Technical Advisory Council (TAC) Meeting

December 3, 2020

CONFIDENTIAL COMPUTING CONSORTIUM

The Confidential Computing Consortium

A community focused on open source licensed projects securing DATA IN USE & accelerating the adoption of confidential computing through open collaboration

Every member is welcome; every project meeting our criteria is welcome. We are a transparent, collaborative community.

We as members, contributors, and leaders pledge to make participation in our community a harassment-free experience for everyone.

Antitrust Policy Notice

› Linux Foundation meetings involve participation by industry competitors, and it is the intention of the Linux Foundation to conduct all of its activities in accordance with applicable antitrust and competition laws. It is therefore extremely important that attendees adhere to meeting agendas, and be aware of, and not participate in, any activities that are prohibited under applicable US state, federal or foreign antitrust and competition laws.

› Examples of types of actions that are prohibited at Linux Foundation meetings and in connection with Linux Foundation activities are described in the Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy available at http://www.linuxfoundation.org/antitrust-policy. If you have questions about these matters, please contact your company counsel, or if you are a member of the Linux Foundation, feel free to contact Andrew Updegrove of the firm of Gesmer Updegrove LLP, which provides legal counsel to the Linux Foundation.

Agenda

1. Welcome, Roll call
2. Approval of minutes
3. Action item review
4. Budget discussion – Stephen Walli
5. TAC whitepaper status
6. ~~Cross-project chat system status~~
7. Any outstanding GitHub issues / pull requests (time permitting)
8. Any other business

Roll Call of TAC Voting Representatives

Quorum requires **5** or more voting reps:

Member	**Representative**	**Email**
Accenture	Giuseppe Giordano	giuseppe.giordano@accenture.com
Ant Group	Zongmin Gu	zongmin.gzm@antgroup.com
ARM	Grant Likely / Michael	grant.likely@arm.com
Facebook	**Eric Northup** / Shankaran	digitaleric@fb.com
Google	Brandon Baker	bsb@google.com
Huawei	Zhipeng (Howard) Huang	huangzhipeng@huawei.com
Intel	Simon Johnson / Dan	simon.p.johnson@intel.com
Microsoft	Dave Thaler(*)	dthaler@microsoft.com
Red Hat/IBM	Mike Bursell / Dimitrios	mbursell@redhat.com

*TAC chair

CONFIDENTIAL COMPUTING CONSORTIUM

2. Approval of TAC Minutes from Nov. 12 telechat

https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/main/files/TAC/Meetings/2020/11-Nov/CCC%20TAC%20Minutes%202020-11-12.pdf

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the November 12, 2020 meeting of the Technical Advisory Council meeting of the Confidential Computing Consortium as distributed to the members of the TAC in advance of this meeting are hereby adopted and approved.

3. Action Item Review

1. [Mike] Ensure that a TAC budget line item for 1 Zoom account for OE SDK
2. [David Kohlbrenner/Stephano to remind] Provide a list of the licenses used by Keystone for crypto implementations, specifically to ensure that they are all OSI approved.
3. [Aeva/Mike] Create straw-person for terminology proposal
4. [Stephen] Reach out to Cat Allman regarding any details we can get on LISA21
5. [Stephano] Ensure that the links from the TAC whitepaper point to the latest version of the Outreach whitepaper
6. ~~[Stephano] Ping LF Creative to ensure that the scoping document is converted to PDF and put on the website. Link to that document from the whitepapers [DONE]~~
7. [Stephano] Look into diversity efforts at the LF and if there is a "best practices" effort underway for LF Projects
8. [Stephano] Find the costs of the chat options over the course of a year and reach out to project contacts with details on our options to get their feedback.
9. [Stephano] Bring reasonable chat options to our projects to see if they have preferences as to the chat applications we might choose from.
10. [Stephano] Stephano will send the TAC the questions from the webinar and we may possibly want to add some of these questions to the FAQ.

