# P0052R2 - Generic Scope Guard and RAII Wrapper for the Standard Library

Peter Sommerlad and Andrew L. Sandoval

#### 2016-02-12

Document Number: P0052R2	(update of N4189, N3949, N3830, N3677)
Date:	2016-02-12
Project:	Programming Language C++
Audience:	LWG/LEWG

## 1 History

## 1.1 Changes from P0052R1

The Jacksonville LEWG, especially Eric Niebler gave splendid input in how to improve the classes in this paper. I (Peter) follow Eric's design in specifying scope\_exit as well as unique\_resource in a more general way.

- Provide scope\_fail and scope\_success as classes. However, we may even hide these types and just provide the factories.
- safe guard all classes against construction errors, i.e., failing to copy the deleter/exitfunction, by calling the passed argument in the case of an exception, except for scope\_success.
- relax the requirements for the template arguments.

Special thanks go to Eric Niebler for providing an implementation that removed previous restrictions on template arguments in a exception-safe way. Also thanks to Axel Naumann for presenting in Jacksonville and to Axel, Eric, and Daniel Krügler for wording improvements.

## 1.2 Changes from P0052R0

In Kona LWG gave a lot of feedback and especially expressed the desire to simplify the constructors and specification by only allowing *nothrow-copyable* RESOURCE and DELETER types. If a reference is required, because they aren't, users are encouraged to pass a std::ref/std::cref wrapper to the factory function instead.

- Simplified constructor specifications by restricting on nothrow copyable types. Facility is intended for simple types anyway. It also avoids the problem of using a type-erased std::function object as the deleter, because it could throw on copy.
- Add some motivation again, to ease review and provide reason for specific API issues.
- Make "Alexandrescu's" "declarative" scope exit variation employing uncaught\_-exceptions() counter optional factories to chose or not.
- propose to make it available for standalone implementations and add the header <scope> to corresponding tables.
- editorial adjustments
- re-established operator\* for unique\_resource.
- overload of make\_unique\_resource to handle reference\_wrapper for resources.
   No overload for reference-wrapped deleter functions is required, because reference\_wrapper provides the call forwarding.

## 1.3 Changes from N4189

- Attempt to address LWG specification issues from Cologne (only learned about those in the week before the deadline from Ville, so not all might be covered).
  - specify that the exit function must be either no-throw copy-constructible, or no-throw move-constructible, or held by reference. Stole the wording and implementation from unique\_ptr's deleter ctors.
  - put both classes in single header <scope>
  - specify factory functions for Alexandrescu's 3 scope exit cases for scope\_exit.
     Deliberately did't provide similar things for unique\_resource.
- remove lengthy motivation and example code, to make paper easier digestible.
- Corrections based on committee feedback in Urbana and Cologne.

#### 1.4 Changes from N3949

• renamed scope\_guard to scope\_exit and the factory to make\_scope\_exit. Reason for make\_ is to teach users to save the result in a local variable instead of just have a temporary that gets destroyed immediately. Similarly for unique resources, unique\_resource, make\_unique\_resource and make\_unique\_resource\_checked.

- renamed editorially scope\_exit::deleter to scope\_exit::exit\_function.
- changed the factories to use forwarding for the deleter/exit\_function but not deduce a reference.
- get rid of invoke's parameter and rename it to reset() and provide a noexcept specification for it.

#### 1.5 Changes from N3830

- rename to unique\_resource\_t and factory to unique\_resource, resp. unique\_resource\_checked
- provide scope guard functionality through type scope\_guard\_t and scope\_guard factory
- remove multiple-argument case in favor of simpler interface, lambda can deal with complicated release APIs requiring multiple arguments.
- make function/functor position the last argument of the factories for lambdafriendliness.

## 1.6 Changes from N3677

- Replace all 4 proposed classes with a single class covering all use cases, using variadic templates, as determined in the Fall 2013 LEWG meeting.
- The conscious decision was made to name the factory functions without "make", because they actually do not allocate any resources, like std::make\_unique or std::make\_shared do

#### 2 Introduction

The Standard Template Library provides RAII (resource acquisition is initialization) classes for managing pointer types, such as std::unique\_ptr and std::shared\_ptr. This proposal seeks to add a two generic RAII wrappers classes which tie zero or one resource to a clean-up/completion routine which is bound by scope, ensuring execution

at scope exit (as the object is destroyed) unless released early or in the case of a single resource: executed early or returned by moving its value.

