



**TAC Conference Call – 7:00am PST
Thursday 3 December 2020**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

1.1. In Attendance

- 1.1.1. Dave Thaler (Microsoft, TAC Chair) *
- 1.1.2. Aeva Black (Microsoft)
- 1.1.3. Brandon Baker (Google)
- 1.1.4. Dan Middleton (Intel)
- 1.1.5. Grant Likely (Arm)*
- 1.1.6. Jethro Beekman (Fortanix)
- 1.1.7. Mike Bursell (Red Hat)*
- 1.1.8. Naveen Cherukuri (NVIDIA)
- 1.1.9. Roy Hopkins (R3)
- 1.1.10. Ryan Haning (Microsoft)
- 1.1.11. Seth Knox (Outreach Chair)
- 1.1.12. Shankaran (Facebook)*
- 1.1.13. Shiri Band (Cysec)
- 1.1.14. Simon Johnson (Intel) *
- 1.1.15. Stephen Walli (Microsoft)
- 1.1.16. Xinxin Fan (IoTex)
- 1.1.17. Stephano Cetola (Linux Foundation)

1.2. *voting member

2. Move to approve minutes

- 2.1. The Technical Advisory Council approves the minutes from the November 12 meeting with one abstention and no objections.

3. Action Item Review

- 3.1. [Mike] Ensure that a TAC budget line item for 1 Zoom account for OE SDK
- 3.2. [David Kohlbrenner/Stephano to remind] Please provide a list of the licenses used by Keystone for crypto implementations, specifically to ensure that they are all OSI approved.
- 3.3. [Aeva/Mike] Create straw-person for terminology proposal
 - 3.3.1. **Note:** This item should likely be tracked long-term in GitHub.
- 3.4. [Stephen] Please reach out to Cat Allman regarding any details we can get on LISA21
- 3.5. [Stephano] Ensure that the links from the TAC whitepaper point to the latest version of the outreach whitepaper.
- 3.6. ~~[Stephano] Look into diversity efforts at the LF~~
 - 3.6.1. <https://www.linuxfoundation.org/about/diversity-inclusiveness/programs/>
 - 3.6.2. <https://training.linuxfoundation.org/training/inclusive-open-source-community-orientation-lfc102/>
- 3.7. [Stephano] Find the costs of the chat options over the course of a year and reach out to project contacts with details on our options to get their feedback.
- 3.8. [Stephano] Bring reasonable chat options to our projects to see if they have preferences as to the chat applications we might choose from.

DRAFT

- 3.9. [Stephano] Send the TAC the questions from the Webinar and discuss creation / extension of a FAQ.

4. Budget Discussion

- 4.1. Monthly budgets will be made available on lists.confidentialcomputing.org and an email sent to the list when those budgets are available to everyone.
- 4.2. After year 1 we have a surplus of about 650k
- 4.3. Large spends that are repeating are LF G&A at about 9% and PM services.
- 4.4. One of our primary goals is to provide services to those projects that are under our umbrella. We will define what that looks like, but the end result we'd like to see would be project growth. In aid of that, we have currently budgeted 280k (14 projects at 20k each) for use in assisting the projects. The TAC is free to allocate funds in any way they wish, however this is a rough guide. Once this is approved, the TAC will be allowed to approve asks from within that 280k project budget. The TAC does not need to check with the board for each spend.
- 4.5. Code Scanning came up as a cost that today we are not interested in, but that will be an ongoing discussion. Part of this discussion will be understanding what the code scanning includes, and why (if at all) we should be taking advantage of this service. Steve Winslow (LF) will give a presentation at a meeting in 2021 (possibly post-FOSDEM) to explain the value here and help us make a decision.
- 4.6. The board will be voting on and approving the budget for 2021 in the December meeting. Any feedback or questions are welcome, please send them to Stephen or to the list.

