

# Optimal Experimental Design: Psychophysics of change point Detection.

Manuel Villarreal and Arturo Bouzas

*Mexico City, Mexico*

---

## Abstract

*Keywords:* Optimal Experimental Design, Psychophysics, Change Point Detection

---

## 1. Introduction

One of the main challenges in scientific research is the design of an experiment. A good experimental design will make the difference between finding an answer to our research question and wasting valuable resources like time and money.

When designing an experiment, often one starts by making decisions about the number of participants, how many and what values of our independent variable should we test or how many times should we test each of those values. Most of the time, these choices are made on the basis of previous research on the field. However, it might be the case that there is not enough information to make these decisions with confidence, or that the values that are commonly used, do not allow for strong conclusions. Optimal Experimental Design (OED) offers an alternative to solve this kind of problems through the formalization of the design problem.

15 OED allows us to re-interpret the problem of an experimental design as  
16 a decision problem, in which the purpose is to maximize a utility function.  
17 This function is a numeric representation of our preference over the possible  
18 consequences of running an experiment. Therefore, the optimization of an  
19 experimental design requires us to have a formal interpretation of the purpose  
20 of the experiment.

21 The concept of optimizing an experimental design is not new to psy-  
22 chological research. There are already examples in the literature of design  
23 optimization (e.g. Myung and Pitt, 2009; Zhang and Lee, 2010). Both of  
24 this examples discuss and demonstrate the advantages of OED for model  
25 comparison in psychology. In this paper, we will present a different approach  
26 where the problem is not to select between two models but to estimate the  
27 parameters of a single one.

28 In particular, we will present an example of OED in the context of Gen-  
29 eralized Linear Models. These models are widely used in psychophysics. The  
30 problem that will be treated here is fairly new, however, the methodologi-  
31 cal aspects remain the same even with more straight-forward psychophysical  
32 experiments. In order to do this, we will use a particular parametrization of  
33 the logistic model which is primarily used in statistical inference.

## 34 **2. Optimal experimental design**

35 In order to apply the concepts of OED to a particular problem, first,  
36 we need to define the elements of the design space. This design space is  
37 defined by the variables that we can manipulate during the experiment, for  
38 example, the values that our independent variable might take or the weight

39 (proportion of observations) assigned to each of those values. These elements  
40 are the ones that we can modify in order to optimize the design.

41 The second step would be to formalise the objective of the experiment.  
42 For example, in the case of a logistic model, we might want to find the  
43 values of our independent variable that minimize the variance of the model  
44 parameters, or we might be interested in the magnitude of the physical stim-  
45 ulus for which the probability of a response takes on a certain value. The  
46 formalization of the research question will define a utility function.

47 The last step is to specify the prior information that we have about the  
48 problem at hand. This last step can be carried out in two ways, first, we can  
49 try to optimize the experiment for a particular guess about the parameter  
50 values of the model of interest, or we could use a probability distribution  
51 to account for the uncertainty in the values that we are interested in. This  
52 last step is primarily important to the optimization process for generalized  
53 linear models, because the optimal design will depend on the values of the  
54 parameters.

55 Once we have defined the design space  $\eta$ , the objective of the experiment  
56 and the prior information  $p(\theta)$ , the expected utility of a design is represented  
57 by the following equation:

$$U(\eta) = \int \int U(\eta, y, \theta) p(\theta|y, \eta) p(y|\eta) d\theta dy \quad (1)$$

58 Therefore, finding the experimental design that is optimal given a utility  
59 function reduces to the problem of finding the values for the variables in  $\eta$  for  
60 which equation 1 takes its maximum value.

61 the objective would be to find the values in the design space that bring a  
62 higher utility.

63 Experimental design First we need a research question, then the problem  
64 of designing the experiment arises, how many participants should we test,  
65 what are the values of the independent variable that we should use, how  
66 many times should we present each of those values, etc. The problem is  
67 when

68 Elements:

69 Design space: what are the elements of the experimental design that we  
70 want to optimize Utility Function: function that maps points on the design  
71 space to the real numbers, this function should reflect the objective of the  
72 experiment, for example if we want to discriminate between two cognitive  
73 models, the utility function should assign a greater value to an experimental  
74 design for which the models give different predictions than to designs for  
75 which the predictions of the models are indistinguishable from one another.

### 76 3. OUTLINE

#### 77 4. Optimal Experimental Design: Example

78 Why is detecting changes important for an organism?

79 Change detection in probabilistic series.

80 Arising problems with experimental design.

81 Research question and its statistical interpretation

82 Assumption about the relationship between a subject's response and the depen-  
83 dent variable under study

84 Design space for this problem and how to reduce the dimensionality of  
85 the space by assuming experimental constraints.

86 Utility function and its relationship with the objective of the experiment

87 Arising problems with utility function and the proposed response func-  
88 tion. Bayesian solution, assigning a prior distribution to the parameters, the  
89 less research in a field the more difficult it is to assign an informative prior,  
90 however, we could use other cognitive models in order to propose a prior  
91 distribution.

#### 92 *4.1. Using a model to generate prior distributions*

93 Using the prior distribution, the utility function and the definition of  
94 a design space we can optimize the experimental design in this case we are  
95 looking for  $\delta\theta^*$  that maximizes the following equation:

$$U(\delta\theta^*) = \max_{\delta\theta} \int_{\beta} \log(\det(I(\beta|\delta\theta)))\pi(\beta)d\beta \quad (2)$$

96 The previous integral can be approximated via Monte Carlo sampling

## 97 **5. Results**

### 98 *5.1. Construction of the prior distribution*

99 Prior over model parameters(Gallistel et al 2014) Results Constructing  
100 the prior: we take a multivariate normal distribution with mean and covari-  
101 ance equal to the unbiased estimators for both parameters.

### 102 *5.2. Optimal design*

103 Aproximating the utility function (integral) through Monte Carlo simu-  
104 lation Utility approximation for 2 Design points

105 the approximation returns a smooth curve over the 2 point design space.

## 106 **6. Discussion**

107     Optimal design for the example Properties of the most useful points (they  
108     land on the points of the curve where the steepness changes most dramati-  
109     cally)

110     Advantages of Optimal Design

111     Using models to generate prior distributions.

## 112 **References**

113     Myung, J., Pitt, M., 2009. Optimal experimental design for model discrimi-  
114     nation. *Psychological Review* 116 (3), 499–518.

115     Zhang, S., Lee, M., 2010. Optimal experimental design for a class of bandit  
116     problems. *Journal of Mathematical Psychology* 54, 499–508.