



Michael Fatigati <fatigati.michael@gmail.com>

Complete Final Draft

Martin Pickave <martin.pickave@utoronto.ca>
To: Michael Fatigati <michael.fatigati@mail.utoronto.ca>

Mon, Sep 28, 2020 at 12:25 PM

Hi Michael,

I don't have many comments regarding chapter 4. It's very learned and it complements the other chapters well, since you are now looking at a new set of texts.

My general worry is similar to what I said about the other chapters. I wished you would streamline the argument in the chapter a bit more. From a contemporary point of view, the texts you discuss are very strange. So ideally you would say a bit more what the philosophical payoff is. At various points you come back to Aristotle and it becomes clear that much of what you explain has to do with the almost hylomorphic nature of the emotions, since they are passions of the soul and the body. Maybe this is a way to frame the entire chapter?

Unfortunately, the conclusion of chapter 4 is a bit weak. Again, what is the philosophical payoff of all this material? The conclusion would have been a great place to stress this.

I found a couple of typos etc. Unfortunately, I forgot to make a complete list. But here are some:

Page 1: à la Galen, à la Aristotle

The "principal" organ (not the "principle" organ). (See also page 3)

Page 3: The quotation on top of the page talks about emotions being "associated with the vital spirit", but you immediately go "the emotion itself is realized in the vital spirit". That seems a bit too rash.

Page 8 (by the way: why don't you use page numbers?):

"the vital spirit as located conceptually in some middle-ground between vegetative faculties and the animal faculties" ???
If the vital spirit is what explains life (in all its forms), then this misrepresents its relationship towards the vegetative and animal faculties.

Footnote 92 (check the text to which it is attached).

Good luck with the final revisions of the dissertation,

Martin

From: Michael Fatigati <michael.fatigati@mail.utoronto.ca>
Date: Monday, September 28, 2020 at 10:15 AM
To: Martin Pickave <martin.pickave@utoronto.ca>
Subject: Re: Complete Final Draft

Hi Martin,

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]