

Overview Code Bugs Blueprints Translations Answers

[OSSA-2021-004] Linuxbridge ARP filter bypass on Netfilter platforms (CVE-2021-38598)

Bug #1938670 reported by Jake Yip on 2021-08-02

This bug affects 1 person

260

Affects	Status	Importance	Assigned to	Milestone
OpenStack Security Advisory	Fix Released	High	Jeremy Stanley	
neutron	Fix Released	Undecided	Rodolfo Alonso	

Bug Description

We are running an OpenStack cloud with linux bridge. We have found that, in certain conditions, ARP spoofing protection is not working as intended. This allows a user do bad things like spoof gratuitous ARP to DoS another user's virtual machine. More details below.

In an environment using linux bridge, neutron-linuxbridge-agent uses ebtables to prevent ARP spoofing. A list of typical ebtables rules for a VM looks like this:

:neutronMAC-tapdb545a8c-8f DROP :neutronARP-tapdb545a8c-8f DROP

-A PREROUTING -i tapdb545a8c-8f -j neutronMAC-tapdb545a8c-8f

-A PREROUTING -p ARP -i tapdb545a8c-8f -j neutronARP-tapdb545a8c-8f

-A neutronMAC-tapdb545a8c-8f -i tapdb545a8c-8f --among-src

-A neutronARP-tapdb545a8c-8f -p ARP --arp-ip-src 192.0.2.5 -j ACCEPT

The neutronARP-xxx chain, however, has a problem during the creation of it. The source for that [1] looks like this:

ebtables(['-N', vif_chain, '-P', 'DROP'])
ebtables(['-F', vif_chain])

This creates a chain with default policy of DROP, and FLUSHes any existing rules.

However, we have found that in certain OS, the FLUSH reverts the default policy back to RETURN. E.g.

root@jake-focal:~# eatables -t nat -N newchain -P DROP root@jake-focal:~# ebtables-save | grep newchain :newchain DROP

root@jake-focal:~# ebtables -t nat -F newchain root@jake-focal:~# ebtables-save | grep newchain

:newchain RETURN

root@jake-focal:~# ebtables --version

ebtables 1.8.4 (nf_tables)

The OSes that exhibit this issue seems to be OSes that uses ebtables-nft -

Ubuntu Bionic is fine. E.g.

root@jake-bionic:~# ebtables -t nat -N newchain -P DROP root@jake-bionic:~# ebtables-save | grep newchain :newchain DROP root@jake-bionic:~# ebtables -t nat -F newchain root@jake-bionic:~# ebtables-save | grep newchain :newchain DROP

root@jake-bionic:~# ebtables --version ebtables v2.0.10-4 (December 2011)

I have a patch for this, but as this is a security issue I am refraining from posting it up to OpenStack's Gerrit. Also, this might have been fixed in master, but it still affects Ussuri and Victoria. Please advise on what I should do next?

[1] https://opendev.org/openstack/neutron/src/branch/stable/ussuri/neutron/plugins/ml2/drivers/linuxbridge/agent/arp_protect.py#L135-L139

See original description

Tags: in-stable-train in-stable-ussuri in-stable-victoria

CVE References

2021-38598

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-02:	
Since this report concerns a possible security risk, an incomplete	
security advisory task has been added while the core security	
reviewers for the affected project or projects confirm the bug and	
discuss the scope of any vulnerability along with potential	
solutions.	
Changed in ossa:	
status:New → Incomplete	
description: updated	
about pour apout to a	

Rodolfo Alonso (rodolfo-alonso-hernandez) on 2021-08-10

Changed in neutron:

assignee:nobody → Rodolfo Alonso (rodolfo-alonso-hernandez)

 $\verb|status:New| \to \verb|Confirmed|$

Rodolfo Alonso (rodolfo-alonso-hernandez) wrote on 2021-08-10:

Report a bug

This report contains Public Security information

Everyone can see this security related information.

You are not directly subscribed to this bug's notifications.

Edit bug mail

Other bug subscribers

Subscribe someone else

Notified of all changes

Jake Yip

Justin Mammarella Neutron Core Secu...

