### ימלוך ה' לעולם אל-היך ציון לדור ודור הללו-יה

In last week's newsletter we identified a מדרש which relates that the מלאכים recite not only the וקרא זה אל זה ואמר קדוש קדוש קדוש ה' צבאות מלא כל הארץ כבודו :פסוקים אל וקרא זה אל זה ואמר קדוש קדוש קדוש קדוש ה' צבאות מלא כל הארץ כבוד ה' ממקומו and ימלוך ה' לעולם אל-היך ציון לדור ודור :פסוק but also the places the היך ציון לדור ודור :פסוק מדרש thereby places the סוקים of הללו-יה in the same caegory as the other two קדושה of הללו-יה ימלוך ה' לעולם מרנים predates the practice of reciting ימלוך ה' לעולם Although references to the ימרת רבתי מרח במרם נאון אום. Although references to the מדר עמרם נאון אום מרושה, it is not quoted in the נאון מרח בתוח מדר רב עמרם נאון אום מודר אום מודר מודר שובות הגאונים.

Assuming arguendo that the ימלוך: פסיקתא רבתי is not the source for including the ימלוך: פסוק מלוך: שלוך אל-היך איון לדור ודור הללו-יה within קדושה, then why was the ממום added to ? The following represents the common explanation:

ספר אבודרהם שמונה עשרה ד"ה ואומר שליח-ובדברי קדשך כתוב לאמר ימלוך ה' לעולם אל-היך ציון לדור ודור הללוי-ה. ישראל נקראו ציון כדאיתא בפסיקתא (פסידר"כ סוף אנכי) אמר רבי חנניא בר פפא חזרנו על כל המקרא ולא מצאנו מקום שנקראו ישראל ציון אלא זה (ישעיה נא, מז) ולאמר לציון עמי אתה. או יש לומר ציון ממש ומן הדין הי' לומר ה' ימלוך לעולם ועד שהוא של תורה (שמות מו, יח) אלא בשביל הזכרת ציון אנו אומרים זה שאמר דוד על שם (תה' קלז, ו) אם לא אעלה את ירושלם על ראש שמחתי. ובכל התפלות אנו מזכירין או ציון או ירושלם.

The ספר האשכול provides a deeper explanation:

ספר האשכול (אלבק) הלכות קריאת שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א'– ומזכירין קדושה ביוצר אור, כי המלאכים כמו כן מקלסין ומקדשין כמו ישראל, כדכתיב (איוב לח',ז'): ברן יחד כוכבי בקר, אלו ישראל; והדר ויריעו כל בני אל–הים אלו המלאכים. וישראל ממליכין שמו של הקדוש ברוך הוא בקריאת שמע אמת ויציב ומקבלים על עצמם מלכות שמים, וכן בתפלה לאחר שאומרים אלו ב' פסוקים קדוש וברוך מוסיפין ישראל פסוק ואומרים ימלוך ה' לעולם אל–היך ציון לדור ודור:

The ימלוך ה' לעולם אל–היך ציון לדור: פסוק added the משכול: פסוק אין לדור אין מלוך ה' לעולם אל–היך ציון לדור פסוק וחוד in order to change the message of קדושה from our imitating שירת המלאכים to שירת המלאכים A similar message is found in the מדרש that we studied last week.

Some מפרשים view the בסוק לדור ודור פחוק אל–היך עיון לעולם אל as representing the day when the whole world fulfills קבלת עול מלכות שמים:

רמב"ן שמות פרק מו' פסוק יח'– ה' ימלוך לעולם ועד – יאמר, כי הראה עתה כי הוא מלך ושלמון על הכל, שהושיע את עבדיו ואבד את מורדיו, כן יהי הרצון מלפניו לעשות בכל הדורות לעולם, לא יגרע מצדיק עיניו, ולא יעלימהו מן הרשעים המריעים. ובאו כזה פסוקים רבים, כגון ימלוך ה' לעולם אל–היך ציון לדור ודור הללוי–ה (תהלים קמו י), יהי שם ה' מברך מעתה ועד עולם (שם קיג ב), והיה ה' למלך על כל הארץ (זכריה יד מ).

