Review of "A Finite-Horizon Approach to Active Level Set Estimation"

Jiaxin Hu

June 25, 2021

This paper purposes an finite horizon search (FHS) method to estimate the boundary for the one-dimensional step function, and apply the method to sub-Gaussian noisy measurements. Also, this paper apply the purposed noisy FHS to the Gaussian Process level set estimation (GP-LSE) by breaking down the high-dimensional problem into numbers of one-dimensional noisy FHS tasks. The main contribution includes purposing a penalized optimization with optimal search strategies in a closed form and the application of the optimal one-dimensional search to noisy and high-dimensional problems.

Points:

1. Do the experiments on GP-LSE take the cost as a function of sampling time in equation (12)? Note that noisy FHS takes a repeating procedure to deal with the noise while the equation (12) counts only the sampling time for N single sample points. I believe, the cost function (12) should reflect the repeating number R, for example, replacing N by RN, since T_s represents the time per sample. On the other hand, it would be helpful to explain more if it is not proper to include R in the cost of time.

2. Grid search over the number of transects and stopping error is used in the experiments on GP-LSE. Note that the time and computation resource required by gird search are usually not negligible. It would be helpful to report and compare the cost to the grid search with other parameter selecting methods in other approaches.

3. The main theorem 1 assumes the prior of change point is a uniform distribution. Is there any intuition for this uniform prior assumption? If we assume other common priors, e.g. Gaussian prior, can we derive the close form of the optimizer, and how sensitive is the performance of the optimizer to the prior?

4. In noisy FHS, the number of repeating R relies on the probability of error δ. What is the choice of δ in simulation and real data analysis?

In general, I think idea in this paper is interesting. Given the above points, I would be hesitant to decide that this paper is suitable for the venue.

References