

tic-tac-toe
workshop

CSCI
373

Suppose we want to reason logically about

tic-tac-toe

1	2	3
4	5	6
7	8	9

let x_i be whether square i has an \times

let o_i be whether square i has an \circ

let w_x be whether \times won

let w_o be whether \circ won

rules of tic-tac-toe

- no square has both \times and \circ
- three \times 's in a row wins
- three \circ 's in a row wins
- \times and \circ can't both win

no square

has both

X and O

$$\neg(x_1 \wedge o_1)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_2 \wedge o_2)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_3 \wedge o_3)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_4 \wedge o_4)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_5 \wedge o_5)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_6 \wedge o_6)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_7 \wedge o_7)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_8 \wedge o_8)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_9 \wedge o_9)$$

three X's
in a row
•
wins

1	2	3
4	5	6
7	8	9

$$\begin{aligned} & ((x_1 \wedge x_2 \wedge x_3) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ \wedge & ((x_4 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_6) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ \wedge & ((x_7 \wedge x_8 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ \wedge & ((x_1 \wedge x_4 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ \wedge & ((x_2 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_8) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ \wedge & ((x_3 \wedge x_6 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ \wedge & ((x_1 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ \wedge & ((x_3 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_x) \end{aligned}$$

three O's
in a row
•
wins

1	2	3
4	5	6
7	8	9

$$\begin{aligned} & ((o_1 \wedge o_2 \wedge o_3) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ \wedge & ((o_4 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_6) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ \wedge & ((o_7 \wedge o_8 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ \wedge & ((o_1 \wedge o_4 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ \wedge & ((o_2 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_8) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ \wedge & ((o_3 \wedge o_6 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ \wedge & ((o_1 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ \wedge & ((o_3 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_o) \end{aligned}$$

.

 and 

can't both

win

$$\neg(w_{\text{X}} \wedge w_{\text{O}})$$

rules of tic-tac-toe

- no square has both \times and \circ
- three \times 's in a row wins
- three \circ 's in a row wins
- \times and \circ can't both win

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg(x_1 \wedge o_1) \wedge \neg(x_2 \wedge o_2) \wedge \neg(x_3 \wedge o_3) \wedge \neg(x_4 \wedge o_4) \wedge \neg(x_5 \wedge o_5) \\ & \wedge \neg(x_6 \wedge o_6) \wedge \neg(x_7 \wedge o_7) \wedge \neg(x_8 \wedge o_8) \wedge \neg(x_9 \wedge o_9) \\ \\ & ((x_1 \wedge x_2 \wedge x_3) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_4 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_6) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_7 \wedge x_8 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_4 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \\ & \wedge ((x_2 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_8) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_3 \wedge x_6 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_3 \wedge x_5) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_3 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \\ \\ & ((o_1 \wedge o_2 \wedge o_3) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_4 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_6) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_7 \wedge o_8 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_4 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \\ & \wedge ((o_2 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_8) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_3 \wedge o_6 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_3 \wedge o_5) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_3 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \\ \\ & \neg(w_{\times} \wedge w_{\circ}) \end{aligned}$$

rules of tic-tac-toe

no square has
both \times and \circ
and

three \times 's in
a row wins
and

three \circ 's in
a row wins
and

\times and \circ
can't both win

$$\neg(x_1 \wedge o_1) \wedge \neg(x_2 \wedge o_2) \wedge \neg(x_3 \wedge o_3) \wedge \neg(x_4 \wedge o_4) \wedge \neg(x_5 \wedge o_5) \\ \wedge \neg(x_6 \wedge o_6) \wedge \neg(x_7 \wedge o_7) \wedge \neg(x_8 \wedge o_8) \wedge \neg(x_9 \wedge o_9)$$



$$((x_1 \wedge x_2 \wedge x_3) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_4 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_6) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_7 \wedge x_8 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_4 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \\ \wedge ((x_2 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_8) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_3 \wedge x_6 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times})$$



