

Optimism Security Review

Auditors

Chris Smith, Lead Security Researcher MiloTruck, Lead Security Researcher

Report prepared by: Lucas Goiriz

Contents

1	1 About Spearbit					
2	Introduction					
3	Risk classification 3.1 Impact					
4	Executive Summary Findings 5.1 Low Risk					
5	Findings 5.1 Low Risk 5.1.1 ReinitializableBase pattern allows initialize() to be incorrectly called during an upgrade 5.1.2 Version enforcement could be violated for future versions 5.1.3 OptimismPortal2.migrateToSuperRoots() could accidentally unpause a chain 5.1.4 Mismatching version passed into EIP-712 for DeputyPauseModule 5.1.5 ProxyAdminOwnedBase.proxyAdmin() risk for future contracts 5.2 Gas Optimization	5 6 6 7				
	5.2.1 Saved storage slot in AnchorStateRegistry.sol	8 8 9 9 10 10				

1 About Spearbit

Spearbit is a decentralized network of expert security engineers offering reviews and other security related services to Web3 projects with the goal of creating a stronger ecosystem. Our network has experience on every part of the blockchain technology stack, including but not limited to protocol design, smart contracts and the Solidity compiler. Spearbit brings in untapped security talent by enabling expert freelance auditors seeking flexibility to work on interesting projects together.

Learn more about us at spearbit.com

2 Introduction

Optimism is a fast, stable, and scalable L2 blockchain built by Ethereum developers, for Ethereum developers. Built as a minimal extension to existing Ethereum software, Optimism's EVM-equivalent architecture scales your Ethereum apps without surprises. If it works on Ethereum, it works on Optimism at a fraction of the cost.

Disclaimer: This security review does not guarantee against a hack. It is a snapshot in time of optimism according to the specific commit. Any modifications to the code will require a new security review.

3 Risk classification

Severity level	Impact: High	Impact: Medium	Impact: Low
Likelihood: high	Critical	High	Medium
Likelihood: medium	High	Medium	Low
Likelihood: low	Medium	Low	Low

3.1 Impact

- High leads to a loss of a significant portion (>10%) of assets in the protocol, or significant harm to a majority
 of users.
- Medium global losses <10% or losses to only a subset of users, but still unacceptable.
- Low losses will be annoying but bearable--applies to things like griefing attacks that can be easily repaired or even gas inefficiencies.

3.2 Likelihood

- High almost certain to happen, easy to perform, or not easy but highly incentivized
- Medium only conditionally possible or incentivized, but still relatively likely
- · Low requires stars to align, or little-to-no incentive

3.3 Action required for severity levels

- Critical Must fix as soon as possible (if already deployed)
- High Must fix (before deployment if not already deployed)
- · Medium Should fix
- Low Could fix

4 Executive Summary

Over the course of 5 days in total, Op Labs engaged with Spearbit to review the optimism protocol.

Summary

Project Name	Op Labs	
Repository	optimism	
Commit	54c19f4a3a6	
Type of Project	Infrastructure, L2	
Audit Timeline	May 5 to May 12	
Two week fix period	May 12 - May 16	

The particular scope of this review involved the following files:

- src/L1/ETHLockbox.sol
- src/L1/L1CrossDomainMessenger.sol
- src/L1/L1ERC721Bridge.sol
- src/L1/L1StandardBridge.sol
- src/L1/OPContractsManager.sol (only the changes for Upgrade 16)
- src/L1/OptimismPortal2.sol
- src/L1/ProtocolVersions.sol
- src/L1/SuperchainConfig.sol
- src/L1/SystemConfig.sol
- src/cannon/MIPS64.sol
- src/dispute/AnchorStateRegistry.sol
- src/dispute/DelayedWETH.sol
- src/dispute/DisputeGameFactory.sol
- src/dispute/SuperFaultDisputeGame.sol
- src/dispute/SuperPermissionedDisputeGame.sol
- src/libraries/Encoding.sol
- src/libraries/Hashing.sol
- src/safe/DeputyPauseModule.sol

In this period of time a total of 14 issues were found.