#### 3 Acknowledgements

- This proposal incorporates what Andrej Alexandrescu described as scope\_guard long ago and explained again at C++ Now 2012 ().
- This proposal would not have been possible without the impressive work of Peter Sommerlad who produced the sample implementation during the Fall 2013 committee meetings in Chicago. Peter took what Andrew Sandoval produced for N3677 and demonstrated the possibility of using C++14 features to make a single, general purpose RAII wrapper capable of fulfilling all of the needs presented by the original 4 classes (from N3677) with none of the compromises.
- Gratitude is also owed to members of the LEWG participating in the Fall 2015(Kona), Fall 2014(Urbana), February 2014 (Issaquah) and Fall 2013 (Chicago) meeting for their support, encouragement, and suggestions that have led to this proposal.
- Special thanks and recognition goes to OpenSpan, Inc. (http://www.openspan.com) for supporting the production of this proposal, and for sponsoring Andrew L. Sandoval's first proposal (N3677) and the trip to Chicago for the Fall 2013 LEWG meeting. Note: this version abandons the over-generic version from N3830 and comes back to two classes with one or no resource to be managed.
- Thanks also to members of the mailing lists who gave feedback. Especially Zhihao Yuan, and Ville Voutilainen.
- Special thanks to Daniel Krügler for his deliberate review of the draft version of this paper (D3949).

#### 4 Motivation

While std::unique\_ptr can be (mis-)used to keep track of general handle types with a user-specified deleter it can become tedious and error prone. Further argumentation can be found in previous papers. Here are two examples using <cstdio>'s FILE \* and POSIX<fcntl.h>'s and <unistd.h>'s int file handles.

```
void demonstrate_unique_resource_with_stdio() {
  const std::string filename = "hello.txt";
  { auto file=make_unique_resource(::fopen(filename.c_str(),"w"),&::fclose);
    ::fputs("Hello World!\n", file.get());
    ASSERT(file.get()!= NULL);
  }
  { std::ifstream input { filename };
    std::string line { };
    getline(input, line);
   ASSERT_EQUAL("Hello World!", line);
   getline(input, line);
   ASSERT(input.eof());
  ::unlink(filename.c_str());
   auto file = make_unique_resource_checked(::fopen("nonexistingfile.txt", "r"),
                (FILE*) NULL, &::fclose);
   ASSERT_EQUAL((FILE*)NULL, file.get());
  }
}
void demontrate_unique_resource_with_POSIX_IO() {
  const std::string filename = "./hello1.txt";
  { auto file=make_unique_resource(::open(filename.c_str(),
                     O_CREAT | O_RDWR | O_TRUNC, 0666), &::close);
    ::write(file.get(), "Hello World!\n", 12u);
    ASSERT(file.get() != -1);
  { std::ifstream input { filename };
   std::string line { };
    getline(input, line);
   ASSERT_EQUAL("Hello World!", line);
    getline(input, line);
   ASSERT(input.eof());
  }
  ::unlink(filename.c_str());
    auto file = make_unique_resource_checked(::open("nonexistingfile.txt",
                       O_RDONLY), -1, &::close);
   ASSERT_EQUAL(-1, file.get());
 }
}
```

We refer to Andrej Alexandrescu's well-known many presentations as a motivation for scope\_exit, scope\_fail, and scope\_success. Here is a brief example on how to use the 3 proposed factories.

```
void demo_scope_exit_fail_success(){
  std::ostringstream out{};
  auto lam=[&]{out << "called ";};
  try{
    auto v=make_scope_exit([&]{out << "always ";});
    auto w=make_scope_success([&]{out << "not ";}); // not called
    auto x=make_scope_fail(lam); // called
    throw 42;
}catch(...){
    auto y=make_scope_fail([&]{out << "not ";}); // not called
    auto z=make_scope_success([&]{out << "handled";}); // called
}
ASSERT_EQUAL("called always handled",out.str());
}</pre>
```

#### 5 Impact on the Standard

This proposal is a pure library extension. A new header, <scope> is proposed, but it does not require changes to any standard classes or functions. Since it proposes a new header, no feature test macro seems required. It does not require any changes in the core language, and it has been implemented in standard C++ conforming to C++14, resp. draft C++17. Depending on the timing of the acceptance of this proposal, it might go into a library fundamentals TS under the namespace std::experimental or directly in the working paper of the standard.

