

Earn a Verified Certificate for this course!

[Get Started](#)

x

[Forums / Introductions](#)[Help](#)

Undocumented ? They Broke the law...should they be departed?

✉ You are subscribed. [Unsubscribe](#)🔖 No tags yet. [+ Add Tag](#)Sort replies by: [Oldest first](#) [Newest first](#) [Most popular](#)[Earl Scott](#) · 20 hours ago 🗨

Undocumented (immigrates) Workers is difficult to embrace for me personally. I cannot understand how people who break the law by entering U.S. Soil; are given a waiver or abdication of sort while if I walk through certain neighborhoods in prestigious communities will be arrested and charged with trespassing, or even shot. I am more than likely going to get community service or probation concerning this charge. This offense will come down to a disorderly conduct charge that will stay on my record and that's **documented**.

So I have an issue with people breaking the law regardless and am relinquished without any accountability. I realize immigrants contribute to the economybut people should be sent packing....

↑ -3 ↓ · flag

[Anthony Watkins](#) · 19 hours ago 🗨

i will resist the urge to ask you if english is your second language, but you might wanna work on it a bit. maybe you are like me, and cant bear the conventions.

so passing on that, i will get to the core issue:

how is someone undocumented if their family was here before the rest of us knew "here was here." i agree europeans, africans, and most asians who are here without legal documentation are on thin ice, as were the founding fathers. none of the original settlers (the 100 million decedents of the immigrants who crossed the land bridge while the anglos, the saxons, the scots, the romans, the greeks and even the egyptians were wonder from cave to desert without written language or much in the way of intelligence to show for themselves) were "from here" but they had squatters rights long before leif or columbus or whichever boat full of pilgrims you wanna claim as original settlers left europe! and none of those european immigrants asked for permission to land, they came, they took, they destroyed, peoples and property and now you wanna know if those they displaced have a right of return against

the great and fair and just laws the europeans drew up upon stealing and killing and destroying? really? if i came to your grandfathers house, raped and murdered most of your ancestors, but your father escaped and raised you in a far away place, and you grew to be a man and decided to return, should i be allowed to deport you on grounds of trespass?

show me a european who has documentation that he has a right to live on this indian land (documentation given to him by they rightful owners, not other europeans drawing up imaginary deeds to things they dont own), then i will ask the indian from mexico or peru to show me his documentation. how can so many americans not only be so stupid, but so evil? if you benefit from murder and theft of property, what right do you have to complain if the victims family tries to survive on the land that was theirs by right?

↑ -4 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 19 hours ago 🔒

This is a red herring.

At the time the British colonized what is now the United States, waging wars for territorial purposes was considered legitimate everywhere, including the Indian themselves.

Now we live under different times with different rules. 1 million years ago, there was no civilized world so to speak. We cannot judge the past with rules of the present.

↑ 2 ↓ · flag

Michael Scott Signature Track · 18 hours ago 🔒

Why are undocumented here 11.5 million of them? Well they are not all picking fruit. In 1969 we had about 394 thousand most all of the guest workers were here to pick fruits and vegetables. In 1980 when Ronald Reagan made the first amnesty program and it was passed by the House and Senate we had about 3 million beginning in 1980 which was a fairly stable number until the 1990s. If you will look at the growth of the Chinese taking over our manufacturing of the USA still had some fortune 500 companies that made perishable products. These products like Oscar Mayer were union facilities paying \$12 to \$14 per hour in the 1970s. The union packing plants were closed one by one and changed over to operations that didn't require the skills the union people had. So today you go into any food plant you wish Tyson Chicken, Breyers Ice Cream, Cargill chicken McNuggets and anyone else in this sector the workers are a large percentage undocumented making \$13.00 or so dollars per hour. Why do we have so many foreigners?.. Well we can't pasteurize our milk in China because it takes longer to get here than the milk date code is good for. They could send it air freight but that isn't affordable either. Our companies don't make things they make money so that's why we are so willing to transfer our knowhow overseas. The decision makers are thinking very short term and short term is all that matters to them. So if you can't move the factory overseas then if you allow hiring of illegal labor they will work cheap and not whine You can bet both parties want this or it wouldn't be happening. They have different reasons for sure but we wouldn't have 12 million odd folks here if they didn't have jobs..

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 18 hours ago 

Michael,

That's a good argument for providing legal status for some illegal immigrants (and actually a legal path for uneducated labor that is now missing).

However, what the senate bill did was to provide said people of a 13 year guaranteed path to citizenship that is not available to many existing legal immigrants.