A similar theme is found in the ברכה of המלך הקדוש in every ממונה עשרה for שמונה מחלד and יום ביפור including נעילה. It is no accident that we find the ימלוך ה' :פסוק ברכה within that ברכה ברכה:

ותמלוך אתה ה' לבדך, על כל מעשיך, בהר ציון משכן כבודך, ובירושלים עיר קדשך, ככתוב בדברי קדשך: ימלוך ה' לעולם אל-היך ציון לדור ודור הללוי-ה. קרוש אתה ונורא שמך, ואין אלו-ה מבלעדיך, ככתוב: ויגבה ה' צבאות במשפט, והא-ל הקרוש נקדש בצדקה. ברוך אתה ה' המלך הקרוש.

Notice the similarity between the words in the ברכה of מלך הקרוש and the version of that we found in ברר רב עמרם גאון:

סדר רב עמרם גאון סדר תפילה-מטקומך מלכנו תופיע ותושיענו ותמלוך עלינו כי מחכים אנחנו לך מתי תמלוך בציון בקרוב ביטינו ובחיינו תשכן. תתגדל ותתקדש בתוך ירושלם עירך לדור ודור ולנצח נצחים. ועינינו תראנה במלכותך כדבר האמור בשירי עוך מפי דוד משיח צדקך, ימלוך ה' לעולם אל-היך ציון לדור ודור הללוי-ה (תהלים קמ"ו י').

Notice also that the words that follow the פסוף: דור ודור ציון לדור ודור אל-היך ציון לדור ודור פסוף מלוך ה' לעולם אל-היך ציון לדור ודור פסוף מנהג ארץ are the words that comprise the הארל הקדוש according to מנהג ארץ according to ברכה מנהג ארץ מברל הקדוש of ברכה הארל הקדוש of שראל הקדוש are the המלך הקדוש of מברכה that is recited on ישראל. יום כיפור and ראש השנה מום ברכה that is recited on יום כיפור איש השנה.

Professor Fleischer in his article on קדושה notes that in the version of קדושה לום קדושה מוסף לום מוב מוסף לשבת which is recited in מוסף לום מוב and מוסף לום מום מוסף, אני ה' אלה—יכם; להיות לכם לאלו—הים are truncated; i.e. שמי ימלוך ה' אלה—יכם; להיות לכם לאלו—ה' לעולם מפסוק שמוק was also truncated. His basis is the fact that the of of ימלוך ה' לעולם אל—היך ציון לדור ודור הללוי—ה followed by ימלוך ה' לעולם אל—היך ציון, בדרך ימלוך ה' לעולם אל—היך ציון, בדרך במרם גאון or according to the ימלוך ה' לעולם אל—היך ציון, בדר רב עמרם גאון אום מליכו לא—ל כי הוא לבדו מרום וקדוש.

### בעד רפואה שלימה לאבי, אליהו בן בילע

#### **SUPPLEMENT**

Excerpts from the paper entitled GATHERING IN THE SYNAGOGUES ON FESTIVALS, SABBATHS AND WEEKDAYS presented by Professor Shmuel Safrai of Hebrew University, Jerusalem at a synposium on Ancient Synagogues in Israel at the University of Haifa in May 1987<sup>1</sup>

Editor's note: This paper is an excellent example of the method used by scholars to cull information from the gemara. You will notice that much of what Professor Safrai concludes is based on what the gemara fails to tell us. What do you think about that method of analysis?

The first and primary element in divine worship in the synagogue in ancient times was not prayer, but the reading of the Torah. This fact is revealed clearly in the various sources both from the time of the Second Temple and afterwards. It can be demonstrated from both early and late Talmudic sources, from the evidence in the New Testament – in the Gospels and the Acts of the Apostles – from the writing of Philo and Josephus, and from epigraphic evidence.

In Tosefta Megilla, Ch.3, Halakha 18 (and in parallel passages in both Talmuds) we read: One does not act lightly in synagogues; one does not enter them in the heat because of the heat, in cold because of the cold, or in the rain because of the rain. One does not eat in them, nor drink in them, nor sleep in them, nor walk around in them nor relax in them, but one does read and study and preach in them. A eulogy for the public may be made in them; Rabbi Yehudah said: To what does this refer? To synagogues that are functioning, but if they are in ruins, then they are left and allowed to grow weeds out of distress.

