

Public signup for this instance is disabled. Go to our [Self serve sign up page](#) to request an account.



Hadoop YARN / [YARN-5355 YARN Timeline Service v.2: alpha 2](#) / [YARN-5792](#)

# adopt the id prefix for YARN, MR, and DS entities

Details

Type:	Sub-task	Status:	RESOLVED
Priority:	Major	Resolution:	Fixed
Affects Version/s:	YARN-5355	Fix Version/s:	2.9.0, YARN-5355, 3.0.0-beta1
Component/s:	timelineserver		
Labels:	None		
Hadoop Flags:	Reviewed		

Description

We introduced the entity id prefix to support flexible entity sorting ([YARN-5745](#)). We should adopt the id prefix for YARN entities, MR entities, and DS entities to take advantage of the id prefix.

Attachments

<a href="#">YARN-5792-YARN-5355.01.patch</a>	90 kB	10/Nov/16 15:18
<a href="#">YARN-5792-YARN-5355.02.patch</a>	96 kB	10/Nov/16 21:23
<a href="#">YARN-5792-YARN-5355.03.patch</a>	97 kB	11/Nov/16 07:11
<a href="#">YARN-5792-YARN-5355.04.patch</a>	97 kB	11/Nov/16 16:03
<a href="#">YARN-5792-YARN-5355.05.patch</a>	96 kB	16/Nov/16 21:49
<a href="#">YARN-5792-YARN-5355.06.patch</a>	103 kB	18/Nov/16 06:03

Issue Links

breaks		
<a href="#">YARN-6140</a> start time key in NM leveledb store should be removed when container is removed		RESOLVED
depends upon		
<a href="#">YARN-5715</a> introduce entity prefix for return and sort order		RESOLVED
is related to		
<a href="#">YARN-9418</a> ATSV2 /apps/appld/entities/YARN_CONTAINER rest api does not show metrics		RESOLVED

Activity

<a href="#">Varun Saxena</a> added a comment - 10/Nov/16 15:23
The patch does the following. <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Uses inverse of container start time to publish id prefix for container entities. As container start time is not stored in NM state store, added support to add it as well.</li><li>2. Uses inverse of task start time to publish id prefix for task entities.</li><li>3. Uses inverse of task attempt start time to publish id prefix for task attempt entities.</li><li>4. Uses inverse of DS container start time to publish id prefix for distributed shell container entities.</li><li>5. Uses inverse of attempt start time to publish id prefix for app attempt entities. We can potentially use inverse of attempt id bit of ApplicationAttemptId as well here. Also app registered time can be used.</li><li>6. Uses inverse of DS attempt start time to publish id prefix for DS attempt entities. We can potentially use inverse of attempt id bit of ApplicationAttemptId as well here.</li><li>7. Uses inverse of id bit of job id to publish id prefix for job entities. We can potentially use job start time here.</li></ol> Last 3 points we can reach a consensus on as to what to use.

<a href="#">Hadoop QA</a> added a comment - 10/Nov/16 20:11
-1 overall

Vote	Subsystem	Runtime	Comment
0	reexec	0m 22s	Docker mode activated.
+1	@author	0m 0s	The patch does not contain any @author tags.
+1	test4tests	0m 0s	The patch appears to include 10 new or modified test files.
0	mvndep	2m 45s	Maven dependency ordering for branch
+1	mvninstall	8m 36s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	compile	8m 14s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	checkstyle	1m 44s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvnsite	2m 58s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvneclipse	1m 35s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	findbugs	4m 5s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	javadoc	1m 55s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
0	mvndep	0m 18s	Maven dependency ordering for patch
+1	mvninstall	2m 41s	the patch passed
+1	compile	7m 16s	the patch passed
+1	javac	7m 16s	the patch passed
-0	checkstyle	1m 55s	root: The patch generated 35 new + 1286 unchanged - 21 fixed = 1321 total (was 1307)
+1	mvnsite	3m 22s	the patch passed
+1	mvneclipse	1m 53s	the patch passed
+1	whitespace	0m 0s	The patch has no whitespace issues.
+1	findbugs	5m 7s	the patch passed
-1	javadoc	0m 26s	hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-core generated 9 new + 2496 unchanged - 0 fixed = 2505 total (was 2496)
+1	unit	15m 44s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch passed.
+1	unit	40m 53s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch passed.
-1	unit	14m 34s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch failed.
+1	unit	4m 34s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-core in the patch passed.
+1	unit	8m 56s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
-1	unit	115m 38s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch failed.
+1	asflicense	0m 38s	The patch does not generate ASF License warnings.
		282m 24s	

