# Three-year fitness of *Panicum virgatum* infected with switchgrass mosaic virus

Michael P. Ryskamp and Charles J. Geyer

January 16, 2023

#### 1 Abstract

We use R package aster to estimate multi-year fitness with sub-sampled data, and we demonstrate how to estimate shape parameters for negative binomial distributions.

# 2 Copyright Waiver

To the extent possible under law, the authors have dedicated all copyright and related and neighboring rights to this text and software to the public domain worldwide in accordance with the CC0 Public Domain Dedication http://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/zero/1.0/.

## 3 R

- The version of R used to make this document is 4.2.1.
- The version of R package rmarkdown used to make this document is 2.19.
- The version of R package knitr used to make this document is 1.41.
- The version of R package aster used to make this document is 1.1.2.
- The version of R package trust used to make this document is 0.1.8.
- $\bullet\,$  The version of R package numDeriv used to make this document is 2016.8.1.1.
- The version of R package freshr used to make this document is 1.0.2.

Ensure a clean R global environment.

```
freshr::freshr()
```

Load R packages aster and numDeriv

```
library("aster")
library("numDeriv")
```

Set global option.

```
# don't need this with R-4.0.0, it's the default there and forevermore
# but it doesn't hurt and defends against users who haven't upgraded R
options(stringsAsFactors = FALSE)
```

## 4 Data

```
redata <- read.csv("redata_fin.csv")</pre>
# "symp.extent" is the proportion of diseased tillers. Taken initially,
# in early summer 2017, and, for 2017 and 2018,
# taken at the end of season around the time
# we collected fitness metrics (panicle counts, lengths)
sapply(redata, class)
##
      PlantID
                                                                        id
                      Year symp.extent
                                              varb
                                                          resp
  "character"
                             "numeric" "character"
##
                 "integer"
                                                     "integer"
                                                                 "integer"
##
          root
##
     "integer"
unique(redata$varb)
   [1] "late17.tillers"
                                    "late17.panicles"
##
   [3] "late17.pans.sampled"
                                    "late17.floret.count.total"
   [5] "late18.tillers"
##
                                    "late18.panicles"
   [7] "late18.pans.sampled"
                                    "late18.floret.count.total"
##
  [9] "late19.tillers"
                                    "late19.panicles"
                                    "late19.floret.count.total"
## [11] "late19.pans.sampled"
str(redata)
  'data.frame':
                   120 obs. of 7 variables:
                        "A" "B" "C" "D" ...
##
   $ PlantID
                 : chr
                       ##
   $ Year
                 : int
                        0.42 0.42 0.39 0.68 0.19 0.05 0.14 0.04 0.22 0.22 ...
  $ symp.extent: num
                        "late17.tillers" "late17.tillers" "late17.tillers" "late17.tillers" ...
   $ varb
                 : chr
##
   $ resp
                 : int
                       56 45 77 79 148 114 172 157 90 219 ...
##
                       1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 ...
   $ id
                 : int
                       1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 ...
   $ root
                 : int
redata$PlantID <- as.factor(redata$PlantID)</pre>
redata$Year <- as.factor(redata$Year)</pre>
```

# 5 Graph

We use the following aster graph for one individual.

$$y_{1} \xrightarrow{\text{Ber}} y_{2} \xrightarrow{\text{Samp}} y_{3} \xrightarrow{\text{Poi}} y_{4}$$

$$1 \xrightarrow{\text{Poi}} y_{5} \xrightarrow{\text{Ber}} y_{6} \xrightarrow{\text{Samp}} y_{7} \xrightarrow{\text{Poi}} y_{8}$$

$$y_{9} \xrightarrow{\text{Ber}} y_{10} \xrightarrow{\text{Samp}} y_{11} \xrightarrow{\text{Poi}} y_{12}$$

In this graph the "rows" are years (2017, 2018, and 2019) and the "columns" are data within years: first tillers  $(y_1, y_5, \text{ and } y_9)$ , then panicles  $(y_2, y_6, \text{ and } y_{10})$ , then sub-sampled panicles  $(y_3, y_7, \text{ and } y_{11})$ , and finally (the terminal nodes) floret count  $(y_4, y_8, \text{ and } y_{12})$ .

After initial analysis we may change some Poisson to negative binomial (a kind of over-dispersed Poisson), but first we see whether that seems necessary.

It is somewhat problematic that tiller counts for different years are for the same plant and these should be dependent. We allow for such dependence (somewhat) by putting individual effects in the model.

```
pred \leftarrow c(0, 1, 2, 3, 0, 5, 6, 7, 0, 9, 10, 11)
fam \leftarrow rep(c(2, 1, 1, 2), times = 3)
fam
    [1] 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 2
vars <- unique(redata$varb)</pre>
vars
##
    [1] "late17.tillers"
                                       "late17.panicles"
                                       "late17.floret.count.total"
##
    [3] "late17.pans.sampled"
    [5] "late18.tillers"
                                       "late18.panicles"
    [7] "late18.pans.sampled"
                                       "late18.floret.count.total"
##
   [9] "late19.tillers"
                                       "late19.panicles"
##
## [11] "late19.pans.sampled"
                                       "late19.floret.count.total"
pred.names <- c("initial", vars)[pred + 1]</pre>
foo <- cbind(pred.names, vars, fam)</pre>
colnames(foo) <- c("predecessor", "successor", "family")</pre>
foo
         predecessor
##
                                                                family
                                 successor
##
    [1,] "initial"
                                  "late17.tillers"
                                                                "2"
    [2,] "late17.tillers"
                                                                "1"
                                  "late17.panicles"
                                                                "1"
                                  "late17.pans.sampled"
    [3,] "late17.panicles"
##
                                                                "2"
##
   [4,] "late17.pans.sampled"
                                 "late17.floret.count.total"
                                                                "2"
##
   [5,] "initial"
                                  "late18.tillers"
   [6,] "late18.tillers"
                                  "late18.panicles"
                                                                "1"
##
                                                                "1"
##
    [7,] "late18.panicles"
                                  "late18.pans.sampled"
                                                                "2"
   [8,] "late18.pans.sampled"
                                 "late18.floret.count.total"
                                                                "2"
   [9,] "initial"
                                  "late19.tillers"
                                                                "1"
## [10,] "late19.tillers"
                                  "late19.panicles"
## [11,] "late19.panicles"
                                  "late19.pans.sampled"
                                                                "1"
## [12,] "late19.pans.sampled" "late19.floret.count.total" "2"
fit <- as.numeric(grepl("floret", as.character(redata$varb)))</pre>
redata <- data.frame(redata, fit = fit)</pre>
ind <- as.factor(redata$id)</pre>
redata <- data.frame(redata, ind = ind)</pre>
redata <- subset(redata, redata$varb %in% vars)
nnode <- length(vars)</pre>
nind <- length(unique(redata$id))</pre>
nnode * nind == nrow(redata)
```

