

Will the real smart city please stand up? Intelligent, progressive or entrepreneurial?

Robert G. Hollands

1. Componente Temático

1.1 Referencia Bibliográfica

Robert G. Hollands (2008) Will the real smart city please stand up?, City, 12:3, 303-320, DOI: 10.1080/13604810802479126

1.2 ¿Quién produce el texto? (texto académico, de ONG, de organismo internacional, etc.), autor, organización, entidad

Autor: Robert G. Hollands is a Professor of Sociology, School of Geography, Politics and Sociology, University of Newcastle, UK. E-mail: Robert.Hollands@ncl.ac.uk

1.3 Tesis centrales y argumentación?

to what extent labelled smart cities can be understood as a high-tech variation of the 'entrepreneurial city', as well as speculates on some general principles which would make them more progressive and inclusive. (Hollands, 2008, p. 303)

en qué medida las ciudades inteligentes etiquetadas pueden entenderse como una variación de alta tecnología de la 'ciudad emprendedora', así como también especula sobre algunos principios generales que las harían más progresistas e inclusivas.

Argumentos principales:

Hollands argumenta que la idea de "ciudad inteligente" se ha convertido en una etiqueta vacía y un término de marketing para las empresas tecnológicas y de consultoría, que utilizan el concepto para atraer inversores y aumentar sus beneficios.

El autor sostiene que las iniciativas de "ciudades inteligentes" se centran en el uso de la tecnología para resolver problemas urbanos y mejorar la eficiencia, sin abordar adecuadamente cuestiones clave como la equidad, la justicia social y la sostenibilidad ambiental.

De igual forma argumenta que la perspectiva empresarial que impulsa el concepto de "ciudad inteligente" tiende a ser elitista y a ignorar las necesidades y perspectivas de los grupos sociales más vulnerables y marginados de la sociedad urbana.

Por último propone que la idea de "ciudad inteligente" debería ser reemplazada por enfoques más amplios y holísticos que aborden los desafíos urbanos desde una perspectiva de justicia social y sostenibilidad ambiental.

1.4 Referencias teóricas y conceptuales del texto

- *American Urban Land Institute (2007) Material from their website, <http://www.uli.org/> (accessed 10 September 2007).*

- Amin, A., Massey, D. and Thrift, N. (2000) *Cities for the Many Not the Few*. Bristol: Policy Press.
- Aubry, J. (2002) 'Billions in tech loans will remain unpaid', *Ottawa Citizen*, 21 October, pp. 1–2.
- Bagnell, J. (2003) 'Entrust in the news', *National Post*, 22 August, 2007.
- Baird, V. (1999) 'Green cities', *New Internationalist*, 313, <http://www.newint.org/issue313/keynote.htm> (accessed 10 September 2007).
- Begg, I. (ed.) (2002) *Urban Competitiveness: Policies for Dynamic Cities*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Brenner, N. and Theodore, N. (eds.) (2002) *Spaces of Neo-liberalism*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Brisbane City Council (2005) See <http://www.ourbrisbane.com/business/doingbusiness/> (accessed 10 August 2005).
- Butler, T. (1997) *Gentrification and the Middle Classes*. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Byrne, D. (1999) *Social Exclusion*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Carrillo F.J. (2006) *Knowledge Cities: Approaches, Experiences and Perspectives*. Elsevier Butterworth Heinemann.
- Carley, M. and Jenkins, P. and Small, H. (2001) *Urban Development and Civil Society: The Role of Communities in Sustainable Cities*. London: Earthscan.
- Castells, M. (1996) *Rise of the Network Society: The Information Age*. Cambridge: Blackwell.
- Chatterton, P. (2000) 'Will the real creative city please stand up', *City*, 4(3), pp. 390–397.
- Chatterton, P. and Hollands, R. (2002) 'Theorising urban playscapes: producing, regulating and consuming youthful nightlife city spaces', *Urban Studies* 39(1), pp. 95–116.
- Chatterton, P. and Hollands, R. (2003) *Urban Nightscapes: Youth Cultures, Pleasure Spaces and Corporate Power*. London: Routledge.
- City of Edmonton (2006) See www.smartcity.edmonton.ab.ca/smart1.html (accessed 20 September 2005).
- City of Ottawa (2006) See http://www.ottawa.ca/2020/es/1_0_en.shtml (accessed on 20 September 2006).
- City of San Diego (2007) *Economic Development*, <http://www.sandiego.gov/economic-development> and http://www.sandiego.gov/environmental-services/sustainable/pdf/survey_answers.pdf, (both accessed 10 September 2007).
- Coe, A. and Paquet, G. and Roy, J. (2000) 'E-governance and smart communities: a social learning challenge', Working Paper 53, Faculty of Administration, University of Ottawa, October.
- Deem, R. (2001) 'Globalisation, new managerialism, academic capitalism and entrepreneurialism in universities: is the local dimension still important?', *Comparative Education* 37(1), pp. 7–20.
- Dutton, W.H. (1987) *Wired Cities: Shaping the Future of Communications*. London: Macmillan.
- Eger, J. (1997) 'Cyberspace and cyberplace: building the smart communities of tomorrow', *San Diego Union-Tribune*, Insight.
- Eger, J. (2003a) 'The creative community', White paper on cities and the future, San Diego State University, San Diego, <http://www.smartcommunities.org/creative-1.htm> (accessed on 12 August 2005).
- Eger, J. (2003b) 'Smart communities: becoming smart is not so much about developing technology as about engaging the body politic to reinvent governance in the digital age', *Urban Land* 60(1), pp. 50–55.

