

## CONFERENCE ON GAME INNOVATIONS REVIEW FORM

---

TITLE OF THE PAPER: Procedural fractal plants generation

AUTHOR(S): Filip Rynkiewicz, Piotr Napieralski

---

### TYPE OF PAPER

a) research paper (with original results)

b) ~~case study~~ \_\_\_\_\_

c) ~~position paper~~ \_\_\_\_\_

d) ~~other (please specify)~~ .....

---

### GENERAL EVALUATION

a) relevance to the Journal scope

EXCELLENT, ~~GOOD~~, ~~FAIR~~, ~~QUESTIONABLE~~, ~~OUT OF SCOPE~~

b) originality

~~EXCEPTIONAL~~, MAJOR, ~~GOOD~~, ~~QUESTIONABLE~~, ~~PREVIOUSLY PUBLISHED~~

c) significance; usefulness

~~EXCEPTIONAL~~, MAJOR, ~~GOOD~~, ~~MINOR~~, ~~NONE~~

d) reference to the related literature

THOROUGH, CORRECT, ~~AMENDABLE~~, ~~POOR~~, ~~UNSUITABLE~~

e) presentation and paper organization

CLEAR & CONSISTENT, ~~READABLE~~, ~~AMENDABLE~~, ~~ENIGMATIC~~, ~~UNREADABLE~~

---

## TECHNICAL SOUNDNESS

- a) ~~Technically correct~~ (after careful check)  
b) ~~Apparently correct~~ (after superficial check)  
c) ~~Minor errors~~ (please indicate them)

÷

- d) ~~Major errors~~ (please indicate them)

---

---

- e) ~~Unsupported claims~~ (please provide a detailed explanation):

---

---

---

## LINGUISTIC QUALITY

- a) ~~very good~~   b) acceptable (minor errors as indicated)   c) ~~needs thorough correction~~

**Comments:**

---

---

## FINAL RECOMMENDATION

- a) **ACCEPT** (editorial changes necessary as pointed)
- b) ~~**ACCEPT WITH MAJOR CHANGES**~~ (needs substantial changes and re-review)
- c) ~~**REJECT**~~ (unsuitable to publish in CGI Proceedings)
- d) ~~**OUT OF SCOPE**~~ (should be re-directed to another journal)

**For choice "ACCEPT" please indicate typos and/or suggested changes**

The paper is nice to read and interesting.

Proposed amendments:

- 1) In abstract "This article was formed to analyze efficiency of this algorithm in modeling 3D tree triangle meshes for games." maybe replace formed by created or "The analysis of the efficiency of this algorithm in modeling 3D tree triangle meshes for games is presented in the paper.
- 2) For example tree created with 468 branches having 87200 vertices and it is ~~made~~ done in few seconds.
- 3) "In conclusion, time-consuming modelling in 3D programs can be replaced by solution described in this article." Do not use the word in conclusion in the abstract

Introduction

- 4) ~~Using~~ 3D modelling programs to create a complex 3D mesh of tree ~~is~~ are very time consuming, because every branch has to be shaped separately.
- 5) A general rule requires that the references must be called within the text in the same order as they appear in the References list.
- 6) Sentence "Most of the algorithms to create 3D tree mesh are generating static models, to change or move branch user must change parameters inside L-System, and the recalculate the whole model." divided into 2 sentences
- 7) Sentence "All formulas and terms are represented as strings, and L-system is ~~all about changing one string to another based on rules.~~" Is not clear

**Procedural Systems**

- 8) Sentence "Using [ and ] the branches can be created." is ugly
- 9) Thanks to parameters L-system can change the values of variables, ~~in~~ for example the steering angle of branch.
- 10) Every letter or string must have brackets immediately behind it and within them there can be multiple parameters, separated ~~with~~ by a comma.

- 11) In the bibliography description of the sources is incomplete

12) In this manuscript, references from [15] are missing

**For choice “ACCEPT WITH MAJOR CHANGES” please indicate what need to be revised:**

---

---

---

---

---

**For choice “REJECT” please indicate the reason(s):**

- 1) reject because it is not relevant to *CGI Proceedings*
- 2) reject because of the presentation
- 3) reject because the content is too premature
- 4) reject because of lack of originality (results already known; similar overview already published, etc.)
- 5) reject because of major errors (please indicate them)

---

---

**For choice d) please propose journal(s) for which the paper would be more suitable**

---

---

---

---

---

---

### BLIND COMMENTS - VISIBLE FOR THE AUTHOR(S)

---

---

---

---

---