Issues Found

Severity	Count	Fixed	Acknowledged
Critical Risk	0	0	0
High Risk	0	0	0
Medium Risk	0	0	0
Low Risk	5	3	2
Gas Optimizations	1	0	1
Informational	8	6	2
Total	14	9	5

5 Findings

5.1 Low Risk

5.1.1 ReinitializableBase pattern allows initialize() to be incorrectly called during an upgrade

Severity: Low Risk

Context: SuperchainConfig.sol#L69, SuperchainConfig.sol#L78

Description: All upgradeable contracts have been modified for their initialize() and upgrade() functions to use the reinitializer modifier with initVersion(). Using SuperchainConfig as an example:

```
function initialize(address _guardian) external reinitializer(initVersion()) {

function upgrade() external reinitializer(initVersion()) {
```

However, this new pattern allows initialize() to be called in place of upgrade() during an upgrade. For example:

- Assume a contract's initialized version is currently 1.
- In the new implementation, INIT_VERSION is set to 2 (i.e. initVersion() = 2).
- After the contract is upgraded to the new implementation, calling initialize() passes as it uses reinitialize().
- However, upgrade() was supposed to be called instead.

Recommendation: An ideal pattern would ensure the version that initialize() is called with never increases (e.g. a hardcoded constant), such that it can only ever be called once.

Optimism: Acknowledged, we will log this as feedback for OPCM and have prioritized appropriately.

Spearbit: Acknowledged.

5.1.2 Version enforcement could be violated for future versions

Severity: Low Risk

Context: Encoding.sol#L237-L247

Description: The literal 0x01 is used for encoding after confirming the _superRootProof.version matches. However, this leaves open a potential footgun where the check is updated for a future version but the literal is still used for the encoding.

Recommendation: Use the version after confirming it is correct so future updates only have to update one place in the library or create an internal CONSTANT for the VERSION and use that instead of the literals.

• Option 1:

```
uint64 internal constant VERSION = 0x01;
...
    if (_superRootProof.version != VERSION) {
        revert Encoding_InvalidSuperRootVersion();
    }
...
    bytes memory encoded = bytes.concat(bytes1(VERSION), bytes8(_superRootProof.timestamp));
```

• Option 2:

```
if (_superRootProof.version != 0x01) {
    revert Encoding_InvalidSuperRootVersion();
}
...
bytes memory encoded = bytes.concat(bytes1(_superRootProof.version),
    bytes8(_superRootProof.timestamp));
```

Optimism: Fixed in commit 7134b4c0.

Spearbit: Fixed.

5.1.3 OptimismPortal2.migrateToSuperRoots() could accidentally unpause a chain

Severity: Low Risk

Context: SystemConfig.sol#L488-L491, OptimismPortal2.sol#L405-L434

Description: In SystemConfig.paused(), a chain is paused if either address(0) or the ethLockbox address set in OptimismPortal2 is paused:

```
function paused() public view returns (bool) {
   IETHLockbox lockbox = IOptimismPortal2(payable(optimismPortal())).ethLockbox();
   return superchainConfig.paused(address(lockbox)) || superchainConfig.paused(address(0));
}
```

However, since the ethLockbox address in OptimismPortal2 can be changed, an upgrade could accidentally unpause a chain by changing the lockbox address stored in OptimismPortal2. For example:

- · Assume the chain is paused.
- OptimismPortal2.migrateToSuperRoots() is called to set a new ethLockbox address.
- The new ethLockbox address is not paused.
- The chain automatically becomes unpaused without calling SuperchainConfig.unpause().

Recommendation: In OptimismPortal2, consider adding the whenNotPaused modifier to migrateToSuper-Roots():

```
- function migrateToSuperRoots(IETHLockbox _newLockbox, IAnchorStateRegistry _newAnchorStateRegistry)

→ external {
+ function migrateToSuperRoots(IETHLockbox _newLockbox, IAnchorStateRegistry _newAnchorStateRegistry)

→ external whenNotPaused {
```

Additionally, ensure that the ethLockbox address cannot change while the chain is paused in future upgrades.

Optimism: Fixed in commit 33695ee.

Spearbit: Verified, the recommended fix was implemented.

