

TODO: Implement methods and functions in `my_air_cargo_problems.py`
Done.

Part 1 - Planning problems

TODO: Experiment and document metrics for non-heuristic planning solution searches

** Run uninformed planning searches for `air_cargo_p1`, `air_cargo_p2`, and `air_cargo_p3`; provide metrics on number of node expansions required, number of goal tests, time elapsed, and optimality of solution for each search algorithm. Include the result of at least three of these searches, including breadth-first and depth-first, in your write-up (`breadth_first_search` and `depth_first_graph_search`).*

breadth_first_search (guarantees optimal solution):

P1:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using breadth_first_search...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
      43         56       180

Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.05210347892716527
Load(C2, P2, JFK)
Load(C1, P1, SF0)
Fly(P2, JFK, SF0)
Unload(C2, P2, SF0)
Fly(P1, SF0, JFK)
Unload(C1, P1, JFK)
```

P2:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using breadth_first_search...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
     3343       4609     30509

Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 23.430756394052878
Load(C2, P2, JFK)
Load(C1, P1, SF0)
Load(C3, P3, ATL)
Fly(P2, JFK, SF0)
Unload(C2, P2, SF0)
Fly(P1, SF0, JFK)
Unload(C1, P1, JFK)
Fly(P3, ATL, SF0)
Unload(C3, P3, SF0)
```

P3:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using breadth_first_search...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
  14491       17947       128184

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 189.12639948003925
Load(C2, P2, JFK)
Load(C1, P1, SF0)
Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)
Load(C4, P2, ORD)
Fly(P2, ORD, SF0)
Unload(C2, P2, SF0)
Unload(C4, P2, SF0)
Fly(P1, SF0, ATL)
Load(C3, P1, ATL)
Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)
Unload(C1, P1, JFK)
Unload(C3, P1, JFK)
```

Depth_first_graph_search (Does not guarantee optimal solution)

P1:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using depth_first_graph_search...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
  12          13         48

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.015370022971183062
Fly(P1, SF0, JFK)
Fly(P2, JFK, SF0)
Load(C1, P2, SF0)
Fly(P2, SF0, JFK)
Fly(P1, JFK, SF0)
Unload(C1, P2, JFK)
Fly(P2, JFK, SF0)
Fly(P1, SF0, JFK)
Load(C2, P1, JFK)
Fly(P2, SF0, JFK)
Fly(P1, JFK, SF0)
Unload(C2, P1, SF0)
```

P2:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using depth_first_graph_search...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
    1669         1670     14863

Plan length: 1444 Time elapsed in seconds: 20.891731776995584
```

Plan length 1444!

P3:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using depth_first_graph_search...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
    3491         3492    29322

Plan length: 3335 Time elapsed in seconds: 92.66610987810418
```

Interesting, the first time I ran P3 on `depth_first_graph_search` it took around 3 hours to find a solution. This time it has only taken minute and a half. I suppose it depends on which of the branches decides to dig into, until finding a solution.

Part 2 - Domain-independent heuristics

TODO: Experiment and document: metrics of A* searches with these heuristics

`astar_search h_1`

P1:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using astar_search with h_1...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
     55         57     224

Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.07825361797586083
```

P2:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using astar_search with h_1...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
    4761         4763    43206

Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 19.40385899809189
```

P3:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using astar_search with h_1...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
    17783        17785   155920

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 92.83498301403597
```

astar_search h_ignore_preconditions

P1:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using astar_search with h_ignore_preconditions...  
  
Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes  
    41         43       170  
  
Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.0936009120196104
```

P2:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using astar_search with h_ignore_preconditions...  
  
Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes  
   1450       1452     13303  
  
Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 11.26468390203081
```

P3:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using astar_search with h_ignore_preconditions...  
  
Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes  
   5003       5005    44586  
  
Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 37.80623276298866
```

astar_search h_pg_levelsum

P1:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using astar_search with h_pg_levelsum...  
  
Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes  
    11        13       50  
  
Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 1.2093116089235991
```

P2:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using astar_search with h_pg_levelsum...  
  
Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes  
    86        88      841  
  
Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 129.71877331403084
```

P3:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using astar_search with h_pg_levelsum...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
    311         313       2863

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 503.4098467959557
```

Part 3: Written Analysis

TODO: Include the following in your written analysis.

- Provide an optimal plan for Problems 1, 2, and 3.

breadth_first_search always guarantees an optimal solution.

We see the steps required for each of the problems are 3/6/12.

Solutions provided in Part1

- Compare and contrast non-heuristic search result metrics (optimality, time elapsed, number of node expansions) for Problems 1,2, and 3. Include breadth-first, depth-first, and at least one other uninformed non-heuristic search in your comparison; Your third choice of non-heuristic search may be skipped for Problem 3 if it takes longer than 10 minutes to run, but a note in this case should be included.

Non-heuristic:greedy_best_first_graph_search

P1:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using greedy_best_first_graph_search with h_1...

Expansions   Goal Tests   New Nodes
     7         9       28

Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.01054584514349699
```