This Tannaitic *halakha*, recounting the things not to be done in the synagogue and those to be done, mentions reading and learning, but does not mention prayer at all. Rabbi Yehuda was familiar with this *halakha* since he added to it that one may make a eulogy for the public in a functioning synagogue, but may not use a ruined synagogue at all because of distress. Also in Rabbi Yehudah's famous description of the great synagogue in Alexandria in Tosefta Sukka 4:6 (and in parallel Talmudic passages), Torah reading and the benediction over the reading of the Torah are mentioned, but not prayer:

And a wooded platform in the middle, and the *hazzan* of the synagogue stands upon it with a cloth a *hanner*? In his hands, *someone* takes *the Torah scroll* to read it, and he, *the hazzan*, raises the cloth and they, *the congregation*, respond amen to every benediction and he raises the cloth and they answer amen.

The proceedings of the synposium have been published as BAR International Series 499, 1989

The benediction is over the reading of the Torah, but prayer is not mentioned. The *halakhot* of the synagogue appear in the Mishna in the tractate Megilla in the context of the laws of reading the Scroll of Esther and of the reading of the Torah, not in the Mishna Berakhot in which the first chapters set forth the laws of the recitation of *Shema* and of prayer. Perusing the tractate Berakhot chapters I-V and the parallel passages in the Tosefta, one finds the individual praying while covering himself with water (3:5), carrying the dead (3:1), riding a donkey (4:5), atop a tree or a scaffold (2:4), standing in a road or market (4:1 and Tosefta 3:20), but not in a synagogue. Only on Sabbath and Festival days, on which the *Musaf* (additional) service is recited, is there any hint of a synagogue.

Editor's Note: In the following section, Professor Safrai argues that the Brachot that are recited after the Haftorah and the Brachot recited by the Koehn Gadol on Yom Kippur represent an early form of a complete prayer.

A number of scholars have pointed out that the benedictions recited after the *haftara* are not only benedictions to be said after a reading from the Prophets because, in contradistinction to the blessing said after the reading of the Torah, which is brief and pertains only to the Torah, giving thanks to the Torah of truth, the blessing after the *haftara* include in their various recensions prayers touching on a wide range of issues: consolation, the kingdom of David, the Torah and the Temple service, and the sanctification of the Sabbath, and they recited in a most festive manner. Some scholars have hypothesized that in ancient times these blessings constituted the nucleus of the prayer to be recited on a given day. In other words; originally, the congregation would gather for the reading of a passage in the Torah and the Prophets; after the reading, the leader or the person who was honored with the reading from the prophets would add a number of benedictions, and these were the entire prayer service. The language and content of the blessings as they have come down to us are similar to the blessings recited by the High Priest on Yom Kippur after the reading of the Torah (Mishna Yoma 7:1): "And he recites eight benedictions over them-on the Torah and on the Temple service and on Thanksgiving and on atonement of sin and on the Temple . . . and on Israel and on Jerusalem . . . and on the priests." According to the Mishna the same benedictions are to be recited by the king after reading "the king's portion:" "On Sukkot when the High Priest blesses them, but he substitutes 'pilgrimage festivals' for 'atonement'." Here too no prayer is mentioned as preceding, and only after the reading of the Torah did they recite the eight blessings which constituted the prayer.

In both instances that we have cited, the reading by the High Priest on Yom Kippur and the reading in the ceremony of convocation (haquel), there is no mention of a reading from the Prophets. Both the High Priest and the king do not read anything but the Torah, yet they recited benedictions like those of the Haftorah. These blessings are not intrinsically linked to the reading from the Prophets but to the reading of the Torah, since in earliest

# להבין את התפלה

times there was no reading other than from the Torah and only later on , in the time of the second Temple was the Prophetic passage appended. Thus it is reasonable to presume that this chain of blessings related to the particular day of festivity was created in ancient times, when only the Torah was read . . .

Editor's Note: In the next section, Professor Safrai presents his opinion as to how the purpose of the synagogue changed after the destruction of the Second Beit Hamikdash. He further suggests a novel theory as to the development of Shemona Esrei. Please note the comment he makes about the third Bracha of Shemona Esrei, the subject of this week's newsletter.

