5 Analysis

First and foremost, it is to be noted, that the vast majority of sites mentioning agile working methods, also mention digitalisation / digital transformation (see Figure 5). This is in line with the apparent connection between agile methods and the digital transformation of the public sector, as already discussed in the Section 2.1.

Figure 5: Percentages of agil* website publications referring to digitalisation in Germany and the UK

As becomes apparent in Figure 6, German governments on federal and state level, have only started publishing agile related content in 2015. Furthermore, it can be seen, that federal level ministries by far, have been the most active in that respect (24 pages in total), and the first ones to publish agile related content in 2015.

Figure 6: Agile* websites published in Germany over time, distinguished between states and federal

When comparing the content published by the ministerial web domains of the federal states, it can be seen that Baden-Wuerttemberg's ministries have published the most number of websites referring to agile (12 pages), followed by Bavaria (8), Bremen and Berlin (each 7). However, in terms of how many co-search terms (for example 'scrum', 'sprint', 'design thinking'; see Table 4 in Appendix A) appear on average on those sites, Hesse leads the board with 3.25 co-search terms, followed by Bavaria (2.27), and Rhineland-Palatine

(2.7). The number of co-search terms might be read as a rough proxy of how in-depth the agile methodology is being described on the respective website. The scraper didn't yield any matching pages for Saarland, North Rhine-Westphalia, Saxony, and Lower Saxony.

Figure 7: Breadth and depth of German federal states' website publications referring to agil*

Looking at the matching hits that the scraper yielded from 'gov.uk' reveals the the following patterns over time (see Figure 8): The very first web-content on the topic, was a guidance on smarter working published on the general domain in 2004.[5] The general domain is also the source for most (WORK IN PROGRESS)

[5]Since this page was updated since its first publication, it might well be, that the original content was not mentioning agile.

Figure 8: Agile* websites published over time on gov.uk, distinguished between organisations

Figure 9: Agile* websites published by British and German ministries over time

Figure 10: Breadth and depth of agile* websites published by British and German ministries

Figure 11: Frequency of co-search terms on agile* websites published by British and German ministries

Appendix A

Table 3: List of ministry websites

Country / Level / Ministry	Source / Website
Britain – Federal & State Level	www.gov.uk/government/organisations
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.gov.uk
Germany – Federal Level	www.protokoll-inland.de/Webs/PI/DE/rang-titulierung/amtliche-reihenfolgen/bundesministerien/liste-der-bundesministerien-node.html
Auswärtiges Amt	www.auswaertiges-amt.de
Bundesministerium der Finanzen	www.bundesfinanzministerium.de
Bundesministerium der Justiz und für Verbraucherschutz	www.bmjv.de
Bundesministerium der Verteidigung	www.bmvg.de
Bundesministerium des Innern, für Bau und Heimat	www.bmi.bund.de
Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales	www.bmas.de
Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung	www.bmbf.de
Bundesministerium für Ernährung und Landwirtschaft	www.bmel.de
Bundesministerium für Familie, Senioren, Frauen und Jugend	www.bmfsfj.de
Bundesministerium für Gesundheit	www.bundesgesundheitsministerium.de
Bundesministerium für Umwelt, Naturschutz und nukleare Sicherheit	www.bmu.de
Bundesministerium für Verkehr und digitale Infrastruktur	www.bmvi.de
Bundesministerium für Wirtschaft und Energie	www.bmwi.de
Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung	www.bmz.de
Bundesregierung	www.bundesregierung.de
Germany – State Level	
Baden-Wuerttemberg	www.baden-wuerttemberg.de/de/regierung/landesregierung/ministerien
Ministerium der Justiz und für Europa	www.justizministerium-bw.de
Ministerium für Kultus, Jugend und Sport	www.km-bw.de
All other institutions are reachable under one domain	www.baden-wuerttemberg.de

Bavaria	https://www.bayern.de/staatsregierung/staatsministerien
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.bayern.de
Berlin	www.berlin.de/rbmskzl/regierender-buergermeister/senat
Senatsverwaltung für Stadtentwicklung und Wohnen	www.stadtentwicklung.berlin.de
All other institutions are reachable under one domain	www.berlin.de
Brandenburg	https://service.brandenburg.de/lis/list.php?page=behoerdenverzeichnis_art&sv[adr_art]=lb_Min&sort=org_name1,org_name2,org_name3,org_name4&_grid=Ministerien
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.brandenburg.de
Bremen	https://landesportal.bremen.de/senat/ressorts
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.bremen.de
Hamburg	www.hamburg.de/behoerden
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.hamburg.de
Hesse	www.hessen.de/regierung/staatskanzlei-und-ministerien
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.hessen.de
Lower Saxony	www.niedersachsen.de/politik_staat/landesregierung_ministerien/die-niedersaechsische-landesregierung-20076.html
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.niedersachsen.de
Mecklenburg-Vorpommern	www.regierung-mv.de/
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.regierung-mv.de
North Rhine-Westphalia	www.land.nrw/de/ministerien-und-vertretungen
Ministerium der Finanzen	www.fm.nrw.de
Ministerium der Justiz	www.justiz.nrw
Ministerium des Innern	www.im.nrw.de
Ministerium für Arbeit, Gesundheit und Soziales	www.mags.nrw
Ministerium für Bundes- und Europaangelegenheiten sowie Internationales	www.mbei.nrw
Ministerium für Heimat, Kommunales, Bau und Gleichstellung	www.mhkbg.nrw
Ministerium für Kinder, Familie, Flüchtlinge und Integration	www.mkffi.nrw