I don't know how much you know about existing immigration law but except for family members (parents, children and siblings), coming to the US to work requires you a so called "non immigrant visa" that requires you to have a sponsor. If you lose your job with that sponsor you are out of luck, you need to leave the US shortly.

The provisional status for illegals that was approved in the senate provides illegals with the ability to work for any employer or to not work for anybody all while they wait in a 13 year guaranteed path to citizenship. No legal immigrant on "non immigrant status" is given such privilege while they wait for their greencard.

The so called Dream Act is a similar canard. Thousands of legal immigrants come to the US with their your children. These children come also through no fault of their own. Yet, the DREAM Act proposal does not benefit them, it benefits only illegal immigrants.

So, for all these reasons, what you find among the legal immigrant community is strong opposition to the reform as passed by the senate, which is not to say that we do not favor making legal immigration easier to the United States (fighting with the www.uscis.gov is one of the least pleasant experiences you can have in life, even when you have a lawyer helping you). We would love to make legal immigration less cumbersome, but we do not like that illegals have an easier path becoming greencard holders or citizens that current legal immigrants have.

↑ 0 ↓ · flag


Michael Scott Signature Track · 16 hours ago 

My wife came from Poland..We had a heck of a time getting her a Visa she is a Citizen now but those immigration people move slow or stop..

Mike Scott

↑ 0 ↓ · flag



Anthony Watkins · 15 hours ago 

in fairness, native americans should have an easier time returning than more europeans, though no doubt your wife, like most immigrants from anywhere is a great addition to our wonderful country. Please tell her welcome!!!

↑ 1 ↓ · flag

Earl Scott · 2 hours ago

This is not about race.....Mr. Watkins.....which you seem to desire to implement....Have there been injustice....absolutely....but giving people a title...undocumented....immigrants...is another way of excusing the actions...they are illegal.....broke the law...that is the point.....

↑ 1 ↓ · flag



Anthony Watkins · 27 minutes ago

Earl, interesting perspective you have! If I drive you and your family from your home where for many generations your ancestors have lived and I claim your house as mine, write myself up a deed and then call the police to arrest you when you try to return, who is the illegal and who is the criminal? You or me? On what grounds do we have the right to put up a guard and a fence around our stolen property?

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

Anonymous · 19 hours ago

Yes, they should be deported or at least not given amnesty. I personally support the ideas behind the 2007 McCain-Kennedy Reform that would have given long term illegal immigrants the possibility of staying but that required them to leave the US if they wanted to apply for a greencard.

And before anybody accuses me of anything, I am a naturalized citizen. I went through all the steps of non immigrant status (H1B), immigrant (greencard) and then naturalization. Millions of people are waiting patiently in the line to become legal immigrants to the US. All amnesty proposals make a mockery of those people, and that is simply wrong.

↑ 2 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

octavio rezende Signature Track · 19 hours ago

Im a Brazilian law student and cant help being shocked by my colleague comments. The US being the main power in the wolrd and being the center of cultural and economical production and also having embraced the world with democratic values will sometimes have to bear th weight of its importance to the world as a whole and be able to reveceive, like it has done through the centuries of its existence, a

parcel of the peoples it has exerted its influence. The undocumented immigrates that have come to this great Nation represent a flaw in the system that can and should be perfected so that this amazing country shall produce more people like the honorable Justice Soto Mayor and other prominent Américas descendente from immigrant parentes, that were luckily legal upon thier arrival in the Country

↑ 1 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 18 hours ago

Get this, no country, and Brazil is not exception, grants foreigners an unchecked right to come inside their borders.

The United States has every right to regulate immigration, just as any other nation.

In addition, illegal immigrants make a mockery of the very same law that many like me faithfully followed to become US citizens.

I know a great deal of legal immigrants to the US and the opposition among us to amnesty as understood by the immigration bill that was passed by the US senate last year is almost unanimous.

↑ 4 ↓ · flag

clinton mathews · 10 hours ago

Amen Brother, and welcome! We need more like you.

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 10 hours ago

The voice of those of us who came here legally or who are patiently waiting in the line is the only voice that has not been listened to during the debates on immigration reform. The US senate bill makes a mockery of fairness and justice. You come to the US legally? Be ready to wait in some cases 15 years or more before you become a US citizen. You come here illegally? No problem, we give you a 13 year guaranteed path to citizenship.

You came here to the US as a young child through no fault of your own to legal immigrant parents? You are as screwed as they are waiting in the line. You came here as a young child to illegal immigrant parents? No problem, we will give you a 5 year path to citizenship.

And so goes. This notion that the US senate bill is fair is a true canard.

