

Technical Advisory Council (TAC) Meeting

March 10, 2022

This meeting is being recorded.



**CONFIDENTIAL COMPUTING
CONSORTIUM**

The Confidential Computing Consortium

A community focused on open source licensed projects securing DATA IN USE & accelerating the adoption of confidential computing through open collaboration

Every member is welcome; every project meeting our criteria is welcome.
We are a transparent, collaborative community.

We as members, contributors, and leaders pledge to make participation in our community a harassment-free experience for everyone.

Antitrust Policy Notice

- › Linux Foundation meetings involve participation by industry competitors, and it is the intention of the Linux Foundation to conduct all of its activities in accordance with applicable antitrust and competition laws. It is therefore extremely important that attendees adhere to meeting agendas, and be aware of, and not participate in, any activities that are prohibited under applicable US state, federal or foreign antitrust and competition laws.
- › Examples of types of actions that are prohibited at Linux Foundation meetings and in connection with Linux Foundation activities are described in the Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy available at <http://www.linuxfoundation.org/antitrust-policy>. If you have questions about these matters, please contact your company counsel, or if you are a member of the Linux Foundation, feel free to contact Andrew Updegrave of the firm of Gesmer Updegrave LLP, which provides legal counsel to the Linux Foundation.

Agenda

1. Welcome, Roll call, Introduce any first-time attendees
2. Approval of minutes
3. Action item review
4. TAC Tech Talk: Overview of TCG confidential computing
5. Enarx annual review
6. Common Terminology
7. Updates from Outreach Committee
8. Review of issues/PRs
9. Any other business

Roll Call, and Introductions of new attendees

Quorum requires **5** or more voting reps:

<u>Member</u>	<u>Representative</u>	<u>Email</u>
Accenture	Giuseppe Giordano	giuseppe.giordano@accenture.com
Ant Group	Zongmin Gu / Tate	zongmin.gzm@antgroup.com
ARM	Thomas Fossati / Michael	thomas.fossati@arm.com
Facebook	Eric Northup / Shankaran	digitaleric@fb.com
Google	Iulia Ion	iuliaion@google.com
Huawei	Zhipeng (Howard) Huang	huangzhipeng@huawei.com
Intel	Dan Middleton / Simon	dan.middleton@intel.com
Microsoft	Dave Thaler(*)	dthaler@microsoft.com
Red Hat/IBM	Lily Sturmann / Dimitrios	lsturman@redhat.com

**TAC chair*

Approval of TAC Minutes

https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/blob/update-2021-12-16-minutes/TAC/Meetings/2021/2021-12-16/CCC_TAC_Minutes-2021-12-16.pdf

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the Dec. 16, 2021 meeting of the Technical Advisory Council meeting of the Confidential Computing Consortium as distributed to the members of the TAC in advance of this meeting are hereby adopted and approved.

Approval of TAC Minutes

https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/blob/minutes-2022-02-10/TAC/Meetings/2022/2022-02-10/CCC_TAC_Minutes-2022-02-10.md

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the February 10, 2022 meeting of the Technical Advisory Council meeting of the Confidential Computing Consortium as distributed to the members of the TAC in advance of this meeting are hereby adopted and approved.

Approval of TAC Minutes

https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/blob/minutes-2022-02-24/TAC/Meetings/2022/2022-02-24/CCC_TAC_Minutes-2022-02-24.md

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the February 24, 2022 meeting of the Technical Advisory Council meeting of the Confidential Computing Consortium as distributed to the members of the TAC in advance of this meeting are hereby adopted and approved.

Action Item Review

1. **[Stephen, Zongmin]** Recommend diversity and inclusion training to their projects and report back to the TAC on whether the maintainers or the contributors will be taking it and when the expected completion date is.
 - Open Enclave maintainers are close to 100% trained (Dave Thaler)
 - Veracruz lead has taken the course (Thomas Fossati).
 - Please report back that project maintainers have been made aware of the training, and have been asked to take it.
2. **[Stephen Walli, Dan Middleton, Aeva Black]** Develop a CoC escalation process, to be presented to TAC and governing board. (done)
3. **[Brian Warner]** Investigate prior efforts to finalize Graduated lifecycle language, and if needed file an issue to finalize Graduated lifecycle language.
4. **[Brian Warner]** Update the Google Sheet containing the [list of CCC dependencies](#) with the changed dependencies noted in the project review document. (done)
5. **[Brian Warner]** Add Enarx annual review to the agenda for March 10th TAC meeting. (done)
6. **[Brian Warner]** Add slide to this deck reminding the TAC to review PRs and issues, time permitting. (done)
7. **[Dan Middleton]** Work with CCC Attestation to schedule annual review, tentatively for March 24, 2022.
8. **[Brian Warner]** Schedule a deep-dive into LFX code scanning for April 21, 2022. (done)
9. **[Dave Thaler]** Open an issue requesting someone sync project benefits slides to the repo.

