

Danielle Lang\*  
Jonathan Diaz\*  
Molly E. Danahy\*  
**CAMPAIGN LEGAL CENTER**  
1101 14th St NW Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 736-2200  
[dlang@campaignlegal.org](mailto:dlang@campaignlegal.org)  
[jdiaz@campaignlegal.org](mailto:jdiaz@campaignlegal.org)  
[mdanahy@campaignlegal.org](mailto:mdanahy@campaignlegal.org)

James E. Barton II, 023888  
Jacqueline Mendez Soto, 022597  
**BARTON MENDEZ SOTO PLLC**  
401 W. Baseline Road, Suite 205  
Tempe, Arizona 85283  
480-550-5165  
[James@bartonmendezsoto.com](mailto:James@bartonmendezsoto.com)  
[Jacqueline@bartonmendezsoto.com](mailto:Jacqueline@bartonmendezsoto.com)

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*  
*\*pro hac vice*

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

Mi Familia Vota, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Adrian Fontes, in his official capacity  
as Secretary of the State of Arizona, et  
al.,

Defendants.

AND CONSOLIDATED CASES.

Case No. 2:22-cv-00509-SRB (Lead)

**NON-UNITED STATES  
PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO  
SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE BEN  
TOMA AND SENATE PRESIDENT  
WARREN PETERSEN'S MOTION  
TO INTERVENE AS DEFENDANTS**

No. CV-22-00519-PHX-SRB  
No. CV-22-01003-PHX-SRB  
No. CV-22-01124-PHX-SRB  
No. CV-22-01369-PHX-SRB  
No. CV-22-01381-PHX-SRB  
No. CV-22-01602-PHX-SRB  
No. CV-22-01901-PHX-SRB

1 Consolidated Plaintiffs, not including the United States (collectively, “non-U.S.  
2 Plaintiffs”), by and through counsel, file this response to the Motion to Intervene as  
3 Defendants, ECF No. 346 (“Motion”), by Representative Ben Toma, Speaker of the  
4 Arizona House of Representatives, and Senator Warren Petersen, President of the Arizona  
5 Senate (“Movants”). Non-U.S. Plaintiffs do not oppose allowing Movants to intervene  
6 permissively under Rule 24(b), provided Movants comply—as agreed in their Motion—  
7 with all existing deadlines set forth in this Court’s March 24, 2023 Case Management  
8 Order, ECF No. 388, and do not otherwise cause delay or prejudice the existing parties.

9 While non-U.S. Plaintiffs do not oppose permissive intervention, they note for the  
10 record that Movants have not met their burden to intervene as of right for at least two  
11 reasons: (1) Movants’ interests are indistinguishable from the State’s interests and the State  
12 is already a party to this case; and (2) because they have no interests independent from the  
13 State, Movants’ interests are adequately represented by the existing parties.<sup>1</sup>

---

17 <sup>1</sup> Non-U.S. Plaintiffs also note that Movants waited more than a year after the first  
18 of the consolidated cases was originally filed before seeking intervention, by which time  
19 this Court had already resolved the State’s motion to dismiss and all existing Defendants  
20 had filed their answers. This is important because timeliness is an essential element of  
21 intervention under Rule 24. *See United States v. Carpenter*, 298 F.3d 1122, 1125 (9th Cir.  
2002); *County of Orange v. Air Cal.*, 799 F.2d 535, 537 (9th Cir. 1986). Moreover,  
although Movants claim that they will abide by the Court’s prescribed deadlines, they make  
no claim that they will respond in a timely manner to discovery requests, or that they will  
abide by discovery agreements already entered into by the parties. Intervention should be  
conditioned on such agreement and timely responses.

**CONCLUSION**

Non-US Plaintiffs do not oppose allowing movants to permissively intervene under Rule 24(b), consistent with the arguments and conditions herein.

Date: April 18, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ James Barton

**BARTON MENDEZ SOTO**

James Barton (AZ Bar No. 023888)  
401 W. Baseline Road  
Suite 205  
Tempe, AZ 85283  
480-418-0668  
james@bartonmendezsoto.com

**DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
SAN CARLOS APACHE TRIBE**

Alexander B. Ritchie  
(AZ Bar No. 019579)  
Attorney General  
Chase A. Velasquez\*  
NM Bar No. 019148  
Assistant Attorney General  
Post Office Box 40  
16 San Carlos Ave.  
San Carlos, AZ 85550  
Alex.Ritchie@scat-nsn.gov  
Chase.Velasquez@scat-nsn.gov

**FREE SPEECH FOR PEOPLE**

Courtney Hostetler\* (MA# 683307)  
John Bonifaz\* (MA# 562478)  
Ben Clements\* (MA# 555082)  
Ronald Fein\* (MA# 657930)  
1320 Centre Street, Suite 405  
Newton, MA 02459