May be notified

ANISh

Abhiraj Butala

Abu Shohel Ahmed

Ahmed Ezzat

Aishwarya

Akihiro Motoki

Alex Baretto

Alex Ermolov Alfredzo Nash

Ali Jabbar

Ali hussnain

Amir Sadoughi

Andrej

Andrew Boik

Angna Aggarwal

Ankur

Anna

April Wang

Armando Migliaccio Arpita Rathi

Arun Sharma

Aruna Kushwaha

Asghar Riahi

Ashish Kumar Singh Ashok kumaran B

Atif

Atif

Bao Fangyan

Barki Mustapha Bathri Ajay Raj

Bernard Cafarelli

Brad Eckert

Branko Vukmirovic

Brian Bowen

Brian Haley

Brian Shang Bruce Martins

C Sasi Kanth

Calub Viem Canh Truong

Cara O'Brien

Chason Chan

Cheng Zuo

Chris Samsor

Christoph Fiehe Craig Miller

Dan Sneddon

Daniel Alvarez

Dave Cahill

David Lapsley

David M. Zendzian David Seelbach

Davish Bhardwai

Davish Bhardwa Deepak Nair

DengBO

Dmitriy Andrushko

Dong Jun

Dongwon Cho

Duc Nguyen

Dustin Lundquist Edgar Magana

#2

Hello:

Thank you for the report. That was solved in master and W in [1]. This patch flushes or creates the related "vif_chain" and then adds a default

I'll backport this patch up to Queens. Although the patch description is not related to this one, it is indeed solving what is described.

[1]https://review.opendev.org/q/I9463b000f6f63e65aaf91d60b30f6c92c01e3baf [2]https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/785177/3/neutron/ plugins/ml2/drivers/linuxbridge/agent/arp_protect.py#122 [3]https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/785177/3/neutron/ plugins/ml2/drivers/linuxbridge/agent/arp_protect.py#128

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-10:

Rodolfo: Thanks for working on this. Unfortunately when you pushed your backports today you linked to this private vulnerability report in the mmit messages, breaking the embargo. As a result, I'm going ahead and switching the bug to Public Security status and proceeding under our public report workflow.

description:updated

information type:Private Security → Public Security

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) on 2021-08-10

Changed in ossa:

status: Incomplete - Confirmed

importance: Undecided - High

 $\textbf{assignee:} \texttt{nobody} \, \rightarrow \, \texttt{Jeremy Stanley (fungi)}$

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-10:

#4

#3

We've been treating other unintended anti-spoofing filter bypasses as class A reports lately, most recently OSSA-2021-001 which had a similar impact and risks (though with differing details obviously), so I'll start putting together an impact description and we'll publish an advisory once the backports for stable/victoria and stable/ussuri merge.

Rodolfo Alonso (rodolfo-alonso-hernandez) wrote on 2021-08-10:

#5

This is the first time I actually provide a patch for a bug with an embargo. Sorry for breaking it. Next time I'll be more careful.

Regards.

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-10:

#6

Rodolfo: Don't sweat it, the other anti-spoofing bypass vulnerability I mentioned was public for a very long time before it was fixed, and I was going to start a conversation about switching this to public ahead of publication anyway. We just prefer to have the opportunity to discuss that decision first if the report was originally provided in private.

For future reference though, when a report of a suspected vulnerability is still in Private Security status we keep a paragraph at the top of the bug description which includes reminders not to mention or link the report in public code review, mailing lists, IRC and so on (I removed it from this bug when switching it to Public Security, but you can find it in the full activity log). The hope is that developers will read that notice before taking further action.

Anyway, thanks for the fixes and for moving this along, I'll push up a draft advisory we can all review, and then file a CVE assignment request with that text once we're satisfied with the details in it.

OpenStack Infra (hudson-openstack) wrote on 2021-08-10; Fix proposed to ossa (master)

#7

Fix proposed to branch: master

Review: https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/ossa/+/804116

status: Confirmed - In Progress

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-10: Re: linuxbridge: ebtables-nft allows ARP spoofing

#8

Please review the proposed advisory text and affected version ranges in https://review.opendev.org/804116 and, if that looks correct, I'll apply to MITRE for a CVE using that description.

Jake: I've credited the discovery to "Jake Yip" and "Nectar" but please let me know if you'd like to go by a different name and/or list a different organizational affiliation (the university, maybe something else?). Thanks!

Jake Yip (waipengyip) wrote on 2021-08-10:

#9

Hi Jeremy,

Please credit it to

"Jake Yip from ARDC and Justin Mammarella from the University of Melbourne'

Thankel

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-11:

#10

Elena Ezhova

Elvira García Ruiz

Euler Jiang

Evgeny Fedoruk

Flavio Fernandes

Florin Vinti Fontenay Tony

Gage Hugo

Gandharva Ganesh Kadam

Gary Kotton

Greg Althaus

Guangya Liu (Jay HENG ZHANG

HaifengLi

Hampapur Ajay

Hao Wang Harikrishna S

Harkirat Singh

Harsh Prasad

Hemant Jadhay

Hemanth Ravi

Hirofumi Ichihara Hong Hui Xiao

Hosam Al Ali

Hugo Kou

Hui Cheng Ian Y. Choi

Igor D.C.