# ## [1] TRUE

## 6 Initial Aster Models

#### 6.1 Fit models (Poisson)

To start, we'll fit three models: a null model, a model with a fixed effect term for symptom extent (symp.extent) (a plant-level measure we assessed each growing season), and a third model that includes a

term to describe variation at the individual level (ind).

```
anull <- aster(resp ~ varb,
    pred, fam, varb, id, root, data = redata)

aout.noind <- aster(resp ~ varb + fit : (symp.extent),
    pred, fam, varb, id, root, data = redata)

aout <- aster(resp ~ varb + fit : (symp.extent + ind),
    pred, fam, varb, id, root, data = redata)

anova(anull, aout.noind, aout)

## Analysis of Deviance Table
##
## Model 1: resp ~ varb
## Model 2: resp ~ varb + fit:(symp.extent)</pre>
```

```
## Model 2: resp ~ varb + fit:(symp.extent)
## Model 3: resp ~ varb + fit:(symp.extent + ind)
    Model Df Model Dev Df Deviance P(>|Chi|)
## 1
          12
               1283304
## 2
               1283318 1
          13
                            14.419 0.0001463 ***
               1283360 9
## 3
          22
                            41.634 3.833e-06 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

The hypothesis test says both symp.extent and ind are statistically significant. The ind term helps us model the dependency of the tiller counts at the individual plant level, which were different among plants at the start of the experiment. Additionally, we also know (from other experiments) that there is a lot of variation in panicle lengths and floret production at the individual plant level. Therefore, going forward, we'll use the ind model as the base model as we evaluate residuals and over-dispersion.

```
summary(aout, info.tol = 1e-9)
```

```
##
## Call:
## aster.formula(formula = resp ~ varb + fit:(symp.extent + ind),
##
      pred = pred, fam = fam, varvar = varb, idvar = id, root = root,
##
      data = redata)
##
##
                                  Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
## (Intercept)
                                 6.006e+00 5.120e-03 1172.906 < 2e-16 ***
                                -3.888e+00 7.796e-02 -49.870 < 2e-16 ***
## varblate17.panicles
## varblate17.pans.sampled
                                -4.124e+02 2.021e+00 -204.073
                                                               < 2e-16 ***
## varblate17.tillers
                                -2.292e+00 7.003e-02 -32.730 < 2e-16 ***
## varblate18.floret.count.total -3.922e-02 6.868e-03
                                                        -5.711 1.13e-08 ***
                                -4.008e+00 6.770e-02 -59.208 < 2e-16 ***
## varblate18.panicles
## varblate18.pans.sampled
                                           1.852e+00 -214.407
                                -3.970e+02
                                                               < 2e-16 ***
## varblate18.tillers
                                -1.984e+00 6.009e-02 -33.017
                                                               < 2e-16 ***
## varblate19.floret.count.total -2.994e-01 6.916e-03 -43.283
                                                               < 2e-16 ***
## varblate19.panicles
                                -4.341e+00 5.463e-02 -79.463
                                                               < 2e-16 ***
## varblate19.pans.sampled
                                -3.078e+02 1.448e+00 -212.613
                                                               < 2e-16 ***
## varblate19.tillers
                                -1.471e+00 4.661e-02 -31.561 < 2e-16 ***
## fit:symp.extent
                                -8.189e-03 4.020e-03 -2.037 0.041653 *
## fit:ind2
                                 1.562e-03 8.528e-04
                                                        1.832 0.066964 .
```

```
## fit:ind3
                                 1.750e-03 7.745e-04
                                                        2.260 0.023826 *
## fit:ind4
                                 1.578e-03 1.771e-03
                                                        0.891 0.372840
                                                        1.037 0.299554
## fit:ind5
                                 8.084e-04 7.792e-04
## fit:ind6
                                -1.225e-03 1.186e-03
                                                       -1.033 0.301691
## fit:ind7
                                 1.379e-03 8.850e-04
                                                        1.558 0.119230
## fit:ind8
                                -8.420e-04 1.125e-03
                                                      -0.748 0.454169
## fit:ind9
                                 4.081e-04 8.167e-04
                                                        0.500 0.617302
## fit:ind10
                                 2.356e-03 6.985e-04
                                                        3.373 0.000744 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