**CAMPAIGN LEGAL CENTER**

Danielle Lang\*  
Jonathan Diaz\*  
Molly Danahy\*  
Hayden Johnson\*  
Nicole Hansen\*  
1101 14th St. NW, Suite 400  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
(202) 736-2200  
dlang@campaignlegalcenter.org  
jdiaz@campaignlegalcenter.org  
mdanahy@campaignlegalcenter.org  
hjohnson@campaignlegalcenter.org  
nhansen@campaignlegalcenter.org

**MAYER BROWN LLP**

Lee H. Rubin\* (CA# 141331)  
Two Palo Alto Square, Suite 300  
3000 El Camino Real  
Palo Alto, CA 94306-2112  
(650) 331-2000  
lrubin@mayerbrown.com

Gary A. Isaac\* (IL# 6192407)  
Daniel T. Fenske\* (IL# 6296360)  
Jed W. Glickstein\* (IL# 6315387)  
William J. McElhaney, III\*  
(IL# 6336357)  
71 S. Wacker Drive

(617) 249-3015  
chostetler@freespeechforpeople.org  
jbonifaz@freespeechforpeople.org  
bclements@freespeechforpeople.org  
rfein@freespeechforpeople.org

Chicago, IL 60606  
(312) 782-0600  
dfenske@mayerbrown.com  
gisaac@mayerbrown.com  
jglickstein@mayerbrown.com

Rachel J. Lamorte\* (NY# 5380019)  
1999 K Street NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
(202) 362-3000  
rlamorte@mayerbrown.com

*Attorneys for Living United for Change in Arizona, League of United Latin American Citizens, Arizona Students' Association, ADRC Action, Inter Tribal Council of Arizona, Inc., San Carlos Apache Tribe, and Arizona Coalition for Change*

/s/ Roy Herrera

**HERRERA ARELLANO LLP**

Roy Herrera (AZ Bar No. 032901)  
Daniel A. Arellano (AZ Bar. No. 032304)  
Jillian L. Andrews (AZ Bar No. 034611)  
530 East McDowell Road  
Suite 107-150  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-1500  
Phone: (602) 567-4820  
roy@ha-firm.com  
daniel@ha-firm.com  
jillian@ha-firm.com

**ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP**

Marc E. Elias\*  
Elisabeth C. Frost\*  
John M. Geise\*  
Christopher D. Dodge\*  
Mollie DiBrell\*  
Alexander F. Atkins\*  
Daniela Lorenzo\*  
250 Massachusetts Ave NW, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20001  
Phone: (202) 968-4513  
Facsimile: (202) 968-4498  
melias@elias.law  
efrost@elias.law  
jgeise@elias.law  
cdodge@elias.law  
mdibrell@elias.law  
aatkins@elias.law  
dlorenzo@elias.law

*Attorneys for Mi Familia Vota and Voto Latino*

/s/ Daniel J. Adelman

**ARIZONA CENTER FOR LAW  
IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST**

Daniel J. Adelman  
352 E. Camelback Rd., Suite 200  
Phoenix, AZ 85012  
danny@aclpi.org  
(602) 258-8850

**ARNOLD & PORTER**

**KAYE SCHOLER, LLP**

Steven L. Mayer\*  
Three Embarcadero Center, 10th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Steve.Mayer@arnoldporter.com  
(415) 471-3100

**ARNOLD & PORTER**

**KAYE SCHOLER, LLP**

Leah R. Novak\*  
250 West 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019  
Leah.Novak@arnoldporter.com  
(212) 836-8000

**FAIR ELECTIONS CENTER**

Jon Sherman\*  
Michelle Kanter Cohen\*  
1825 K St. NW, Ste. 450  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
jsherman@fairelectionscenter.org  
mkantercohen@fairelectionscenter.org  
(202) 331-0114

**ARNOLD & PORTER**

**KAYE SCHOLER, LLP**

Jeremy Karpatkin\*  
John A. Freedman\*  
Erica McCabe\*  
601 Massachusetts Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Jeremy.Karpatkin@arnoldporter.com  
John.Freedman@arnoldporter.com  
Erica.McCabe@arnoldporter.com  
(202) 942-5000

*Attorneys for Poder Latinx, Chicanos Por La Causa, and Chicanos Por La Causa  
Action Fund*

/s/ Bruce Samuels

**PAPETTI SAMUELS**

**WEISS MCKIRGAN LLP**

Bruce Samuels (AZ Bar No. 015996)  
Jennifer Lee-Cota (AZ Bar No. 033190)  
bsamuels@pswmlaw.com  
jleecota@pswmlaw.com  
Scottsdale Quarter  
15169 North Scottsdale Road  
Suite 205

**WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR LLP**

Seth P. Waxman\*  
Daniel S. Volchok\*  
Christopher E. Babbitt\*  
seth.waxman@wilmerhale.com  
daniel.volchok@wilmerhale.com  
christopher.babbitt@wilmerhale.com  
2100 Pennsylvania Avenue N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037

