Results

2022-03-10

Note: Table 1 shows full panel results with the imputed dataset. Table 2 shows full panel results with the non-imputed dataset. Tables 3-5 show OLS, IV, and Lewbel IV estimates by region, respectively, for the imputed dataset. Tables 6-8 show the same with the non-imputed dataset.

	OLS	ML Tobit	Selection (ML logit)	Level (OLS)	IV Lag
Coverage (lag)	0.64*	1.32**	0.19***	0.12	
	(0.29)	(0.43)	(0.05)	(0.14)	
Coverage (in-year)					0.69*
					(0.32)
Diplomatic Visits (lag)	0.91**	1.47·	0.20**	0.33*	
	(0.35)	(0.86)	(0.07)	(0.14)	
Diplomatic Visits (in-year)					1.04*
					(0.41)
Polity	−0.10	−0.11	−0.02*	−0.06**	−0.10
	(0.07)	(0.12)	(0.01)	(0.02)	(0.07)
GDP	−2.78***	−4.90***	−0.78***	−0.01	−2.80***
	(0.35)	(0.49)	(0.06)	(0.16)	(0.35)
Population	2.61***	5.41***	0.70***	0.29·	2.60***
	(0.31)	(0.76)	(0.06)	(0.16)	(0.31)
Unemployment	0.24	0.87	0.13·	−0.05	0.25
	(0.48)	(0.98)	(0.08)	(0.19)	(0.48)
Disaster Deaths	0.19	0.14	0.04	0.03	0.19
	(0.16)	(0.27)	(0.03)	(0.05)	(0.16)
Civil War	−1.46	−2.59*	−0.34*	−0.68·	−1.46
	(0.91)	(1.26)	(0.15)	(0.39)	(0.92)
Trade	0.14	−0.18	0.04	0.02	0.14
	(0.14)	(0.19)	(0.03)	(0.05)	(0.15)
Alliance	0.47	2.17	0.30	−0.60	0.17
	(0.94)	(2.82)	(0.23)	(0.47)	(0.95)
Distance	1.84*	3.61	0.47**	0.54	1.93*
	(0.80)	(2.25)	(0.14)	(0.37)	(0.83)
R^2	0.20		0.19	0.14	0.21
Adj. R^2	0.19			0.12	0.20
Num. obs.	1932	1932	1932	982	1932
RMSE	8.26			2.53	8.25
N Clusters	138			129	138
AIC		9182.94	2325.39		
BIC		9333.23	2464.57		
Log Likelihood		−4564.47	−1137.69		
Left-censored		950			
Uncensored		982			
Right-censored		0			
Deviance			2275.39		
Deviance explained			0.15		
Dispersion			1.00		
GCV score			1170.73		
Num. smooth terms			1		

***$p < 0.001$; **$p < 0.01$; *$p < 0.05$; ·$p < 0.1$

Table 2: Model Estimates

	OLS	Selection (ML logit)	Level (OLS)	IV Lag
Coverage (lag)	0.70	0.15	0.42**	
	(0.46)	(0.10)	(0.13)	
Coverage (in-year)				0.79
				(0.56)
Diplomatic Visits (lag)	0.64	0.14	0.36*	
	(0.40)	(0.11)	(0.17)	
Diplomatic Visits (in-year)				0.78
				(0.49)
Polity	−0.09	−0.01	−0.10***	−0.09
	(0.08)	(0.01)	(0.03)	(0.08)
GDP	−3.38***	−0.90***	−0.17	−3.42***
	(0.62)	(0.13)	(0.23)	(0.63)
Population	3.00***	0.79***	0.22	2.98***
	(0.51)	(0.11)	(0.26)	(0.51)
Unemployment	0.73	0.22˙	0.22	0.74
	(0.59)	(0.11)	(0.24)	(0.59)
Disaster Deaths	0.06	0.02	0.00	0.06
	(0.21)	(0.05)	(0.07)	(0.20)
Civil War	−1.19	−0.35	0.04	−1.13
	(1.19)	(0.22)	(0.44)	(1.19)
Trade	0.34	0.07	0.08	0.34
	(0.55)	(0.10)	(0.17)	(0.55)
Alliance	0.39	0.28	−0.66	0.08
	(1.35)	(0.35)	(0.54)	(1.38)
Distance	1.15	0.28	0.60	1.27
	(1.01)	(0.23)	(0.44)	(1.05)
R^2	0.21	0.18	0.19	0.22
Adj. R^2	0.20		0.16	0.20
Num. obs.	837	837	460	837
RMSE	8.18		2.39	8.16
N Clusters	106		97	106
AIC		1009.98		
BIC		1099.85		
Log Likelihood		−485.99		
Deviance		971.98		
Deviance explained		0.16		
Dispersion		1.00		
GCV score		507.35		
Num. smooth terms		1		

