

Time-stamp: < 10 Jun 2002 at 12:39:50 by charpov on berlioz.cs.unh.edu >

Atomic Commitment Protocol with Simple Broadcast primitive (ACP-SB)

From:

Sape Mullender , editor. Distributed Systems.

Chapter 6: Non-Blocking Atomic Commitment, by Ö. Babaoglu and S. Toueg.

1993.

Synchronous communication has been replaced with (implicit) asynchronous communication. Failures are detected “magically” instead or relying on timeouts.

This version of the protocol uses a “simple broadcast” where a broadcast is simply a series of messages sent, possibly interrupted by a failure. Consequently, this algorithm is “non terminating” and property *AC5* does not hold.

CONSTANTS

<i>participants</i> ,	set of participants
<i>yes, no</i> ,	vote
<i>undecided, commit, abort</i> ,	decision
<i>waiting</i> ,	coordinator state wrt a participant
<i>notsent</i>	broadcast state wrt a participant

VARIABLES

<i>participant</i> ,	participants (N)
<i>coordinator</i>	coordinator (1)

$$\begin{aligned} \text{TypeInvParticipant} \triangleq & \text{ participant} \in [\\ & \text{participants} \rightarrow [\\ & \quad \text{vote} : \{\text{yes, no}\}, \\ & \quad \text{alive} : \text{BOOLEAN}, \\ & \quad \text{decision} : \{\text{undecided, commit, abort}\}, \\ & \quad \text{faulty} : \text{BOOLEAN}, \\ & \quad \text{voteSent} : \text{BOOLEAN} \\ &] \\ &] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{TypeInvCoordinator} \triangleq & \text{ coordinator} \in [\\ & \text{request} : [\text{participants} \rightarrow \text{BOOLEAN}], \\ & \text{vote} : [\text{participants} \rightarrow \{\text{waiting, yes, no}\}], \\ & \text{broadcast} : [\text{participants} \rightarrow \{\text{commit, abort, notsent}\}], \\ & \text{decision} : \{\text{commit, abort, undecided}\}, \\ & \text{alive} : \text{BOOLEAN}, \\ & \text{faulty} : \text{BOOLEAN} \\ &] \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{TypeInv} \triangleq \text{TypeInvParticipant} \wedge \text{TypeInvCoordinator}$$

Initially:

All the participants:

have a yes/no vote

are alive and not faulty

have not sent in their votes yet

are undecided about final decision

The coordinator:

has not sent vote requests yet

has not received votes from any participant

is alive and not faulty

has not sent broadcast messages to any participant

is undecided about final decision

$$\begin{aligned} \text{InitParticipant} &\triangleq \text{participant} \in [\\ &\quad \text{participants} \rightarrow [\\ &\quad \quad \text{vote} : \{\text{yes}, \text{no}\}, \\ &\quad \quad \text{alive} : \{\text{TRUE}\}, \\ &\quad \quad \text{decision} : \{\text{undecided}\}, \\ &\quad \quad \text{faulty} : \{\text{FALSE}\}, \\ &\quad \quad \text{voteSent} : \{\text{FALSE}\} \\ &\quad] \\ &] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{InitCoordinator} &\triangleq \text{coordinator} \in [\\ &\quad \text{request} : [\text{participants} \rightarrow \{\text{FALSE}\}], \\ &\quad \text{vote} : [\text{participants} \rightarrow \{\text{waiting}\}], \\ &\quad \text{alive} : \{\text{TRUE}\}, \\ &\quad \text{broadcast} : [\text{participants} \rightarrow \{\text{notsent}\}], \\ &\quad \text{decision} : \{\text{undecided}\}, \\ &\quad \text{faulty} : \{\text{FALSE}\} \\ &] \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Init} \triangleq \text{InitParticipant} \wedge \text{InitCoordinator}$$

COORDINATOR STATEMENTS

request(i):

IF coordinator is alive
 request for vote has not been sent to participant *i*
 THEN request for vote is sent to participant *i*

$$\begin{aligned} \text{request}(i) &\triangleq \wedge \text{coordinator.alive} \\ &\wedge \neg \text{coordinator.request}[i] \\ &\wedge \text{coordinator}' = [\text{coordinator EXCEPT !.request} = \\ &\quad [\text{@ EXCEPT } ![i] = \text{TRUE}]] \\ &\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{participant} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

getVote(i):