#### 6.2 Get Conditional and Unconditional Mean Value Parameters

```
pout.cond <- predict(aout, model.type = "conditional",</pre>
     is.always.parameter = TRUE, gradient = TRUE)
xi <- pout.cond$fit
class(xi)
## [1] "numeric"
length(xi) == nind * nnode
## [1] TRUE
xi <- matrix(xi, nrow = nind)
colnames(xi) <- vars</pre>
хi
##
         late17.tillers late17.panicles late17.pans.sampled
    [1,]
##
               109.6623
                               0.8130624
                                                   0.04443901
##
  [2,]
               113.1557
                                                   0.08046659
                               0.8188337
##
  [3,]
               114.5872
                               0.8210970
                                                  0.09445717
## [4,]
               108.8709
                               0.8117036
                                                  0.03588178
##
   [5,]
               117.4830
                               0.8255067
                                                  0.12149555
##
                                                  0.08805372
  [6,]
               113.9266
                               0.8200595
##
  [7,]
               123.2334
                               0.8336490
                                                   0.17066907
##
   [8,]
               115.6305
                               0.8227111
                                                   0.10438804
##
   [9,]
               114.7692
                               0.8213806
                                                   0.09620495
               125.6813
## [10,]
                               0.8368890
                                                   0.18997002
         late17.floret.count.total late18.tillers late18.panicles
##
   [1,]
                           404.3292
                                          138.8843
                                                          0.7991133
  [2,]
##
                           404.9614
                                          140.3235
                                                          0.8011737
##
  [3,]
                           405.1370
                                          142.4651
                                                          0.8041626
## [4,]
                           404.1064
                                          134.6663
                                                          0.7928213
## [5,]
                           405.4191
                                          142.2782
                                                          0.8039053
##
  [6,]
                           405.0598
                                          140.0113
                                                          0.8007304
##
   [7,]
                           405.8165
                                          151.9228
                                                          0.8163542
##
   [8,]
                           405.2480
                                          140.2137
                                                          0.8010180
##
   [9,]
                           405.1573
                                          140.2947
                                                          0.8011329
## [10,]
                           405.9472
                                          149.9400
                                                          0.8139256
##
         late18.pans.sampled late18.floret.count.total late19.tillers
  [1,]
                  0.07374258
##
                                               389.5105
                                                               180.9998
##
   [2,]
                  0.08560038
                                               389.6725
                                                               184.5408
## [3,]
                  0.10269359
                                               389.8735
                                                               187.0294
## [4,]
                  0.03714979
                                               388.7862
                                                               176.8308
## [5,]
                  0.10122746
                                               389.8574
                                                               183.7563
```

```
[6,]
##
                   0.08305444
                                                  389.6395
                                                                  181.2938
##
    [7,]
                   0.17112048
                                                  390.4634
                                                                  188.1139
    [8,]
##
                   0.08470643
                                                  389.6610
                                                                  181.7812
    [9,]
##
                   0.08536599
                                                  389.6695
                                                                  185.6416
##
   [10,]
                   0.15765326
                                                  390.3653
                                                                  191.0123
##
         late19.panicles late19.pans.sampled late19.floret.count.total
##
    [1,]
                0.7425412
                                    0.08407609
                                                                   300.3656
    [2,]
                0.7474814
                                    0.10758842
##
                                                                   300.6382
##
    [3,]
                0.7508413
                                    0.12340281
                                                                   300.7933
##
   [4,]
                0.7364712
                                    0.05475488
                                                                   299.9053
   [5,]
                0.7464032
                                    0.10248368
                                                                   300.5839
##
   [6,]
                0.7429587
                                                                   300.3913
                                    0.08607541
   [7,]
                0.7522778
                                    0.13012098
                                                                   300.8540
##
  [8,]
                                    0.08937021
                0.7436478
                                                                   300.4325
## [9,]
                0.7489787
                                    0.11465373
                                                                   300.7098
## [10,]
                0.7560367
                                    0.14757983
                                                                   301.0001
pout.unco <- predict(aout, gradient = TRUE)</pre>
mu <- pout.unco$fit</pre>
mu <- matrix(mu, nrow = nind)</pre>
colnames(mu) <- vars</pre>
mu
##
         late17.tillers late17.panicles late17.pans.sampled
##
    [1,]
                109.6623
                                 89.16228
                                                       3.962284
##
   [2,]
                113.1557
                                 92.65569
                                                       7.455688
##
   [3,]
                114.5872
                                 94.08721
                                                       8.887212
##
    [4,]
                108.8709
                                 88.37091
                                                       3.170905
##
   [5,]
                117.4830
                                 96.98300
                                                      11.783003
##
   [6.]
                113.9266
                                 93.42656
                                                       8.226556
##
    [7,]
                123.2334
                                102.73342
                                                      17.533416
##
    [8,]
                115.6305
                                 95.13048
                                                       9.930485
##
    [9,]
                114.7692
                                 94.26916
                                                       9.069160
   [10,]
                125.6813
                                105.18129
                                                      19.981292
##
         late17.floret.count.total late18.tillers late18.panicles
##
    [1,]
                            1602.067
                                            138.8843
                                                              110.9843
##
   [2,]
                            3019.266
                                            140.3235
                                                              112.4235
##
   [3,]
                            3600.538
                                            142.4651
                                                              114.5651
##
    [4,]
                            1281.383
                                            134.6663
                                                              106.7663
##
   [5,]
                            4777.054
                                            142.2782
                                                              114.3782
##
   [6,]
                            3332.247
                                            140.0113
                                                              112.1113
##
   [7,]
                            7115.350
                                            151.9228
                                                              124.0228
##
    [8,]
                            4024.309
                                            140.2137
                                                              112.3137
   [9,]
##
                            3674.436
                                            140.2947
                                                              112.3947
## [10,]
                            8111.349
                                            149.9400
                                                              122.0400
##
         late18.pans.sampled late18.floret.count.total late19.tillers
##
    [1,]
                     8.184266
                                                  3187.858
                                                                  180.9998
##
   [2,]
                     9.623494
                                                  3750.011
                                                                  184.5408
##
   [3,]
                    11.765102
                                                  4586.901
                                                                  187.0294
##
   [4,]
                     3.966348
                                                  1542.061
                                                                  176.8308
##
    [5,]
                    11.578217
                                                  4513.854
                                                                  183.7563
##
   [6,]
                     9.311345
                                                  3628.068
                                                                  181.2938
##
   [7,]
                    21.222849
                                                  8286.746
                                                                  188.1139
##
    [8,]
                     9.513691
                                                  3707.115
                                                                  181.7812
                                                                  185.6416
##
   [9,]
                     9.594683
                                                  3738.756
```

##	[10,]	19.240005		7510.630	191.0123
##		late19.panicles	late19.pans.sampled	${\tt late 19.floret}.$	count.total
##	[1,]	134.3998	11.299811		3394.075
##	[2,]	137.9408	14.840837		4461.723
##	[3,]	140.4294	17.329381		5212.561
##	[4,]	130.2308	7.130771		2138.556
##	[5,]	137.1563	14.056280		4225.092
##	[6,]	134.6938	11.593826		3482.685
##	[7,]	141.5139	18.413932		5539.904
##	[8,]	135.1812	12.081169		3629.576
##	[9,]	139.0416	15.941643		4793.808
##	[10,]	144.4123	21.312350		6415.020

## 6.3 Correct for Sub-sampling

#### 6.3.1 Point Estimates

The fundamental relationship between conditional and unconditional means is

$$\mu_j = \mu_{p(j)} \xi_j$$

So we get unconditional means by multiplying together the corresponding conditional mean and the unconditional mean for the predecessor.