Ministerium für Kultur und Wissenschaft	www.mkw.nrw
Ministerium für Schule und Bildung	www.schulministerium.nrw.de
Ministerium für Umwelt, Landwirtschaft, Natur- und Verbraucherschutz	www.umwelt.nrw.de
Ministerium für Verkehr	www.vm.nrw.de
Ministerium für Wirtschaft, Innovation, Digitalisierung und Energie	www.wirtschaft.nrw
Staatskanzlei	www.land.nrw
Rhineland-Palatinate	www.rlp.de/de/landesregierung/ministerien
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.rlp.de
Saarland	www.saarland.de/12341.htm
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.saarland.de
Saxony	www.sachsen.de/regierung-verwaltung-egovernment.html
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.sachsen.de
Saxony-Anhalt	www.sachsen-anhalt.de/lj/politik-und-verwaltung/die-landesregierung/ministerien/ministerien
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.sachsen-anhalt.de
Schleswig-Holstein	www.schleswig-holstein.de/DE/Landesregierung/landesregierung_node.html
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.schleswig-holstein.de
Thuringia	www.thueringen.de
Thüringer Ministerium für Arbeit, Soziales, Gesundheit, Frauen und Familie	www.tmasgff.de
Thüringer Staatskanzlei	www.staatskanzlei-thueringen.de
All institutions are reachable under one domain	www.thueringen.de

Table 4: List English and German co-search terms

German	English
abteilungsübergreifender Ansatz	cross-departmental approach
agil arbeitende Organisationseinheit	agile organization unit
agil arbeitende Teams	agile team (double)
agile Arbeitsformen	agile working methods (double)
agile Arbeitskultur	agile working culture
agile Arbeitsmethoden	agile working methods
agile Arbeitspraktiken	agile work practices
agile Arbeitsumgebung	agile environment
agile Arbeitsweise	agile way of working
agile Bereitstellung	agile delivery
agile digitale Fähigkeit	agile digital capability
agile Entwicklung	agile development
agile Fähigkeiten	agile capability
agile Innovation	agile innovation
agile Methode	agile method
agile Methodik	agile methodology
agile Organisation	agile organisation
agile Phasen	agile stages
agile Prinzipien	agile principles
agile Prozesse	agile processes
agile Softwareentwicklung	agile software development
agile Strukturen	agile structures
agile Techniken	agile techniques
agile Transformation	agile transformation
Agile Transition	agile transition
agile Wände	agile walls
agile Weise	agile way
agile Zeremonie	agile ceremony
agile Zertifizierung	agile certification
agilen Arbeits- und Managementmethoden	agile working and management methods
agiler Ansatz	agile approach (deleted because of ambiguity)
agiler Coach	agile coach
agiler Wert	agile Value
agiles Arbeiten	agile work
agiles Betriebsmodell	agile operating model
agiles Coaching	agile coaching
agiles Management	agile management

Agiles Manifest	agile manifesto
agiles Mindset	agile mindset
agiles Programmieren	agile programming
agiles Projekt	agile project
Agiles Projektmanagement	agile project management
agiles Team	agile team
agiles Training	agile training (deleted because of confusion with military terms)
agiles Zertifikat	agile certificate
Backlog	backlog
Co-Design	co-design
Daily Scrum	daily scrum
Definition of Done	definition of done
Definition of Ready	definition of ready
Design Thinking	design thinking
Empathy Map	empathy map
Entwicklungsteam	development team
Extremnutzer Nutzer	extreme user
fail fast	fail fast
fail forward	fail forward
hierarchiefrei	free of hierarchy
hierarchiefreier Raum	hierarchy free space
Innovationskultur	innovation culture
Innovationsmanagement	innovation management
Iteration	iteration
iterativ	iterative
Kanban	Kanban
Kanban Board	kanban board
Kollaborationsräume	collaboration spaces
kollaboratives Design	collaborative design
kurzzyklische Ergebnisse	short-cycle results
Lean Start up	lean start up
Lean Start-up	lean start-up
Lean Startup	lean startup
Minimum Viable Product	minimum viable product
MVP	MVP
neue Arbeitsmodelle	new working models
neue Arbeitsweisen	new working methods
neue Team- und Führungsstrukturen	new team and management structures
New Work	new work
Nutzeranforderungen	user requirements

Nutzerbedürfnisse	user needs
Nutzerforschung	user research
nutzerorientiert	user-oriented
nutzerorientierte Lösungen	user-friendly solutions
Nutzerstory	user story
Nutzertest	user testing
nutzerzentriert	user-centred
nutzerzentriertes Design	user-centred design
Planning Poker	planning poker
Product Backlog	product backlog
Product Owner	product owner
Project Canvas	project canvas
Projektarbeiten	project work
schlanke Softwareentwicklung	lean software development
Scrum	scrum
Scrum Coach	scrum coach
Scrum Master	scrum master
Scrum Team	scrum team
Service Design	service design
Softwareentwicklung	software development
Sprint	sprint
Sprint Backlog	sprint backlog
Sprint Planning	sprint planning
Sprint Retrospective	sprint retrospective
Sprint Review	sprint review
Timebox	time box
Timeboxing	timeboxing
visuelles Denken	visual thinking
Whiteboard	whiteboard
Wicked Problem	wicked problem
Wireframe	wireframe

Appendix B

Figure 12: Agile* websites published by German ministries over time

Figure 13: Agile* websites published by British ministries over time

Figure 14: Breadth and depth of agile* websites published by British and German ministries (with ministry names)