5.1.4 Mismatching version passed into EIP-712 for DeputyPauseModule

Severity: Low Risk

Context: DeputyPauseModule.sol#L82-L84, DeputyPauseModule.sol#L98

Description: The version of DeputyPauseModule is declared in a string constant as such:

```
/// @notice Semantic version.
/// @custom:semver 2.0.0
string public constant version = "2.0.0";
```

However, the version passed to EIP712 is 1, as seen from the second argument in the constructor, instead of the correct version:

```
constructor(
    // ...
)
    EIP712("DeputyPauseModule", "1")
{
```

As a result, the domain separator for all signatures related to DeputyPauseModule will contain the wrong version.

Recommendation: Pass the version string into EIP712 instead of 1:

```
constructor(
    // ...
)
- EIP712("DeputyPauseModule", "1")
+ EIP712("DeputyPauseModule", version)
{
```

Optimism: Acknowledged. Since we always redeploy DeputyPauseModule when making changes, the version string here is essentially cosmetic. It would be important if we deployed DeputyPauseModule behind a proxy, but we do not intend to do that.

Spearbit: Acknowledged.

5.1.5 ProxyAdminOwnedBase.proxyAdmin() risk for future contracts

Severity: Low Risk

Context: ProxyAdminOwnedBase.sol#L41-L72

Description: ProxyAdminOwnedBase.proxyAdmin() fetches the proxy admin for L1CrossDomainMessenger by manually checking the first two mappings in ResolvedDelegateProxy:

More specifically, it checks that implementationName[address(this)] is "OVM_L1CrossDomainMessenger" and fetches the address manager at addressManager[address(this)].

However, if a future (possibly new) contract:

- 1. Does not store the ProxyAdmin address at Constants.PROXY_OWNER_ADDRESS.
- 2. Has address mappings at its first and second slot.

These checks could mistakenly pass and return a wrong address.

Additionally, note that such an implementation means L1CrossDomainMessenger must always be named OVM_-L1CrossDomainMessenger in ResolvedDelegateProxy for all chains.

Recommendation: Consider explicitly documenting the proxies which are compatible with ProxyAdminOwnedBase. Additionally, ensure that future contracts are not deployed behind a ResolvedDelegateProxy.

Optimism: Documented in commit c637130.

Spearbit: Verified, the risk has been documented in the comments.

5.2 Gas Optimization

5.2.1 Saved storage slot in AnchorStateRegistry.sol

Severity: Gas Optimization

Context: AnchorStateRegistry.sol#L181-L190

Description: This adds as to the stack just to use it in the return assessment.

Recommendation: This is could be gas optimized as the storage slot is only used in the return as part of the comparison. Trade off is this is will make the code and comments harder to read something like:

Optimism: Acknowledged, but won't fix, readability is worth more than the gas in this case.

Spearbit: Agreed.

5.3 Informational

5.3.1 FaultDisputegame.claimCredit() cannot be called while the system is paused

Severity: Informational

Context: FaultDisputeGame.sol#L1005-L1007, FaultDisputeGame.sol#L957-L961

Description: In FaultDisputeGame, closeGame() now reverts if the AnchorStateRegistry is currently paused:

```
if (ANCHOR_STATE_REGISTRY.paused()) {
   revert GamePaused();
}
```

However, claimCredit() also calls closeGame(). As such, claimCredit() also cannot be called while the system is paused for games where the bond distribution mode has already been determined, which is an unintended consequence of this change. For example:

- · Assume the system is unpaused.
- closeGame() is called for a dispute game and bondDistributionMode is set to BondDistribution-Mode.NORMAL.
- · Guardian pauses the system.

Recommendation: Move the pause check to after the early return from checking bondDistributionMode:

This allows claimCredit() to be called if bondDistributionMode is already determined, even when the system is paused (i.e. the example above).

Optimism: Fixed in commit 3ad1915.

Spearbit: Verified, the recommended fix was implemented.

5.3.2 Reduce duplicate code and follow "internal modifer" pattern in AnchorStateRegistry

Severity: Informational

Context: AnchorStateRegistry.sol#L125-L146

Description: These three functions all contain: if (msg.sender != systemConfig.guardian()) revert AnchorStateRegistry_Unauthorized(); which could be moved to a helper function similar to _assertOnlyProxyAdminOwner() in OptimismPortal2.sol.

Optimism: Fixed in commit c7c974d1.

