfulness of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) and no one has said that the verse:

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْعُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَأُتُوهُنَّ أُجُورَهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by, give them their dowries as appointed.”²

...has been abrogated.

Reply to Moosa

These are the statements of this man mentioned in his book of *Washiya*, regarding Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*), which we have compiled. These dark pages are really remote from religious and academic manners and social and literary chastity; and between these statements and commands of Islam, there is a distance of the earth from the sky and we would also not confront him, except with ‘peace’³

As regards *Mutah* or Fixed time marriage with attention to the conclusions of research of scholars and their efforts, especially the latter scholars, there is no need to prolong the discussion.⁴ Though he, after stating these points, has condemned the Shia for promiscuity and used foul words regarding them in a cowardly manner and has not feared Almighty Allah.

But, what is important for us is that the minds should be made attentive to

¹ Surah Nisa 4:24

² Surah Nisa 4:24

³ The Almighty Allah says: “And when the ignorant address them, they say: Peace.” (Surah Furqan 25:63)

⁴ Great personalities like Sayyid Abdul Husain Sharafuddin, Sayyid Mohsin Amin, Shaykh Muhammad Husain Kashiful Ghita and Taufeeq Fakiki has written a separate exhaustive book regarding this subject.

falsehoods and his great crimes related to knowledge, wisdom, Quran and its people. We awaken the perception of folks of discussion and research, so that they may know how he concealed the reality and views of past persons, how through deceit, he inverted clear facts and spread points contradictory to Quran and Sunnah in academic societies.

It is interesting that he, despite such ignorance regarding Quran and Sunnah, considered himself among jurists of Islam Then goodbye to Islam [the presence of such persons is farewell to Islam].

Mutah (Fixed time marriage in Quran)

فَمَا اسْتَهْنَتُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ فَأُتْوِهُنَّ أُجُورَهُنَّ فَرِيضَةٌ ۖ وَلَا جُنَاحَ عَلَيْكُمْ قِيمَةٌ
تَرَاضَيْتُمْ بِهِ مِنْ بَعْدِ الْفَرِيضَةِ ۖ إِنَّ اللَّهَ كَانَ عَلَيْهِ حَكِيمًا^۱

“Then as to those whom you profit by, give them their dowries as appointed; and there is no blame on you about what you mutually agree after what is appointed; surely Allah is Knowing, Wise.”¹

In view of Moosa, author of *Washiya*, the revelation of the verse of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) is claimed only by Shia; and such a thing cannot be found in books of others and such a viewpoint is a sign of ignorance and meanness of its sayer.

After that Allamah Amini has mentioned 19 points from Ahle Sunnat books in *Al-Ghadeer*,² in order to inform the reader that to whom are the poisonous and illogical statement of this vile man are aimed at; among them being:

1. Ahmad, the leader of Hanbalis in *Musnad*,³ has narrated from Imran bin Husain, through chains, all of whose narrators are trustworthy that: The verse of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) was revealed in Quran and we acted upon it during lifetime of Prophet. And after that no abrogation was revealed for this verse and Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) also did not prohibit it till the end of his life.

2. In his *Tafseer*,⁴ Abu Ja'far Tabari (d. 310 A.H.), has narrated through his chains from Abu Nazara that:

I asked Ibne Abbas about Fixed time marriage. He replied: “Have you not recited Surah Nisa?”

I asked: “Why not?”

He asked: “Have you not read the following verse in it?”

¹ Surah Nisa 4:24

² *Al-Ghadeer*, 6/323. 332.

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:436 [5/603, H. 19409].

⁴ *Jaameul Bayan*, 5:9 [No. 4/Vol. 5/12-13].

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْعُثُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by.”¹

For an appointed term...

I said: “If I had read it like this, I would not have asked.”

He said: “It is as I have recited.”

It is mentioned in traditional reports that Ibne Abbas said thrice: “By God, Almighty Allah has revealed it in this manner.”

It is also narrated from Qatada as such in the recitation of Ubayy bin Kaab.

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْعُثُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by.”²

For an appointed term...

3. Hafiz Abu Bakr Baihaqi (d. 458 A.H.) has narrated through his chains of authorities in *Sunanul Kubra*³ from Muhammad bin Kaab from Ibne Abbas that: “Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) was lawful at the beginning of Islam and it had become customary and they recited this verse regarding that and in this manner:

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْعُثُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by.”⁴

For an appointed term...

4. Abul Qasim Jarullah Zamakhshari Mutazali (d. 538 A.H.) say in *Kashaf*:⁵

“It is said that a verse is revealed regarding Fixed time marriage and it is narrated from Ibne Abbas that this is a clear verse and it is not abrogated and it is recited as follows:

فَمَا أَسْتَأْتَتْعُثُمْ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by.”⁶

For an appointed term...

5. Abu Bakr Yahya bin Sadun Qurtubi⁷ (d. 567 A.H.) says in his *Tafseer*,⁸ while discussion the different views regarding the verse:

“All commentators has said that the verse imply Fixed time marriage, which

¹ Surah Nisa 4:24

² Surah Nisa 4:24

³ Sonanul Kubraa, 7:205.

⁴ Surah Nisa 4:24

⁵ *Al-Kashaf*, 1:360 [1/498].

⁶ Surah Nisa 4:24

⁷ Qurtubbi, writer of *Tafseer*, he is Abdullah Muhammad bin Ahmad Ansari (d. 671 A.H.).

⁸ Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran, 5:130 [5/88].

was customary in the early period of Islam. Ibne Abbas and Saeed bin Jubair have recited the verse in the following form:

فَمَا أَسْتَهِنَتُعْتَمِ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by.”¹

For an appointed term...

فَأَتُوْهُنَّ أُجْوَرَهُنَّ

“give them their dowries.”²

6. Abu Abdullah Fakhrudin Raaza Shafei (d. 606 A.H.), in his *Tafseer Kabeer*,³ has mentioned two viewpoints and said:

First: Majority of scholars state that, secondly it is that they say: The implication of this verse is the command of Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) and all have consensus that Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) was lawful in the early period of Islam. And the argument lies in the fact whether the verse is abrogated or not.

7. Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.) says in *Durre Manthur*:⁴

Tibrani⁵ and Baihaqi in his *Sunan*⁶ have narrated from Ibne Abbas: Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) was lawful in the early period of Islam and the verse was recited as follows:

فَمَا أَسْتَهِنَتُعْتَمِ بِهِ مِنْهُنَّ

“Then as to those whom you profit by.”⁷

For an appointed term...

Now, stay with me

Respected reader, accompany me, so that we may ask Moosa Jarullah:

Are these books not reference points of Ahle Sunnat in the science of Quran?

Are these persons not their personalities and scholars of exegesis?

Is it not necessary for a researcher to refer to these books, before condemning anyone or before presenting an analysis?

Are these painful and harmful statement not aimed at the like Ibne Abbas, the speaking tongue of Quran: Ubayy Ibne Kaab, the most aware person about

¹ Surah Nisa 4:24

² Surah Nisa 4:24

³ *Tafseer Kabeer*, 3:200 [10/49, 51 & 53].

⁴ *Durre Mansoor*, 2:140 [2/484].

⁵ *Mojamul Kabeer*, [10/320, H. 10782].

⁶ *Sonanul Kubraa*, [7/205].

⁷ Surah Nisa 4:24

recitation of Quran in view of Ahle Sunnat; Abdullah bin Masud, expert of Quran and Sunnah; Imran bin Husain, Hakam, Habib bin Thabit, Saeed bin Jubair, Qatada and Mujahid?

Whether he considers all of them to be unaware, thoughtless and false claimants?

Whether this is not abusing companions and holy ancestors – for which Ahle Sunnat accuse the Shia?

Or he considered his own personalities Shia, then used sharp words against them? Then abused them and condemned them?

If the like of Bukhari, Muslim, Ahmad, Tabari, Muhammad bin Kaab, Abad bin Hamid, Abu Dawood, Ibne Jarih, Jassas, Ibne Anbari, Baihaqi, Hakeem, Baghawi, Zamakhshari, Andulusi, Qurtubi, Fakhre Razi, Nawawi, Baidhawi, Khazin, Ibne Jauzi, Abu Hayyan, Ibne Kathir, Abu Saud, Suyuti, Shaukani and Alusi have not value in his view; then who is his role model in religion and academics?

Yes, we are not unaware that these falsehoods and fabrications attributing the viewpoint about the revelation of verse to the Shia, is all of it not a preface for speaking ill about Holy Imams: Imam Muhammad Baqir and Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.), whereas he himself and every just person knows that all the four imams of Ahle Sunnat obtained knowledge from the Holy Imams (a.s.). And if a share of knowledge and wisdom is available with the four imams, it is due to the fact that they have drank from the spring of knowledge of Imam Muhammad Baqir and Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.).

Yes, Imam Muhammad Baqir and Imam Ja'far Sadiq (a.s.) are the same Imam Baqir and Imam Sadiq and Moosa Al-Washiya is also Moosa Al-Washiya. God is Himself the judge and our complaint is only to Him.

Also, come, and ask him regarding the manners of discourse, which he has understood, but great personalities and the prominent ones of the past have not understood them and the disorder in the verse, in case it is revealed about Fixed-time marriage (*Mutah*) is noticed and he understood it and they did not. That what it is? Where it is? Who has said it? What is its evidence and proof? From whom has he obtained it? Why he has concealed its beginning and end?

I don't think he would give a satisfactory reply and satisfy the intellect; and perhaps he would aim his acidic abuses to others.

Salient features of Fixed time marriage in Islam

1. Recompense
2. Period
3. Recitation of formula, which includes acceptance.
4. Separation at the end of the period or through giving up or condoning.
5. Observance of the waiting period, whether she is a free woman or a slave

girl; whether she is pregnant or not.

6. Absence of inheritance.

These are conditions and limits, which all jurists have mentioned in their books, tradition scholars in their *Saheeh* and *Musnad* books, and exegesists have mentioned under interpretation of the holy verse. All of them, whether they believe in its permanent lawfulness or in its fixed time lawfulness and before its abrogation, all have consensus that these are religious and Islamic limits and there is no option, except to observe them.

Now, we ask: what is the basis of his statement, when he says: *Mutah* is marriage of the period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*) and it was not as per the commands of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

When was this kind of marriage, with these conditions, seen during the period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*)?

Historians have recorded the description of all kinds of marriages and customs of period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*); but among them we do not find any kind of marriage, which might resemble the Fixed time marriage.

Yes, he says whatever he likes; and pays no attention to his statements. Before this,¹ we mentioned some persons, who described the limits of Fixed time marriage.

Why Ibne Jarrah committed excess in a wanton deed, which according to Moosa was among the worst unlawful acts?

If Ibne Jarrah has considered religion as unimportant and has not accorded any significance to it; why scholars of traditions; that is the authors of six authentic books of traditions, have all narrated from him? Their *Musnad* books are full of traditions narrated on his authority. They have heard and narrated from him 12000 traditions, which jurists are needful of.² If his like or his reports were corrupted, it was necessary that innumerable pages should be deleted from collections of traditions and no more value would remain of these tradition books (*Sihah*) and if Ibne Jarrah is as Moosa Jarullah thinks, then why scholars of narrators of traditions praised and accorded respect to his works. How they named his books as the books of trust?³

Read; and laugh or cry

Qushji (d. 879 A.H.) in *Sharh Tajreed*,⁴ says in discussion of Imamate: Umar said from pulpit:

“People, three things were lawful during period of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and I prohibit them; and I will penalize anyone, who practices them:

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 357.

² *Miftahus Saada*, 2:120 [2/231].

³ *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 6:404 [6/359].

⁴ *Sharh Tajreed*, [Pg. 484].

Fixed time marriage, Hajje Tamatto and Hayya Alaa Khairil Amal.”

After that Qushji justifies his act and says: This act of Umar does not cast aspersion on him, because opposition of a jurist (*Mujtahid*) to another jurist (*Mujtahid*) in matters of jurisprudence is nothing new.

We can never think that anyone with even a little academic expertise can regard Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) same as an ordinary human being and regard both as jurists (*Mujtahid*)! Where is he and where the Prophet? But was it not that whatever the trustworthy said is the same thing, which is recorded in Protected Tablet (*Lauhe Mahfuz*):

إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا وَحْيٌ يُوحَىٰ عَلَيْهِ شَدِيعُ الْقُوَىٰ

“It is naught but revelation that is revealed, the Lord of Mighty Power has taught him,”¹

What relation does this have with independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*), which comprises of application of principles of jurisprudence?

Jurisprudential opposition is allowed to the extent that a jurist can oppose a jurist like himself; and not that deduction should be opposed to the clear text of Quran or traditions and that the jurist should issue verdicts opposing clear commands of religion!

In addition to that, what factors and which logic made the views of this man comparable to those of Prophet?

What is the value of the personal viewpoints of people when they are opposed to the established statements of the holy Shariat of Islam?

But I excuse Qushji, because he has regarded necessary to refute all arguments and reasonings of Khwaja Nasiruddin Tusi lest he should be accused of helplessness and weakness. So he is compelled to mention everything that comes to his mind, whether it is proof and beneficial to him or whether it makes him culpable:

وَلَا تَقُولُوا إِلَيْهَا تَصِيفُ الْسِنَتُكُمُ الْكَذِبَ هَذَا حَلْلٌ وَهَذَا حَرَامٌ لِتَفْتَرُوا عَلَىِ
اللَّهِ الْكَذِبَ إِنَّ الَّذِينَ يَفْتَرُونَ عَلَىِ اللَّهِ الْكَذِبَ لَا يُعْلِمُونَ

“And, for what your tongues describe, do not utter the lie, (saying): This is lawful and this is unlawful, in order to forge a lie against Allah; surely those who forge the lie against Allah shall not prosper.”²

¹ Surah Najm 53:4-5
² Surah Nahl 16:116

43. Independent judgment (Ijtehaad) of the Caliph regarding liquor and its verse

In *Rabiul Abrar*,¹ Zamakhshari says that in the matter of pleasure, song and music parties² and Shahabuddin Abshahi in *Mustatraf*³ has said:

“Almighty Allah has revealed three verses regarding liquor. The first is the statement of Allah, the Mighty and the High:

يَسْأَلُوكُمْ عَنِ الْخَمْرِ وَالْمَيْسِرِ قُلْ فِيهِمَا إِثْمٌ كَبِيرٌ وَمَنَّا فِي لِلَّهِ أَنْتُمْ

“They ask you about intoxicants and games of chance. Say: In both of them there is a great sin and means of profit for men.”⁴

Before the revelation of this verse, some people among Muslims used to imbibe wine and some of them used to keep away from it; till a man came to prayers while being intoxicated with wine and began to utter nonsense. At the end of which the verse was revealed:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَقْرُبُوا الصَّلَاةَ وَأَنْتُمْ سُكْرٌ حَتَّىٰ تَعْلَمُوا مَا تَقُولُونَ

“O you who believe! do not go near prayer when you are intoxicated until you know (well) what you say.”⁵

After the revelation of this verse, some Muslim gave up drinking and some continued to drink, till one day Umar drank wine and with a femur of camel broke the head of Abdur Rahman bin Auf and then recited the verses of Aswad bin Yafar on the killing of the infidels in the Battle of Badr:

1. In the center of the well – well of Badr – youths and nobles of Arabs were placed. 2. In the center of the well – well of Badr, generous men of Arabs embellished with greatness sleep.⁶ 3. Son of Kabsha⁷ (Prophet of Islam) frightens me from my becoming alive after death. How the decayed body, which worms

¹ Rabeeul Abraar, [4/51].

² We found numerous copies of this book in libraries of Iran and Iraq during our research.

³ *Al-Mustatraf*, 2:291 [2/260]

⁴ Surah Baqarah 2:219

⁵ Surah Nisa 4:43

⁶ This verse is not mentioned in *Al-Mustatraf*.