***$p < 0.001$; **$p < 0.01$; *$p < 0.05$; ˙$p < 0.1$

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (lag)	−0.01	0.60·	−0.32	−0.00	5.81·	1.66***
	(0.47)	(0.30)	(0.99)	(0.80)	(2.47)	(0.34)
Diplomatic Visits (lag)	1.49*	0.14			−0.26	
	(0.57)	(1.15)			(1.61)	
Polity	0.11	−0.30	0.06	0.07	−0.37·	−0.19·
	(0.15)	(0.18)	(0.19)	(0.11)	(0.19)	(0.11)
GDP	−2.64*	−2.72***	−1.60	−1.64	−7.17	−1.61*
	(1.21)	(0.49)	(1.56)	(1.25)	(3.82)	(0.62)
Population	2.15·	2.76***	1.23	1.26	−1.54	1.30*
	(1.24)	(0.64)	(1.35)	(1.25)	(3.94)	(0.63)
Unemployment	−1.76	−0.20	−1.16	1.60	0.55	0.64
	(2.88)	(1.06)	(1.42)	(1.64)	(1.42)	(0.85)
Disaster Deaths	0.44	1.07**	−0.41	0.54·	0.07	0.20
	(0.28)	(0.35)	(0.38)	(0.29)	(0.42)	(0.21)
Civil War	−0.71	−0.80	0.17	−5.23*	−4.98*	−1.52
	(1.33)	(1.66)	(1.51)	(2.14)	(1.78)	(1.21)
Trade	0.03	−0.05	0.93·	0.45	7.08*	0.75*
	(0.18)	(0.15)	(0.50)	(0.65)	(2.12)	(0.32)
Alliance	1.80				0.29	
	(1.29)				(2.66)	
Distance	0.15	1.51	11.77	−0.19	6.60	0.06
	(1.20)	(2.32)	(7.24)	(3.46)	(14.46)	(3.53)
R^2	0.33	0.21	0.23	0.21	0.46	0.23
Adj. R^2	0.27	0.14	0.17	0.14	0.28	0.21
Num. obs.	322	294	336	252	98	630
RMSE	7.68	8.48	7.99	7.15	7.25	7.81
N Clusters	23	21	24	18	7	45

Table 3: OLS Estimates by Region

***$p < 0.001$; **$p < 0.01$; *$p < 0.05$; ·$p < 0.1$

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Sahara
Coverage (in-year)	−0.38	0.63˙	−0.50	−0.00	9.76	1.84
	(0.46)	(0.33)	(1.52)	(0.97)	(6.55)	(0.3
Diplomatic Visits (in-year)	2.87*	0.16			0.32	
	(1.03)	(1.21)			(21.51)	
Polity	0.08	−0.30	0.05	0.07	−0.21	−0.
	(0.16)	(0.18)	(0.20)	(0.11)	(0.31)	(0.1
GDP	−2.71*	−2.74***	−1.56	−1.64	−7.53˙	−1.6
	(1.16)	(0.50)	(1.65)	(1.28)	(3.09)	(0.6
Population	2.29˙	2.74***	1.28	1.26	−3.04	1.2
	(1.27)	(0.65)	(1.35)	(1.24)	(6.21)	(0.6
Unemployment	−1.22	−0.23	−1.16	1.60	0.99	0.6
	(2.83)	(1.05)	(1.43)	(1.66)	(2.53)	(0.8
Disaster Deaths	0.46	1.08**	−0.42	0.54˙	−0.02	0.2
	(0.28)	(0.34)	(0.38)	(0.29)	(0.30)	(0.2
Civil War	−0.31	−0.63	0.14	−5.23*	−7.59*	−1.
	(1.22)	(1.78)	(1.49)	(2.14)	(2.49)	(1.2
Trade	0.01	−0.05	0.94˙	0.45	7.46*	0.7
	(0.17)	(0.15)	(0.49)	(0.65)	(2.39)	(0.3
Alliance	0.84				2.83	
	(1.27)				(5.42)	
Distance	0.20	1.60	12.03	−0.19	3.53	0.1
	(1.21)	(2.46)	(7.56)	(3.68)	(18.50)	(3.5
R²	0.34	0.21	0.22	0.21	0.41	0.2
Adj. R²	0.29	0.14	0.17	0.14	0.21	0.2
Num. obs.	322	294	336	252	98	63
RMSE	7.59	8.48	8.02	7.15	7.60	7.8
N Clusters	23	21	24	18	7	45