Reason	Tests
Failed junit tests	hadoop.yarn.applications.distributedshell.TestDistributedShell
	hadoop.mapred.TestMRTimelineEventHandling

Subsystem	Report/Notes
Docker	Image:yetus/hadoop:9560f25
JIRA Issue	<a href="#">YARN-5792</a>
JIRA Patch URL	<a href="https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12838376/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.01.patch">https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12838376/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.01.patch</a>
Optional Tests	asflicense compile javac javadoc mvninstall mvnsite unit findbugs checkstyle
uname	Linux 7d79c9db0dc3 3.13.0-95-generic #142-Ubuntu SMP Fri Aug 12 17:00:09 UTC 2016 x86_64 x86_64 x86_64 GNU/Linux
Build tool	maven
Personality	/testptch/hadoop/patchprocess/precommit/personality/provided.sh
git revision	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> / 25b1917

Default Java	1.8.0_101
findbugs	v3.0.0
checkstyle	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt</a>
javadoc	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/diff-javadoc-javadoc-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-core.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/diff-javadoc-javadoc-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-core.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-applications_hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-applications_hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient.txt</a>
Test Results	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/testReport/">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/testReport/</a>
modules	C: hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-applications/hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient U: .
Console output	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/console">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13860/console</a>
Powered by	Apache Yetus 0.4.0-SNAPSHOT <a href="http://yetus.apache.org">http://yetus.apache.org</a>

This message was automatically generated.

Varun Saxena added a comment - 10/Nov/16 20:45

Tests pass in local. Lets see what comes up when build is invoked again.

Varun Saxena added a comment - 10/Nov/16 21:23

Fixed checkstyle and javadoc issues

Sangjin Lee added a comment - 10/Nov/16 23:32

Patch v.2 fails compilation:

```
[INFO] -----
[INFO] -----
[ERROR] COMPILATION ERROR :
[INFO] -----
[ERROR] /Users/sjlee/git/hadoop-ats/hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/or
[INFO] 1 error
```

Could you please take a look? Thanks!

Sangjin Lee added a comment - 10/Nov/16 23:40

At a high level, I'd like to discuss options.

I see that you're mostly using the (inverted) start time as the id prefix. Would it be better to use simply the id instead whenever possible? One big benefit of using the id is that it is very portable. When creating entities and updating them, the id is almost always available. All we require is a uniqueness within the app and the entity type, and it seems to me that the id is a superior alternative to the start time.

What do you think?

Varun Saxena added a comment - 11/Nov/16 09:14

At a high level, I'd like to discuss options. I see that you're mostly using the (inverted) start time as the id prefix. Would it be better to use simply the id instead whenever possible?

I wanted to discuss the same as well. That is why I mixed both approaches in first patch. I had used Id bit of job id to have id prefix for jobs and attempt created time for attempts despite it being possible that attempt id can be used.

Anyways in latest patch for YARN and DS attempts I now use the id bit of attempt id in addition to id bit of job id.


Coming to task IDs', the ID bit of task is cannot really be used because that's within the scope of task type (map/reduce). Whether task is map or reduce can be stored in one bit and then we can shift around id. Frankly this should be fine as one bit of long will be used as sign bit and we do not expect ids' to be negative. But should we do it. Some mappers may be launched after reducers are launched so with the approach mentioned above, we may not get that order. So I would continue going with current approach.