## 6 Design Decisions

## 6.1 General Principles

The following general principles are formulated for unique\_resource, and are valid for scope\_exit correspondingly.

- Transparency It should be obvious from a glance what each instance of a unique\_resource object does. By binding the resource to it's clean-up routine, the declaration of unique\_resource makes its intention clear.
- Resource Conservation and Lifetime Management Using unique\_resource makes
  it possible to "allocate it and forget about it" in the sense that deallocation is
  always accounted for after the unique\_resource has been initialized.
- Exception Safety Exception unwinding is one of the primary reasons that unique\_resource and scope\_exit/scope\_fail are needed. Therefore, the specification

asks for strong safety guarantee when creating and moving the defined types, making sure to call the deleter/exit function if such attempts fail.

• Flexibility - unique\_resource is designed to be flexible, allowing the use of lambdas or existing functions for clean-up of resources.

### 6.2 Prior Implementations

Please see N3677 from the May 2013 mailing (or http://www.andrewlsandoval.com/scope\_exit/) for the previously proposed solution and implementation. Discussion of N3677 in the (Chicago) Fall 2013 LEWG meeting led to the creation of unique\_resource and scope\_exit with the general agreement that such an implementation would be vastly superior to N3677 and would find favor with the LEWG. Professor Sommerlad produced the implementation backing this proposal during the days following that discussion.

N3677 has a more complete list of other prior implementations.

N3830 provided an alternative approach to allow an arbitrary number of resources which was abandoned due to LEWG feedback

The following issues have been discussed by LEWG already:

- Should there be a companion class for sharing the resource shared\_resource? (Peter thinks no. Ville thinks it could be provided later anyway.) LEWG: NO.
- Should scope\_exit() and unique\_resource::invoke() guard against deleter functions that throw with try deleter(); catch(...) (as now) or not? LEWG: NO, but provide noexcept in detail.
- Does scope\_exit need to be move-assignable? LEWG: NO.

The following issues have been recommended by LWG already:

Make it a facility available for free-standing implementations in a new header
 <scope> (<utility> doesn't work, because it is not available for free-standing implementations)

## 6.3 Open Issues to be Discussed by LEWG

- Should we make the regular constructor of the scope\_exit templates private and friend the factory function only? This could prohibit the use as class members, which might sneakily be used to create "destructor" functionality by not writing a destructor.
- Should we provide the factories make\_scope\_success(ef) and make\_scope\_fail(ef) and accompanying types to enable Alexandrescu's three scope-exiting modes?

## 7 Technical Specifications

The following formulation is based on inclusion to the draft of the C++ standard. However, if it is decided to go into the Library Fundamentals TS, the position of the texts and the namespaces will have to be adapted accordingly, i.e., instead of namespace std:: we suppose namespace std::experimental::.

#### 7.1 Header

In section 17.6.1.1 Library contents [contents] add an entry to table 14 for the new header <scope>. Because of the new header, there is no need for a feature test macro.

In section 17.6.1.3 Freestanding implementations [compliance] add an extra row to table 16 and in section [utilities.general] add the same extra row to table 44

Table 1: table 16 and table 44

	Subclause	Header
20.nn	Scope Guard Support	<scope></scope>

#### 7.2 Additional sections

Add a a new section to chapter 20 introducing the contents of the header <scope>.

## 7.3 Scope guard support [scope]

This subclause contains infrastructure for a generic scope guard and RAII (resource acquisition is initialization) resource wrapper.

