

[Forums / General Discussion](#)[Help](#)

Article V: "provided that"

✉ You are subscribed. [Unsubscribe](#)

🔖 No tags yet. [+ Add Tag](#)

Sort replies by: [Oldest first](#) [Newest first](#) [Most popular](#)

[Wanda](#) Signature Track · 17 hours ago 🔗

What did Professor Amar mean by saying that the clause "provided that.." in article V means that we can't amend the Senate's apportionment by 2/3, 2/3, 3/4 but we can take the power from the existing Senate and give it to a new body? And why would anyone be interested in creating that new body? I didn't understand that idea. Could somebody explain that to me please? Thank you!

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[Devin Watkins](#) · 6 minutes ago 🔗

that clause says we cannot diminish a state power in the senate by constitutional amendment. But we can create a new body to do something else if we wanted to. Maybe I want a new body to only be able to repeal laws (but in which the presidents veto doesn't apply), or maybe to create a 3 part legislature so that the house and the senate and this new body all have to agree. The possibilities are endless (but none are likely to occur as there is no movement that I am aware of to create a new body like this). The only thing you cant do is say have all the states except new York agree to remove new yorks representation in the house and the senate, that wouldn't work as the state is guaranteed equal representation in the senate.

↑ 0 ↓ · flag

[+ Comment](#)

New post

To ensure a positive and productive discussion, please read our [forum posting policies](#) before posting.

B	<i>I</i>			Link	<code>	Pic	Math		Edit: Rich ▼	Preview
<div></div>										

Article V: "provided that"

<https://class.coursera.org/conlaw-001/forum/...>

☐ Make this post anonymous to other students

☒ Subscribe to this thread at the same time

Add post

