Individual dietary specialization in a generalist bee varies across populations but has no effect on the richness of associated microbial communities

Marilia P. Gaiarsa, Sandra Rehan, Matthew Barbour, Quinn McFrederick

March 2022, The American Naturalist

Overview

We examine the occurrence of individual specialization in a solitary bee species, Ceratina australensis in three different wild populations from Australia. We use data previously published by McFrederick and Rehan (2019) on metabarcoding of the pollen contents of Ceratina nests to characterize the plant, bacteria, and fungi present in each individual nest. We show that bee individuals have marked dietary specialization and that the level of specialization varies across populations. In the most specialized population, we also show that individuals' diet breadth was positively related to the richness of fungi, but not bacteria. Overall, individual specialization appeared to have a weak or negligible effect on the microbial richness of nests, suggesting that different mechanisms beyond environmental transmission may be at play regarding microbial acquisition in wild bees.

The analyses and data are in Zenodo and the github repo ceratinaIndDiet, and previously published sequence data are publicly available under NCBI/EMBL/DDBJ accession numbers SAMN08911168-SAMN08911424.

Session Info

sessionInfo()

```
## R version 4.1.1 (2021-08-10)
## Platform: x86_64-pc-linux-gnu (64-bit)
## Running under: Ubuntu 20.04.3 LTS
##
## Matrix products: default
           /usr/lib/x86_64-linux-gnu/blas/libblas.so.3.9.0
## LAPACK: /usr/lib/x86 64-linux-gnu/lapack/liblapack.so.3.9.0
##
## locale:
   [1] LC_CTYPE=en_US.UTF-8
                                   LC NUMERIC=C
    [3] LC_TIME=en_US.UTF-8
                                   LC_COLLATE=en_US.UTF-8
   [5] LC_MONETARY=en_US.UTF-8
                                   LC_MESSAGES=en_US.UTF-8
##
   [7] LC_PAPER=en_US.UTF-8
                                   LC_NAME=C
##
   [9] LC_ADDRESS=C
                                   LC_TELEPHONE=C
## [11] LC_MEASUREMENT=en_US.UTF-8 LC_IDENTIFICATION=C
## attached base packages:
## [1] stats
                 graphics grDevices utils
                                                datasets methods
                                                                    base
```

```
##
## loaded via a namespace (and not attached):
##
    [1] compiler_4.1.1
                           magrittr_2.0.1
                                             tools_4.1.1
                                                                htmltools_0.5.1.1
##
    [5] yaml_2.2.1
                           stringi_1.7.5
                                             rmarkdown_2.10
                                                                knitr_1.33
##
    [9] stringr_1.4.0
                           xfun_0.25
                                             digest_0.6.27
                                                                rlang_0.4.11
## [13] evaluate_0.14
```

Data

Each line in the file data.csv relates to one individual nest (inds) from each of the three different populations (pop). The column degree refers to the total number of plant genera present in the nest (richness), weighted.closeness to the centrality of that individual in their network (as a measure of resource overlap among individuals), psis is the individual specialization (Schoener 1968; Roughgarden 1979; Zaccarelli, Bolnick, and Mancinelli 2013). We used the R packages bipartite (Dormann, Gruber, and Fründ 2008) to calculate centrality and RInSp (Zaccarelli, Bolnick, and Mancinelli 2013) to calculate specialization. The next six columns refer to the richness of bacteria and fungi associated to the pollen, in three different rarefaction depths (see Methods and Online Supplement for details).

```
## # A tibble: 38 x 11
##
      inds
            pop
                   degree weighted.closeness psis bact.rich bact.rich.2
##
      <chr> <chr>
                    <dbl>
                                        <dbl> <dbl>
                                                         <dbl>
                                                                      <dbl>
##
   1 Q116
            Q
                       14
                                       0.0954 0.530
                                                          35.0
                                                                       30.0
    2 Q119
                                       0.113 0.647
##
            Q
                       12
                                                          NA
                                                                       NΑ
    3 Q31
                                                          42.2
                                                                       34.4
##
            Q
                       13
                                       0.0968 0.577
##
   4 Q36
                        8
                                       0.121 0.817
                                                          15.8
                                                                       14.3
            Q
##
   5 Q55
                        6
                                       0.136
                                             0.391
                                                          21.3
                                                                       19.4
##
    6 Q74
            Q
                        5
                                       0.121
                                              0.640
                                                          40.5
                                                                       33.3
##
    7 Q77
            Q
                        9
                                       0.128
                                              0.602
                                                                       NA
                                                          NA
##
   8 Q89
            Q
                        5
                                       0.126 0.369
                                                          35.8
                                                                       31.3
                        7
##
   9 Q94
            Q
                                       0.131
                                              0.742
                                                          48.5
                                                                       37.6
                        7
## 10 S104
            S
                                       0.0593 0.493
                                                          21.7
                                                                       19.1
## # ... with 28 more rows, and 4 more variables: bact.rich.notrare <dbl>,
       fungi.rich <dbl>, fungi.rich.2 <dbl>, fungi.rich.notrare <dbl>
```

Code

The script analysis. R loads the data file above and details the statistical analysis and recreates the plots from the main text.

References

Dormann, C., B. Gruber, and J. Fründ. 2008. "Introducing the Bipartite Package: Analysing Ecological Networks." R News 8: 8.

McFrederick, Quinn S, and Sandra M Rehan. 2019. "Wild Bee Pollen Usage and Microbial Communities Co-Vary Across Landscapes." *Microbial Ecology* 77 (2): 513–22.

Roughgarden, Joan. 1979. Theory of Population Genetics and Evolutionary Ecology: An Introduction.

Schoener, Thomas W. 1968. "The Anolis Lizards of Bimini: Resource Partitioning in a Complex Fauna." *Ecology* 49 (4): 704–26.

Zaccarelli, Nicola, Daniel I Bolnick, and Giorgio Mancinelli. 2013. "RI n s p: An r Package for the Analysis of Individual Specialization in Resource Use." *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* 4 (11): 1018–23.