

Technical Advisory Council (TAC) Meeting

October 21, 2021



CONFIDENTIAL COMPUTING
CONSORTIUM

The Confidential Computing Consortium

A community focused on open source licensed projects securing DATA IN USE
& accelerating the adoption of confidential computing through open collaboration

Every member is welcome; every project meeting our criteria is welcome.
We are a transparent, collaborative community.

We as members, contributors, and leaders pledge to make participation
in our community a harassment-free experience for everyone.

Antitrust Policy Notice

- › Linux Foundation meetings involve participation by industry competitors, and it is the intention of the Linux Foundation to conduct all of its activities in accordance with applicable antitrust and competition laws. It is therefore extremely important that attendees adhere to meeting agendas, and be aware of, and not participate in, any activities that are prohibited under applicable US state, federal or foreign antitrust and competition laws.
- › Examples of types of actions that are prohibited at Linux Foundation meetings and in connection with Linux Foundation activities are described in the Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy available at <http://www.linuxfoundation.org/antitrust-policy>. If you have questions about these matters, please contact your company counsel, or if you are a member of the Linux Foundation, feel free to contact Andrew Updegrove of the firm of Gesmer Updegrove LLP, which provides legal counsel to the Linux Foundation.

Agenda

1. Welcome, Roll call, Introduce any first-time attendees
2. Approval of minutes
3. Action item review
4. Updates from Outreach committee
5. 2022 Budget planning
6. CCC security reports and VMT process
7. Common Terminology
8. Upcoming TAC Tech Talk schedule
9. TAC Tech Talk: Protecting Critical Infrastructure
10. Any other business

Roll Call, and Introductions

Quorum requires **5** or more voting reps:

<u>Member</u>	<u>Representative</u>	<u>Email</u>
Accenture	Giuseppe Giordano	giuseppe.giordano@accenture.com
Ant Group	Zongmin Gu	zongmin.gzm@antgroup.com
ARM	Thomas Fossati / Michael	thomas.fossati@arm.com
Facebook	Eric Northup / Shankaran	digitaleric@fb.com
Google	Iulia Ion	iuliaion@google.com
Huawei	Zhipeng (Howard) Huang	huangzhipeng@huawei.com
Intel	Dan Middleton / Simon	dan.middleton@intel.com
Microsoft	Dave Thaler(*)	dthaler@microsoft.com
Red Hat/IBM	Lily Sturmann / Dimitrios	lsturman@redhat.com

**TAC chair*

2. Approval of TAC Minutes from Oct. 7 telechat

<https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/main/files/TAC/Meetings/2021/10-Oct/TAC%20Minutes%202021-07-10.pdf>

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the Oct. 7, 2021 meeting of the Technical Advisory Council meeting of the Confidential Computing Consortium as distributed to the members of the TAC in advance of this meeting are hereby adopted and approved.

3. Action Item Review

1. [Stephen] Chat with LF legal counsel to inform the process in place to establish a Vulnerability Management Team
2. [Ashley] Reach out to project mentors to confirm potential security contacts for each current and upcoming project
3. [Project Mentors] Recommend diversity and inclusion trainings to their projects and report back to the TAC on whether the maintainers or the contributors will be taking it and when the expected completion date is
4. [Thomas H/Eric V] Support text creation for VM terminology
5. [Dave/Ashley] Reach out to project mentors to schedule annual reviews for projects
6. [Ashley/Brian] Update CCC technical documentation to include internship policy as a project benefit
7. [Steve] Provide list of definitions from Anjuna glossary of terms to present at the next TAC meeting
8. [Ashley] Seek clarity on the process for recommending projects to participate in industry events. Should the outreach suggest this or are project mentors responsible for notifying their projects?
9. [Nick] Bring topic of discussion to the outreach for a newsletter focused on project updates
10. [Brian] create mailing list linuxcollab@confidentialcomputing.io

