



**Find out how to access preview-only content**

Look inside Get Access

Higher Education  
1989, Volume 18, Issue 5, pp 529-549

## Quantitative studies of student self-assessment in higher education: a critical analysis of findings

### Abstract

Student self-assessment occurs when learners make judgements about aspects of their own performance. This paper focuses on one aspect of quantitative self-assessments: the comparison of student-generated marks with those generated by teachers. Studies including such comparisons in the context of higher education courses are reviewed and the following questions are addressed: (i) do students tend to over- or under-rate themselves *vis-à-vis* teachers?, (ii) do students of different abilities have the same tendencies?, (iii) do students in different kinds or levels of course tend to under- or over-rate themselves?, (iv) do students improve their ability to rate themselves over time or with practice?, (v) are the same tendencies evident when self-marks are used for formal assessment purposes?, and (vi) are there gender differences in self-rating? The paper also discusses methodological issues in studies of this type and makes recommendations concerning the analysis and presentation of information.





## Article Metrics

112 Citations 12 Social Shares

## Related Content



## References (78)

1. Argyris, C. and Schön, D.A. (1974) *Theory in Practice: Increasing Professional Effectiveness*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
2. Arnold, L., Willoughby, T.L., and Calkins, E.V. (1985) Self-evaluation in undergraduate medical education: a longitudinal perspective, *Journal of Medical Education*, 60, 21-28.
3. Bailey, G.D. (1979) Student self-assessment: helping students help themselves, *Kappa Delta Pi Record*, 15, 3, 86-88,96.
4. Baird, J.R. and White, R.T. (1982) Promoting self-control of learning, *Instructional Science*, 11, 227-247.
5. Barrows, H.S. and Tamblyn, R.M. (1976) Self-assessment units, *Journal of Medical Education*, 51, 334-336.
6. Biggs, J.B. and Telfer, R. (1987) *The Process of Learning*, Second Edition, Sydney: Prentice-Hall of Australia.
7. Bishop, J.B. (1971) Another look at counselor, client, and supervisor ratings of counselor effectiveness, *Counselor Education and Supervision* 10, 319-323.
8. Borman, C.A. and Ramirez, C. (1975) Evaluating counseling practicum students. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 15, 48-54.
9. Boud, D.J. (1989) The role of self assessment in formal grading procedures, *Assessment and*

*Evaluation in Higher Education*, 14, 1, 20–30.

10. Boud, D.J. and Kilty, J.M. (1985) Self-appraisal: an approach to academic staff development, in *Training Activities for Teachers in Higher Education*, Volume Two, Cryer, P. (ed), Guildford: Society for Research into Higher Education.
11. Boud, D.J., Churches, A.E., and Smith, E.M. (1986) Student self assessment in an engineering design course: an evaluation, *International Journal of Applied Engineering Education*, 2, 2, 83–90.
12. Boud, D.J. (1986) *Implementing Student Self-Assessment*, Green Guide No. 5, Sydney: Higher Education Research and Development Society of Australasia.
13. Boud, D.J. and Holmes, W.H. (1981) Self and peer marking in an undergraduate engineering course, *IEEE Transactions on Education*, E-24, 4, 267–274.
14. Boud, D.J. and Tyree, A.L. (1979) Self and peer assessment in professional education: a preliminary study in law, *Journal of the Society of Public Teachers of Law*, 15, 1, 65–74.
15. Broadfoot, P. (ed) (1986) *Profiles and Records of Achievement: A Review of Issues and Practice*. London: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
16. Burke, R.J. (1969) Some preliminary data on the use of self-evaluations and peer-ratings in assigning university course grades, *Journal of Educational Research*, 62, 10, 444–448.
17. Butler, S. (1982) Assessing the journal: an exercise in self evaluation, *English Quarterly*, 14, 4, 75–83.
18. Candy, P., Harri-Augstein, S., and Thomas, L. (1985) Reflection and the self-organized learner: a model of learning conversations, in Boud, D.J., Keogh, R. and Walker, D. (eds) *Reflection: Turning Experience into Learning*, London: Kogan Page, 100–116.
19. Chiu, L.H. (1975) Influence of student teaching on perceived teaching competence. *Perceptual and Motor Skills* 40, 872–874.

