

Heuristic Evaluation

Joint report

Part I: Project Description

A prototype of a smartphone app called Monument Viewer that was made of 5 slides which allows you to see how the monuments were built originally just by pointing the phone camera to them.

Part II: Joint List of Violations

1. H1 Visibility of system status
Where: "Colosseum view" page
What: When you switch from "80 AD" to "NOW", the "See info" button remain the same and it doesn't indicate in any way, that the content of the related Pop-up has changed
Why: The user is not led to reopen the Pop-up to read its contents and he can miss it
Severity: 2
2. H1 Visibility of system status
Where: Colosseum Info
What: It isn't shown at what point of the lecture you are with a scrollbar
Why: You don't have a way to know how much text you still need to read
Severity: 1
3. H1 Visibility of system status
Where: In the Colosseum info page.
What: When I click on "see info" button, the pop-up page does not show that I'm actually in the info section.
Why: The user should always know where he is in the application.
Severity: 1
4. H1 Visibility of system status
Where: In the Suggest an edit page.
What: There is a "Colosseum" entry that does not specify what it is.
Why: A didactic title should be inserted above each form.
Severity: 2
5. H2 Match between system and the real world
Where: "Suggest an edit" form page, "Upload a photo" section
What: It is used the "library" term, to indicate the collection of photos in your device
Why: The more correct term should be "gallery"
Severity: 1
6. H2 Match between system and the real world
Where: "Colosseum view" page
What: It is used a scroll bar to change historical period
Why: The user would expect to see a change or more stopping points, not a start and an end
Severity: 3
7. H2 Match between system and real word
Where: In the slide where the coliseum description is open
What: In the top left of the phone there is an edit button without actually saying what the button does.

Why: The user might not be aware what the icon represents

Severity:1

8. H2 Match between system and the real world

Where: In the “Are you sure” pop-up.

What: “Are you sure” is too general, the pop-up should give information about what the app is going to do.

Why: It is not clear what the pop-up refers to.

Severity: 2

9. H3 User control and freedom

Where: “Suggest an edit” form page

What: If the user opens this page, starting from the Colosseum page in the “NOW” period, he will return to the Colosseum page in the wrong period

Why: The user “Cancel” or “Send” a form, doesn’t go back to where he started from

Severity: 2

10. H3 User control and freedom

Where: Everywhere

What: There isn’t a home button that allows the user to return to the main page

Why: Interface not comfortable

Severity: 4

11. H4 Consistency and standards

Where: “Colosseum view” page and Lateral Menu

What: Text font of “See info” button, in “Colosseum view” page, and text font of “Suggest an edit” button, in the Lateral Menu, aren’t synchronized

Why: They are both secondary functions of equal importance

Severity: 1

12. H4 Consistency and standards

Where: “Suggest an edit” form page

What: The “Choose the topic” button icon isn’t exactly correct

Why: This is a dropdown button, not a scroll list, and the icon have two arrows

Severity: 1

13. H4 Consistency and standards

Where: “Suggest an edit” page Pop-up

What: Text font used for the question is never used elsewhere, the Pop-up layout is different from the rest of the prototype

Why: This Pop-up is inconsistent with the rest of the prototype

Severity: 1

14. H4 Consistency and standards

Where: In the first slide.

What: In this page the “Lateral Menu” button isn’t clickable, while in “Colosseum view page” yes

Why: It is a simulated page, but I don’t know if it will be clickable and what happen when clicked

Severity: 2

15. H4 Consistency and standards

Where: In the edit slide when you have to confirm and when there is the popup to make the action go

What: The positive answer is placed on the right in the first slide but for the confirmation the positive one is placed on the left