#### Header <scope> synopsis

```
namespace std {
template <class EF>
class scope_exit;
template <class EF>
class scope_fail;
template <class EF>
class scope_success;

template <class EF>
scope_exit<decay_t<EF>> make_scope_exit(EF && exit_function);
template <class EF>
scope_fail<decay_t<EF>> make_scope_fail(EF && exit_function);
template <class EF>
```

```
scope_success<decay_t<EF>> make_scope_success(EF && exit_function);

template<class R,class D>
    class unique_resource;

template<class R,class D>
    unique_resource(decay_t<R>, decay_t<D>>
    make_unique_resource(R && r, D && d) noexcept;

template<class R,class D>
    unique_resource<R&, decay_t<D>>
    make_unique_resource(reference_wrapper<R> r, D && d) noexcept;

template<class R,class D, class S=R>
    unique_resource<std::decay_t<R>, std::decay_t<D>>
    make_unique_resource<checked(R && r, S const & invalid, D && d) noexcept;
}</pre>
```

- The header <scope> defines the class templates scope\_exit, scope\_fail, scope\_success, unique\_resource and the factory function templates make\_scope\_exit(), make\_scope\_success(), make\_scope\_fail(), make\_unique\_resource(), and make\_unique\_resource\_checked() to create their instances.
- <sup>2</sup> The class templates scope\_exit, scope\_fail, and scope\_success define scope guards that wrap a function object to be called on their destruction.
- The following clauses describe the class templates scope\_exit, scope\_fail, and scope\_success. In each clause, the name scope\_guard denotes either of these class templates. In description of class members scope\_guard refers to the enclosing class.

#### 7.3.1 Scope guard class templates [scope.scope\_guard]

```
template <class EF>
class scope_guard {
public:
  explicit scope_quard(EF const & f);
  explicit scope_quard(EF && f);
  scope_quard(scope_quard&& rhs) ;
  ~scope_guard();
  void release() noexcept;
  scope_guard(const scope_guard&)=delete;
  scope_guard& operator=(const scope_guard&)=delete;
  scope_guard& operator=(scope_guard&&)=delete;
private:
                       // exposition only
  EF exit_function;
  bool execute_on_destruction{true}; //exposition only
  int uncaught_on_creation{uncaught_exceptions()}; // exposition only
};
```

[Note: scope\_exit is meant to be a general-purpose scope guard that calls its exit function when a scope is exited. The class templates scope\_fail and scope\_success share the scope\_exit's interface, only the situation when the exit function is called differs. These latter two class templates memorize the value of uncaught\_exceptions() on construction and in the case of scope\_fail call the exit function on destruction, when uncaught\_exceptions() at that time returns a greater value, in the case of scope\_success when uncaught\_exceptions() on destruction returns the same or a lesser value.

```
value.
   [Example:
     void grow(vector<int>&v){
              auto guard = make_scope_success([]{ cout << "Good!" << endl; });</pre>
              v.resize(1024);
     }
   -end \ example \ ] \ -end \ note \ ]
   Requires: If template argument EF is not a lyalue reference type, EF shall satisfy the re-
   quirements of Destructible (Table 24). is_callable<EF&>::value is true. The con-
   structor arguments f in the following constructors shall be a function object (20.9) [func-
   tion.objects].
   explicit
   scope_exit(EF const & f) ;
   explicit
   scope_exit(EF && f) ;
         Requires: The call expression of EF shall not throw an exception.
4
         Effects: Initializes exit_function with f. If construction fails, calls f().
         Throws: Any exception thrown by the selected constructor of EF.
   explicit
   scope_fail(EF const & f) ;
   explicit
   scope_fail(EF && f) ;
6
         Requires: The call expression of EF shall not throw an exception.
7
         Effects: Initializes exit_function with f. If construction fails, calls f().
         Throws: Any exception thrown by the selected constructor of EF.
   explicit
   scope_success(EF const & f) ;
   explicit
   scope_success(EF && f) ;
         Effects: Initializes exit_function with f.
        [Note: If construction fails, f() won't be called. — end note]
```

Throws: Any exception thrown by the selected constructor of EF.

```
scope_guard(scope_guard&& rhs) ;
```

10

11 Effects: Copies the release state from rhs, and sets rhs to the released state, preventing it from invoking its copy of exit\_function. If is\_nothrow\_move\_constructible\_v<EF> move constructs otherwise copy constructs exit\_function from rhs.exit\_function. In case of an exception during the last operations, calls rhs.exit\_function() if it would be called when rhs would have been destroyed without being moved from.

```
~scope_exit();
12
         Effects:
           if (execute_on_destruction)
                    exit_function();
    ~scope_fail();
13
         Effects:
           if (execute_on_destruction
               && uncaught_exceptions() > uncaught_on_creation)
                    exit_function();
    ~scope_success();
14
         Effects:
           \hbox{if (execute\_on\_destruction}\\
               && uncaught_exceptions() <= uncaught_on_creation)</pre>
                    exit_function();
    void release() noexcept;
15
         Prevents exit_function() from being called on destruction.
         execute_on_destruction=false;
```