Ihar Hrachyshka

Ivan Groenewald

Jamal Mitchell

James Denton Jared R Greene

Jay Janardhan

Jeff Ward Jeremy Stanley

Jiaiun Liu

Jie Li

Jinlai Shan

Joel wineland John

John Buswell

John Davidge John Kasperski

John Lenihan

John Perkins

Jordan Rinke

Joshua Padman Kausal Malladi

Kausum Kumar

Ken'ichi Ohmichi Kenii Motobashi

Kent Liu

Kevin Benton

Kunal.Yadav LIU Yulong

Le Tian Ren

Lei Zhang

Lewis Denny

Li Xipeng Lionel Zerbib

Louis Fourie

Luiin Luo

Lukas Koenen MARZAK Ilham

Maciej Jozefczyk

Madhu CR

Mamatisa Nurmatov

Manikanta Srinivas

Manish Godara

Manjeet Singh Bhatia

Manoi Raiu

Marcus Vinicius G...

Mark McClain

Marta Sdvoiispa

Matthew Thode Michael Rowland H...

Michael Tietz

Micheal Thompson

Miguel Lavalle

Mika Kohonen

Mohit Malik

Murali Raju

Na Zhu

Jake: Thanks for the correction, I've updated it in the proposed advisory now as requested.

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-12:

I have requested a CVE through MITRE's form based on the summary in https://review.opendev.org/804116 and will update that proposed advisory,

as well as this bug, with it once assigned.

summary: - linuxbridge: ebtables-nft allows ARP spoofing

+ Linuxbridge ARP filter bypass on Netfilter platforms

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) on 2021-08-12

summary:- Linuxbridge ARP filter bypass on Netfilter platforms

+ Linuxbridge ARP filter bypass on Netfilter platforms (CVE-2021-38598)

OpenStack Infra (hudson-openstack) wrote on 2021-08-16: Fix merged to neutron (stable/victoria)

Reviewed: https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/804056

Committed: https://opendev.org/openstack/neutron/commit/fafa5dacd505712

0562184a734e7345e7c0e9639

Submitter: "Zuul (22348)" Branch: stable/victoria

mit fafa5dacd5057120562184a734e7345e7c0e9639

Author: Rodolfo Alonso Hernandez <email address hidden>

Date: Wed Apr 7 13:16:21 2021 +0000

Make ARP protection commands compatible with "ebtables-nft"

"nftables" compatible binary, "ebtables-nft", is not 100% compatible with the legacy API, as reported in LP#1922892.

This patch fixes the following issues when using "ebtables-nft" (while keeping compatibility with legacy binary):

- When a new chain is created, a default DROP rule is added at the end of the chain (append). This will prevent the error code 4 when the chain is listed
- The chain rules are added at the begining of the chain (insert), before the default DROP rule. This will prioritize the port rules
- The MAC rules are cleaned before the new ones are added. That will prevent the deletion of any new needed rule, now added after the deletion.
- The "ebtables" command will retry on error code 4. This is the error returned when the chains are listed and no rule is present in a new created chain (reporeted in LP#1922892).

This code is backwards compatible, that means it works with the legacy "ebtables" binary; this is currently installed in the Neutron CI [1] In order to test with the new binary, "ebtables-nft", two new CI jobs are added to the periodic queue [2].

[1]https://github.com/openstack/neutron/blob/lad9ca56b07ffdc9f7e0bc6a6

2af61961b9128eb/roles/legacy_ebtables/tasks/main.yaml [2]https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/785144

Closes-Bug: #1922892

Related-Bug: #1508155

Closes-Bug: #1938670

neutron/tests/unit/plugins/ml2/drivers/linuxbridge/agent/test

Change-Id: I9463b000f6f63e65aaf91d60b30f6c92c01e3baf (cherry picked from commit 0a931391d8990f3e654b4bfda24ae4119c609bbf)

tags:added: in-stable-victoria

tags:added: in-stable-ussuri

OpenStack Infra (hudson-openstack) wrote on 2021-08-16: Fix merged to neutron (stable/ussuri)

Reviewed: https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/804057

mmitted: https://opendev.org/openstack/neutron/commit/f034de001ba224c 3add364ca5d00cc15e26c2e96

Submitter: "Zuul (22348)"

Branch: stable/ussuri

commit f034de001ba224c3add364ca5d00cc15e26c2e96

Author: Rodolfo Alonso Hernandez <email address hidden>

Date: Wed Apr 7 13:16:21 2021 +0000

Make ARP protection commands compatible with "ebtables-nft"

"nftables" compatible binary, "ebtables-nft", is not 100% compatible with the legacy API, as reported in LP#1922892.

