

Dear Editor,

Herein is my response to manuscript ID XXXXX, entitled [“Why Hermione was better than Harry in almost every respect”] [by Ronald Frump and colleagues] to the [Journal of Squirrel-Puppy Relationships].

The authors present [insert general overview of research and key findings]. This research is [well-suited/not-suitable] for the remit of the journal.

[Insert any comments regarding potential conflicts of interest, or about areas of relevant expertise that you feel you are lacking].

I recommend XXXX, pending x, y, and z.

Basic reporting

Figures

- Are the figures legible, relevant, and integrated into the text

Data

- Are the supporting data included in the manuscript or in a relevant repository
- Are the data presented in a way that is consistent with the FAIR principles (<https://www.force11.org/group/fairgroup/fairprinciples>)

Experimental design

- Was the way in which the research was conducted the best way to answer the relevant questions

Validity of the findings

- Are the conclusions supported by the results
- Do the results contribute to the research field, irrespective of whether they are ‘negative’ or a replication study

General comments

- Is the language used appropriate for a scientific publication
- Is the structure appropriate

Abstract

- Is the abstract concise, and does it convey the main research findings
- Are any key points of context or conclusions missing

Introduction

- Does this cover the published literature sufficiently
- Does it provide enough context in which to place the current research
- Are any key citations missing
- Is the history of the research conveyed at all for historical significance
- Does it finish with a paragraph summarising the relevance of the current research

Materials and methods

- Are the methods clear and easy to follow
- Can the methods be replicated if needed
- Are the source materials/data openly available, and is appropriate justification provided if not
- Were any statistical analyses applied performed appropriately

Results

- Are the results presented in a coherent fashion
- Are the results reported in a way that is supported by the data

Discussion

- Are the new results placed into context of the relevant literature
- Is a balanced argument provided
- Are the full implications of the new results discussed in sufficient detail

Conclusions

- Are the conclusions supported by the results
- Are they concise and written in an impactful way (not over-embellished)

Additional comments

- Anything else you want to add that doesn't fit above

Congratulations to the authors on a great piece of work, and I look forward to seeing their research published/rejected/re-written with all of the references to my own tangentially-relevant work included.

Sincerely,

Ralph Lauren

References

- Any additional papers you have cited within your report