4. Budget Discussion

- Monthly budgets:
  https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/budget/files/Actuals/2020
- After our first year of operation, surplus ~$650K in the bank
- Big unchangeable items are G&A at ~$77K and PM services at ~$104K
- Minimal spend on travel & board meetings (~$14K) and shows ($13K)
- ~$800K Memberships
- Expected Memberships ~$700 (2021)
- ~12% down in a global pandemic, but new general members still joining

Confidential Computing Consortium	First Year Actuals	2021 Prelim Budget	2021 Assumptions
I. Marketing			
Creative Services Retainer	$3,150	$15,000	Logo design, creative templates, initial web site
Public Relations & Social Media	$0	$40,000	RethinkIt Discretionary Project Budget
TAM Report	$0	$60,000	IDC TAM Report
Event Participation and Developer Engagement	$12,898	$100,000	Events and meetups and Dev Days
Marketing Subtotal	**$16,048**	**$215,000**	
II. Legal			
Trademark Filings	$0	$10,000	
Legal Support	$0	$10,000	
Export Control	$0	$10,000	
Legal Subtotal	$0	**$30,000**	We didn't spend money on Legal last year. Hope not to this year.
III. General and Administrative			
G&A	**$101,475**	**$68,363**	The $101K is an artifact of our long first year budget
IV. Staff, Travel & Board			
Program Management	$125,000	$125,000	starting 11/1
Staff Travel	$1,803	$15,000	
Board Meetings	$12,386	$20,000	Two F2F if we get to travel in 2021.
Staff & Operations Subtotal	**$139,189**	**$160,000**	
V. Development			
Consortium IT Services and Collab Tools	$5,026	$5,700	IT Infrastructure, website hosting and security patches, jire, groups.io
Project IT Services and Collab Tools	$0	$280,000	14 Projects at $20K/project
Development Subtotal	**$5,026**	**$285,700**	
Total Expenses	$261,738	$759,063	
Membership Revenue	$860,000	$732,916	
Other Revenues	$0		
Total Revenues	$860,000	$732,916	
Budget Gap / Surplus	**$598,262**	**-$521**	

2021 Proposed Budget

- Business (G&A, PM, travel, legal, Board all similar to last year)
- Marketing (Creative services, Events, Earmark $60K for the TAM study, and earmark $40K for PR)
- Development (Calculate an IT services Collab Tools budget of $20K per project with a projection of 6 new projects in 2021)

- We finish 2021 with still most of a year surplus in the bank

Specific TAC Expense Discussion

- To date, there is a $450/month charge for collab services (covering IT Infrastructure, website hosting and security patches, jira, groups.io)
- Going forward, the Budget subcommittee will work with LF accounting to provide a budget report tab where individual services to projects will be aggregated per project

5. TAC Whitepaper status

- https://docs.google.com/document/d/17PhrIXvFJsAIJryYjpezmfdSl1BSB1x1tE2FTbriHyc/edit?ts=5ec71ac7

- Steve Riley's comments in https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/main/files/TAC/Meetings/2020/11-Nov/Confidential-Computing-Deep-Dive-white-paper_10.29.20%20-%20Gartner%20comments.pdf

CONFIDENTIAL COMPUTING
CONSORTIUM

7. Github PR's and issues (time permitting)

https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/pulls
- PR #69 (Add definition of a Growth Plan)

https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/issues
- Issue #50 (Define what a growth plan entails)
- Issue #48 (Annual project reviews)

Github IDs (PR #70)

Member	Representative	Github ID	Member	Representative	Github ID
Accenture	Giuseppe Giordano	GiuseppeGiordano	AMD	Liam Coffey	
Ant Group	Zongmin Gu	guzongmin	CYSEC	Alexandre Karlov	bassbeat
ARM	Grant Likely	glikely	Fortanix	Jethro Beekman	jethrogb
Facebook	~~Jinsong Yu~~ Eric Northup	~~jinsongyu-fb~~	Iotex	IoTex	
Google	Brandon Baker	brandonb-work	NVIDIA	Naveen Cherukuri	
Huawei	Zhipeng (Howard) Huang	hannibalhuang	R3	Roy Hopkins	roy-hopkins
Intel	Simon Johnson	spjohnso	Xilinx	Scott Schweitzer	
Microsoft	Dave Thaler	dthaler	…		
Red Hat	Mike Bursell	MikeCamel			

8. Any other business

- Future meeting topics:
    - AAA SIG proposal – January (but post proposal to list next week)
    - Enarx annual project review – January
    - SGX SDX for Linux annual project review - ??
    - Tech Talk series planning