

7 April 2016

MEMORANDUM FOR: AFIT/EN (Dean Badiru)

FROM: AFIT/EN Academic Rank Promotion and Tenure Committee (Dr. David Weeks)

SUBJECT: Addendum to the Promotion and Tenure Recommendations, AY 15-16, to include our review of the request for tenure for Dr. Kenneth Schultz.

1. The Academic Rank Promotion and Tenure Committee of the Graduate School of Engineering and Management (EN P&T Committee) met on 28 March 2016 and 5 April 2016 to review the request for tenure for Dr. Kenneth Schultz. Dr. Alan Johnson advocated for Dr. Schultz on 28 March 2016. Dr. Schultz identified his desire to add a letter of rebuttal to his package on 27 March 2016, and on 30 March 2016 Dr. Schultz delivered his letter of rebuttal along with additional supporting material. The EN P&T Committee met on 5 April 2016 to consider the entirety of Dr. Schultz's package including his letter of rebuttal and supporting material.
2. Dr. Schultz's rebuttal package includes his letter of rebuttal, an updated vita, and supporting letters from; Dr. Gary Burns, Associate Professor, Wright State University; Mr. Donald Anderson, Assistant Director, AMC/A9; Dr. Leslie Perkins, Director, AF Energy Office; and Dr. Elliot Bendoly, Professor, Ohio State University. In addition to his letter of support, Dr. Bendoly also includes his vita and documentation concerning Dr. Schultz's role as editor for the Journal of Operations Management.
3. Two primary areas of concern regarding Dr. Schultz's request for tenure are identified in the ENS Department P&T letter and in the ENS Department Head letter. The first relates to inconsistencies in Dr. Schultz's vita regarding his funding record, his publication record, his record of invited talks, and his editorial activities for the Journal of Operations Management. The concerns regarding his publication record and his record of invited talks are echoed in the external review letter from (name of school redacted). The second area of concern for both the Department Committee and the Department Head is the absence of activity regarding peer-reviewed publications. The Department Head notes that "Dr. Schultz has not had any peer-reviewed, refereed scholarly publications since his arrival at AFIT." The Department Committee notes that "Dr. Schultz arrived at AFIT with 10 journal articles in-print or in-press. He has not published any journal articles or conference papers while at AFIT." The concern over the absence of publication activity is also noted by the external reviewer from (name of school redacted). The Department Head letter identifies a third area of concern regarding consistently low quality classroom instruction as measured by student response to the AFIT On-line Evaluation System. The ENS Department P&T Committee vote is 1 yes out of a total of 9 voting-eligible members, and recommends that Dr. Schultz not be awarded tenure. The Department Head also does not support the award of tenure.
4. The EN P&T Committee finds the absence of any published peer-reviewed journal articles authored by Dr. Schultz, during the time he has been an AFIT faculty

member, as unacceptable. The letter from Dr. Bendoly included in Dr. Schultz's rebuttal package discusses Dr. Schultz's editorial activities for the Journal of Operations Management. The various external letters of support also included in the rebuttal package identify that Dr. Schultz's research is in their opinion valuable. None of the material in the rebuttal package addresses the absence of any published peer-reviewed journal articles since Dr. Schultz joined the AFIT faculty in 2011. As a result, the EN P&T Committee finds the letter of rebuttal and supporting materials to be insufficient in changing our fundamental position that Dr. Schultz's record of publication while at AFIT is deficient.

5. The EN P&T committee finds that the ENS Department P&T Committee followed an appropriate process and agrees with the departmental recommendation to not award Dr. Schultz tenure. The EN P&T committee vote is 0 yes out of a total of 6 voting eligible members, and recommends that Dr. Schultz not be awarded tenure.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "D. Weeks", is positioned above the typed name and title.

David E. Weeks, Ph.D.

Chair, Academic Rank Promotion and Tenure Committee

cc (w/o atch): AFIT/EN Faculty Council President
AFIT/EN Department P&T Committee Chairs