#### 7.3.2 Scope guard factory functions [scope.make\_scope\_exit]

The scope guard factory functions create scope\_exit, scope\_fail, and scope\_success objects that for the function object exit\_function evaluate exit\_function() at their destruction unless release() was called.

```
template <class EF>
scope_exit<decay_t<EF>> make_scope_exit(EF && exit_function);

Returns: scope_exit<decay_t<EF>>(forward<EF>(exit_function));

template <class EF>
scope_fail<decay_t<EF>> make_scope_fail(EF && exit_function);

Returns: scope_fail<decay_t<EF>>(forward<EF>(exit_function));

template <class EF>
scope_success<decay_t<EF>> make_scope_success(EF && exit_function));

template <class EF>
scope_success<decay_t<EF>> make_scope_success(EF && exit_function);

Returns: scope_success<decay_t<EF>> (forward<EF>(exit_function));
```

#### 7.3.3 Unique resource wrapper [scope.unique\_resource]

#### 7.3.4 Class template unique\_resource [scope.unique\_resource.class]

```
template < class R, class D>
class unique_resource {
public:
  template<typename RR, typename DD>
  explicit unique_resource(RR &&r, DD &&d)
   noexcept(is_nothrow_constructible_v<R, RR> &&
             is_nothrow_constructible_v<D, DD>);
  unique_resource(unique_resource&& rhs)
        noexcept(is_nothrow_move_constructible_v<R> &&
             is_nothrow_move_constructible_v<D>);
  unique_resource(unique_resource const &)=delete;
  ~unique_resource();
  unique_resource& operator=(unique_resource&& rhs) ;
  unique_resource& operator=(unique_resource const &)=delete;
  void swap(unique_resource &other);
  void reset();
  void reset(R const & r);
  void reset(R && r);
  void release() noexcept;
  R const & get() const noexcept;
  R operator->() const noexcept;
  see below operator*() const noexcept;
  const D & get_deleter() const noexcept;
private:
  R resource; // exposition only
  D deleter; // exposition only
  bool execute_on_destruction; // exposition only
```

- 1 [Note: unique\_resource is meant to be a universal RAII wrapper for resource handles provided by an operating system or platform. Typically, such resource handles are of trivial type and come with a factory function and a clean-up or deleter function that do not throw exceptions. The clean-up function together with the result of the factory function is used to create a unique\_resource variable, that on destruction will call the clean-up function. Access to the underlying resource handle is achieved through get() and in case of a pointer type resource through a set of convenience pointer operator functions. end note]
- 2 Requires: (is\_copy\_constructible\_v<R> || is\_nothrow\_move\_constructible\_v<R>)
  && (is\_copy\_constructible\_v<D> || is\_nothrow\_move\_constructible\_v<D>)
- <sup>3</sup> The template argument D shall be a Destructible (Table 24) function object type (20.9), for which, given a value d of type D and a value r of type R, the expression d(r) is valid and does not throw an exception.
- <sup>4</sup> R shall be a Destructible (Table 24) type.

5 Requires:

(is\_copy\_constructible\_v<R,RR> || is\_nothrow\_move\_constructible\_v<R,RR>)
and

(is\_copy\_constructible\_v<D,DD> || is\_nothrow\_move\_constructible\_v<D,DD>)

- Effects: Move-initializes resource from r if that can not throw an exception, otherwise copy-initializes resource from r. Then move-initializes deleter from d if that can not throw an exception, otherwise copy-initializes deleter from d. If construction of resource throws an exception, calls d(r). If construction of deleter throws an exception, calls d(resource). [Note: The explained mechanism should ensure no leaking resources. end note]
- Postconditions: get() == r. get\_deleter() returns a reference to the stored function object d.
- 8 Throws: any exception thrown during construction.