Project	Proposed by	TAC Approved	Tech. Charter	IP Assigned	Board Presentation	Board Approved	Annual Review	Mentor	Webinar
Enarx	Red Hat	31 OCT 2019	Yes	Yes	31 OCT 2019	Yes	14 JAN 2021	Mike Bursell	JAN 2021
OE SDK	Microsoft	31 OCT 2019	Yes	Yes	31 OCT 2019	Yes	24 FEB 2022	Dave Thaler	MAR 2021
Gramine	UNC Chapel Hill	2 APR 2020	Yes	Yes	1 DEC 2021	15 SEP 2021	4 NOV 2021	Eric V	FEB 2022
Keystone	UC Berkeley	23 JUL 2020	Yes	Yes	24 JUN 2021	MAR 2021	13 JAN 2022	Stephen	JUN 2021
Occlum	Ant Financial	20 AUG 2020	Yes	Yes	10 SEP 2020	15 SEP 2021	2 DEC 2021	Zongmin	MAY 2021
Veracruz	Arm	3 SEP 2020	Yes	Yes	19 NOV 2020	14 APR 2021	18 NOV 2021	Thomas F	APR 2021
CCC-Attestation	TAC	Yes	Yes	N/A	18 MAR 2021	18 MAR 2021		Dan & Aeva	
Veraison	Arm	4 FEB 2022			MAR 2022?			Howard Huang	NOV 2021

TAC Tech Talk: Henk Birkholz

Enarx Annual Review

Enarx project review documents:

<https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/tree/main/TAC/Meetings/2022/2022-03-10>

Establishing common terminology (issue #79)

Github Issue:

- <https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/issues/79>

Doc in progress:

- <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1xZ6lX0w0jaWDbLMFNaybTF3FpLnQ5TJ98nzIWbsbFnY/edit#>

Anjuna glossary slides from last meeting:

- <https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/main/files/TAC/Meetings/2021/11-Nov/AnjunaDefinitions.pdf>

Updates from Outreach Committee

- Webinar: “The Hard Facts About Confidential Computing: Understanding Hardware’s Role in Delivering a New Level of Data Security”
 - March 15 @ 8a PDT ([register](#))
- Mentorship discussion and coordination
- Events - Which events can we afford **and** staff? What do projects want?
- Analysts - Which analysts should we prioritize?
- Website planning subteam will begin meeting again

Any other business

Date	CCC Project Review	TAC Tech Talk
10 MAR 2022	Enarx annual review	TCG work on Confidential Computing - Henk
24 MAR 2022	skip	skip
7 APR 2022	CCC-Attestation	Confidential computing from the perspective of the network – Penglin & Eric V.
21 APR		Code Scanning via LFX Security - Shubhra Kar and David Deal (Linux Foundation), confirmed

List of suggested future topics

- Rust Hypervisor firmware: <https://github.com/cloud-hypervisor/rust-hypervisor-firmware> - Dan to provide contact
- IETF Trusted Execution Environment Provisioning (TEEP) work – Dave
- Logging and error reporting in confidential computing – Mike B.

Time permitting: Review of open issues and PRs

Current open issues in the Governance repo:

<https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/issues>

Current open PRs in the Governance repo:

<https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/pulls>

Reference: CCC project benefits

CCC projects have access to a number of benefits:

- Up to \$7,500 in budget for hardware and software per year.
- Funding for one Outreachy intern.
- TAC mentor assigned to the project.
- Collaboration tools (contact operations@confidentialcomputing.io):
 - Zoom
 - Domain registration and renewals
 - Mailing lists
 - YouTube playlists
- Optional security scanning
- LFX tools (<https://lfx.linuxfoundation.org>).

Reference: CCC project expectations

CCC projects are expected to:

- Participate actively in CCC activities (webinars, newsletters, events, etc.).
- Notify the TAC and Outreach committees of relevant news.
- Participate in an [annual review with the TAC](#).
- Inform the TAC when [dependencies change so records can be updated](#).
- Maintainers should take the Linux Foundation's free [Inclusive Open Source Community Orientation](#) training course.
- Transfer trademarks and domain registrations to the Linux Foundation

Deferred topics

Code Scanning from the LF

Recap:

- **Intake Scan:** High level scan with an emphasis on finding all open source licenses present in the codebase, and some third party dependencies. We provide a summary report listing the licenses found, including any copyleft licenses and potential license conflicts. We do NOT examine every match to a potential license, and we do NOT provide a detailed file inventory showing where the license matches occur. In order to do any follow up or recurring scans, a full baseline scan will be necessary first.
- **Baseline Scan:** Full scan, where every license match is examined. A detailed report is provided including a complete file inventory for every license match, and detailed findings for any copyleft license or other potential license issues found. This can potentially take significantly longer than an intake scan, depending on the size of the codebase. The baseline scan results are stored and are available for doing incremental / recurring periodic scans.

Scanning

Completed FOSSology scans (as of Sept. 16)

- Open Enclave SDK
- Enarx

Process for initiating a scan and getting access to results:

- Please ask an LF staffer, who will work with Legal to schedule the scan and distribute the results to core project participants.