- Elkin, S. L. (1987) *City and Regime in the American Republic*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Eurocities (2007) *Knowledge Society*, <http://www.eurocities.org/main.php> (accessed 9 February 2007).
- Evans, S. (2002) 'Smart cities more than broadband networks', *Ottawa Business Journal*, 25 September.
- Fincher, R. and Jacobs, J. (eds.) (1998) *Cities of Difference*. London: The Guilford Press.
- Florida, R. (2002) *The Rise of the Creative Class: and How it's Transforming Work, Leisure, Community and Everyday Life*. New York: Basic Books.
- Florida, R. (2005) *Cities and the Creative Class*. New York: Harper Business.
- Florida, R. and Tinagli, I. (2004) *Europe and the Creative Age*. Pittsburgh and London: Carnegie Mellon Software Industry centre and Demos.
- Galbraith, J.K. (1993) *The Culture of Contentment*. London: Penguin.
- Gleeson, B. and Low, N. (2000) 'Cities as consumers of worlds environment', in N. Low, B. Gleeson, I. Elander and R. Lidskog (eds.) *Consuming Cities: The Urban Environment in the Global Economy after the Rio Declaration*, pp. 1–29. London: Routledge.
- Gottdiener, M. (2001) *The Theming of America*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Graham, S. (2002) 'Bridging urban digital divides: urban polarisation and information and communication technologies (s)', *Urban Studies* 39(1), pp. 33–56.
- Graham, S. and Marvin, S. (1996) *Telecommunications and the City: Electronic Spaces, Urban Places*. London: Routledge.
- Graham, S. and Marvin, S. (2001) *Splintering Urbanism: Networked Infrastructures, Technological Mobilities and the Urban Condition*. London: Routledge.
- Hall, P. (2000) 'Creative cities and economic development', *Urban Studies* 37(4), pp. 633–649.
- Harvey, D. (1973) *Social Justice and the City*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Harvey, D. (1989) 'From managerialism to entrepreneurialism: the transformation in urban governance in late capitalism', *Geografiska Annale*, 71B(1), pp. 3–17.
- Harvey, D. (2000) *Spaces of Hope*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Helgason, W. (2002) 'Inclusion through a digital lens'. Paper presented at the conference *Thinking Smart Cities*, Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada, 15 November.
- Hill, B. (2002) 'Fastest-50 list includes only three Ottawa firms', *Ottawa Citizen*, 26 September, p. D1.
- Hollands, R. and Chatteron, P. (2004) 'The London of the north?: youth cultures, urban change and nightlife in Leeds', in R. Unsworth and J. Stillwell (eds.) *Twenty First Century Leeds: Geographies of a Regional City*. Leeds University Press.
- Inoguchi, T., Newman, E. and Paoletto, G. (1999) *Cities and the Environment: New Approaches for Eco societies*. New York: UN University Press.
- Intelligent Community Forum (2007), See www.intelligentcommunity.org (accessed on 10 September 2007).
- Ishido, T. (2002) 'Digital city Kyoto', *Communications of the ACM*, 45(7), pp. 78–81.
- Jarvis, H. (2005) *Work/Life City Limits: Comparative Household Perspectives*. New York: Palgrave.