To correct for sub-sampling, we want to do the same thing except we want to leave out the sub-sampling arrows. That is

 $\mu_{\text{florets}} = \mu_{\text{panicles}} \xi_{\text{florets}}$ 

So first we obtain these quantities.

```
is.florets <- grep("floret", vars)
is.panicles <- grep("panicles", vars)
is.florets</pre>
```

```
## [1] 4 8 12
```

is.panicles

```
## [1] 2 6 10
```

```
mu.panicles <- mu[ , is.panicles]
xi.florets <- xi[ , is.florets]
mu.florets <- mu.panicles * xi.florets
mu.florets</pre>
```

```
##
         late17.panicles late18.panicles late19.panicles
##
    [1,]
                 36050.92
                                  43229.54
                                                    40369.09
##
    [2,]
                 37521.98
                                  43808.35
                                                    41470.29
   [3,]
##
                 38118.21
                                  44665.89
                                                    42240.21
##
   [4,]
                 35711.25
                                  41509.28
                                                    39056.89
    [5,]
##
                 39318.76
                                  44591.20
                                                    41226.97
##
    [6,]
                 37843.34
                                  43683.01
                                                    40460.86
##
    [7,]
                 41690.92
                                  48426.38
                                                    42575.03
    [8,]
                 38551.44
                                  43764.27
##
                                                    40612.82
##
    [9,]
                 38193.84
                                  43796.78
                                                    41811.18
## [10,]
                                                    43468.14
                 42698.05
                                  47640.18
```

Then (the best surrogate of) fitness (in these data) is the sum of these for each individual.

```
mu.fit <- rowSums(mu.florets)
mu.fit

## [1] 119649.5 122800.6 125024.3 116277.4 125136.9 121987.2 132692.3 122928.5
## [9] 123801.8 133806.4
```

#### 6.4 Standard Errors

For reasons that will soon become apparent, we make an R function to do the preceding calculation.

```
foo <- function(x) {
    # x is xi and mu strung out as one vector
    xi <- x[1:length(xi)]
    mu <- x[- (1:length(xi))]
    xi <- matrix(xi, nrow = nind)
    mu <- matrix(mu, nrow = nind)
    mu.panicles <- mu[ , is.panicles]
    xi.florets <- xi[ , is.florets]
    mu.florets <- mu.panicles * xi.florets
    mu.fit <- rowSums(mu.florets)
}</pre>
```

And we check that it does indeed give the same calculation as above.

```
ximu <- c(xi, mu)
all.equal(foo(ximu), mu.fit)</pre>
```

```
## [1] TRUE
```

In order to derive standard errors using the delta method, we need Jacobian matrices (matrices of partial derivatives). Rather than do any calculus, we let R package numDeriv figure out the Jacobian matrix for this transformation. We also need the Jacobian matrix for the transformation from the "coefficients" vector to the vector ximu.

```
jac.foo <- jacobian(foo, ximu)
jac.ximu <- rbind(pout.cond$gradient, pout.unco$gradient)</pre>
```

Now the chain rule from multivariate calculus says the Jacobian for the overall transformation is the product of the Jacobians for the parts.

```
jac.total <- jac.foo %*% jac.ximu
```

Now the delta method says the variance-covariance matrix of all the fitnesses (the vector estimate  $\mathtt{mu.fit}$ ) is  $JI^{-1}J^{T}$ , where J is the overall Jacobian matrix  $\mathtt{jac.total}$  and I is Fisher information for the "coefficients" vector

```
V <- jac.total %*% solve(aout$fisher) %*% t(jac.total)</pre>
```

and the standard errors are square roots of the variances (the diagonal elements of V)

```
se <- sqrt(diag(V))
bar.pois <- cbind(mu.fit, se)
colnames(bar.pois) <- c("Estimate", "SE")</pre>
```

Table 1: Estimated Fitness with Standard Error for Different Individuals (Poisson Distributions for Tillers and Florets)

Estimate	SE
119649.5	2702.672
122800.6	2903.538
125024.3	3037.413
116277.4	2478.442
125136.9	3062.308
121987.2	2865.781
132692.3	3495.365
122928.5	2927.697
123801.8	2965.634
133806.4	3547.607

# 7 Checking for Over-dispersion

Following the theory for the negative binomial distribution, if the conditional mean value parameter is  $\xi$  and the shape parameter is  $\alpha$  and the data are y, then the conditional variance is

$$\xi \left(1 + \frac{\xi}{\alpha}\right)$$

We use this to estimate the shape parameter. Let A be a set of nodes all of which we think might be negative binomial with the same shape parameter, and let  $\hat{\xi}$  be the estimated conditional mean value parameter vector assuming the Poisson distribution. Then we equate empirical conditional variance with the formula above

$$\sum_{j \in A} (y_j - y_{p(j)}\hat{\xi}_j)^2 = \sum_{j \in A} y_{p(j)}\hat{\xi}_j \left(1 + \frac{\hat{\xi}_j}{\alpha}\right)$$
 (\*)

where p(j) is the predecessor of j. The right-hand side is a decreasing function of  $\alpha$  and has infimum

$$\sum_{j \in A} y_{p(j)} \hat{\xi}_j \tag{**}$$

So long as the left-hand side of (\*) is greater than (\*\*) there will be a unique solution for  $\alpha$ . Otherwise there is no solution, in which case the  $y_j$  values are under-dispersed rather than over-dispersed, and negative binomial is not appropriate.

#### 7.1 Tillers

#### 7.1.1 Observed and Conditional Mean Values

We assume the three arrows to the tillers nodes have the same over-dispersion. For these arrows, the predecessor is the constant 1. We have  $y_{p(j)} = 1$  in (\*) and (\*\*).

```
is.tiller <- grepl("tiller", redata$varb)
y.tiller <- redata$resp[is.tiller]
xi.tiller <- xi[is.tiller]</pre>
```

#### 7.1.2 Pearson Residuals

So-called Pearson residuals are deviations from the (estimated) mean divided by the (estimated) standard error. For Poisson (which we used for the fitted model we are diagnosing now) the standard deviation is the square root of the mean, hence

```
resid.pois.t <- (y.tiller - xi.tiller) / sqrt(xi.tiller)</pre>
stem(resid.pois.t, scale = 2)
##
##
     The decimal point is at the \mid
##
##
     -7 | 0
##
     -6 | 554
##
     -5 | 1
     -4 | 700
##
##
     -3 | 953
##
     -2 | 9430
##
     -1 |
     -0 | 44
##
##
      0 | 0
##
      1 |
##
      2 | 28
##
      3 | 588
      4 | 47
##
##
      5 I
##
      6 |
##
      7 | 124
##
      8 | 34
resid.pois.tills <- stem(resid.pois.t, scale = 2)</pre>
##
##
     The decimal point is at the |
##
##
     -7 I 0
##
     -6 | 554
##
     -5 | 1
     -4 | 700
##
     -3 | 953
##
     -2 | 9430
##
##
     -1 l
##
     -0 | 44
      0 | 0
##
##
      1 |
##
      2 | 28
##
      3 | 588
##
      4 | 47
      5 |
##
##
      6 |
##
      7 | 124
##
      8 | 34
```

We do not expect such large residuals in such a small sample. Thus we think we need negative binomial.