P2

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using greedy_best_first_graph_search with h_1...
```

Expansions	Goal Tests	New Nodes
550	552	4950

```
Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 2.3386169329751283
```

```
Load(C1, P1, SF0)
```

```
Load(C2, P2, JFK)
```

```
Load(C3, P3, ATL)
```

```
Fly(P1, SF0, JFK)
```

```
Fly(P2, JFK, SF0)
```

```
Fly(P3, ATL, SF0)
```

```
Unload(C3, P3, SF0)
```

```
Unload(C2, P2, SF0)
```

```
Unload(C1, P1, JFK)
```

P3:

```
Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using greedy_best_first_graph_search with h_1...
```

Expansions	Goal Tests	New Nodes
4031	4033	35794

```
Plan length: 22 Time elapsed in seconds: 20.138448597164825
```

Breadth_first_search: optimal finding the solution, expands more nodes than the other two

Depth_first_graph_search: non-optimal solutions, fast, expands the least nodes of all, same times as before.

Greedy_best_first_graph_search: optimal finding the solution for P1 and P2 but not for P3 (22 vs 12), expands similar nodes than depth_first, and less than breadth_first, fast, specially for P3.

- Compare and contrast heuristic search result metrics using A* with the "ignore preconditions" and "level-sum" heuristics for Problems 1, 2, and 3.

astar_search h_1: optimal finding the solution, expands more nodes than the other two, and is second in speed.

astar_search h_ignore_preconditions: optimal finding the solution, second in expanding nodes, fastest of the three.

astar_search h_pg_levelsum optimal finding the solution, winner in least expanding nodes, slowest.

- What was the best heuristic used in these problems? Was it better than non-heuristic search planning methods for all problems? Why or why not?

I think the best heuristic is "astar_search h_ignore_preconditions" since it is fast and does not expand too many nodes. If speed was not a concern, I'd use **astar_search h_pg_levelsum**

although it might be the case that the complexity of the planning graph or its implementation plays a big role in it being really slow, in terms of nodes expanded is the best of all A*.

There is one non-heuristic search that is superior to ignore_preconditions, that is **3-greedy_best_first_graph_search with h_1**

After this comparative and having checked all possible search functions for P2, I think **astar_search h_pg_levelsum** demonstrates that using heuristics helps reducing the number of nodes explored for all problems; and although it might have a penalty on computational cost, if the heuristic is admissible and consistent, we'll have optimal solutions too. In most of the cases, since there are fewer nodes expanded, this means that the search is shorter, so faster to find a solution (except in the already commented case of PG).

Comparative chart:

NOTE:

'breadth_first_tree_search'

'depth_limited_search'

'recursive_best_first_search'

Are not present, since even for P2 problems they were taking longer than 1 hour to complete.

Global results					
Search-Problem	Expansions	Goals	New Nodes	Plan lenght	Time Elapsed
Air Cargo Problem 1-breadth_first_search	43	56	180	6	0.05665080202743411
Air Cargo Problem 1-depth_first_graph_search	12	13	48	12	0.012953563127666712
Air Cargo Problem 1-uniform_cost_search	55	57	224	6	0.06628095963969827
Air Cargo Problem 1-greedy_best_first_graph_search with h_1	7	9	28	6	0.012290739919990301
Air Cargo Problem 1-astar_search with h_1	55	57	224	6	0.08033474627882242
Air Cargo Problem 1-astar_search with h_ignore_preconditions	41	43	170	6	0.0643903617747128
Air Cargo Problem 1-astar_search with h_pg_levelsum	11	13	50	6	1.114807927981019
Air Cargo Problem 2-breadth_first_search	3343	4609	30509	9	24.770511573180556
Air Cargo Problem 2-depth_first_graph_search	1669	1670	14863	1444	24.158565250691026
Air Cargo Problem 2-uniform_cost_search	4761	4763	43206	9	21.927996010985225
Air Cargo Problem 2-greedy_best_first_graph_search with h_1	550	552	4950	9	2.352442105766386
Air Cargo Problem 2-astar_search with h_1	4761	4763	43206	9	21.258179971016943
Air Cargo Problem 2-astar_search with h_ignore_preconditions	1450	1452	13303	9	7.806141233071685
Air Cargo Problem 2-astar_search with h_pg_levelsum	86	88	841	9	106.16469939192757
Air Cargo Problem 3-breadth_first_search	14491	17947	128184	12	188.24099823320284
Air Cargo Problem 3-depth_first_graph_search	3491	3492	29322	3335	95.84076651418582
Air Cargo Problem 3-uniform_cost_search	17783	17785	155920	12	96.7542014438659
Air Cargo Problem 3-greedy_best_first_graph_search with h_1	4031	4033	35794	22	20.24258102942258
Air Cargo Problem 3-astar_search with h_1	17783	17785	155920	12	96.95214396715164
Air Cargo Problem 3-astar_search with h_ignore_preconditions	5003	5005	44586	12	29.733329590875655
Air Cargo Problem 3-astar_search with h_pg_levelsum	311	313	2863	12	539.2586630298756