20. Cochran, S.B. and Spears, M.C. (1980) Student self-assessment and instructors' ratings: a comparison, *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 76, 253-257.
21. Cowan, J. (1988) Struggling with self-assessment, in Boud, D.J. (ed) *Developing Student Autonomy in Learning*, Second Edition, London: Kogan Page, 192-210.
22. Daines, J.M. (1978) Self evaluation of academic performance in a continuously assessed course of study, *Research Intelligence*, 4, 1, 24-26.
23. Davis, J.K. and Rand, D.C. (1980) Self-grading versus instructor grading, *Journal of Educational Research*, 73, 4, 207-211.
24. Denscombe, M. and Robins, L. (1980) Self-assessment and essay writing, *Teaching Sociology*, 8, 1, 63-78.
25. Doleys, E.J. and Renzaglia, G.A. (1963) Accuracy of student prediction of college grades, *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 41, 6, 528-530.
26. Elliott, J. (1978) Classroom accountability and the self-monitoring teacher, in Wynne Harlen (ed) *Evaluation and the Teacher's Role*, London: Macmillan Education, 47-90.
27. Everett, M.S. (1983) Influence of trait anxiety on self-grading. *Educational Directions*, 8, 1, 4-9.
28. Falchikov, N; (1986) Product comparisons and process benefits of collaborative peer group and self assessments, *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education*, 11, 2, 146-166.
29. Filene, P.O. (1969) Self-grading: an experiment in learning, *Journal of Higher Education*, 40, 451-458.
30. Fitz-Gibbon, C.T. (1985) The implications of meta-analysis for educational research, *British Educational Research Journal*, 11, 1, 45-49.
31. Flavell, J.H. (1979) Metacognition and cognitive monitoring: a new area of cognitive-developmental

inquiry, *American Psychologist*, 34, 10, 906–11.

32. Forehand, L.S., Vann, W.F., & Shugars, D.A. (1982) Student self-evaluation in preclinical restorative dentistry. *Journal of Dental Education* 46, 4, 221–226.
33. Fuqua, D.R., Johnson, A.W., Newman, J.L., Anderson, M.W., and Gade, E.M. (1984) Variability across sources of performance ratings, *Journal of Counselling Psychology*, 31, 2, 249–252.
34. Gaier, E.L. (1961) Student self estimates of final course grades, *Journal of Genetic Psychology*, 98, 63–67.
35. Gale, J. (1984) Self-assessment and self-remediation strategies, in Henderson, Ewan, S. and Nathenson, Michael, B. (eds) *Independent Learning in Higher Education*, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Educational Technology Publications, 98–140.
36. Glass, G.V., McGaw, B., and Smith, M.L. (1981) *Meta-Analysis in Social Research*, Beverly Hills, California: Sage Publications.
37. Gray, T.G.F. (1987) An exercise in improving the potential of exams for learning, *European Journal of Engineering Education*, 12, 4, 311–323.
38. Greenfield, D.G. (1978) Evaluation of music therapy practicum competencies: comparisons of self- and instructor ratings of videotapes. *Journal of Music Therapy* 15, 1, 15–20.
39. Henbest, R.J. and Fehrsen, G.S. (1985) Preliminary study at the Medical University of Southern Africa on student self-assessment as a means of evaluation, *Journal of Medical Education*, 60, 66–68.
40. Heron, J. (1981) Self and peer assessment, in *Management Self-Development: Concepts and Practices*, Farnborough: Gower, 111–128.
41. Heron, J. (1988) Assessment revisited, in D.J. Boud (ed) *Developing Student Autonomy in Learning*, London: Kogan Page, Second Edition, 77–90.

42. Hoffman, R.A. & Geller, M.I. (1981) A comparison of self-evaluations and classroom teacher evaluations for aides in a pre-student teaching field experience program, *Teacher Educator* 17, 2, 16-21.
43. Holzbach, R.L. (1978) Rater bias in performance ratings: superior, self-, and peer ratings, *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 63, 5, 579-588.
44. Israelite, L. (1983) Adult student self-evaluation, *Performance and Instruction Journal*, 22, 5, 15-16.
45. Jackson, M.W. (1988) Patterns of self assessment in a political analysis course. Unpublished manuscript. Department of Government, University of Sydney.
46. Keefer, K.E. (1971) Characteristics of students who make accurate and inaccurate self-predictions of college achievement, *Journal of Educational Research*, 64, 9, 401-404.
47. Kegel-Flom, P. (1975) Predicting supervisor, peer, and self-ratings of intern performance, *Journal of Medical Education*, 50, 812-815.
48. Klug, B. (1977) *The Grading Game*, London: NUS Publications.
49. Knowles, M.S. (1975) *Self-directed Learning: A Guide for Learners and Teachers*, New York: Association Press.
50. Larson, M.B. (1978) Multiple copies of exams encourage self-grading, *Engineering Education*, 68, 5, 435-437.
51. Magin, D. J. and Churches, A.E. (in press) What do students learn from self and peer assessment? in *Designing for Learning in Industry and Education*, Canberra: Australian Society for Educational Technology, 224-233.
52. McGeever, P.J. (1978) Student self-grading in the introductory American politics course, *Teaching Political Science*, 5, 3, 319-330.