#### 7.1.3 Estimating Shape Parameter for Tillers

```
lhs <- sum((y.tiller - xi.tiller)^2)
rhs.min <- sum(xi.tiller)
lhs > rhs.min
```

```
## [1] TRUE
Thus we can fit negative binomial. Write a function the zero of which is our estimate of the shape parameter.
baz <- function(alpha) lhs - sum(xi.tiller * (1 + xi.tiller / alpha))</pre>
Then we find two points where this function has opposite signs and feed it to R function uniroot.
baz(1)
## [1] -573518.5
baz(10)
## [1] 34305.9
uout <- uniroot(baz, c(1, 10), tol = sqrt(.Machine$double.eps))</pre>
uout
## $root
## [1] 6.631457
## $f.root
## [1] 0
##
## $iter
## [1] 8
##
## $init.it
## [1] NA
## $estim.prec
## [1] 0.002350784
Looks like we want negative binomial with shape parameter 6.6314567 for this first arrow.
famlist <- list(fam.bernoulli(), fam.poisson(),</pre>
    fam.negative.binomial(uout$root))
# assign the nb to all tiller nodes
fam[grep("tillers", vars)] <- 3</pre>
famlist
## [[1]]
## [1] "bernoulli"
##
## [[2]]
## [1] "poisson"
##
## [[3]]
## [1] "negative.binomial(size = 6.63145669255945)"
7.1.4 Model fitting
Now do everything all over again, and check for over-dispersion for florets.
aout <- aster(resp ~ varb + fit : (symp.extent + ind),</pre>
    pred, fam, varb, id, root, data = redata, famlist = famlist)
## Warning in aster.default(x, root, pred, fam, modmat, parm, type, famlist, :
## Algorithm did not converge
```

To avoid convergence trouble, let's bump up the max iterations and then see if convergence comes more easily after we finalize the shape parameter estimates.

```
aout <- aster(resp ~ varb + fit : (symp.extent + ind),
    pred, fam, varb, id, root, data = redata, famlist = famlist, maxiter = 20000)</pre>
```

#### 7.2 Florets

Now we look at terminal arrows, using the same shape parameter for all years.

#### 7.2.1 Observed, Predecessors, and Conditional Mean Values

```
is.floret <- grep("floret.count.total", redata$varb)
is.floret.pred <- grep("pans.sampled", redata$varb)
y.floret <- redata$resp[is.floret]
y.floret.pred <- redata$resp[is.floret.pred]
xi.floret <- xi[is.floret]</pre>
```

```
7.2.2 Pearson Residuals
resid.pois.f <- (y.floret - y.floret.pred * xi.floret) / sqrt(y.floret.pred * xi.floret)
summary(resid.pois.f)
      Min. 1st Qu. Median
                               Mean 3rd Qu.
                                                Max.
## -36.646 -9.606
                    1.307
                              1.047 10.897 72.895
stem(resid.pois.f, scale = 2)
##
     The decimal point is 1 digit(s) to the right of the |
##
##
##
     -3 | 70
     -2 | 5
##
     -1 | 86550
##
     -0 | 988754
##
##
      0 | 1145799
      1 | 013347
##
      2 | 08
##
##
      3 |
##
      4 |
##
      5 I
##
      6 I
      7 | 3
resid.pois.florets <- stem(resid.pois.f, scale = 2)</pre>
##
##
     The decimal point is 1 digit(s) to the right of the |
```

```
##
## The decimal point is 1 digit(s) to the right of the |
##
## -3 | 70
## -2 | 5
## -1 | 86550
## -0 | 988754
## 0 | 1145799
## 1 | 013347
## 2 | 08
```

```
## 3 |
## 4 |
## 5 |
## 6 |
## 7 | 3
```

We do not expect such large residuals (more than 4 standard deviations from the mean) in such a small sample. Thus we think we need negative binomial.

#### 7.2.3 Estimating Shape Parameter for Florets

```
lhs.f <- sum((y.floret - y.floret.pred * xi.floret)^2)</pre>
rhs.min.f <- sum(y.floret.pred * xi.floret)</pre>
lhs.f > rhs.min.f
## [1] TRUE
Thus we can fit negative binomial. Write a function the zero of which is our estimate of the shape parameter.
baz.f <- function(alpha) lhs.f -</pre>
    sum(y.floret.pred * xi.floret * (1 + xi.floret / alpha))
Then we find two points where this function has opposite signs and feed it to R function uniroot.
baz.f(1)
## [1] -4097496
baz.f(10)
## [1] 37998248
uout.f <- uniroot(baz.f, c(1, 10), tol = sqrt(.Machine$double.eps))</pre>
uout.f
## $root
## [1] 1.096015
##
## $f.root
## [1] 0.0002074242
##
## $iter
## [1] 7
## $init.it
## [1] NA
##
## $estim.prec
## [1] 7.450581e-09
Looks like we want negative binomial with shape parameter 1.0960151 for these terminal arrows.
famlist <- c(famlist, list(fam.negative.binomial(uout.f$root)))</pre>
famlist
## [[1]]
## [1] "bernoulli"
##
## [[2]]
## [1] "poisson"
```

```
##
## [[3]]
## [1] "negative.binomial(size = 6.63145669255945)"
##
## [[4]]
## [1] "negative.binomial(size = 1.09601506363191)"
fam[grep("floret", vars)] <- 4</pre>
   [1] 3 1 1 4 3 1 1 4 3 1 1 4
```

#### 7.2.4 Model Fitting

Fit model with NB distributions for tillers and florets

```
aout <- aster(resp ~ varb + fit : (symp.extent + ind),</pre>
    pred, fam, varb, id, root, data = redata, famlist = famlist)
```