Project	Proposed by	TAC Approved	Tech. Charter	IP Assigned	Board Presentation	Board Approved	Annual Review	Mentor	Webinar
Enarx	Red Hat	31 OCT 2019	Yes	Yes	31 OCT 2019	Yes	14 JAN 2021	Mike Bursell	JAN 2021
OE SDK	Microsoft	31 OCT 2019	Yes	Yes	31 OCT 2019	Yes	12 NOV 2020	Dave Thaler	MAR 2021
SGX SDK for Linux	Intel	31 OCT 2019			31 OCT 2019			(Simon Johnson)	
TCF	Intel	28 MAY 2020							
Gramine	UNC Chapel Hill	2 APR 2020	Yes	Yes	(Nov 2021?)	15 SEP 2021	(4 NOV 2021?)	Eric	FEB 2021 (DEC 2021?)
Keystone	UC Berkeley	23 JUL 2020	Yes	Yes	24 JUN 2021	MAR 2021		Stephen	JUN 2021
Occlum	Ant Financial	20 AUG 2020	Yes	Yes	10 SEP 2020	15 SEP 2021		Zongmin	MAY 2021
Veracruz	Arm	3 SEP 2020	Yes	Yes	19 NOV 2020	14 APR 2021		Grant & Mike	APR 2021
CCC- Attestation	TAC	Yes	Yes	N/A	18 MAR 2021	18 MAR 2021		Dan & Aeva	(Veraison – NOV 18?)

4. Updates from Outreach Committee

- How to make announcements for project milestones
 - What milestones are significant? (project acceptance? Version release? Etc.)
 - Avenues for announcements
 - Press release? CCC blog? Newsletter?
 - Example: Blog when Gramine released v1.0
 - <https://confidentialcomputing.io/2021/10/08/gramine-1-0-release/>

5. 2022 Budget Planning

- Reminder of TAC Resources available to projects on request:
 - Zoom account
 - Outreachy intern
 - LF License Scanning
 - Email list hosting
 - Channel in cross-project slack
 - LF Creative, e.g. logo creation
 - Chat service (open question)?
- Dev Summit came out of the Outreach budget
- Outreach intern previously in Outreach budget, but should move to TAC budget
- Stephen Walli writes:
 - “We are not spending a lot of money on project services, but (remembering that a budget is a planning document) it is worth keeping that plan of \$20K/project x 14 projects is not a horrible plan. (We are at 6 projects with a couple inbound. Planning for a large number of inbound project growth means you still have money to move around within the current projects.)”

5. 2022 Budget Planning

V. Development	2021	2021 Forecast	Jan-Aug '21	Remainder	2022 prelim
License Scanning	\$10,000	\$10,000	\$6,000	\$4,000	\$12,000
Consortium IT Services and Collab Tools	\$270,000	\$50,000	\$0	\$270,000	\$200,000
IT Services and Collab Tools	\$5,700	\$3,864	\$3,352	\$2,348	\$3,864
Hosting and other costs	\$0	\$10,000	\$0	\$10,000	\$10,000
Development Subtotal	\$285,700	\$73,864	\$9,352	\$286,348	\$225,864

6. CCC security reports and VMT process

- Gramine requested a mailing list for vulnerability disclosures across projects, internal to the CCC
- Existing VMT subteam to propose process: Aeva, Dan, Jethro, and Eric
- Subteam has been discussing offline, do we have a proposal for the TAC?

7. Establishing common terminology (issue #79)

Github Issue:

- <https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/issues/79>

Doc in progress:

- <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1xZ6IX0w0jaWDbLMFNAybTF3FpLnQ5TJ98nziWbsbFnY/edit#>

Anjuna document?

AWS Perspective on Confidential Computing

- <https://aws.amazon.com/blogs/security/confidential-computing-an-aws-perspective>
- “We’ve observed that this phrase is being applied to various technologies that solve very different problems, leading to confusion about what it actually means. With the mission of innovating on behalf of our customers, we want to offer you our perspective on confidential computing.
- At AWS, we define confidential computing as **the use of specialized hardware and associated firmware to protect customer code and data during processing from outside access. ...**”

8. Future TAC Tech Talk topics

- Annual Project Review: Keystone
- Annual Project Review: Occlum
- Annual Project Review: Veracruz
- TCG POV on CC? – Henk Birkholz?
- OP-TEE from TrustedFirmware.org
- Hacktoberfest? – Nick?
- Rust Hypervisor firmware: <https://github.com/cloud-hypervisor/rust-hypervisor-firmware>
- Protecting Critical Infrastructure – Dave
- Homomorphic Encryption + Confidential Computing – suggested by Outreach
- IETF Trusted Execution Environment Provisioning (TEEP) work - Dave

9. TAC Tech Talk

10. Any other business

Reminder: annual chair election starts next month

- TUE Nov 9, 2021: Call for nominations opens
- TUE Nov 16, 2021: Call for nominations closes
- WED Nov 17, 2021: Voting period opens
- WED Nov 24, 2021: Voting period closes
- TUE Nov 30, 2021: Election results announced