⁷ Idolaters used to call the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) Abu Kabsha and Abu Kabsha was a man from the Khaza-a tribe, who used to oppose the Quraish because of their idol worship; and since the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) also opposed their idol worship, they used to compare him to Abu Kabsha and it is said that Ibne Abi Kabsha is attributed to the maternal grandfather of the Prophet, because the agnomen of Wahab bin Abde Manaf, maternal grandfather of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), was Abu Kabsha and its implication was that the face of His Eminence resembled his maternal grandfather. Some have said that Abu Kabsha was the agnomen of Halima Saadiya, the foster mother of the Prophet or the agnomen of the brother of her husband. And sometimes Ibne Kabsha is mentioned instead of Abi Kabsha, which implies the grandfather of the Prophet, Abdul Muttalib, who was the chief of the community in Mecca and possessed great might and awe. And it is said that Ibne Kabsha is related to the grandfather of the Prophet, His Eminence, Ismail (a.s.), for whom the ram was sacrificed.

have eaten up, will become alive? 4. Does he have the power to remove death from me and make me alive after my bones have decayed. 5. Is he a messenger, who can convey to God that I omitted the fasts of the month of Ramadhan? 6. By God, tell me if you can restrain me from drinking and by God, tell me if you are able to deprive me from food.

The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was informed about Umar's drinking liquor and reciting couplets, His Eminence was infuriated and he came out with his cloak dragging on the ground and he hit on the head of Umar with what he had in hand and Umar said: I seek refuge of God from the anger of God and His Messenger. After that Almighty Allah revealed the verse:

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ الشَّيْطَنُ أَنْ يُوقِعَ بَيْنَكُمُ الْعَدَاوَةَ وَالْبَغْضَاءَ فِي الْخَمْرِ وَالْمَيْسِرِ
وَيَصُلُّ كُلَّهُ عَنِ ذِكْرِ اللَّهِ وَعَنِ الصَّلَاةِ فَهَلْ أَنْتُمْ مُّنْتَهُونَ ④

“The Shaitan only desires to cause enmity and hatred to spring in your midst by means of intoxicants and games of chance, and to keep you off from the remembrance of Allah and from prayer. Will you then desist?”¹

At that moment Umar said: I give it up! I give it up!

2. It is narrated from Umar bin Khattab that when the verse of prohibition of liquor was revealed, he said:

“O God, please make the command of liquor completely clear for me.” After that the verse,

يَسْأَلُونَكَ عَنِ الْخَمْرِ وَالْمَيْسِرِ

“They ask you about intoxicants and games of chance.”²

...was revealed, which is mentioned in Surah Baqarah. When the verse was revealed, Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) summoned Umar and recited the verse to him. He said the second time: “O God, make it clearer.” After that the verse of Surah Nisa was revealed:

يَأَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَقْرَبُوا الصَّلَاةَ وَأَنْتُمْ سُكْنَى

“O you who believe! do not go near prayer when you are intoxicated.”³

After that an announcer of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) announced at the time of prayers: “People, don’t approach the prayers while intoxicated.”

Again Umar was summoned and the verse was recited to him and he repeated his supplication once more. This time was revealed the verse of:

¹ Surah Maidah 5:91

² Surah Baqarah 2:219

³ Surah Nisa 4:43

إِنَّمَا يُرِيدُ الشَّيْطَنُ أَنْ يُوقِعَ بَيْنَكُمُ الْعَدَاوَةَ وَالْبُغْضَاءَ فِي الْخَمْرِ وَالْمَيْسِرِ
وَيَصُلَّ كُمْ عَنِ ذِكْرِ اللَّهِ وَعَنِ الصَّلَاةِ فَهَلْ أَنْتُمْ مُنْتَهُونَ^①

“The Shaitan only desires to cause enmity and hatred to spring in your midst by means of intoxicants and games of chance, and to keep you off from the remembrance of Allah and from prayer. Will you then desist?”¹

At that point, Umar said: “I give it up! I give it up!”²

Allamah Amini says: Our aim from quoting these traditions was not to prove that Umar drank (liquor) during period of Ignorance, because Islam purifies the past acts:

لَيْسَ عَلَى الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ جُنَاحٌ قِيمًا طَعَمُوا إِذَا مَا أَتَّقَوْا
وَآمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّلِحَاتِ ثُمَّ اتَّقَوْا وَآمَنُوا ثُمَّ اتَّقَوْا وَآخْسَنُوا طَوَّلَ اللَّهُ يُحِبُّ
الْمُحْسِنِينَ^③

“On those who believe and do good there is no blame for what they eat, when they are careful (of their duty) and believe and do good deeds, then they are careful (of their duty) and believe, then they are careful (of their duty) and do good (to others), and Allah loves those who do good (to others).”³

On the contrary, the aim was to make the reader aware about the level of Caliph’s knowledge of Quran and the quantum of his understanding the meaning of divine verses to such an extent that:

يَسْأَلُونَكَ عَنِ الْخَمْرِ وَالْمَيْسِرِ قُلْ فِيهِمَا إِثْمٌ كَبِيرٌ

“They ask you about intoxicants and games of chance. Say: In both of them there is a great sin.”⁴

That he was not aware of its prohibition, whereas this verse was revealed forbidding liquor and all companions of Prophet also understood that. Ayesha says: “When Surah Baqarah was revealed, the prohibition of liquor was also revealed in it. Thus, Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) prohibited it.”⁵ When restraining is better than drinking liquor, while prohibiting liquor, there will be no

¹ Surah Maidah 5:91

² *Sunan Abi Dawood*, 2:128 [3/325, H. 3670]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 2:53 [1/86, H. 380]; *Sunanul Kubraa*, Nasai, 8:287 [3/202, H. 5049]; *Tafsir Tabari*, 7:22 [Jaameul Bayan, No. 5/Vol. 7/33]; *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 2:278 [2/305, H. 3101].

³ Surah Maidah 5:93

⁴ Surah Baqarah 2:219

⁵ Khateeb Baghdadi has mentioned this tradition in his *Taareekh*, 8:358 [No. 4457]; and Suyuti has also quoted it from him in his *Durre Mansoor*, 1:52 [1/606].

need to explain it in detail. Especially regarding the verse of ‘sin’, for example:

فُلِ إِنَّمَا حَرَّمَ رَبِّ الْفَوَاحِشَ مَا ظَاهَرٌ مِّنْهَا وَمَا بَطَنٌ وَالْإِثْمُ وَالْبَغْيُ

“Say: My Lord has only prohibited indecencies, those of them that are apparent as well as those that are concealed, and sin and rebellion.”¹

...which explains and prohibits the ‘sin’ mentioned in the verse above it.

‘Ithm’ means sin, and ‘Aathim’ and ‘Atheem’ means sinner. Sometimes liquor itself is called ‘sin’. Like statement of the poet:

“I drank to such an extent that I lost my senses. Yes liquor makes one lose sense in this manner.”²

As mentioned in *Tafseer Tabari*, before its prohibition, liquor was not having more than two benefits: one was the profit earned through its sale and another, the pleasure one gets when one drinks liquor.³

The only cause, which made the Caliph ask for verse and again asked for its justification and he did not give it up before its prohibition and promise of chastisement, was his liking for liquor. Such that during the period of Ignorance, no one equaled him in drinking and he has himself confessed this fact as mentioned in the *Seerah Ibne Hisham*:⁴ “I was remote from Islam and during period of Ignorance I was always drinking liquor and was very fond of it. We used to have gatherings of wine in Hazora⁵ besides the house of Umar bin Abad bin Imran Makhzumi, where Quraish men gathered. One night, I came out of my house with an aim to participate in that gathering and to meet friends. But when I reached there, I did not find any of my friends over there. So I said to myself: If I go to that man, who sells liquor in Mecca, I might be able to get some liquor and become intoxicated...”

Another evidence is the quotation of Baihaqi in *Sunanul Kubra*,⁶ from Abdullah bin Umar regarding the statement of his father during his Caliphate; that he said:

“During the period of Ignorance, I was foremost in drinking liquor and drinking is not like fornication.”⁷

It was for this reason that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) only summoned him and recited the verse prohibiting liquor to him. He was among the persons, who

¹ Surah Araaf 7:33

² *Lesaanul Arab*, 14:272 [1/75]; *Taajul Oroos*, 8:179.

³ *Jaameul Bayan*, 2:202 [No. 2, Vol. 2/359].

⁴ *Seerah Ibne Hisham*, 1:368 [1/371].

⁵ A market in Mecca, which is a part of the Masjid even today.

⁶ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 10:214.

⁷ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 10:214 & Ref: *Seerah Umar*, Ibne Jauzi, 98 [Pg. 122]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:107 [5/505, H. 13746]; *Muntakhabul Kanz* on the margins of *Musnad Ahmad*, 2:428 [2/500]; *Al-Khulafa Rashideen*, Abdul Wahhab Najjar, 238.

had justified these verses and did not give up drinking till the verse of Surah Maidah was revealed and which clearly prohibited it; and promised divine chastisement to one who drank liquor.

Surah Maidah, some of whose verses were revealed in Farewell Hajj,¹ is the last Surah to be revealed.² And due to addiction to liquor for a long time before revelation of verses of Surah Maidah in Farewell Hajj, after revelation of verse and promise of chastisement and after his statement: 'I give up! I give up!' again he drank Nabidh (a kind of wine), saying: I drink this wine in order to digest camel meat in my stomach, so that it may not cause discomfort to me. And if wine makes one senseless, one should mix it with water.³

And says: "I am a man with stomach full of fire;⁴ I drink this wine to soften my stomach."⁵

And he says: "The flesh of these camels does not digest in my stomach unless I drink this thick and strong Nabidh wine."⁶

He continued to drink this thick Nabidh wine till his last moments. Amr bin Maimoon says: "When Umar was in his last moments and lying on his deathbed, I was present there. Nabidh was brought for him and he drank it."⁷

His wine was so sharp and strong that if someone else took a sip from it, he would become intoxicated and penalty of drinking wine would be awarded to him. But since the Caliph was so much habituated to it or it had been diluted so much and then drank it, it did not have any effect.

Shobi says: An Arab drank from the vessel of wine that belonged to Umar and the latter applied the legal penalty to him; then he said: "This penalty is for becoming intoxicated and not for drinking it."⁸

In the words of Jassas in *Ahkamul Quran*,⁹ it is mentioned that: "An Arab drank some wine belonging to Umar and the latter decreed punishment for him. The Arab said: 'I drank from your wine.' Umar called for water and diluted his wine. Then he drank it and said: 'One, who get intoxicated by wine, should dilute it and then drink it.'"

It is narrated from Abu Rafe that Umar bin Khattab said:

"Whenever you fear the sharpness and strength of liquor, you should dilute

¹ *Tafseer Qurtubbi*, 6:30 [6/22]; *Irshadus Sari*, 7:95 [10/198].

² *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 2:311 [2/340, H. 3211]; *Jaameul Tirmizi*, 2:178 [5/243, H. 3063]; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:252 [2/3]; quoting from Ahmad, Tirmizi, Hakeem, Ibne Marduya, Baihaqi, Saeed bin Mansur and Ibne Mundhir.

³ *Sonanul Kubraa*, 8:299; *Mahaziratul Raghib*, 1:319 [No. 1, Vol. 2/699]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:109 [5/514, H. 13772] quoting from Ibne Abi Shaibah.

⁴ Ibne Asir in *Nihaya*, 1/275.

⁵ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 3:109 [5/514, H. 13773].

⁶ *Jami Masanid*, Abu Hanifah, 2:190 & 215.

⁷ *Tareekh Baghdad*, Khateeb, 6:156.

⁸ *Iqdul Fareed*, 3:416 [6/278].

⁹ *Ahkamul Quran*, 2:565 [2/464].

it with water.”

Nasai has narrated this statement in his *Sunan*,¹ and remarks: “Those, who regard as lawful drinking of wine have argued through this traditional report.”

More amazing is the fact that: Penalty is awarded to one, who drinks Umar’s wine and becomes intoxicated, because he was either unaware of the fact that the liquid in the vessel was liquor and he drank it; thus in that case, penalty should not be imposed on him as Abu Umar, in *Jami Bayanul Ilm*, has narrated from the Caliph:

“Penalty is not applicable on one, who drinks wine inadvertently.”²

Or that he was aware: in that case, the penalty should not be applicable to him, since he has followed the Caliph in this act. The only difference between him and the Caliph is that it intoxicated him, but it did not intoxicate the Caliph, since he was used to it. As if the criterion of lawful and unlawful and application of penalties and its absence in view of Caliph, was getting intoxicated and depends on the person. This is supported by his own statement when he says: “Wine is that which makes one lose the senses.”³

While the fact is that there is absolute prohibition for drinking wine (being intoxicated is sufficient for prohibition and penalty), even though it may be mixed with something else or diluted. From this aspect, the criterion of wine is not whether one becomes intoxicated by it, or not. Thus, everything that intoxicates in large quantity, its minuscule quantity is also unlawful.

Numerous authentic traditional reports prove this rule; like this statement of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

“I prohibit to you even lesser amounts of what intoxicates you in large quantities.”⁴

Also, the statement of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) narrated through Jabir, Ibne Umar and Ibne Amr that:

“Everything, which intoxicates in large quantities, its little quantity is also unlawful.”

44. Caliph was the founder of preference (Awl)⁵ in inheritance

It is narrated from Ibne Abbas that:

¹ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 8:326 [3/237, H. 5214].

² *Jami Bayanul Ilm*, 2:86 [Pg. 308, H. 1548].

³ From the six authors of Sihah, five have narrated this tradition; as is mentioned in *Taisirul Wusul*, 2:174 [2/213, H. 2].

⁴ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 8:301 [3/216, H. 5118].

⁵ *Awl*: It is a heresy of Umar in inheritance. It is that when the inheritance is less than the shares, the deficiency is applied to all the heirs; this is opposed to the viewpoint of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

“Umar bin Khattab was the first to establish ‘Awl’ in obligations. When the division of heirloom was difficult for him as stipulated by Quran and dispute arose among the heirs, he said: ‘By God, I don’t know which of you Almighty Allah has preferred and which of you He has deferred.’ Being a man of piety, he said: ‘The best thing for me is to distribute according to shares and then divide the deficiency from all shareholders equally.’”

It is narrated from Ubaidullah bin Abdullah bin Utbah bin Masud that:

“I and Zafar bin Aws bin Hadsan met Ibne Abbas after he has lost his eyesight, and discussed with him rules of inheritance. Ibne Abbas said: “In your view one, who knows the number of particles of sand, regarding wealth half and half and one-third has not calculated and it half and half goes away then where is place of the third?”¹

Zafar asked Ibne Abbas: “O Ibne Abbas, who was the first one to include ‘Awl’ in inheritance and applied the deficiency to all heirs? Ibne Abbas replied: “Umar bin Khattab.” He asked: “Why?”

He replied: “When distribution of inheritance became difficult and they wanted him to adjudicate, he said: “By God, I don’t know what to do. By God, I don’t know, which of you should I prefer and which of you should I defer.” On the basis of this, he said: “Thus, it is better that I should equally distribute the deficiency among all heirs.”

At that moment, Ibne Abbas said: “By God, if you had preferred someone that Allah preferred and deferred one that Allah deferred, the obligation of ‘Awl’ would never have arisen.”

Zafar said: “Which one has Allah preferred and which one has He deferred?”

Ibne Abbas replied: “Every obligation that does not disappears, on the contrary it is transformed into another obligation is like the case of Almighty Allah preferring (Quranic share) of the husband, which is half the heirloom and in case of the presence of a son, it is changed into one-fourth and he does not get less than that.

Also the share of the wife, which is one-fourth and in case the deceased does not have a son, it will change into one-eighth and it does not become lesser than that.

And the share of two or more sisters is two-third and share of one sister is

¹ That is if the heirs are such that the Quranic share is one one-half and the share of the other is also one-half, and the share of the third is one-third, does the Almighty Allah not know that after reducing two half twice nothing would remain so that it may reach the third, because: $8/6=3+3+2/6=1/3+1/2+1/2$ and it cannot be from the property, which is divided into six, eight parts is taken away and terminologically ‘Awl’ is supposed to come when the Quranic shares are added when all the heirs are paid their shares, there will remain some extra shares, but on the basis of the religion of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) a large portion is distributed according to their shares.

one-half. Now, the presence of sisters besides them, the residue from them [daughters] will reach them. And these [sisters] are those whom Almighty Allah had deferred; thus if the beginning of the share of one, whose share Allah has advanced [husband, wife and sister], is paid and after that the residue is distributed among those, whose share Allah had deferred [like daughters in the above example] no need of ‘Awl’ will arise.

