



**Technical Advisory Council Conference Call – 7:00am PST
Thursday 6 February 2020**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

a. Members of the Technical Advisory Council

- i. Stephen Walli (Microsoft)
- ii. Dave Thaler (Microsoft)* Chair
- iii. Aeva van der Veen (Microsoft)
- iv. Grant Likely (Arm)*
- v. John Haxby (Oracle)*
- vi. Mike Bursell (Red Hat)*
- vii. Simon Johnson (Intel)*
- viii. Howard Huang – (Huawei)*
- ix. Brandon Baker (Google)*
- x. Jinsong Yu (Facebook)*
- xi. Dan Middleton (Intl)
- xii. Gorav Arora (Thales)
- xiii. Seth Knox (Outreach chair)
- xiv. Jethro Beekman (Fortanix)
- xv. Richard Searle (Fortanix)
- xvi. Faiyaz Shahpurwala (Fortanix)
- xvii. Stephano Cetola (Linux Foundation)

b. Not in attendance

- i. Xiaoning Li – (Alibaba)*

*voting member

2. Agenda Items & Motions

- a. The council approves the minutes of the January 23rd meeting.
- b. Stephano is working on an inquiry form for the website. Updates forthcoming.
- c. Scoping discussion: Analysts
 - i. Stephano will move the files for outreach to “main” and send a link.
 - ii. Analyst outreach: We’re working to influence Gartner to help guide their definitions by meeting to discuss confidential computing. They are not familiar with the CCC, so the first stage is defining our group and scope for them. They are also interested in the current state of “confidential computing support” by cloud providers. Finally, they would like as many examples of “real-world” use of confidential computing.
 - iii. When speaking with analyst, we speak as representatives of the consortium. However, it is useful for us to also be able to speak to our own corporations as well. We will document this concept.
- d. Scoping discussion: Definitions
 - i. The document is available online:
 - 1. <https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/blob/master/scoping.md>

DRAFT

- ii. All, please read through this document as you have time, specifically the fine-grained questions (scoping.md section 2)
- iii. One key point when asking these questions is “how does a project **promote** the use of confidential general-purpose computing”. Please note we are changing from “**enable**” as discussed in previous minutes to “**promote**”.
- iv. Root of trust: Without some form of attestation, it does not fulfill our definition of confidential computing. Also, the actual method for protection and isolation guarantee confidentiality/integrity. Those methods must be hardware assisted; however, we must be careful not to become too granular. The TCB must be described so that we know the limitations of the system.
- v. Hardware backed vs purely algorithmic: Algorithmic seems outside the scope of what we’ve done so far, unless there is something servicing the hardware TEEs. We have a rough consensus view where we “promote the use of hardware backed (or rooted) technologies”.
- vi. We should have an executive summary as the “recommendation of the TAC” at the top, before the introduction. The point here is that we’ve been asked to develop a recommendation and we should put that front-and-center in our documentation.
- e. Homomorphic Encryption Workshop
 - i. There is a workshop today and we will be presenting to them.
 - ii. We should invite them to RSA sessions and can invite them to the F2F. Stephen is working on room size and will report back on the situation there. If we can guarantee space, we can invite more people.
 - iii. Some editing was done on the slides we will present to the workshop.
- f. GitHub: Pull request review
 - i. Two question: Do we merge pull request before or after review? Do we use issues for conversations? We should use issues for things that do not have pull requests. We should make use of date-based tags for versions that we consider “known good states” for documents. We need 2 approvers for merging pull requests.
- g. F2F / Next meeting
 - i. If we meet on the 20th Jethro will be temp chair (to be confirmed). We will pencil that in and cancel if no agenda items come up.
 - ii. Location for the F2F has a confirmed room, however we are looking for a larger room (San Francisco Microsoft Sales Office).

3. Action Items

- a. [Stephano] Move outreach files into the main group and send a link to the list so that the TAC can access their materials.
- b. [Seth] Document our role when speaking with analysts. (consortium vs corporate messaging)
- c. [ALL] Please consider the scoping document now online:
<https://github.com/confidential-computing/governance/blob/master/scoping.md>
- d. [Stephano] Find the mission statement and submit a pull request for adding it to our GitHub repo.

Meeting adjourned at 8:50 am PST on February 6, 2020. The next conference call is scheduled for February 20th.

DRAFT

Respectfully submitted by Stephano Cetola, Acting Secretary, on February 7, 2020.