5. Outreach Update – IDC TAM Report

- 5.1. IDC TAM report proposal was in line with the 60k cost we estimated. The proposal included a timeline, cost, and general output, however there were a lot of **scope** and **methodology** details not included. Seth will have a follow up meeting with them and include those who are interested. We'd also like to get a cross section of the types of vendors and questions we'd like covered. We should know more about the scope after the discussion, specifically the scope of the report (will it cover cloud, chip, hardware, software, edge, etc). We'd like to also understand the process of how they will collect the data better. Will report back on this as we progress.
- 5.2. We have sent them high level preliminary questions. General timeline would be a publication in March 2021, assuming we approve moving forward in December.
- 5.3. They plan to make this part of their general research, not just a commissioned piece. As such, in 2021 they will publish the TAM as an IDC TAM that is available to all the IDC subscribers, not just provide it to us. This gives the TAM more visibility.
- 5.4. CCC Members can license the report for a reduced cost of 5k (normally this would cost 20k-ish). As such a member would be able to reference the IDC TAM report directly (e.g. on their website) rather than having to reference the CCC publication of the report.

6. Outreach Update - Webinar

- 6.1. <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1EeK4FVgrir3zWmL1ubU9DeBeY1IXMcGLALsAW4PerYg/edit>
- 6.2. We reviewed a process for submitting and reviewing a webinar calendar. There are several guidelines and timelines in the document above. Enarx will be next to give a webinar, and Ben Fischer (Red Hat) will work with Outreach to refine this process. The TAC whitepaper would be a good example of a future webinar. Attestation would be another great subject for a future webinar.

7. Outreach Update – FOSDEM Devroom for Hardware-Aided Trusted Computing devroom

- 7.1. https://fosdem.org/2021/schedule/track/hardware_aided_trusted_computing/
- 7.2. The Devroom was approved and the CFP has been posted and runs through Dec 24th.

DRAFT

- 7.3. There was no specific ask of the CCC, however we should disseminate this information to the projects. Jethro will send the info to Dave who will post on the announcement list: <https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/announce/topics>
- 7.4. Jethro will create a text blurb and Dave will send that out on the announcement list.

8. TAC Whitepaper Updates

- 8.1. **New title:** A Technical Analysis of Confidential Computing v1.1
- 8.2. **Section 2.2:** We need more discussion around this, so no changes will be included in version 1.1. We will revisit this and include any changes in version 1.2.
- 8.3. **Section 3.1:** Remove TAC.
- 8.4. **Section 4.1:** Rewording
- 8.5. **Section 5.1:** Grammatical changes and rewording.
- 8.6. **Section 5.2:** Rewording.
- 8.7. **Section 5.3.1:** Update section number to reference the correct section.
- 8.8. **References:** Update the link to the scoping document.

9. GitHub PR & Issues

- 9.1. Issue #[50](#) (Define what a growth plan entails)
- 9.2. PR #[69](#) – The TAC should have a recommendation here for the GB. Approved and merged.
- 9.3. Anyone who has a GitHub ID they'd like to share such that we can actively participate, please send that ID to Stephano. (allows automatic notification and async communication)

10. Other Business

- 10.1. We will defer the AAA SIG proposal off until January.
- 10.2. Next meeting will be January 14th, and our schedule will continue from there on a 2 week cadence. Mike will be reporting on the Enarx annual review in January.

Action Items

1. [Stephen] Pick a date for Steve Winslow to meet with the TAC and discuss code scanning.
2. [Jethro] Create a blurb for FOSDEM to be posted to the CCC Announcement list.
3. [Dave] Post the blurb Jethro writes to the announce list.
4. [Dave] Check with the possibility of adding a doi to a future version of the whitepaper to encourage academic papers to reference our whitepapers.
5. [Stephano] Check with LF to see if doi whitepapers is something that has been done in the past.
6. [Stephano] Make the updates to the TAC whitepaper and send to LF Creative.

Meeting adjourned at 9:00 am PT on December 3, 2020. The next conference call will be scheduled for Thursday January 14, 2020.

Respectfully submitted by Stephano Cetola, Acting Secretary, on December 4, 2020.