1 Scottsdale, AZ 85254  
2 +1 480 800 3530

+1 202 663 6000 (telephone)  
+1 202 663 6363 (facsimile)

3 *Attorneys for the Democratic National Committee and Arizona Democratic Party*

4 /s/ Sadik Huseny

5 **LATHAM & WATKINS LLP**

Sadik Huseny\*

6 *sadik.huseny@lw.com*

Amit Makker\*

7 *amit.makker@lw.com*

505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000

8 San Francisco, CA 94111-6538

Telephone: (415) 391-0600

9 Facsimile: (415) 395-8095

10 /s/ Andrew M. Federhar

**SPENCER FANE**

Andrew M. Federhar

11 (AZ Bar No. 006567)

*afederhar@spencerfane.com*

12 2415 East Camelback Road, Suite 600

Phoenix, AZ 85016

13 Telephone: (602) 333-5430

14 Facsimile: (602) 333-5431

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Arizona Asian American Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander*  
16 *for Equity Coalition*

**ASIAN AMERICANS ADVANCING  
JUSTICE-AAJC**

Niyati Shah\*

6 *nshah@advancingjustice-aajc.org*

Terry Ao Minnis\*

7 *tminnis@advancingjustice-aajc.org*

1620 L Street NW, Suite 1050

Washington, DC 20036

Telephone: (202) 296-2300

Facsimile: (202) 296-2318

1 /s/ Ernest Herrera

2 **MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL**  
3 **DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL**  
4 **FUND**

5 Ernest Herrera\*

6 Erika Cervantes\*

7 634 South Spring Street, 11th Floor

8 Los Angeles, CA 90014

9 Telephone: (213) 629-2512

10 Facsimile: (213) 629-0266

11 eherrera@maldef.org

12 ecervantes@maldef.org

13 *Attorneys for Promise Arizona Plaintiffs*

14 /s/ David Rosenbaum

15 **OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.**

16 David B. Rosenbaum

17 AZ No. 009819

18 Joshua J. Messer

19 AZ No. 035101

20 2929 North Central Avenue, 21st Floor

21 Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793

(602) 640-9000

drosenbaum@omlaw.com

jmesser@omlaw.com

**LAWYERS COMMITTEE FOR**  
**CIVIL RIGHTS UNDER LAW**

Ezra Rosenberg\*

DC No. 360927, NJ No. 012671974

Jim Tucker\*\*

AZ No. 019341

Ryan Snow\*

1500 K Street NW, Suite 900

Washington, DC 20005

(202) 662-8600 (main)

erosenberg@lawyerscommittee.org

jtucker@lawyerscommittee.org

/s/ Daniel R. Ortega Jr.

**ORTEGA LAW FIRM**

Daniel R. Ortega Jr.

361 East Coronado Road, Suite 101

Phoenix, AZ 85004-1525

Telephone: (602) 386-4455

Email: danny@ortegalaw.com

**NATIVE AMERICAN RIGHTS FUND**

Allison A. Neswood\*

CO No. 49846

neswood@narf.org

Michael S. Carter

AZ No. 028704, OK No. 31961

carter@narf.org

Matthew Campbell\*

NM No. 138207, CO No. 40808

mcampbell@narf.org

Jacqueline D. DeLeon\*

CA No. 288192

jdeleon@narf.org

1506 Broadway

Boulder, CO 80301

(303) 447-8760 (main)

Samantha B. Kelty

AZ No. 024110, TX No. 24085074

kelty@narf.org

950 F Street NW, Suite 1050,

Washington, D.C. 20004

(202) 785-4166 (direct)

rsnow@lawyerscommittee.org

*\*\*Admitted in Arizona, D.C. and Nevada.*

**GILA RIVER INDIAN COMMUNITY**

Thomas L. Murphy

AZ No. 022953

Javier G. Ramos

AZ No. 017442

Post Office Box 97

Sacaton, Arizona 85147

(520) 562-9760

thomas.murphy@gric.nsn.us

javier.ramos@gric.nsn.us

*Representing Gila River Indian  
Community Only*

**TOHONO O'ODHAM NATION**

Howard M. Shanker (AZ Bar 015547)

Attorney General, Tohono O'odham  
Nation

Marissa L. Sites (AZ Bar 027390)

Assistant Attorney General, Tohono  
O'odham Nation

P.O. Box 830

Sells, Arizona 85634

(520) 383-3410

Howard.Shanker@tonation-nsn.gov

Marissa.Sites@tonation-nsn.gov

*Representing Tohono O'odham Nation  
Only*

*Attorneys for Tohono O'odham Nation, Gila River Indian Community, Keanu Stevens,  
Alanna Siquieros, and LaDonna Jacket*

*\* Admitted Pro Hac Vice*



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 18th day of April, 2023, I caused the foregoing document to be electronically transmitted to all counsel of record via the Court's CM/ECF electronic filing system.

/s/ Monse Vejar