## 7.3 Redo Conditional and Unconditional Mean Value Parameters

```
pout.cond <- predict(aout, model.type = "conditional",</pre>
     is.always.parameter = TRUE, gradient = TRUE)
xi <- pout.cond$fit</pre>
pout.unco <- predict(aout, gradient = TRUE)</pre>
mu <- pout.unco$fit</pre>
ximu \leftarrow c(xi, mu)
```

#### 7.4Redo Jacobian matrices

```
jac.foo <- jacobian(foo, ximu)</pre>
jac.ximu <- rbind(pout.cond$gradient, pout.unco$gradient)</pre>
jac.total <- jac.foo %*% jac.ximu</pre>
```

#### 7.5 Estimate fitness

Re-do the delta method to estimate fitness.

```
V <- jac.total <pre>%*% solve(aout$fisher) %*% t(jac.total)
se <- sqrt(diag(V))</pre>
bar.nb1 <- cbind(foo(ximu), se)</pre>
colnames(bar.nb1) <- c("Estimate", "SE")</pre>
```

Table 2: Estimated Fitness with Standard Error for Different Individuals (Initial Negative Binomial Distributions for Tillers and Florets)

Estimate	SE
89147.71	23208.04
112386.97	28338.03
128489.18	32061.15
62850.23	17022.06
128860.78	31942.63

Estimate	SE
106362.79	26877.86
181763.34	44533.71
113017.06	28360.42
119496.72	29896.84
189029.06	45572.24

# 8 Re-estimating over-dispersion for final model

Now that we have fit the ind model with two negative binomial distributions, we

- re-estimate  $\xi$ ,
- re-estimate the negative binomial shape parameters based on this new  $\hat{\xi}$ .

And we do this repeatedly until the estimates of shape parameters converge. We'll use the initial estimates for the NB shape parameters as the starting point for the model.

```
shapes.save <- lapply(famlist, function(x) x$size)</pre>
shapes.save <- unlist(shapes.save)</pre>
for (i in 1:7) {
xi <- predict(aout, model.type = "conditional", is.always.parameter = TRUE)
# tillers
xi.tiller <- xi[is.tiller]</pre>
lhs <- sum((y.tiller - xi.tiller)^2)</pre>
rhs.min <- sum(xi.tiller)</pre>
stopifnot(lhs > rhs.min)
baz <- function(alpha) lhs - sum(xi.tiller * (1 + xi.tiller / alpha))</pre>
uout <- uniroot(baz, c(2, 20), tol = sqrt(.Machine$double.eps),</pre>
    extendInt = "yes")
famlist[[3]] <- fam.negative.binomial(uout$root)</pre>
# florets
xi.floret <- xi[is.floret]</pre>
lhs <- sum((y.floret - y.floret.pred * xi.floret)^2)</pre>
rhs.min <- sum(y.floret.pred * xi.floret)</pre>
stopifnot(lhs > rhs.min)
baz <- function(alpha) lhs -
    sum(y.floret.pred * xi.floret * (1 + xi.floret / alpha))
uout <- uniroot(baz, c(1/2, 2), tol = sqrt(.Machine$double.eps),</pre>
    extendInt = "yes")
famlist[[4]] <- fam.negative.binomial(uout$root)</pre>
aout <- aster(resp ~ varb + fit : (symp.extent + ind),</pre>
    pred, fam, varb, id, root, data = redata, famlist = famlist,
    maxiter = 20000)
shapes.tmp <- lapply(famlist, function(x) x$size)</pre>
```

```
shapes.save <- rbind(shapes.save, unlist(shapes.tmp))
}
rownames(shapes.save) <- NULL
colnames(shapes.save) <- c("tillers", "florets")</pre>
```

Let's take a look at where the shape parameters converged for the negative binomial model.

Table 3: Estimated shape parameters of negative binomial distributions, each row one iteration

tillers	florets
6.6315 11.9381	1.0960 1.2094
10.1647	1.1872
10.6408 10.5046	1.1950 $1.1930$
10.5430 $10.5322$	1.1936 $1.1935$
10.5352	1.1935

The initial NB shape parameter for tillers was 6.631, and it converged at 10.535. The change in the shape parameter for florets was less drastic. Initially, it was 1.096, and it converged at 1.193.

# 9 Evaluating final model

The famlist was automatically updated during the convergence process, so we just need to rerun the null and final model in order to compare them.

```
## Analysis of Deviance Table
##
## Model 1: resp ~ varb
## Model 2: resp ~ varb + fit:(symp.extent + ind)
## Model Df Model Dev Df Deviance P(>|Chi|)
## 1 12 -14909
## 2 22 -14889 10 19.719 0.03203 *
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

With the final shape parameters for tillers and florets for the ind model, we didn't have any convergence trouble. We also see that our final model is still explaining a significant amount of variation relative the null.

## 10 Final fitness estimates

#### 10.1 Get Conditional and Unconditional Mean Value Parameters

