Summary of The Irrelevance of Environmental, Social, and Governance Disclosure to Retail Investors

Austin Moss, James P. Naughton, Clare Wang (MS,2021)
Summarized by Li Ziming

1. What are the research questions?

• Whether retail investors respond to ESG press releases and why retail investors do not respond to ESG disclosures.

2. Why are the research questions interesting?

- The empirical research on retail investors' response to ESG disclosures is insufficient. Prior studies are limited to experimental studies. There is a problem on external validity.
- Robinhood Markets provides unique research data to research this question. It publishes the number of Robinhood investors who own each security in real time.

3. What is the paper's contribution?

- Contribute to the literature that examines how ESG disclosures affect the composition of firms' shareholder base.
 - Prior literature: ESG disclosures attract investors who have a taste for ESG activities (Friedman and Heinle, 2016) and dedicated institutional investors (Dhaliwal et al., 2011).
 - Extend: This paper suggests that retail investors do not adjust their holdings of securities in response to ESG disclosures.
- Contribute to the literature that examines how investors respond to ESG disclosures.
 - Prior literature: Use the laboratory experiment approach, find the subjects transact based on ESG disclosures (Cheng et al., 2015; Martin and Moser, 2016).
 - Extend: This paper uses an empirical archival approach and narrows the unit of analysis to retail investors.
- Contribute to the ongoing development of ESG disclosures by various regulatory entities.
 - Generally, the discussion of ESG disclosure proposals assumed that investors are homogeneous.
 - Extend: This paper suggests that retail investors have different informational needs towards ESG disclosures.

4. What hypotheses are tested in the paper?

- H1: Retail investors adjust their portfolio holdings in response to ESG disclosures.
- H2: The absence of retail investors' response is attributed to a lack of economic content, a lack of visibility, or integration difficulties.

a) Do these hypotheses follow from and answer the research questions?

• Yes.

b) Do these hypotheses follow from theory? Explain logic of the hypotheses.

- The development of these hypotheses is motivated by prior studies which use experiment approach (Cheng et al., 2015; Martin and Moser, 2016).
- The possible explanations for a lack of retail investor response are introduced by Blanke-spoor et al. (2019) for how investors might process a disclosure in trading decisions.

5. Sample: comment on the appropriateness of the sample selection procedures.

Front-Page News Summary

• The reduction in the sample of press releases leads to a question on whether CSRWire is a complete source because thousands of listed companies do not issue press releases on this platform. This may cause an endogeneity problem of self-selection.

6. Comment on the appropriateness of variable definition and measurement.

- Retail investors' portfolio holdings is described by the change in number of retail investors holding stocks, but the positions of individual investors change is not reflected.
- The paper does not clearly describe how to distinguish between ESG-related press release and not-ESG-related press release.

7. Comment on the appropriateness of the regress/predict model specification.

• The study controls for lagged returns and includes firm and date fixed effects to fully absorb time-invariant cross-firm heterogeneity and time trends.

8. What difficulties arise in drawing inferences from the empirical work?

• The examination of three explanations for a lack of retail investor response is based on the sample limited to a subset of the first analysis.

9. Describe at least one publishable and feasible extension of this research.

- In the future studies, we can investigate the overall demand for ESG disclosures and consider other ways in which different investor classes process this type of information.
- Research the reason why retail investors do not respond to ESG disclosures. One explanation is that ESG investment concepts have not been taken seriously by retail investors.