Task attempts are anyways one level below tasks.

Talking about containers, id bit of container ID is a long. And containers are within scope of an app attempt (id bit of attempt is int). Although number of attempts are never going to be a very large and id bit of container ID not reach near the value of long (i.e. not as many containers are

likely to be launched) so we can still adjust both in 8 bytes by doing some bit shifting. But then we will be making assumptions which IMO we should not do so its safer to go with container start time. Thoughts ?

▼

 Hadoop QA added a comment - 11/Nov/16 11:37

 -1 overall


Vote	Subsystem	Runtime	Comment
0	reexec	0m 19s	Docker mode activated.
+1	@author	0m 0s	The patch does not contain any @author tags.
+1	test4tests	0m 0s	The patch appears to include 10 new or modified test files.
0	mvndep	5m 1s	Maven dependency ordering for branch
+1	mvninstall	6m 51s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	compile	6m 53s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	checkstyle	1m 45s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvnsite	3m 0s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvneclipse	1m 37s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	findbugs	4m 3s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	javadoc	1m 57s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
0	mvndep	0m 17s	Maven dependency ordering for patch
+1	mvninstall	2m 31s	the patch passed
+1	compile	6m 55s	the patch passed
+1	javac	6m 55s	the patch passed
-0	checkstyle	1m 49s	root: The patch generated 18 new + 1245 unchanged - 62 fixed = 1263 total (was 1307)
+1	mvnsite	3m 15s	the patch passed
+1	mvneclipse	1m 54s	the patch passed
+1	whitespace	0m 0s	The patch has no whitespace issues.
+1	findbugs	5m 8s	the patch passed
+1	javadoc	0m 23s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 27s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 18s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 27s	hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-core generated 0 new + 2490 unchanged - 6 fixed = 2490 total (was 2496)
+1	javadoc	0m 21s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 19s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch passed.
+1	unit	15m 3s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch passed.
-1	unit	35m 53s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch failed.
+1	unit	9m 0s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch passed.
+1	unit	2m 54s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-core in the patch passed.
+1	unit	8m 52s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
+1	unit	106m 42s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch passed.
+1	asflicense	0m 37s	The patch does not generate ASF License warnings.
		259m 10s	

Reason	Tests
Failed junit tests	hadoop.yarn.server.resourcemanager.metrics.TestSystemMetricsPublisherForV2


Subsystem	Report/Notes
-----------	--------------

Docker	Image:yetus/hadoop:9560f25
JIRA Issue	<a href="#">YARN-5792</a>
JIRA Patch URL	<a href="https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12838519/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.03.patch">https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12838519/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.03.patch</a>
Optional Tests	asflicense compile javac javadoc mvninstall mvnsite unit findbugs checkstyle
uname	Linux 52211eabfd73 3.13.0-36-lowlatency #63-Ubuntu SMP PREEMPT Wed Sep 3 21:56:12 UTC 2014 x86_64 x86_64 x86_64 GNU/Linux
Build tool	maven
Personality	/testptch/hadoop/patchprocess/precommit/personality/provided.sh
git revision	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> / 25b1917
Default Java	1.8.0_101
findbugs	v3.0.0
checkstyle	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager.txt</a>
Test Results	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/testReport/">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/testReport/</a>
modules	C: hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-applications/hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient U: .
Console output	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/console">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13869/console</a>
Powered by	Apache Yetus 0.4.0-SNAPSHOT <a href="http://yetus.apache.org">http://yetus.apache.org</a>

This message was automatically generated.