$$((o_1 \wedge o_2 \wedge o_3) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_4 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_6) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_7 \wedge o_8 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_4 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \\ \wedge ((o_2 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_8) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_3 \wedge o_6 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ})$$



$$\neg(w_{\times} \wedge w_{\circ})$$

this is just a long conjunction

no square has
both \times and \circ
and

three \times 's in
a row wins
and

three \circ 's in
a row wins
and

\times and \circ
can't both win

$$\neg(x_1 \wedge o_1) \wedge \neg(x_2 \wedge o_2) \wedge \neg(x_3 \wedge o_3) \wedge \neg(x_4 \wedge o_4) \wedge \neg(x_5 \wedge o_5) \\ \wedge \neg(x_6 \wedge o_6) \wedge \neg(x_7 \wedge o_7) \wedge \neg(x_8 \wedge o_8) \wedge \neg(x_9 \wedge o_9)$$



$$((x_1 \wedge x_2 \wedge x_3) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_4 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_6) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_7 \wedge x_8 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_4 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \\ \wedge ((x_2 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_8) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_3 \wedge x_6 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times}) \wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_{\times})$$



$$((o_1 \wedge o_2 \wedge o_3) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_4 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_6) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_7 \wedge o_8 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_4 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \\ \wedge ((o_2 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_8) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_3 \wedge o_6 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}) \wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_{\circ})$$



$$\neg(w_{\times} \wedge w_{\circ})$$

this is just a long conjunction

$$\text{notBoth} = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \neg(x_1 \wedge o_1), \neg(x_2 \wedge o_2), \neg(x_3 \wedge o_3), \neg(x_4 \wedge o_4), \neg(x_5 \wedge o_5) \\ \neg(x_6 \wedge o_6), \neg(x_7 \wedge o_7), \neg(x_8 \wedge o_8), \neg(x_9 \wedge o_9) \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\text{threeX} = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} ((x_1 \wedge x_2 \wedge x_3) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_4 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_6) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_7 \wedge x_8 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_1 \wedge x_4 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ ((x_2 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_8) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_3 \wedge x_6 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x) \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\text{threeO} = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} ((o_1 \wedge o_2 \wedge o_3) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_4 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_6) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_7 \wedge o_8 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_1 \wedge o_4 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ ((o_2 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_8) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_3 \wedge o_6 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o) \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\neg(w_x \wedge w_o)$$

this is just a long conjunction

$$\text{notBoth} = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} \neg(x_1 \wedge o_1), \neg(x_2 \wedge o_2), \neg(x_3 \wedge o_3), \neg(x_4 \wedge o_4), \neg(x_5 \wedge o_5) \\ \neg(x_6 \wedge o_6), \neg(x_7 \wedge o_7), \neg(x_8 \wedge o_8), \neg(x_9 \wedge o_9) \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\text{threeX} = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} ((x_1 \wedge x_2 \wedge x_3) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_4 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_6) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_7 \wedge x_8 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_1 \wedge x_4 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_x) \\ ((x_2 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_8) \Rightarrow w_x), ((x_3 \wedge x_6 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x) \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\text{threeO} = \left\{ \begin{array}{l} ((o_1 \wedge o_2 \wedge o_3) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_4 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_6) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_7 \wedge o_8 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_1 \wedge o_4 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_o) \\ ((o_2 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_8) \Rightarrow w_o), ((o_3 \wedge o_6 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o) \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\left(\begin{array}{c} \wedge \quad \alpha \\ \alpha \in \text{notBoth} \cup \text{threeX} \cup \text{threeO} \end{array} \right) \wedge \neg(w_x \wedge w_o)$$

no square

has both

X and O

$$\neg(x_1 \wedge o_1)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_2 \wedge o_2)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_3 \wedge o_3)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_4 \wedge o_4)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_5 \wedge o_5)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_6 \wedge o_6)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_7 \wedge o_7)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_8 \wedge o_8)$$