53. Moreland, R., Miller, J. and Laucka, F. (1981) Academic achievement and self-evaluation of academic performance. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 73, 3, 335–344.
54. Morton, J.B. and Macbeth, W.A.A.G. (1977) Correlations between staff, peer, and self assessments of fourth-years students in surgery, *Medical Education*, 11, 3, 167–170.
55. Mueller, R.H. (1970) Is self-grading the answer?, *Journal of Higher Education*, 41, 3, 221–224.
56. Murstein, B.I. (1965) The relationship of grade expectations and grades believed to be deserved to actual grades received, *Journal of Experimental Education*, 33, 4, 357–362.
57. O'Neill, G.P. (1985) Self, teacher and faculty assessments of student teaching performance: a second scenario, *The Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 31, 2, 88–98.
58. Oskarsson, M. (1980) *Approaches to Self-Assessment in Foreign Language Learning*, Pergamon: Oxford.
59. Pease, D. (1975) Comparing faculty and school supervisor ratings for education students, *College Student Journal*, 9, 1, 91–94.
60. Perkins, E.R. and Anderson, D.C. (1981) *Self-assessment in the National Health Service*, Studies in Education Ltd., Nafferton.
61. Peterson, J.M. (1979) Me and my critics: students' responses to architectural jury criticism, *Studies in Art Education*, 20, 2, 64–67.
62. Pitishkin-Potanich, V. (1983) On evaluating students knowledge, *Higher Education in Europe*, 8, 2, 18–22.
63. Ries, A.L., Kreit, L.H., and Podshadley, K.W. (1971) A comparison of dental student self-evaluations with predicted and actual teacher evaluations, *Journal of Dental Education*, 35, 493–495.



64. Rogers, C.R. (1983) *Freedom to Learn for the 80's*, Charles E. Merrill; Columbus, Ohio.
65. Rotem, A. and Abbatt, F.R. (1982) Self-assessment for teachers of health workers: how to be a better teaching, *WHO Publication 68*, Geneva: World Health Organisation.
66. Rowntree, D. (1977) *Assessing Students: How Shall We Know Them?*, London: Harper and Row.
67. Schön, D.A. (1983) *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action*, New York: Basic Books.
68. Schön, D.A. (1987) *Educating the Reflective Practitioner: Towards a New Design for Teaching and Learning in the Professions*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
69. Sclabassi, S.E. & Woelfel, S.K. (1984) Development of self-assessment skills in medical students, *Medical Education*, 84, 226–231.
70. Slavin, R.E. (1986) Best-evidence synthesis: an alternative to meta-analytic and traditional reviews, *Educational Research*, 15, 9, 5–11.
71. Stanton, H.E. (1978) Self-grading as an assessment method, *Improving College and University Teaching*, 26, 4, 236–238.
72. Stover, R.V. (1976) The impact of self-grading on performance and evaluation in a constitutional law course, *Teaching Political Science*, 3, 3, 303–310.
73. Stuart, M.R., Goldstein, H.S., & Snope, F.C. (1980) Self-evaluation by residents in family medicine. *Journal of Family Practice* 10, 4, 639–642.
74. Sumner, F.C. (1932) Marks as estimated by students, *Education*, 32, 429.
75. Thomas, L.F. and Harri-Augstein, E.S. (1977) Learning to learn: the personal construction and exchange of meaning, in Howe, M.J.A. (ed) *Adult Learning: Psychological Research and Applications*,

London: J. Wiley, 85-104.

76. Van Riper, B.W. (1982) Facilitating systematic self-assessment: a role for teachers in contemporary appraisal, *Education*, 103, 1.
77. Wheeler, A.E. and Knoop, H.R. (1981) Self, teacher and faculty assessments of student teaching performance, *Journal of Educational Research*, 75, 3, 171-181.
78. Wilcox, K. (1988) Student self-evaluation in a first year Australian politics course. Unpublished manuscript, Department of Government, University of Sydney.

## About this Article

---

### Title

Quantitative studies of student self-assessment in higher education: a critical analysis of findings

### Journal

Higher Education

Volume 18, Issue 5 , pp 529-549

### Cover Date

1989-09-01

### DOI

10.1007/BF00138746

### Print ISSN

0018-1560

### Online ISSN

1573-174X

### Publisher

Kluwer Academic Publishers

### Additional Links

- [Register for Journal Updates](#)

- Editorial Board
- About This Journal
- Manuscript Submission

#### Topics

- Education (general)
- Psychology, general

#### Industry Sectors

- Consumer Packaged Goods
- Finance, Business & Banking

#### Authors

- David Boud <sup>(1)</sup> <sup>(2)</sup> <sup>(3)</sup>
- Nancy Falchikov <sup>(1)</sup> <sup>(2)</sup> <sup>(3)</sup>

#### Author Affiliations

- 1. Professional Development Centre, University of New South Wales, 2033, Kensington, NSW, Australia
- 2. Napier Polytechnic, Edinburgh, Scotland
- 3. Honorary Visiting Fellow in the former Tertiary Education Research Centre, University of New South Wales, New South Wales, Australia

Continue reading...

To view the rest of this content please follow the download PDF link above.

---

Over 8.5 million scientific documents at your fingertips  
© Springer International Publishing AG, Part of Springer Science+Business Media