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

Earl Scott · 2 hours ago

You have 65% of African Americans incarcerated...in my state....many for

trespassing....etc.....and they can't receive housing or benefits because of many illegal activities.....if one sells one bag of reefer or whatever its called they cannot get TANF or housing.....yet an immigrant can come here illegal.....have kids.... get benefits....and the story goes on and on....

↑ 0 ↓ · flag



Anthony Watkins · 24 minutes ago

Really? What state has incarcerated 65% of its black folks?

On every post you keep citing the most outrageous "facts"would love to see your source documents. It mostly sounds like the lies spewed by rightwing talk show hosts

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

William Lee · 18 hours ago

Red herring? A million years ago? Actually we are taking less than a 1000 years. I can see how your logic helps defend against reparations for slaves descendants, though....

And given your overall tone, I am thinking you are more in the camp that we ought to charge today's American Blacks for passage to this great and wonderful land of opportunity.

↑ 1 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 18 hours ago

Yes, a red herring. Be it 1 million years ago or 100 years ago, you cannot judge the past by today's standards.

Also, your last paragraph is an insulting straw man, of the kind that my anonymity protects me. I have never been a racist nor I have ever believed that slavery (in the US or abroad) was ever right.

I see nothing wrong in asking that the law is applied equally to all people. If you are living in the US illegally, you should not expect to be treated better than those who are here legally. I am not opposed to some kind of relief to illegals but certainly I am very opposed to the preferential treatment that the senate bill gives to illegal immigrants over legal immigrants.

↑ 1 ↓ · flag



Michael J Esposito Signature Track · 6 hours ago

The undocumented immigrants living here are already part of mainstream america. They work, get paid, spend their money, Kids go to school, when sick go to the ER or a doctor, only

thing not mainstream about them is they don't have to pay taxes??????

↑ 0 ↓ · flag



Anthony Watkins · 5 hours ago

actually most of them pay taxes and SS and MC, but it goes under a bogus name and they are not eligible for the services they pay into, be it retirement, medicare or higher education. it is a crazy system. open the doors, let them back in, it was their country before it was ours! the only difference between native peoples of the Americas are in the minds of the white invaders from Europe

↑ 1 ↓ · flag

Earl Scott · 2 hours ago

Not paying taxes if you're working is a crime...of some sort....(TAX EVASION). Those who have been here put such an extreme strain on our healthcare system and just coming here to have babies to get US citizenship....and do you have any idea how many are on...the welfare system.....They as parents cannot get benefits.....but they get the benefits of their children who are born on US soil.....

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

Michael Scott Signature Track · an hour ago

I don't want to make light of your statements Mr Scott. Large Corporations evade taxes that is considered smart business. If you are a successful individual you take your salary in deferred compensation so when you pay your taxes you pay at a long term capital gains rate of 15%. Evading taxes is wrong whether it is a crime or smart business.

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)



Michael J Esposito Signature Track · 18 hours ago

A true Conservative of course wants to take our country backwards, maybe we should get rid of cable and go back to 2,4,5,7,9,11,13? This is no longer a country that is an Island, what happens on the other side of the world affects this country. Look around at the changes across the seas and how we can no longer deny an American involvement world Economics and world peace if you will. Intolerance is the main problem with our country today and till that changes the USA will remain stagnant.

↑ -1 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 18 hours ago

Sure, let's abolish the US army (that has to be reauthorized every two years anyway per

constitutional requirements as we learned this week) and make sure that we have an open borders policy with Mexico and Canada!

You are just being unreasonable here. Ironically, Switzerland voted today to limit immigration from the EU <http://www.cbsnews.com/news/switzerland-bucks-european-union-votes-to-limit-immigration/> . So if the people from Switzerland have a right to limit the amount of highly qualified immigrants arriving there from the EU, I bet we do have a right to fight illegal immigration.

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

Reggie Signature Track · 11 hours ago 🔒

Obamamigra has deported more people than any other president since Truman and the last decade the Immigration dilemma is not the result of the undocumented worker but rather the lack of enforcement of the Employer Sanctions by the present and previous federal administration (Employer Sanctions instituted under the 1986 Immigration Law instituted by President Reagan.) The federal government and many State Governors had no problem with the 11.5 Million undocumented workers until the USA economy collapsed and the tragedy of 9/11. When America has high unemployment and the economy is not growing than corporations begin to layoff workers and the downward spiral begins and who get's the blame; "illegal aliens"! It is a matter of humanitarian justice that should govern the path toward Comprehensive Immigration Reform and not label the "illegal alien" as being the problem of this broken immigration system. Obamamigra (President Obama had promised, pledge and made it his platform in his 1st and 2nd presidential race to provide Comprehensive Immigration Reform and he has done the opposite.) It is imperative that the USA have a humanitarian immigration process and that it does not build a "China" wall in it's southern border but rather have a strong enforcement program that will stop "illegal" crossings. As for the present undocumented workers residing here in the USA; legalization is far more suitable than deporting them!