```
pout.cond.f <- predict(aout, model.type = "conditional",</pre>
     is.always.parameter = TRUE, gradient = TRUE)
xi <- pout.cond.f$fit</pre>
class(xi)
## [1] "numeric"
length(xi) == nind * nnode
## [1] TRUE
xi <- matrix(xi, nrow = nind)</pre>
colnames(xi) <- vars</pre>
##
         late17.tillers late17.panicles late17.pans.sampled
##
    [1,]
                90.67461
                                0.8187365
                                                    0.07986425
##
    [2,]
               105.28175
                                0.8213544
                                                    0.09604337
##
   [3,]
               110.67019
                                0.8221456
                                                    0.10091307
   [4,]
               85.22798
                                0.8175307
                                                    0.07237712
   [5,]
##
              124.38953
                                0.8238506
                                                    0.11137532
##
    [6,]
              108.97500
                                                    0.09943399
                                0.8219051
##
    [7,]
              145.55836
                                0.8258509
                                                    0.12359413
    [8,]
               116.43644
                                0.8229112
                                                    0.10561608
    [9,]
                                                    0.10195526
##
               111.89728
                                0.8223151
##
   [10,]
               157.88888
                                0.8267688
                                                    0.12918153
##
         late17.floret.count.total late18.tillers late18.panicles
##
    [1,]
                            307.3460
                                            125.2207
                                                            0.8018327
##
    [2,]
                            364.3105
                                            133.3189
                                                            0.8027668
##
   [3,]
                            381.5037
                                            143.5432
                                                            0.8037956
##
   [4,]
                            280.9967
                                            102.9123
                                                            0.7984990
##
   [5,]
                            418.5753
                                            143.7408
                                                            0.8038141
##
    [6,]
                            376.2781
                                            132.4406
                                                            0.8026710
##
   [7,]
                            462.1763
                                            194.4716
                                                            0.8073089
##
   [8,]
                            398.1430
                                            133.5357
                                                            0.8027903
##
   [9,]
                            385.1878
                                            133.0589
                                                            0.8027386
  [10,]
##
                            482.2485
                                            178.7573
                                                            0.8064384
##
         late18.pans.sampled late18.floret.count.total late19.tillers
##
                   0.08937983
    [1,]
                                                 346.1512
                                                                 163.5410
##
   [2,]
                   0.09472708
                                                 365.2839
                                                                 188.0090
    [3,]
##
                   0.10060202
                                                 386.3426
                                                                 205.2266
##
   [4,]
                   0.07019538
                                                 277.5825
                                                                 135.8233
##
   [5,]
                   0.10070720
                                                 386.7200
                                                                 182.9424
    [6,]
##
                   0.09417931
                                                 363.3227
                                                                 167.5384
##
   [7,]
                   0.12055089
                                                 458.3223
                                                                 205.0083
##
   [8,]
                   0.09486116
                                                 365.7640
                                                                 170.6834
##
   [9,]
                   0.09456566
                                                 364.7059
                                                                 195.7690
##
  [10,]
                   0.11562430
                                                 440.4627
                                                                 226.4587
##
         late19.panicles late19.pans.sampled late19.floret.count.total
##
    [1,]
                0.7451543
                                    0.09655191
                                                                  276.6657
##
   [2,]
                0.7471616
                                    0.10607578
                                                                  302.1346
##
    [3,]
                0.7482871
                                    0.11139389
                                                                  316.4095
```

```
[4,]
##
                0.7420068
                                     0.08151413
                                                                   236.6059
##
    [5,]
                0.7467900
                                     0.10431668
                                                                   297.4219
    [6,]
                                     0.09830178
##
                0.7455223
                                                                   281.3375
   [7,]
                                                                   316.2436
##
                0.7482740
                                     0.11133216
##
   [8,]
                0.7457997
                                     0.09961978
                                                                   284.8583
  [9,]
##
                0.7476934
                                     0.10859044
                                                                   308.8791
## [10.]
                0.7494395
                                                                   331.0277
                                     0.11682196
pout.unco.f <- predict(aout, gradient = TRUE)</pre>
mu <- pout.unco.f$fit</pre>
mu <- matrix(mu, nrow = nind)</pre>
colnames(mu) <- vars</pre>
mıı
         late17.tillers late17.panicles late17.pans.sampled
##
##
    [1,]
                90.67461
                                 74.23861
                                                       5.929011
##
    [2,]
                                 86.47362
               105.28175
                                                       8.305218
##
    [3,]
               110.67019
                                 90.98700
                                                       9.181778
   [4,]
                85.22798
                                  69.67649
                                                       5.042984
##
    [5,]
               124.38953
                                102.47839
                                                      11.413563
##
    [6,]
               108.97500
                                  89.56711
                                                       8.906015
##
   [7,]
               145.55836
                                120.20950
                                                      14.857189
##
    [8,]
                                                      10.119799
               116.43644
                                  95.81684
##
    [9,]
               111.89728
                                 92.01482
                                                       9.381395
##
   Γ10. ]
               157.88888
                                130.53761
                                                      16.863048
##
         late17.floret.count.total late18.tillers late18.panicles
##
    [1,]
                            1822.258
                                            125.2207
                                                             100.40607
##
    [2,]
                            3025.678
                                            133.3189
                                                             107.02402
##
   [3,]
                            3502.882
                                            143.5432
                                                             115.37937
##
   [4.]
                            1417.062
                                            102.9123
                                                              82.17538
##
    [5,]
                            4777.436
                                            143.7408
                                                             115.54086
##
    [6,]
                            3351.138
                                            132.4406
                                                             106.30625
##
    [7,]
                            6866.640
                                            194.4716
                                                             156.99862
    [8,]
                            4029.127
                                            133.5357
                                                             107.20119
##
    [9,]
                            3613.599
                                            133.0589
                                                             106.81150
##
   ſ10.]
                            8132.179
                                            178.7573
                                                             144.15673
##
         late18.pans.sampled late18.floret.count.total late19.tillers
##
    [1,]
                     8.974277
                                                  3106.457
                                                                  163.5410
##
    [2,]
                    10.138073
                                                  3703.275
                                                                  188.0090
##
    [3,]
                    11.607398
                                                                  205.2266
                                                  4484.432
##
   [4,]
                     5.768332
                                                  1601.188
                                                                  135.8233
##
   [5,]
                    11.635796
                                                  4499.795
                                                                  182.9424
##
    [6,]
                    10.011850
                                                  3637.532
                                                                  167.5384
   [7,]
                    18.926324
##
                                                  8674.356
                                                                  205.0083
##
    [8,]
                    10.169230
                                                  3719.538
                                                                  170.6834
    [9,]
##
                    10.100700
                                                  3683.785
                                                                  195.7690
##
   Γ10. ]
                    16.668020
                                                  7341.641
                                                                  226.4587
##
         late19.panicles late19.pans.sampled late19.floret.count.total
##
    [1,]
                 121.8633
                                      11.766132
                                                                   3255.285
##
    [2,]
                 140.4731
                                      14.900797
                                                                   4502.047
    [3,]
                                      17.106582
##
                 153.5684
                                                                   5412.685
##
   [4,]
                 100.7818
                                       8.215139
                                                                   1943.750
##
   [5,]
                 136.6196
                                      14.251701
                                                                   4238.768
##
    [6,]
                 124.9036
                                      12.278243
                                                                   3454.330
    [7,]
                 153.4024
                                      17.078621
                                                                   5401.004
```

```
## [8,]
               127.2956
                                   12.681160
                                                              3612.334
## [9,]
               146.3752
                                   15.894944
                                                              4909.616
## [10,]
               169.7171
                                   19.826680
                                                              6563.180
```

#### Correcting for Sub-sampling 10.2

#### Point Estimates 10.2.1

