

## Quiz 5

**Quiz Rules:** closed-book, closed-notes; no computers, no calculators, no phones; if you are working on papers, have only a pen/pencil on your desk; if you are working with digital devices, keep them in airplane mode; work independently for at most **90 minutes**

*On my honor, I pledge that I followed the Quiz Rules and I have neither given nor received unpermitted aid on this quiz.*

signature: *Chanwood*

print name: *Chanwood Lee*

start time: *9:40*

end time: *10:40*

Suppose that we observe

$$\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{X}\mathbf{w}^* + \boldsymbol{\epsilon} \quad (1)$$

where  $\mathbf{X} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  has orthonormal columns and  $\boldsymbol{\epsilon} \sim \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{0}, \mathbf{I})$ . Consider the regularized optimization for estimating  $\mathbf{w}^*$

$$\min_{\mathbf{w}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{y} - \mathbf{X}\mathbf{w}\|_2^2 + \frac{\lambda}{p} \|\mathbf{w}\|_p^p$$

for  $p = 1$  or  $2$  and  $\lambda > 0$ .

1. Show/explain how the optimization problem above can be transformed into an equivalent optimization of the form

$$\min_{\mathbf{w}} \frac{1}{2} \|\tilde{\mathbf{y}} - \mathbf{w}\|_2^2 + \frac{\lambda}{p} \|\mathbf{w}\|_p^p$$

and explain how  $\tilde{\mathbf{y}}$  is related to  $\mathbf{y}$ .

*Handwritten solution:*

$$\begin{aligned} & \arg \min_{\mathbf{w}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{y} - \mathbf{X}\mathbf{w}\|_2^2 + \frac{\lambda}{p} \|\mathbf{w}\|_p^p \\ &= \arg \min_{\mathbf{w}} \frac{1}{2} (\|\mathbf{y}\|_2^2 - 2\mathbf{y}^T \mathbf{X}\mathbf{w} + \|\mathbf{w}\|_2^2) + \frac{\lambda}{p} \|\mathbf{w}\|_p^p \\ & \quad \begin{matrix} \nearrow \\ \mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{X} = \mathbf{I} \end{matrix} \\ &= \arg \min_{\mathbf{w}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{y} - \mathbf{w}\|_2^2 + \frac{\lambda}{p} \|\mathbf{w}\|_p^p \\ & \quad \begin{matrix} \text{Q } \mathbf{y} \text{ is constant} \\ \mathbf{X} \text{ is const} \end{matrix} \quad \therefore \tilde{\mathbf{y}} = \mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{y} \end{aligned}$$

(continued on next page)

2. Let  $\lambda = 0$ .

- (a) Give an expression for  $\hat{\mathbf{w}}$ , the solution to optimization above, and  
 (b) Consider the prediction error for a new observation of the form  $y = \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^* + \epsilon$ , for arbitrary, fixed  $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and independent noise  $\epsilon \sim \mathcal{N}(0, 1)$ . Show that the expected squared prediction error

$$\mathbb{E}[(y - \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}})^2] = \|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2 + 1.$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{(a)} \quad \min_{\mathbf{w}} \underbrace{\frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{y} - \mathbf{X}\mathbf{w}\|_2^2}_{=L(\mathbf{w})} \\ \frac{\partial L(\mathbf{w})}{\partial \mathbf{w}} = (\mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{X}) \mathbf{w} - \mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{y} = 0 \quad \frac{\partial^2 L(\mathbf{w})}{\partial \mathbf{w}^2} = \mathbf{I} \text{ "p.d."} \\ \therefore \hat{\mathbf{w}} = \mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{y} \quad (\because \mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{X} = \mathbf{I}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{(b)} \quad \mathbb{E}(\hat{\mathbf{w}}) &= \mathbf{X}^T \mathbf{X} \mathbf{w}^* = \mathbf{w}^* & \mathbf{y} &\sim \mathcal{N}(\mathbf{X} \mathbf{w}^*, \mathbf{I}) \\ \text{Var}(\hat{\mathbf{w}}) &= \mathbf{I} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E} (y - \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}})^2 &= \mathbb{E} ( \mathbf{x}^T (\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}) + \epsilon )^2 \\ &= \mathbb{E}(\epsilon^2) + \mathbb{E} ( \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^* - \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}} )^2 \\ &= 1 + \mathbb{E} ( ( \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}} - \mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}}) )^2 ) \\ &= 1 + \text{Var}(\mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}}) \\ &= 1 + \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{I} \mathbf{x} = 1 + \|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2 \end{aligned}$$

(continued on next page)

3. Let  $\lambda > 0$  and  $p = 2$ .

- (a) Give an expression for  $\hat{\mathbf{w}}$ , the solution to optimization above in this case, and  
 (b) Consider the prediction error for a new observation of the form  $y = \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^* + \epsilon$ , as above. Derive an expression for the expected squared prediction error  $\mathbb{E}[(y - \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}})^2]$ , and show that it reduces to the expression in the MLE case when  $\lambda = 0$ .

