Peer review of Beppe Karlssons Workshop 2

by Linda Ott Olander

I downloaded the solution and followed the instructions on how to open it. I was able to open the project in Visual Studio. I ran the program without problems.

Problems/bugs?

When I edited a member, I purposefully added the wrong format on the personal number. I added a month as "21". This was just accepted by the program, which should not be the case.

I later on tried to edit the member again, I entered the personal number with "0000" as the four last digits. I then got the message "Something went wrong while retrieving the member". I think a more elaborate message here would be helpful. I tried to change the personal number again to four last digits, but got the same error message.

Do the implementation and diagrams conform?

Yes.

Are there any missing relations?

No.

Is the UML notation correct?

Yes. I'm a little bit confused by "BoatType" in the class diagram, but I'm assuming it's a description class.

Architecture

There is a model/view/controller separation. Member.cs does return formatted strings, but I think the model could easily be adapted to different UIs. There is not a high degree of specialization for a certain kind of UI. There are no domain rules in the UI.

Quality of the implementation

The general quality of the implementation is good. The code has proper indentation, clear naming conventions and I could not find any code duplication or "dead code".

Quality of the design

The code follows GRASP[1, p418] well. There is a controller pattern that represents the use case scenarios. Creator pattern, high cohesion, low coupling and information expert are also well implemented. There are no static variables.

The diagrams would be helpful to me as a developer. They are clear and easy to read.

The strong points are that the code is easy to understand with good naming conventions, it is well encapsulated and with good comments.

The weak point is that it needs more testing with alternate scenarios, such as the possibility of the user entering personal numbers in the wrong format, as mentioned above.

Do you think the design/implementation has passed the grade 2 criteria?

Yes.

References:

1. Larman C., Applying UML and Patterns 3rd Ed, 2005, ISBN: 0131489062