***$p < 0.001$; **$p < 0.01$; *$p < 0.05$; ˙$p < 0.1$

Table 4: IV Lag Estimates by Region

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (in-year)	−0.41	0.32	0.83	1.97	5.67	1.63***
	(0.74)	(0.28)	(1.30)	(1.34)	(3.77)	(0.31)
Diplomatic Visits	2.14˙	−1.15			0.50	
	(1.10)	(1.42)			(1.41)	
Polity	0.11	−0.33˙	0.04	0.03	−0.03	−0.22˙
	(0.15)	(0.17)	(0.20)	(0.13)	(0.14)	(0.11)
GDP	−2.58˙	−2.78***	−1.75	−2.12	−1.78	−1.65*
	(1.25)	(0.64)	(1.28)	(1.41)	(3.90)	(0.61)
Population	2.09	2.81**	0.68	0.54	−2.32	1.30*
	(1.36)	(0.77)	(1.50)	(1.36)	(4.12)	(0.62)
Unemployment	−2.15	−0.47	−1.15	1.22	−1.52˙	0.57
	(2.90)	(1.11)	(1.43)	(1.66)	(0.75)	(0.82)
Disaster Deaths	0.51˙	1.16**	−0.38	0.83˙	−0.00	0.23
	(0.29)	(0.34)	(0.38)	(0.40)	(0.46)	(0.21)
Civil War	−0.47	−1.69	0.21	−5.92**	−5.72*	−1.81
	(1.33)	(1.79)	(1.45)	(1.95)	(2.04)	(1.21)
Trade	0.04	−0.01	0.85˙	0.46	2.12	0.83**
	(0.17)	(0.18)	(0.49)	(0.87)	(1.57)	(0.29)
Alliance	2.08˙				−2.70	
	(1.12)				(1.93)	
Distance	0.50	−1.60	11.04	4.58	−1.32	0.24
	(1.31)	(3.16)	(6.88)	(3.93)	(15.81)	(3.70)
R²	0.33	0.20	0.23	0.20	0.36	0.24
Adj. R²	0.27	0.13	0.18	0.12	0.15	0.21
Num. obs.	322	294	336	252	98	630
RMSE	7.68	8.53	7.98	7.23	7.90	7.80
N Clusters	23	21	24	18	7	45

Table 5: Lewbel IV Estimates by Region

***$p < 0.001$; **$p < 0.01$; *$p < 0.05$; ˙$p < 0.1$

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (lag)	2.58	0.58	−0.39	1.34	4.65	1.20
	(2.11)	(0.37)	(2.05)	(0.82)	(5.66)	(0.81)
Diplomatic Visits (lag)	0.85	−0.61			−0.93	
	(1.15)	(1.82)			(3.55)	
Polity	0.01	−0.28	0.33	0.15	−0.44	−0.10
	(0.14)	(0.24)	(0.19)	(0.21)	(0.26)	(0.11)
GDP	−7.82***	−1.89	0.16	−3.16*	−5.36	−0.68
	(1.49)	(1.61)	(2.44)	(1.10)	(22.08)	(0.88)
Population	6.93***	1.62	2.93	2.78·	1.46	−0.20
	(0.82)	(1.04)	(1.81)	(1.40)	(17.68)	(0.89)
Unemployment	4.46**	−0.19	−2.72	0.05	−0.51	0.50
	(1.21)	(0.95)	(2.10)	(1.20)	(4.22)	(0.91)
Disaster Deaths	−0.25	1.31**	−1.14*	0.42	−0.29	0.31
	(0.26)	(0.42)	(0.46)	(0.54)	(0.56)	(0.32)
Civil War	0.03	−0.30	2.86	−7.78**	−0.20	−1.89
	(1.68)	(3.73)	(2.47)	(2.25)	(3.50)	(1.58)
Trade	0.30	−0.13	−2.17	0.92	2.57	1.05*
	(1.43)	(1.78)	(1.24)	(1.00)	(8.28)	(0.51)
Alliance	1.23				−7.16	
	(2.42)				(7.38)	
Distance	5.40**	−2.98	8.19	1.57	12.70	−8.53*
	(1.50)	(8.16)	(7.57)	(4.77)	(40.69)	(3.95)
R^2	0.54	0.22	0.26	0.42	0.62	0.20
Adj. R^2	0.45	0.10	0.16	0.31	0.30	0.15
Num. obs.	112	136	136	101	40	312
RMSE	6.76	8.50	7.70	6.41	7.57	7.59
N Clusters	14	17	17	14	5	39