Spearbit: Fixed.

5.3.3 Inconsistent variable declaration patterns with upgradeability

Severity: Informational

Context: L1ERC721Bridge.sol#L28-L40

Description: Several contract use different patterns (some with constants and immutables first and some with them after storage variables. However, the L1ERC721Bridge mixes a constant in the middle of the storage declarations. This complicates upgrading the contract and leads to potential memory corruption with future upgrades.

Another example of this is the internal variable in the middle of public variables in AnchorStateRegistry.sol.

Recommendation: Move the constant above the mapping or below the systemConfig. Ideally, it would be good to establish a style guide for how upgradable contracts should have their variables laid out.

Optimism: Acknowledged, we will fix this in a future cleanup of the contracts.

Spearbit: Acknowledged.

5.3.4 OPContractsManager Contract deployment naming inconsistency

Severity: Informational

Context: OPContractsManager.sol#L675, OPContractsManager.sol#L717

Description: There is some inconsistency with naming and version suffixes in deploying contracts in the OPCM.

Recommendation: Establish a pattern that can be used consistently for these suffixes so there is a clear versioning system within the contract names.

Optimism: Fixed in commit 62dcc8a8.

Spearbit: Fixed.

5.3.5 Contracts Manager could better optimize use of encodeETHLockboxInitializer

Severity: Informational

Context: OPContractsManager.sol#L728-L733, OPContractsManager.sol#L1238-L1249

Description: The upgrade function does not take advantage of the encodeETHLockboxInitializer helper function duplicating code and potentially leading to a divergence if future updates are not make in both places. Further, it appears that the encodeETHLockboxInitializer function is only ever used with one portal in the array, so it could remove some pressure from the stack to move this:

```
IOptimismPortal[] memory portals = new IOptimismPortal[](1);
portals[0] = optimismPortal;
```

Into the function itself and only pass the optimism portal.

Recommendation: Consider using the helper function in upgrade and moving the array construction in both places to that function.

Optimism: Acknowledged. **Spearbit:** Acknowledged.

5.3.6 OptimismPortal2.upgrade() sets the wrong state variables

Severity: Informational

Context: OptimismPortal2.sol#L296-L300

Description: OptimismPortal2.upgrade() sets the following state variables:

```
// Now perform upgrade logic.
anchorStateRegistry = _anchorStateRegistry;
ethLockbox = _ethLockbox;
systemConfig = _systemConfig;
spacer_53_1_20 = address(0);
```

However, systemConfig does not need to be set as it is already set in the current OptimismPortal2 that is live. Additionally, the following spacers are not cleared:

- spacer_56_0_20, previously the disputeGameFactory address
- spacer_58_0_32, previously the disputeGameBlacklist mapping
- spacer_59_0_4, previously respectedGameType
- spacer_59_4_8, previously respectedGameTypeUpdatedAt

Recommendation: Consider modifying upgrade() as suggested above:

```
// Now perform upgrade logic.
anchorStateRegistry = _anchorStateRegistry;
ethLockbox = _ethLockbox;
- systemConfig = _systemConfig;
spacer_53_1_20 = address(0);
+ spacer_56_0_20 = address(0);
+ spacer_58_0_32 = bytes32(0)
+ spacer_59_0_4 = GameType.wrap(0);
+ spacer_59_4_8 = 0;
```

Optimism: Fixed in commit 3f77c1b.

Optimism: Verified, OptimismPortal2.upgrade() has been modified to not set systemConfig. Additionally, spacers are no longer cleared in all upgrade() functions.

5.3.7 SuperchainConfig.extend() can be used to pause a chain

Severity: Informational

Context: SuperchainConfig.sol#L136-L145

Description: SuperchainConfig.extend() does not check that _identifier is already paused:

```
function extend(address _identifier) external {
    // Only the Guardian can extend the pause.
    if (msg.sender != guardian) {
        revert SuperchainConfig_OnlyGuardian();
    }

    // Reset the pause timestamp.
    pauseTimestamps[_identifier] = block.timestamp;
    emit Paused(_identifier);
}
```

This allows the guardian to call <code>extend()</code> instead of <code>pause()</code> to pause an identifier. While there technically is no issue with the guardian using <code>extend()</code> instead of <code>pause()</code>, it would be good to ensure <code>extend()</code> can only be used to extend an existing pause.