▼  [Varun Saxena](#) added a comment - 11/Nov/16 16:03

Attaching patch fixing test failure and rest of the checkstyle issues which could be fixed

▼  [Hadoop QA](#) added a comment - 11/Nov/16 20:23

 **-1 overall**


Vote	Subsystem	Runtime	Comment
0	reexec	0m 28s	Docker mode activated.
+1	@author	0m 0s	The patch does not contain any @author tags.
+1	test4tests	0m 0s	The patch appears to include 10 new or modified test files.
0	mvndep	2m 44s	Maven dependency ordering for branch
+1	mvninstall	7m 1s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	compile	6m 56s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	checkstyle	1m 44s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvnsite	2m 55s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvneclipse	1m 33s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	findbugs	3m 59s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	javadoc	1m 51s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
0	mvndep	0m 17s	Maven dependency ordering for patch
+1	mvninstall	2m 27s	the patch passed
+1	compile	6m 53s	the patch passed
+1	javac	6m 53s	the patch passed
-0	checkstyle	1m 46s	root: The patch generated 13 new + 1245 unchanged - 62 fixed = 1258 total (was 1307)
+1	mvnsite	3m 10s	the patch passed
+1	mvneclipse	1m 51s	the patch passed

+1	whitespace	0m 0s	The patch has no whitespace issues.
+1	findbugs	5m 2s	the patch passed
+1	javadoc	0m 22s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 26s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 17s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 26s	hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-core generated 0 new + 2490 unchanged - 6 fixed = 2490 total (was 2496)
+1	javadoc	0m 21s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 18s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch passed.
-1	unit	14m 48s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch failed.
+1	unit	35m 43s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch passed.
+1	unit	9m 26s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch passed.
+1	unit	2m 48s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-core in the patch passed.
+1	unit	8m 39s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
+1	unit	105m 23s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch passed.
+1	asflicense	0m 37s	The patch does not generate ASF License warnings.
		254m 44s	

Reason	Tests
Failed junit tests	hadoop.yarn.server.nodemanager.containermanager.queuing.TestQueuingContainerManager

Subsystem	Report/Notes
Docker	Image:yetus/hadoop:9560f25
JIRA Issue	<a href="#">YARN-5792</a>
JIRA Patch URL	<a href="https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12838570/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.04.patch">https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12838570/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.04.patch</a>
Optional Tests	asflicense compile javac javadoc mvninstall mvnsite unit findbugs checkstyle
uname	Linux b96168584c69 3.13.0-95-generic #142-Ubuntu SMP Fri Aug 12 17:00:09 UTC 2016 x86_64 x86_64 x86_64 GNU/Linux
Build tool	maven
Personality	/testptch/hadoop/patchprocess/precommit/personality/provided.sh
git revision	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> / 25b1917
Default Java	1.8.0_111
findbugs	v3.0.0
checkstyle	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager.txt</a>
Test Results	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/testReport/">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/testReport/</a>
modules	C: hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-applications/hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient U: .
Console output	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/console">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13875/console</a>
Powered by	Apache Yetus 0.4.0-SNAPSHOT <a href="http://yetus.apache.org">http://yetus.apache.org</a>

This message was automatically generated.

▼  Sangjin Lee added a comment - 11/Nov/16 23:34

[varun\\_saxena](#), thanks for the update!

Your points are acknowledged about the MR task id as well as the container id. If using the id part takes extra assumptions and unnatural handling, then I don't think we need to force it. My original concern about using the created time is that that information may not always be available on all update cases. If we can guarantee the created time is made always available for all kinds of update scenarios, then I'm fine with using the created time. What do you think?

Varun Saxena added a comment - 13/Nov/16 17:20

If we can guarantee the created time is made always available for all kinds of update scenarios, then I'm fine with using the created time. What do you think?

It should be available. For YARN container in NM it wasnt available across restarts so I saved it in state store. For distributed shell, its not required. For MR entities, there are certain events which seem to be only used by rumen hence haven't handled them. Not sure why rumen has them though.

Sangjin Lee added a comment - 14/Nov/16 21:48

I went over the latest patch, and had some comments.

(ContainerImpl.java)

- l.170: nit: let's make this final

(ApplicationMaster.java)

- l.315: I don't see a reason it needs to be static. Let's make it an instance variable. Nit: let's also make it final.

(JobHistoryEventHandler.java)

- l.1073, 1083: Strictly speaking, we don't need the id prefix for the job id, because there is only one job entity per YARN application, right? Should we skip setting the prefix for job entities?