```
is.florets <- grep("floret", vars)</pre>
is.panicles <- grep("panicles", vars)</pre>
is.florets
## [1] 4 8 12
is.panicles
## [1] 2 6 10
mu.panicles <- mu[ , is.panicles]</pre>
xi.florets <- xi[ , is.florets]</pre>
mu.florets <- mu.panicles * xi.florets</pre>
mu.florets
##
         late17.panicles late18.panicles late19.panicles
## [1,]
                22816.94
                                 34755.68
                                                  33715.39
## [2,]
                31503.25
                                 39094.15
                                                   42441.80
## [3,]
                34711.88
                                 44575.96
                                                  48590.51
## [4,]
                19578.86
                                 22810.45
                                                   23845.56
## [5,]
                42894.93
                                 44681.97
                                                  40633.66
## [6,]
                33702.14
                                 38623.47
                                                   35140.06
## [7,]
                55557.98
                                 71955.96
                                                  48512.53
## [8,]
                38148.81
                                 39210.34
                                                   36261.22
## [9,]
                35442.99
                                 38954.79
                                                  45212.23
                62951.56
## [10,]
                                 63495.66
                                                   56181.05
```

Now calculate the final fitness estimates.

```
mu.fit <- rowSums(mu.florets)</pre>
mu.fit
   [1] 91288.01 113039.20 127878.35 66234.87 128210.55 107465.67 176026.47
  [8] 113620.36 119610.00 182628.26
```

Check

```
ximu \leftarrow c(xi, mu)
all.equal(foo(ximu), mu.fit)
```

## [1] TRUE

Final Jacobian matrices

```
jac.foo <- jacobian(foo, ximu)</pre>
jac.ximu <- rbind(pout.cond.f$gradient, pout.unco.f$gradient)</pre>
jac.total <- jac.foo %*% jac.ximu</pre>
```

Delta method for final fitness estimates.

```
V <- jac.total <pre>%*% solve(aout$fisher) %*% t(jac.total)
```

The standard errors are square roots of the variances (the diagonal elements of V)

```
se.final <- sqrt(diag(V))
bar.final <- cbind(mu.fit, se.final)
colnames(bar.final) <- c("Estimate", "SE")</pre>
```

Table 4: Estimated Fitness with Standard Error for Different Individuals (Final Negative Binomial Distributions for Tillers and Florets

Estimate	SE
91288.01	19816.16
113039.20	23636.53
127878.35	26353.40
66234.88	15136.14
128210.55	26297.39
107465.66	22584.03
176026.47	35303.11
113620.36	23671.55
119610.00	24776.94
182628.26	36099.52

Caution: Standard errors involving negative binomial arrows do not account for estimating the shape parameters of these negative binomial distributions. Whenever such are presented, some academic weasel wording must be emitted to refer to this fact. More precisely, the standard errors in Table 3 assume the size parameters of the negative binomial distributions are known rather than estimated. They do correctly account for sampling variability under that assumption, asymptotically (for sufficiently large sample size).

# 11 Comparing Pearson residuals for models

```
is.tiller <- grepl("tiller", redata$varb)</pre>
y.tiller <- redata$resp[is.tiller]</pre>
xi.tiller <- xi[is.tiller]</pre>
resid.t.final <- (y.tiller - xi.tiller) /
    sqrt(xi.tiller * (1 + xi.tiller / famlist[[3]]$size))
summary(resid.t.final)
##
       Min. 1st Qu.
                        Median
                                          3rd Qu.
                                    Mean
                                                        Max.
## -1.77192 -0.87328 -0.24797 -0.07649 0.72515 2.14036
stem(resid.t.final, scale = 1)
##
##
     The decimal point is at the |
##
##
     -1 | 876
##
     -1 | 321
##
     -0 | 997765
##
     -0 | 4432
##
      0 | 12
##
      0 | 666778
##
      1 | 11122
##
      1 |
##
      2 | 1
```

Compare these to the Pearson residuals for tillers from the initial Poisson model.

```
stem(resid.pois.t, scale = 2)
##
##
     The decimal point is at the |
##
##
     -7 | 0
##
     -6 | 554
##
     -5 | 1
##
     -4 | 700
##
     -3 | 953
##
     -2 | 9430
##
     -1 |
##
     -0 | 44
      0 | 0
##
##
      1 |
##
      2 | 28
      3 | 588
##
##
      4 | 47
      5 I
##
##
      6 |
##
      7 | 124
##
      8 | 34
```

The residual analysis for the original model (with Poisson arrows for tillers and florets) clearly showed the model did not fit the data because the residuals were far larger than standard normal (which they would be only for very large sample sizes, which we do not have here, but still the residuals are far larger than they should be). The residual analysis for the final model (with negative binomial arrows for tillers and florets) shows no lack of fit of the model data because the residuals are the same size as standard normal residuals would be, although not quite standard normal in distribution, perhaps. But there isn't anywhere else in aster models to go. So we declare this model fits and move on (at least as far as tillers are concerned).

On to florets.

```
resid.f.final <-
    (y.floret - y.floret.pred * xi.floret) /
    sqrt(y.floret.pred * xi.floret * (1 + xi.floret / famlist[[4]]$size))
summary(resid.f.final)
##
        Min.
                1st Qu.
                           Median
                                        Mean
                                                3rd Qu.
                                                              Max.
## -2.164408 -0.654005 -0.006392
                                    0.134414
                                              0.738515
                                                         4.545859
stem(resid.f.final, scale = 2)
##
##
     The decimal point is at the |
##
##
     -2 \mid 2
##
     -1 | 5
##
     -1 | 2
##
     -0 | 9887755
     -0 | 444300
##
##
      0 | 333
      0 | 577889
##
##
      1 | 234
##
      1 | 5
```

```
## 2 |
## 2 |
## 3 |
## 4 |
## 4 | 5
```

Compare these to initial residuals from Poisson model

```
stem(resid.pois.f, scale = 2)
```

```
##
##
     The decimal point is 1 digit(s) to the right of the |
##
     -3 | 70
##
##
     -2 | 5
##
     -1 | 86550
##
     -0 | 988754
##
      0 | 1145799
##
      1 | 013347
##
      2 | 08
##
      3 |
##
      4 |
      5 I
##
##
      6 |
      7 | 3
##
```

We still have the one outlier. Clearly that one observation does not fit either Poisson or negative binomial model. But the final model shows no other issues. The residuals are (except for the outlier) about the same size as standard normal residuals.