

Results

2022-01-06

Note: Table 1 shows full panel results with the imputed dataset. Table 2 shows full panel results with the non-imputed dataset. Tables 3-5 show OLS, IV, and Lewbel IV estimates by region, respectively, for the imputed dataset. Tables 6-8 show the same with the non-imputed dataset.

	OLS	ML Tobit	Selection (OLS)	Level (OLS)	IV Lag	IV Lewbel
Coverage (lag)	0.86** (0.31)	1.57*** (0.43)	0.05* (0.02)	0.15 (0.13)		
Coverage (in-year)					0.93** (0.34)	0.84* (0.40)
Polity	-0.09 (0.07)	-0.09 (0.11)	-0.00 (0.00)	-0.06* (0.02)	-0.09 (0.07)	-0.09 (0.07)
GDP	-2.87*** (0.36)	-4.99*** (0.49)	-0.16*** (0.02)	-0.02 (0.16)	-2.88*** (0.36)	-2.86*** (0.35)
Population	2.51*** (0.32)	5.14*** (0.74)	0.13*** (0.02)	0.24 (0.16)	2.49*** (0.32)	2.51*** (0.33)
Unemployment	0.10 (0.48)	0.28 (0.90)	0.01 (0.03)	-0.10 (0.19)	0.10 (0.48)	0.09 (0.48)
Disaster Deaths	0.22 (0.16)	0.18 (0.27)	0.01 (0.01)	0.04 (0.05)	0.23 (0.16)	0.23 (0.16)
Civil War	-1.52 (0.92)	-2.64* (1.24)	-0.07 (0.05)	-0.69* (0.39)	-1.53 (0.93)	-1.51 (0.93)
Trade	0.16 (0.14)	-0.18 (0.21)	0.01 (0.01)	0.05 (0.05)	0.15 (0.15)	0.16 (0.15)
Alliance	1.78 (1.09)	3.30 (2.22)	0.11 (0.06)	-0.22 (0.48)	1.72 (1.08)	1.77 (1.09)
Distance	1.10 (0.70)	1.62 (1.91)	0.06 (0.04)	0.15 (0.30)	1.12 (0.70)	1.11 (0.71)
R ²	0.20		0.18	0.13	0.20	0.20
Adj. R ²	0.19		0.17	0.11	0.19	0.19
Num. obs.	1946	1946	1946	985	1946	1946
RMSE	8.29		0.46	2.54	8.28	8.28
N Clusters	139		139	130	139	139
AIC		9227.30				
BIC		9372.21				
Log Likelihood		-4587.65				
Left-censored		961				
Uncensored		985				
Right-censored		0				

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; · $p < 0.1$

Table 1: Model Estimates

	OLS	Selection (OLS)	Level (OLS)	IV Lag	IV Lewbel
Coverage (lag)	0.72 (0.45)	0.03 (0.03)	0.41** (0.14)		
Coverage (in-year)				0.81 (0.54)	0.11 (0.22)
Polity	-0.09 (0.08)	-0.00 (0.00)	-0.10*** (0.03)	-0.09 (0.08)	-0.09 (0.08)
GDP	-3.41*** (0.61)	-0.19*** (0.03)	-0.16 (0.23)	-3.44*** (0.63)	-3.29*** (0.58)
Population	3.00*** (0.51)	0.16*** (0.03)	0.20 (0.26)	2.98*** (0.51)	3.13*** (0.51)
Unemployment	0.69 (0.59)	0.04 (0.03)	0.19 (0.25)	0.71 (0.59)	0.63 (0.60)
Disaster Deaths	0.09 (0.21)	0.00 (0.01)	0.02 (0.07)	0.09 (0.21)	0.07 (0.21)
Civil War	-1.35 (1.19)	-0.07 (0.06)	-0.00 (0.43)	-1.31 (1.19)	-1.35 (1.20)
Trade	0.39 (0.54)	0.02 (0.03)	0.10 (0.17)	0.39 (0.54)	0.48 (0.55)
Alliance	1.28 (1.44)	0.08 (0.08)	-0.26 (0.52)	1.20 (1.44)	1.50 (1.41)
Distance	0.48 (0.90)	0.02 (0.05)	0.14 (0.36)	0.50 (0.90)	0.41 (0.90)
R ²	0.21	0.20	0.18	0.21	0.21
Adj. R ²	0.19	0.18	0.15	0.20	0.19
Num. obs.	838	838	460	838	838
RMSE	8.18	0.45	2.40	8.17	8.20
N Clusters	106	106	97	106	106