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 10 hours ago 🔒

If Mexicans want to truly escape misery, they should fight for having their own country become more democratic and less corrupt. The notion that the US has an obligation to absorb the people from Mexico that are escaping the miseries of the Mexican society doesn't hold any ground. As I say above, today Switzerland voted to do something far less dramatic: limiting immigration of EU citizens to their country <http://www.cbsnews.com/news/switzerland-bucks-european-union-votes-to-limit-immigration/> . So if the people of Switzerland have legitimacy to do that, surely the US has a legitimacy to protect its borders and enforce its existing immigration laws.

↑ 2 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

Reggie Signature Track · 10 hours ago 

I bet you that in Switzerland there's some Mejjicano working in the kitchens or the tourist industry there. As for Mexican fighting for their own country a recent study released by the Woodrow Wilson Institute in DC along with [MATT (Mexicans and Americans Thinking Together; www.matt.org) **Mexicans and Americans Thinking Together** (MATT) is a bi-national non-profit organization focused on building cultural and economic links between the U.S. ...] has shown that the migration into the USA has decreased and that more Mexicans have returned to the mother land. If this trend continues I think the USA will seek to open the doors to other migrants and Comprehensive Immigration Reform will happen in 2014 if not the USA will begin a gradual decline of population growth.

↑ -1 ↓ · flag

Anonymous · 10 hours ago 

Your doomsday scenario is not happening any time soon. The US remains the land of opportunity that attracts the best and brightest. No other country on Earth can match the opportunities that this country offers to hard working people. So, I am not against immigration per se, I am against illegal immigration. People should come to the US using the legally established means to do so. And I am one of those who thinks that immigration reform is necessary. I see no point in having "family ties" as being the main feature of American immigration. Outside spouses and children, there should be no easy greencards for parents and siblings. Our immigration laws should be changed to accommodate both highly qualified STEM workers and labor intensive sectors like agriculture,. Instead, we are stuck with an early XX-th century system that favors family ties. At the same time, I don't think that the US should give an easy path to those who broke our immigration laws.

↑ 2 ↓ · flag


[+ Comment](#)

Earl Scott · an hour ago 

Not so much conservative wanting to take the country back....I am progressive on some issues...but allowing illegal behavior to get a pass ...is not my desire.....I mean where are our morals....people complainingwe have become a nation of victims....we make a rational for everyone....just like the death penalty...I say yes.....

↑ 0 ↓ · flag



Michael J Esposito Signature Track · an hour ago 

what people fail to realize is that millions of undocumented imm. are here, with children born here or brought here. What do you propose to do, round them all up and have a couple of

refugee camps IE Japanese, then send the parents back but keep the born cits? You say, they are law breakers and so are millions of white/blue collared frauds that goes unpunished. A better solution is needed and my mention of taxes not being collected was my way of saying, if legalized then taxes can be collected.

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

[Earl Scott](#) · an hour ago 🔒

I also see I have received a -3 all because I am giving my opinion ...and that is what disturbs....me....we have to be exceptionally careful.....on others feelings....even if its the truth.....

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

[Earl Scott](#) · 42 minutes ago 🔒

Mr. Esposito.....I appreciate your compassion.....for these people....but they entered the country illegal....and they should be held accountable.....I mean they are having numerous amounts of children...getting benefits....food stamps....cash benefits....the fathers...are undercover....it's just a mess....

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

[Earl Scott](#) · 41 minutes ago 🔒

How much does it cost that they don't pay taxes...and utilize healthcare ...the law is the law

↑ 0 ↓ · flag



[Michael J Esposito](#) Signature Track · 36 minutes ago 🔒

I guess there is no changing of anyone's minds here so Please Mr Scott, a solution or 2 or 3

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

New post

To ensure a positive and productive discussion, please read our [forum posting policies](#) before posting.

B	<i>I</i>			Link	<code>	Pic	Math		Edit: Rich ▼	Preview
----------	----------	--	--	------	--------	-----	------	--	--------------	---------

☐ Make this post anonymous to other students

☒ Subscribe to this thread at the same time

Add post

Undocumented ? They Broke the law...should...

<https://class.coursera.org/conlaw-001/forum/...>