The synagogue operated for hundreds of years during the Second Temple period, a fact which we can learn from internal Jewish tradition, from both Jewish and Gentile writers, and from epigraphic and archaeological sources; but the destruction of the Temple brought about a further development in the synagogue service. A few cogent facts from the generation of Yavne will suffice to bear out these points:

- With the destruction of the Temple, Rabban Yohanan b. Zakkai established the priestly benediction as the conclusion of the synagogue service: "The Rabbis taught: the priests may not ascend the dukhan (pulpit) with their shoes and that is one of nine decrees which Rabban Yohanan b. Zakkai decreed. Even before the destruction of the Temple, the priestly benediction had been carried out in the synagogue, but the ruling that the priests must ascend barefoot added an element of the Temple atmosphere to its execution in the synagogue because in the Temple the entire service was conducted by barefoot priests. Likewise, as the priestly benediction concluded offering of the daily sacrifice in the Temple, so it concluded the synagogue service, coming at the end of the Amida. The last prayer of the amida is known in the Amoraic literature as "Grant Peace" (Sim Shalom) but it is always referred to in Talmudic literature as the "priestly benediction (Birkat Kohanim). The text of this final benediction does not stand by itself, but forms a response to the priestly benediction by the congegation or the leader. It is reasonable to assume that this decree which gave teh priestly benediction in the synagogue a standing similar to that which it had in the Temple as part of the daily sacrifice, was made on the presumption that public prayer is conducted every morning.
- (2) In the Mishna (Berakhot 4:3), Rabban Gamliel ruled that "every day a person should pray eighteen benedictions." His colleagues disagree with him, some saying that one should recite an equivalent of eighteen blessings, others specifying that "if he is able to say the prayer fluently", and still others raising objections to the arrangement, claiming that pre-ordained prayer is not heartfelt supplication. The discussion of the "eighteen benedictions" presupposes public prayer that includes the priestly benediction, and

even an individual praying privately says the "priestly benediction" in conformity with public prayer. The recollection of prayer on weekdays in the time of the Temple, as mentioned in the literature, is very distant from the format of the eighteen blessings. The Mishna (Tamid, beginning of chapter 5) describes the gathering of the priests for prayer in the Chamber of Hewn Stone after preparing the daily sacrifice to be offered. Their service includes the reading of the Shema, the Ten Commandments and a short prayer concluding with the priestly benediction. The Tractate Tamid in the Mishna reports the reality just prior to the destruction of the Temple, and it is doubtful if at that time there already was a fixed text of eighteen benedictions. The priestly benediction is likely to have been included because the priests had just gathered and were preparing themselves to offer the daily sacrifice.

(3)One baraita testifies explicitly: "Shimon ha-Paquli arranged the eighteen benedictions before Rabban Gamliel in Yavne". In recent generations numerous scholars have debated the meaning of this tradition. Already in the Babylonian Talmud it presented a problem that demanded an explanation, since adjacent to it is the tradition that "one hundred and twenty elders, and among them prophets, ordained the eighteen benedictions in their order." The Talmud explains: "They forgot them and he, Shimon, arranged them again." This equivocation is not historical, but there is no doubt that some prayers were accepted in ancient times and left their mark in different references in Second Temple literature. However, we can find no genuine indication from the time of the Temple of a chain of eighteen benedictions comprising three introductory blessings, twelve intermediate blessings or supplications (recited on weekdays only) and three concluding blessings. It is not unlikely that as a result of the tradition that the order of prayer devolved from the earliest days of the Temple, and the fact that in the period of Yavne a weekday prayer of eighteen benedictions existed, the ordination of those eighteen benedictions came to be attributed to the "Men of the Great Assembly."

On the contrary, we can say with certainty that the format of the Amidah of the Sabbath and festivals, i.e., three introductory blessings, three concluding blessings, and one intermediate blessing specifically pertaining to the sabbath or festival, already existed before the destruction of the Temple. "A holiday that falls on Shabbat-Bet Shammai says: one recites eight benedictions saying the blessing of the Sabbath by itself and the blessing of the holiday by itself, starting with the Sabbath. And Bet Hillel says: one recites seven, starting with the Sabbath and ending with the Sabbath, and with the sanctification of the holiday day in between. Bet Shammai said: Honi the Small went down before the ark and said seven and the entire people said to him: you have satisfaction." Certainly, Bet Shammai and Bet Hillel were describing an event that took place before the destruction of the Temple, and the format of these six benedictions existed in the time of the Second Temple.

## להבין את התפלה

Perhaps we would not be wrong to presume that the public prayers on Sabbath and holidays opened and closed with three blessings, all of them having a general religious significance, but on weekdays, when the individual prayed alone, they would begin with supplications, the first supplication being "You grant man knowledge" . . . just as many of the prayers of the Qumran community open with a request or note of thanks for knowledge. After the request for knowledge came the other requests which added up to twelve benedictions or perhaps less.

