DRAFT

CONFIDENTIAL COMPUTING CONSORTIUM

TAC Conference Call – 7:00am PST
Thursday 27 January 2022

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

- AD
- Aeva Black (Microsoft)
- Ashley Weltz (Linux Foundation)
- BF
- Brian Warner (Linux Foundation)
- Dan Middleton (Intel)*
- Dave Thaler (Microsoft, TAC Chair)*
- Dmitrii Kuvaiskii
- Eric Voit (Cisco)
- Henk Birkholtz (Fraunhofer SIT)
- Ionut Mihalcea
- Jeff Borek (IBM)
- Jiang Liu
- Julian Hall (ARM)
- Lily Sturmann (Red Hat/IBM)*
- Marc Meunier (ARM)
- Matthieu Legré (Cysec)
- Mike Bursell (Enarx)
- Naveen Cherukuri (Nvidia)
- Nick Vidal (Profian)
- Penglin Yang (Enarx)
- Pradeep (IBM)
- Ran Lifshitz (HUB Security)
- Ravi Sahita (Rivos)
- Samuel Ortiz (Kata Containers)
- Shalom Shefa (Cisco)
- Simon Frost
- Simon Johnson (Intel)
- Steve Van Lare (Anjuna)
- Thomas Fossati (ARM)*
- Xinxin Fan (IoTeX)
- Yogesh Deshpande

*voting member

2. Move to approve minutes (Deferred to email)

2.1. The Technical Advisory Council deferred the vote on the minutes from December 16, 2021 and January 13, 2022.

3. Action Item Review

3.1. **[Mike, Eric, Stephen, Zongmin, Thomas F.]** Recommend diversity and inclusion training to their projects and report back to the TAC on whether the maintainers or the contributors will be taking it and when the expected completion date is. **[IN PROGRESS]**

3.1.1. Dave Thaler noted that OpenEnclave maintainers are close to 100% trained.

3.1.2. Thomas Fossati noted that the Veracruz lead has taken the course.

3.1.3. Dave Thaler noted that the TAC would like each project lead to report back that project maintainers have been made aware of the training, and have been asked to take it.

3.2. **[Nathaniel]** Identify a definition that Enarx can fit into on the Common Terminology document and define what is the smallest unit (such as confidential computation). **[DONE]**

3.2.1. Completed, per Nathaniel

3.3. **[Steve]** Define a term that is wider than only protecting data.

3.3.1. Discussion ensued. To be moved to the Common Terminology slide.

3.4. **[Ashley]** Add link to LFX in the meeting minutes. **[DONE]**

3.4.1. Completed, per Ashley

3.5. **[Brian]** Share process for Linux Foundation license scanning with Keystone project.

3.6. **[Thomas F., Mike B.]** Attestation SIG co-chairs to discuss / clarify goals

3.7. **[Eric Voit]** Diagram and description on slide 3 of common terminology presentation to be added to the whitepaper draft

3.8. **[Dave]** Schedule Open Enclave annual review

3.9. **[ALL]** Review, comment and/or correct text in Common Terminology Document: https://docs.google.com/document/d/1xZ6IX0w0jaWDbLMFNAybTF3FpLnQ5TJ98nzIWbsbFnY/edit **[IN PROGRESS]**

4. TAC Tech Talk OP-TEE & Trusted Services - Julian Hall

4.1. Dave Thaler noted that multiple CCC projects work with OP-TEE and have a dependency upon it. It is in CCC's best interest to ensure a close relationship with OP-TEE.

4.2. Julian Hall provided an overview of OP-TEE and the Trusted Services Project, both of which are TrustedFirmware.org projects.

5. Veraison New Project Submission

5.1. Simon Frost presented on Project Veraison. As this is a submission presentation, he gave a brief introduction. More detail is available in the Veraison webinar.

5.2. Dave Thaler noted that the goal was to review the submission template and vote, but that this will be deferred to email due to not reaching quorum.

5.3. The goal of Veraison is to establish that a TEE is trustworthy by ensuring an attestation report is valid. The project's goal is to perform all operations while being itself trustworthy.