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

Table 2: Model Estimates

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (lag)	0.65 (0.62)	0.60 [*] (0.29)	-0.38 (0.99)	-0.17 (0.83)	4.42 (3.02)	1.71*** (0.39)
Polity	0.13 (0.11)	-0.30 [*] (0.15)	-0.00 (0.22)	0.09 (0.12)	-0.08 (0.14)	-0.21 [*] (0.11)
GDP	-2.63* (1.18)	-2.73*** (0.51)	-1.49 (1.47)	-1.49 (1.32)	-1.45 (3.96)	-1.68** (0.62)
Population	1.86 (1.09)	2.68*** (0.67)	1.10 (1.26)	1.48 (1.14)	-2.05 (4.66)	1.28* (0.61)
Unemployment	-2.63 (2.60)	-0.30 (1.00)	-1.22 (1.45)	1.60 (1.57)	-1.66 (1.16)	0.59 (0.82)
Disaster Deaths	0.47 (0.28)	1.08** (0.32)	-0.39 (0.38)	0.47 (0.29)	0.00 (0.39)	0.21 (0.21)
Civil War	-1.13 (1.30)	-0.68 (1.50)	0.25 (1.48)	-5.16* (2.01)	-4.73* (1.43)	-1.83 (1.18)
Trade	0.06 (0.18)	-0.03 (0.15)	0.92 [*] (0.48)	0.14 (0.87)	2.03 (2.40)	0.83** (0.29)
Alliance	2.83 [*] (1.40)				-3.48 (3.02)	
Distance	0.15 (0.87)	1.13 (1.97)	12.59 [*] (7.21)	-2.05 (4.02)	-0.94 (16.10)	0.04 (3.53)
R ²	0.32	0.21	0.23	0.21	0.36	0.24
Adj. R ²	0.27	0.15	0.17	0.14	0.17	0.21
Num. obs.	336	294	336	252	98	630
RMSE	7.68	8.46	7.99	7.15	7.81	7.79
N Clusters	24	21	24	18	7	45

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; ^{*} $p < 0.1$

Table 3: OLS Estimates by Region

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (in-year)	0.69 (0.66)	0.63 (0.32)	-0.58 (1.52)	-0.21 (1.03)	8.26 (6.28)	1.90*** (0.44)
Polity	0.13 (0.11)	-0.30 (0.15)	-0.01 (0.22)	0.10 (0.12)	0.03 (0.24)	-0.22* (0.11)
GDP	-2.65* (1.20)	-2.75*** (0.52)	-1.44 (1.55)	-1.47 (1.37)	-1.51 (3.38)	-1.76** (0.62)
Population	1.88 (1.10)	2.66*** (0.67)	1.17 (1.27)	1.49 (1.11)	-4.05 (5.32)	1.22 (0.62)
Unemployment	-2.61 (2.61)	-0.32 (0.99)	-1.23 (1.46)	1.61 (1.59)	-1.04 (1.16)	0.61 (0.82)
Disaster Deaths	0.46 (0.28)	1.09** (0.32)	-0.40 (0.39)	0.47 (0.30)	-0.07 (0.45)	0.22 (0.21)
Civil War	-1.14 (1.29)	-0.51 (1.61)	0.22 (1.45)	-5.16* (2.02)	-6.72 (2.78)	-1.92 (1.18)
Trade	0.05 (0.19)	-0.03 (0.15)	0.94 (0.48)	0.14 (0.87)	2.76 (2.52)	0.82** (0.29)
Alliance	2.80 (1.40)				-1.50 (4.19)	
Distance	0.14 (0.87)	1.17 (1.99)	12.89 (7.52)	-2.17 (4.32)	-5.60 (16.30)	0.17 (3.61)
R ²	0.33	0.21	0.22	0.21	0.34	0.23
Adj. R ²	0.28	0.15	0.17	0.14	0.13	0.21
Num. obs.	336	294	336	252	98	630
RMSE	7.66	8.46	8.02	7.15	7.97	7.80
N Clusters	24	21	24	18	7	45