(TaskImpl.java)

- l.142: The name is bit too verbose. Could there be a better name for this? Would `launchTime` cause confusion?

In addition, should we revisit and change `TimelineEntity.compareTo()` to use the entity id prefix? We may also need to review `TimelineEntityReader.readEntities()` and see if we need to change it.

Varun Saxena added a comment - 16/Nov/16 21:49 - edited

Thanks [sjlee0](#) for the review.

Fixed all the comments.

In `TimelineEntityReader#readEntities`, as we get entries from HBase in descending order (because of prefix), we don't need `TreeSet`. We will be using `LinkedHashSet` which Rohith is using in his patch in [YARN-5585](#). For HBase implementation we do not need it but we can still change `compareTo` and use prefix in it, so that if required the correct version is used.

As this is related to reader side changes primarily, lets do so in [YARN-5585](#).

Sangjin Lee added a comment - 16/Nov/16 23:28

Thanks [varun\\_saxena](#) for updating the patch! I think it's almost there.

One minor nit: The (first) javadoc sentence should be in the third person. For example, it should say "Gets the task attempt start time" instead of "Get the task attempt start time". Could you check the javadoc we're adding in this patch and correct them?

Can others please review this patch? Thanks!

Hadoop QA added a comment - 17/Nov/16 00:33

-1 overall

Vote	Subsystem	Runtime	Comment
0	reexec	0m 19s	<a href="#">Docker mode activated.</a>
+1	@author	0m 0s	The patch does not contain any <a href="#">@author</a> tags.
+1	test4tests	0m 0s	The patch appears to include 10 new or modified test files.
0	mvndep	1m 51s	<a href="#">Maven dependency ordering for branch</a>
+1	mvninstall	8m 21s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	compile	8m 19s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	checkstyle	1m 46s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvnsite	3m 5s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed




+1	mvneclipse	1m 35s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	findbugs	4m 15s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	javadoc	2m 3s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
0	mvndep	0m 21s	Maven dependency ordering for patch
+1	mvninstall	3m 13s	the patch passed
+1	compile	9m 13s	the patch passed
+1	javac	9m 13s	the patch passed
-0	checkstyle	2m 2s	root: The patch generated 13 new + 1246 unchanged - 62 fixed = 1259 total (was 1308)
+1	mvnsite	3m 57s	the patch passed
+1	mvneclipse	2m 10s	the patch passed
+1	whitespace	0m 0s	The patch has no whitespace issues.
+1	findbugs	6m 33s	the patch passed
+1	javadoc	0m 27s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 32s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 21s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 29s	hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-core generated 0 new + 2490 unchanged - 6 fixed = 2490 total (was 2496)
+1	javadoc	0m 23s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 19s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch passed.
+1	unit	15m 41s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch passed.
+1	unit	36m 42s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch passed.
-1	unit	1m 1s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch failed.
+1	unit	2m 54s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-core in the patch passed.
-1	unit	0m 25s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch failed.
-1	unit	0m 35s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch failed.
+1	asflicense	0m 28s	The patch does not generate ASF License warnings.
		143m 56s	

Subsystem	Report/Notes
Docker	Image:yetus/hadoop:9560f25
JIRA Issue	<a href="#">YARN-5792</a>
JIRA Patch URL	<a href="https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12839241/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.05.patch">https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12839241/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.05.patch</a>
Optional Tests	asflicense compile javac javadoc mvninstall mvnsite unit findbugs checkstyle
uname	Linux 257a0a7d9ca0 3.13.0-93-generic #140-Ubuntu SMP Mon Jul 18 21:21:05 UTC 2016 x86_64 x86_64 x86_64 GNU/Linux
Build tool	maven
Personality	/testptch/hadoop/patchprocess/precommit/personality/provided.sh
git revision	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> / 25b1917
Default Java	1.8.0_111
findbugs	v3.0.0
checkstyle	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-applications_hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-applications_hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-app.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-app.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient.txt</a>
Test Results	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/testReport/">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/testReport/</a>
modules	C: hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-



	applications/hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient U: .
Console output	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/console">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13945/console</a>
Powered by	Apache Yetus 0.4.0-SNAPSHOT <a href="http://yetus.apache.org">http://yetus.apache.org</a>

This message was automatically generated.

