

Memorandum

To: John R. Folkerth, Esq

From: Michael Magazine, PhD

Re: Kenneth Schultz, PhD

December 10, 2018

I am responding to a request to provide an expert opinion regarding the tenure review of Dr. Kenneth Schultz at the Air Force Institute of Technology (AFIT). I have known Dr. Schultz in a professional setting for 15-20 years. This essentially includes familiarity of his research, listening to presentations at professional meetings as well as discussions at these meetings about the importance of his work. In addition, Dr. Schultz has given a seminar at the University of Cincinnati (UC), where we had somewhat more, in depth, discussions of our joint research interests. I have never collaborated with Dr. Schultz on these common research interests.

I feel qualified to provide academic assessment of his tenure deliberations as I have had many opportunities to evaluate faculty in the area of operations management. I have been doing this as a faculty member, department head, associate dean and interim dean (see bio sketch). In addition, I typically am asked to assess candidates for tenure and promotion at 3-5 doctoral granting universities each academic year.

Specifically, I was asked to provide documentation on two issues. One is an assessment of an external reviewer, regarding qualifications as an expert in Dr. Schultz' area of expertise; the other was whether Dr. Schultz exceeds the standards of AFIT in comparison with others who have been granted tenure. Regarding the second issue first: I am able to assess Dr. Schultz scholarly contributions and if they meet or exceed standards set forth (and I do below), however I will not compare Dr. Schultz with other candidates for two different reasons. The first is that tenure is granted if an individual meets or exceeds a standard, not if they are at least as good as other individuals; the second reason is that tenure is rarely awarded on scholarly contributions alone. I am not in the position to judge Dr. Schultz' contributions as an instructor and his service to the community, which typically are considered in these decisions.

Dr. Schultz is truly a leader in the field of behavioral operations management, possibly number 2 in the country. His contributions have defined the field and he has demonstrated the importance of these contributions in the top journals in the field of operations management. I do not have a document from AFIT describing the expectations for tenure but I can say he exceeds the scholarly standards for UC's Lindner College of Business and several other universities that I am familiar.

The second issue is related to the appropriateness of Dr. David R. King as an external reviewer for Dr. Schultz' application for tenure. I do not know Dr. King but have looked at his record. Dr. King is a senior faculty member and a department chair at a doctoral granting institution. He is clearly an accomplished scholar in the field of strategic management. In addition, as a department chair, he is expected to make independent assessments for individuals in his department that may not be in his particular area of expertise. Specifically, his department teaches and does research in organizational behavior, human resources, business communication, strategy, entrepreneurship and general management. The area of operations management is most closely aligned with his college's department of Business Analytics, Information Systems and Supply Chain Management. Though a senior academic will be familiar with the journals in other fields of business, there is no evidence that Dr. King is an expert or has had the opportunity to perform and evaluate the quality of research in the field most associated with Dr. Schultz. That said, Dr. King has familiarity with AFIT, having received a degree from there and would understand the needs of the institution even if he isn't an expert in operations management. If the goal was to find the best individual to assess the scholarly contributions of Dr. Schultz, there are several other senior scholars would have been better choices.

I have respect of Dr. Schultz as a scholar and I hope that he is given the opportunity to appeal his case for tenure. If I can be of further assistance, please let me know.

Michael Magazine, Professor and Ohio Eminent Scholar
Department of Operations, Business Analytics and Information Systems
Lindner College of Business
University of Cincinnati