$$\wedge \neg(x_9 \wedge o_9)$$

define: $\text{notBoth}(i) = \{\neg(x_i \wedge o_i)\}$

three X's
in a row
•
wins

1	2	3
4	5	6
7	8	9

$$((x_1 \wedge x_2 \wedge x_3) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

$$\wedge ((x_4 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_6) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

$$\wedge ((x_7 \wedge x_8 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

$$\wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_4 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

$$\wedge ((x_2 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_8) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

$$\wedge ((x_3 \wedge x_6 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

$$\wedge ((x_1 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_9) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

$$\wedge ((x_3 \wedge x_5 \wedge x_7) \Rightarrow w_x)$$

define: lines = $\{(1,2,3), (4,5,6), (7,8,9), (1,4,7), (2,5,8), (3,6,9), (1,5,9), (3,5,7)\}$

$$\text{threeX} = \bigcup_{(i,j,k) \in \text{lines}} (x_i \wedge x_j \wedge x_k) \Rightarrow w_x$$

three ○'s
in a row
•
wins

1	2	3
4	5	6
7	8	9

$$((o_1 \wedge o_2 \wedge o_3) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

$$\wedge ((o_4 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_6) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

$$\wedge ((o_7 \wedge o_8 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

$$\wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_4 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

$$\wedge ((o_2 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_8) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

$$\wedge ((o_3 \wedge o_6 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

$$\wedge ((o_1 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_9) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

$$\wedge ((o_3 \wedge o_5 \wedge o_7) \Rightarrow w_o)$$

define: $\text{lines} = \{(1,2,3), (4,5,6), (7,8,9), (1,4,7), (2,5,8), (3,6,9), (1,5,9), (3,5,7)\}$

$$\text{three } O = \bigcup_{(i,j,k) \in \text{lines}} (o_i \wedge o_j \wedge o_k) \Rightarrow w_o$$

X and O

can't both

win

$$\neg(w_X \wedge w_O)$$

Seems fine

rules of tic-tac-toe

no square has
both \times and \circ

$$\text{notBoth}(i) = \{\neg(x_i \wedge o_i)\}$$

three \times 's in
a row wins
and
three \circ 's in
a row wins

$$\text{lines} = \{(1,2,3), (4,5,6), (7,8,9), (1,4,7), (2,5,8), (3,6,9), (1,5,9), (3,5,7)\}$$

$$\text{threeX} = \bigcup_{(i,j,k) \in \text{lines}} (x_i \wedge x_j \wedge x_k) \Rightarrow w_x$$

$$\text{threeO} = \bigcup_{(i,j,k) \in \text{lines}} (o_i \wedge o_j \wedge o_k) \Rightarrow w_o$$

\times and \circ
can't both win

$$\neg(w_x \wedge w_o)$$

rules of tic-tac-toe

no square has
both \times and \circ

$$\text{notBoth}(i) = \{\neg(x_i \wedge o_i)\}$$

three \times 's in
a row wins
and
three \circ 's in
a row wins

$$\text{lines} = \{(1,2,3), (4,5,6), (7,8,9), (1,4,7), (2,5,8), (3,6,9), (1,5,9), (3,5,7)\}$$

$$\text{three } \times = \bigcup_{(i,j,k) \in \text{lines}} (x_i \wedge x_j \wedge x_k) \Rightarrow w_{\times}$$

$$\text{three } \circ = \bigcup_{(i,j,k) \in \text{lines}} (o_i \wedge o_j \wedge o_k) \Rightarrow w_{\circ}$$

\times and \circ
can't both win

$$\neg(w_{\times} \wedge w_{\circ})$$

$$\left(\begin{array}{c} \Delta \\ i \in \{1, \dots, 9\} \\ s \in \text{notBoth}(i) \end{array} \right) \wedge \left(\begin{array}{c} \Delta \\ s \in \text{three } \times \cup \text{three } \circ \\ s \end{array} \right) \wedge \neg(w_{\times} \wedge w_{\circ})$$