Robin Karlsson 1DV607

Peer review 2 Lucas, Martin, Anton

Oct 8, 2015

Concerning the class diagram

In the classdiagram the UML notation with a dashed line and open arrow specifies a dependency. But looking at the code they seem to be associations since they are fields. See Larman [1, p252]

Also I see a lot of dependencies not in the class diagram. For example the menucontroller uses both member and boats and should according to Larman [1, ch16.11, p260] therefore have a dependency to those classes.

This gives me the impression that the diagram is incomplete.

Concerning sequence diagrams

I've assumed that SequenceDiagram Version 3.png is the sequence diagram I'm supposed to review.

The Title of the diagram doesn't describe the sequence thats shown. Furthermore there are several different sequences shown in the same diagram. I would recomend splitting them up to increase clarity.

Consider using any of the UML return notations described by Larman [1, p229]

The class names in the lifeline boxes doesn't match reality. Membercontroller is named Menucontroller in the code suggesting that the diagram is not up to date.

In the create member sequence the view is interacted with in several cases but is not illustrated on the diagram (view.getFistname, etc)

Theese things suggests that the diagram is incomplete.

Concerning code and code quality

Some thought about the code and code quality:

- Very large methods and classes. Could benefit from some division of responsibility.
- Some inconsistencies in naming. Different naming conventions are used.
- The member and boat lists would benefit from being painted types.

Concerning the instructions

When trying to run the Workshop2.exe.config the result is just an error box. I'm not a native windows user so could be me. Opening the project, compiling and running however, works.

It is also stated that the class and sequence diagrams can be found in the workshop 2 folder. However I cannot find either of them at that location.

Final thoughts

With some minor tweaks to notation and some updates to the diagrams and they will provide a good overview of the application. The design separates the models from the view in a good way and uses an object oriented design.

As far as I can see the application and documentation, with some edits, should definitely meet the grade criteria.

References

1. Larman C., Applying UML and Patterns 3rd Ed, 2005, ISBN: 0131489062