IF coordinator is alive
 coordinator is still undecided
 coordinator has sent request for votes to all participants
 coordinator is waiting to receive a vote from participant *i*
 participant *i* has sent the vote message
 THEN the coordinator can record the vote of participant *i*

$$\begin{aligned} \text{getVote}(i) &\triangleq \wedge \text{coordinator.alive} \\ &\wedge \text{coordinator.decision} = \text{undecided} \\ &\wedge \forall j \in \text{participants} : \text{coordinator.request}[j] \\ &\wedge \text{coordinator.vote}[i] = \text{waiting} \\ &\wedge \text{participant}[i].\text{voteSent} \\ &\wedge \text{coordinator}' = [\text{coordinator EXCEPT !.vote} = \\ &\quad [\text{@ EXCEPT } ![i] = \text{participant}[i].\text{vote}]] \\ &\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{participant} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

detectFault(i):

IF coordinator is alive

coordinator is still undecided
 coordinator has sent request for votes to all participants
 coordinator is waiting for vote from participant i
 participant i has died without sending its vote
 THEN
 coordinator times out on participant i and decides to abort

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{detectFault}(i) \triangleq & \quad \wedge \text{coordinator.alive} \\
 & \wedge \text{coordinator.decision} = \text{undecided} \\
 & \wedge \forall j \in \text{participants} : \text{coordinator.request}[j] \\
 & \wedge \text{coordinator.vote}[i] = \text{waiting} \\
 & \wedge \neg \text{participant}[i].\text{alive} \\
 & \wedge \neg \text{participant}[i].\text{voteSent} \\
 & \wedge \text{coordinator}' = [\text{coordinator EXCEPT } !.\text{decision} = \text{abort}] \\
 & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{participant} \rangle
 \end{aligned}$$

makeDecision:
 IF
 coordinator is alive
 coordinator is undecided
 coordinator has received votes from all participants
 THEN
 IF
 all votes are yes
 THEN
 coordinator decides commit
 ELSE
 coordinator decides abort

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{makeDecision} \triangleq & \quad \wedge \text{coordinator.alive} \\
 & \wedge \text{coordinator.decision} = \text{undecided} \\
 & \wedge \forall j \in \text{participants} : \text{coordinator.vote}[j] \in \{\text{yes}, \text{no}\} \\
 & \wedge \vee \wedge \forall j \in \text{participants} : \text{coordinator.vote}[j] = \text{yes} \\
 & \quad \wedge \text{coordinator}' = [\text{coordinator EXCEPT } !.\text{decision} = \text{commit}] \\
 & \vee \wedge \exists j \in \text{participants} : \text{coordinator.vote}[j] = \text{no} \\
 & \quad \wedge \text{coordinator}' = [\text{coordinator EXCEPT } !.\text{decision} = \text{abort}] \\
 & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{participant} \rangle
 \end{aligned}$$

coordBroadcast(i) (simple broadcast):
 IF
 coordinator is alive
 coordinator has made a decision
 coordinator has not sent the decision to participant i
 THEN
 coordinator sends its decision to participant i

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{coordBroadcast}(i) \triangleq & \quad \wedge \text{coordinator.alive} \\
 & \wedge \text{coordinator.decision} \neq \text{undecided} \\
 & \wedge \text{coordinator.broadcast}[i] = \text{notsent} \\
 & \wedge \text{coordinator}' = [\text{coordinator EXCEPT } !.\text{broadcast} = \\
 & \quad @ \text{EXCEPT } ![i] = \text{coordinator.decision}] \\
 & \quad] \\
 & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{participant} \rangle
 \end{aligned}$$

coordDie:
 IF
 coordinator is alive
 THEN
 coordinator dies
 coordinator is now faulty

$$\begin{aligned} \text{coordDie} &\triangleq \wedge \text{coordinator}.alive \\ &\wedge \text{coordinator}' = [\text{coordinator} \text{ EXCEPT } !.\text{alive} = \text{FALSE}, !.\text{faulty} = \text{TRUE}] \\ &\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{participant} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