5.4. The project is active, and is running openly. Public meetings are attracting interest beyond the core team.

5.5. Questions:

5.5.1. Dave Thaler: Is it easy to add another module?

5.5.1.1. Simon: Yes, it is designed to be pluggable.

5.6. Template review:

5.6.1. Simon reviewed the Veraison submission template.

5.6.2. Simon noted that the core team is currently small but looking to expand as the project grows.

5.6.3. Simon confirmed the project will comply with all CCC policies.

5.6.4. The list of dependencies is attached to the submission package

5.6.5. The Code of Conduct is published in the GitHub repo.

5.7. Dave Thaler reviewed resources available to CCC projects on request

5.7.1. Up to $7,500 of hardware for maintainers or CI

5.7.2. One Outreachy intern

5.7.3. License scanning from the Linux Foundation

5.8. Dave Thaler requested votes from currently attending voting members, with the remainder to respond on the list

5.8.1. In favor: Thomas Fossati (ARM), Dave Thaler (Microsoft)

6. Updates from Attestation SIG

6.1. Mike Bursell provided an update, requesting additional help with chairing the meetings and increased participation in the SIG.

6.2. He suggested a discussion among co-chairs to evaluate how to make tangible progress on deliverables, as well as to discern who the work is for.

6.3. Dave Thaler noted that an annual review will be scheduled within the next few months.

6.3.1. It would be helpful to have these questions addressed prior to the review.

6.4. Dave Thaler asked if the goal is for the SIG to produce code

6.4.1. Dan Middleton noted that the ultimate goal is to provide code, but prior to that the goal was to understand use cases and ontology.

6.5. ACTION: Attestation SIG co-chairs to discuss / clarify goals (Thomas Fossati, Mike Bursell)

7. Updates from Outreach Committee

7.1. Ashley Weltz noted that the newsletter will be distributed today.

8. Establishing Common Terminology

8.1. Eric Voit reviewed prior discussion on common terminology.

8.2. Eric provided a review of the current definitions, and provided detailed context.

8.3. Dave Thaler requested that the slides be uploaded to a public repo, and requested confirmation to use the diagram on slide 3 in the whitepaper.

8.3.1. Eric confirmed it can be used.

8.3.2. ACTION: Diagram and description on slide 3 to be added to the whitepaper draft (Eric Voit)

8.4. Discussion ensued over end-goals.

8.5. Github Issue:

8.5.1. https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/issues/79

8.6. Doc in progress:

8.6.1. https://docs.google.com/document/d/1xZ6IX0w0jaWDbLMFNAybTF3FpLnQ5TJ98nzIWbsbFnY/edit#

8.7. Anjuna's slides

8.7.1. https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/main/files/TAC/Meetings/2021/11-Nov/AnjunaDefinitions.pdf

9. Any other Business

9.1. Backups of project repos

9.1.1. Mike Bursell asked if there is a facility to back up projects including repos, issues, wikis, etc. Brian Warner had noted the LF does not offer this as a service.

9.1.2. There are commercial solutions for this. This might be something to spend money on.

9.1.3. Dan Middleton asked if GitHub has availability guarantees.

9.1.4. Mike clarified that he's concerned about data being lost if projects are corrupted or deleted.

9.1.5. Scope is beyond Enarx.

9.1.6. Discussion will continue on the mailing list.

9.2. Upcoming reviews
 9.2.1. Nick Vidal giving a tech talk on mentorships
9.3. Dave Thaler thanked Ashley Weltz for her work in the community in support of CCC.
9.4. LFX Platform
 9.4.1. https://lfx.linuxfoundation.org/

Action Items:
Attestation SIG co-chairs to discuss / clarify goals (Thomas Fossati, Mike Bursell)
Diagram and description on slide 3 to be added to the whitepaper draft (Eric Voit)

Recording link:
https://zoom.us/rec/share/yd9UZzxHPmyk2Y8dW2NylXcwXsklsDGUIbP5UbMgqGqTA67xgZtIO
G9zmZG0MGgd.q3tga695GYyD31mh?startTime=1643295409000

Meeting adjourned at 9:00am PST on January 27, 2022. The next conference call is scheduled for Thursday February 10, 2022 at 7am PST.