This patch fixes the following issues when using "ebtables-nft" (while keeping compatibility with legacy binary):
- When a new chain is created, a default DROP rule is added at the end

- of the chain (append). This will prevent the error code 4 when the chain is listed.
- The chain rules are added at the begining of the chain (insert), before the default DROP rule. This will prioritize the port rules.
- The MAC rules are cleaned before the new ones are added. That will prevent the deletion of any new needed rule, now added after the
- The "ebtables" command will retry on error code 4. This is the error returned when the chains are listed and no rule is present in a new created chain (reporeted in LP#1922892).

This code is backwards compatible, that means it works with the legacy "ebtables" binary; this is currently installed in the Neutron CI [1]. In order to test with the new binary, "ebtables-nft", two new CI jobs are added to the periodic gueue [2].

[1]https://github.com/openstack/neutron/blob/1ad9ca56b07ffdc9f7e0bc6a6

2af61961b9128eb/roles/legacy_ebtables/tasks/main.yaml

[2]https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/785144

Nahian Chowdhury

Nate

#11

#12

Nate Johnston

Naved Ali Naved Ali Shah

Nitish

Normen Scholtke Oleg Bondarev

OpenStack Vulnera...

Ozgur Kara

Pallavi Paul Halmos

Paul Voccio

Pavani_addanki

Perry Waldner

Piyush Pathak

Pradeep Naik

Pradeep Roy Kandru

Pramod

Prateek

Prayeen Kumar SM

Prithiy

Prosunjit Biswas

Raiesh Battala

Rajesh Mohan Raju Alluri

Ralf Trezeciak

Ranjit Ray RaoFei

Ravi Chunduru

RaviM Singh

Rayman Lwo Reedip

Richa

Rick Melick

Robert Love

Rochelle Grober Rodolfo Alonso

Roman Goncharov

Ron Cannella

Rudra Rugge

Ryan Tidwell

Rvo Shi Rvu Ishimoto

SANTOSH KUMAR PAN...

ST Wang

Saisrikiran Mudig... Samuel Bercovici

Sandeep Bisht

Sapna Jadhav

Satvanaravana Pat...

Sean McCully Sehastian Luna-Va

Shawn Hartsock

Shraddha Pandhe

Shruthi Chari Shweta P

Simon

#13

Sindhu Devale

Slawek Kaplonski Somik Behera

Songhee Kang

Songlian Li Soo Choi

Sridhar Gaddam

Steve Sloka Steven Paylon

Stuart Hart

Sumit Naiksatam

Surai Deshmukh

Swaminathan Vasud.. Swaroop Jayanthi

Takashi Kaiinami

Tamas Kapolnasi

Tao Zhou

Taurus Cheung

Tavaa Med Amine

Thongth Tiago Everton Fer...

Tony Tan

Tushar Patil Uma

Vidhisha Naii

Vikas Deolaliker Vinod Kuma

Vinu Pillai

```
Closes-Bug: #1922892
   Related-Bug: #1508155
   Closes-Bug: #1938670
       neutron/tests/unit/plugins/ml2/drivers/linuxbridge/agent/test
arp_protect.py
    Change-Id: I9463b000f6f63e65aaf91d60b30f6c92c01e3baf
    (cherry picked from commit 0a931391d8990f3e654b4bfda24ae4119c609bbf)
   (cherry picked from commit fafa5dacd5057120562184a734e7345e7c0e9639)
tags:added: in-stable-train
```