▼  Hadoop QA added a comment - 18/Nov/16 10:46

 -1 overall

Vote	Subsystem	Runtime	Comment
0	reexec	0m 29s	Docker mode activated.
+1	@author	0m 0s	The patch does not contain any @author tags.
+1	test4tests	0m 0s	The patch appears to include 10 new or modified test files.
0	mvndep	1m 51s	Maven dependency ordering for branch
+1	mvninstall	9m 12s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	compile	9m 24s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	checkstyle	2m 0s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvnsite	3m 36s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	mvneclipse	2m 8s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	findbugs	5m 12s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
+1	javadoc	2m 38s	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> passed
0	mvndep	0m 22s	Maven dependency ordering for patch
+1	mvninstall	3m 13s	the patch passed
+1	compile	9m 23s	the patch passed
+1	javac	9m 23s	the patch passed
-0	checkstyle	2m 2s	root: The patch generated 14 new + 1180 unchanged - 127 fixed = 1194 total (was 1307)
+1	mvnsite	3m 55s	the patch passed
+1	mvneclipse	2m 13s	the patch passed
+1	whitespace	0m 0s	The patch has no whitespace issues.
+1	findbugs	6m 6s	the patch passed
+1	javadoc	0m 23s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 26s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 19s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 27s	hadoop-mapreduce-project_hadoop-mapreduce-client_hadoop-mapreduce-client-core generated 0 new + 2490 unchanged - 6 fixed = 2490 total (was 2496)
+1	javadoc	0m 21s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
+1	javadoc	0m 18s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch passed.
-1	unit	15m 47s	hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager in the patch failed.
-1	unit	39m 16s	hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager in the patch failed.
+1	unit	9m 22s	hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell in the patch passed.
+1	unit	2m 50s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-core in the patch passed.
+1	unit	8m 39s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-app in the patch passed.
+1	unit	110m 48s	hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient in the patch passed.
+1	asflicense	0m 38s	The patch does not generate ASF License warnings.
		278m 7s	

Reason	Tests
--------	-------


Failed junit tests	hadoop.yarn.server.nodemanager.containermanager.queueing.TestQueueingContainerManager
	hadoop.yarn.server.resourcemanager.TestResourceTrackerService

Subsystem	Report/Notes
Docker	Image:yetus/hadoop:9560f25
JIRA Issue	<a href="#">YARN-5792</a>
JIRA Patch URL	<a href="https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12839507/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.06.patch">https://issues.apache.org/jira/secure/attachment/12839507/YARN-5792-YARN-5355.06.patch</a>
Optional Tests	asflicense compile javac javadoc mvninstall mvnsite unit findbugs checkstyle
uname	Linux 09adf8a6b833 3.13.0-95-generic #142-Ubuntu SMP Fri Aug 12 17:00:09 UTC 2016 x86_64 x86_64 x86_64 GNU/Linux
Build tool	maven
Personality	/testptch/hadoop/patchprocess/precommit/personality/provided.sh
git revision	<a href="#">YARN-5355</a> / 25b1917
Default Java	1.8.0_111
findbugs	v3.0.0
checkstyle	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/artifact/patchprocess/diff-checkstyle-root.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager.txt</a>
unit	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager.txt">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/artifact/patchprocess/patch-unit-hadoop-yarn-project_hadoop-yarn_hadoop-yarn-server_hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager.txt</a>
Test Results	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/testReport/">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/testReport/</a>
modules	C: hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-applications/hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient U: .
Console output	<a href="https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/console">https://builds.apache.org/job/PreCommit-YARN-Build/13969/console</a>
Powered by	Apache Yetus 0.4.0-SNAPSHOT <a href="http://yetus.apache.org">http://yetus.apache.org</a>

This message was automatically generated.