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

Table 4: IV Lag Estimates by Region

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (in-year)	-0.30 (0.77)	0.29 (0.24)	0.83 (1.30)	1.97 (1.34)	6.23 [*] (2.91)	1.63*** (0.31)
Polity	0.18 (0.12)	-0.30 [*] (0.15)	0.04 (0.20)	0.03 (0.13)	-0.01 (0.15)	-0.22 [*] (0.11)
GDP	-2.21* (1.07)	-2.64*** (0.49)	-1.75 (1.28)	-2.12 (1.41)	-1.84 (3.54)	-1.65* (0.61)
Population	1.74 (1.07)	2.69*** (0.66)	0.68 (1.50)	0.54 (1.36)	-2.50 (2.75)	1.30* (0.62)
Unemployment	-3.72 (2.39)	-0.31 (1.00)	-1.15 (1.43)	1.22 (1.66)	-1.46 (0.79)	0.57 (0.82)
Disaster Deaths	0.43 (0.28)	1.07*** (0.32)	-0.38 (0.38)	0.83 [*] (0.40)	-0.03 (0.46)	0.23 (0.21)
Civil War	-0.74 (1.43)	-1.10 (1.53)	0.21 (1.45)	-5.92*** (1.95)	-6.04* (2.00)	-1.81 (1.21)
Trade	0.16 (0.17)	-0.02 (0.16)	0.85 [*] (0.49)	0.46 (0.87)	2.26 (1.59)	0.83*** (0.29)
Alliance	3.79* (1.54)				-2.38 (1.94)	
Distance	0.19 (1.07)	0.96 (1.99)	11.04 (6.88)	4.58 (3.93)	-1.72 (13.76)	0.24 (3.70)
R ²	0.30	0.21	0.23	0.20	0.36	0.24
Adj. R ²	0.25	0.14	0.18	0.12	0.16	0.21
Num. obs.	336	294	336	252	98	630
RMSE	7.80	8.47	7.98	7.23	7.86	7.80
N Clusters	24	21	24	18	7	45

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

Table 5: Lewbel IV Estimates by Region

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (lag)	2.79 (2.04)	0.63 [*] (0.34)	-0.39 (2.05)	1.34 (0.82)	4.94 (5.51)	1.20 (0.81)
Polity	0.03 (0.13)	-0.27 (0.22)	0.33 (0.19)	0.15 (0.21)	-0.45 (0.22)	-0.10 (0.11)
GDP	-7.53*** (1.53)	-1.81 (1.69)	0.16 (2.44)	-3.17* (1.10)	-4.81 (19.85)	-0.68 (0.88)
Population	6.89*** (0.85)	1.72 [*] (0.90)	2.93 (1.81)	2.78 [*] (1.40)	0.21 (14.86)	-0.20 (0.89)
Unemployment	4.19** (1.19)	-0.34 (0.92)	-2.72 (2.10)	0.04 (1.22)	-0.49 (4.03)	0.50 (0.91)
Disaster Deaths	-0.25 (0.27)	1.32*** (0.40)	-1.14* (0.46)	0.42 (0.53)	-0.22 (0.52)	0.31 (0.32)
Civil War	-0.25 (1.67)	-0.06 (3.91)	2.86 (2.47)	-7.76*** (2.25)	0.10 (3.24)	-1.89 (1.58)
Trade	0.08 (1.42)	-0.35 (1.86)	-2.17 (1.24)	0.92 (0.99)	2.99 (8.18)	1.05* (0.51)
Alliance	1.15 (2.35)				-7.01 (7.19)	
Distance	5.28** (1.51)	-0.29 (4.81)	8.19 (7.57)	1.56 (4.75)	9.55 (34.13)	-8.53* (3.95)
R ²	0.54	0.21	0.26	0.43	0.62	0.20
Adj. R ²	0.45	0.11	0.16	0.32	0.33	0.15
Num. obs.	112	136	136	102	40	312
RMSE	6.74	8.46	7.70	6.37	7.41	7.59
N Clusters	14	17	17	14	5	39

