Optimal Experimental Design: Psychophysics of change point Detection.

Manuel Villarreal and Arturo Bouzas

Mexico City, Mexico

Abstract

Keywords: Optimal Experimental Design, Psycophysics, Change Point Detection

1. Introduction

One of the main challenges in scientific research is the design of an experiment. A good experimental design will make the difference between finding an answer to our research question and wasting valuable resources like time and money.

When designing an experiment, often one start's by making decisions about the number of participants, how many and what values of our independent variable should we test or how many times should we test each of those values. Most of the time, these choices are made on the basis of previous research on the field. However, it might be the case that there is not enough information to make these decisions with confidence, or that the values that are commonly used, do not allow for strong conclusions. Optimal Experimental Design (OED) offers an alternative to solve this kind of problems through the formalization of the design problem.

The concept of optimizing an experimental design is not new to psychological research. There are already examples in the literature of design optimization (e.g. Myung and Pitt, 2009; Zhang and Lee, 2010). Both of this examples discuss and demostrate the advantages of OED for model comparison in psychology. In the present paper we will present a different approach were the problem is not to select between two models but to estimate the parameters of a single one.

In particular, we will present an example of OED in the context of Generalized Linear Models. This type of models are widely used in psychophisics. The problem that will be treated here is farly new, however, the methodological aspects remain the same even with more straight-foward psychiphisical experiments. In order to do this we will use a particular parametrization of the logistic model, which has been used to model the relationship between a phisical stimulus and the probability of a given response.

2. OUTLINE

Experimental design First we need a research question, then the problem of designing the experiment arises, how many participants should we test, what are the values of the independent variable that we should use, how many times should we present each of those values, etc. The problem is when

2.1. Optimal experimental design

Elements:

Design space: what are the elements of the experimental design that we want to optimize Utility Function: function that maps points on the design space to the real numbers, this function should reflect the objective of the experiment, for example if we want to discriminate between two cognitive models, the utility function should assign a greater value to an experimental design for which the models give different predictions that to designs for which the predictions of the models are indistinguishable from one another.

3. Optimal Experimental Design: Example

Why is is detecting changes important for an organism?

Change detection in probabilistic series.

Arising problems with experimental design.

Research question and its statistichal interpretation

Assumtion about the relationship between a subjects response the dependent variable under study

Design space for this problem and how to reduce the dimensionality of the space by assuming experimental constraints.

Utility function and its relationship with the objective of the experiment

Arising problems with utility function and the proposed response function. Bayesian solution, assigning a prior distribution to the parameters, the less research in a field the more difficult it is to assign an informative prior, however, we could use other cognitive models in order to propose a prior distribution.

3.1. Using a model to generate prior distributions

Using the prior distribution, the utility function and the definition of a design space we can otimize the experimental design in this case we are looking for $\delta\theta^*$ that maximizes the following equation:

$$U(\delta\theta^*) = \max_{\delta\theta} \int_\beta log(det(I(\beta|\delta\theta)))\pi(\beta)d\beta \qquad (1)$$

The previous integral can be approximated via Monte Carlo sampling

4. Results

4.1. Consruction of the prior distribution

Prior over model parameters(Gallistel et al 2014) Results Constructing the prior: we take a multivariate normal distribution with mean and covariance equal to the unbiased estimators for both parameters.

4.2. Optimal design

Aproximating the utility function (integral) throught Monte Carlo simulation Utility aproximation for 2 Design points

the approximation returns a smooth curve over the 2 point design space.

5. Discussion

Optimal design for the example Properties of the most useful points (they land on the points of the curve where the steepness changes most dramatically)

Advantages of Optimal Design

Using models to generte prior distributions.

References

Myung, J., Pitt, M., 2009. Optimal experimental design for model discrimination. Psychological Review 116 (3), 499–518.

Zhang, S., Lee, M., 2010. Optimal experimental design for a class of bandit problems. Journal of Mathematical Psychology 54, 499–508.