Zafar asked Ibne Abbas: “Then why didn’t you mention it to Umar?”

Ibne Abbas replied: “By God, I feared.”¹

In *Awail* of Suyuti and his *Tarikh*, and *Mahazirtus Saktawari*, it is mentioned that:²

“Umar was the first to believe in ‘Awl’ in obligations [and in case of deficiency, he distributed it equally among heirs].

Amini says: What should I say after the statement of Caliph that:

“By God, I don’t know what to do. By God, I don’t know, which of you Allah has preferred and which of you, He has deferred.”

After the statement of Ibne Abbas that: “By God, if he had preferred one that Allah has preferred and deferred one that Allah deferred, no need was there for ‘Awl’.

Now, inspite of the fact that he himself admits that he is unaware of correct solution, how did he deliver a verdict based on his personal opinion?

Whereas, he himself said in a sermon: “Know that those, who believe in validity of personal deduction are enemies of Sunnah. They are unable to memorize traditions; that is why they deliver verdict on the basis of their personal opinion and as a result of that they have become misguided and misguided others. Know that we only emulate and we do not begin delivering verdicts; we follow, but we don’t start heresies and as long as we remain attached to Sunnah and traditional reports, we shall not be misguided.”³

Is this following and emulation or it is an innovation and heresy [emulation and following one’s own opinion].

How was it lawful for the Caliph to be unaware of religious obligations whereas he himself says:

“No unawareness and ignorance is more disliked by Allah and more harmful than foolishness and unawareness of imam and Caliph.”⁴

How before gaining proficiency in religion he can sat on the seat of judgment and issue verdicts, whereas he himself says: “Before accepting a

¹ *Ahkamul Quran*, Jassas, 2:109 [2/90]; *Mustadrak Hakeem*, 4:340 [4/378, H. 7985] and he has considered it as authentic. *Sonanul Kubraa*, 6:253; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:7 [11/27, H. 30489].

² *Taareekhul Kholafa*, 93 [Pg. 128]; *Mahazirtus Saktawari*, 152.

³ *Seearat Umar*, Ibne Jauzi, 107 [Pg. 116].

⁴ *Seearat Umar*, Ibne Jauzi, 100, 102 & 161 [Pg. 108, 111 & 166].

responsibility, get awareness and its proficiency.”¹

45. The Caliph’s viewpoint regarding Baitul Maqdas

It is narrated from Saeed bin Musayyab that a man sought permission from Umar bin Khattab to visit Baitul Maqdas. Umar said: “Go and make preparations and when you are ready, inform me.”

When that man was ready, he came to Umar and Umar said: “Instead of traveling there. Go to Mecca and perform the Hajj and Umrah.”

He also says: “When Umar was engrossed in receiving Zakat of camels, two persons approached him; he asked: “Where do you come from?”

They replied: “From Baitul Maqdas.” Umar raised his whip and said: “Is there a Hajj pilgrimage other than pilgrimage to the House of Allah?”

They were terrified and said: “We passed by from there.”²

Allamah Amini says: “Baitul Muqaddas is one of the Masjids, to which people travel to visit it again and again and to pray and supplicate there.”

But the Caliph was unaware of these traditional reports of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and he had not heard them from the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) or was unable to remember them or had forgotten them. That is why that man, who had intended to travel there was discouraged from undertaking that journey. Umar raised his whip in order to hit those two persons, whom he suspected of having traveled there for Ziyarat. But those two in order to save their skins, mentioned that they had only passed from there.

Following are some traditional reports regarding this issue. You may read them and be amazed:

1. Abu Huraira has narrated from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

“Do not undertake journey, except to travel to three Masjids: Masjidul Haraam, my Masjid (Masjidun Nabi) and Masjid Aqsa.”³

2. It is narrated from Abdullah Ibne Amr Aas in chainless tradition from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that:

“When Sulaiman bin Dawood built Baitul Muqaddas, he requested for three qualities: 1. He pleaded that he may be granted knowledge of adjudication, and it was bestowed to him. 2. He requested Almighty Allah to bestow him with such a kingdom as no one should have after him, and it was given to him. 3. He pleaded that when he completes the Masjid, no one should come to him, except that he should pray in it and Almighty Allah purifies him from all sins as if he was born

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 1:38 [1/39, Chapter 15].

² Azraqi has mentioned this in *Akhbare Makkah*, 2/63. It is also mentioned in *Kanzul Ummaal*, 7:157 [4/146, H. 38194].

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 2:238 & 278 [2/473, H. 7208 & Pg. 542, H. 7678]; *Saheeh Bukhari*, [1/398, H. 1132]; *Saheeh Muslim*, [3/183, H. 511 and 513, *Kitabul Hajj*].

that day.”¹

These are some traditional reports, which are recorded about Baitul Maqdas and praying over there and Allah, the Mighty and the High, His selected servant, Muhammad Mustafa (s.a.w.a.), on the night of Meraj, traveled from the Sacred Mosque (*Masjidul Haraam*) to Masjidul Aqsa to pray in it, as mentioned in *Majmauz Zawaiid*.²

Hafiz Ibne Asakir has written a separate book on this issue and entitled it: *Al-Mustaqls fee Fazail Masjidul Aqsa*.

Supposing we overlook these reports, traveling to every Masjid to which going is not prohibited, is lawful; in that case, what is the meaning of threatening people with whip in this matter?

Yes, as if the Caliph regarded going to these Masjids as revival of relics of prophets and only he had this strange viewpoint as was mentioned before.³

46. The Caliph’s viewpoint regarding Zoroastrians (Majus)

Yahya bin Saeed has narrated through his chains of authorities from Umar bin Khattab that he said:

“I don’t know how to deal with Zoroastrians (*Majus*), who are not People of the Book.”

It is mentioned in another version: “I don’t know what to do about them.”

Abdur Rahman bin Auf said: I heard from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said: “Deal with them like People of Book.”

It is narrated from Bajala that he said: “Umar did not collect *Jizya* from Majus till Abdur Rahman bin Auf testified that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) collected *Jizya* from the Majus of Hajar.”⁴

Allamah Amini says: Are you not amazed at one, who carries the responsibility of a great Caliphate and is unaware of its most important requirement? Identification of the command of Majus from the aspect of financial, political and religious matters is from the initial acts of an Islamic ruler.

Are you not amazed that such an important rule was not acted upon till Abdur Rahman bin Auf testified and after that it once again became applicable? And that too only for a year before the death of the Caliph.⁵ And if he was involved with such kinds of problems and Abdur Rahman and his like were far away from him, in that case, how he had acted upon it?

If the mother of Abdur Rahman had not given birth him, to whom would the

¹ *Sonan Ibne Majah*, 1:430 [1/452, H. 1408]; *Sonan Kubra*, 2:34 [1/256, H. 772].

² *Majmauz Zawaad*, 4:4.

³ *Barguzida Jaame’ Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 530 & 531.

⁴ *Al-Amwal*, [Pg. 40, H. 77]; *Muwattah*, Malik, 1:270 [1/278, H. 42]; *Saheeh Bukhari*, [3/1151, H. 2987]; *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:190 [1/312, H. 1660].

⁵ *Mishkatul Masabih*, Khateeb Tabrizi, 344 [2/413, H. 4035].

Caliph had referred? Who would have benefited him through his knowledge? How he became the caretaker of the affairs of people, whereas there existed someone, who was more intelligent than him among the people?

What would he and all caretakers of the matter of Caliphate would do with this statement of Prophet:

“One, who becomes the caretaker of issues of Muslims, and appoints someone in charge of them, while he knows that among them there is someone more deserving and more wise than him regarding Book of Allah and Sunnah of Prophet, indeed he has been dishonest with God, His Prophet and all believers.¹

فَمَالِ هُؤُلَاءِ الْقَوْمِ لَا يَكَلُونَ يَفْقَهُونَ حَدِيثًا

“But what is the matter with these people that they do not make approach to understanding what is told (them)?”²

47. The Caliph’s viewpoint about fast of Rajab

It is narrated from Kharsha bin Hurr that he said:

“I saw Umar bin Khattab beating up some people, who kept fasts during month of Rajab to such an extent that they broke their fasts; and said:

Rajab? What is Rajab? Rajab is month, which the people of Jahiliyya used to regard as important. When Islam arrived it was given up.”³

Allamah Amini says: This matter shows negligence of Caliph from different aspects:

First aspect

A traditional report is recorded especially about fast of Rajab month and its encouragement by reminding about its considerable divine rewards.⁴

Second aspect

The statement of His Eminence regarding fasting for three days in every month, which also includes the month of Rajab.⁵

Third aspect

The statement of His Eminence regarding the sacred months, Rajab being one of them.⁶

¹ Majmauz Zawaad, Hafiz Haithami, 5:211.

² Surah Nisa 4:78

³ Ibne Abi Shaibah has mentioned this report [in *Musannaf*, 3/102] and Tibrani has also mentioned it in *Awsat*. As is mentioned in *Majmauz Zawaad*, 3:191 and *Kanzul Ummaal*, 4:341 [8/635, H. 24580].

⁴ Majmauz Zawaad, 3:191; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 4:341 [8/653, H. 24582].

⁵ Saheeh Bukhari, 3:219 [2/698, H. 1877] Sonan Tirmizi, 1:146 [3/135, H. 762].

⁶ Sonan Abi Dawood, 1:381 [2/322, H. 2428]; Sonan Ibne Majah, 1:350 [1/554, H. 1741].

Fourth aspect

They are traditional reports that His Eminence encouraged fasting throughout the year on alternate days and the month of Rajab is also a part of year.¹

Fifth aspect

They are traditional reports saying that it is recommended to fast on all days and people are encouraged for it, whichever month it might be.²

All jurists of the four schools of jurisprudence consider fasting in the month of Rajab recommended, except Hanbalis, who say that fasting in the month of Rajab is detestable, except that on one day of the month one should not fast, as in that case the detestability is removed.³ This view is also perhaps taken from the book of *Ihyaaul Uloomdeen*,⁴ where the author says:

“Some companions, regarded fasting during the month of Rajab detestable as similarity would appear with month of Ramadhan and I don’t think that after reading these reports as compared to traditional reports of Ibne Majah, which only he has narrated, you would believe it is of any value. He has narrated from Ibne Abbas that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) prohibited fasting during month of Rajab.”

Even if the report of Ibne Majah is authentic, it is opposed to widely narrated reports of the same kind. And it regards the fast of Rajab as recommended and encourages them and scholars of the four schools of Islamic law have issued verdicts on its basis. And where are these authentic and numerous traditional reports and where are the reports of Ibne Majah?

Reports, which are weak due to presence of Dawood bin Ata. Bukhari⁵ and Abu Zara have said that Dawood bin Ata is a denier of traditions. He narrated unidentified and unfamiliar traditions; traditions, whose apparent meaning is not correct and only Ibne Majah has narrated these reports. Experts of traditions do not accept such traditions.

Abul Hajjaj Mizzi says: Every tradition, which is only narrated by Ibne Majah is weak. It implies that all traditions, which only he has narrated and five other persons from the authors of Saheeh books have not narrated.⁶ I don’t know after knowing all this, what is the justification of beating up people, who were fasting to make them break the fast? And what is the meaning of his statement that:

“Rajab, what is Rajab? It was a month, which people regarded as sacred

¹ *Saheeh Bukhari*, 3:217 [1/380, H. 1097]; *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:319-321 [2/514-520, H. 181-183 & 186-193, *Kitabus Siyam*].

² *Sunanul Kubraa*, Nasai, 4:165 [2/92, H. 2530-2533].

³ Al-Fiqha Alal Mazahibul Arba, 1:439 [1/557].

⁴ *Ehyaaul Uloomdeen*, 1:244 [1/213].

⁵ *Taareekhul Kabeer*, 3/243, No. 836.

⁶ *Tahzeebut Tahzeeb*, 9:531 [9/269].

during period of Ignorance; but when Islam arrived it was abandoned?”

48. Independent judgment (Ijtehaad) of the Caliph regarding difficult questions on Quran

1. It is narrated from Anas that:

“Umar bin Khattab beat up Sabigh Kufi so severely that his back became bloody only because of his query regarding a letter of Quran.”

It is narrated from Zuhri that Umar beat up with lash Sabigh, as he made excessive inquiries regarding letters of Quran and his back started bleeding.¹

Ghazzali says in *Ihyhaul Uloom*.² Umar was one, who closed the path of argumentation, scholasticism and debates and he lashed Sabigh, drove him away and also asked people not to go near him as he had asked him about disparity between two verses of Quran.

2. Abdur Rahman bin Yazid says: A man asked Umar about the verse:

وَفَاكِهَةٌ وَأَبْرَقٌ

“And fruits and herbage”³

When Umar saw that they were talking about this, he went towards them with a whip.⁴

Allamah Amini says: I think that clear reply to every unknown thing is possible through the tongue of lash. The statement of the Caliph, also hints at this when he said: “We are forbidden from excessive precaution,” in reply to the simplest query, which every pure Arab knew and that is the meaning of the term of ‘Abb’, which is clearly explained in Holy Quran in the verse of:

مَتَاعًا لَكُمْ وَلَا نَعَمْكُمْ

“A provision for you and for your cattle.”⁵

I don’t know how the questioner, who posed a question about meaning of words in Quran can become eligible for their blood to be shed through the lash and that they bear pain and discomfort? Because this query is not an evidence of their infidelity and apostasy, but the story is as you see.

In addition to that, what is the sin of the person, who is aware of the meaning of ‘Abb’ and he replies? And why the Caliph attacked them with whip? In this way, would any scope remain for teaching and training?!

¹ *Sonan Darimi*, 1:54 & 55; *Tareekh Ibne Asakir*, 6:384 [23/411, No. 2846 & *Mukhtasar Tareekh Damishq*, 11/46]; *Seerah Umar*, Ibne Jauzi, 109 [Pg. 117]; *Durre Mansoor*, 6:111 [7/614].

² *Ehyaaul Uloomdeean*, 1:30 [1/28].

³ Surah Abasa 80:31

⁴ *Fathul Bari*, 13:230 [13/371]; *Durre Mansoor*, 6:317 [8/422].

⁵ Surah Abasa 80:32

Perhaps it was through the blessings of that lash that people were deprived of progress and development in knowledge and sciences. So much so that persons like Ibne Abbas were unable to ask the Caliph regarding the verse:

وَلَنْ تَظْهَرَ عَلَيْهِ

“And if you back up each other against him.”¹

Ibne Abbas says:

“I wanted to ask Umar bin Khattab about a tradition since last two years, but his ferocity restrained me.”²

And he also says:

“Since last one year I wanted to ask Umar bin Khattab about a verse of Quran; but due to his ferocity, I am unable to do so.”³

49. Viewpoint of the Caliph regarding query about future

To his independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) regarding inquiries about difficult portions of Quran, add his unique viewpoint regarding queries about future, because he prohibited asking questions regarding these as well.

Tawus says: Umar said from the pulpit:

“By God, I would deal harshly with one, who makes inquiries about future, because God has only mentioned about what is present.”⁴

He also said: “It is not lawful to make inquiries about what has not yet come to pass, because Allah, the Mighty and the High has only mentioned and revealed commands about the present.”

He also said: “I shall deal harshly with your queries about the future and what is there for us is sufficient; and it has kept us sufficiently occupied.”