PARTICIPANT STATEMENTS

sendVote(i):

IF participant is alive
participant has received a request for vote
THEN participant sends vote

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sendVote}(i) &\triangleq \wedge \text{participant}[i].alive \\ &\wedge \text{coordinator}.request[i] \\ &\wedge \text{participant}' = [\text{participant} \text{ EXCEPT } !(i) = \\ &\quad [@ \text{EXCEPT } !.\text{voteSent} = \text{TRUE}] \\ &\quad] \\ &\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{coordinator} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

abortOnVote(i):

IF participant is alive
participant is undecided
participant has sent its vote to the coordinator
participant's vote is no
THEN participant decides (unilaterally) to abort

$$\begin{aligned} \text{abortOnVote}(i) &\triangleq \wedge \text{participant}[i].alive \\ &\wedge \text{participant}[i].decision = \text{undecided} \\ &\wedge \text{participant}[i].voteSent \\ &\wedge \text{participant}[i].vote = \text{no} \\ &\wedge \text{participant}' = [\text{participant} \text{ EXCEPT } !(i) = \\ &\quad [@ \text{EXCEPT } !.\text{decision} = \text{abort}] \\ &\quad] \\ &\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{coordinator} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

abortOnTimeoutRequest(i):

IF participant is alive
participant is still undecided
coordinator has died without sending request for vote
THEN participant decides (unilaterally) to abort

$$\begin{aligned} \text{abortOnTimeoutRequest}(i) &\triangleq \wedge \text{participant}[i].alive \\ &\wedge \text{participant}[i].decision = \text{undecided} \\ &\wedge \neg \text{coordinator}.alive \\ &\wedge \neg \text{coordinator}.request[i] \\ &\wedge \text{participant}' = [\text{participant} \text{ EXCEPT } !(i) = \\ &\quad [@ \text{EXCEPT } !.\text{decision} = \text{abort}] \\ &\quad] \\ &\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{coordinator} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

decide(i):

IF participant is alive
participant is undecided

participant has received decision from the coordinator
 THEN
 participant decides according to decision from coordinator

$$\begin{aligned} \text{decide}(i) \triangleq & \wedge \text{participant}[i].\text{alive} \\ & \wedge \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{undecided} \\ & \wedge \text{coordinator.broadcast}[i] \neq \text{notsent} \\ & \wedge \text{participant}' = [\text{participant} \text{ EXCEPT } !i] = \\ & \quad [\text{@ EXCEPT } !.\text{decision} = \text{coordinator.broadcast}[i]] \\ & \quad] \\ & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{coordinator} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

parDie(i):
 IF
 participant is alive
 THEN
 participant dies and is now faulty

$$\begin{aligned} \text{parDie}(i) \triangleq & \wedge \text{participant}[i].\text{alive} \\ & \wedge \text{participant}' = [\text{participant} \text{ EXCEPT } !i] = \\ & \quad [\text{@ EXCEPT } !.\text{alive} = \text{FALSE}, !.\text{faulty} = \text{TRUE}] \\ & \quad] \\ & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{coordinator} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

FOR N PARTICIPANTS

$$\text{parProg}(i) \triangleq \text{sendVote}(i) \vee \text{abortOnVote}(i) \vee \text{abortOnTimeoutRequest}(i) \vee \text{decide}(i)$$

$$\text{parProgN} \triangleq \exists i \in \text{participants} : \text{parDie}(i) \vee \text{parProg}(i)$$

$$\text{coordProgA}(i) \triangleq \text{request}(i) \vee \text{getVote}(i) \vee \text{detectFault}(i) \vee \text{coordBroadcast}(i)$$

$$\text{coordProgB} \triangleq \text{makeDecision} \vee \exists i \in \text{participants} : \text{coordProgA}(i)$$

$$\text{coordProgN} \triangleq \text{coordDie} \vee \text{coordProgB}$$

$$\text{progN} \triangleq \text{parProgN} \vee \text{coordProgN}$$

Death transitions are left outside of fairness

$$\begin{aligned} \text{fairness} \triangleq & \wedge \forall i \in \text{participants} : \text{WF}_{\langle \text{coordinator}, \text{participant} \rangle}(\text{parProg}(i)) \\ & \wedge \text{WF}_{\langle \text{coordinator}, \text{participant} \rangle}(\text{coordProgB}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Spec} \triangleq \text{Init} \wedge \square[\text{progN}]_{\langle \text{coordinator}, \text{participant} \rangle} \wedge \text{fairness}$$

CORRECTNESS SPECIFICATION

This specification follows the original paper, except that AC3 is stronger: It forces participants to abort if one vote at least is NO (in the absence of failure).

