Heuristic Evaluation

Individual Report

Part I: Your Name

Luca Rota, student ID s303941.

Part II: Project Description

"Monument Viewer" is a little good project, developed by "Internet Explorers" group, about a cultural application, that allow you to see how monuments have changed during the history, with few functionalities, but covering the three tasks considered by the group.

Part III: Evaluation Execution

I carried out the Heuristic Evaluation first in-person, during the dedicated lesson of December 16, interacting with the other group, to clarify some aspects of the prototype's functionalities implemented by them.

Then I continued at home, using the template provided by the professor and I based my report on Jakob Nielsen's 10 general principles for interaction design, as requested. To do that, I did all phases of Heuristic Evaluation, from get a general feeling for the interaction flow of the prototype, to focus on specific UI elements, for each tasks developed.

The ReadMe provided by "Internet Explorers" group is quite comprehensive, there was some aspect reported, by the tasks developed, not completely coherently in the prototype, which I highlighted among the violations.

The main difficulty, for my evaluation, was that this prototype was very small in terms of "user" screens to analyze (four screens, not counting repeated ones and confirmation Pop-ups), so I also had to analyze some missing aspects, after considering the Heuristic Violations of the implemented functions.

Part IV: List of Violations

Focus on giving feedback on the implemented functions (in order of "*Heuristic #*" and "*severity rating*"):

1. H1 Visibility of system status
   Where: "Colosseum view" page
   What: When you switch from "80 AD" to "NOW", the "See info" button remain the same and it doesn't indicate in any way, that the content of the related Pop-up has changed
   Why: The user is not led to reopen the Pop-up to read its contents and he can miss it
   Severity: 2

2. H2 Match between system and the real world
   Where: "Suggest an edit" form page, "Upload a photo" section
   What: It is used the "library" term, to indicate the collection of photos in your device
   Why: The more correct term should be "gallery"
   Severity: 1

3. H2 Match between system and the real world
   Where: "Colosseum view" page
   What: It is used a scroll bar to change historical period
   Why: The user would expect to see a change or more stopping points, not a start and an end
   Severity: 3

4. H3 User control and freedom
   Where: "Suggest an edit" form page
   What: If the user opens this page, starting from the Colosseum page in the "NOW" period, he will return to the Colosseum page in the wrong period
   Why: The user "Cancel" or "Send" a form, doesn't go back to where he started from
   Severity: 2

5. H4 Consistency and standards
   Where: "Colosseum view" page and Lateral Menu
   What: Text font of "See info" button, in "Colosseum view" page, and text font of "Suggest an edit" button, in the Lateral Menu, aren't synchronized
   Why: They are both secondary functions of equal importance
   Severity: 1

6. H4 Consistency and standards
   Where: "See info" Pop-up
   What: The "Lateral Menu" button icon change in the "Suggested an edit" button icon
   Why: The icon keeps the same position can be confusing
   Severity: 1

7. H4 Consistency and standards
   Where: "Suggest an edit" form page
   What: The "Choose the topic" button icon isn't exactly correct
   Why: This is a dropdown button, not a scroll list, and the icon have two arrows
   Severity: 1

8. H4 Consistency and standards
   Where: "Suggest an edit" page Pop-up
   What: Text font used for the question is never used elsewhere, the Pop-up layout is different from the rest of the prototype and the order of "Sure" and "Not sure" buttons is the reverse of "Cancel" and "Send" buttons, on this page
   Why: This Pop-up isn't consistent with the rest of the prototype
   Severity: 3

9. H5 Error prevention
   Where: "See info" Pop-up
   What: The "80 AD" and "NOW" text of "Colosseum view" page they are perfectly aligned with the edges of the Pop-up, and it seems that they allow to change the written information
   Why: It could be an error, if clicking outside the Pop-up closes it, without allowing the user to understand why the written information has not changed
   Severity: 1

10. H5 Error prevention
    Where: "Suggest an edit" page
    What: It is possible to send an infinite number of empty forms, even without choosing a topic
    Why: It could be an error for the integrity of the application itself (server saturation, DoS, …)
    Severity: 3

11. H6 Recognition rather than recall
    Where: "Suggest an edit" page
    What: The user is informed, that the "Suggested an edit" is "Done!", but is not reminded later, that it has already been done that
    Why: The user who doesn't remember this, will make the suggestion multiple times
    Severity: 2

12. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use
    Where: "Suggest an edit" page
    What: "Upload a photo" feature isn't necessary to "Suggest an edit", about written information and its functioning is not very efficient
    Why: The user must have already taken the photo, before opening the application
    Severity: 2

13. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use
    Where: "Colosseum view" page
    What: The scroll bar starts from "what you want to see" to "what you have already seen"
    Why: It is a conceptual mistake, "Why users should be prompted to use the scroll bar?"
    Severity: 3

14. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
    Where: "Colosseum view" page
    What: The Lateral Menu and the relative button, are unnecessary
    Why: It contains only one button, which could be interchanged with the one on the menu itself
    Severity: 2

15. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
    Where: "Suggest an edit" page
    What: The "Please insert your name" section is unnecessary
    Why: There isn't a user profile and the user's name isn't useful for solving the reported issue
    Severity: 2

16. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design
    Where: "See info" Pop-up
    What: The text has no titles, no paragraphs and it's all the same size
    Why: The user may have difficulty reading and maintaining his focus on the information
    Severity: 3

17. HN: Non-heuristic issue
    Where: "See info" Pop-up
    What: The Pop-up, on "Colosseum view" page in "NOW" period doesn't open properly
    Why: There is a bug
    Severity: 2

18. HN: Non-heuristic issue
    Where: Lateral Menu
    What: On "Colosseum view" page, when the Lateral Menu is open the background changes
    Why: There is a bug
    Severity: 2

19. HN: Non-heuristic issue
    Where: "See info" Pop-up
    What: The text style of "See info" Pop-up makes the information not quick to read
    Why: It is not consistent with what is reported in the Simple Task on the ReadMe ("retrieve quick and exhaustive information")
    Severity: 4

20. HN: Non-heuristic issue
    Where: "Suggest an edit" page
    What: The "Suggest an edit" feature allows the user to report an issue, but also to ask to add some missing information
    Why: It is not consistent with what is reported in the Complex Task on the ReadMe ("signal incorrect information")
    Severity: 4

Pointing out missing features (in order of "*Heuristic #*" and "*severity rating*"):

21. H1 Visibility of system status
    Where: "Simulated" Home page and "Suggest an edit" form page, "Upload a photo" section
    What: User permissions aren't asked to access the camera and gallery
    Why: The user doesn't know which are the permissions, of the application, in his device
    Severity: 3

22. H3 User control and freedom
    Where: "Colosseum view" page
    What: There isn't a button that allows users to come back to the "Simulated" Home page
    Why: The user is forced to physically move his device
    Severity: 4

23. H4 Consistency and standards
    Where: "Simulated" Home page
    What: In this page the "Lateral Menu" button isn't clickable, while in "Colosseum view page" yes
    Why: It is a simulated page, but I don't know if it will be clickable and what happen when clicked
    Severity: 2

24. H7 Flexibility and efficiency of use
    Where: "Colosseum view" page
    What: The user is obliged to carry out the entire use of the application, including reading the information, with the device pointing to the monument
    Why: The user may have to be in an uncomfortable physical position, otherwise the application would return to the Home page
    Severity: 4

25. H9 Help users recognize, diagnose, and recover from errors
    Where: "Simulated" Home page
    What: In the prototype, the case in which a monument isn't recognized, isn't present, not even in a simulated form
    Why: I can't know how the case is handled and the error shown to the user
    Severity: 3

Part V: Summary and Recommendations

I found 25 Heuristic Violations, of which 20 related to the implemented functions and 5 to missing features. In the table I reported all Violations. Without counting the last 5, the values that change are: H1 → 1, H3 → 1, H4 → 4, H7 → 2, H9 → 0; while the others remain the same.

Heuristic	# Violations
H1: Visibility of system status	2
H2: Match between system and the real world	2
H3: User control and freedom	2
H4: Consistency and standards	5
H5: Error prevention	2
H6: Recognition rather than recall	1
H7: Flexibility and efficiency of use	3
H8: Aesthetic and minimalist design	3
H9: Help users recognize, diagnose, and recover from errors	1
H10: Help and documentation	0
HN: Non-heuristic issue	4

The prototype is generally good, but there are some aspects that need to be improved and others that are missing; for example, the possibility for a user not to have to stand in front of the monument, to read the information relating to it or to change the use of the scroll bar, making it more useful.

Another important aspect, that I feel like underlining, is that of modifying features relating to the tasks as indicated or modifying the presentation of the tasks themselves (H19 and H20).

Finally, I suggest, graphically, making the changes indicated, in order to increase graphic coherence and make the information relating to the monuments more readable.