- Jessop, B. (1997) 'The entrepreneurial city: re-imagining localities, redesigning economic governance or restructuring capital', in N. Jewson and S. McGregor (eds.) *Transforming Cities*, 28–41. London: Routledge.
- Keith, M. and S. Pile (eds.) (1993) *Place and the Politics of Identity*. London: Routledge.
- Kirkland, D. (nd) *Smart cities—a smarter approach*, <http://www.publicservice.co.uk/pdf/detr/winter2000/p24.pdf> (accessed on 10 September 2007).
- Klein, N. (2000) *No Logo*. London: Flamingo.
- Komninos, N. (2002) *Intelligent Cities: Innovation, Knowledge Systems and Digital Spaces*. London: Spon Press.
- Landry, C. (2000) *The Creative City: A Toolkit for Urban Innovation*. London: Earthscan.
- Landry, C and Bianchini, F. (1995) *The Creative City*. London: Demos.
- Local Government Focus (2004) See <http://www.locgov-focus.aus.net/2001/june/bris13.htm> (accessed on 10 February 2004).
- Logan, J. and Molotch, H. (1987) *Urban Fortunes: The Political Economy of Place*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Low, N., Gleeson, B., Elander, I. and Lidskog, R. (eds.), (2000) *Consuming Cities: The Urban Environment in the Global Economy after the Rio Declaration*. London: Routledge.
- Monbiot, G. (2000) *The Captive State*. London: Macmillan.
- Newcastle City Council (2006) See <http://www.newcastle.gov.uk/compnewc.nsf/a/home> (accessed 10 June 2006)
- New Zealand Smart Growth Network (2000) *Smart Growth: Intelligent Development in a New Century*. Rotorua.
- Newman, P. and Kenworthy, J. (1999) *Sustainability and Cities: Overcoming Automobile Dependency*. Washington DC: Island Press.
- Ottawa Centre for Research and Innovation (2007) *Smart Capital projects*, http://www.ocri.ca/smartcapital/sc_subprojects.asp (accessed 10 September 2007).
- OECD and Eurostat (2005) *Oslo Manual: Guidelines for Collecting and Interpreting Innovative Data*. 3rd edition, a joint publication of OECD and Eurostat, http://epp.eurostat.cec.eu.int/cache/ITY_PUBLIC/OSLO/EN/OSLO-EN.PDF (accessed 10 September 2007).
- Paquet, G. (2001) 'Smart communities', *LAC Carling Government's Review* 3(5), pp. 28–30.
- Peck, J. (2005) 'Struggling with the creative class', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 29(4), pp. 740–770.
- Peck, J. and Tickell, A. (2002) 'Neo-liberalising space', *Antipode* 34(3), pp. 380–404.
- Phipps, L. (2000) 'New communication technologies—a conduit for social inclusion', *Information, Communication & Society* 3(1), pp. 39–68.
- Polese, M. and Stren, R. (2000) *The Social Sustainability of Cities: Diversity and the Management of Change*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Quilley, S. (2000) 'Manchester first: from municipal socialism to the entrepreneurial city', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 24(3), pp. 601–15.

- Rathgeber, E. (2002) 'Gender and telecentres: what have we learned?', World Bank Group, <http://www.worldbank.org/gender/digitaldivide/Eva%20Rathgeber.ppt> (accessed on 12 June 2004).
- Roy, J. (2001) 'Rethinking communities: aligning technology & governance', LAC Carling Government's Review, Special Edition, 6–11 June.
- Sample, I. (2004) 'PCs: the latest waste mountain', *The Guardian*, 8 March, p. 2.
- Satterthwaite, D. (ed.) (1999) *The Earthscan Reader in Sustainable Cities*. London: Earthscan.
- Sandercock, L. (1998) *Towards Cosmopolis: Planning for Multicultural Cities*. Chichester: John Wiley.
- Sandercock, L. (2003) *Cosmopolis II: Mongrel Cities of the 21st Century*. 2nd edition, London: Continuum.
- Scott, A. (2000) *The Cultural Economy of Cities: Essays on the Geography of Image-producing Industries*. London: Sage.
- Shiller, D. (1999) *Digital Capitalism: Networking the Global Market System*. Massachusetts: MIT Press.
- Short, J.R, Breitbach, C., Buckman, C.S. and Essex, J. (2000) 'From world cities to gateway cities: extending the boundaries of globalization theory', *City* 4(3), pp. 317–340.
- Sibley, D. (1995) *Geographies of Exclusion*. London: Routledge.
- Siemiatycki, M. (2002) 'Smart cities, whats next?' Paper presented at the conference *Thinking Smart Cities*, Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada, 15 November. Singapore Democratic Party (nd) See www.singaporedemocrat.org/poverty.html (accessed on 10 September 2007).
- Slaughter, S. and Rhoades, G. (2004) *Academic Capitalism and the New Economy: Markets, State and Higher Education*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Smart Cities.net (2002) See <http://www.smart-cities.net> (accessed on 10 September 2007).
- Smart Growth Network (2007) *Smart growth online*, <http://www.smartgrowth.org> (accessed 10 September 2007).
- Smith, N. (1996) *The New Urban Frontier: Gentrification and the Revanchist City*. London: Routledge.
- Solnit, R. and Schwartzberg, S. (2000) *Hollow City: The Siege of San Francisco and the Crisis of Urban America*. London: Verso.
- Southampton City Council (2006) Southampton On-line, <http://www.smartcities.co.uk/InterestGroup/> (accessed on 20 September 2006).
- Stone, C. N. (1993) 'Urban regimes and the capacity to govern: a political economy approach', *Journal of Urban Affairs* 15, pp. 1–28.
- Sykora, L. (1999) 'Processes of socio-spatial differentiation in post-communist Prague', *Housing Studies* 14(5), pp. 679–701.
- Talbot, C. and Newman, D. (1998) 'Beyond access and awareness—evaluating electronic community networks', *The British Library Board: British Library Research and Innovation Centre Report 149/Queens University Belfast On-line*, <http://www.qub.ac.uk/mgt/cicn/beyond/> (accessed 10 June 2005).
- Thorns, D. (2002) *The Transformation of Cities: Urban Theory and Urban Life*. Basingstoke: Palgrave.

