



Michael Fatigati <fatigati.michael@gmail.com>

---

## chapter 1

---

**Martin Pickave** <martin.pickave@utoronto.ca>  
To: Michael Fatigati <michael.fatigati@mail.utoronto.ca>

Mon, Jul 6, 2020 at 1:48 PM

Dear Michael,

Hope all is well!

I will be writing to you with comments on your dissertation chapters over the next couple of days. Attached is your first chapter with some comments (more at the beginning).

But my main comment is this: The chapter shows some good level of erudition, but you need to streamline it, so that there is a thesis. And if there's no thesis, which is also ok – some dissertation chapters are more expository – then there still needs to be a clear path. Right now, the first chapter meanders around various topics, but you do little tying them together. You start with the basic Aristotelian account of animal motion (sect. 1), then you focus on the distinction between irascible and concupiscible appetites (without explaining why someone would find it necessary to make such a distinction) (sect. 2), then you talk about different forms of pleasure (sect. 3), and so on. It's very easy for the reader to get lost – and I certainly did.

Of course one way of streamlining an exploratory chapter would be to focus on one or two key texts. You do something like this, but to really make this work, you need to say a bit more about the context in which Avicenna does what he does etc.

Another question that every reader will have is: how is all this about emotion. Maybe this is something that happens in the introduction. But it strikes me from reading your chapter that Avicenna has no common concept for all the psychological states you have in mind. The closest he gets is the term inclinations (see your first page). But then you want to make the chapter a bit more about the various forms of inclinations (since that term actually appears in the text you quote). And then you want to come back to emotions in the conclusion of the chapter. But I guess this comment also falls under the rubric 'streamlining'.

Cheers,

Martin



**Fatigati Thesis 1- Emotions and the Animal Motive Soul comments MP.pdf**  
209K