

Technical Advisory Council (TAC) Meeting

October 29, 2020



CONFIDENTIAL COMPUTING
CONSORTIUM

The Confidential Computing Consortium

A community focused on open source licensed projects securing DATA IN USE
& accelerating the adoption of confidential computing through open collaboration

Every member is welcome; every project meeting our criteria is welcome.
We are a transparent, collaborative community.

We as members, contributors, and leaders pledge to make participation
in our community a harassment-free experience for everyone.

Antitrust Policy Notice

- › Linux Foundation meetings involve participation by industry competitors, and it is the intention of the Linux Foundation to conduct all of its activities in accordance with applicable antitrust and competition laws. It is therefore extremely important that attendees adhere to meeting agendas, and be aware of, and not participate in, any activities that are prohibited under applicable US state, federal or foreign antitrust and competition laws.
- › Examples of types of actions that are prohibited at Linux Foundation meetings and in connection with Linux Foundation activities are described in the Linux Foundation Antitrust Policy available at <http://www.linuxfoundation.org/antitrust-policy>. If you have questions about these matters, please contact your company counsel, or if you are a member of the Linux Foundation, feel free to contact Andrew Updegrove of the firm of Gesmer Updegrove LLP, which provides legal counsel to the Linux Foundation.

Agenda

1. Welcome, Roll call
2. Approval of minutes
3. Action item review
4. Open Source Summit/TAC whitepaper next steps
5. Dev room at FOSDEM 2021
6. Attestation SIG proposal
7. Areas of CCC Focus for Year #2
8. Annual chair election process
9. Any outstanding GitHub issues / pull requests (time permitting)
10. Any other business

Roll Call of TAC Voting Representatives

Quorum requires **5** or more voting reps:

<u>Member</u>	<u>Representative</u>	<u>Email</u>
Accenture	Giuseppe Giordano	giuseppe.giordano@accenture.com
Ant Group	Zongmin Gu	zongmin.gzm@antgroup.com
ARM	Grant Likely / Michael	grant.likely@arm.com
Facebook	Jinsong Yu / Shankaran	jinsongyu@fb.com
Google	Brandon Baker	bsb@google.com
Huawei	Zhipeng (Howard) Huang	huangzhipeng@huawei.com
Intel	Simon Johnson	simon.p.johnson@intel.com
Microsoft	Dave Thaler(*)	dthaler@microsoft.com
Red Hat/IBM	Mike Bursell / Dimitrios	mbursell@redhat.com

**TAC chair*

2. Approval of TAC Minutes from Oct. 15 telechat

<https://lists.confidentialcomputing.io/g/main/files/TAC/Meetings/2020/10-Oct/CCC%20TAC%20Minutes%202020-10-15.pdf>

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the October 15, 2020 meeting of the Technical Advisory Council meeting of the Confidential Computing Consortium as distributed to the members of the TAC in advance of this meeting are hereby adopted and approved.

3. Action Item Review

1. [Mike] Ensure that a TAC budget line item for 1 Zoom account for OE SDK
2. [David Kohlbrenner/Stephano to remind] Please provide a list of the licenses used by Keystone for crypto implementations, specifically to ensure that they are all OSI approved.
3. [Stephano] Ping Mike if we can't redirect Enarx mailing list
4. [Aeva/Mike] Create straw-person for terminology proposal
5. [Stephen] Please reach out to Cat Allman regarding any details we can get on LISA21
6. [Stephano] Set up a vote for a chat system
7. [Seth/Stephano] Discuss how to properly version the whitepaper with the Outreach committee and ensure that the links from the TAC whitepaper point to the latest version.
8. [Brandon] Provide a document on the formalization of the attestation interoperability working group, define scope, output criteria, goals, etc. [ON AGENDA]

4. Open Source Summit/TAC whitepaper next steps

- Report on booth experiences
- Whitepaper PDF was posted on website for OSS
- Use [original TAC whitepaper location](#) for future edits
- Title suggestions:
 - [Current] Confidential Computing Deep Dive
 - [Stephano] An In-Depth Analysis of Confidential Computing
 - [Seth] A Technical Analysis of Confidential Computing
- Convert scoping.md to PDF and update reference URL in whitepaper

5. Dev room at FOSDEM 2021

- <https://fosdem.org/2021/> is February 6-7
- Last year someone else ran a confidential computing Dev Room
 - https://archive.fosdem.org/2020/schedule/track/hardware_aided_trusted_computing/
- Unknown(?) whether one already scheduled, deadline for proposal is Friday
- Outreach discussed options:
 - a) combining efforts if someone else already running
 - b) could we get sufficient people (10+) if we had to propose one ourselves?

6. Attestation SIG proposal

Notes from last meeting:

- 5.7. Brandon will provide a document for folks to review that will go into more detail on the formalization of this working group, define scope, output criteria, goals, and to provide some accountability to the TAC about the output.
- 5.8. One of the goals of the working group would be to look at standards like IETF RATS and would be scoped narrowly to interoperability in terms of attestation only.
- 5.9. More info coming on the ML and discussions at the next TAC meeting.

7. Areas of CCC Focus for Year #2

1. Cross-project coordination/communication
 - Cross-project chat (e.g., attestation channel)
2. Cross-org coordination
 - Standards orgs (IETF, GlobalPlatform, TCG, FIDO, HomomorphicEncryption.org, ...)
 - Government agencies (NIST, BSI, ...)
 - Open source orgs (CNCF, TrustedFirmware.org, Open Compute Project (OCP), ...)
3. Additional collateral (whitepaper, terminology, talks)
4. Demos and tech talks in TAC meetings
5. Community development & DCI (diversity, civility, inclusion), see email thread

Tech Talks

- Comparables:
 - TrustedFirmware.org has every-other-week open “Tech Forum” meetings
 - <https://www.trustedfirmware.org/meetings/tf-a-technical-forum/>
 - https://developer.trustedfirmware.org/w/tf_a/tf-a-tech-forum-scheduling/
 - Internet Architecture Board has ~monthly invited “tech chat” talks to educate the board
 - ...

8. Annual chair election process

- Charter:
 - *“The TAC will be responsible for ... electing **annually** a chairperson to preside over meetings, set the agenda for meetings, ensure meeting minutes are taken and who will also serve on the Governing Board as the TAC’s representative (the “TAC Representative”),”*
 - *“The TAC representatives will elect a chair to preside over meetings, ensure minutes are taken and drive the TAC agenda with input from the TAC representatives.”*
- Nominees must be TAC members but need not be *voting* members
- We have also had a vice-chair to act as chairperson in the absence of the chair
- Leadership is listed at <https://confidentialcomputing.io/leadership/>

Annual Chair Election Timeline

- Timeline last year:
 - FRI Nov 8, 2019: Call for nominations opened
 - THU Nov 14, 2019: Call for nominations closed
 - WED Nov 20, 2019: Voting period opened, via Condorcet Internet Voting Service
 - WED Nov 27, 2019: Voting period closed
 - TUE Dec 3, 2019: Election results announced
- Since election is done “annually” propose using similar timeline this year
- Maybe something like this?
 - FRI Nov 6, 2019: Call for nominations opens
 - THU Nov 12, 2020: Call for nominations closes
 - WED Nov 18, 2020: Voting period opens
 - WED Nov 25, 2020: Voting period closes
 - TUE Dec 1, 2020: Election results announced

9. Github PR's and issues (time permitting)

<https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/pulls>

<https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/issues>

- PR #[50](#) (Define what a growth plan entails)

10. Any other business