“One day, a person came to Ibne Umar and asked about something, which I don’t what it was. Ibne Umar said: Don’t ask about what has not yet happened, because I heard from Umar bin Khattab cursing one, who inquired about future.”⁵

¹ Surah Tahrim 66:4; *Majmauz Zawaad*, Hafiz Haithami, 5:8 [Salabi in his *Tafseer*, 9:348, through his chains of narrators from Asma binte Umais that when the verse of: “**And if you back up each other against him, then surely Allah it is Who is his Guardian, and Jibreel and the believers that do good, and the angels after that are the aiders.**” (Surah Tahrim 66:4) that I heard from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he said: The ‘the believers that do good’ is Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.), Ref: *Al-Ghadeer*, 1/684].

² *Kitabul Ilm*, Abu Umar, 56 [Pg. 135, H. 664].

³ *Seerah Umar*, Ibne Jauzi, 118 [Pg. 126].

⁴ *Sonan Darimi*, 1:50; *Jami Bayanul Ilm*, 2:141 [Pg. 372, H. 1807].

⁵ *Sonan Darimi*, 1:50; *Kitabul Ilm*, Abu Umar, 2:143 [Pg. 369, H. 1794]; and its *Mukhtasar*, 190 [Pg. 326, H. 232]; *Fathul Bari*, 13:225 [13/226]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 2:174 [3/839, H. 8906].

50. Prohibition of the Caliph regarding traditions

Two incidents can be mentioned: that is forbidding questions about difficult portions of Quran and queries about future. The third incident, which is more exposing than these two is prohibition of Caliph to narrate traditions of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) or too much inclination to them; and his threatening and confining the companions of Prophet due to this act.

It is mentioned in the text of Tabari that:¹

“Umar often said: Read only the Quran, which is written on skin and do not interpret it and narrate minimum traditions from the Prophet, as long as I am present among you.”²

Tibrani has narrated from Ibrahim bin Abdur Rahman that:

“Umar imprisoned three persons: Ibne Masud, Abu Darda and Abu Masud Ansari and said: You narrate too many traditions from the Prophet, and he confined them in Medina till they were martyred.”³

Dhahabi has narrated from Abu Salma in *Tadhkira*⁴ that they asked Abu Huraira:

“Did you narrate so many traditions during period of Umar?”

Abu Huraira replied: “If I have narrated as many traditions during period of Umar, I would have definitely been lashed.”

Abu Huraira says: “As long as Umar was alive, I was not able to say: Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said...”

Allamah Amini says: The facts that apparent of Quran does not make people needless of Sunnah and Sunnah can never be separated from Quran till they would arrive to the Prophet at the Cistern of Kauthar; and the need of Sunnah is not less than the need for Quran. And need of Book for Sunnah, according to Awzai and Makhul is more than the need of the Sunnah over the Book; was the Caliph unaware of these facts.⁵

After the Caliph prohibited the Islamic Ummah from knowledge of Quran; after he forbid them from excessive discussions, academic, religious, political, social, moral, historical pursuits; and closed the path of learning; restraining them from deriving laws, whose need has not risen till then. And keeping them away from readiness for acting according to religion of God before appearance of phenomenon; stopping them from learning the holy Sunnah and prohibiting its spread among people and society.

¹ *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, [4/204, Incidents of 23 A.H.].

² *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*, 3:120 [12/93, Sermon 223].

³ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, Zahabi, 1:7 [No. 2]; *Majmauz Zawaaed*, 1:149 and the writer of gloss on this book has regarded it as authentic and said: This matter is narrated from Umar through many authentic chains and Umar was dead against the narration of traditions.

⁴ *Tazkeratul Huffaaz*, Zahabi, 1:7.

⁵ *Jami Bayanul Ilm*, 2:191 [Pg. 429, H. 2071 & 2073].

How this helpless community could benefit from these teachings and get precedence on other communities? And from which Book and from which Sunnah, can we obtain the success of the world that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) brought for us and laid its foundation?

This style of the Caliph was a fatal strike at the backbone of the structure of Islam and Islamic Ummah, which degraded its teachings, nobility and progress. Now, whether he was aware of this fact or not?

Among the products of this hateful behavior was the matter of writing the Sunnah, which we recount as follows:

51. Writing of the Sunnah

It is narrated from Urwah that:

“Umar decided to write and record the Sunnah of Prophet. He sought advice of companions of Prophet and they said that it was advisable. But Umar continued to draw *Istikhara* [and prayed to God to show him the right path]. Till once day he gave up his intention and said:

‘I had decided to record in writing, the reports and traditions of Prophet, but when I studied histories of previous nations, I saw that people before had written books and they became engrossed in those books and abandoned the Book of God. By God, I will never mix the Book of God with another thing.’

Some people also followed the practice of the Caliph as opposed to Sunnah of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and prohibited writing and narration of traditions.¹

52. Caliph’s viewpoint regarding books

You may add to the four issues of: Incident of difficulties of Quran, incident about inquiring about future, incident of narrating traditional reports from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and incident of writing Sunnah and traditional reports – the issue of personal view and independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) of Caliph regarding books and authors.

A Muslim man came to the Caliph and said: When we conquered Madayan, we got hold of a book, which contained wisdom of Fars and amazing statements. Umar demanded his lash and began to strike that man. After that he recited the verse:

نَحْنُ نَقْصُ عَلَيْكَ أَخْسَنَ الْقَصَصِ

“We narrate to you the best of narratives.”²

And said: Woe upon you, have seen any narrative better than the narratives of Quran? The previous nations were destroyed, due to the fact that they became

¹ Sonan Darami, 1:125; Mustadrak Hakeem, 1:104-106 [1/186-187, H. 357-359]; Mukhtasar Jaameul Ilm, 36-37 [Pg. 68-72, H. 61-63].

² Surah Yusuf 12:3

involved in books of their scholars and priests and abandoned Taurat and Injeel, till the knowledge contained in them disappeared.¹

In *Tarikh Mukhtasarud Dawl*,² printed in Oxania in 1663 A.D., it is narrated from Abul Faraj Multi (d. 684 A.H.) that:

Yahya Gharama Teeqi was alive till the conquest of Alexandria at the hands of Amr Aas and he came to Amr and the latter recognized the position of Yahya and he accorded respect to him and he heard some philosophical issues from him, about which Arabs were unaware and in his view these issues were very important. He was greatly amazed, because he was a wise and broad minded man. From this aspect he took up his employment and never left him.

After that once Yahya said to Amr: "You have conquered all provinces of Alexandria and subjugated all groups and whatever is beneficial to you, I don't want to say anything about it. As for whatever is not beneficial for you, I am more worthy for that."

Amr asked: "What do you need?"

He replied: "Books of wisdom present in the treasure of regime."

Amr said: "This is a matter, about which I cannot decide, without directions of Umar bin Khattab."

So he wrote about it to Umar and expressed the request of Yahya. Reply came from Umar as follows:

"As for the books you mentioned, if they are in agreement with Quran, then in presence of Quran we are needless of them and if they are opposed to Quran, we have no need for them. So destroy them."

Amr distributed them among public baths of Alexandria to be used as fuel to heat water. For six months the public baths of Alexandria heated water by burning these books. You may read about this bitter incident and be amazed.

In the *History of Islamic Civilization*,³ George Gordon has narrated the complete statements of Multi and in the appendix, he says:

"All these statements of Multi are deleted from the printed edition of *Al-Abalii Yasueen*, and we don't know what was the reason for that."

Abdul Latif Baghdadi (d. 629 A.H.) says in *Al-Ifada wal Etebar*:⁴

"Also, regarding pillars of Sawari,⁵ I observed the relics in some of them were whole and some were broken up and from that I concluded that this palace once had pillars and that they bore the roof and there was a dome above the

¹ *Tareekh Umar bin Khattab*, Ibne Jauzi, 107 [Pg. 116]; *Sharh Nahjul Balagha*, 3:122 [12/101, Sermon 223]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:95 [1/374, H. 1632].

² *Tareekh Mukhtasarud Dawl*, 180 [Pg. 103].

³ *History of Islamic Civilization*, 3:40 [Complete works of George Gordon, History of Islamic civilization, No. 11/635].

⁴ *Al-Ifada wal Etebar*, 28 [Pg. 132].

⁵ The hall where Aristotle delivered lectures.

pillars. In my view this is the same hall, in which Aristotle and after him, his students lectured. And this place is still the residence of the first teacher (Aristotle), which Alexander constructed at the time of building Alexandria and the treasure of kingdom, comprising of books and the great library of Alexandria, which Amr Aas burnt up at the directions of Umar was situated in this house only.”

This viewpoint of the Caliph was general and all books obtained from all areas that Islam conquered, met the same fate. The author of *Kashfuz Zunoon* says:¹

“When Muslims conquered the cities of Fars and got access to books present there, Saad bin Abi Waqqas wrote to Umar bin Khattab and inquired about them and mentioned the difficulty of transferring them. Umar replied:

‘Throw all of them into the water. If there is guidance in them, Allah has guided us to something better; and if they contain misguided things Allah has made us needless of them.’

Following this command, they threw them into water or burnt them up; and in this manner, the learning of the Iranians was lost.”

In his statements, he says regarding Muslims and their learning:² “During their conquests, whenever they came in possession of any book, they destroyed it.”

Ibne Khaldun say in his *Tarikh*:³ “Learning was present in excess among different communities. Learning, which we could not get access to were much more than what has reached us. Where is the learning of Iran, which Umar ordered to destroy at the time of the conquest?”

Allamah Amini says: It is not absolutely unlawful to study books of ancient people, especially if they were academic, technological, moral, medical, space or astronomy, mathematics, philosophy or books like that. More important than that: if books are attributed to the like of Prophet Daniyal, provided their attribution is correct and there is no distortion in it.

Yes, if they are from deviating books, which call to invalid beliefs and abrogated religions or create doubts in the foundations of Islam, for simple minded persons, who are unable to reply or refute them, studying them is not lawful.

But for those, who are capable to reason and reply against them in order to prove them wrong and their perusal takes them towards truth, reading them is the highest obedience. Between the Quran, which contains the best of stories and lessons and books mentioned above, which contained beneficial sciences and wisdoms about manufacture and arts useful to human society, there is no kind of

¹ *Kashfuz Zunoon*, 1:446 [1/679].

² *Kashfuz Zunoon*, 1:25 [Pg. 33, Preface].

³ *Taareekh*, Ibne Khaldun, 1:32 [1/50].

contradiction

Although points mentioned in Quran are very much full of meaning, profound and stable than those mentioned in those books. But lack of understanding the depth of meaning of the Holy Quran, in spite of presence of all sciences of the world in Quran impelled him to keep people keep away from sciences and he lashed those, who study those books; although this is not having any kind of justification from the view point of Quran, Sunnah and general law of Islam.

God knows that as result of destroying this treasure of knowledge in Alexandria and erasing the progressive culture and technology of the Iranians what loss is caused to the Muslims!

And this unique wealth of human knowledge neither has any relation to guidance or deviation in such a way as the Caliph thought regarding books of Iranians and if Muslims had benefited from knowledge of these books they would definitely not have come to any loss.

Yes, this hateful act became the cause of retreat of knowledge, poverty in the world and defamed the Arabs and Muslim in the world. Among the critics some regarded this to be wildness and some ignorance. We leave the evaluation of this act to perfect reasoning and correct logic.

Moreover, the Caliph could have chosen from them books, which were beneficial for human society and then destroyed books of deviation and polytheism. However, regrettably, he did not do that and history has recorded the events as you heard.

53. Ijtehaad of Caliph regarding names and agnomens

1. It is narrated from Zaid bin Aslam from his father that Umar bin Khattab scolded his son, because his agnomen was Abu Isa. The agnomen of Mughira bin Shoba was also Abu Isa. Umar said to him: Why did you not give yourself the agnomen of Abu Abdullah? He replied: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) kept my agnomen as Abu Isa. Umar said: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) has forgiven past and future sins,¹ but we are responsible for ourselves.² After that he used to address him as Abu Abdullah till he was killed.³

2. Wife of Ubaidullah Ibne Umar came to Umar and complained: "O chief of believers, will you not save me from Abu Isa?"

Umar asked: "Who is Abu Isa?"

The wife said: "Your son, Ubaidullah."

¹ In Surah Fath: 2 it is mentioned: "That Allah may forgive your community their past faults and those to follow..." (Surah Fath 48:2)

² It is mentioned in Abu Dawood that it means: We are placed in the crowd of Muslims and we don't know what happens.

³ Sonan Abu Dawood, 2:309 [4/291, H. 4963].

Umar said: "Woe be on you, how can you call him Abu Isa?"

And he summoned his son and asked: "Woe be on you, have you adopted the agnomen of Abu Isa?"

He warned and threatened him; after that he bit his hand till he screamed. Then he beat him up and said: "Woe be on you, did Isa have a father? Can't you have agnomens, which Arabs adopt? Like Abu Salma, Abu Hanzala, Abu Arfata and Abu Murra."¹

3. Umar wrote to the people of Kufa: "Do not name anyone on names of prophets;" and commanded the residents of Medina to change the names of their sons if they were named Muhammad, till some companions of Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself had permitted them to name their sons as Muhammad. At that time he left them alone.²

4. Umar heard a man called another person as Zulqarnain and told him: "Now that you exhausted names of prophets; you have started naming people after angels?"

Allamah Amini says: These reports expose the ignorance of Caliph:

1. The Caliph prohibited naming people as Muhammad. And ordered changing names of persons, who were named as Muhammad, whereas the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) had said: "One who has three sons and has not named anyone as Muhammad, is ignorant."³

He also said: "When you name your son Muhammad, you must not beat him or deprive him of anything."⁴

And said: "On Judgment Day, Almighty Allah looks at one, whose name is Ahmad or Muhammad and says: O My servant, you, who is named after my beloved, Muhammad, how did you not feel ashamed to commit sin?" He would hang his head in shame and say: "Indeed, I am guilty of sins."

Allah, the Mighty and Sublime will say: "Jibreel, take the hand of My servant and admit him to Paradise. I feel ashamed to punish by Hellfire, a servant named Muhammad."⁵

The Prophet himself named most persons born during his lifetime as Muhammad. Moreover, Islam has encouraged people to name children with beautiful names and Muhammad is the most beautiful name and the best name, through which God is worshipped and praised. That is why it is narrated from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that:

"On Judgment Day, you will be summoned by your names and names of

¹ Sharh Nahjul Balagha, 3:104 [12/44, Sermon 223].

² Umdatul Qari, 7:143 [15/39].

³ Tabari has mentioned this report in Mojamil Kabeer, 11/59 H. 11077. and Ibne Adi in Al-Kamil fee Zoofa ar-Rijal, 6/89, No. 1617; Suyuti in Jamius Saghir, under the letter 'M' [2/653, H. 9084].

⁴ Majmauz Zawaad, 8:48; Seeratul Halabiyya, 1:89 [1/83].

⁵ Al-Mudkhal, Ibne Haaj, 1:129.

your fathers; so choose good names for yourself.”¹

He also said: “Among the rights of children is that they should be given good names and trained well.”²

2. His prohibiting people from using names of prophets, which after names derived from the beautiful divine names: that is Muhammad, Ali, Hasan and Husain, are the most beautiful names.

It is mentioned in a traditional report from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that: “There is no house having a name of a prophet, except that Allah, the Mighty and High raises an angel, who sanctifies them every morning and night.”³

And he says: “Choose your name from names of prophets and the best name in view of Allah is Abdullah, Abdur Rahman and the most true of them is Harith and Hamam and the worst of them is Harb and Murrah.”⁴

3. Umar condemned using agnomen of Abu Isa on the pretext that Isa (a.s.) did not have a father.

Did the Caliph think that everyone, who named himself as Abu Isa regarded himself as father of Isa, son of Maryam that objection should be raised against him whether Isa had a father? Or he thought that agnomens of fathers should be according to names of their children. That is why he said to Suhaib: “Why you named yourself Abu Yahya; you who don’t have a son?”

4. More amazing is the fact that the Caliph after hearing the statement of Mughira that the Prophet named him Abu Isa, he testified to it, yet he did not give up his view and regarded him to be forgiven of his sins by Prophet. He asked him and his companions not to commit sins; because he did not know what their end shall be.