- ▼  [Varun Saxena](#) added a comment - 18/Nov/16 18:23

Checkstyle issues are related to constructor param length and cannot be fixed.

- ▼  [Sangjin Lee](#) added a comment - 19/Nov/16 00:01

The latest patch LGTM.

I'll wait until next Monday (if you don't mind) so others have a chance to chime in before I commit. Thanks!

- ▼  [Sangjin Lee](#) added a comment - 21/Nov/16 22:42

Committed the latest patch (v.06) to [YARN-5355](#) and cherry-picked it to [YARN-5355](#)-branch-2.

There were a couple of conflict resolutions I had to do for branch-2:

(1) there appears to be a redundant `storeContainer()` call in `ContainerManagerImpl.startContainerInternal()` in [YARN-5355](#). This redundant call does not exist on [YARN-5355](#)-branch-2. The redundant call in the trunk was subsequently removed by [YARN-5856](#).

(2) Similarly, there appears to be a `storeContainer()` call in `QueueingContainerManagerImpl` that does not exist on [YARN-5355](#)-branch-2.

Thanks [varun\\_saxena](#) for your contribution!

- ▼  [Varun Saxena](#) added a comment - 22/Nov/16 11:31

Thanks [sjlee0](#) for the review and commit.

- ▼  [Hudson](#) added a comment - 30/Aug/17 06:43

SUCCESS: Integrated in Jenkins build Hadoop-trunk-Commit #12271 (See <https://builds.apache.org/job/Hadoop-trunk-Commit/12271/>) [YARN-5792](#). Adopt the id prefix for YARN, MR, and DS entities. (varunsaxena: rev 092fead5d9875fb3760206bcd76cdafec5e9481)

- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/TaskAttemptFinishedEvent.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/TaskAttemptUnsuccessfulCompletionEvent.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/TaskFailedEvent.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/recovery/NMMemoryStateStoreService.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/containermanager/container/ContainerImpl.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-applications/hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/applications/distributedshell/ApplicationMaster.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/recovery/TestNMLevelDbStateStoreService.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/TestEvents.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/TaskFinishedEvent.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/MapAttemptFinishedEvent.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-jobclient/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapred/TestMRTimelineEventHandling.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/containermanager/container/Container.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-applications/hadoop-yarn-applications-distributedshell/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/applications/distributedshell/TestDistributedShell.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/recovery/NMNullStateStoreService.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/v2/app/job/impl/TaskAttemptImpl.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/containermanager/application/TestApplication.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/containermanager/application/ApplicationContainerFinishedEvent.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/resourcemanager/metrics/TestSystemMetricsPublisherForV2.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/recovery/NMStateStoreService.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/TestJobHistoryEventHandler.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/resourcemanager/ResourceTrackerService.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/webapp/TestNMWebServer.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-resourcemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/resourcemanager/metrics/TimelineServiceV2Publisher.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-core/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/ReduceAttemptFinishedEvent.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/test/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/webapp/MockContainer.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/jobhistory/JobHistoryEventHandler.java
- (edit) hadoop-mapreduce-project/hadoop-mapreduce-client/hadoop-mapreduce-client-app/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/mapreduce/v2/app/job/impl/TaskImpl.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/containermanager/ContainerManagerImpl.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/recovery/NMLevelDbStateStoreService.java
- (edit) hadoop-yarn-project/hadoop-yarn/hadoop-yarn-server/hadoop-yarn-server-nodemanager/src/main/java/org/apache/hadoop/yarn/server/nodemanager/timeline/timelinepublisher/NMTimelinePublisher.java

## People

Assignee:



Varun Saxena

Reporter:



Sangjin Lee

Votes:

0 Vote for this issue

Watchers:

7 Start watching this issue

▼ Dates

---

Created:

27/Oct/16 22:33

Updated:

28/Mar/19 14:08

Resolved:

21/Nov/16 22:42