

Response to reviews: Variable pneumatic features in the ribs of *Brachiosaurus altithorax*

Michael P. Taylor and Mathew J. Wedel

Overview

First of all, we are genuinely grateful to all three reviewers for their helpful and generous reviews. This experience has been a rare and very welcome one of every reviewer's goal being to improve the manuscript.

We have in general accepted the recommendations of the reviewers. In the remainder of this document, we describe the relatively few points where we have elected not to do so.

Review 1 - Jerry Harris:

We have added some further brief material to the introduction as suggested, but in general prefer short introductions that allow the abbreviations to be near the start of a paper.

The only aspect of the manuscript that puzzled me a bit was a peculiar over-division into many paragraphs

In some cases, we have followed Jerry's advice to join consecutive paragraphs. In others, however, we have kept paragraphs separate, following the approach that paragraphs have no ideal length to aim for but are units of thought. For example, the paragraph beginning "As with pneumatic features in other bones, it is likely that the excavation of ribs by diverticula of the pulmonary system followed paths laid down by blood vessels" introduces a new idea, and so is rightly presented in its own paragraph.

Review 2 - Virginia Zurriaguz

Virginia's specific suggestions on the manuscript are helpful. However:

A good idea would be to put, within the supplementary material, a similar study within Neosauropoda, in order to compare results and see if it is something typical of this entire clade.

This would be beyond the scope of the present study. We agree it would be useful work to do!

Review 3 - Patrick O'Connor

We are especially grateful to Pat for spotting several silly errors including misspelled species names and singular/plural disagreements.