I don’t know whether he proved through definite evidences that it was sin in which chastisement is followed by forgiveness. Moreover, how he understood that Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) committed sins that he argued through verse of Surah Fath that sins of Prophet are forgiven. No, he does not have a proof, on the contrary, through this imaginary reasoning, he deliberated whether Isa had a father?

Now, if this statement had evidence – and I definitely don’t say that – then refuge of God, kudos to the non-infallible Prophet. And if he issued this statement due to sophistication, then woe be on one, who utters without knowing.

5. After regarding these two agnomens bad, his punishment was that before beating them up, he used to bite his hand and time has never heard of such punishment.

6. Among agnomens the Caliph liked for Arabs is Abu Murrah, whereas the

¹ *Sunan Abu Dawood*, 2:307 [4/287, H. 4948]; *Sunan Baihaqi*, 9:306.

² *Majmauz Zawaad*, Hafiz Haithami, 8:47.

³ *Al-Mudkhal*, Ibne Haaj, 1:128.

⁴ *Sunan Abu Dawood*, 2:307 [4/287, H. 4950]; *Sunan Baihaqi*, 9:306.

Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) prohibited using this agnomen. In addition to that as mentioned in books of language, Abu Murrah is the agnomen of Iblees.¹ That is why it is said that Iblees has a daughter named Murrah. The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) prohibited people from naming people as Hayat (life) and said: Indeed Hayat is Shaitan.

In his *Sunan*, Abu Dawood has narrated from Masruq that:² I went to meet Umar bin Khattab and he asked: "Who are you?" I replied: "Masruq bin Ajda."

Umar said: "I heard the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) say: 'Ajda' means Shaitan." As if Umar had forgotten his directions when he ordered people use the agnomen of Abu Murrah. Did he not know that Abu Murrah is the agnomen of Iblees or he expressed his personal opinion as opposed to that of the Prophet? God knows best.

In the same way is the agnomen of Abu Hanzala, because as mentioned by Ibne Qayyim in *Zaadul Maad*,³ Hanzala is one of the worst names.

7. His view that Zulqarnain is the name of an angel, whereas he did not know that Zulqarnain, according to Tabari, was a Roman youth to whom rulership was given.⁴

It is mentioned in authentic reports from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) that:

"Zulqarnain was one, who loved Allah and Allah loved him as well. And he acted sincerely for God and Almighty Allah also bestowed him with sincerity and purity. He was neither a prophet nor an angel."⁵

There are some verses in Holy Quran about Zulqarnain and it seems that the Caliph was unaware of them. Also, he was ignorant that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) named Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) as Zulqarnain and announced in public:

"O people, I recommend you to love Zulqarnain, that is my brother and son of my uncle; because only the believer loves him and only the hypocrite bears enmity. One, who loves him, loves me and one, who is inimical to him, has borne malice to me."⁶

He also addressed Ali (a.s.) saying: "There is a house in Paradise for you," and according to a report "there is a treasure for you" and "you are the Zulqarnain of Paradise".

Scholars of traditions say that it implies the owner of two sides of Paradise and its great kingdom, which encompasses the whole Paradise just as the whole earth was under the control of Zulqarnain. Or it implies that he is Zulqarnain of Islamic Ummah, although in place of the term of Ummah, a pronoun is given

¹ *Qaamoosul Loghaat*, 2:133 [Pg. 610]; *Taqjul Oroos*, 2:539; *Lesaanul Arab*, 7:18 [13/76].

² *Sunan*, Abu Dawood, 2:308 [4/289, H. 4957].

³ *Zaadul Maad*, 1:260 [2/6].

⁴ *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, Tabari, 1/575.

⁵ *Fathul Bari*, 6:295 [6/383]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:254 [2/457, H. 4493].

⁶ *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:214 [3/166]; *Tazkeratus Sibt*, 17[Pg. 28]; *Sharh Ibne Abil Hadeed*, 2:451 [9/172, Sermon 154].

without naming the Ummah; like statement of Almighty Allah:

حَتَّىٰ تَوَارَثْ بِالْجَابِ

“Until the sun set and time for Asr prayer was over, (he said):”¹

...where Almighty Allah used the hidden pronoun for the sun in Taurat² without stating the name of sun. Abu Ubaid says: I prefer the second explanation; they have said that it is narrated from Ali (a.s.) regarding Zulqarnain; he called his people to worship of God, but they hit on his head twice and among you also there is someone like Zulqarnain. In my view, His Eminence implied himself. That is: I would call people to truth till I would be attacked twice on my head. As a result of that I would be martyred.

It is narrated from Thalib that: It implies that Ali is the father of two illustrious personalities of Ummah: Hasan and Husain, sons of Prophet (may God be pleased with them). [and Zuqarni means two mountains].

Or Zulqarnain implies two gashes, which appeared on his head: one of them being the strike the Amr bin Abde Wudd in Battle of Khandaq and the other being the gash of Ibne Muljim (curse of Allah be on him). Abu Ubaid says: And this is the most correct interpretation.³

And when the Caliph was unaware of points mentioned in Holy Quran and Sunnah, there is no more scope; we cannot condemn him for verses of poets from the period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*); because the name and mention is present in verses of Imrul Qays, Aws bin Hajar and Tarafa bin Abad.

Moreover, what is the problem in using names of angels? How numerous are people named after angels, like Jibreel, Mikaeel and Israfeel. And these are three Hebrew names and according to Ibne Hajar, their meanings in Arabic are as follows: Abdullah, Ubaidullah and Abdur Rahman.⁴

In *Saheeh Bukhari*, it is narrated from Akrama that: *Jabar*, *Meek* and *Saraaf* mean servant and ‘eel’ means God.⁵

It is also mentioned in authentic tradition that: The names liked most by Almighty Allah are: Abdullah (servant of Allah) and Abdur Rahman (servant of the Beneficent). And there is no problem in using these Hebrew names as well.⁶

¹ Surah Saad 38:32

² The conclusion of the verse is that His Eminence, Sulaiman says: I am so fond of horses that when horses are presented to me, I forgot to pray and its time lapsed and the sun set. But was wanted to train them to fight in the way of God. Ref: *Tafseer Mizan* 17/203.

³ *Nawaaderul Usul*, Hakeem Tirmizi, 307 [2/187, Principle 241]; *Mustadrak*, Hakeem, 3123 [3/133, H. 4623]; *Riyazun Nazara*, 2:210 [3/161]; *Nihaya*, Ibne Asir, 3:278 [4/51]; *Lesaamul Arab*, 17:210 [11/136]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:254 [2/456-457, H. 4491-4493].

⁴ *Al-Isabah* [2/399, No. 5126].

⁵ *Saheeh Bukhari*, Chapter of one, who is inimical to Jibreel, Kitabul Tafseer [4/1628, H. 4210].

⁶ Ahmad has mentioned this report in *Musnad*, 5:456, H. 18553; and Ibne Habban in his *Saheeh*, 13/142, H. 5828.

54. The Caliph didn't know which Surahs were recited on Eid days

It is narrated from Ubaidah that: Umar came out from his house to lead the Eid prayer and summoned Abu Waqid Laithi and asked:

“Which chapter of Quran did the Prophet recite on such days?”

Laithi replied: “Surah Qaf and Surah Qamar.”

Allamah Amini says: This report is authentic, which Ahle Sunnat scholars have narrated in their *Saheeh* books.¹ On the basis of this, to regard it as chainless on the pretext that Ubaidullah bin Abdullah did not live till the time of Umar, is invalid, due to the fact that in *Saheeh Muslim*, this traditional report is narrated from Ubaidullah bin Abdullah from Abu Waqid and there is no doubt that Ubaidullah met Abu Waqid.

It is on this basis that Baihaqi, Sanadi, Suyuti and others have rejected the objection that it was chainless.

Come, let us ask the Caliph why he remained unaware of Surahs, which Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) recited on festivals of Eidul Fitr and Eid of Sacrifice?

Did he forget it and wanted to be reminded; as Suyuti has justified in *Tanweerul Hawalik*.²

Or his being preoccupied in market prevented him from that; as he himself admitted on numerous occasions?

It is unlikely that he should have forgotten it, because it was a common issue encountered every year and a practice carried out in public in maximum attendance and it was repeated twice; such a thing is not usually forgotten.

55. The Caliph and the meanings of terms

1. It is narrated from Umar that he asked from the pulpit: “What do you conclude from the verse:

أَوْيَ أُخْلَهُمْ عَلٰى تَخْوِفٍ

“Or that He may not seize them by causing them to suffer gradual loss.”³”

Everyone was silent. An old man from Huzail tribe arose and said: ‘to suffer gradual loss’ is from our language and it implies reduction.

Umar asked: “Is this point mentioned in Arab poetry?”

He replied: “Yes, our poet, Abu Kabeer Hazali - Zuhair describes a camel,

¹ *Saheeh Muslim*, 1:242 [2/415, H. 534]; *Sunanul Kubraa*, Nasai, 3:184 [1/546, H. 1773]; *Sunan, Baihaqi*, 3:294.

² *Tanweerul Hawalik*, 1:147 [1/191].

³ Surah Nahl 16:47

whose humps were high and fat before, but have now become thin due to long journeys, and he says:

“Due to roaming and traveling from high mountains, loads of flesh are reduced from this camel, as a branch is chafed into a bow.”

At this point, Umar said:

“People should learn their collections of poems, so that they may not be lost.”

They asked: What is our collection?

He replied: “Poems from the period of Ignorance (*Jahiliyya*), because exegesis of the Book and meaning of your discourse is present in them.”¹

2. It is narrated from Abu Sult Thaqafi that: Umar bin Khattab pronounced the ‘r’ in the term ‘strait and narrow’ (*حرجاً*) in the verse:

وَمَنْ يُرِدُّ أَنْ يُضْلَلَ يَجْعَلُ صَدْرَهُ ضَيْقَاحَرَجًا كَمَا يَصْعَدُ فِي السَّمَاءِ

“And (for) whomsoever He intends that He should cause him to err, He makes his breast strait and narrow as though he were ascending upwards.”²

...with vowel ‘a’ and some companions of the Prophet present there recited it with vowel ‘e’ (*Harij*). Umar said: Bring to me a shepherd from Kinana from Madlaj tribe. When they brought him, Umar asked: Young man, what is ‘Harja’. He replied: In our view ‘Harja’ is a tree and no domestic or wild animal can access it.

At that time, Umar said: “The heart of the hypocrite is same: no goodness can enter it.”³

3. Abdullah bin Umar says: Umar bin Khattab recited the verse of:

وَمَا جَعَلَ عَلَيْكُمْ فِي الدِّينِ مِنْ حَرَجٍ

“And has not laid upon you any hardship in religion”⁴

Then he said: “Bring to me a man from the clan of Madlaj.” Umar asked him: “What is the meaning of *Harajin* (*حرج*) in your language?” He replied: “Trouble and difficulty.”⁵

4. Hakeem has narrated from Saeed bin Musayyab that: Umar bin Khattab concluded the recitation of the verse:

¹ *Al-Kashaf*, 2:165 [2/608 & 609]; *Al-Jaameul Akhakul Quran*, 10:110 [10/73]; *Tafseer Baizaawi*, 1:667 [1/545].

² Surah Anaam 6:125

³ *Durre Mansoor*, 3:45 [3/356]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:285 [2/596, H. 4820].

⁴ Surah Hajj 22:78

⁵ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:257 [2/470, H. 4523].

الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَلَمْ يَلْبِسُوا إِيمَانَهُمْ بُطُولٍ

“Those who believe and do not mix up their faith with iniquity.”¹

Then he went to Ubayy bin Kaab and asked: “Which of us have not committed injustice?”

Ubayy said: “It implies polytheism. Have you not heard the statement of Luqman to his son:

يُبَيِّنَ لَكُمْ أَنَّ اللَّهَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ كَلْمَةُ عَظِيمٌ ﴿٢﴾

“O my son! do not associate aught with Allah; most surely polytheism is a grievous iniquity.”²

I regard the Caliph excused in the matter that knowledge of Book and Sunnah remained concealed from him or he was incapable of adjudication, because of his being engrossed in brokering quadrupeds,³ preoccupation in market⁴ and trading in yarn.

The fact is that leaves of the *salam* tree were used for tanning).⁵ During the period of poverty, when he barely had enough to survive, he was prevented from acquiring knowledge, but I don't regard him excused from his lack of awareness of his language, which he spoke day and night.

إِنَّ هَذَا الَّهُوَ الْقَصْصُ الْحُكْمُ

“Most surely this is the true explanation.”⁶

وَلَقَدْ جَعَلْنَاهُمْ بِكِتَابٍ فَصَلَّنَاهُ عَلَى عِلْمٍ

“And certainly We have brought them a Book which We have made clear with knowledge.”⁷

وَمَا لَهُمْ بِنِلَكَ مِنْ عِلْمٍ إِنْ هُمْ إِلَّا يَظْنُونَ ﴿٨﴾

“And they have no knowledge of that; they only conjecture.”⁸

إِنَّ الظَّنَّ لَا يُعْنِي مِنَ الْحَقِّ شَيْئًا

¹ Surah Anaam 6:82

² Surah Luqman 31:13; *Mustadrak Alas Saheehain*, 3:305 [3/345, H. 5330].

³ *Nihaya*, 1:78 [1/119]; *Qaamoosul Loghaat* [*Qaamoosul Moheet*, 754]; *Taajul Oroos*, 4:721; and he says: It implies one, who acts as an agent for hiring out donkeys and camels.

⁴ *Saheeh Muslim*, 2:234 [4/361, H. 36]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:278-279 [2/567-569, H. 4741, 4744 & 4746].

⁵ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 581.

⁶ Surah Aale Imran 3:62

⁷ Surah Araaf 7:52

⁸ Surah Jaaseyah 45:24

“Surely conjecture will not avail aught against the truth.”¹

Conclusion

These were some intellectual masterpieces of Umar, which we could access and some of the points distilled are:

“1. The Caliph, used to learn Islamic issues from companions as he himself lacked this knowledge; though some of them were also completely ignorant. Before everyone, was our master, Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.), from whom he inquired most about knowledge and wisdom, as we mentioned before and due to which, he said:

‘If Ali had not been there, Umar would have perished.’”

And his statement: “If Ali had not been there, Umar would have lost his way.”

And his statement: “O God. Do not pose a difficulty to me, when Ali is not there to solve it.”

And his statement: “O Abul Hasan, may God not leave me alone, where you are not present.”

And his statement: “O God, don’t present a problem to me, except when Ali is at my side.”

And his statement: “If Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.) had not been there, Umar would have perished.”

And his statement: “I seek the refuge of God from a difficulty, where Ali is not present.”

And his statement: “Women are unable to give birth to the like of Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). If Ali had not been there, Umar would have been destroyed.”

And his statement: “Refer the statements of Umar to Ali; if Ali were not there, Umar would have perished.”

And his statement: “May God not keep me alive after the son of Abu Talib.”

And his statement: “O Ali, you are summoned to solve every problem and difficulty.”

And his statement: “Has any free woman given birth to and reared the like of him?”

And his statement: “Alas, here is the branch of Bani Hashim, branch of Prophet and vestige of knowledge needed by everyone, while he is not needful of it, and wisdom is available in his house.”

And his statement: “O Ali, may God not leave me alone in a difficulty, where you are not present nor in the city, where you are not present.”

And his statement: “O son of Abu Talib, you are always the remover of

¹ Surah Yunus 10:36

every doubt and one, who makes all commands clear.”

And his statement: “If you had not been there, I would have been disgraced.”

And his statement: “I seek refuge of God from every difficulty where Abul Hasan is not there.”

And his statement [as he gestured to Ali (a.s.)]: “This man is the most knowledgeable about our Prophet and Book of our Prophet.”

And due to his dire need of knowledge, guidance of companions and removal of his deviation through them, on many occasions, he was compelled to seek assistance from senior companions in judicial matters and he referred to them and discussed with them. And this statement of his exposes the fact: “All people are more learned than Umar.”

And his statement: “You heard me speak in this manner and did not deny, till an uneducated old lady rejected that.”

And his statement: “O Umar, all are more accomplished than you.”