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; · $p < 0.1$

Table 6: OLS Estimates by Region

8

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Sahara
Coverage (in-year)	−0.45	0.62	−0.73	1.53	−80.66	1.6
	(6.83)	(0.42)	(3.84)	(0.93)	(369.99)	(1.0
Diplomatic Visits (in-year)	6.66	−0.61			−28.17	
	(10.48)	(2.17)			(126.74)	
Polity	−0.16	−0.28	0.32	0.14	−1.49	−0.
	(0.39)	(0.24)	(0.22)	(0.22)	(4.73)	(0.1
GDP	−9.34**	−1.93	0.25	−3.23*	−142.42	−0.
	(2.81)	(1.62)	(2.78)	(1.14)	(645.00)	(0.9
Population	7.53***	1.61	3.03	2.63·	216.67	−0.
	(1.65)	(1.07)	(1.79)	(1.44)	(975.52)	(0.9
Unemployment	6.35	−0.16	−2.75	−0.02	−6.81	0.4
	(3.66)	(0.99)	(2.17)	(1.22)	(22.49)	(0.9
Disaster Deaths	−0.20	1.29*	−1.16*	0.47	−0.34	0.3
	(0.35)	(0.46)	(0.50)	(0.55)	(2.02)	(0.3
Civil War	1.27	−0.03	2.85	−7.81**	−2.97	−1.
	(3.29)	(3.85)	(2.46)	(2.25)	(14.08)	(1.5
Trade	2.14	−0.11	−2.14	0.98	−35.75	1.0
	(3.63)	(1.76)	(1.24)	(1.00)	(159.97)	(0.5
Alliance	0.82				−45.04	
	(2.59)				(164.99)	
Distance	6.31*	−2.89	8.58	2.63	547.22	−8.0
	(2.59)	(9.68)	(8.83)	(4.87)	(2423.44)	(4.0
R²	0.44	0.21	0.26	0.41	−1.89	0.2
Adj. R²	0.33	0.10	0.16	0.30	−4.37	0.1
Num. obs.	112	136	136	101	40	31
RMSE	7.44	8.50	7.70	6.46	20.94	7.5
N Clusters	14	17	17	14	5	39

Table 7: IV Lag Estimates by Region

***$p < 0.001$; **$p < 0.01$; *$p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (in-year)	7.84	0.43	−0.41	0.28	16.72*	−1.48
	(5.57)	(0.61)	(2.38)	(1.71)	(4.53)	(2.49)
Diplomatic Visits	1.04	−2.40			−1.11	
	(1.98)	(5.06)			(4.58)	
Polity	0.07	−0.31	0.33	0.24	−0.29	−0.10
	(0.13)	(0.28)	(0.20)	(0.20)	(0.28)	(0.13)
GDP	−7.98**	−2.16	0.17	−2.71·	14.26	−0.10
	(2.52)	(1.61)	(2.48)	(1.32)	(27.59)	(1.13)
Population	6.03***	1.29	2.96	3.15·	−26.42	1.03
	(1.19)	(1.37)	(1.96)	(1.65)	(25.87)	(1.07)
Unemployment	4.91*	0.29	−2.72	0.07	0.68	0.91
	(1.68)	(1.29)	(2.10)	(1.36)	(2.68)	(1.03)
Disaster Deaths	−0.11	1.26*	−1.15*	0.23	−0.65	0.29
	(0.27)	(0.46)	(0.46)	(0.58)	(0.45)	(0.36)
Civil War	−0.38	−0.88	2.79	−7.81**	−1.08	−1.61
	(2.29)	(3.61)	(2.26)	(2.18)	(3.95)	(1.83)
Trade	−1.65	0.53	−2.18·	0.75	6.07	1.16·
	(2.04)	(2.08)	(1.25)	(1.07)	(5.47)	(0.64)
Alliance	1.89				−2.89	
	(2.57)				(7.21)	
Distance	4.56*	−10.90	8.13	−0.88	−57.25	−11.17*
	(2.08)	(21.62)	(7.99)	(6.02)	(62.51)	(4.94)
R²	0.52	0.21	0.26	0.42	0.69	0.16
Adj. R²	0.43	0.09	0.16	0.31	0.42	0.11
Num. obs.	112	136	136	102	40	312
RMSE	6.86	8.53	7.70	6.41	6.91	7.78
N Clusters	14	17	17	14	5	39

***$p < 0.001$; **$p < 0.01$; *$p < 0.05$; ·$p < 0.1$

Table 8: Lewbel IV Estimates by Region