OpenStack Infra (hudson-openstack) wrote on 2021-08-16: Fix merged to neutron (stable/train) #14 Reviewed: https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/804058 mmitted: https://opendev.org/openstack/neutron/commit/4245963c71280be bd94e9005230d610931a7c2df Submitter: "Zuul (22348)" Branch: stable/train mmit 4245963c71280bebd94e9005230d610931a7c2df Author: Rodolfo Alonso Hernandez <email address hidden> Date: Wed Apr 7 13:16:21 2021 +0000 Make ARP protection commands compatible with "ebtables-nft" "nftables" compatible binary, "ebtables-nft", is not 100% compatible with the legacy API, as reported in LP#1922892. This patch fixes the following issues when using "ebtables-nft" (while keeping compatibility with legacy binary): - When a new chain is created, a default DROP rule is added at the end of the chain (append). This will prevent the error code 4 when the - The chain rules are added at the begining of the chain (insert), before the default DROP rule. This will prioritize the port rules. - The MAC rules are cleaned before the new ones are added. That will prevent the deletion of any new needed rule, now added after the deletion. - The "ebtables" command will retry on error code 4. This is the error returned when the chains are listed and no rule is present in a new created chain (reporeted in LP#1922892). This code is backwards compatible, that means it works with the legacy "ebtables" binary; this is currently installed in the Neutron CI [1]. In order to test with the new binary, "ebtables-nft", two new CI jobs are added to the periodic queue [2]. [1]https://github.com/openstack/neutron/blob/lad9ca56b07ffdc9f7e0bc6a6 2af61961b9128eb/roles/legacy_ebtables/tasks/main.yaml [2]https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/neutron/+/785144 Closes-Bug: #1922892 Related-Bug: #1508155 Closes-Bug: #1938670 neutron/tests/unit/plugins/ml2/drivers/linuxbridge/agent/test arp_protect.py Change-Id: I9463b000f6f63e65aaf91d60b30f6c92c01e3baf (cherry picked from commit 0a931391d8990f3e654b4bfda24ae4119c609bbf) (cherry picked from commit fafa5dacd5057120562184a734e7345e7c0e9639)

#15 OpenStack Infra (hudson-openstack) wrote on 2021-08-17; Fix merged to ossa (master) Reviewed: https://review.opendev.org/c/openstack/ossa/+/804116 Committed: https://opendev.org/openstack/ossa/commit/5bfba3e739b9988 206a51fc564a05cc32b23a791 Submitter: "Zuul (22348)" commit 5bfba3e739b9988206a51fc564a05cc32b23a791 Author: Jeremy Stanley <email address hidden> Date: Tue Aug 10 16:41:27 2021 +0000 Add OSSA-2021-004 (CVE-2021-38598) Change-Id: T91b44e7fab3209170efd8dc594cb1b442ee48c2d Closes-Bug: #1938670 status: In Progress → Fix Released

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) on 2021-08-17

summary:- Linuxbridge ARP filter bypass on Netfilter platforms (CVE-2021-38598) + [OSSA-2021-004] Linuxbridge ARP filter bypass on Netfilter platforms + (CVE-2021-38598)

Jeremy Stanley (fungi) wrote on 2021-08-17: #16 I've distributed the advisory for this to relevant mailing lists now.

OpenStack Infra (hudson-openstack) wrote on 2021-09-10: Fix included in openstack/neutron 16.4.1

This issue was fixed in the openstack/neutron 16.4.1 release.

#18 OpenStack Infra (hudson-openstack) wrote on 2021-09-10; Fix included in openstack/neutron 17.2.1 This issue was fixed in the openstack/neutron 17.2.1 release

Slawek Kaplonski (slaweq) on 2022-04-05

Changed in neutron:

Vishal Agarwal Vivekanandan maha... Wajid Baig Xiang Hui Xiaolin Zhang Xin Zhong YAMAMOTO Takashi Yahoo! Engineerin.. Yang Yu Yapeng Wu Yi Yang Yi Yang Yogesh Mulay Yongqiang Yang Yushiro FURUKAWA Yuxin Zhuang Zahid Hasan ZhangNi Zhengwei Gao Ziv Zou Keke ammarun aprilcxn avinashsau ayyalaraju chalam... bailin.zhan balajipatnala brightson bugtracker@devshe.. bychyahoo@gmail.com chaiwat wannaposop chitu congge denghui huang devin.li diroquan dql droom eroc Jiang fei Yang galeido gsccr hideki takashima iopenstack iavchi jeff wang jiangjunyong iinpenachena iivifena iordan tardif kalim khuang korvamsi kiriti kkup lanpi lin_victor liuvang lololmarwa255 lpmqtt lzh maestropandy manish mavu mavu mershard frierson miralaunchpad monika nawawit kes pawan pawnesh kumar

ginhaizhong гаја

#17

ratalevolamena satvanaravana pat... satvanaravana pat...

sharko,cheng sivagnanam C sowmini sunil

sunilcn tangfeixiong vivek.ys

status:Confirmed → Fix Released	

To post a comment you must log in.

See full activity log

vividh siddha
wanghuagong
wushaohan
xianliangchi
xiaoningli
xreuze
yalei wang
yangbo
yanglianfeng
yangkai
yangzhenyu
yilong
yinpeijun
yongxiangwang
zhaobo
zhu zhu
zzfancy