And his statement: All the people, even ladies in women’s quarters, are more accomplished than Umar.

And his statement: All the people, even ladies behind veils, are more accomplished than Umar.

And his statement: O Umar, all are more learned than you.

And his statement: O Umar, all are more learned than you, even aged ladies.

And his statement: All are more accomplished than me.

All the above mentioned traditions and hundreds of others like them, make us aware that the Caliph was not imbued with qualities and specialties which senior personalities of Ummah have mentioned regarding Imamate.

Imamal Harmain, Juwaini says in Al-Irshad Ilaa Qawatiul Adilla fee Usulul Itiqad:¹

“Among the requirements of the imam is that he should be capable of independent judgment (*Ijtehaad*) in such a way that in new problems, he should not be needful of asking others and this condition is necessary according to consensus.”

With attention to this condition, on which the whole community has consensus, what is the position of one, who does not know and is not needful of people? On the contrary, people were needless of his knowledge and stories of his asking for verdicts and his inquiries have filled all books of traditions, Sunnah, history and biography?

فَمَاذَا بَعْدَ الْحَقِّ إِلَّا الضَّلَلُ

¹ Al-Irshad Ilaa Qawatiul Adilla fee Usulul Itiqad: 426 [Pg. 358].

“And what is there after the truth but error?”¹

With attention to the above mentioned points, you will recognize the value of the statement of Ibne Hazm Andulusi in his book.²

“Every discerning person knows that the knowledge of Umar was many times knowledge of Ali.”

And the value of Ibne Taymiyyah’s statement in *Minhajus Sunnah*.³

“Jurists have collected the verdicts related to Abu Bakr, Umar, Uthman and Ali and concluded that the most accurate and most clear from them, which show the level of knowledge of its owner, are issues related to Abu Bakr and then Umar.

Because of this, verdicts, which are clearly contradicted by traditional reports, are seen to be very less from Umar than Ali. As for Abu Bakr, they are basically not seen. Abu Bakr and Umar and other senior companions did not learn anything from Ali; on the contrary it is well known that Ali obtained his knowledge from Abu Bakr.”

It is strange that this man has deceived himself and imagines that he can also cheat and deceive others by this!

How is it possible to believe that Ali (a.s.), being the gate of the city of knowledge of Prophet (s.a.w.a.), as mentioned before,⁴ - and inheritor of his knowledge and wisdom,⁵ should have obtained knowledge from Abu Bakr! Such a thing is impossible even though Ibne Taymiyyah, who claims to be Shaykhul Islam, has invented it. Evaluate his other falsehoods as well from this statement and derive your conclusion. And after statements of Ibne Hazm and Ibne Taymiyyah come the above mentioned statements⁶ of author of *Washiya*.

2. Also, with attention to the above mentioned points, the value of interpretation and justification of Ahle Sunnat regarding this traditional report will be understood: “Follow my Sunnah and practice of righteous Caliphs and guided ones; and protect it through remaining attached to them and protect it with earnest and keep away from innovations (as opposed to Book and Sunnah), because every innovation is heresy and every heresy is misguidance;”⁷ as Ahle Sunnat apply this tradition to one, who sat on the seat of Caliphate through choice of people, or by appointment of Abu Bakr or by appointment of Shura committee, and they are compelled to mention Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) also with them.

Because it is not logical that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) should command

¹ Surah Yunus 10:32

² Al-Fisal fil Melal wan Nehal, [4/138].

³ *Minhajus Sunnah*, 3:128.

⁴ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 507-510.

⁵ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 283.

⁶ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 511.

⁷ *Sonan Ibne Majah*, 1:20 [1/15, H. 42]; *Sonan Abu Dawood*, 2:261 [4/200, H. 4607].

following the practice of someone, who has no practice. And everything that he has from jurisprudence, Book and Sunnah, he has heard it from others or delivered verdicts according to his personal view. And he says: "I present my view herewith; if it is correct, it is from Allah and if it is a mistake, it is from me and Shaitan."¹

Thus, in this case the Prophet has ordered following the view of people and personal conjectures in the religion of God. And this has no similarity to the command of following jurists, who derive their verdicts on the basis of Book, Sunnah and consensus or even analogy; because jurists derives laws through matter, which they have understood.

Now, one who has no discernment, who fails to reply to even the clearest issues, swears that he does not know what to do,² and is unaware of every day issues regarding Tayammum, doubts in prayer, ritual bath, secondary issues of prayer, fasting, Hajj and its like; it is not possible for him to guide the Ummah and discharge responsibilities of Caliphate.

The correct meaning of the tradition is that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) mentioned the names of his Caliphs and specified their names and deemed them to be equals of Quran in this statement: "Indeed, I leave two Caliphs among you – or: I leave two heavy things among you: Book of Allah and my progeny, my Ahle Bayt (a.s.); they will not separate till they arrive at the Pool".³ He deemed them equals of Holy Quran and has not implied anyone else due to the use of Arabic 'laam' (definite article); those who are ascribed guidance.

They are folks, whose practice was exactly and without any difference, practice of Prophet, and not persons, whom His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) neither introduced or attributed or made bequest for them; nor did he appoint them as his successors; nor mentioned their number that it may apply to them.

On the contrary, he mentioned qualities, which do not fit anyone, except the infallible Caliphs of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and to rely on this tradition to prove Caliphate in whose pursuit the Ahle Sunnat are, is relying on doubts.

3. Fabricated traditions are present in Ahle Sunnat books, which mention merits of Umar, which are not at all compatible with authentic traditions we mentioned and each of these traditions falsify those fabricated traditions.

Following are some reports falsely attributed to the Prophet:

"If I had not been appointed as a Prophet, Umar would have been appointed as one."⁴

"O Umar, if I were not sent as a prophet, definitely you would have been

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 527-528.

² In *Nawaaderul Athar*, (masterpieces of the knowledge of Umar) it is mentioned a number of times.

³ This is a tradition on which all scholars of traditions have consensus.

⁴ *Al-Mauzuuat*, Ibne Jauzi, [1/320].

sent for it.”¹

“If there had been a prophet after me, without any doubt, it would have been Umar bin Khattab.”²

“In the previous nations, there were *Muhaddath* persons;³ if there is someone like this in my Ummah, it is definitely Umar.”⁴

“Almighty Allah placed truth on the tongue and heart of Umar.”⁵

“Almighty Allah struck truth on tongue and heart of Umar.”⁶

Also, among these falsehoods are what all they narrate from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), like:

His statement that: “We said to ourselves, an angel speaks from the tongue of Umar.”⁷

And his statement: “I don’t regard it as unlikely that tranquility⁸ speaks from the tongue of Umar.”⁹

And from those falsehoods are traditional reports, which senior companions have narrated, like:

This report attributed to Ibne Masud: “If the knowledge of Umar is placed in one pan of the balance and knowledge of rest of the inhabitants of earth in the other, indeed knowledge of Umar would emerge heavier.”

And other falsehoods of this kind; because one, who holds such a position and is about to be raised as a prophet, he definitely cannot lack awareness of simple issues in case people would need to refer to him, and to such an extent that for twelve years, he cannot learn one Surah of Quran!¹⁰

Where were truth, angel and tranquility, on the day when he could not solve the most basic issues; was unable to reply and truth had not settled in his heart?

How a person having this specialty regards all people, even ladies behind veils to be more knowledgeable than him?

How he can learn the knowledge of Quran and Sunnah from women and common people in the streets and markets; what to say about elders of community?

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 271.

² *Riyazun Nazara*, 1:199 [2/245].

³ To whom angels speak.

⁴ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 426.

⁵ *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:42.

⁶ *Al-Amwal*, Abu Ubaid, 543 [Pg. 652, H. 1702].

⁷ *Hilyatul Awliya*, 1:42.

⁸ The Almighty Allah says in Surah Fath: 4: “He it is Who sent down tranquility into the hearts of the believers.” (Surah Fath 48:4) and “So He sent down tranquility on them and rewarded them with a near victory,” (Surah Fath 48:18). According to some, tranquility is an angel, who gives comfort to the heart of believers and protects them. Ref. Tafseer Alusi, 26/92.

⁹ *Al-Amwal*, Abu Ubaid, 543 [652, H. 1704].

¹⁰ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 545.

And how does he regard as undue trouble knowing the terms, which Quran has already mentioned and says: “By God, this is undue trouble, O son of Umar’s mother, no problem if you don’t know what ‘abb’ is.”¹

How can he obtain his knowledge from those numerous companions and seek their opinion about Islamic laws?

How can he apologize for his lack of awareness about the clearest traditional reports, saying: “My involvement in the market place hindered me from this.”²

How helpless he was in giving verdict on ‘Kalala’, its application and inheritance of grandfather and Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said regarding this:

“I don’t think he would ever learn this issue.”

Or: “I don’t think he would enforce it.”

He also said: “I think he would die, before he learns this.”³

How can someone like Ubayy bin Kaab be harsh on him and trading in yarn, ropes and *salam* leaves (used for tanning)⁴ prevented him from learning Quran?

How does Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) regard him ignorant about interpretation of Quran?⁵ How can? How can... and hundreds of how can’s?

فَاحْكُمْ بَيْنَ النَّاسِ بِالْحَقِّ وَلَا تَنْبِغِي لَهُوَ طَرِيقٌ
الَّذِينَ يَضِلُّونَ عَنْ سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ هُمْ عَذَابٌ شَدِيدٌ مَا نَسُوا يَوْمَ الْحِسَابِ⁶

“So judge between men with justice and do not follow desire, lest it should lead you astray from the path of Allah; (as for) those who go astray from the path of Allah, they shall surely have a severe punishment because they forgot the day of reckoning.”⁶

Return to the poetry of Shamsuddin Maliki

3. Among the other merits of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), which our poet, Maliki has hinted at in his poem, is the tradition of Mastership (*Wilayat*) or

¹ *Barguzida Jaame’ Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 517.

² *Barguzida Jaame’ Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 546, 576 & 721.

³ *Barguzida Jaame’ Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 528.

⁴ Ubayy said to Umar: “The Quran kept me engrossed, while you were busy in the market.” *Sonan Baihaqi*, 7:69 and *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:279 [2/569, H. 4746]; he also said: “You had no concern, except with trading.” *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1278 [2/567, H. 4741]; and also said: “By God, the Prophet read it out to me when you were involved in trading yarn.” In another version: “The Prophet taught it to me when you were selling *Salam* leaves in Baqi.” Ref: *Jaameul Bayan*, 1:7 [No. 7/ Vol. 11/8]; *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, 3:305 [3/345, H. 5329]; *Al-Jaameul Ahkamul Quran*, 8:238 [151-152]; *Tafseer*, Ibne Kaseer, 2:383; *Al-Kashaf*, 2:46 [2/304]; *Durre Mansoor*, 3:269; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:285-287 [2/605, H. 4858, Pg. 597, H. 4823]; *Fathul Qaazir*, 2:379 [2/398]; *Ruhul Maani*, Muniriya edition, 11:8.

⁵ *Barguzida Jaame’ Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 518-519.

⁶ Surah Saad 38:26

tradition of Ghadeer, which is the topic of our book.

4. Tradition of *Manzilah* (rank): “You are to me as Harun was to Moosa, except that after me, there is no prophet.”

Previously, we discussed about this tradition¹ and stated that according to clarification of scholars of traditions, it is authentic and proved.

5. Tradition of precedence of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in Islam, which was explained in detail.²

6. Tradition that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) named Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as Abu Turab. Selection of this agnomen was in the Battle of Asheera, which occurred in the second year of Migration, when Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) saw Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.) and Ammaar sleeping in soft sand, he woke them up and shaking Ali (a.s.) said: “Rise up, Abu Turab, shall I inform you about the most wicked of human beings? They are two: Ahimar, who hamstrung the she-camel of Thamud and one, who would strike here: that is on your head and who would dye your beard with the blood of your head.”

The chains of authorities of this tradition is correct and Hakeem Abu Abdullah Nishapuri has mentioned it is in *Mustadrak* and Haithami has regarded it as authentic and the following persons have narrated it: Imam of Hanbalis, in his *Musnad*; Hakeem in *Mustadrak*, Tabari in his *Tarikh*; Ibne Hisham in *Seeratun Nabawiyya*; Ibne Kathir in his *Tarikh*...³

Yes, Ibne Ishaq has narrated from scholars that:⁴ The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) named Ali as Abu Turab as whenever he had an argument with Fatima and he was angry with her, he did not speak to her and did not mention a word to her lest she might be distressed; he only picked dust and placed it on his head.

Ibne Ishaq says: Whenever the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) saw him smeared in dust, he understood that he had a tiff with Fatima, so he asked: “What’s the matter, O Abu Turab?”

Allamah Amini says: This statement is full of prejudice and malice, to smear the pure reputation of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and to malign his pure and chaste wife, so that it may bring down the rank of the greatest truthful one (*Siddiqe Akbar*) and the most truthful lady (*Siddiqah Kubra*) with regard to morals and manners.

Although those two personalities, according to clarification of Quran, possessed infallibility of every kind. Seeds of malice and hatred, which they had

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 319.

² *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 324-329.

³ *Musnad Ahmad*, 4:263. 264 [5/326, H. 17857, Pg. 327, H. 17862]; *Al-Mustadrak alas Saheehain*, 3:140 [3/151, H. 4679]; *Tareekh Umam wal Mulook*, 2:261 [2/408, Events of year 2 A.H.]; *Seerah Nabawiyya*, 2:236 [2/249]; *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 3:247 [3/303, Events of the year 2 A.H.].

⁴ Ibne Hisham has mentioned it in *Seerah Nabawiyya*, 2:237 [2/250]; and Aini in *Umdah*, 7:630 [22/214 & 263].

sown yesterday, are being harvested today by writers of the present age, who have blackened pages of history¹ through such propaganda.

Like: After every argument Ali, used to be enraged and he went away till he slept in the Masjid and his cousin, held his shoulders and advised him and made peace between them for a period of time. Among the arguments, which erupted among them was that one day, the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) came home to find Fatima crying, because of the slap she had got from Ali (a.s.).

Hakeem Abu Abdullah Nishapuri says:

“Bani Umayyah, regarded as a defect of Ali (a.s.), this title, which the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) had bestowed and they used to curse him by this name from the pulpits throughout their reign and ridiculed him by this name. Yes, they also ridiculed one, who gave him this title. Allah Almighty says:

قُلْ أَيُّلِهِ وَأَيْتِهِ وَرَسُولِهِ كُنْتُمْ تَسْتَهِنُونَ ﴿٤٥﴾ لَا تَعْتَذِرُوْا قَدْ كَفَرُتُمْ بَعْدَ
إِيمَانِكُمْ

“Say: Was it at Allah and His communications and His Apostle that you mocked? Do not make excuses; you have denied indeed after you had believed.”²

Nobility regarding the tradition

Shaykh Alauddin Sakatwari says in *Mahaziratul Awail*:³

“The first one to be named as Abu Turab, was Ali Ibne Abi Talib (a.s.). When the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) saw him sleeping smeared in dust, he said to him kindly: ‘Rise up, O Abu Turab.’ And this was his (Ali’s) favorite title and after that through the blessings of the self of Muhammad, nobility was obtained by him and the dust informed him of the future and past events. Understand this issue, which is a remarkable secret.”⁴

The talented poet, Abdul Baqi Effendi Umari, has mentioned a beautiful and profound point; he says:

“Almighty Allah created Adam from dust; thus Adam is the son of dust and you are the father of dust.”

7. Among the special qualities of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), which our poet, Maliki has hinted at, is the tradition of immunity and its announcement.

It is that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) first deputed Abu Bakr to announce the initial verses of Surah Baraat. At this point Jibreel came down from Almighty Allah and said: This mission cannot be performed, except by you,

¹ *Barguzida Jaame' Al-Ghadeer*, Muhammad Hasan Shafei Shahroodi, Pg. 249.

² Surah Taubah 9:65-66

³ *Mahaziratul Awail*, 113 [Pg. 123].

⁴ *Dalailun Nubuwwah*, Baihaqi, [3/12].

or someone, who is from you.