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

Table 6: OLS Estimates by Region

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (in-year)	4.20 (3.28)	0.68 (0.37)	-0.73 (3.84)	1.53 (0.93)	15.99 (22.75)	1.61 (1.06)
Polity	0.05 (0.12)	-0.28 (0.22)	0.32 (0.22)	0.14 (0.22)	-0.31 (0.21)	-0.10 (0.11)
GDP	-7.50*** (1.55)	-1.89 (1.69)	0.25 (2.78)	-3.23* (1.15)	13.06 (26.61)	-0.80 (0.90)
Population	6.60*** (0.94)	1.71 (0.89)	3.03 (1.79)	2.63 (1.43)	-25.31 (45.23)	-0.37 (0.94)
Unemployment	4.22** (1.18)	-0.31 (0.93)	-2.75 (2.17)	-0.02 (1.25)	0.58 (4.86)	0.44 (0.90)
Disaster Deaths	-0.19 (0.25)	1.32** (0.41)	-1.16* (0.50)	0.47 (0.55)	-0.56 (0.47)	0.33 (0.32)
Civil War	-0.41 (1.83)	0.23 (4.03)	2.85 (2.46)	-7.81** (2.25)	-0.80 (3.57)	-1.97 (1.58)
Trade	-0.45 (1.68)	-0.30 (1.85)	-2.14 (1.24)	0.98 (1.00)	6.27 (11.52)	1.05* (0.50)
Alliance	1.27 (2.43)				-2.97 (12.47)	
Distance	4.91* (1.69)	-0.16 (4.86)	8.58 (8.83)	2.63 (4.86)	-54.37 (111.66)	-8.03 (4.08)
R ²	0.54	0.22	0.26	0.42	0.68	0.20
Adj. R ²	0.46	0.11	0.16	0.31	0.42	0.16
Num. obs.	112	136	136	102	40	312
RMSE	6.69	8.45	7.70	6.42	6.86	7.56
N Clusters	14	17	17	14	5	39

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

Table 7: IV Lag Estimates by Region

	East Asia + Pacific	Europe + Central Asia	Latin America + Caribbean	Middle East + North Africa	South Asia	Sub-Saharan Africa
Coverage (in-year)	8.69 (5.71)	0.36 (0.44)	-0.41 (2.38)	0.28 (1.71)	7.91 (15.47)	-1.48 (2.49)
Polity	0.09 (0.15)	-0.26 (0.22)	0.33 (0.20)	0.24 (0.20)	-0.38 (0.31)	-0.10 (0.13)
GDP	-7.64** (2.14)	-1.60 (1.72)	0.17 (2.48)	-2.71 (1.32)	-0.51 (47.17)	-0.10 (1.13)
Population	5.88*** (1.17)	1.69 (0.85)	2.96 (1.96)	3.15 (1.65)	-6.11 (52.59)	1.03 (1.07)
Unemployment	4.62** (1.34)	-0.36 (0.84)	-2.72 (2.10)	0.07 (1.36)	-0.28 (2.33)	0.91 (1.03)
Disaster Deaths	-0.09 (0.27)	1.32** (0.40)	-1.15* (0.46)	0.23 (0.58)	-0.44 (0.54)	0.29 (0.36)
Civil War	-0.77 (2.23)	-0.33 (4.02)	2.79 (2.26)	-7.81** (2.18)	-0.86 (3.35)	-1.61 (1.83)
Trade	-2.15 (1.73)	-0.47 (1.85)	-2.18 (1.25)	0.75 (1.07)	3.97 (3.26)	1.16 (0.64)
Alliance	1.87 (2.47)				-5.34 (6.82)	
Distance	4.32 (2.00)	-0.83 (4.88)	8.13 (7.99)	-0.88 (6.02)	-5.88 (131.39)	-11.17* (4.94)
R ²	0.51	0.21	0.26	0.42	0.66	0.16
Adj. R ²	0.43	0.11	0.16	0.31	0.39	0.11
Num. obs.	112	136	136	102	40	312
RMSE	6.91	8.47	7.70	6.41	7.03	7.78
N Clusters	14	17	17	14	5	39

*** $p < 0.001$; ** $p < 0.01$; * $p < 0.05$; $p < 0.1$

Table 8: Lewbel IV Estimates by Region