$$(a) \underset{\mathbf{w}}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{y} - \mathbf{w}\|^2 + \frac{\lambda}{2} \|\mathbf{w}\|_2^2$$

$$\frac{\partial L(\mathbf{w})}{\partial \mathbf{w}} = \mathbf{w} - \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{y} + \lambda \mathbf{w} = 0$$

$$\frac{\partial^2 L(\mathbf{w})}{\partial \mathbf{w}^2} = (1 + \lambda) \mathbf{I} \quad \text{"p.d."}$$

$$\therefore \hat{\mathbf{w}} = \frac{1}{1 + \lambda} \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{y}$$

$$(b) \quad \mathbb{E}(\hat{\mathbf{w}}) = \frac{1}{1 + \lambda} \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{x} \mathbf{w}^* = \frac{1}{1 + \lambda} \mathbf{w}^*$$

$$\operatorname{Var}(\hat{\mathbf{w}}) = \left(\frac{1}{1 + \lambda}\right)^2 \mathbf{I}$$

$$\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}}) = \frac{1}{1 + \lambda} \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^*$$

$$\operatorname{var}(\mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}}) = \left(\frac{1}{1 + \lambda}\right)^2 \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{x} = \left(\frac{1}{1 + \lambda}\right)^2 \|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2$$

$$\mathbb{E}((y - \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}})^2) = \mathbb{E}((\mathbf{x}^T (\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}) + \epsilon)^2)$$

$$= \mathbb{E}(\epsilon^2) + \mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}^T (\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}))^2$$

$$= 1 + \operatorname{MSE} \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^* (\mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}})$$

$$= 1 + \left(\frac{1}{1 + \lambda} \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^* - \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^*\right)^2 + \left(\frac{1}{1 + \lambda}\right)^2 \|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2$$

$$= 1 + \left(\frac{\lambda}{1 + \lambda}\right)^2 (\mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^*)^2 + \left(\frac{1}{1 + \lambda}\right)^2 \|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2$$

Put  $\lambda = 0$  then

$\Rightarrow 1 + \|\mathbf{x}\|_2^2$  it reduces to expression in MLE case

(continued on next page)

4. Let  $\lambda > 0$  and  $p = 1$ .

- (a) What value of  $\lambda$  would you suggest for this case and why?
- (b) Suppose that  $\mathbf{w}^*$  has only  $k < n$  nonzero elements. Consider the prediction error for a new observation of the form  $y = \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{w}^* + \epsilon$ , as above. Show that the expected squared prediction error can be bounded as follows

$$\mathbb{E}[(y - \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}})^2] \leq (2 \log n + 1)(k + 1) \|\mathbf{x}\|^2 + 1.$$

Hint: You may use the soft-thresholding result from class which states that the solution to the optimization in (2), for appropriately chosen  $\lambda$ , produces an estimator  $\hat{\mathbf{w}}$  satisfying the bound

$$\mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}\|_2^2] \leq (2 \log n + 1) \left( 1 + \sum_{i=1}^n \min(|w_i^*|^2, 1) \right).$$

$$\frac{1}{2} \|\tilde{\mathbf{y}} - \mathbf{w}\|_2^2 + \lambda \|\mathbf{w}\|_1 \Rightarrow \hat{w}_i = \text{sign}(\tilde{y}_i) \max(|\tilde{y}_i| - \lambda, 0)$$

(a) I suggest  $\lambda = \sqrt{2 \log n}$  because  $\max |\epsilon_i| \approx \sqrt{2 \log n}$

then we have  $p(|y_i| > \lambda | w_i = 0) \approx 0$

(with the above fact)  $p(|\tilde{y}_i| > \lambda | w_i \neq 0) \approx 1$   
 $\Rightarrow$  we can bound  $\text{MSE}(\hat{\mathbf{w}})$  well

$$(b) \mathbb{E}[(y - \mathbf{x}^T \hat{\mathbf{w}})^2]$$

$$\begin{aligned} &= \mathbb{E}[(\mathbf{x}^T (\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}) + \epsilon)^2] = \mathbb{E}[(\mathbf{x}^T (\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}))^2] + \mathbb{E}(\epsilon^2) \\ &= \underbrace{\mathbb{E}[(\mathbf{x}^T (\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}))^2]}_{(*)} + 1 \end{aligned}$$

$$(*) \mathbb{E}[(\mathbf{x}^T (\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}))^2] \stackrel{\text{C-S Inequality}}{\leq} \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{x}\|^2 \|\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}\|^2] = \|\mathbf{x}\|^2 \mathbb{E}\|\mathbf{w}^* - \hat{\mathbf{w}}\|^2$$

$$\leq \|\mathbf{x}\|^2 (2 \log n + 1) \left( 1 + \sum_{i=1}^n \min(|w_i^*|^2, 1) \right) \quad (\text{end of the quiz})$$

$$\leq k \quad (\because \text{at most } k \text{ non zero elts})$$

$$(*) \leq \|x\|^2 (2\log n + 1)(1+K)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \therefore E((y - x^* \cdot \omega)^2) &= E[\bar{x}^T (\omega^* - \omega)]^2 + 1 \\ &\leq \|x\|^2 (2\log n + 1)(1+K) + 1 \end{aligned}$$