The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) sent Ali (a.s.) in pursuit of Abu Bakr on his own camel, Ghazba or Jada saying: Go to him; and when you reach him, take the verses from him, go to Mecca and announce them to Meccans.

Ali (a.s.) caught up with Abu Bakr at Arj, Zul Halifah, Zajnan or Johfa. He took the letter from him and set out for Mecca. He performed the Hajj and announced those verses.

This traditional report is mentioned by numerous scholars through different authentic chains of narrators to such an extent that in view of some Ahle Sunnat, even if it had been less frequently narrated, it would have been widely narrated (*Mutawatir*).

In *Al-Ghadeer*, the late Allamah Amini has mentioned names of seventy-three persons, who mentioned this traditional report.¹

The following are some of them:

1. Hafiz Abu Muhammad Abdullah Darami, author of *Sunan* (d. 255 A.H.).
2. Hafiz Abu Abdullah Ibne Majah Qazwini, author of *Sunan* (d. 273 A.H.).
3. Hafiz Abu Isa Tirmizi, author of *Saheeh* (d. 279 A.H.).
4. Hafiz Abu Abdur Rahman Ahmad Nasai, author of *Sunan* (d. 303 A.H.).
5. Hafiz Abu Ja'far Muhammad bin Jarir Tabari, (d. 310 A.H.).
6. Hafiz Abu Bakr Ahmad bin Husain Baihaqi, author of *Sunan* (d. 458 A.H.).
7. Hafiz Abu Qasim Jarullah Zamakhshari Shafei, (d. 538 A.H.).
8. Hafiz Abu Abdullah Yahya Qurtubi, author of *Tafseer Kabeer*, (d. 567 A.H.).
9. Hafiz Izzuddin bin Abil Hadeed Mutazali, (d. 655 A.H.).
10. Hafiz Jalaluddin Abdur Rahman Suyuti Shafei, (d. 911 A.H.).

The chains of narrators of these scholars in the event of announcement of immunity reach upto to some companions of Prophet. Allamah Amini in *Al-Ghadeer*, has mentioned the names of thirteen persons from them, among whom are:

1. Ameerul Momineen Ali (a.s.), through the chains of Zaid bin Yasi. He has narrated from His Eminence (a.s.) that when ten verses of Surah Baraat were revealed on Prophet, he summoned Abu Bakr and asked him to announce them to the Meccans. After that he summoned me and said:

“Follow Abu Bakr [enroute to Mecca] and when you reach him take the letter from him and go to the people of Mecca and announce it to them.”

I caught up with him at Johfa, took the letter from him and he returned and asked the Prophet: “O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), was something revealed about me.” His Eminence replied: “No, but Jibreel came and said to me: Only

¹ *Al-Ghadeer*, 6/477-480.

yourself or someone from you, can announce this.”

Abdullah bin Ahmad in *Zawaaidul Musnad*, Hafiz Abu Shaykh and Ibne Marduya have mentioned it and in the same way, Suyuti in *Durre Manthur*, *Kanzul Ummal*, Shaukani in his *Tafseer*, have quoted from them and it can be seen In *Tafseer al-Manar* as well.¹

2. Abu Bakr bin Abu Qahafa: He says: The Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) sent him to announce the verses to Meccans that from the following year, the polytheists will not have the right to perform Hajj and no one would circumambulate in nude. And that except for Muslims, none would enter Paradise. Also, any pact that exists between Prophet and someone else, will continue as it is till the end of the period. And Allah and His Messenger are immune from the polytheists.

Abu Bakr was gone for three days when the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) summoned Ali (a.s.) and said: Catch up with him and send Abu Bakr back to me; and you announce the verses yourself. He says: Ali did that and when Abu Bakr came to the Prophet, he cried and asked: ‘O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), am I facing a difficulty?’ His Eminence said: ‘Regarding you, nothing, except good has happened, but I was commanded that only I could announce them or a man from me.’

Ahmad has mentioned this tradition in *Musnad* and Ibne Kathir in his *Tarikh*.²

3. Ibne Abbas:

Tirmizi in *Jami*, Baihaqi in *Sunan* and...have narrated this report from him.³

4. Jabir bin Abdullah Ansari:

Darami in his *Sunan*, Nasai in *Khasais* and...have narrated the following report from him.⁴

The gist of these traditions is that: The incidence of the actual event is having wide narration or its idea is widely narrated (*Mutawatir*); it is that the verses were taken away from Abu Bakr and Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) announced them and revelation arrived commanding the Prophet that only he or a persons from him can announce it. This indicates that he was not considered worthy for announcing some verses of Quran; then how he can be vested with promotion and teaching of whole religion and informing about all issues?

¹ *Zawaaidul Musnad*, 353, H. 146; *Durre Mansoor*, 2:209 [4/122]; *Kanzul Ummaal*, 1:247 [2/422, H. 4400]; *Fathul Qaazir*, 2:319 [2/334].

² *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:3 [1/7, H. 4]; *Al-Bedaya wa al-Nehaya*, 7:357 [7/394, Events of the year 40 A.H.].

³ *Sunan Tirmizi*, 2:35 [5/257, H. 3091]; *Sunanul Kubraa*, Baihaqi, 9:224-225.

⁴ *Sunanul Kubraa*, 2:67 [5/129, H. 8463]; *Khasais Ameerul Momineen* (a.s.), 20 [Pg. 93 H. 78].

Introduction to the poet

Abu Abdullah Shamsuddin Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Ali Hawari Maliki Andulusi Nahwi, famous as Ibne Jabir Aami, was from the province of Mariya.¹ He was a poet, a literary person and had expertise in grammar, history, biography and traditions. He was born in the year 698 A.H. and he passed away in 780 A.H. He has left behind important writing, among them being: *Sharhul Feeya Ibne Malik*; in *Baghiya*, Suyuti says:

“It is a useful book, since it has diacritics on the verses. This book is really very valuable; and is beneficial for beginners.”

His biography can be found in the books of *Ad-Durarul Kamina*, *Baghiyatul Waa fee Tabaqatul Naha* and *Shazaratuz Zahab*.²

71. Alauddin Hilli

1. O beauty spot of the face, which fire made permanent; I don't think that before you, there was anyone in everlasting fire. 2. But one, who denies the successor whom Muhammad announced on Ghadeer day. 3. At that time he arose and while he had his hand in his hand and from the top of the saddles piled. 4. And angels had surrounded him and Almighty Allah was a witness of that. 5. He announced the truth and said: Of whomsoever I am the master, this Haider is (also) his master and Sayyid. 6. O Allah, love those, who love him and degrade his enemies, and be inimical to those, who are inimical to Haider. 7. By God, except for the righteous believer none loves him and except for the apostate and disbeliever, none is inimical to him. 8. O people, be his friend and do not humiliate him and do not leave him alone and seek his guidance that you may be guided. 9. They said: We heard your command and the instruction of trustworthy spirit, Jibreel, which he stressed. 10. We say: Ali is our Imam and Wali and we seek guidance from him, so that through him, we may be guided to the right path. 11. Till the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) passed away and no one came to perform his funeral and bury him. 12. Yes, they failed to follow the recommendation of Prophet and opposed the statements of Ahmad, the best human being. 13. After they recognized the right path, they exchanged guidance for deviation and fell into misguidance. 14. The son of Abu Qahafa, who was nothing before this, became their chief.

Introduction to the poet

Abul Hasan Alauddin Shaykh Ali bin Husain Hilli Shahifi³ was famous as Ibne Shahfiya. He was an accomplished scholar and an expert litterateur. He had

¹ Mariya is a large town in Spain. [*Mo'jamul Buldaan*, 5:119].

² *Ad-Durarul Kamina*, 3:339; *Baghiyatul Waa fee Tabaqatul Naha*, 14 [1/34, No. 55]; *Shazaratuz Zahab*, 6:268 [8/262, Events of the year 780 A.H.].

³ I have not recognized the cause of this attribution. Different editions have mentioned variations of the term: Shahifi, Shafhini, Shahfini, Shafhi and Shahifini.

command on all genres of literature, had authentic views and right opinion. He was the standard bearer of the poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and his panegyrics are well known and full of meaningful points, illuminated facts merged with subtle meanings and eloquent statements in praise of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) and extolling his respected son, Imam Husain (a.s.).

These selections are the best examples of his expertise, his precedence among poets, his devotion to laws of religion and his following the imams of religion. His contemporary, the First Martyr, who was martyred in 786 A.H., has written a gloss on one of his Qasidas. When the report of martyrdom of the Martyr reached him, he praised him and composed verses on him.

The Qaazi in *Majalis*,¹ Shaykh Hurre Amili in *Amalul Amal*,² and Mirza in *Riyazul Ulama*³ have mentioned his account: and praised him for knowledge and excellence.

¹ Majaalesul Momineen, [2:571].

² *Amalul Amal*, [2/190, No. 565].

³ Riyazul Ulama, [3/427].

Poets of Ghadeer in the ninth century Hijri

- 72. Ibne Arandas Hilli
- 73. Ibne Daghir Hilli
- 74. Hafiz Bursi Hilli

72. Ibne Arandas Hilli

1. Then peace be from peace [Almighty Allah] who was handed the standard of Mastership (*Wilayat*) on the day of Ghadeer. 2. Reader of the book of God and best of its readers and senior-most successor of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), the chosen one and the guide. 3. Climbing the shoulders of Ahmad, other than relation and companionship, is another excellence (of his). 4. He was cognizant of all sciences; brief and detailed. 5. He is the most perfect and superior person for the sake of prayer, service in religion and the world. 6. With spear and wielded sword, he made the most difficult victory, easy in Khyber.

Explanation of the verses

He has mentioned some merits of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) in this panegyric and here we hint at what is mentioned in this following verse:

“3. Climbing the shoulders of Ahmad, other than relation and companionship, is another excellence (of his).”

It is narrated from Jabir bin Abdullah that when we entered Mecca with the Prophet, 360 idols were present around the Holy House and Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) ordered all of them to be toppled and there was a tall idol on the roof of Kaaba.

His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) glanced at Ali (a.s.) and said: “O Ali, either you climb on my shoulders or I climb on your shoulders in order to topple the idol of Hubal.”

Ali (a.s.) said: “Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), you climb on my shoulders.”

Ali says: When the Prophet stepped on my shoulders, I was unable to bear him due to heaviness of messengership. I said: “Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), permit me to climb on your shoulders.”

His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) smiled and he stepped down from my back and bent down and I climbed on his shoulders. By the one, Who split the seed and created man, if I wanted to touch the heavens, I would have been able to do so and I toppled Hubal from the roof of Kaaba and following that Allah, the Mighty and the High revealed the verse of:

وَقُلْ جَاءَ الْحَقُّ وَزَهَقَ الْبَاطِلُ إِنَّ الْبَاطِلَ كَانَ زَهُوقًا ^⑧

“And say: The truth has come and the falsehood has vanished; surely falsehood is a vanishing (thing).”¹

A number of tradition scholars, imams of traditions and history have narrated this and in the later centuries, writers have quoted from them and recorded it in their books and accepted it without any doubt in its chains of

¹ Surah Isra 17:81

authorities.

In *Al-Ghadeer*,¹ Allamah Amini has mentioned the names of forty-one authorities, among them being:

1. Ahmad, imam of Hanbalis (d. 241 A.H.), in his *Musnad* through authentic chains of narrators and through reliable narrators.²
2. Abu Ali Ahmad Mazani (d. 263 A.H.) and Nasai have narrated from him.³
3. Hafiz Shamsuddin Dhahabi (d. 748 A.H.), in *Talkhisul Mustadrak*.⁴ He says: “Its chain of narrators is perfect, but its text is unacceptable and improper.”!
4. Hafiz Jalaluddin Suyuti (d. 911 A.H.): He has mentioned this traditional report in his book, *Jamiul Kabeer* and in its sequence⁵ and it is also mentioned in *Al-Khasaisul Kubra*.⁶
5. Nuruddin Halabi Shafei (d. 1044 A.H.) in *Seeratul Halabiyya*⁷.
6. Shaykh Abu Bakr bin Muhammad Hanafi (d. 1270 A.H.) in *Qiratul Uyun al-Mubsira*.⁸

Introduction to the poet

Shaykh Salih bin Abdul Wahab bin Arandas Hilli, famous as Ibne Arandas is from the elder Shia scholars and writers in jurisprudence and principles of jurisprudence and his verses are present in praise of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), which show his deep attachment to the Holy Family and his severe malice to enemies of Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

In *Al-Muntakhab*, the late Tarihi has mentioned some of his verses.⁹ His verses are also mentioned in *Dairatul Maarif*, dictionaries and other books.

In *Al-Taliqa*, Allamah Samawi has mentioned his biography and in that he has mentioned him to be in possession of piety, excellence, self-building and having great knowledge. Following that in *Al-Babaliyat*,¹⁰ Khatib Fazil Yaqubi has mentioned his biography and has extolled him in excess and it is mentioned in *Al-Taliya* that:

¹ *Al-Ghadeer*, 7/19-24.

² *Musnad Ahmad*, 1:84 [1/136, H. 645].

³ *Sonanul Kubraa*, [5/142, H. 8507].

⁴ *Talkhisul Mustadrak*, [2/398, H. 3387].

⁵ *Kanzul Ummaal*, 6:407 [13/171, H. 36516].

⁶ *Al-Khasaisul Kubra*, 1:264 [1/438].

⁷ *Seeratul Halabiyya*, 3:97 [3/86].

⁸ *Qiratul Uyun al-Mubsira*, 1:185.

⁹ *Al-Muntakhab*, 2/254.

¹⁰ *Al-Babaliyat*, 1/144, No. 47.

He passed away in 840 A.H. in the fragrant Hilla and was (also) buried there; and his tomb is a place of visitation where people seek blessings from it.

73. Ibne Daghar Hilli

1. He assisted the Hashemite prophet with his sword till his shoulders were severely injured. 2. And he selected only him for his brotherhood and except for the door of his house, he closed the doors of all others into the Masjid. 3. And in the years of Farewell Hajj on the day of Ghadeer, he bestowed his Wilayat to him and this was witnessed by all. 4. On the day of Ghadeer his blessings increase so much that they could not be counted. 5. Apparently, they accepted the recommendations of Prophet but concealed their malice for Aale Muhammad (a.s.). 6. When the Prophet passed away, they exposed their malice of their hearts. 7. Due to lack of perception, and deviations, they denied the manifestation of Caliphate to its owner of Caliphate and master (*Wali*). 8. And came around in groups till they deprived Lady Fatima Zahra (s.a.) from her right, who remained distressed till she passed away. 9. Fatima was filled with sorrow and she gave up her life to the creator and after that Husain was martyred and his sons were slaughtered.

Introduction to the poet

His name was Shaykh Maghamis bin Daghir Hilli. In numerous later collections – like *Al-Husunul Maniya*, by Allamah Shaykh Ali Aale Kashiful Ghita, *Al-Taliya*, by Samawi and *Al-Babaliyat*,¹ Khatib Yaqubi, is mentioned his love and attachment towards to the Holy Progeny (s.a.). Some of his verses are quoted by Shaykh Fakhrudin Tarihi in *Al-Muntakhab*.²

He was among the devotees and poets of Ahle Bayt (a.s.), but time has forgotten him. Perhaps it was this same affection and loyalty to Ahle Bayt (a.s.), which is the reason that his name is not mentioned in books of opponents of Ahle Bayt (a.s.). Such is the usual feature of these people regarding devotees of Ahle Bayt (a.s.); that either they have not recorded their name or mentioned it in a disgraceful manner as opposed to those, who have no share of excellence; they are mentioned with great respect. Yes, what crimes are not committed by history with regard to disrespect and exaltation of persons.

74. Hafiz Bursi Hilli

1. He is the beloved of the beloved of God, on the contrary the secret of the secret of God. He is the body of the command, which is the soul of creatures. 2. He is one, whose Caliphate and praise were revealed from Almighty Allah and Quran declared this clearly. 3. He is the Imam: such that whoever loves him, the balance of his deeds on Judgment Day shall be

¹ *Al-Babaliyat*, 1/132, No. 44.

