

## DDC Assessment Criteria for Linking to non-dataset resources:

*KNMI Climate Explorer*

Document ownership and history		
Owner	TGICA	
Location		
Author team:	Martin Juckes, Bob Chen, Michael Lautenschlager, Stewart Cohen, Volker Krey, Seita Emori.	
Version	draft	
Date	March 16 <sup>th</sup> , 2017	
Version history		
Date	Version	Comment
March 16 <sup>th</sup> , 2017	Draft	

### 1 Introduction

This document reviews the KNMI Climate Explorer (<https://climexp.knmi.nl> )

### 2 Questionnaire

No.	Question	Response		
<b>1 Description</b>				
<b>1.1 Basic Information</b>				
1.1a	Contact point	Geert Jan van Oldenborgh, <a href="mailto:oldenborgh@knmi.nl">oldenborgh@knmi.nl</a>	Provide name and address	
1.1b	URL	<a href="https://climexp.knmi.nl">https://climexp.knmi.nl</a>		
<b>1.2 Resource</b>				
1.2a	Title	Climate Explorer	Provide a long (up to 120 characters) and short version (less than 32 characters) of the title.	

*TGICA20, draft, non-dataset linking criteria*

No.	Question	Response		
1.2b	Description	The KNMI Climate Explorer is a web application to analysis climate data statistically. It started in late 1999 as a <a href="#">single web page</a> to analyse ENSO teleconnections and has grown over the years to more than 10 TB of climate data and dozens of analysis tools. It is now part of the WMO Regional Climate Centre at KNMI, together with <a href="#">ECA&amp;D</a> .		
2 Authority				
2.1	International organisations			
2.1a	Is the resource provided by an organisation set up by international treaty?	Yes/no/not known	No	Specify the treaty.
2.1b	Is the resource provided on behalf of one or more international treaty organisations?	Yes/no/not known	Yes, WMO ( <a href="#">Convention of the World Meteorological Organization</a> )	List organisations.
2.1c	Is the resource provided by an international body with an open governance document?	Yes/no/not known		Provide a link to the governance document.
2.1d	Is the governance of the resource transparently documented?	Yes/no		Provide a link to the governance document.
2.2	National and regional resources			
2.2a	Does the resource have recognised authority in its principle area of activity?	Yes/no/not known		Provide references
3 Significance Relative to the IPCC Community				
3.1	Interest in the data			
3.1a	Is the resource referred to in an IPCC Assessment or Special Report.	Yes/no/not known	The portal is not cited, but the Climate Atlas, which is included in the portal, is a key component of the 5 <sup>th</sup> Assessment Report	List report name(s), table/figure/page number(s)
3.1b	Does the resource contain datasets which satisfy the DDC dataset linking criteria?	Yes/no/not known	Yes: CMIP3, CMIP5, Re-analyses	List datasets
3.1c	Does the resource contain datasets which fail the DDC linking criteria?	Yes/no/not known	Not known	List datasets and grounds for failure

*TGICA20, draft, non-dataset linking criteria*

No.	Question	Response		
3.1d	Does the resource contain guidance documentation relevant to the DDC?	yes/no/not known	No	Give link to guidance document
3.1f	Where there is overlap, is the guidance offered by the resource consistent with that offered by the DDC?	yes/no/not known/not applicable	not applicable	
3.1g	Are the methods implemented in tools provided by the resource consistent with DDC guidance?	yes/no/not known/not applicable	Yes	
3.1h	Does the resource have datasets which are relevant to the DDC user community?	yes/no/not known	Yes	
<b>4 Stability of resource</b>				
<b>4.1</b>	<b>Curation</b>			
4.1a	Does the host institution have a commitment to maintaining the resource	Yes/no/not known	not known	Give reference
4.1b	When was the resource established?		1999	
<b>5 Accessibility (for information only)</b>				
<b>5.1</b>	<b>Access requirements</b>			
5.1a	Are any of the services provided free of charge?	Yes/no/not known	Yes	Give examples or list?
5.1b	Are any of the services charged for?	Yes/no/not known	no	Give link to price structure
5.1c	Are there restrictions on how the services can be used?	Yes/no/not known	no	
<b>5.2</b>	<b>Additional information</b>			
5.2a	Is user registration required or requested?	Yes/no/not known	no	Give links
5.2b	Is user support available (e.g., help desk, frequently asked questions)?	Yes/no/not known	Contact email address: oldenborgh@knmi.nl	Give links

