

# Multilevel Modeling (Part 2)

## Random-Intercept and Random-Slope Modeling with Covariates

Desmond D. Wallace

Department of Political Science  
The University of Iowa  
Iowa City, IA

April 13, 2018

# Regression Highlights

- A way to summarize the relationship between variables.
- Assuming there is a relationship between  $Y$  and the independent variable(s).
- Relationship may be linear (OLS) or non-linear (CLDV).
- Regression helps our understanding of how our dependent variable of interest changes when one or more independent variables vary, while holding remaining variables fixed.
- PRF:  $y_i = \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_1 + \cdots + \beta_k x_k + \varepsilon_i$
- SRF:  $y_i = b_0 + b_1 x_1 + \cdots + b_k x_k + e_i$

# Model Specification

- 1 Linearity in the parameters
- 2 The number of observations  $n$  must be greater than the number of parameters to be estimated
- 3 The regression model is correctly specified

# Independent Variable(s)

- 1  $X$  values are fixed in repeated sampling
- 2 Variability in  $X$  values
- 3 There is no perfect multicollinearity

# Error Term

- 1 Zero mean value of error ( $e_i$ )
- 2 **Homoscedasticity or equal variance** of  $e_i$
- 3 No autocorrelation between the errors
- 4 Zero covariance between  $e_i$  and  $X_i$

# Additional Assumptions

- ① Errors are normally distributed
- ② **Errors for any two observations are independent of one another**

# Multi-Stage Sampling

- OLS assumptions imply utilization of Simple Random Sampling (SRS)
- However, due to cost-efficiency, multi-stage sampling approaches may be utilized instead.
- Researcher may randomly sample grouping units instead of individuals (cluster sampling)
- Examples
  - Students nested in schools
  - Respondents nested in states (countries)
  - Patients nested in hospitals

# Applying OLS to Multilevel Data

- Biased standard errors
- Model Misspecification



# New Approach

- Best approach to analyzing nested data is a statistical approach that accounts for both within-group and between-group variation *simultaneously*
- One approach is to conceive within-group and between-group variation as random variability
- One can achieve this by including *random coefficient(s)* in the statistical model

# Multilevel Model

- Multilevel Model (MLM) is a model where the parameters vary at more than one level
- Features more than one error term
- Variation can occur with respect to the intercept (*random intercept*) and/or the slope (*random slope*)
- This approach leads to corrected standard errors and correct model specification

# Multilevel Model

- Model coefficients are now a combination of both fixed and random components
  - Fixed Coefficient – An unknown constant of nature
  - Random Coefficient – One which varies from sample of groups to sample of groups
- Random coefficients are not estimated, and are instead predicted
- Instead of BLUE (Best Linear Unbiased Estimator) coefficients, we now have BLUP (Best Linear Unbiased Prediction) coefficients

# Null (Variance Components) Model

- Predicting the outcome from only an intercept that varies between groups
- The 2-level null model takes the following form:
  - Level-1 Model:  $y_{ij} = \beta_{0j} + \varepsilon_{ij}$
  - Level-2 Model:  $\beta_{0j} = \gamma_{00} + U_{0j}$  where
    - $\beta_{0j}$  – Average (general) intercept holding across all groups (fixed effect)
    - $U_{0j}$  – Group-specific effect on the intercept (random effect)
  - Full Specification:  $y_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + U_{0j} + \varepsilon_{ij}$
- Interested in general mean value for  $y_{ij}$  ( $\gamma_{00}$ ) and deviation between overall mean and group-specific effects for the intercept ( $U_{0j}$ )

# Null Model Assumptions

- 1 Groups are a random sample from the population of all possible groups
- 2  $U_{0j}$  is randomly drawn from a population distribution with mean 0 and variance  $\tau_0^2$
- 3  $\tau_0^2$  (Variance of  $U_{0j}$ ) and  $\sigma^2$  (variance of  $\varepsilon_{ij}$ ) are uncorrelated

# Variance of $y_{ij}$

- Variance of  $y_{ij}$  is just the sum of the level-two and level-one variances
  - $Var(y_{ij}) = Var(U_{0j}) + Var(\varepsilon_{ij}) = \tau_0^2 + \sigma^2$
- Covariance between two observations from the same group ( $ij$  and  $i'j$ ) is equal to the variance of the contribution  $U_{0j}$  that is shared by these observations
  - $Cov(y_{ij}, y_{i'j}) = Var(U_{0j}) = \tau_0^2$

# Intraclass Correlation Coefficient

- A measure of the proportion of variation in the dependent variable that occurs *between* groups versus the total variation (*between* and *within*)
- Correlation between two randomly drawn observations from in one randomly drawn group
- Ranges between 0 (no variation between groups) and 1 (all between-group variation but no within-group variation)
- $$\rho(y_{ij}, y_{i'j}) = \frac{\tau_0^2}{\tau_0^2 + \sigma^2}$$

# Example #1: Math Achievement

- Goal: Partition the value of students' math achievement scores into an overall mean and group-specific random effects.
- Model Specification
  - Level-1 Model (student-level):  $\text{mathach}_{ij} = \beta_{0j} + \varepsilon_{ij}$
  - Level-2 Model (school-level):  $\beta_{0j} = \gamma_{00} + U_{0j}$
  - Full Model:  $\text{mathach}_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + U_{0j} + \varepsilon_{ij}$
- Parameter Interpretation
  - $\gamma_{00}$ : Overall mean of student's math achievement scores
  - $U_{0j}$ : Unique effect of school  $j$  on mean math achievement score



## Example #2: Gross State Product

- Goal: Partition the value of states' gross domestic product into an overall mean, state-specific random effects, and region-specific random effects.
- Model Specification
  - Level-1 Model (repeated measures):  $GSP_{ijk} = \beta_{0jk} + \varepsilon_{ijk}$
  - Level-2 Model (state-level):  $\beta_{0jk} = \gamma_{00k} + U_{0jk}$
  - Level-3 Model (region-level) :  $\gamma_{00k} = \delta_{000} + V_{00k}$
  - Full Model:  $GSP_{ijk} = \delta_{000} + V_{00k} + U_{0jk} + \varepsilon_{ijk}$
- Parameter Interpretation
  - $\delta_{000}$ : Overall mean of GSP
  - $U_{0jk}$ : Unique effect of state  $j$  on mean GSP
  - $V_{00k}$ : Unique effect of region  $k$  on mean GSP

Email: [desmond-wallace@uiowa.edu](mailto:desmond-wallace@uiowa.edu)  
Any Questions?