



THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT DALLAS

800 W. Campbell Road, Richardson, TX
75080-3021

Elena Katok

*Co-Director, The Center and Laboratory for Behavioral Operations and Economics (LBOE)
Ashok & Monica Mago Professor, Naveen Jindal School of Management*

Phone: (972) 883-4047

Assistant: (972) 883-2047

Fax: (972) 883-6486

ekatok@utdallas.edu

<http://www.utdallas.edu/~ekatok>

May 24, 2019

John R. Folkerth, Jr., Attorneys At Law
109 North Main Street
500 Performance Place
Dayton, Ohio 45402

Dear Mr. Folkerth:

In your letter dated February 18, 2019 you asked me to provide my opinion regarding Dr. Schultz's tenure review at AFIT. I will now address the two specific questions you posed, first question (2) and then question (1).

The quality and impact of Dr. Schultz's academic contributions:

Dr. Schultz's contribution to the field of Operation Management (OM) in general, and to the area of Behavioral Operations Management (BOM) in particular, is quite remarkable. His 1998 and 1999 *Management Science* papers on worker motivation are seminal papers that questions fundamental assumptions of OM models (independent between processing times and inventory levels). The findings reported in those papers serve as a basis for several subsequent studies, including Powell and Schultz (*Management Science* 2004), which draws specific connections between the way workers adjust their behavior based on inventory levels, and the overall system efficiency, as well (Schultz et al. *Management Science* 2010), which proposes a remedy for the problem. I am sure that these papers are a must-read in any PhD class that deals with behavioral issues in operations management. It is worth pointing put that most BOM researchers consider the "birth" of the field to be the 2000 Management Science paper by Schweitzer and Cachon. In fact, Schultz's early work preceded that paper by two years. So he was doing BOM work when literally nobody else was doing it, which is why I say that his contribution is remarkable. He was the first to change the fundamental OM paradigm of full rationality and started to seriously investigate and model systems that account for human behavior.

Dr. Schultz reports 12 journal articles on his CV. While it may seem like a small number (which is what I suspect happened at AFIT) it is important to note that of those 12 papers four are in *Management Science*, which is the gold standard for OM publications, and the other eight are in the other three top OM journals (M&SOM, POM and JOM) included in the UTD24 journal list (<https://jindal.utdallas.edu/the-utd-top-100-business-school-research-rankings/>). So Dr. Schultz's work is of quality and impact that meets requirements of most top OM departments. In fact I should mention that Dr. Schultz made tenure at the University of Alberta, which is ranked 57 on the UTD Top 100 North American Rankings (<https://jindal.utdallas.edu/the-utd-top-100-business-school-research-rankings/northRankings#20142018>) while AFIT is not present on this ranking at all.

Now specifically regarding comparing Schultz's contribution to three tenured AFIT faculty members:

- Dr William A. Cunningham III is a Professor of Logistics and Supply Chain Management in the Department of Operational Sciences at AFIT reports 52 publications on his web page. Of the journals I heard of Omega, where Dr. Cunningham published one paper in 2011. The rest of the journals listed are not mainstream OM journals. Perhaps some of these outlets are good specialty journals for Air Force specifically—I cannot speak to this—but as far as contribution to the OM field in general, Dr. Schultz's contribution is significantly higher.
- Dr. Alan W. Johnson is a Professor of Logistics and Supply Chain Management with the Department of Operational Sciences at AFIT lists 32 papers on his web page. Of the journals I heard of four (Annals of OR, MOR, IJPE and EJOR). Annals and EJOR are considered solid journals by many schools. But again, in my opinion, quantity is not the same as impact, so contribution is not there.
- Dr. Jeffrey Ogden, currently at University of North Texas, but previously was tenured at AFIT in 2009 and promoted to Full Professor at AFIT in 2017. He lists 31 published papers on his CV and I believe I heard of *Journal of Production Research* where he has two papers, but not of any of the others.

So in examining the record of those three faculty members I have to conclude that they have not made any significant contribution to mainstream OM. Another metric of contribution is citation. Dr. Johnson has 753 Google scholar citations, while Dr. Schultz has 1461, almost twice as many in roughly the same time period. Dr. Ogden has 1610 citations, same ballpark as Dr. Schultz (but please note that Dr. Johnson and Dr. Ogden are full professors). Dr. Cunningham does not appear to be listed on google scholar at all.

To answer your question directly, if the three faculty members I just evaluated represent the acceptable quality, impact, and academic contribution that a faculty member at AFIT is required to have, then there is no doubt in my mind that Dr. Schultz greatly exceeds this level.

Your second question was whether Dr. David R. King met qualification requirements as set forth by AFIT to act as an external reviewer of Dr. Schultz. Dr. King appears to be a prominent scholar in the field of Strategic Management. In looking at the work Dr. King lists on his CV, I was unable to find any work related to Operations Management, which is the area of research

of Dr. Schultz. Therefore I have to conclude that Dr. King should not have acted as an external reviewer for Dr. Schultz.

You asked me to include “a description of any personal and professional relationship, including your involvement, if any, with respect to prior research collaboration, with Dr. Schultz.” I have never collaborated with Dr. Schultz on research, or co-edited any journal issues or books. I do know him personally because we are both prominent members of the BOM community. Had I been asked to write a tenure letter for Dr. Schultz at the University of Texas, my letter would have been considered “arms length.”

You also asked for a short bio:

Dr. Elena Katok joined the Jindal School of Management at the University of Texas at Dallas in 2012. She is Ashok and Monica Mago Professor of Operations Management. She is also on the International Faculty at the University of Cologne, Germany. Prior to her appointment at the University of Texas at Dallas she was a Professor at the Smeal College of Business at Penn State, where she was a Zimmerman Faculty Fellow. She holds a Bachelor’s from the University of California, Berkeley, and an MBA and a Ph.D. degree from Penn State. Dr. Katok’s research is in the area of Behavioral Operations Management. She analyzes behavioral factors that affect the efficiency of supply chain contracts, the performance of procurement mechanism, and other channel coordination issues. Her work is published in *Management Science*, *M&SOM*, *Production and Operations Management Journal*, *Journal of Operations Management*, and other journals in business and economics. Dr. Katok was part of a team that won the 2000 Franz Edelman Award, which is the most prestigious award given for the Practice of Operations Research and the Management Sciences. She is the Department Editor for the Behavioral Operations Department at the *Production and Operations Management Journal* and an Associate Editor of *Management Science*. She also co-edited the Handbook of Behavioral Operations published by Wiley and expected to come out in 2018.

Sincerely yours,



Elena Katok
Ashok & Monica Mago Professor