Effects: Move-initializes resource from rhs.resource if that can not throw an exception, otherwise copy-initializes resource from rhs.resource. Then move-initializes deleter from rhs.deleter if that can not throw an exception, otherwise copy-initializes deleter from rhs.deleter. If construction of resource throws an exception, calls rhs.deleter(rhs.resource). If construction of deleter throws an exception, calls rhs.deleter(resource). [Note: The explained mechanism should ensure no leaking resources. — end note] Finally calls rhs.release().

unique\_resource& operator=(unique\_resource&& rhs) ;

- 10 Requires:
  - (is\_nothrow\_move\_assignable\_v<R> || is\_copy\_assignable\_v<R>) and (is\_nothrow\_move\_assignable\_v<D> || is\_copy\_assignable\_v<D>)
- Effects: If this == &rhs no effect, otherwise reset(), then move assigns members from rhs if the member is nothrow\_move\_assignable. Remaining members are then copy-assigned from rhs. Then rhs.release(). If a copy of a member throws and exception leaves rhs intact.
- Throws: Any exception thrown during a copy-assignment of a member that can not be moved without risking an exception.

```
~unique_resource();
13
         Effects: reset().
   void reset();
14
         Effects: Equivalent to
             if (execute_on_destruction) {
               execute_on_destruction=false;
               get_deleter()(resource);
   void reset(R const & r) ;
   void reset(R && r) ;
15
         Effects: Equivalent to
             reset();
             resource = move(r);
             execute_on_destruction = true;
         If move-assignment of the resource fails, get_deleter()(r) on the original value
         of r and execute_on_destruction=false.
   void release() noexcept;
16
         Effects: execute_on_destruction = false.
   const R& get() const noexcept ;
   R operator->() const noexcept ;
17
         Remarks: operator-> is only available if
         is_pointer_v<R> && is_nothrow_copy_constructible_v<R>
         &&(is_class_v<remove_pointer_t<R>>> || is_union_v<remove_pointer_t<R>>>)
         is true.
18
         Returns: resource.
   see below operator*() const noexcept ;
19
         Remarks: operator* is only available if is_pointer_v<R> is true.
20
         Returns: *resource. [Note: The return type is equivalent to add_lvalue_-
         reference_t<remove_pointer_t<R>>. — end note]
   const D & get_deleter() const noexcept;
21
         Returns: deleter
```

#### 7.3.5 Factories for unique\_resource [scope.make\_unique\_resource]

```
template < class R, class D>
  unique_resource<decay_t<R>, decay_t<D>>
  make_unique_resource( R && r, D && d) noexcept;
                   unique_resource<decay_t<R>, decay_t<D>>(forward<R>(r), forward<D>(d))
  template < class R, class D>
  unique_resource<R&,decay_t<D>>
  make_unique_resource( reference_wrapper<R> r, D d) noexcept;
        Returns: unique_resource<R&,decay_t<D>>(r.get(),forward<D>(d))
        Note: There is no need to overload on reference_wrapper for the deleter. — end
        note
  template < class R, class D, class S=R>
  unique_resource<decay_t<R>,decay_t<D>>
  make_unique_resource_checked(R&& r, S const & invalid, D && d ) noexcept;
4
        Requires: If s denotes a (possibly const) value of type S and r denotes a (possibly
        const) value of type R, the expressions s == r and r == s are both valid, both
        have the same domain, both have a type that is convertible to bool, and bool(s
        == r) == bool(r == s) for every r and s. If S is the same type as R, R shall be
        Equality
Comparable<br/>(Table 17 ).
        Effects: As if
            bool mustrelease = bool(r == invalid);
            auto ur= make_unique_resource(forward<R>(r), forward<D>(d));
            if(mustrelease) ur.release();
            return ur;
6
        Note: This factory function exists to avoid calling a deleter function with an
        invalid argument. The following example shows its use to avoid calling fclose
        when fopen failed and returned NULL.
        [Example:
                           auto file = make_unique_resource_checked(
                                 ::fopen("potentially_nonexisting_file.txt", "r"),
                                 (FILE*) NULL,
                                 &::fclose);
        - end example ] - end note ]
```

## 8 Appendix: Example Implementations

removed, see

 $https://github.com/PeterSommerlad/SC22WG21\_Papers/tree/master/workspace/P0052\_scope\_exit/src$