This fact may also explain the relative brevity of the third benediction "You are holy." In all the versions we have, this benediction is short, because it was expanded by the Qedusha, which was recited only in public and at first only on Sabbath and festivals. As early as the Geonic period the Qedusha was not recited in Eretz Yisroel except on Sabbath and holidays. What Shimon Pequli did was not to set down the final text of the eighteen benedictions but to arrange the basic format: adding the three first blessings and the three last to the weekday prayer and arranging the twelve intermediate blessings, the weekday portions for the individual and the community. And indeed, even in the generation of Yavne we find that they prayed eighteen benedictions in public on weekdays, as in the story told of Shmuel ha-Qatan, the older contemporary of Rabban Gamliel, who went before the ark "and thought about (the benediction for heretics) for two and three hours, but they did not remove him." That is to say, they did not stop him from reciting the prayer on behalf of the public, even though the halaka rules that one who errs in the benediction for heretics 'is to be removed.'

In our opinion, in the time of the Temple a seven-fold prayer was recited in public on Sabbaths and holidays, three introductory benedictions, three concluding benedictions and a special one for the Sabbath or festival. These six benedictions were recited in public and thus their content is of general religious significance. In the course of their recitation they would recite the Qedusha and conclude with the priestly benediction. On weekdays, the individual would commence the prayers with 'You grant knowledge' and conclude with "He that hears prayers." In the generation of Yavne, at the time of Rabban Yohanan ben Zakkai and Rabban Gamliel, with the destruction of the Temple and the cessation of the daily sacrifice in the Temple, i.e., the cessation of public daily worship, they began to pray in public on weekdays as well and therefore added the opening and concluding blessings to the weekday prayer, ending with the priestly benediction. The Quedusha was still only recited on Sabbaths and holidays, and consequently the text of the blessing "You are holy" remained minimal in the custom of Eretz Yisroel.

Thus we see that in the field of public prayer, as in other areas of public life, the teachers of Israel in the generation of Yavne were able to transform the catastrophe of the destruction of the Temple into a source of creativity and reconstruction in the life of the Jewish people.

Vol. 3 No. 35

#### TRANSLATION OF SOURCES

The Jewish people are called Tzion as we find in the Psikta: Rav Chanaya son of Papa said: we have reviewed all of Tanach and have not found a place where the Jewish people are called Tzion except in the verse (Yeshayahu 51, 16) V'Lomar L'Tzion Ami Ata. In the alternative, we should interpret the word Tzion in the verse Yimloch as referring to Tzion itself. In truth, the third verse in Kedushah should have been: Hashem Yimloch L'Olam V'A'Ed which is found in the Torah (Shemot 15, 18) but because of the need to mention Tzion, we say that which King David said (Tehillim 137, 6), Im Lo A'Aleh Et Yerushalayim Al Rosh Simchasi. In all our Tephilot, we mention either Tzion or Yerushalayim.

שבר האשכול (אלבק) הלכות קריאת שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א' הלבות קריאת שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א' האשכול (אלבק) הלכות קריאת שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א' האשכול (אלבק) הלכות קריאת שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א' האשכול (אלבק) הלכות קריאת שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א' באר שמע וברכותיה דף ו' שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א' באר שמע וברכותיה דף ו' עמ' א' שמע וברכותיה דף וו' עמ' א' שמע וברכותיה דף וו' עמ' א' שמע וברכותיה דף וו' עמ' א' ברכותיה דף וו' עמ' א' שמע וברכותיה דף וו' עמ' א' ברכותיה דף וו' עמ' א' ברכותיה דף וו' ברכותיה די ברכותיה דף וו' ברכותיה די ברכותיה די ברכותי

רמב"ן שמות פרק מו' פסוק יה' – ה' ימלוך לעולם ועד-Let it be said that G-d then showed that He is the King and Ruler over everything; that G-d saved his servants and destroyed those who rebelled against G-d. In the same manner let it be G-d's will to do the same in all generations forever; that the ones who are right in G-d's eyes not be diminished and that they not be hidden because of the evil ones who cause harm to them. We find many verses that share the same theme such as: Yimloch Hashem L'Olam (Tehillim 146, 10); YiHio Shem Hashem Mi'Vorach Mai'Ata V'Ad Olam (Tehillim 113, 2) V'Haya Hashem L'Melech Al Kol Ha'Aretz (Zechariya 14, 9).