² *Al-Muntakhab*, [2/284, 292, 300 & 323].

heavy. 4. He is having followers (Shia), who sparkle like stars and dazzle the eyes of the folks of the world.

Introduction to the poet

His full name was Hafiz Shaykh Raziuddin Rajab bin Muhammad bin Rajab bin Bursi Mahalli. He was from the well scholars and jurists of the Imamiyah. He possessed great excellence and wisdom and was learned about traditions and most preceding authority in literature.

He had a nice diction, was an expert of letters and aware of the secrets of prosody and conclusive statements. From this aspect, his books are full of meanings and gnosis. He was having a particular style in knowledge of letters.

In the same way, with regard to affection for Ahle Bayt (a.s.), he possessed a special point of view not liked by some people and that is why they accused him of extremism in beliefs.

It is narrated from Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) that His Eminence (a.s.) said:

“Do not resort to extremism about us, on the contrary you should say that we are slaves and creatures of God. After that you can say whatever you like about us.”¹

Imam Ja’far Sadiq (a.s.) says: “Appoint for us our Lord, as our return is to Him alone. After that you can say whatever you want in our excellence.”²

And he says: “Regard us as creatures of God and you can say whatever you want regarding our excellence and you would not have exaggerated.”

And how is it possible for us to reach the end of those merits, which Almighty Allah has bestowed them with?

How can we become aware of all those excellent qualities and personal traits that Almighty Allah bestowed them with?

How far from the truth is it! Intellects have lost (themselves), imaginations have gone astray, minds have become perplexed, eyes have turned away, the great are made small, the wise have confounded themselves, those, who reflect, forever fall short, orators falter, intelligent become ignorant, poets become expressionless, prosodists incapable and the eloquent stammer in describing one of his aspects, or one of his eminences. All of them have confessed their incapacity and inadequacy.

How can his totality be described, and how can his inner essence be characterized? How can anything concerning him be understood? Who can be found to take his place and to give what he can give? No! How and where? Since he is in position of the star that hands cannot grasp. Where can someone like this be found?³

¹ *Al-Khesaal*, Shaykh Saduq, [Pg. 614].

² *Basaerud Darajaat*, Saffaar, [236 & 507].

³ Among them being: Who can recognize the Imam till this point, the tradition is narrated by

That is why, you will observe many scholars of recognition proving such qualities for them, which others do not have. Among the scholars of Qom, if there were persons, who attributed such qualities to anyone, they blamed him to be extremist; so much so that some of them said: The first foundation of extremism is that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was free from error; till researchers arrived and recognized the reality.

Conclusion

Persons differ in concluding facts; and they do so according to their view as per their capacity. Some do not have the capacity to learn complex secrets, and some have the capacity to realize great secrets and important issues.

Naturally, the first group cannot digest the issue they are unaware of. In the same way, the second group cannot leave aside the cognitions that they obtain and this becomes a basis for disunity and malice. We appreciate the efforts of both groups and awareness of their pure intentions to reach the truth and we say:

“Everyone should make efforts according to his capacity. Even though he might not be able to succeed.”

Know that people are like mines of gold and silver¹ and it is mentioned in widely narrated traditional reports from Ahle Bayt (a.s.) that:

“Our issue or our traditions are difficult and complex and none can understand them, except for the messenger prophet, the proximate angel or the believer, whose heart Almighty Allah has tested for faith.”²

On the basis of this, we don't blame scholars of religion and we also don't reject miracles of Gnostics and don't object to anyone, who is unable to recognize the rank of those higher than him, because:

لَا يُكَفِّرُ اللَّهُ نَفْسًا إِلَّا وُسْعَهَا

“Allah does not impose upon any soul a duty but to the extent of its ability.”³

Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) says: “If I take the seat of narrating traditions and relate what I have heard from Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), you would leave me saying: Ali is the greatest liar.”⁴

Imam Sajjad (a.s.) says: “*If Abu Zar came to know what was present in the heart of Salman, he would definitely have slain him,*” in spite of the fact that the Prophet established brotherhood between him and Salman. Then what is the meaning of your suspicion for others? (what do you expect from others?)⁵

¹ Imam Ali Reza (a.s.) in *Usul Kafi*, Seqatul Islam Kulaini. *Usul Kafi*: 99 [1/201].

This tradition is narrated from both Shia and Ahle Sunnat sources.

² *Basaerud Darajaat*, Saffaar, 6 [Pg. 20]; *Usul Kafi*, 216 [1/401].

³ Surah Baqarah 2:286

⁴ *Manahul Mannat*, Sherani, 14.

⁵ *Basaerud Darajaat*, Saffaar, 7 [Pg. 25], end of Chapter 11 from Part I; *Usul Kafi*, Seqatul

وَكُلَّا وَعْدَ اللَّهِ الْحُسْنَى ۖ وَفَضَّلَ اللَّهُ الْمُجْهِدِينَ عَلَى الْقُعْدِينَ أَجْرًا عَظِيمًا ۝

“And to each (class) Allah has promised good; and Allah shall grant to the strivers above the holders back a mighty reward:”¹

In the following verses, Imam Sajjad (a.s.) implies this same point:

1. I conceal the gems of my knowledge from ignorant; that he may not see the truth and create mischief for me. 2. Before me, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) made such recommendation to Imam Husain (a.s.) and before that he also advised the same to Imam Hasan (a.s.). 3. How numerous are the jewels that exist, they would say: You are an idol-worshipper. 4. And Muslim men regarded my blood lawful and the worst act, which is slaying me, would be the best deed in their view.²

In *Ayanush Shia*,³ the late Sayyid Amin, in the account of late Bursi Hilli has issued statements like this, except that he has criticized him due to his reliance on letters and numbers, which are not worthy of reasoning and establishment of proof.

Although in this matter we support the late Sayyid, but we regard Bursi and those, who have such views, like Ibne Shahr Ashob and others to be excused, because these sciences are the best means to confront the specialists of this science like Ubaidi, Maliki in *Umdatut Tahqiq*.⁴

Also, we have not understood the implication of our great Sayyid Amin from this statement: In his publication, there are negative points and in this writings, obsessions and mania⁵ are mixed together and mistakes and signs of extremism are present, which are not only not needed, on the contrary, they even carry harms. Though, it is possible that he might have a valid justification. Alas, if only the Sayyid had illustrated this sample of the negative points of this poet and those opposed to principles, his statement might have carried weight.

I don't know how he interprets them to be mistakes and forgetfulness? Is it not that you should interpret the act of your brother in the best way. Bursi has followed the same accepted style in his poetry; thus where is the obsession, mania, extremism and harm, which the Sayyid, author of *Ayanush Shia* has imagined?

As for the statement of the Sayyid that he said: “His writings are not in the least beneficial and some of them are harmful. There is wisdom in creation of Allah. Allah Almighty would forgive us and him.” Among the mistakes of the pen is that it is issued unintentionally. May Almighty Allah forgive our and his

¹ Islam Kulaini, 216 [1/401].

² Surah Nisa 4:95

³ Tafseer Alusi, 6:190.

⁴ *Ayanush Shia*, 31:193. 205 [6/465-468].

⁵ *Umdatut Tahqeq*, 155 [Pg. 262].

⁵ Mischief and distress caused by touch of Shaitan.

mistakes.

Valuable writings of Bursi

1. Mashariqul Anwaarul Yaqeen fee Haqaiqq Asraare Ameerul Momineen (a.s.).
2. Risala fee as-Salawat Alan Nabi wa Aalihi Masoomeen.
3. Ad-Durre Thameen, fee Khamsa Miya Ayat Nazalat fee Maulana Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) ba Ittefaaq Aksar Mufassireen min Ahlat Deen. Maula Muhammad Taqi Zanjani in his book of Tariqatun Najat has quoted from him.
4. Lawamih Anwar Tamjeed was Jawame Asrarut Tauheed fee Usulul Aqaid.

His beautiful couplets

Hafiz Bursi composed beautiful, amazing and interesting couplets: most of whom, or rather all of them are in praise of Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) and his purified Ahle Bayt (a.s.).

His non de plume in poetry is Hafiz. His biography can be found in the books of: Amalul Amal, Riyazul Ulama, Riyazul Jannah, in Rauza Four of Rauziyatul Jannat; Tatmeemul Amal, Sayyid bin Abi Shabana, Al Kuna wal Alqaab, Ayanush Shia, Al-Taliya and al-Babaliyat.¹

We were unable to find information about the date of birth and death of the poet, except the date mentioned in some of his writings and said: There was a period of 518 years between the birth of His Eminence (s.a.w.a.) and writing of this book. This would be on the basis of the report that the birth of His Eminence took place in the year 255 A.H. and thus this book must have been written in 773 A.H. In some of his books he has mentioned the date as 813 A.H. that perhaps his death was near about that time, and Allah knows best.

¹ *Amalul Amal*, [2/117, No. 329]; *Riyazul Ulama*, [2/304]; *Rauzayatul Jannat*, [3/337, No. 302]; *Al Kuna wal Alqaab*, [2/166]; *Ayanush Shia*, [6/465-468]; *Al-Babaliyat*, [1/118, No. 41].

Exaggerating excellence

Since most poets of Ghadeer, like Bursi have become targets of condemnation and objection; they are attributed with extremism and some writers¹ have targeted them from all directions, spoken ill of them and abused them; we wanted to inform the readers about this so that they may not be under the influence of this nonsense and not pay attention to this hateful talk.

So, firstly we ask: “What is extremism?”

On the basis of clarification of scholars of language like Jauhari, Fayyumi, Raghib and others,² “Extremism is crossing the limit; like saying: “The price crossed the limit and the commodity became costly,” or: “the person crossed his limits,” or: “the flesh and bones of the girl crossed its limits,” when a youth arrives fast and the maturity of that girl is more than others of her age.

In the same meaning is the statement of Prophet:

“Do not resort to extremism regarding women, as they are rain from Almighty Allah that falls on the land and people.”³⁽⁴⁾

In any case, extremism from anywhere, in any form, and in everything is hateful, especially in religion as mentioned in the holy verse:

يَا أَهْلَ الْكِتَبِ لَا تَغْلُبُوا فِي دِينِكُمْ

“O followers of the Book! do not exceed the limits in your religion.”⁵

...and:

قُلْ يَا أَهْلَ الْكِتَبِ لَا تَغْلُبُوا فِي دِينِكُمْ

“Say: O followers of the Book! be not unduly immoderate in your religion.”⁶

...which has come in two places in the Holy Quran. It is mentioned in the

¹ Like Ibne Taymiyyah, Ibne Kaseer, Khaseemi, Moosa Jarullah and their compatriots.

² Sihahul Lughat, [6/2448]; Al-Misbahul Munir, [2/452]; Al-Mufradat, [Pg. 364].

³ Al-Bayan wat Tabaiyyan, 2:21 [2/19-20].

⁴ This statement of the Prophet is a metaphor and implies compatibility of women with their husbands from Almighty Allah. Though the dower of the women be less, she is obedient to her husband and is kind to him; and sometimes she is unkind and disobedient to the man even though her dower is more. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has compared this to rain, which God sends down: some people benefit from it and some are deprived. It falls on a city and makes the abodes benefit from it. Ref: *Al-Majazatun Nabawiyya*, Sayyid Razi, 183, *Behaarul Anwaar*, 100/353.

⁵ Surah Nisa 4:171

⁶ Surah Maidah 5:77

same meaning. And the implication is same as commentators have mentioned.¹

Extremism of Jews is about Isa (a.s.) till they made improper attributions to Lady Maryam; and extremism of Christians is that they regarded him as God. On the basis of this, extremism of both of them is evil and a sin and the reward is between these two evil extremities is as the poet says:

“Give complete rights of others and do not demand your right fully and overlook shortcomings of others. A noble man never demands his complete right. Do not be extremist in anything and follow the middle path. Because both sides of moderation are condemnable.”

Another poet says:

“Choose the path of moderation, because salvation lies in this and don’t mount the refractory animal; also do not become rebellious.”

What is necessary at this point is determination of a limit, which should not be crossed in religion, since the arrival of extremism is first of all falsehood; secondly encouraging and promoting ignorance and thirdly shortcoming in fulfilling obligatory rights. [Thus, this is extremism] and not as some have this habit of attributing extremism to statement of every speaker, with whom they are not pleased and blind prejudice compels them to hate those, whose taste is not amenable to them.

Majority of extremism blamed on Shia Imamiyah due to their belief in Holy Imams (a.s.) and narrating of their excellence is in this matter, whereas Sihah and Musnad books are full of excellence of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) and books are teeming with their merits.

One, who is in possession of some personal powers, like magnetic sleep, hypnotism or calling the souls in order to make them do some errands or know something about unseen matters, accept these views; how can they deny the return the soul to bodies by permission of Almighty Allah and through supplication of holy saints or power of truthful ones, which is a divine gift and is from the creator of the world of being? And this is not difficult for Almighty Allah:

هُوَ الَّذِي يُحْيِي وَمُمْتِثٌ فَإِذَا قَضَى أَمْرًا فَإِنَّمَا يَقُولُ لَهُ كُنْ فَيَكُونُ

“He it is Who gives life and brings death, so when He decrees an affair, He only says to it: Be, and it is.”²

Also, one who sees the aircraft covering thousands of kilometers in a short time, distances, which in the past required several months on quadrupeds to cover. How his intellect permits him to deny covering of large distances by one gifted power by Almighty Allah?

¹ *Tafseer Qurtubbi*, 6:21 [6/16 & 163].
² Surah Ghafir 40:68

وَتَرَى الْجِبَالَ تَخْسِبُهَا جَامِدَةً وَهِيَ تَمْرُ مَرَّ السَّحَابِ

“And you see the mountains, you think them to be solid, and they shall pass away as the passing away of the cloud.”¹

Or one, who listens to radio or watches television that transfers sound and vision from thousands of kilometers. How can he deny such a thing in the being of Imam, who is helped and supported by Almighty Allah?

إِنَّ اللَّهَ يُسَمِّعُ مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَمَا آتَنَاكُمْ سَمِيعًا مِّنْ فِي الْقُلُوبِ²

“Surely Allah makes whom He pleases hear, and you cannot make those hear who are in the graves.”²

It is like the case of seeing from far away and speaking to it as if he was besides it.

وَكَذَلِكَ نُرِيَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ مَلَكُوتَ السَّمَاوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضِ

“And thus did We show Ibrahim the kingdom of the heavens and the earth.”³

Also, examples of discoveries and recent skills that are effects of electricity and other powers, and they are numerous. Simple human intellects before this were unable to discover these things, but today they have solved the problems, which were impossible to solve yesterday and made every impossible thing possible.

Perhaps in future, science and learning would make further progress, because knowledge does not have any limits and there is no evidence and proof as well that knowledge has reached its limit.

Thus, there is no problem that the progress achieved today was in possession of the Imam at that time; and the power of the creator is higher than all. I don't want to consider the miracle acts of holy saints to be like acts of scientific progress, even though they might have occurred through natural causes, their being miracles is not invalidated.

But we believe that Imams of Ahle Bayt (a.s.) have connection with source of creation, through whom, their desires are fulfilled from outside the world of nature. And it is a necessary requirement of divine grace that He should strengthen His special servants.

It is interesting that some people find fault with the Shia and accuse them of extremism, infidelity and polytheism, whereas they have proved the same for their own saints. Many a times the merits, which they regard as extremism of Shia, they have narrated in excellence for ordinary persons. Without any kind of

¹ Surah Naml 27:88

² Surah Fatir 35:22

³ Surah Anaam 6:75

denial or doubt in chains of narrators and without any kind of hesitation in accepting the texts of reports; and made them popular in religious literature and consider them as historical.

It is because of their attachment to these persons and due their regarding them as great that they have fabricated these merits. Yes, attachment to something makes man blind and deaf.

This practice is present among them since day one till the present and no researcher and scholar had guts to attribute deviation, polytheism, extremism and leaving the consensus of Islamic Ummah to these writers, which they have attributed to the Shia.

Following are some of their examples: