

MEMORANDUM FOR: AFIT/EN (Promotion and Tenure Committee)  
AFIT/EN (Dr. Badiru)  
In Turn

FROM: AFIT/ENS

SUBJECT: Tenure Request for Ken Schultz, PhD

1. The ENS Promotion and Tenure committee met on Friday March 18, 2016 to consider the tenure request for Dr. Kenneth Schultz, an Associate Professor. All nine committee members were present. The vote was 1 in favor, 7 against and 1 abstain for tenure. Therefore, the ENS Promotion and Tenure committee does not recommend the award of tenure for Dr. Kenneth Schultz.

2. The deliberations highlighted strong points in Dr. Schultz' package. These include 10 refereed journal publications in very strong outlets, his advising of multiple master's thesis students, and his activity on sponsored research projects as 10% co-principle investigator and \$187.5K project as single principle investigator.

3. There were many weaknesses and concerns raised about Dr. Schultz' promotion package. Among the weaknesses and concerns discussed:

a. Dr. Schultz arrived at AFIT with 10 journal articles in-print or in-press. He has not published any journal articles or conference papers while at AFIT. He has 10 published articles in the 19 years he has been in academia.

b. The paper Dr. Schultz lists as a published journal article in 2013 is in fact a editorial piece introducing a special issue in Journal of Operations Management.

c. Dr. Schultz lists as research funding a proposal (\$50K), and research efforts he was not involved in (\$220K and \$120K). The recent funding of \$182.5K was received in September 2015 as fall-out funding sent direct to the ENS support contract so that it did not come through AFIT.

d. Dr. Schultz lists two invited talks, one at Clemson and one at Iowa, that were in fact job interviews. The Iowa talk was a focus in one of the external review letters.

e. Dr. Schultz indicates editing two special issues of the Journal of Operations Management, one in 2006 and one in 2013 (the vita erroneously lists this as 2006). He in fact was not a special issue editor for the 2006 issue.

f. Dr. Schultz indicates many works in progress and papers under revision. Some of those papers are in fact MS thesis efforts and at least one of the papers under revision was posted on-line in 2007. There was discussion of how an unpublished paper can have 31 citations. The unpublished paper, listed as being under revision, is posted in Research Gate.

g. Dr. Schultz' package provided no information as to the quality of his teaching other than to list the courses he has taught and the teaching awards he has won.

4. The item of biggest concern to some of the faculty involved the two Journal of Management special issues and the editorials in those issues. Dr. Schultz was listed on a 2005 call for papers in the journal but was not one of the editors when the special issue came out in 2006. The editorial for that issue was written by one of the editors for the issue, Dr. Bendoly. In 2013 a new special issue came out in the same journal with Dr. Schultz as one of four special issue editors. The lead editorial indicated it had been seven years since the previous special issue and provided a

citation to Bendoly and Schultz (2006). The reference listing in that 2013 editorial lists a citation to Bendoly and Schultz, indicating they were the editors, leaving off the other two actual special issue editors. Unfortunately, the title of that reference is the editorial by Bendoly. The concern is the editorial narrative and reference implies that (i) Dr. Schultz was an editor of the 2006 issue, and(ii) he wrote either the editorial or the entire special issue depending upon how you interpret the page count. These concerns pose an academic honesty issue since (i) the reference is fabricated, and (ii) Dr. Schultz' name was added to a colleague's published editorial. This is the same editorial that Dr. Schultz lists as a published article.

5. The general opinion regarding the decision to not award tenure was that Dr. Schultz has not done enough since coming to AFIT and he presents a vita with many misleading entries.

WILLIAM A. CUNNINGHAM III, PhD  
Chair, AFIT /ENS P&T Committee  
Professor of Logistics and Supply Chain management