



DEPARTMENT OF THE AIR FORCE  
AIR UNIVERSITY (AETC)

29 March 2016

MEMORANDUM FOR: AFIT/EN Promotion and Tenure Committee  
AFIT/EN Dr. Badiru  
IN TURN

FROM: AFIT/ENS (Joseph J. Pignatiello)

SUBJECT: Evaluation and Recommendation on Tenure for Dr. Kenneth L. Schultz

1. The AFIT/ENS Promotion and Tenure Committee met on Friday 18 March 2016 to consider the tenure request for Dr. Kenneth L. Schultz, an Associate Professor. The Committee voted against the awarding of tenure by a large margin. (I was not able to respond sooner due to a death in my family. I received the Committee's letter on 28 March 2016, my first day back from bereavement leave.) Based on the position of the AFIT/ENS tenured faculty and on my review and evaluation of the tenure request package, the AFIT/ENS position is not to award tenure to Dr. Kenneth L. Schultz.
2. I agree with the ENS P&T Committee that Dr. Schultz has had some strong publications prior to his arrival at AFIT. Although he has done some graduate student advising and he has been involved in some funded research projects, I have some very significant and serious concerns that preclude me from endorsing Dr. Schultz for tenure.
3. My serious concerns are the following:
  - a. Dr. Schultz has not had any peer-reviewed, refereed scholarly research journal publications since his arrival at AFIT. On his C.V. under the category of "Research Papers" he lists one publication since his 2011 arrival. That publication, however, is *not* refereed – it is an editorial in a special issue. Dr. Schultz and two of his co-authors were co-editors for that special issue. Unlike standard professional practice, Dr. Schultz did not list that non-refereed editorial separate from the list of his rigorously refereed publications. This could give a misleading impression as to the actual number of refereed scholarly journal articles he has published. Furthermore, in the 18.5 years since earning his PhD and serving throughout that time as a faculty member at academic institutions, he has produced a total of only 10 refereed publications, a rate of just 0.54 papers per year.
  - b. On his C.V., Dr. Schultz lists research involvement as 10% on projects that were already in place when he arrived at AFIT. None of financial support he received from working on other faculty members' research projects resulted in any refereed scholarly journal articles. Moreover, I have concerns that he listed projects on his C.V. for which he was not involved in the proposal writing and execution. This is different from standard professional practice of clearly distinguishing between the proposals one writes and the funded projects one works on as a research assistant/collaborator.

c. Dr. Schultz's C.V. contains a number of potentially misleading entries. For example, Dr. Schultz listed two academic job interviews (at Iowa State and Clemson) as invited talks. He listed two instances of being a special issue editor when there is no documentation to corroborate that it should be more than one. He listed students' theses and a dissertation that are still underway as "work in progress". He did not indicate that he did not seek the initial funding nor write the research proposals where he lists 10% support, for example, nor did he indicate his support role on those projects as that of a research collaborator. He also did not list the PIs or co-PIs on those projects. In such cases, he was provided financial support for his PDQs, travel, etc. from the projects' PIs in support of the research as a collaborator. The standard professional practice would be to make it unquestionably clear whether one's role was that of a PI, a co-PI or a research assistant/collaborator providing support on a project.

d. Dr. Schultz lists 16 entries as "Work In Progress". One entry is for an unpublished manuscript that *Google Scholar* lists with a 2007 date, a work that has apparently been in progress for 9 years. The ages of most other entries on the list cannot be readily identified. Thus, one cannot easily determine when those papers were initially submitted, how long those have been in-review/under-revision or otherwise in-progress, or whether they are no longer active. The last three of the 16 entries do not have any authors' names listed but Dr. Schultz's name is listed first on all the other 13 "Work In Progress" entries including those for a student's PhD dissertation and 3 students' MS theses. Those last three entries are listed as "Funded" but the source, magnitude or competitive nature of those funds are not provided nor what role Dr. Schultz or any co-PIs may have played.

e. Dr. Schultz lists being a AFIT/EN Faculty Research Fellow on his C.V. as a "Selected Honor". I nominated Dr. Schultz for the Faculty Research Fellows program specifically so that he could benefit from the valuable mentorship and feedback that the program was intentionally designed to provide for junior faculty members. I nominated him with the intention that the program would assist in accelerating Dr. Schultz's research efforts and ultimately result in refereed scholarly journal publications as well as streams of funding to support his own specific individual research foci.

f. Dr. Schultz lists 21 entries on his C.V. for "Presentations and Conference Attendance (Since 2012)". He has given many talks at various conferences, workshops and universities in the United States, China, Italy, Germany, the Netherlands, Wales and England. Despite such a widespread presence at all these venues, none of these opportunities have yet resulted in any substantive research collaborations culminating in refereed scholarly journal articles or research funding.

g. While Dr. Schultz's C.V. does not provide information on teaching performance, as the ENS Department Head, I am able to provide some comments. Since his arrival at AFIT, Dr. Schultz's performance as an instructor has consistently stratified him among the lowest two faculty members in the Department. "Question 12" (Q12) on the OES addresses students' perceptions of the quality of instruction (as opposed to other aspects of a course such as content, relevance, etc.). In ENS, the established standard is that the Q12 average must be at least 4.0/5.0 for the quality of a faculty member's performance to be



assessed as meeting expectations for instruction. Dr. Schultz's Q12 averages have been consistently well below 4.0 (except for a Q12 score of exactly 4.0 in his first year at AFIT when he had a reduced teaching load).

h. I am deeply concerned about the serious ethical issues raised. One of the external review letters actually called out the issue. The AFIT/ENS P&T Committee also raised the issue with respect to editorials in special issues of the *Journal of Operations Management*. The fabrication of references and taking credit for work not accomplished are clearly not acceptable professional practices for any of AFIT's faculty or students. Such practices would not be exemplars for mentoring AFIT's junior faculty or students as they run counter to the Air Force's core value of integrity first.

4. Overall, I rate Dr. Schultz as poor in the research category. This is based on his lack of refereed scholarly journal publications and a consistent lack of activity in securing new research funding streams to support his own research agenda. In the teaching category, I rate Dr. Schultz as fair. This assessment is due to his consistently substandard performance on Q12 coupled with a modest level of student advising while only teaching 4 unique courses at AFIT (LOGM 567, 569, 899 and ORSC 642). His service activities at the Department, AFIT/EN and professional levels are adequate. Since his arrival at AFIT, his overall combined performances in the categories of teaching, research and service consistently stratify him as one of the two lowest faculty members in the Department.

5. In summary, I do not feel that Dr. Schultz has done enough at AFIT to warrant the award of academic tenure.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, reading "Pignatiello", with a large, stylized flourish at the end.

JOSEPH J. PIGNATIELLO, JR., PhD.  
Head, Department of Operational Sciences