Recommendation: Add the following check to extend():

```
if (pauseTimestamps[_identifier] == 0) {
    revert SuperchainConfig_NotPaused(_identifier);
}
```

Optimism: Fixed in commit 1891f66.

Spearbit: Verified, the recommended fix was implemented.

5.3.8 Minor issues with code and comments

Severity: Informational

Context: (See each case below).

Description/Recommendation:

- 1. SuperchainConfig.sol#L157 -- paused() can be declared external.
- 2. SystemConfig.sol#L213 -- Unnecessary cast of _superchainConfig to ISuperchainConfig:

```
- superchainConfig = ISuperchainConfig(_superchainConfig);
+ superchainConfig = _superchainConfig;
```

3. SystemConfig.sol#L230-L232 -- Consider clearing slots using Storage.setBytes32() to ensure the entire slot is cleared. This would also be consistent with how slots are cleared in SuperchainConfig:

```
- Storage.setAddress(disputeGameFactorySlot, address(0));
+ Storage.setBytes32(disputeGameFactorySlot, bytes32(0));
```

4. SystemConfig.sol#L278 -- The code here can be simplified:

```
- IOptimismPortal2 portal = IOptimismPortal2(payable(Storage.getAddress(OPTIMISM_PORTAL_SLOT)));
+ IOptimismPortal2 portal = IOptimismPortal2(payable(optimismPortal()));
```

- 5. DeputyPauseModule.sol#L149 -- This comment as incorrect as DeputyPauseModule.pause() no longer calls the Foundation Safe.
- 6. ProxyAdminOwnedBase.sol#L57-L59 -- Consider making the encoded L1CrossDomainMessenger's name a constant, for example:

```
bytes32 private constant L1CDM_IMPLEMENTATION_NAME =
   0x4f564d5f4c3143726f7373446f6d61696e4d657373656e67657200000000034
```

- 7. ProxyAdminOwnedBase.sol#L80 -- Typo, there is an extra + at the end of the comment.
- 8. DisputeGameFactory.sol#L122-L123 -- This comment is incorrect, DisputeGameFactory.gameAtIndex() does not return address(0) for non-existent proxies.
- 9. OptimismPortal2.sol#L675-L678 -- Consider calling EthLockbox.lockETH() only when _tx.value is non-zero:

```
// Send ETH back to the Lockbox or it'll get stuck here.
- if (!success) {
+ if (!success && _tx.value > 0) {
     ethLockbox.lockETH{ value: _tx.value }();
}
```

- 10. ProxyAdminOwnedBase.sol#L74-L81 -- Consider documenting in the comments that multiple OP stack chains could have the same ProxyAdmin owner address. Since this isn't obvious when looking at the ProxyAdminOwnedBase contract, this could become a potential footgun in the future. For example, when calling _assertSharedProxyAdminOwner(), passing the address of a proxy from another chain would pass if both chains share the same ProxyAdminOwner.
- 11. OptimismPortal2.sol#L159-L169 -- Consider indexing addresses for the event to make it easier to query (at least the two new addresses).
- 12. OptimismPortal2.sol#L318-L322 -- superchainConfig() can be set to external and might need a @custom: legacy notation.
- 13. OptimismPortal2.sol#L675 -- This comment is misleading. ETH can always be recovered with the new migrateLiquidity function.
- 14. OptimismPortal2.sol#L324-L328 -- Guardian legacy function could be external.
- 15. OPContractsManager.sol#L1920-L1921 -- Incorrect comment on the migrate function about being a "stub".
- 16. OPContractsManager.sol#L626-L627 -- It seemed to me with a little testing that it would be possible to cache the config without a stack too deep error which would optimize the code some: OPContractsManager.OpChainConfig memory config = _opChainConfigs[i];.

Optimism:

- 1. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 2. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 3. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 4. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.

- 5. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 6. Acknowledged.
- 7. Acknowledged.
- 8. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 9. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 10. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 11. Acknowledged.
- 12. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 13. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 14. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 15. Fixed in commit 4fc9181a.
- 16. Acknowledged.

Spearbit: Verified fixes and acknowledged the rest.