- Van der Meer, A. and Van Winden, W. (2003) 'E-governance in cities: a comparison of urban policies', *Regional Studies* 37(4), pp. 407–419.
- Webster, F. (2002) *Theories of the Information Society*. London: Routledge.
- Wei Choo, C. (1997) 'IT2000: Singapore's vision of an intelligent island', in P. Droege (ed.) *Intelligent Environments: Spatial Aspects of the Information Revolution*, pp. 48–65. Amsterdam: Elsevier Science.
- Williams, R. (1983) *Towards 2000*. London: Chatto and Windus.
- Wolfe, D. and Holbrook, J. (eds.) (2002) *Knowledge, Clusters and Regional Innovation: Economic Development in Canada*. Kingston: Queen's School of Policy Studies and McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Zukin, S. (1995) *The Culture of Cities*. Oxford: Blackwell.

2. Componente Metodológico

2.1 Estructura del texto (introducción, sección teórica, sección de contexto)

Introducción: establece el marco teórico y el objetivo del artículo.

Cuerpo: desarrolla el análisis y se presentan los argumentos a favor de las tesis planteadas.

Conclusión: resume las principales ideas y brinda una respuesta a la pregunta planteada en el título.

En términos generales, se podría dividir el cuerpo del artículo en tres secciones que abordan los tres tipos de ciudad inteligente propuestos por el autor:

- la ciudad inteligente inteligente,
- la ciudad inteligente progresista y
- la ciudad inteligente empresarial.

2.2 Datos: Fuente de los datos: ¿quién los produce?

El autor utiliza principalmente fuentes secundarias como otros estudios académicos, libros y reportes de organizaciones internacionales para respaldar sus argumentos y análisis sobre las estrategias y enfoques de las ciudades inteligentes. También se apoya en algunas fuentes primarias como entrevistas realizadas por el autor a expertos en el campo de las ciudades inteligentes.

2.3 Herramientas metodológicas (entrevistas, estadísticas, revisión de prensa, revisión normativa, cualitativo, cuantitativo, etc.)

Revisión y análisis crítico de la literatura existente sobre el tema de las ciudades inteligentes.

Análisis de discurso y semántica en su enfoque crítico de los términos y conceptos utilizados en el discurso de las ciudades inteligentes.

Conclusiones

Las ciudades inteligentes se han convertido en un término de moda en la política urbana y el desarrollo económico, y están siendo promovidas en todo el mundo como una estrategia para el éxito y la competitividad urbana.

Existe una tensión en la definición de ciudades inteligentes entre las perspectivas "progresista" y "empresarial", lo que refleja una tensión más amplia en el desarrollo urbano contemporáneo entre el "progreso" y el "crecimiento"

La visión empresarial de las ciudades inteligentes ha sido ampliamente adoptada por los gobiernos locales y las empresas, pero también ha sido objeto de críticas por su énfasis en la tecnología y el marketing, en detrimento de una visión más amplia de la ciudadanía y la justicia social,

La visión progresista de las ciudades inteligentes, por otro lado, se enfoca en la participación ciudadana, la justicia social y la sostenibilidad ambiental, pero ha sido criticada por su falta de claridad y coherencia en términos de estrategias concretas de implementación (Hollands, 2015, p. 314).

Elaboración de la Ficha de Lectura por: Luis Enrique Guerrero Ibarra, ESAP. Bogotá.