- Why: This may introduce the user to make mistakes while using the app
Severity: 2
16. H5 Error prevention
Where: "Suggest an edit" page
What: It is possible to send an infinite number of empty forms, even without choosing a topic
Why: It could be an error for the integrity of the application itself (server saturation, DoS, ...)
Severity: 3
17. H6 Recognition rather than recall
Where: "Suggest an edit" page
What: The user is informed, that the "Suggested an edit" is "Done!", but is not reminded later, that it has already been done that
Why: The user who doesn't remember this, will make the suggestion multiple times
Severity: 1
18. H6 Recognition rather than recall
Where: Suggest an edit
What: It isn't shown the original text which you want to suggest an edit
Why: If you want to change different things it can be difficult to remember all
Severity: 3
19. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use
Where: "Colosseum view" page
What: The scroll bar makes you watch the monument how it is nowadays but you have it in front of you when you are using the app, making it pointless
Why: It is a conceptual mistake, "Why users should be prompted to use the scroll bar?"
Severity: 3
20. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use
Where: In the description of the document
What: There are two different descriptions of the same monument (present and past) but it's not intuitive to understand that the two descriptions are different
Why: User might miss some content of the app
Severity: 3
21. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use
Where: In the readme explanation of functionalities
What: If you move the screen away from the monument you go back to the loading page
Why: If you want to use the app you must frame the monument, it's super uncomfortable
Severity: 4
22. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
Where: "Colosseum view" page
What: The Lateral Menu and the relative button, are unnecessary
Why: It contains only one button, which could be interchanged with the one on the menu itself
Severity: 2
23. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
Where: Colosseum Info
What: There is a difference style of writing between the two info (80ad and now), in now info after going to a new line there is a space, while in the 80ad not.

- Why: Ugly to see
Severity: 1
24. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
Where: Suggest an edit page.
What: The user can add a photo even if the selected issue is not related to the photo.
Why: The user doesn't need to add photos if the selected problem is another.
Severity: 3
25. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
Where: "Suggest an edit" page
What: The "Please insert your name" section is unnecessary
Why: There isn't a user profile and the user's name isn't useful for solving the reported issue
Severity: 2
26. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
Where: Colosseum Info
What: The space between words is different each time, there isn't a proper text formatting
Why: Ugly to see
Severity: 1
27. H9 Help users recognize, diagnose, and recover from errors
Where: "Simulated" Home page
What: In the prototype, the case in which a monument isn't recognized, isn't present, not even in a simulated form
Why: I can't know how the case is handled and the error shown to the user
Severity: 3
28. H10 Help and Documentation
Where: in the README
What: The simple task says that you have to provide quick information but both description of the monument in the prototype are not quick.
Why: The simple task doesn't match with the prototype features.
Severity: 4
29. H10 Help and documentation
Where: In the README on the complex task
What: The readme says that the app allows you to signal incorrect information but in reality you propose an edit not a real correction (so you can also add more info instead of correct wrong ones)
Why: The complex task doesn't match with the prototype features
Severity: 4
30. HN: Non-heuristic issue
Where: "See info" Pop-up
What: The Pop-up, on "Colosseum view" page in "NOW" period doesn't open properly if you open it while scrolling instead of clicking
Why: There is a bug
Severity: 2
31. HN: Non-heuristic issue
Where: Lateral Menu
What: On "Colosseum view" page, when the Lateral Menu is open the background changes
Why: There is a bug
Severity: 2

32. HN Non-heuristic issue

Where: Left Navbar

What: It isn't shown a button for closing the left-sidebar

Why: It isn't intuitive, there should be a "go back" button together with clicking randomly out of the left-sidebar

Severity: 1

Part III: Summary and Joint Recommendations

Report in the table below the number of identified violations according to their severity rating.

Heuristic	# viol. (rating: 0)	# viol. (rating: 1)	# viol. (rating: 2)	# viol. (rating: 3)	# viol. (rating: 4)
H1: Visibility of system status		2	2		
H2: Match between system and the real world		2	1	1	
H3: User control and freedom		1			1
H4: Consistency and standards		3	2		
H5: Error prevention			1		
H6: Recognition rather than recall		1		1	
H7: Flexibility and efficiency of use				2	1
H8: Aesthetic and minimalist design		2	2	1	
H9: Help users recognize, diagnose, and recover from errors				1	
H10: Help and documentation					2
HN: Non-heuristic issue		1	1		

Generally the application was well made, but there are some problems of graphic inconsistency for having so few slides. Even if there are the inconsistency in the graphic this is not the main problem we found. There are 2 major problems that we think might affect very hard the interface: the first one is that the entire concept of the application is a bit inefficient because it forces the users to point the monument the whole time while reading and scrolling the application, the second one is that the simple and complex task

don't represent directly the feature of the application. The simple task says that the information provided are quick but in the prototype there is a long list to read which is not quick; the complex task instead says that you can signal incorrect information but you can just propose an edit which allows you to add more things rather than signal wrong ones.