No.	Question	Response		
5.2c	Is the resource in English?	Yes/no/not known	Yes	Give links
5.2d	Is the resource multi-lingual?	Yes/no/not known	No	Give links
5.2e	Does the resource cover a specific region?	yes/no	Global	

*Table 1: Questions to gather information for the decision.*

### 3 Assessment

This assessment should be filled in by the DMWG. Where value judgements are required these should be backed with the level of justification typical of the academic peer review process. A points system is used, with negative points possible for some questions (e.g. if a portal or web site recommend methods which conflict with guidance information provided by the DDC). The minimum score (zero if not specified otherwise in the table) should be given if there is no answer or the answer is not appropriate. Maximum points indicate best practise or highest profile (e.g. an institution which is recognised as having a world leading role in the relevant domain).

No.	Question	Marks available	Criteria	Score
<b>1 Description</b>				
<b>1.1</b>	<b>Basic Information</b>			
1.1a	Contact point	2	Is contact information fit for purpose.	2
1.1b	URL	1	Does link work?	1
<b>1.2</b>	<b>Resource</b>			
1.2a	Title	3	Is the title suitably clear and concise?	3
1.2b	Description	5	Is the description clear?	5
<b>2 Authority</b>				
<b>2.1</b>	<b>International organisations</b>			
2.1a	Is the resource run by an organisation set up by international treaty?	5	5 for yes, 0 otherwise.	
2.1b	Is the resource run on behalf of one or more international treaty organisations?	5	5 for yes, 0 otherwise	5

*TGICA20, draft, non-dataset linking criteria*

No.	Question	Marks available	Criteria	Score
2.1c	Is the resource run by an international body with an open governance document?	5	5 for yes, 0 otherwise	
2.1d	Is the governance of the resource transparently documented?	3	3: if a well formed governance document is easily located. 1: if something can be found	
<b>2.2</b>	<b>National and regional resources</b>			
2.2a	Does the resource have recognised authority in its principle area of activity?	5	5: for a resources of exceptional significance; 4: for a strong national resource;	5
<b>3</b>	<b>Significance Relative to the IPCC Community</b>			
<b>3.1</b>	<b>Interest in the data</b>			
3.1a	Is the resource referred to in an IPCC Assessment or Special Report.	5		
3.1b	Does the resource contain datasets which satisfy the DDC dataset linking criteria?	3		3
3.1c	Does the resource contain datasets which fail the DDC linking criteria?	-3		
3.1d	Does the resource contain guidance documentation relevant to the DDC?	3		
3.1f	Where there is overlap, is the guidance offered by the resource consistent with that offered by the DDC?	-3 to 3		
3.1g	Are the methods implemented in tools provided by the resource consistent with DDC guidance?	-3 to 3		3
3.1h	Does the resource have datasets which are relevant to the DDC user community?	4		4

No.	Question	Marks available	Criteria	Score
<b>4 Stability of resource</b>				
<b>4.1 Curation</b>				
4.1a	Does the host institution have a commitment to maintaining the resource	5	5 if there is a clear publicly stated commitment.	
4.1b	When was the resource established?	5	5: for 20 years or more of service.	4
<b>5 Additional remarks</b>				
A5.1	Can any of the negative aspects be fixed?	yes/no		
A5.2	Are any of the negative aspects which can not be fixed so strong that the proposal should be rejected?	yes/no		no

Table 2: Assessment guide.

## 4 Decision

*The resource will be linked to if a cumulative score of 5 or greater is obtained in each of sections 1 to 4, and the response to A5.2 is “no”.*

The score in sections 1 to 3 is well over the threshold of 5, but the score in section 4 is only 4, because the site provides no commitment to curation of resources. It is explicitly described as a non-operational web service (see [climexp.knmi.nl/about.cgi](http://climexp.knmi.nl/about.cgi) )

Recommendation: TGICA should review the criteria with respect to section 4.