The specification is split between safety and liveness.

SAFETY

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{All participants that decide reach the same decision} \\ \text{AC1} \triangleq & \square \forall i, j \in \text{participants} : \\ & \quad \vee \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} \neq \text{commit} \\ & \quad \vee \text{participant}[j].\text{decision} \neq \text{abort} \end{aligned}$$

If any participant decides commit, then all participants must have votes YES
 $AC2 \triangleq \square((\exists i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{commit}) \Rightarrow (\forall j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{vote} = \text{yes}))$

If any participant decides abort, then:
at least one participant voted NO, or
at least one participant is faulty, or
coordinator is faulty

$AC3_1 \triangleq \square((\exists i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{abort}) \Rightarrow \vee (\exists j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{vote} = \text{no}) \vee (\exists j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{faulty}) \vee \text{coordinator}.\text{faulty})$

Each participant decides at most once
 $AC4 \triangleq \square \wedge (\forall i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{commit} \Rightarrow \square(\text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{commit})) \wedge (\forall j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{decision} = \text{abort} \Rightarrow \square(\text{participant}[j].\text{decision} = \text{abort}))$

LIVENESS

(stronger for $AC3$ than in the original paper)

$AC3_2 \triangleq \diamond \vee \forall i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} \in \{\text{abort}, \text{commit}\} \vee \exists j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{faulty} \vee \text{coordinator}.\text{faulty}$

(SOME) INTERMEDIATE PROPERTIES USED IN PROOFS

$FaultyStable \triangleq \wedge \forall i \in \text{participants} : \square(\text{participant}[i].\text{faulty} \Rightarrow \square \text{participant}[i].\text{faulty}) \wedge \square(\text{coordinator}.\text{faulty} \Rightarrow \square \text{coordinator}.\text{faulty})$

$VoteStable \triangleq \forall i \in \text{participants} : \vee \square(\text{participant}[i].\text{vote} = \text{yes}) \vee \square(\text{participant}[i].\text{vote} = \text{no})$

$StrongerAC2 \triangleq \square((\exists i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{commit}) \Rightarrow \wedge (\forall j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{vote} = \text{yes}) \wedge \text{coordinator}.\text{decision} = \text{commit})$

$StrongerAC3_1 \triangleq \square((\exists i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{abort}) \Rightarrow \vee (\exists j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{vote} = \text{no}) \vee \wedge \exists j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{faulty} \wedge \text{coordinator}.\text{decision} = \text{abort} \vee \wedge \text{coordinator}.\text{faulty} \wedge \text{coordinator}.\text{decision} = \text{undecided})$

($AC1$ follows from $StrongerAC2 \wedge StrongerAC3_1$)

$NoRecovery \triangleq \square \wedge \forall i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{alive} \equiv \neg \text{participant}[i].\text{faulty} \wedge \text{coordinator}.\text{alive} \equiv \neg \text{coordinator}.\text{faulty}$

(SOME) INVALID PROPERTIES

$DecisionReachedNoFault \triangleq (\forall i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{alive}) \rightsquigarrow (\forall k \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[k].\text{decision} \neq \text{undecided})$

$AbortImpliesNoVote \triangleq \square((\exists i \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[i].\text{decision} = \text{abort}) \Rightarrow (\exists j \in \text{participants} : \text{participant}[j].\text{vote} = \text{no}))$

The following is the termination property that this SB algorithm doesn't have

$$AC5 \triangleq \diamond \forall i \in participants : \vee participant[i].decision \in \{abort, commit\} \\ \vee participant[i].faulty$$
